LOEB CLASSICAL LIBRARY

# XENOPHON MEMORABILIA **ECONOMICUS** SYMPOSIUM APOLOGY



Translated by C. MARCHANT O. J. TODD Revised by **IEFFREY HENDERSON**  Xenophon (ca. 430 to ca. 354 BC), a member of a wealthy but politically quietist Athenian family and an admirer of Socrates, left Athens in 401 BC to serve as a mercenary commander for Cyrus the Younger of Persia, then joined the staff of King Agesilaus II of Sparta before settling in Elis and, in the aftermath of the battle of Leuctra in 371 BC, retiring to Corinth. His historical and biographical works, Socratic dialogues and reminiscences, and short treatises on hunting, horsemanship, economics, and the Spartan constitution are richly informative about his own life and times.

This volume collects Xenophon's portrayals of his associate, Socrates. In *Memorabilia* (or *Memoirs of Socrates*) and in *Oeconomicus*, a dialogue about household management, we see the philosopher through Xenophon's eyes. Here, as in the accompanying *Symposium*, we also obtain insight on life in Athens. The volume concludes with Xenophon's *Apology*, an interesting complement to Plato's account of Socrates' defense at his trial.

Jeffrey Henderson is William Goodwin Aurelio Professor of Greek Language and Literature at Boston University.

# LOEB CLASSICAL LIBRARY

FOUNDED BY JAMES LOEB 1911

EDITED BY
JEFFREY HENDERSON

# XENOPHON IV

LCL 168

## MEMORABILIA OECONOMICUS

TRANSLATED BY

E. C. MARCHANT

### SYMPOSIUM · APOLOGY

TRANSLATED BY

O. J. TODD

REVISED BY

JEFFREY HENDERSON



HARVARD UNIVERSITY PRESS CAMBRIDGE, MASSACHUSETTS LONDON, ENGLAND 2013

#### Copyright © 2013 by the President and Fellows of Harvard College All rights reserved

First published 1923

Revised 2013

 $\label{loeb} \mbox{LOEB CLASSICAL LIBRARY}^{\circledcirc} \mbox{ is a registered trademark} \\ \mbox{of the President and Fellows of Harvard College}$ 

Library of Congress Control Number 2013933686 CIP data available from the Library of Congress

ISBN 978-0-674-99695-3

Composed in ZephGreek and ZephText by Technologies 'N Typography, Merrimac, Massachusetts. Printed on acid-free paper and bound by The Maple-Vail Book Manufacturing Group

## CONTENTS

PREFACE	vii
GENERAL INTRODUCTION	ix
GENERAL BIBLIOGRAPHY	xvii
MEMORABILIA	1
воок і	8
BOOK II	88
BOOK III	178
BOOK IV	276
OECONOMICUS	379
SYMPOSIUM	559
APOLOGY	663
INDEX TO MEMORABILIA	690
INDEX TO OECONOMICUS	696
INDEX TO SYMPOSIUM	699
INDEX TO APOLOGY	702

#### PREFACE

The Loeb edition of Xenophon's Socratic works by E. C. Marchant and O. J. Todd, first published in 1923, has stood up well, but the time has come to modernize its translations—which now seem thoroughly dated not only in style but also in their decorum, unavoidable in that era, as regards frank reference to (homo)sexuality and pederasty—and to update the texts, introductions, and bibliography in light of current scholarship. I hope that this revision will help freshen the appeal of an author still too little read and appreciated as a Socratic.

JJH January 2013

#### LIFE

Xenophon of Athens lived through a very significant period in history—from the outbreak of the Peloponnesian War ca. 430 to at least 355,¹ when Philip of Macedon had begun to encroach upon Greece—and is one of its most important and versatile witnesses. He is often an original writer, in the fields of war memoir, history (both documentary and romantic), biography, philosophy, and political and military science, and an enlightened and progressive exponent of the important ideas of his era, who could draw upon an exceptionally broad range of interests, experiences, and acquaintances.

The son of Gryllus of the rural deme Erchia, Xenophon was at least well enough off that he could serve in the cavalry from boyhood, and his associations, Athenian and foreign, suggest that he belonged to the highest economic class. Certainly in his life and writings, he exemplified the social and political attitudes characteristic of Athenians from refined landowning families with inherited wealth who eschewed politics and (other) banausic occupations. Although Xenophon may have acquired his evident affec-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Our main sources of information are Xenophon's own works, especially *Anabasis*, and Diogenes Laertius' *Life* (2.48–59).

tion for farming and estate management in boyhood, he must have spent many of his first thirty years in the city as a result of the Spartan investment of the countryside during the years 431–425 and 413–403.

After the war, Xenophon (along with the cavalry as a whole) seems to have supported the oligarchic regime of the so-called Thirty Tyrants (though like Plato he was not uncritical of their excesses) and perhaps even fought against the democratic forces under Thrasybulus and Anytus (one of Socrates' accusers) who restored the democracy in 403: if so, he would have been protected by the amnesty (HG 2.4.43). But still, he could not have felt secure, and in less than two years he had left Athens on the invitation of the Boeotian Proxenus, an "old friend," who invited him to join the Persian prince Cyrus in a campaign intended to undermine the new king, Cyrus' brother Artaxerxes. Xenophon reports that Socrates had urged caution on the grounds that "becoming a friend of Cyrus might open him to accusations on the part of the city because Cyrus was thought to have given the Spartans enthusiastic support in the war against Athens" (An. 3.1.4–7). This may indeed have caused Xenophon's exile, declared at some point after his departure, unless the cause was his support of Agesilaus in the defeat of a coalition including Athens at the battle of Coroneia in 394.

Cyrus' plot soon collapsed (at Cunaxa in 401), but in coping with the aftermath Xenophon became a military commander, helping to lead his ten thousand Greeks back to Europe, and thereafter served as a mercenary with the Thracian Seuthes, the Spartan commanders Thibron and Dercylidas, and with King Agesilaus of Sparta, of whom

he wrote an idealizing biography. These adventures are recounted in *Anabasis* and *Hellenica Graeca*.

For his services Xenophon was appointed Spartan proxenos at Olympia and awarded a home nearby, at Scillous in Triphylia, where he settled in 394, built a fine estate funded by his Asian booty, and raised his twin sons, Gryllus and Diodorus, in the Spartan system (cf. Constitution of the Spartans), living the life of the gentleman farmer described in Oeconomicus (cf. An. 5.3.7–13) and writing; the games provided a convenient venue for meeting and making acquaintances from every part of the Greek world. He stayed on at Scillous until 371, when after the Spartan defeat at Leuctra, Elis recovered Triphylia, forcing Xenophon to flee to Corinth.

According to Diogenes Laertius 2.56, Xenophon remained in Corinth for the rest of his life, but it is possible that he returned to Athens or at least visited regularly: after Leuctra, Athens and Sparta were joined by common hostility to Thebes, and both Xenophon's sons fought as cavalrymen with the Athenians at Mantinea in 362, Gryllus dying a hero's death (HG 7.5.15–17), which was commemorated by Athens in a painting by Euphranor, still visible in Pausanias' day (1.3.4), located in the Stoa of Zeus Eleutherios, a popular meeting place in the agora where Xenophon stages Socrates' discussion with Ischomachus in *Oeconomicus* (7.1). To this period belong also the treatises on horsemanship and cavalry command, perhaps written in connection with his sons' service, and (not earlier than 355) Ways and Means (Vectigalia), which offers economic advice to the Athenians along the lines of the policies of the leading Athenian statesman of the time,

Eubulus. If Xenophon did return to Athens (with his exile lifted), it may have been around 366, when Athenian relations with Corinth had soured (*HG* 7.4.6).

#### SOCRATIC WORKS

From 413 until his departure from Athens in 401, the young Xenophon had ample time to get to know Socrates and other members of Socrates' retinue, including Plato, though Plato never (and Xenophon only once [Mem. 1.3.8 ff.]) mentions his own active participation in their conversations. Unlike Plato, who devoted his life to carrying on the master's mission and was first and foremost a philosopher and teacher, Xenophon was a practical man of affairs and a writer with many other interests. Nevertheless, his four Socratic works earned him the reputation in antiquity as second only to Plato as a Socratic, and as more a philosopher than a historian.<sup>2</sup>

Socrates' condemnation in 399 at about seventy years of age was soon followed by literary works, mainly philosophical dialogues based on his life, conversations, and thought, written by those who knew him, not only by the two extant Socratics, Xenophon (the first, according to Diogenes Laertius, 2.48) and Plato, but also by (among others) Aeschines of Sphettus, Antisthenes, Lysias, Crito, Phaedo, Aristippus, and perhaps Hermogenes (Ap. 2). Because Socrates never committed anything to writing, we

 $<sup>^2</sup>$  For example Quintilian 10.1.75 (on historians), "I have not forgotten Xenophon, but he must be considered among the philosophers."

depend for our information about his life and thought entirely on what survives of or is traceable to these works, together with the unflattering caricature in Aristophanes' comedy *Clouds* and other comedies produced during Socrates' lifetime.<sup>3</sup>

These works agree on the sort of basic details whose verisimilitude anyone who had known Socrates would expect and none would dispute, for example his distinctive and unconventional appearance, personality, and mannerisms; his visibility both in the streets and, though poor and threadbare, in the houses of the wealthy; his fondness for conversing with well-to-do young men who sought out his company; and the method of his conversations, which are dialectic, elenctic, and maieutic, employ humor, irony, and paradox, and illustrate the two principal inventions attributed to him by Aristotle (*Metaph.* 1078b27), inductive reasoning and general definition. Beyond such superficial features, however, there are great divergences in the Socratics' recreations of what Socrates said and thought, and these cannot be resolved by trying to determine which witness is more or less accurate, or which alternatives are true or faithful and which false or misunderstood. The Socratics cannot help us recover the "actual" Socrates, because their purposes transcend the merely documentary: they aimed not merely to prove the falseness of the charges brought against Socrates in court, together with the public image that had lent those charges credibility,

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Clouds was performed in 423 but we possess only an incomplete revision abandoned by Aristophanes ca. 417 and never produced; of the other plays, only a few fragments remain.

but also to portray him as intellectually, spiritually, and morally the very best of men and to demonstrate that his associates—even men like Callias, Charmides, Lycon, and Alcibiades—were only improved and never harmed or misguided while in his company. Thus Socrates was to be remembered as a good man, a blameless citizen, and a great teacher.

To the latter end both Plato and Xenophon extended the memorializing and apologetic project by adding didactic dimensions (long speeches or demonstrations, passive interlocutors), each developing the implications of his recollections beyond where the master might have taken them. And so while Aristotle views the Socratic dialogues as essentially mimetic and thus as a kind of poetry akin to mimes, 4 they also owed something to the ancient wisdom tradition, in which ethical and/or practical advice or instruction is imparted by an older person or sage to a younger one. Inevitably, each Socratic portrait is built on its creator's own recollections and reflects his own priorities, definitions, and interpretations, sometimes as time went on in response (never explicitly acknowledged) to another Socratic's writings. 5 Nor was their subject static or monolithic: Socrates cannot have re-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Poet. 1447b9–13. A tradition traceable to the fourth century credits Sophron, the Sicilian composer of prose mimes, as influencing Plato (cf. Suda  $\sigma$  893), and of course tragedy and comedy will have played a role.

 $<sup>^5</sup>$  Stand-ins for Xenophon's own views can also be found in his historical works, e.g., Theopompus  $(\mathit{An.}\ 1.12)$  and Themistogenes  $(\mathit{HG}\ 3.1.2).$ 

mained intellectually uniform throughout a long life lived in an unusually dynamic time and place, nor was he doctrinaire, but rather interrogative, encouraging each of his many and various interlocutors to think and learn for himself

Thus it is unsurprising that the practical and soldierly Xenophon would develop his portrait along different lines than the unworldly, aloof, and hyper-intellectual Plato. Xenophon's Socrates is down-to-earth, handy, and practical as well as philosophical and comfortable in any society, from gentlemen, the self-designated "good and beautiful" (kaloi kagathoi), to intellectuals, working men, and courtesans. Diogenes Laertius recounts that it was Socrates' interest in how men become kaloi kagathoi that first attracted Xenophon to him, and although Plato's Socrates denies having any interest in making money or running an estate (Ap. 36b), Xenophon's Socrates shows both interest and expertise in these subjects. In this connection it is probably significant that the fragments and titles (e.g., Oeconomicus) of Antisthenes, Socrates' contemporary and longest-term companion, also suggest a Socrates interested in practical matters. No doubt Xenophon, like Plato, at times used Socrates as a vehicle for his own ideas, but we can never know how much in fact they had learned from him.

The dating of Xenophon's Socratic works can be only approximate: we have no precise information about where or how they were published; Xenophon often uses the same material in more than one work and revises or augments earlier work, sometimes (e.g., in *Mem.*) over a long period of time; and when there are correspondences with

Plato's works (whose dating is far from clear-cut either), priority cannot be established with certainty.

#### The Text

Marchant and Todd used the text of G. Sauppe (Tauchnitz: Leipzig, 1865–1867) with few modifications, and their text is retained in this revision, though it has been modified on an eclectic basis in light of more recent editions.

#### GENERAL BIBLIOGRAPHY

Complete bibliographical coverage of Xenophon's Socratic writings can be found in D. Morrison, *Bibliography of Editions, Translations, and Commentary on Xenophon's Socratic Writings, 1600–Present* (Pittsburgh, 1988), supplemented to 2008 by L.-A. Dorion in Narcy and Tordesillas, 283–300.

- Bartlett, R. C. Xenophon. The Shorter Socratic Writings: Apology of Socrates to the Jury, Oeconomicus, and Symposium. Ithaca, 1996.
- Breitenbach, H. R. "Xenophon von Athen." In Real-Encyclopadie der classischen Altertumswissenschaft [RE], IX A<sup>2</sup>, edited by August Pauly et al. Stuttgart, 1967.
- Delebecque, E. Essai sur la vie de Xénophon. Paris, 1957. Danzig, G. Apologizing for Socrates: How Plato and Xenophon Created Our Socrates. Lanham, MD, 2010.
- Dillery, J. Xenophon and the History of His Times. London, 1995.
- Dillery, J., and T. Gagos, "Xenophon and an Unknown Christian Text with an Appendix of All Xenophon Papyri." ZPE 93 (1992): 187–89.
- Gray, V. J., ed. *Xenophon* [Oxford Readings in Classical Studies]. Oxford, 2010.

#### GENERAL BIBLIOGRAPHY

- ——. Xenophon's Mirror of Princes: Reading the Reflections. Oxford, 2011.
- Guthrie, W. K. C. Socrates. Cambridge, 1971.
- Higgins, W. E. Xenophon the Athenian. Albany, 1977.
- Morrison, D. R. The Cambridge Companion to Socrates. Cambridge, 2010.
- Mueller-Goldingen, C. Xenophon, Philosophie und Geschichte. Darmstadt, 2007.
- Narcy, M., and A. Tordesillas, eds. *Xénophon et Socrate*. Paris, 2008.
- O'Connor, D. K. "Xenophon and the Enviable Life of Socrates," in Morrison, *Cambridge Companion to Socrates*, 48–74.
- Rosetti, L. Le dialogue socratique. Paris, 2011.
- Strauss, L. Xenophon's Socrates. New York, 1972.
- Tuplin, C. J., ed. Xenophon and His World. Stuttgart, 2004.
- Wilms, H. Techne und Paideia bei Xenophon und Isokrates. Stuttgart, 1995.

## **MEMORABILIA**

#### INTRODUCTION

Memorabilia<sup>1</sup> is not a complete account of Socrates but rather a collection of reminiscences about and conversations involving him, composed at different times<sup>2</sup> and arranged in four parts. It is not worked into a coherent whole, but has only a general shape, the first book being primarily apologetic, the following books thematically more wide-ranging, the conclusion (4.8) a recapitulation of Socrates' defense at trial, and an epilogue summarizing his virtues and usefulness.

#### BOOK 1

Chapters 1 and 2 defend Socrates against charges leveled both at his trial, which Xenophon could have known only by report (religious nonobservance, corrupting the young), and in Polycrates'  $Accusation~(K\alpha\tau\eta\gamma o\rho i\alpha)$ , a speech for Anytus against Socrates published sometime, but presumably not long, after 393 (encouraging his companions to

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> This Latin title, which has replaced the more accurate *Commentarii* probably current in antiquity (Aul. Gell. 14.3), was first used by J. Lenklau in his edition (Frankfurt, 1596).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> The latest identifiable reference is to the military situation between 371 and 362.

despise the laws, teaching Critias and Alcibiades how to subvert the democracy). In 3 the themes are trust in Delphi, frugality, and sexual self-control. In 4 Socrates talks with Aristodemus (who debunks sacrifice and divination) about divine providence in creating mankind. Socrates discourses on self-control in 5, and in 6 he answers the accusations of Antiphon the sophist that, being poor, he can teach only misery, that he is foolish to teach for free, and that his avoidance of politics makes him ineffective in counseling politicians. In 7 Socrates discourages pretensions in his companions.

#### BOOK 2

In chapter 1 Socrates resumes the topic of self-control, arguing with Aristippus (founder of the Cyrenaic school) for a plainer way of life and telling Prodicus' story of Heracles' Choice. In 2 and 3 Socrates rebukes his son Lamprocles for misbehavior toward his mother and brothers, in 4–6 discusses the importance of friendship, and in 7–10 advises a series of acquaintances who are down on their luck.

#### BOOK 3

Socrates discusses leadership in chapters 1–7 with a series of commanders and would-be commanders, including the younger Pericles (general in 406), Glaucon, and Charmides. In 3.8–9 Aristippus reappears and argues about various topics. In 10 Socrates converses with a painter, a sculp-

#### MEMORABILIA

tor, and an armorer, while in 11 he converses with the courtesan Theodote as she poses for a painter. In 12 Socrates speaks about the importance of physical fitness, in 13 about keeping annoyance appropriate to the situation, and in 14 about etiquette at symposia.

#### BOOK 4

We are told in chapter 1 that Socrates benefits his companions both when he is earnest and when he is playful; that he was often in love, but with virtuous souls not mere bodies; and that he thought education benefits everyone, even the well endowed. In 2 Socrates convinces the widely read Euthydemus that he does not know as much as he thinks and wins him as a follower, and in 3 he discusses divine providence with him (cf. 1.4). Socrates defines justice to Hippias in 4 as being the same as what is lawful, with an appeal (as in Ap. 15) to the Spartan lawgiver Lycurgus. In 5-6 Euthydemus returns for instruction in discussion and definition, as examples analyzing several important goods for which knowledge is necessary, as well as in monarchy and despotism. In 7 Socrates claims that geometry, astronomy, and mathematics are worthwhile only insofar as they are useful, which study of the heavens can never be, as exemplified in the sad case of Anaxagoras. He also urges his companions to look after their health. Xenophon recapitulates in 8 (sometimes verbatim) his account of Socrates' defense in Apology, that Socrates' divine voice did not fail him and that he had reached the

proper time to die, and he ends the work with the brief but eloquent epilogue.

#### TEXT

The most important manuscripts are *Parisini graeci* 1302 (A) and 1740 (B), both late-thirteenth century, which derive from a lost ancient original, A directly and B from an intermediary. Several later manuscripts akin to B and deriving from a different intermediary are useful as a check on B and as a source of emendations from a scholarly revision of the text made in the fourteenth century. A few good readings and words missing from the manuscripts are supplied by testimonial sources and five papyri, the earliest (*PHeid.* 206) from ca. 280 BC (provenance unknown) and the latest (*PCairo* inv. 45622) from the fourth century AD (Oxyrhynchus). Detailed information about the tradition may be found in Bandini's Budé edition.

#### **EDITIONS**

- Bandini, M., and L.-A. Dorion, *Xénophon Mémorables*. Budé: Paris, 2000–2011.
- Bevilacqua, F., ed., trans., comm. *Memorabili di Seno*fonte. Classici greci. Torino, 2010.
- Gignon, O. Kommentar zum ersten Buch von Xenophons Memorabilien, Basel, 1995.
- Macleod, M. D. Xenophon: Apology and Memorabilia I. Oxford, 2008.
- Marchant, E. C. Xenophontis Opera<sup>2</sup>. Oxford, 1921.

#### MEMORABILIA

#### GENERAL

Gray, V. J. The Framing of Socrates. The Literary Interpretation of Xenophon's Memorabilia. Oxford, 1998.
 ———. "Xenophon's Image of Socrates in the Memorabilia." Prudentia 27 (1995): 50–73.

#### ΑΠΟΜΝΗΜΟΝΕΥΜΑΤΩΝ Α

1. Πολλάκις έθαύμασα, τίσι ποτέ λόγοις Άθηναίους έπεισαν οί γραψάμενοι Σωκράτην ως άξιος είη θανάτου τῆ πόλει, ἡ μὲν γὰρ γραφὴ κατ' αὐτοῦ τοιάδε τις ην Αδικεί Σωκράτης ους μεν ή πόλις νομίζει θεους οὐ νομίζων, ἔτερα δὲ καινὰ δαιμόνια εἰσφέρων ἀδικεῖ δὲ καὶ τοὺς νέους διαφθείρων.

Πρώτον μὲν οὖν, ὡς οὐκ ἐνόμιζεν οὓς ἡ πόλις νομίζει θεούς, ποίω ποτ' έχρήσαντο τεκμηρίω; θύων τε γὰρ φανερὸς ἦν πολλάκις μὲν οἴκοι, πολλάκις δὲ ἐπὶ τῶν κοινῶν τῆς πόλεως βωμῶν, καὶ μαντικῆ χρώμενος οὐκ ἀφανὴς ἦν διετεθρύλητο γὰρ ὡς φαίη Σωκράτης τὸ δαιμόνιον έαυτῷ σημαίνειν ὅθεν δὴ καὶ μάλιστά μοι δοκοῦσιν αὐτὸν αἰτιάσασθαι καινὰ δαιμόνια εἰσφέρειν. ὁ δ' οὐδὲν καινότερον εἰσέφερε τῶν άλλων, όσοι μαντικήν νομίζοντες οἰωνοῖς τε χρώνται καὶ φήμαις καὶ συμβόλοις καὶ θυσίαις. οὖτοί τε γὰρ ύπολαμβάνουσιν οὐ τοὺς ὄρνιθας οὐδὲ τοὺς ἀπαντῶντας είδεναι τὰ συμφεροντα τοῖς μαντευομένοις, άλλὰ τοὺς θεοὺς διὰ τούτων αὐτὰ σημαίνειν, κάκεῖνος δὲ 4 οὕτως ἐνόμιζεν. ἀλλ' οἱ μὲν πλεῖστοί φασιν ὑπό τε

#### BOOK I

1. I have often wondered by what arguments those who drew up the indictment against Socrates could persuade the Athenians that he deserved to forfeit his life to the state. The indictment against him was to this effect: Socrates does wrong by not worshipping the gods worshipped by the state and of bringing in other novel divinities: he also does wrong by corrupting the young men.

First then, that he did not worship the gods worshipped by the state—what evidence did they produce of that? He often offered sacrifices, and made no secret of it, now in his home, now at the communal altars of the state, and he made use of divination with as little secrecy; indeed it had become notorious that Socrates claimed to be guided by his "divine sign": I it was out of this claim, I think, that the charge of bringing in novel deities arose. He was no more bringing in anything novel than are others who practice divination and rely on augury, utterances, coincidences and sacrifices. For these men's belief is not that the birds or the people met by accident know what profits the inquirer, but that they are the instruments by which the gods make this known; and that was Socrates' belief too. Only

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> That immanent "divine something," as Cicero terms it, which Socrates claimed as his peculiar possession.

των ορνίθων καὶ των απαντώντων αποτρέπεσθαί τε καὶ προτρέπεσθαι Σωκράτης δ' ὥσπερ ἐγίγνωσκεν, οὕτως ἔλεγε τὸ δαιμόνιον γὰρ ἔφη σημαίνειν. καὶ πολλοίς των συνόντων προηγόρευε τὰ μὲν ποιείν, τὰ δὲ μὴ ποιείν, ὡς τοῦ δαιμονίου προσημαίνοντος, καὶ τοίς μεν πειθομένοις αὐτῶ συνέφερε, τοίς δε μη πειθομένοις μετέμελε, καίτοι τίς οὐκ ἂν ὁμολογήσειεν αὐτὸν βούλεσθαι μήτ' ἠλίθιον μήτ' ἀλαζόνα φαίνεσθαι τοῖς συνοῦσιν; έδόκει δ' αν αμφότερα ταῦτα, εἰ προαγορεύων ώς ύπὸ θεοῦ φαινόμενα καὶ ψευδόμενος έφαίνετο. δήλον οὖν ὅτι οὐκ ἂν προέλεγεν, εἰ μὴ ἐπίστευεν άληθεύσειν. ταῦτα δὲ τίς ἂν ἄλλω πιστεύσειεν η θεώ; πιστεύων δε θεοίς πώς οὐκ εἶναι θεοὺς ἐνόμι-6 ζεν; άλλὰ μὴν ἐποίει καὶ τάδε πρὸς τοὺς ἐπιτηδείους. τὰ μὲν γὰρ ἀναγκαῖα συνεβούλευε καὶ πράττειν. ὡς νομίζοιεν ἄριστ' ἂν πραχθήναι περὶ δὲ τῶν ἀδήλων όπως ἀποβήσοιτο μαντευσομένους ἔπεμπεν, εί ποιητέα καὶ τοὺς μέλλοντας οἴκους τε καὶ πόλεις καλῶς οἰκήσειν μαντικής ἔφη προσδεῖσθαι τεκτονικὸν μὲν γὰρ ἢ χαλκευτικὸν ἢ γεωργικὸν ἢ ἀνθρώπων ἀρχικὸν η των τοιούτων έργων έξεταστικόν η λογιστικόν η οἰκονομικὸν ἢ στρατηγικὸν γενέσθαι, πάντα τὰ τοιαῦτα μαθήματα καὶ ἀνθρώπου γνώμη αἰρετὰ ἐνόμιζεν εἶναι τὰ δὲ μέγιστα τῶν ἐν τούτοις ἔφη τοὺς θεοὺς έαυτοις καταλείπεσθαι, ὧν οὐδὲν δήλον είναι τοις ἀνθρώποις, οὔτε γάρ τοι τῷ καλῶς ἀγρὸν φυτευσαμένῳ δήλον, ὅστις καρπώσεται, οὕτε τῷ καλῶς οἰκίαν οἰκοδομησαμένω δήλον, ὅστις ἐνοικήσει, οὔτε τῷ στρατη-

#### MEMORABILIA I. 1.4-1.8

whereas most people say that the birds or the people they meet dissuade or encourage them, Socrates said what he meant: for he said that the divine sign was signaling him. Many of his companions were counseled by him to do this or not to do that in accordance with the warnings of the divine sign: and those who followed his advice prospered, and those who rejected it had cause for regret. And yet who would not admit that he wished to appear neither a fool nor a fraud to his companions? but he would have been thought both had he proved to be mistaken when he alleged that his counsel was in accordance with divine revelation. Obviously then, he would not have given the counsel if he had not been confident that what he said would come true. And who could have inspired him with that confidence but a god? And since he had confidence in the gods, how can he have disbelieved in the existence of the gods? Another way he had of dealing with close friends was this: if there was no room for doubt, he advised them to act as they thought best; but if the consequences could not be foreseen, he sent them to the oracle to inquire whether the thing ought to be done. Those who intended to control estates or states, he said, needed the additional help of divination. For the craft of carpenter, smith, farmer or ruler, and the theory of such crafts, and arithmetic and economics and generalship might be learned and mastered by the application of human intelligence; but the deepest secrets of these matters the gods reserved to themselves; none were clear to men. You may plant a field well; but you know not who will gather the fruits: you may build a house well; but you know not who will dwell in it: able to command, you cannot know

γικώ δήλον, εί συμφέρει στρατηγείν, οὔτε τῶ πολιτικώ δήλον, εί συμφέρει τής πόλεως προστατείν, οὔτε τῶ καλὴν γήμαντι, ἵν' εὐφραίνηται, δῆλον, εἰ διὰ ταύτην ἀνιάσεται, οὔτε τῶ δυνατοὺς ἐν τῆ πόλει κηδεστάς λαβόντι δήλον, εί διὰ τούτους στερήσεται τής πόλεως, τοὺς δὲ μηδὲν τῶν τοιούτων οἰομένους εἶναι δαιμόνιον, άλλὰ πάντα τῆς ἀνθρωπίνης γνώμης δαιμονάν ἔφη δαιμονάν δὲ καὶ τοὺς μαντευομένους ἃ τοῖς ἀνθρώποις ἔδωκαν οἱ θεοὶ μαθοῦσι διακρίνειν, οἷον εἴ τις ἐπερωτώη, πότερον ἐπιστάμενον ἡνιοχεῖν έπὶ ζεύγος λαβείν κρείττον ἢ μὴ ἐπιστάμενον ἢ πότερον ἐπιστάμενον κυβερνᾶν ἐπὶ τὴν ναῦν κρεῖττον λαβείν ἢ μὴ ἐπιστάμενον ἢ ἃ ἔξεστιν ἀριθμήσαντας ἢ μετρήσαντας ή στήσαντας είδεναι, τούς τὰ τοιαῦτα παρὰ τῶν θεῶν πυνθανομένους ἀθέμιτα ποιεῖν ἡγεῖτο. έφη δε δείν α μεν μαθόντας ποιείν έδωκαν οί θεοί μανθάνειν, ἃ δὲ μὴ δῆλα τοῖς ἀνθρώποις ἐστὶ πειρᾶσθαι διὰ μαντικής παρὰ τῶν θεῶν πυνθάνεσθαι τοὺς θεούς γὰρ οἷς ἂν ὧσιν ἵλεω σημαίνειν.

ἀλλὰ μὴν ἐκεῖνός γε ἀεὶ μὲν ἦν ἐν τῷ φανερῷ· πρωί τε γὰρ εἰς τοὺς περιπάτους καὶ τὰ γυμνάσια ἤει καὶ πληθούσης ἀγορᾶς ἐκεῖ φανερὸς ἢν καὶ τὸ λοιπὸν ἀεὶ τῆς ἡμέρας ἦν ὅπου πλείστοις μέλλοι συνέσεσθαι καὶ ἔλεγε μὲν ὡς τὸ πολύ, τοῖς δὲ βουλομένοις ἐξῆν ἀκούειν. οὐδεὶς δὲ πώποτε Σωκράτους οὐδὲν ἀσεβὲς οὐδὲ ἀνόσιον οὕτε πράττοντος εἶδεν οὕτε λέγοντος ἤκουσεν. οὐδὲ γὰρ περὶ τῆς τῶν πάντων φύσεως ἦπερ

10

#### MEMORABILIA I. 1.8-1.11

whether it is profitable to command: versed in statecraft, you know not whether it is profitable to guide the state: though, for your delight, you marry a pretty woman, you cannot tell whether she will bring you sorrow: though you form a party among men mighty in the state, you know not whether on their account you will be exiled from the state. Those who think that these matters are wholly within the grasp of the human mind and nothing in them is beyond our reason, they, he said, are the irrational ones, just as it is no less irrational to use divination in matters which human beings are permitted by the gods to decide for themselves through knowledge: to ask, for instance, Is it better to get an experienced coachman to drive my carriage or a man without experience?2 Is it better to get an experienced seaman to steer my ship or a man without experience? So too with what we may know by reckoning, measurement or weighing. To put such questions to the gods was, to his mind, to act improperly. In short, what the gods have granted us to do by help of learning, we must learn; what is hidden from mortals we should try to find out from the gods by divination: for to those in their favor the gods give signals.

Moreover, Socrates lived ever in the open; for early in the morning he went to the public promenades and training grounds; in the forenoon he was seen in the market; and the rest of the day he passed just where most people were to be met: he was generally talking, and anyone might listen. Yet none ever knew him to offend against piety and religion in deed or word. He did not even discuss that topic so favored by other talkers, "the nature of the 10

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Cyr. 1.6.6.

τῶν ἄλλων οἱ πλεῖστοι διελένετο σκοπῶν, ὅπως ὁ καλούμενος ύπὸ τῶν σοφιστῶν κόσμος ἔφυ καὶ τίσιν άνάγκαις ξκαστα γίγνεται των οὐρανίων, άλλὰ καὶ τοὺς Φροντίζοντας τὰ τοιαῦτα μωραίνοντας ἀπεδείκυυε, καὶ πρώτον μὲν αὐτών ἐσκόπει πότερά ποτε νομίσαντες ίκανως ήδη τάνθρώπινα είδέναι έρχονται έπὶ τὸ περὶ τῶν τοιούτων Φροντίζειν ἢ τὰ μὲν ἀνθρώπεια παρέντες, τὰ δαιμόνια δὲ σκοποῦντες ἡγοῦνται τὰ προσήκοντα πράττειν. ἐθαύμαζε δ' εἰ μὴ φανερὸν αὐτοῖς ἐστιν, ὅτι ταῦτα οὐ δυνατόν ἐστιν ἀνθρώποις εύρειν έπει και τους μέγιστον φρονούντας έπι τω περὶ τούτων λέγειν οὐ ταὐτὰ δοξάζειν ἀλλήλοις, ἀλλὰ τοίς μαινομένοις όμοίως διακείσθαι πρὸς ἀλλήλους. τῶν τε γὰρ μαινομένων τοὺς μὲν οὐδὲ τὰ δεινὰ δεδιέναι, τοὺς δὲ καὶ τὰ μὴ φοβερὰ φοβεῖσθαι καὶ τοῖς μεν οὐδ' ἐν ὄχλω δοκείν αἰσχρον εἶναι λέγειν ἢ ποιείν ότιοῦν, τοῖς δὲ οὐδ' ἐξιτητέον εἰς ἀνθρώπους εἶναι δοκείν καὶ τοὺς μὲν οὔθ' ἱερὸν οὔτε βωμὸν οὔτ' ἄλλο τῶν θείων οὐδὲν τιμᾶν, τοὺς δὲ καὶ λίθους καὶ ξύλα τὰ τυχόντα καὶ θηρία σέβεσθαι τῶν τε περὶ τῆς τῶν πάντων φύσεως μεριμνώντων τοῖς μὲν δοκεῖν εν μόνον τὸ ὂν εἶναι, τοῖς δ' ἄπειρα τὸ πληθος καὶ τοῖς μὲν άεὶ πάντα κινεῖσθαι, τοῖς δ' οὐδὲν ἄν ποτε κινηθῆναι. καὶ τοῖς μὲν πάντα γίγνεσθαί τε καὶ ἀπόλλυσθαι, τοίς δὲ οὕτ' ἄν γενέσθαι ποτὲ οὐδὲν οὕτε ἀπολείσθαι.1 έσκόπει δὲ περὶ αὐτῶν καὶ τάδε, ἆρ' ὥσπερ οἱ τάν-

15

12

13

 $<sup>\</sup>frac{1}{a} \vec{a} \pi o \lambda \epsilon \sigma \theta a \iota$  Stobaeus

#### MEMORABILIA I. 1.11-1.15

universe": and avoided speculation on the so-called Cosmos of the sophists, how it works, and on the laws that govern the phenomena of the heavens: indeed he would demonstrate that to trouble one's mind with such problems is sheer folly.<sup>3</sup> In the first place, he would inquire, did these thinkers suppose that their knowledge of human affairs was so complete that they must seek these new fields for the exercise of their brains; or that it was their duty to neglect human affairs and consider only things divine? Moreover, he marveled at their blindness in not seeing that man cannot solve these riddles; since even the most conceited talkers on these problems did not agree in their theories, but behaved to one another like madmen. As some madmen have no fear of danger and others are afraid where there is nothing to be afraid of, as some will do or say anything in a crowd with no sense of shame, while others shrink even from going abroad among men, some respect neither temple nor altar nor any other sacred thing, others worship stones or pieces of wood or wild animals, so is it, he said, with those who worry about the nature of the universe. Some hold that What is is one, others that it is infinite in number: some that all things are in perpetual motion, others that nothing can ever be moved at any time: some that all life is birth and decay, others that nothing could ever have been born or will ever perish. Nor were those the only questions he asked about such theorists. Students of human nature, he said, think

<sup>3</sup> Cf. Pl. Ap. 18b, 19c, though Socrates had pursued such studies before abandoning them: 4.7.5, Ar. Clouds, Pl. Phaedo 96a, Cic. Tusc. 5.4.10, D. L. 2.16.

12

13

14

θρώπεια μανθάνοντες ἡγοῦνται τοῦθ' ὅ τι αν μάθωσιν έαυτοῖς τε καὶ τῶν ἄλλων ὅτῷ αν βούλωνται ποιήσειν, οὕτω καὶ οἱ τὰ θεῖα ζητοῦντες νομίζουσιν, ἐπειδὰν γνῶσιν, αις ἀνάγκαις ἔκαστα γίγνεται, ποιήσειν, ὅταν βούλωνται, καὶ ἀνέμους καὶ ὕδατα καὶ ὥρας καὶ ὅτου αν ἄλλου δέωνται τῶν τοιούτων, ἢ τοιοῦτο μὲν οὐδὲν οὐδ' ἐλπίζουσιν, ἀρκεῖ δ' αὐτοῖς γνῶναι μόνον, ἢ τῶν τοιούτων ἔκαστα γίγνεται.

Περὶ μὲν οὖν τῶν ταῦτα πραγματευομένων τοιαῦτα ἔλεγεν αὐτὸς δὲ περὶ τῶν ἀνθρωπίνων ἀεὶ διελέγετο σκοπῶν, τί εὐσεβές, τί ἀσεβές, τί καλόν, τί αἰσχρόν, τί δίκαιον, τί ἄδικον, τί σωφροσύνη, τί μανία, τί ἀνδρεία, τί δειλία, τί πόλις, τί πολιτικός, τί ἀρχὴ ἀνθρώπων, τί ἀρχικὸς ἀνθρώπων, καὶ περὶ τῶν ἄλλων, ἃ τοὺς μὲν εἰδότας ἡγεῖτο καλοὺς κἀγαθοὺς εἶναι, τοὺς δ᾽ ἀγνοοῦντας ἀνδραποδώδεις ἃν δικαίως κεκλῆσθαι.

17 Όσα μὲν οὖν μὴ φανερὸς ἦν ὅπως ἐγίγνωσκεν, οὐδὲν θαυμαστὸν ὑπὲρ τούτων περὶ αὐτοῦ παραγνῶναι τοὺς δικαστάς· ὅσα δὲ πάντες ἤδεσαν, οὐ θαυμα18 στὸν εἰ μὴ τούτων ἐνεθυμήθησαν; βουλεύσας γάρ ποτε καὶ τὸν βουλευτικὸν ὅρκον ὀμόσας, ἐν ῷ ἦν κατὰ τοὺς νόμους βουλεύσειν, ἐπιστάτης ἐν τῷ δήμῳ γενόμενος, ἐπιθυμήσαντος τοῦ δήμου παρὰ τοὺς νόμους ἐννέα στρατηγοὺς μιᾳ ψήφῳ τοὺς ἀμφὶ Θράσυλλον καὶ Ἐρασινίδην ἀποκτεῖναι πάντας, οὐκ ἠθέλησεν ἐπιψηφίσαι, ὀργιζομένου μὲν αὐτῷ τοῦ δήμου, πολ-

# MEMORABILIA I. 1.15-1.18

that they will apply their knowledge in due course for the good of themselves and any others they choose. Do those who pry into heavenly phenomena imagine that, once they have discovered the laws by which these are produced, they will create at their will winds, waters, seasons and such things to their need? Or have they no such expectation but are satisfied merely to know the causes of these various phenomena?

Such, then, was his criticism of those who meddle with these matters. His own conversation was ever of human matters, investigating what is pious, what is impious; what is beautiful, what is ugly; what is just, what is unjust; what is prudence, what is madness; what is courage, what is cowardice; what is a state, what is a statesman; what is government, and what is a governor—these and others like them, knowledge of which made a gentleman, in his opinion, while ignorance could fairly be called slavishness.

So, in pronouncing on opinions of his that were unknown to them it is not surprising that the jury erred: but is it not astonishing that they should have ignored matters of common knowledge? For instance, when he was on the Council and had taken the counselor's oath by which he bound himself to give counsel in accordance with the laws, it fell to his lot to preside in the Assembly when the people wanted to execute nine generals, Thrasyllus and Erasinides and their colleagues, by a single vote. That was illegal, and he refused the motion in spite of popular ran-

<sup>4</sup> This chapter is revised and augmented below, 4.6; for Socratic definitions cf. Arist. *Metaph.* 1078b27.

16

17

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> In 406, after the battle of Arginusae: X. H. 1.6-7.

λῶν δὲ καὶ δυνατῶν ἀπειλούντων ἀλλὰ περὶ πλείονος ἐποιήσατο εὐορκεῖν ἢ χαρίσασθαι τῷ δήμῷ παρὰ τὸ δίκαιον καὶ φυλάξασθαι τοὺς ἀπειλοῦντας. καὶ γὰρ ἐπιμελεῖσθαι θεοὺς ἐνόμιζεν ἀνθρώπων οὐχ ὃν τρόπον οἱ πολλοὶ νομίζουσιν οὖτοι μὲν γὰρ οἴονται τοὺς θεοὺς τὰ μὲν εἰδέναι, τὰ δ' οὐκ εἰδέναι Σωκράτης δὲ πάντα μὲν ἡγεῖτο θεοὺς εἰδέναι, τά τε λεγόμενα καὶ πραττόμενα καὶ τὰ σιγῆ βουλευόμενα, πανταχοῦ δὲ παρεῖναι καὶ σημαίνειν τοῖς ἀνθρώποις περὶ τῶν ἀνθρωπείων πάντων.

Θαυμάζω οὖν, ὅπως ποτὲ ἐπείσθησαν ᾿Αθηναῖοι Σωκράτην περὶ τοὺς θεοὺς μὴ σωφρονεῖν, τὸν ἀσεβὲς μὲν οὐδέν ποτε περὶ θεοὺς οὔτ᾽ εἰπόντα οὔτε πράξαντα, τοιαῦτα δὲ καὶ λέγοντα καὶ πράττοντα περὶ θεῶν, οἶά τις ἂν καὶ λέγων καὶ πράττων εἴη τε καὶ νομίζοιτο εὐσεβέστατος.

2. Θαυμαστὸν δὲ φαίνεταί μοι καὶ τὸ πεισθηναί τινας, ὡς Σωκράτης τοὺς νέους διέφθειρεν, ὃς πρὸς τοῦς εἰρημένοις πρῶτον μὲν ἀφροδισίων καὶ γαστρὸς πάντων ἀνθρώπων ἐγκρατέστατος ἢν, εἶτα πρὸς χειμῶνα καὶ θέρος καὶ πάντας πόνους καρτερικώτατος, ἔτι δὲ πρὸς τὸ μετρίων δεῖσθαι πεπαιδευμένος οὕτως, ὥστε πάνυ μικρὰ κεκτημένος πάνυ ῥαδίως ἔχειν ἀρκοῦντα. πῶς οὖν αὐτὸς ὢν τοιοῦτος ἄλλους ἂν ἢ ἀσεβεῖς ἢ παρανόμους ἢ λίχνους ἢ ἀφροδισίων ἀκρατεῖς ἢ πρὸς τὸ πονεῖν μαλακοὺς ἐποίησεν; ἀλλ' ἔπαυσε μὲν τούτων πολλούς, ἀρετῆς ποιήσας ἐπιθυμεῖν καὶ ἐλπίδας παρασχών, ἂν ἑαυτῶν ἐπιμελῶνται, καλοὺς

# MEMORABILIA I. 1.18-2.2

cor and the threats of many powerful persons. It was more to him that he should keep his oath than that he should humor the people in an unjust demand and shield himself from threats. For like most people he believed that the gods have a care for humankind, but with an important difference: whereas they think that the gods know about some things but not others, Socrates thought that they know all things, our words and deeds and secret purposes; that they are present everywhere, and send signals to humans about all that concerns humankind.<sup>6</sup>

So I wonder how the Athenians were ever persuaded that Socrates was a maverick as regards the gods, when he never said or did anything irreverent regarding gods, and his words and behavior regarding gods were the words and behavior of one who is, and is acknowledged to be, truly pious.

2. No less wonderful is it to me that some were convinced that Socrates corrupted the young men. In the first place, apart from what I have said, in control of his lusts and appetite he was the strongest of all men; further, in endurance of cold<sup>7</sup> and heat and every kind of toil he was most resolute; and besides, his needs were so schooled to moderation that having very little he was yet very content. Such was his own character: how then can he have made others impious, criminal, gluttonous, lustful, or soft? On the contrary, he cured these vices in many, by putting into them a desire for goodness, and by giving them confidence

19

20

<sup>6 1.4.15, 1.4.18, 4.3.2</sup> ff.; Cyr. 1.6.46.

 $<sup>^{7}</sup>$  Referring to the battle of Potidaea in 432, cf. Pl. Smp. 219e ff.

κάγαθοὺς ἔσεσθαι. καίτοι γε οὐδεπώποτε ὑπέσχετο 3 διδάσκαλος είναι τούτου, άλλὰ τῶ φανερὸς είναι τοιοῦτος ὢν ἐλπίζειν ἐποίει τοὺς συνδιατρίβοντας ἑαυτῷ μιμουμένους έκεινον τοιούτους γενήσεσθαι. άλλα μην καὶ τοῦ σώματος αὐτός τε οὐκ ἡμέλει τούς τ' ἀμελοῦντας οὐκ ἐπήνει. τὸ μὲν οὖν ὑπερεσθίοντα ὑπερπονεῖν άπεδοκίμαζε, τὸ δὲ ὅσα γ' ἡδέως ἡ ψυχὴ δέχεται, ταῦτα ἱκανῶς ἐκπονεῖν ἐδοκίμαζε, ταύτην γὰρ τὴν έξιν ύγιεινήν τε ίκανως είναι καὶ τὴν τῆς ψυχῆς ἐπιμέλειαν οὐκ ἐμποδίζειν ἔφη, ἀλλ' οὐ μὴν θρυπτικός γε οὐδὲ ἀλαζονικὸς ἦν οὕτ' ἀμπεχόνη οὔθ' ὑποδέσει οὔτε τῆ ἄλλη διαίτη, οὐ μὴν οὐδ' ἐρασιχρημάτους γε τοὺς συνόντας ἐποίει. τῶν μὲν γὰρ ἄλλων ἐπιθυμιῶν έπαυε, τοὺς δὲ έαυτοῦ ἐπιθυμοῦντας οὐκ ἐπράττετο χρήματα. τούτου δ' ἀπεχόμενος ἐνόμιζεν ἐλευθερίας έπιμελείσθαι τοὺς δὲ λαμβάνοντας τῆς ὁμιλίας μισθον ανδραποδιστάς έαυτων απεκάλει δια το αναγκαῖον αὐτοῖς εἶναι διαλέγεσθαι παρ' ὧν ἂν λάβοιεν τὸν μισθόν, ἐθαύμαζε δ', εί τις ἀρετὴν ἐπαγγελλόμενος ἀργύριον πράττοιτο καὶ μὴ νομίζοι τὸ μέγιστον κέρδος έξειν φίλον ἀγαθὸν κτησάμενος, ἀλλὰ φοβοίτο μὴ ὁ γενόμενος καλὸς κάγαθὸς τῶ τὰ μέγιστα εὐεργετήσαντι μὴ τὴν μεγίστην χάριν έξοι. Σωκράτης δὲ ἐπηγγείλατο μὲν οὐδενὶ πώποτε τοιοῦτον οὐδέν, έπίστευε δὲ τῶν συνόντων ξαυτῷ τοὺς ἀποδεξαμένους άπερ αὐτὸς έδοκίμαζεν εἰς τὸν πάντα βίον έαυτῶ τε καὶ ἀλλήλοις φίλους ἀγαθοὺς ἔσεσθαι. πῶς ἂν οὖν ὁ τοιούτος άνηρ διαφθείροι τούς νέους; εί μη άρα ή της άρετης ἐπιμέλεια διαφθορά ἐστιν.

#### MEMORABILIA I. 2.3-2.8

that self-discipline would make them gentlemen. To be sure he never professed to teach this, but by letting his own light shine, he led his disciples to hope that through imitation of him they would develop likewise. Furthermore, he himself never neglected his body and reproved such neglect in others. Thus overeating followed by overexertion he disapproved, but he approved of taking as much hard exercise as is agreeable to the soul:8 for the habit not only insured good health, but did not hamper the care of the soul. On the other hand, he disliked fopperv and pretentiousness in the fashion of clothes or shoes or in behavior. Nor, again, did he encourage love of money in his associates. For while he checked their other desires, he would not make money himself out of their desire for his companionship. He held that this self-denying ordinance insured his independence, whereas those who charged a fee for their society he denounced for selling themselves into slavery, since they were bound to converse with all from whom they could take the fee. He marveled that anyone who professed to teach virtue should charge a fee, failing to reflect that his highest reward would be the gain of a good friend and fearing that he who became a true gentleman would not feel deep gratitude for a benefit so great. Socrates indeed never promised any such thing to anyone; but he was confident that those of his associates who adopted his principles of conduct would throughout life be good friends to him and to one another. How, then, should such a man "corrupt the young men"? Unless perhaps it is corruption to foster virtue.

5

<sup>8</sup> Cyr. 1.6.17.

Άλλὰ νὴ Δία, ὁ κατήγορος ἔφη, ὑπερορᾶν ἐποίει 9 των καθεστώτων νόμων τους συνόντας λέγων, ώς μώρον είη τοὺς μὲν τῆς πόλεως ἄρχοντας ἀπὸ κυάμου καθιστάναι, κυβερνήτη δὲ μηδένα θέλειν χρησθαι κυαμευτώ μηδε τέκτονι μηδ' αὐλητη μηδ' έπ' ἄλλα τοιαῦτα, ἃ πολλῶ ἐλάττονας βλάβας ἁμαρτανόμενα ποιεί τῶν περὶ τὴν πόλιν ἁμαρτανομένων τοὺς δὲ τοιούτους λόγους ἐπαίρειν ἔφη τοὺς νέους καταφρονείν της καθεστώσης πολιτείας καὶ ποιείν βιαίους. έγω δ' 10 οίμαι τοὺς Φρόνησιν ἀσκοῦντας καὶ νομίζοντας ίκανοὺς ἔσεσθαι τὰ συμφέροντα διδάσκειν τοὺς πολίτας ήκιστα γίγνεσθαι βιαίους, είδότας, ὅτι τῆ μὲν βία πρόσεισιν έχθραι καὶ κίνδυνοι, διὰ δὲ τοῦ πείθειν άκινδύνως τε καὶ μετὰ φιλίας ταὐτὰ γίγνεται, οί μὲν γὰρ βιασθέντες ὡς ἀφαιρεθέντες μισοῦσιν, οἱ δὲ πεισθέντες ώς κεχαρισμένοι φιλοῦσιν. οὔκουν τῶν φρόνησιν ἀσκούντων τὸ βιάζεσθαι, ἀλλὰ τῶν ἰσχὺν άνευ γνώμης έχόντων τὰ τοιαῦτα πράττειν έστίν. άλλὰ μὴν καὶ συμμάχων ὁ μὲν βιάζεσθαι τολμῶν 11 δέοιτ' αν ούκ όλίγων, ό δὲ πείθειν δυνάμενος οὐδενός. καὶ γὰρ μόνος ἡγοῖτ' ἂν δύνασθαι πείθειν. καὶ φονεύειν δε τοις τοιούτοις ήκιστα συμβαίνει τίς γάρ άποκτειναί τινα βούλοιτ' αν μαλλον η ζωντι πειθομένω χρησθαι:

#### MEMORABILIA I. 2.9-2.12

But, said his accuser, he taught his companions to despise the established laws by calling it folly to appoint public officials by lot, when none would choose a pilot or builder or piper by lot, nor any other craftsman for work in which mistakes are far less disastrous than mistakes in statecraft. Such talk, he argued, led the young to despise the established constitution and made them violent. But I hold<sup>9</sup> that they who cultivate prudence and think they will be able to guide the people in expedient policy never lapse into violence: they know that enmities and dangers are inseparable from violence, but persuasion produces the same results safely and amicably. For violence, by making its victims sensible of loss, excites their hatred: but persuasion, by seeming to confer a favor, wins goodwill. It is not, then, cultivation of prudence that leads to violent methods, but the possession of power without thought. Besides, many supporters are necessary to him who ventures to use force: but he who can persuade needs no confederate, having confidence in his own unaided power of persuasion. And such a man has no occasion to shed blood: for who would rather take a man's life than have a live and willing follower?

But, his accuser argued, having become associates of Socrates Critias<sup>10</sup> and Alcibiades<sup>11</sup> did a great deal of harm

<sup>9</sup> Cyr. 1.4.21.
 <sup>10</sup> A cousin of Plato's mother, a friend of Alcibiades since youth (Pl. Prt.), a sophistic writer and thinker, and a prominent member of the "Thirty Tyrants" in 404–403 (X. H. 2.3.15 ff.).
 <sup>11</sup> The dashing and talented protégé of Pericles, to whom he was related on his mother's side, had a tumultuous career that brought Athens both benefit and harm; his relationship with Socrates is memorably portrayed in Pl. Smp.

πόλιν ἐποιησάτην. Κριτίας μὲν γὰρ τῶν ἐν τῆ ὀλιγαρχία πάντων πλεονεκτίστατός τε καὶ βιαιότατος έγενετο, Άλκιβιάδης δὲ αὖ τῶν ἐν τῆ δημοκρατία πάντων άκρατέστατός τε καὶ ύβριστότατος, έγω δ', εἰ μέν τι 13 κακὸν ἐκείνω τὴν πόλιν ἐποιησάτην, οὐκ ἀπολογήσομαι την δέ προς Σωκράτην συνουσίαν αὐτοῖν ώς ἐγένετο διηγήσομαι. έγενέσθην μεν γαρ δη τω άνδρε 14 τούτω φύσει φιλοτιμοτάτω πάντων Άθηναίων βουλομένω τε πάντα δι' έαυτῶν πράττεσθαι καὶ πάντων ονομαστοτάτω γενέσθαι. ήδεσαν δε Σωκράτην απ' έλαχίστων μέν χρημάτων αὐταρκέστατα ζώντα, τών ήδονων δὲ πασων ἐγκρατέστατον ὄντα, τοῖς δὲ διαλεγομένοις αὐτῷ πᾶσι χρώμενον ἐν τοῖς λόγοις ὅπως βούλοιτο, ταῦτα δὲ ὁρῶντε καὶ ὄντε οἵω προείρησθον, 15 πότερόν τις αὐτὼ φῆ τοῦ βίου τοῦ Σωκράτους ἐπιθυμήσαντε καὶ τῆς σωφροσύνης, ἡν ἐκεῖνος εἶχεν, ὀρέξασθαι τῆς ὁμιλίας αὐτοῦ ἢ νομίσαντε, εἰ ὁμιλησαίτην ἐκείνω, γενέσθαι ἂν ἱκανωτάτω λέγειν τε καὶ πράττειν; έγω μεν γαρ ήγουμαι, θεού διδόντος αὐτοις 16 η ζην όλον τὸν βίον ὥσπερ ζῶντα Σωκράτην έώρων ἢ τεθνάναι, έλέσθαι ἂν αὐτὼ μᾶλλον τεθνάναι. δήλω δ' έγενέσθην έξ ὧν έπραξάτην ώς γὰρ τάχιστα κρείττονε τῶν συγγιγνομένων ἡγησάσθην εἶναι, εὐθὺς άποπηδήσαντε Σωκράτους ἐπραττέτην τὰ πολιτικά, ὧνπερ ἔνεκα Σωκράτους ώρεχθήτην.

Ίσως οὖν εἴποι τις ἃν πρὸς ταῦτα, ὅτι ἐχρῆν τὸν Σωκράτην μὴ πρότερον τὰ πολιτικὰ διδάσκειν τοὺς συνόντας ἢ σωφρονεῖν. ἐγὰ δὲ πρὸς τοῦτο μὲν οὐκ

#### MEMORABILIA I. 2.12-2.17

to the state. For Critias, of all involved in the oligarchy, bore the palm for greed and violence, while Alcibiades exceeded all in licentiousness and arrogance under the democracy. Now I have no intention of excusing the wrong these two did the state; but I will explain how they came to be with Socrates. Ambition was the very lifeblood of both: no Athenian was ever like them. They were eager to get control of everything and to outstrip every rival in celebrity. They knew that Socrates was living on very little. and yet was wholly independent; that he was strictly moderate in all his pleasures; and that in argument he could do what he liked with all who conversed with him. Seeing this and being such men as I have indicated, is it to be supposed that these two wanted to adopt the simple life of Socrates, and with this object in view sought his society? Did they not rather think that by associating with him they would attain the utmost proficiency in speech and action? For my part I believe that, had heaven granted them the choice between the life they saw Socrates leading and death, they would rather have died. Their conduct revealed their purpose; for as soon as they thought themselves superior to their fellow disciples they sprang away from Socrates and took to politics; it was for political ends that they had wanted Socrates.

But it may be answered: Socrates should have taught his companions self-control before politics. I do not deny it; but I find that all teachers show their disciples how they

**y** 

17

13

14

15

ἀντιλέγω· πάντας δὲ τοὺς διδάσκοντας ὁρῶ αὐτοὺς δεικνύντας τε τοῖς μανθάνουσιν, ἢπερ αὐτοὶ ποιοῦσιν ἃ διδάσκουσι, καὶ τῷ λόγῳ προσβιβάζοντας. οἶδα δὲ καὶ Σωκράτην δεικνύντα τοῖς συνοῦσιν ἑαυτὸν καλὸν κἀγαθὸν ὄντα καὶ διαλεγόμενον κάλλιστα περὶ ἀρετῆς καὶ τῶν ἄλλων ἀνθρωπίνων. οἶδα δὲ κἀκείνω σωφρονοῦντε, ἔστε Σωκράτει συνήστην, οὐ φοβουμένω, μὴ ζημιοῖντο ἢ παίοιντο ὑπὸ Σωκράτους, ἀλλ' οἰομένω τότε κράτιστον εἶναι τοῦτο πράττειν.

Ἰσως οὖν εἴποιεν ἂν πολλοὶ τῶν φασκόντων φιλοσοφεῖν, ὅτι οὐκ ἄν ποτε ὁ δίκαιος ἄδικος γένοιτο οὐδὲ ὁ σώφρων ὑβριστὴς οὐδὲ ἄλλο οὐδὲν ὧν μάθησίς ἐστιν ὁ μαθὼν ἀνεπιστήμων ἄν ποτε γένοιτο. ἐγὼ δὲ περὶ τούτων οὐχ οὕτω γιγνώσκω· ὁρῶ γὰρ ὥσπερ τὰ τοῦ σώματος ἔργα τοὺς μὴ τὰ σώματα ἀσκοῦντας οὐ δυναμένους ποιεῖν, οὕτω καὶ τὰ τῆς ψυχῆς ἔργα τοὺς μὴ τὴν ψυχὴν ἀσκοῦντας οὐ δυναμένους· οὕτε ῷν δεῖ ἀπέχεσθαι δύνανται. διὸ καὶ τοὺς υἱεῖς οἱ πατέρες, κἂν ὧσι σώφρονες, ὅμως ἀπὸ τῶν πονηρῶν ἀνθρώπων εἴργουσιν, ὡς τὴν μὲν τῶν χρηστῶν ὁμιλίαν ἄσκησιν οὖσαν τῆς ἀρετῆς, τὴν δὲ τῶν πονηρῶν κατάλυσιν. μαρτυρεῖ δὲ καὶ τῶν ποιητῶν ὅ τε λέγων,

έσθλων μεν γαρ ἀπ' έσθλα διδάξεαι ἢν δε κακοίσι συμμίσγης, ἀπολείς καὶ τὸν ἐόντα νόον

18

19

# MEMORABILIA I. 2.17-2.20

themselves practice what they teach, and persuade them by argument. And I know that it was so with Socrates: he showed his companions that he was a gentleman himself, and talked most excellently of goodness and of all things that concern human life. I know further that even those two controlled themselves so long as they were with Socrates, not from fear of fine or blow, but because at that time they believed it was the best way to behave.

18

But many self-styled philosophers may reply: A just man can never become unjust; a prudent man can never become wanton; in fact no one having learned any kind of knowledge can become ignorant of it. I do not hold with this view. I notice that as those who do not train the body cannot perform the functions proper to the body, so those who do not train the soul cannot perform the functions of the soul: for they cannot do what they ought to do nor avoid what they ought not to do. That is why fathers try to keep their sons, even if they are well behaved, out of bad company: for the society of honest men is a training in virtue, but the society of the bad is virtue's undoing. As one of the poets says:

19

From the good shall you learn good things; but if you mingle with the bad you shall lose even what wisdom you have. $^{12}$ 

...

20

12 Theognidea 34-35.

καὶ ὁ λέγων,

αὐτὰρ ἀνὴρ ἀγαθὸς τοτὲ μὲν κακός, ἄλλοτε δ' ἐσθλός.

Κάγὼ δὲ μαρτυρῶ τούτοις όρῶ γὰρ ὥσπερ τῶν ἐν 21 μέτρω πεποιημένων έπων τοὺς μη μελετώντας έπιλανθανομένους, ούτω καὶ τῶν διδασκαλικῶν λόγων τοῖς άμελοῦσι λήθην έγγιγνομένην. ὅταν δὲ τῶν νουθετικῶν λόγων ἐπιλάθηταί τις, ἐπιλέλησται καὶ ὧν ἡ ψυχὴ πάσχουσα τῆς σωφροσύνης ἐπεθύμει τούτων δ' ἐπιλαθόμενον οὐδὲν θαυμαστὸν καὶ τῆς σωφροσύνης ἐπιλαθέσθαι. ὁρῶ δὲ καὶ τοὺς εἰς φιλοποσίαν 22 προαχθέντας καὶ τοὺς εἰς ἔρωτας έγκυλισθέντας ήττον δυναμένους τῶν τε δεόντων ἐπιμελεῖσθαι καὶ τῶν μη δεόντων ἀπέχεσθαι, πολλοί γὰρ καὶ χρημάτων δυνάμενοι φείδεσθαι, πρίν έραν, έρασθέντες οὐκέτι δύνανται καὶ τὰ χρήματα καταναλώσαντες ὧν πρόσθεν ἀπείχοντο κερδών, αἰσχρὰ νομίζοντες εἶναι, τούτων οὐκ ἀπέχονται. πῶς οὖν οὐκ ἐνδέχεται σωφρο-23 νήσαντας πρόσθεν αὖθις μὴ σωφρονεῖν καὶ δίκαια δυνηθέντας πράττειν αὖθις άδυνατεῖν: πάντα μὲν οὖν έμοιγε δοκεί τὰ καλὰ καὶ τάγαθὰ ἀσκητὰ εἶναι, οὐχ ήκιστα δὲ σωφροσύνη, ἐν γὰρ τῷ αὐτῷ σώματι συμπεφυτευμέναι τῆ ψυχῆ αἱ ἡδοναὶ πείθουσιν αὐτὴν μὴ σωφρονείν, άλλὰ τὴν ταχίστην έαυταίς τε καὶ τῷ σώματι χαρίζεσθαι.

Καὶ Κριτίας δὴ καὶ ἀλκιβιάδης ἔως μὲν Σωκράτει συνήστην, ἐδυνάσθην ἐκείνῳ χρωμένω συμμάχῳ τῶν μὴ καλῶν ἐπιθυμιῶν κρατεῖν ἐκείνου δ' ἀπαλλαγέντε

#### MEMORABILIA I. 2.20-2.24

# And another says:

Ah, but a good man is at one time noble, at another hase  $^{13}$ 

My testimony agrees with theirs; for I see that, just as 21 poetry is forgotten unless it is often repeated, so instruction, when no longer heeded, fades from the mind. To forget good counsel is to forget the experiences that prompted the soul to desire self-control: and when those words are forgotten, it is not surprising that self-control itself is forgotten. I see also that men who take to drink or 22 get involved in love affairs lose the power of caring about right conduct and avoiding wrong. For many who are careful with their money no sooner fall in love than they begin to waste it: and when they have spent it all, they no longer shrink from making more by methods which they formerly avoided because they thought them disgraceful. How then 23 can it be impossible for one who was self-controlled to lose his self-control, for one who was capable of just action to become incapable? To me indeed it seems that whatever is honorable, whatever is good in conduct is the result of training, and that this is especially true of self-control. For in the same body along with the soul are planted the pleasures which call to her: "Abandon self-control, and make haste to gratify us and the body."

And indeed it was thus with Critias and Alcibiades. So long as they were with Socrates, they found in him an ally who gave them strength to conquer their base passions.

<sup>13</sup> Elegiaca adespota 2 West.

Κριτίας μεν φυγών είς Θετταλίαν έκει συνήν ανθρώποις ἀνομία μᾶλλον ἢ δικαιοσύνη χρωμένοις, Άλκιβιάδης δ' αὖ διὰ μὲν κάλλος ὑπὸ πολλῶν καὶ σεμνῶν γυναικών θηρώμενος, διὰ δύναμιν δὲ τὴν ἐν τῆ πόλει καὶ τοῖς συμμάχοις ὑπὸ πολλῶν καὶ δυνατῶν [κολακεύειν] ανθρώπων διαθρυπτόμενος, ύπὸ δὲ τοῦ δήμου τιμώμενος καὶ ραδίως πρωτεύων, ώσπερ οἱ τῶν γυμνικῶν ἀγώνων ἀθληταὶ ῥαδίως πρωτεύοντες ἀμελοῦσι της ασκήσεως, ούτω κακείνος ημέλησεν αύτου, τοιούτων δὲ συμβάντων αὐτοῖν καὶ ώγκωμένω μὲν ἐπὶ γένει, έπηρμένω δ' έπὶ πλούτω, πεφυσημένω δ' έπὶ δυνάμει, διατεθρυμμένω δε ύπο πολλών ανθρώπων, έπὶ δὲ πᾶσι τούτοις διεφθαρμένω καὶ πολύν χρόνον ἀπὸ Σωκράτους γεγονότε τί θαυμαστὸν εἰ ὑπερηφάνω έγενέσθην; εἶτα εἰ μέν τι ἐπλημμελησάτην, τούτου Σωκράτην ὁ κατήγορος αἰτιᾶται: ὅτι δὲ νέω ὄντε αὐτώ, ἡνίκα καὶ ἀγνωμονεστάτω καὶ ἀκρατεστάτω είκὸς είναι, Σωκράτης παρέσχε σώφρονε, οὐδενὸς έπαίνου δοκεί τῷ κατηγόρῳ ἄξιος εἶναι; οὐ μὴν τά γε άλλα ούτω κρίνεται. τίς μέν γὰρ αὐλητής, τίς δὲ κιθαριστής, τίς δὲ ἄλλος διδάσκαλος ίκανοὺς ποιήσας τοὺς μαθητάς, ἐὰν πρὸς ἄλλους ἐλθόντες χείρους φανῶσιν, αἰτίαν ἔχει τούτου; τίς δὲ πατήρ, ἐὰν ὁ παῖς αὐτοῦ συνδιατρίβων τω σωφρονή, ὕστερον δὲ ἄλλω τω συγγενόμενος πονηρός γένηται, τὸν πρόσθεν αἰτιᾶται, ἀλλ' οὐχ ὅσω ἂν παρὰ τῷ ὑστέρω χείρων φαίνηται, τοσούτω μᾶλλον ἐπαινεῖ τὸν πρότερον; ἀλλ' οί γε πατέρες αὐτοὶ συνόντες τοῖς υἱέσι, τῶν παίδων

25

26

#### MEMORABILIA I 2.24-2.27

But when they parted from him, Critias fled to Thessaly and began to associate with men who put lawlessness before justice; while Alcibiades, on account of his beauty, was hunted by many great ladies, and because of his influence at Athens and among her allies he was spoiled by many powerful men: and as athletes who gain an easy victory in the games are apt to neglect their training, so the honor in which he was held, the cheap triumph he won with the people, led him to neglect himself. Such was their fortune: and when to pride of birth, confidence in wealth, vainglory and much yielding to temptation were added corruption and long separation from Socrates, what wonder if they grew overbearing? For their wrongdoing, then, is Socrates to be called to account by his accuser? And does he deserve no word of praise for having controlled them in the days of their youth, when they would naturally be most reckless and licentious? Other cases, at least, are not so judged. For what piper or citharist or any other teacher, after making his pupils proficient, is blamed if they leave him for another teacher and then become less proficient? What father, whose son bears a good character so long as he is with one teacher but goes wrong after he has attached himself to another, throws the blame on the earlier teacher? Is it not true that the worse the boy turns out with the second, the higher is his father's praise of the first? Indeed fathers themselves, living with their sons, are

25

26

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> del. Musurus

πλημμελούντων, οὐκ αἰτίαν ἔχουσιν, ἐὰν αὐτοὶ σωφρονῶσιν. οὕτω δὲ καὶ Σωκράτην δίκαιον ἢν κρίνειν εἰ μὲν αὐτὸς ἐποίει τι φαῦλον, εἰκότως ἃν ἐδόκει πονηρὸς εἶναι εἰ δ' αὐτὸς σωφρονῶν διετέλει, πῶς ἂν δικαίως τῆς οὐκ ἐνούσης αὐτῷ κακίας αἰτίαν ἔχοι;

Άλλ' εἰ καὶ μηδὲν αὐτὸς πονηρὸν ποιῶν ἐκείνους φαῦλα πράττοντας ὁρῶν ἐπήνει, δικαίως ἂν ἐπιτιμῶτο. Κριτίαν μὲν τοίνυν αἰσθανόμενος ἐρῶντα Εὐθυδήμου καὶ πειρώντα χρησθαι καθάπερ οἱ πρὸς τάφροδίσια τῶν σωμάτων ἀπολαύοντες, ἀπέτρεπε φάσκων ἀνελεύθερόν τε εἶναι καὶ οὐ πρέπον ἀνδρὶ καλῶ κάγαθῶ τὸν ἐρώμενον, ὧ βούλεται πολλοῦ ἄξιος φαίνεσθαι, προσαιτείν ώσπερ τους πτωχούς ίκετεύοντα καὶ δεόμενον προσδοῦναι, καὶ ταῦτα μηδενὸς ἀγαθοῦ. τοῦ δὲ Κριτίου τοῖς τοιούτοις οὐχ ὑπακούοντος οὐδὲ άποτρεπομένου, λέγεται τὸν Σωκράτην ἄλλων τε πολλῶν παρόντων καὶ τοῦ Εὐθυδήμου εἰπεῖν, ὅτι ὑικὸν αὐτῷ δοκοίη πάσχειν ὁ Κριτίας ἐπιθυμῶν Εὐθυδήμῳ προσκνήσασθαι ὥσπερ τὰ ὑίδια τοῖς λίθοις. ἐξ ὧν δὴ καὶ ἐμίσει τὸν Σωκράτην ὁ Κριτίας, ὥστε καὶ ὅτε τῶν τριάκοντα ὢν νομοθέτης μετὰ Χαρικλέους ἐγένετο, άπεμνημόνευσεν αὐτῶ καὶ ἐν τοῖς νόμοις ἔγραψε λόγων τέχνην μη διδάσκειν, έπηρεάζων έκείνω καὶ οὐκ έχων ὅπη ἐπιλάβοιτο, ἀλλὰ τὸ κοινῆ τοῖς φιλοσόφοις ύπὸ τῶν πολλῶν ἐπιτιμώμενον ἐπιφέρων αὐτῷ καὶ

28

29

30

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>14</sup> The handsome son of Diocles; cf. 4.2.1, 4.3, 4.5, 4.6, Pl. Smp. 22b. <sup>15</sup> A fellow member of the Thirty Tyrants.

# MEMORABILIA I. 2.27-2.31

not held responsible for their boys' wrongdoing if they are themselves well-behaved men. This is the test which should have been applied to Socrates too. If there was anything base in his own life, he might fairly have been thought vicious. But if his own conduct was always proper, how can he be fairly held to blame for the evil that was not in him?

Nevertheless, if he, although himself free of baseness, saw and approved of bad conduct in them, he would be open to censure. Well, when he found that Critias loved Euthydemus<sup>14</sup> and was trying to use him in the way of those who enjoy carnal lust, he tried to restrain him by saying that it was servile and unbecoming in a gentleman to sue like a beggar to the object of his affection, whose good opinion he coveted, stooping to ask an extra favor and a no-good one at that. As Critias paid no heed whatever to this protest, Socrates, it is said, exclaimed in the presence of Euthydemus and many others, "Critias seems to have the feelings of a pig: he can no more keep away from Euthydemus than pigs can help rubbing themselves against stones." Now Critias bore a grudge against Socrates for this; and when he was one of the Thirty and was drafting laws with Charicles. 15 he bore it in mind. He inserted a clause which made it illegal "to teach the art of words." It was a calculated insult to Socrates, whom he saw no means of attacking, except by imputing to him the practice constantly attributed to philosophers, 16 and so making him

28

29

30

 $<sup>^{16}</sup>$  Presumably the practice of "making the worse appear the better argument." In Pl.  $Ap.\ 19b$  Socrates makes Aristophanes (in Clouds) the author of this charge against him; Arist.  $Rhet.\ B\ 24.11$  associates the practice with Protagoras, cf. D. L. 9.51.

διαβάλλων πρὸς τοὺς πολλούς. οὐδὲ γὰρ ἔγωγε οὕτ αὐτὸς τοῦτο πώποτε Σωκράτους ἤκουσα οὕτ ἄλλου του φάσκοντος ἀκηκοέναι ἤσθόμην. ἐδήλωσε δέ ἐπεὶ γὰρ οἱ τριάκοντα πολλοὺς μὲν τῶν πολιτῶν καὶ οὐ τοὺς χειρίστους ἀπέκτεινον, πολλοὺς δὲ προετρέποντο ἀδικεῖν, εἶπέ που ὁ Σωκράτης, ὅτι θαυμαστόν οἱ δοκοίη εἶναι, εἴ τις γενόμενος βοῶν ἀγέλης νομεὺς καὶ τὰς βοῦς ἐλάττους τε καὶ χείρους ποιῶν μὴ ὁμολογοίη κακὸς βουκόλος εἶναι, ἔτι δὲ θαυμαστότερον, εἴ τις προστάτης γενόμενος πόλεως καὶ ποιῶν τοὺς πολίτας ἐλάττους τε καὶ χείρους μὴ αἰσχύνεται μηδ οἴεται κακὸς εἶναι προστάτης τῆς πόλεως. ἀπαγγελθέντος δὲ αὐτοῖς τούτου, καλέσαντες ὅ τε Κριτίας καὶ ὁ Χαρικλῆς τὸν Σωκράτην τόν τε νόμον ἐδεικνύτην αὐτῷ καὶ τοῖς νέοις ἀπειπέτην μὴ διαλέγεσθαι.

Ό δὲ Σωκράτης ἐπήρετο αὐτώ, εἰ ἐξείη πυνθάνεσθαι, εἴ τι ἀγνοοῖτο τῶν προαγορευομένων.

 $T\hat{\omega} \delta \delta \dot{\epsilon} \phi \dot{\alpha} \tau \eta \nu$ .

Έγὼ τοίνυν, ἔφη, παρεσκεύασμαι μὲν πείθεσθαι τοῖς νόμοις ὅπως δὲ μὴ δι' ἄγνοιαν λάθω τι παρανομήσας, τοῦτο βούλομαι σαφῶς μαθεῖν παρ' ὑμῶν, πότερον τὴν τῶν λόγων τέχνην σὺν τοῖς ὀρθῶς λεγομένοις εἶναι νομίζοντες ἢ σὺν τοῖς μὴ ὀρθῶς ἀπέχεσθαι κελεύετε αὐτῆς. εἰ μὲν γὰρ σὺν τοῖς ὀρθῶς, δῆλον ὅτι ἀφεκτέον ἂν εἴη τοῦ ὀρθῶς λέγειν εἰ δὲ σὺν τοῖς μὴ ὀρθῶς, δῆλον ὅτι πειρατέον ὀρθῶς λέγειν.

Καὶ ὁ Χαρικλης ὀργισθεὶς αὐτῷ, Ἐπειδή, ἔφη, ὧ

32

33

34

#### MEMORABILIA I 2 31-2 35

unpopular. For I myself never heard Socrates indulge in the practice, nor knew of anyone who professed to have heard him do so. He made that clear, for when the Thirty were putting to death many citizens of no small respectability and encouraging many others in crime, Socrates had remarked: "It seems amazing enough to me that a herdsman<sup>17</sup> who lets his cattle decrease and go to the bad should not admit that he is a poor herdsman; but more amazing still that a statesman, when he causes the citizens to decrease and go to the bad, should feel no shame nor think himself a poor statesman." This remark was reported to Critias and Charicles, who sent for Socrates, showed him the law, and forbade him to hold conversation with young men.

"May I question you," asked Socrates, "in case I do not understand any point in your orders?"

"You may," said they.

"Well now," said he, "I am ready to obey the laws. But in case I may unwittingly transgress through ignorance, I want clear directions from you. Do you think that the art of words from which you bid me abstain is associated with sound or unsound reasoning? For if with sound, then clearly I must abstain from sound reasoning: but if with unsound, clearly I must try to reason soundly."

"Since you are ignorant, Socrates," said Charicles in an

32

33

34

<sup>17</sup> Cyr. 8.2.13.

Σώκρατες, άγνοεις, τάδε σοι εὐμαθέστερα ὄντα προαγορεύομεν, τοις νέοις ὅλως μὴ διαλέγεσθαι.

Καὶ ὁ Σωκράτης, Ίνα τοίνυν, ἔφη, μὴ ἀμφίβολον ἢ, ὡς ἄλλο τι ποιῶ ἢ τὰ προηγορευμένα, ὁρίσατέ μοι, μέχρι πόσων ἐτῶν δεῖ νομίζειν νέους εἶναι τοὺς ἀνθρώπους.

Καὶ ὁ Χαρικλῆς, Ὁσουπερ, εἶπε, χρόνου βουλεύειν οὐκ ἔξεστιν, ὡς οὔπω φρονίμοις οὖσι· μηδὲ σὰ διαλέγου νεωτέροις τριάκοντα ἐτῶν.

Μηδ' ἐάν τι ἀνῶμαι, ἔφη, ἢν πωλῆ νεώτερος τριάκοντα ἐτῶν, ἔρωμαι, ὁπόσου πωλεῖ;

Ναὶ τά γε τοιαῦτα, ἔφη ὁ Χαρικλῆς ἀλλά τοι σύγε, ὧ Σώκρατες, εἴωθας εἰδὼς πῶς ἔχει τὰ πλεῖστα ἐρωτᾶν. ταῦτα οὖν μὴ ἐρώτα.

Μηδ' ἀποκρίνωμαι οὖν, ἔφη, ἄν τίς με ἐρωτᾳ νέος, ἐὰν εἰδῶ, οἷον ποῦ οἰκεῖ Χαρικλῆς ἢ ποῦ ἐστι Κριτίας;

Ναὶ τά γε τοιαῦτα, ἔφη ὁ Χαρικλῆς.

Ό δὲ Κριτίας, ἀλλὰ τῶνδέ τοί σε ἀπέχεσθαι ἔφη, δεήσει, ὧ Σώκρατες, τῶν σκυτέων καὶ τῶν τεκτόνων καὶ τῶν χαλκέων καὶ γὰρ οἶμαι αὐτοὺς ἤδη κατατετρῖφθαι διαθρυλουμένους ὑπὸ σοῦ.

Οὐκοῦν, ἔφη ὁ Σωκράτης, καὶ τῶν ἑπομένων τούτοις τοῦ τε δικαίου καὶ τοῦ ὁσίου καὶ τῶν ἄλλων τῶν τοι-ούτων;

Ναὶ μὰ Δί', ἔφη ὁ Χαρικλῆς, καὶ τῶν βουκόλων γε· εἰ δὲ μή, φυλάττου, ὅπως μὴ καὶ σὺ ἐλάττους τὰς βοῦς ποιήσης.

36

#### MEMORABILIA I. 2.35-2.37

angry tone, "we put our order into language easier to understand. You may not hold any converse whatever with the young."

"Well then," said Socrates, "that there may be no question raised about my obedience, please fix the age limit below which a man is to be accounted young."

"So long," replied Charicles, "as he is not permitted to sit in the Council, because as yet he lacks wisdom. You shall not converse with anyone who is under thirty."

"Suppose I want to buy something, am I not even then to ask the price if the seller is under thirty?"

"Oh yes," answered Charicles, "you may in such cases. But the fact is, Socrates, you are in the habit of asking questions to which you know the answer: so that is what you are not to do."

"Am I to give no answer, then, if a young man asks me something that I know?—for instance, 'Where does Charicles live?' or 'Where is Critias?'"

"Oh yes," answered Charicles, "you may, in such cases."

"But you see, Socrates," explained Critias, "you will have to avoid your favorite topics: cobblers, builders and metal workers; 18 for I think you have already worn them threadbare."

"Then must I keep off the subjects of which these supply illustrations, Justice, Holiness, and so forth?"

"Indeed yes," said Charicles, "and herdsmen too: or else *you* may find the cattle decrease."

<sup>18</sup> 1.2.9, 3.7.6; Cyr. 6.2.37; Pl. Prt. 319d.

36

38 Ένθα καὶ δῆλον ἐγένετο, ὅτι ἀπαγγελθέντος αὐτοῖς τοῦ περὶ τῶν βοῶν λόγου ἀργίζοντο τῷ Σωκράτει.

Οἵα μὲν οὖν ἡ συνουσία ἐγεγόνει Κριτία πρὸς Σωκράτην καὶ ὡς εἶχον πρὸς ἀλλήλους, εἴρηται. 39 φαίην δ' ἃν ἔγωγε μηδενὶ μηδεμίαν εἶναι παίδευσιν παρὰ τοῦ μὴ ἀρέσκοντος. Κριτίας δὲ καὶ ἀλκιβιάδης οὐκ ἀρέσκοντος αὐτοῖς Σωκράτους ὡμιλησάτην ὃν χρόνον ὡμιλείτην αὐτῷ, ἀλλ' εὐθὺς ἐξ ἀρχῆς ὡρμηκότε προεστάναι τῆς πόλεως. ἔτι γὰρ Σωκράτει συνόντες οὐκ ἄλλοις τισὶ μᾶλλον ἐπεχείρουν διαλέγεσθαι ἡ τοῖς μάλιστα πράττουσι τὰ πολιτικά. λέγεται γὰρ ἀλκιβιάδην, πρὶν εἴκοσιν ἐτῶν εἶναι, Περικλεῖ, ἐπιτρόπῳ μὲν ὄντι ἑαυτοῦ, προστάτη δὲ τῆς πόλεως, τοιάδε διαλεχθῆναι περὶ νόμων.

41 Εἰπέ μοι, φάναι, ὧ Περίκλεις, ἔχοις ἄν με διδάξαι, τί ἐστι νόμος;

Πάντως δήπου, φάναι τὸν Περικλέα.

Δίδαξον δὴ πρὸς τῶν θεῶν, φάναι τὸν ᾿Αλκιβιάδην ὡς ἐγὰ ἀκούων τινῶν ἐπαινουμένων, ὅτι νόμιμοι ἄν-δρες εἰσίν, οἶμαι μὴ ἂν δικαίως τούτου τυχεῖν τοῦ ἐπαίνου τὸν μὴ εἰδότα, τί ἐστι νόμος.

'Αλλ' οὐδέν τι χαλεποῦ πράγματος ἐπιθυμεῖς, ὧ 'Αλκιβιάδη, φάναι τὸν Περικλέα, βουλόμενος γνῶναι, τί ἐστι νόμος· πάντες γὰρ οὖτοι νόμοι εἰσίν, οῦς τὸ πλῆθος συνελθὸν καὶ δοκιμάσαν ἔγραψε, φράζον ἄ τε δεῖ ποιεῖν καὶ ἃ μή.

Πότερον δὲ τἀγαθὰ νομίσαν δεῖν ποιεῖν ἢ τὰ κακά;

# MEMORABILIA I. 2.38-2.42

Thus the truth was out: the remark about the cattle had been repeated to them: and it was this that made them angry with him.

So much, then, for the connection of Critias with Socrates and their attitude toward each other. I venture to assert that learners get nothing from a teacher with whom they are out of sympathy. Now, all the time that Critias and Alcibiades associated with Socrates they were out of sympathy with him, but from the very first their ambition was political advancement. For while they were still with him, they tried to converse, whenever possible, with prominent politicians. Indeed, there is a story told of Alcibiades, that, when he was less than twenty years old, he had a talk about laws with Pericles, his guardian, the first citizen in the State.

"Tell me, Pericles," he said, "can you teach me what a law is?"

"Certainly," he replied.

"Then please do teach me. For whenever I hear men praised for keeping the laws, it occurs to me that no one can really deserve that praise who does not know what law is."

"Well, Alcibiades, there is no great difficulty about what you desire. You wish to know what law is. Laws are all the rules approved and enacted by the majority in assembly, whereby they declare what ought and what ought not to be done."

"Having decided whether to do good or do bad?"

38

39

40

41

Τάγαθὰ νὴ Δία, φάναι, ὧ μειράκιον, τὰ δὲ κακὰ οὔ.

Πάντα, φάναι, ὅσα ἃν τὸ κρατοῦν τῆς πόλεως βουλευσάμενον ἃ χρὴ ποιεῖν γράψη, νόμος καλεῖται.

Καὶ ἂν τύραννος οὖν κρατῶν τῆς πόλεως γράψη τοῖς πολίταις ἃ χρὴ ποιεῖν, καὶ ταῦτα νόμος ἐστί;

Καὶ ὅσα τύραννος ἄρχων, φάναι, γράφει, καὶ ταῦτα νόμος καλεῖται.

Βία δέ, φάναι, καὶ ἀνομία τί ἐστιν, ὧ Περίκλεις; ἆρ' οὐχ ὅταν ὁ κρείττων τὸν ἥττω μὴ πείσας, ἀλλὰ βιασάμενος ἀναγκάση ποιεῖν ὅ τι ἂν αὐτῷ δοκῆ;

"Εμοιγε δοκεῖ, φάναι τὸν Περικλέα.

Καὶ ὅσα ἄρα τύραννος μὴ πείσας τοὺς πολίτας ἀναγκάζει ποιεῖν γράφων, ἀνομία ἐστί;

Δοκεῖ μοι, φάναι τὸν Περικλέα ἀνατίθεμαι γὰρ τὸ ὅσα τύραννος μὴ πείσας γράφει νόμον εἶναι.

Όσα δὲ οἱ ὀλίγοι τοὺς πολλοὺς μὴ πείσαντες, ἀλλὰ κρατοῦντες γράφουσι, πότερον βίαν φῶμεν ἢ μὴ φῶμεν εἶναι;

Πάντα μοι δοκεῖ, φάναι τὸν Περικλέα, ὅσα τις μὴ πείσας ἀναγκάζει τινὰ ποιεῖν, εἴτε γράφων εἴτε μή, βία μᾶλλον ἢ νόμος εἶναι.

Καὶ ὅσα ἄρα τὸ πᾶν πληθος κρατοῦν τῶν τὰ χρήματα ἐχόντων γράφει μὴ πεῖσαν, βία μᾶλλον ἢ νόμος ἂν εἴη;

44

# MEMORABILIA I. 2.42-2.45

"Good, of course, young man-not bad."

"But if, as happens under an oligarchy, not the majority, but a minority meet and enact rules of conduct, what are these?"

43

"Whatsoever the sovereign power in the state enacts, after deliberation about what is to be done, is known as a law."

"If, then, a tyrant, being the sovereign power, enacts what the citizens are to do, are his orders also law?"

"Yes, whatever a tyrant as ruler enacts is also known as law."

"But force, the negation of law, what is that, Pericles? Is it not the action of the stronger when he constrains the weaker to do whatever he chooses, not by persuasion but by force?"

"That is my opinion."

"Then whatever a despot by enactment constrains the citizens to do without persuasion, is the negation of law?"

"I think so: and I withdraw my answer that whatever a despot enacts without persuasion is law."

"And when the minority passes enactments, not by persuading the majority, but through using its power, are we to call that force or not?"

- 45 e

"Everything, I think, that men constrain others to do 'without persuasion,' whether by enactment or not, is not law but force."

"It follows then, that whatever the assembled majority, through using its power over the owners of property, enacts without persuasion is not law, but force?"

46 Μάλα τοι, φάναι τὸν Περικλέα, ὧ ᾿Αλκιβιάδη, καὶ ἡμεῖς τηλικοῦτοι ὄντες δεινοὶ τὰ τοιαῦτα ἡμεν· τοιαῦτα γὰρ καὶ ἐμελετῶμεν καὶ ἐσοφιζόμεθα, οἶάπερ καὶ σὺ νῦν ἐμοὶ δοκεῖς μελετᾶν.

Τὸν δὲ Ἀλκιβιάδην φάναι Εἴθε σοι, ὧ Περίκλεις, τότε συνεγενόμην ὅτε δεινότατος ἑαυτοῦ ταῦτα ἦσθα.

Έπεὶ τοίνυν τάχιστα τῶν πολιτευομένων ὑπέλαβον κρείττονες εἶναι, Σωκράτει μὲν οὐκέτι προσήεσαν οὕτε γὰρ αὐτοῖς ἄλλως ἤρεσκεν εἴ τε προσέλθοιεν, ὑπὲρ ὧν ἡμάρτανον ἐλεγχόμενοι ἤχθοντο· τὰ δὲ τῆς πόλεως ἔπραττον, ὧνπερ ἔνεκεν καὶ Σωκράτει προσ- ῆλθον.

ἀλλὰ Κρίτων τε Σωκράτους ἦν ὁμιλητὴς καὶ Χαιρεφῶν καὶ Χαιρεκράτης καὶ Ἑρμογένης³ καὶ Σιμμίας καὶ Κέβης καὶ Φαιδώνδας καὶ ἄλλοι, οι ἐκείνῳ συνῆσαν οὐχ ἵνα δημηγορικοὶ ἢ δικανικοὶ γένοιντο, ἀλλ' ἵνα καλοί τε κἀγαθοὶ γενόμενοι καὶ οἴκῳ καὶ οἰκέταις καὶ οἰκείοις καὶ φίλοις καὶ πόλει καὶ πολίταις δύναιντο καλῶς χρῆσθαι. καὶ τούτων οὐδεὶς οὔτε νεώτερος οὔτε πρεσβύτερος ὧν οὕτ' ἐποίησε κακὸν οὐδὲν οὕτ' αἰτίαν ἔσχεν.

'Αλλὰ Σωκράτης γ', ἔφη ὁ κατήγορος, τοὺς πατέρας προπηλακίζειν ἐδίδασκε, πείθων μὲν τοὺς συνόντας ἑαυτῷ σοφωτέρους ποιεῖν τῶν πατέρων, φάσκων δὲ κατὰ νόμον ἐξεῖναι παρανοίας ἑλόντι καὶ τὸν πατέρα δῆσαι, τεκμηρίῳ τούτῳ χρώμενος, ὡς τὸν ἀμαθέστερον ὑπὸ τοῦ σοφωτέρου νόμιμον εἴη δεδέσθαι. Σωκράτης δὲ τὸν μὲν ἀμαθίας ἔνεκα δεσμεύοντα δικαίως

47

48

49

# MEMORABILIA I. 2.46-2.50

"Alcibiades," said Pericles, "at your age, I may tell you, we too were very clever at this sort of thing. For the puzzles we thought about and exercised our wits on were just such as you seem to think about now."

"Ah, Pericles," cried Alcibiades, "if only I had known you when you were at your cleverest in these matters!"

So soon, then, as they presumed themselves to be the superiors of the politicians, they no longer came near Socrates. For apart from their general want of sympathy with him, they resented being cross-examined about their errors when they came. Politics had brought them to Socrates, and for politics they left him.

But Crito was a true associate of Socrates, as were Chaerophon, Chaerecrates, Hermogenes, Simmias, Cebes, Phaedondas, and others who kept his company not hoping to shine in the assembly or the courts but to become gentlemen and be able to do their duty by house and household, relatives and friends, city and citizens. Of these not one, in his youth or old age, did evil or incurred censure.

"But," said his accuser, "Socrates taught sons to treat their fathers with contempt: he persuaded them that he made his companions wiser than their fathers: he said that the law allowed a son to put his father in prison if he convinced a jury that he was insane; and this was a proof that it was lawful for the wiser to keep the more ignorant in jail." In reality Socrates held that, if you clap fetters on a

<sup>3</sup> van Prinsterer: Έρμοκράτης PBerol. 21108 codd.

47

48

49

αν καὶ αὐτὸν ὤετο δεδέσθαι ὑπὸ τῶν ἐπισταμένων α μὴ αὐτὸς ἐπίσταται· καὶ τῶν τοιούτων ἔνεκα πολλάκις ἐσκόπει, τί διαφέρει μανίας ἀμαθία· καὶ τοὺς μὲν μαινομένους ὤετο συμφερόντως αν δεδέσθαι καὶ αὐτοῖς καὶ τοῖς φίλοις, τοὺς δὲ μὴ ἐπισταμένους τὰ δέοντα δικαίως αν μανθάνειν παρὰ τῶν ἐπισταμένων.

Άλλὰ Σωκράτης γε, ἔφη ὁ κατήγορος, οὐ μόνον τοὺς πατέρας, ἀλλὰ καὶ τοὺς ἄλλους συγγενεῖς ἐποίει έν άτιμία είναι παρά τοις έαυτώ συνούσι, λέγων, ώς ούτε τοὺς κάμνοντας ούτε τοὺς δικαζομένους οἱ συγγενείς ώφελοῦσιν, άλλὰ τοὺς μὲν οἱ ἰατροί, τοὺς δὲ οἱ συνδικείν έπιστάμενοι. έφη δε καὶ περὶ τῶν φίλων αὐτὸν λέγειν, ώς οὐδὲν ὄφελος εὔνους εἶναι, εἰ μὴ καὶ ώφελείν δυνήσονται μόνους δε φάσκειν αὐτὸν ἀξίους είναι τιμής τους είδότας τὰ δέοντα καὶ έρμηνεῦσαι δυναμένους άναπείθοντα οὖν τοὺς νέους αὐτόν, ὡς αὐτὸς είη σοφώτατός τε καὶ ἄλλους ἱκανώτατος ποιῆσαι σοφούς, οὕτω διατιθέναι τοὺς ξαυτῶ συνόντας, ώστε μηδαμού παρ' αὐτοῖς τοὺς ἄλλους εἶναι πρὸς αὐτόν. ἐγὼ δ' αὐτὸν οἶδα μὲν καὶ περὶ πατέρων τε καὶ τῶν ἄλλων συγγενῶν καὶ περὶ φίλων ταῦτα λέγοντα: καὶ πρὸς τούτοις γε δή, ὅτι τῆς ψυχῆς ἐξελθούσης, ἐν ή μόνη γίγνεται φρόνησις, τὸ σῶμα τοῦ οἰκειοτάτου άνθρώπου τὴν ταχίστην έξενέγκαντες άφανίζουσιν. ἔλεγε δέ, ὅτι καὶ ζῶν ἔκαστος ἑαυτοῦ, ὁ πάντων μάλιστα φιλεί, του σώματος ὅ, τι ἂν ἀχρείον ἢ καὶ ἀνωφελές, αὐτός τε ἀφαιρεῖ καὶ ἄλλω παρέχει. αὐτοί τέ γε αύτῶν ὄνυχάς τε καὶ τρίχας καὶ τύλους ἀφαιροῦσι

51

52

53

# MEMORABILIA I. 2.50-2.54

man for his ignorance, you deserve to be kept in jail yourself by those whose knowledge is greater than your own: and such reasoning led him frequently to consider the difference between madness and ignorance. That madmen should be kept in prison was expedient, he thought, both for themselves and for their friends: but those who are ignorant of what they ought to know deserve to learn from those who know it.

"But," said his accuser, "Socrates caused his companions to dishonor not only their fathers but their other relations as well, by saying that invalids and litigants get benefit not from their relatives but from their doctors or those who know how to assist them at law. Of friends too he said that their goodwill was worthless unless they could combine with it some power to help: only those deserved honor who knew what was the right thing to do, and could explain it. Thus by leading the young to think that he excelled in wisdom and in ability to make others wise, he had such an effect on his companions that no one counted for anything in their estimation in comparison with him." Now I do know that he used this language about fathers, relatives, and friends, and what is more, he would say that as soon as the soul, the only seat of intelligence, has departed, people carry out the body of their nearest and dearest and hide it in the tomb as quickly as they can. Moreover, though a man's dearest friend is himself, even in his lifetime he removes or lets another remove from his body whatever is useless and unprofitable. People remove

51

52

53

καὶ τοῖς ἰατροῖς παρέχουσι μετὰ πόνων τε καὶ ἀλγηδόνων καὶ ἀποτέμνειν καὶ ἀποκάειν καὶ τούτου χάριν οἴονται δεῖν αὐτοῖς καὶ μισθὸν τίνειν καὶ τὸ σίαλον ἐκ τοῦ στόματος ἀποπτύουσιν ὡς δύνανται πορρωτάτω, διότι ὡφελεῖ μὲν οὐδὲν αὐτοὺς ἐνόν, βλάπτει δὲ πολὺ μᾶλλον.

Ταῦτ' οὖν ἔλεγεν οὐ τὸν μὲν πατέρα ζῶντα κατορύττειν διδάσκων, ἑαυτὸν δὲ κατατέμνειν, ἀλλ' ἐπιδεικνύων, ὅτι τὸ ἄφρον ἄτιμόν ἐστι, παρεκάλει ἐπιμελεῖσθαι τοῦ ὡς φρονιμώτατον εἶναι καὶ ὡφελιμώτατον, ὅπως, ἐάν τε ὑπὸ πατρὸς ἐάν τε ὑπὸ ἀδελφοῦ ἐάν τε ὑπ' ἄλλου τινὸς βούληται τιμᾶσθαι, μὴ τῷ οἰκεῖος εἶναι πιστεύων ἀμελῆ, ἀλλὰ πειρᾶται ὑφ' ὧν ἂν βούληται τιμᾶσθαι, τούτοις ὡφέλιμος εἶναι.

ἔφη δ' αὐτὸν ὁ κατήγορος καὶ τῶν ἐνδοξοτάτων ποιητῶν ἐκλεγόμενον τὰ πονηρότατα καὶ τούτοις μαρτυρίοις χρώμενον διδάσκειν τοὺς συνόντας κακούργους τε εἶναι καὶ τυραννικούς, Ἡσιόδου μὲν τὸ

ἔργον δ' οὐδὲν ὄνειδος, ἀεργίη δέ τ' ὄνειδος·

τοῦτο δὴ λέγειν αὐτὸν ὡς ὁ ποιητὴς κελεύει μηδενὸς ἔργου μήτ' ἀδίκου μήτ' αἰσχροῦ ἀπέχεσθαι, ἀλλὰ καὶ ταῦτα ποιεῖν ἐπὶ τῷ κέρδει. Σωκράτης δ' ἐπεὶ διομολογήσαιτο τὸ μὲν ἐργάτην εἶναι ἀφέλιμόν τε ἀνθρώπῳ καὶ ἀγαθὸν εἶναι, τὸ δὲ ἀργὸν βλαβερόν τε καὶ κακόν, καὶ τὸ μὲν ἐργάζεσθαι ἀγαθόν, τὸ δ' ἀργεῖν κακόν, τοὺς μὲν ἀγαθόν τι ποιοῦντας ἐργάζεσθαί τε ἔφη καὶ ἐργάτας εἶναι, τοὺς δὲ κυβεύοντας ἤ τι

55

56

# MEMORABILIA I. 2.54-2.57

their own nails, hair, calluses: they let the surgeon amputate and cauterize, and aches and pains notwithstanding, feel bound to thank and pay him for it. They spit out the saliva from their mouths as far away as they can, because to retain it doesn't help but rather harms them.

Now in saying all this, he was not giving a lesson on the duty of burying one's father alive, or making mincemeat of one's own body: he meant to show that unreason is unworth, and was urging the necessity of cultivating sound sense and usefulness, in order that one who wished to be valued by father or by brother or by anyone else would not rely merely on the bond of familiarity and neglect him, but would try to be useful to all those by whom he wished to be valued

And his accuser alleged that he selected the most immoral passages, even from the most famous poets, and used them as evidence in teaching his companions to be maleficent and tyrannical: for example, Hesiod's line:

No work is a disgrace, but idleness is a disgrace. 19

He was charged with explaining this line as an injunction to refrain from no work, dishonest or disgraceful, but to do anything for gain. Now, though Socrates would fully agree that it is a benefit and a blessing to a man to be a worker, and a disadvantage and an evil to be an idler—that work, in fact, is a blessing, idleness an evil—"working," "being a worker," meant to him doing good work; but gambling and any occupation that is immoral and leads to loss

19 WD 311.

55

άλλο πονηρον καὶ ἐπιζήμιον ποιοῦντας ἀργοὺς ἀπεκάλει, έκ δὲ τούτων ὀρθώς ἂν ἔγοι τὸ

ἔργον δ' οὐδὲν ὄνειδος, ἀεργίη δέ τ' ὄνειδος.

τὸ δὲ ὑμήρου ἔφη ὁ κατήγορος πολλάκις αὐτὸν λέγειν. ὅτι Ὀδυσσεὺς

> οντινα μέν βασιλήα καὶ έξοχον ἄνδρα κιχείη, τὸν δ' ἀγανοῖς ἐπέεσσιν ἐρητύσασκε παραστάς. δαιμόνι, ού σε ξοικε κακὸν ώς δειδίσσεσθαι. άλλ' αὐτὸς τε κάθησο καὶ ἄλλους ἵδουε λαούς. οντινα δ' αὖ δήμου τε ἴδοι βοόωντά τ' ἐφεύροι, τὸν σκήπτρω ἐλάσασκεν ὁμοκλήσασκέ τε μύθω. δαιμόνι', ἀτρέμας ήσο καὶ ἄλλων μῦθον ἄκουε. οἳ σέο φέρτεροί εἰσι σὺ δ' ἀπτόλεμος καὶ ἄναλκις.

οὔτε ποτ' ἐν πολέμω ἐναρίθμιος οὔτ' ἐνὶ βουλŷ.

ταῦτα δὴ αὐτὸν έξηγεῖσθαι, ώς ὁ ποιητὴς ἐπαινοίη παίεσθαι τοὺς δημότας καὶ πένητας. Σωκράτης δ' οὐ ταῦτ' ἔλεγε, καὶ γὰρ έαυτὸν οὕτω γ' ἂν ὤετο δεῖν παίεσθαι, άλλ' ἔφη δεῖν τοὺς μήτε λόγω μήτ' ἔργω ώφελίμους ὄντας καὶ μήτε στρατεύματι μήτε πόλει μήτε αὐτῷ τῷ δήμῳ, εἴ τι δέοι, βοηθεῖν ἱκανούς, ἄλλως τε κἂν πρὸς τούτω καὶ θρασεῖς ὧσι, πάντα τρόπον κωλύεσθαι, κἂν πάνυ πλούσιοι τυγχάνωσιν όντες. άλλὰ Σωκράτης γε τάναντία τούτων φανερὸς 60 ην καὶ δημοτικὸς καὶ φιλάνθρωπος ὤν. ἐκεῖνος γὰρ πολλούς ἐπιθυμητὰς καὶ ἀστούς καὶ ξένους λαβών

#### MEMORABILIA I. 2.57-2.60

he called idling. When thus interpreted there is nothing amiss with the line:

No work is a disgrace, but idleness is a disgrace.

And his accuser said that he often quoted the passage from Homer, showing how Odysseus:

58

Whenever he found one that was a captain and a man of eminence, he stood by his side and restrained him with gentle words: "Good sir, it is not seemly to be frightened like a coward, but take a seat yourself and sit the others down..." But whatever man of the people he saw and found him shouting, him he drove with his scepter and berated him with loud words: "Good sir, sit still and hearken to the words of others who are your betters: for you are no warrior and a weakling, never reckoned whether in battle or in council." 20

59

He allegedly interpreted this passage to mean that the poet approved of chastising ordinary and poor people. But Socrates never said that: indeed, on that view he would have thought himself worthy of chastisement. But what he did say was that those who render no service either by word or deed, who cannot help army or city or the people itself in time of need, ought to be stopped, even if they have riches in abundance, above all if they are insolent as well as inefficient. But Socrates was quite the opposite of all that: he showed himself to be one of the people and a friend of mankind. For although he had many eager dis-

60

20 Il. 2.188-91, 198-202.

οὐδένα πώποτε μισθὸν τῆς συνουσίας ἐπράξατο, ἀλλὰ πᾶσιν ἀφθόνως ἐπήρκει τῶν ἑαυτοῦ· ὧν τινες μικρὰ μέρη παρ' ἐκείνου προῖκα λαβόντες πολλοῦ τοῖς ἄλλοις ἐπώλουν καὶ οὐκ ἦσαν ὥσπερ ἐκείνος δημοτικοί. τοῖς γὰρ μὴ ἔχουσι χρήματα διδόναι οὐκ ἤθελον διαλέγεσθαι. ἀλλὰ Σωκράτης γε καὶ πρὸς τοὺς ἄλλους ἀνθρώπους κόσμον τῆ πόλει παρείχε, πολλῷ μᾶλλον ἢ Λίχας τῆ Λακεδαιμονίων, ὃς ὀνομαστὸς ἐπὶ τούτῳ γέγονε. Λίχας μὲν γὰρ ταῖς γυμνοπαιδίαις τοὺς ἐπιδημοῦντας ἐν Λακεδαίμονι ξένους ἐδείπνιζε, Σωκράτης δὲ διὰ παντὸς τοῦ βίου τὰ ἑαυτοῦ δαπανῶν τὰ μέγιστα πάντας τοὺς βουλομένους ἀφέλει· βελτίους γὰρ ποιῶν τοὺς συγγιγνομένους ἀπέπεμπεν.

Έμοὶ μὲν δὴ Σωκράτης τοιοῦτος ὢν ἐδόκει τιμῆς 62 άξιος είναι τῆ πόλει μᾶλλον ἢ θανάτου, καὶ κατὰ τοὺς νόμους δὲ σκοπῶν ἄν τις τοῦθ' εὕροι, κατὰ γὰρ τοὺς νόμους, έάν τις φανερός γένηται κλέπτων η λωποδυτῶν ἢ βαλαντιοτομῶν ἢ τοιχωρυχῶν ἢ ἀνδραποδιζόμενος η ιεροσυλών, τούτοις θάνατός έστιν η ζημία. ὧν ἐκεῖνος πάντων ἀνθρώπων πλεῖστον ἀπεῖχεν. ἀλλὰ 63 μην τη πόλει γε οὔτε πολέμου κακῶς συμβάντος οὔτε στάσεως ούτε προδοσίας ούτε ἄλλου κακοῦ οὐδενὸς πώποτε αἴτιος ἐγένετο· οὐδὲ μὴν ἰδία γε οὐδένα πώποτε ανθρώπων οὔτε αγαθών απεστέρησεν οὔτε κακοίς περιέβαλεν, άλλ' οὐδ' αἰτίαν τῶν εἰρημένων οὐδενὸς πώποτ' ἔσχε, πῶς οὖν ἂν ἔνοχος εἴη τῆ γραφῆ: 64 ος άντὶ μεν τοῦ μη νομίζειν θεούς, ώς έν τη γραφή

#### MEMORABILIA I. 2.60-2.64

ciples among citizens and foreigners, he never exacted a fee for his company from anyone, but of his own resources he gave unsparingly to everyone. Some indeed, after getting from him a few trifles for nothing, sold them for a high price to others, and showed none of his sympathy with the people, refusing to talk with those who had no money to give them. But Socrates did far more to win respect for the State in the world at large than Lichas, whose services to Sparta have made his name immortal. For Lichas used to entertain the foreigners staying at Sparta during the Gymnopaidiai;<sup>21</sup> but Socrates spent his life in lavishing his gifts and rendering the greatest services to all who cared to receive them. For he always tried to make his associates better men before he sent them on their way.

Such was the character of Socrates. To me he seemed to deserve honor rather than death at the hands of the state, and anyone considering his case in its legal aspect will find likewise. Under the laws, death is the penalty inflicted on persons proved to be thieves, highwaymen, cutpurses, kidnappers, robbers of temples; and from such criminals no one was so widely separated as he was. Furthermore, to the state he was never the cause of disaster in war, or sedition or treason or any harm whatever. Again, in private life he never ever deprived anyone of what was good or involved anyone in what was bad. None of these crimes was ever so much as imputed to him. How then could he be guilty of the charges? For so far was he from rejecting the gods, as charged in the indictment, that no

 $^{21}$  A boys' exhibition of gymnastic and martial dance held annually in the high summer.

62

63

έγέγραπτο, φανερὸς ἦν θεραπεύων τοὺς θεοὺς μάλιστα τῶν ἄλλων ἀνθρώπων, ἀντὶ δὲ τοῦ διαφθείρειν τοὺς νέους, ὅ δὴ ὁ γραψάμενος αὐτὸν ἢτιᾶτο, φανερὸς ἦν τῶν συνόντων τοὺς πονηρὰς ἐπιθυμίας ἔχοντας τούτων μὲν παύων, τῆς δὲ καλλίστης καὶ μεγαλοπρεπεστάτης ἀρετῆς, ἢ πόλεις τε καὶ οἶκοι εὖ οἰκοῦσι, προτρέπων ἐπιθυμεῖν ταῦτα δὲ πράττων πῶς οὐ μεγάλης ἄξιος ἦν τιμῆς τῆ πόλει;

3. Οἷς δὲ δὴ καὶ ὡφελεῖν ἐδόκει μοι τοὺς συνόντας τὰ μὲν ἔργῳ δεικνύων ἑαυτὸν οἷος ἦν, τὰ δὲ καὶ δια-λεγόμενος, τούτων δὴ γράψω ὁπόσα ἃν διαμνημο-νεύσω.

Τὰ μὲν τοίνυν πρὸς τοὺς θεοὺς φανερὸς ἦν καὶ ποιῶν καὶ λέγων ἦπερ ἡ Πυθία ἀποκρίνεται τοῖς ἐρωτῶσι, πῶς δεῖ ποιεῖν ἢ περὶ θυσίας ἢ περὶ προγόνων θεραπείας ἢ περὶ ἄλλου τινὸς τῶν τοιούτων ἤ τε γὰρ Πυθία νόμω πόλεως ἀναιρεῖ ποιοῦντας εὐσεβῶς ἂν ποιεῖν Σωκράτης τε οὕτω καὶ αὐτὸς ἐποίει καὶ τοῖς ἄλλοις παρήνει, τοὺς δὲ ἄλλως πως ποιοῦντας περιέργους καὶ ματαίους ἐνόμιζεν εἶναι. καὶ εὕχετο δὲ πρὸς τοὺς θεοὺς ἀπλῶς τἀγαθὰ διδόναι, ὡς τοὺς θεοὺς κάλλιστα εἰδότας, ὁποῖα ἀγαθά ἐστι τοὺς δ' εὐχομένους χρυσίον ἢ ἀργύριον ἢ τυραννίδα ἢ ἄλλο τι τῶν τοιούτων οὐδὲν διάφορον ἐνόμιζεν εὕχεσθαι ἢ εἰ κυβείαν ἢ μάχην ἢ ἄλλο τι εὕχοιντο τῶν φανερῶς ἀδήλων ὅπως ἀποβήσοιτο. θυσίας δὲ θύων μικρὰς ἀπὸ μι-

 $<sup>^4</sup>$  τῶν ἄλλων cett.: πάντων A

#### MEMORABILIA I. 2.64-3.3

man was more conspicuous for his devotion to the service of the gods: so far from corrupting the youth, as his accuser<sup>22</sup> actually charged against him, that if any among his companions had evil desires, he openly tried to reform them and exhorted them to desire the fairest and noblest virtue, by which men prosper both in public life and in their homes. By this conduct did he not deserve high honor from the state?

3. In order to support my opinion that he benefited his associates alike by actions that revealed his own character and by his conversation, I will set down what I recollect of these.

First, then, for his attitude toward the gods; his deeds and words were clearly consistent with the answer given by the Priestess at Delphi to those who inquire about their duty regarding sacrifice or the cult of ancestors or any other such matters, for the answer of the Priestess is that those who follow the custom of the state would act piously, and that was how Socrates acted himself and counseled others to act, and to take any other course he considered presumption and folly. And again, when he prayed he asked simply for gifts that were good, <sup>23</sup> for the gods know best what things are good, whereas to pray for gold or silver or sovereignty or any other such thing was just like praying for a wager or a fight or anything of which the result is obviously uncertain. Though his sacrifices were

2

<sup>22</sup> Meletus.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>23</sup> Cyr. 1.6.5.

κρών οὐδὲν ἡγεῖτο μειοῦσθαι τών ἀπὸ πολλών καὶ μεγάλων πολλὰ καὶ μεγάλα θυόντων. οὕτε γὰρ τοῖς θεοῖς ἔφη καλῶς ἔχειν, εἰ ταῖς μεγάλαις θυσίαις μᾶλλον ἢ ταῖς μικραῖς ἔχαιρον· πολλάκις γὰρ ἂν αὐτοῖς τὰ παρὰ τῶν πονηρῶν μᾶλλον ἢ τὰ παρὰ τῶν χρηστῶν εἶναι κεχαρισμένα· οὕτ' ἂν τοῖς ἀνθρώποις ἄξιον εἶναι ζῆν, εἰ τὰ παρὰ τῶν πονηρῶν μᾶλλον ἢν κεχαρισμένα τοῖς θεοῖς ἢ τὰ παρὰ τῶν χρηστῶν· ἀλλ' ἐνόμιζε τοὺς θεοὺς ταῖς παρὰ τῶν εὐσεβεστάτων τιμαῖς μάλιστα χαίρειν. ἐπαινέτης δ' ἦν καὶ τοῦ ἔπους τούτου,

κὰδ δύναμιν δ' ἔρδειν ἱέρ' ἀθανάτοισι θεοῖσι

καὶ πρὸς φίλους δὲ καὶ ξένους καὶ πρὸς τὴν ἄλλην δίαιταν καλὴν ἔφη παραίνεσιν εἶναι [τὴν] Κὰδ δύναμιν ἔρδειν. εἶ δέ τι δόξειεν αὐτῷ σημαίνεσθαι παρὰ τῶν θεῶν, ἦττον ἂν ἐπείσθη παρὰ τὰ σημαινόμενα ποιῆσαι ἢ εἴ τις αὐτὸν ἔπειθεν ὁδοῦ λαβεῖν ἡγεμόνα τυφλὸν καὶ μὴ εἰδότα τὴν ὁδὸν ἀντὶ βλέποντος καὶ εἰδότος καὶ τῶν ἄλλων δὲ μωρίαν κατηγόρει, οἴτινες παρὰ τὰ ὑπὸ τῶν θεῶν σημαινόμενα ποιοῦσί τι φυλαττόμενοι τὴν παρὰ τοῖς ἀνθρώποις ἀδοξίαν. αὐτὸς δὲ πάντα τἀνθρώπινα ὑπερεώρα πρὸς τὴν παρὰ τῶν θεῶν συμβουλίαν.

Διαίτη δὲ τήν τε ψυχὴν ἐπαίδευσε καὶ τὸ σῶμα, ἦ χρώμενος ἄν τις, εἰ μή τι δαιμόνιον εἴη, θαρραλέως καὶ ἀσφαλῶς διάγοι καὶ οὐκ ἂν ἀπορήσειε τοσαύτης δαπάνης. οὕτω γὰρ εὐτελὴς ἦν, ὥστ' οὐκ οἶδ' εἴ τις

# MEMORABILIA I. 3.3-3.5

humble, according to his means, he thought himself not a whit inferior to those who made frequent and magnificent sacrifices out of great possessions. The gods, he said, could not well delight more in great offerings than in small—for in that case must the gifts of the wicked often have found more favor in their sight than the gifts of the upright—and people would not find life worth living if the gifts of the wicked were received with more favor by the gods than the gifts of the upright. No, the greater the piety of the giver, the greater, he thought, was the delight of the gods in the gift. He would quote with approval the line:

According to your power render sacrifice to the immortal gods  $^{24}\,$ 

and he would add that in our treatment of friends and strangers, and in all our behavior, it is a noble principle to render according to our power. If ever any signal seemed to be given him from the gods, he would more easily have been persuaded to choose a blind guide who did not know the road in preference to one who could see and knew the way, than to disregard the admonition. All people, in fact, who flouted the warnings of the gods in their anxiety to avoid the censure of others he denounced for foolishness. He himself despised all human opinions in comparison with counsel given by the gods.

He schooled his body and soul by following a regimen which, barring a bolt from the blue, would afford anyone a life of confidence and security and make it easy to meet the required expenses. For he was so frugal that it is hardly

<sup>24</sup> Hesiod. WD 336.

ούτως ἂν ὀλίγα ἐργάζοιτο, ὥστε μὴ λαμβάνειν τὰ Σωκράτει άρκοῦντα. σίτω μὲν γὰρ τοσούτω ἐχρῆτο, όσον ήδέως ήσθιε καὶ ἐπὶ τοῦτο οὕτω παρεσκευασμένος ήει, ώστε την ἐπιθυμίαν τοῦ σίτου ὄψον αὐτῶ εἶναι ποτὸν δὲ πᾶν ἡδὺ ἦν αὐτῶ διὰ τὸ μὴ πίνειν, εἰ μη διψώη, εί δέ ποτε κληθείς έθελησειεν έπι δείπνον έλθεῖν, ὁ τοῖς πλείστοις ἐργωδέστατόν ἐστιν, ὥστε φυλάξασθαι τὸ ὑπὲρ τὸν κόρον ἐμπίπλασθαι, τοῦτο ραδίως πάνυ έφυλάττετο, τοῖς δὲ μὴ δυναμένοις τοῦτο ποιείν συνεβούλευε φυλάττεσθαι τὰ πείθοντα μὴ πεινῶντας ἐσθίειν μηδὲ διψῶντας πίνειν καὶ γὰρ τὰ λυμαινόμενα γαστέρας καὶ κεφαλάς καὶ ψυχάς ταῦτ' έφη εἶναι, οἴεσθαι δ' ἔφη ἐπισκώπτων καὶ τὴν Κίρκην ὖς ποιείν τοιούτοις πολλοίς δειπνίζουσαν τὸν δὲ 'Οδυσσέα Έρμοῦ τε ὑποθημοσύνη καὶ αὐτὸν ἐγκρατῆ οντα καὶ ἀποσχόμενον τὸ ὑπὲρ τὸν κόρον τῶν τοιούτων ἄπτεσθαι διὰ ταῦτα οὐ γενέσθαι ὧν, τοιαῦτα μὲν περὶ τούτων ἔπαιζεν ἄμα σπουδάζων.

'Αφροδισίων δὲ παρήνει τῶν καλῶν ἰσχυρῶς ἀπέχεσθαι· οὐ γὰρ ἔφη ῥάδιον εἶναι τῶν τοιούτων ἀπτόμενον σωφρονεῖν. ἀλλὰ<sup>5</sup> καὶ Κριτόβουλόν ποτε τὸν Κρίτωνος πυθόμενος ὅτι ἐφίλησε τὸν ᾿Αλκιβιάδου υἱὸν καλὸν ὄντα, παρόντος τοῦ Κριτοβούλου ἤρετο Ξενοφῶντα, Εἰπέ μοι, ἔφη, ὧ Ξενοφῶν, οὐ σὰ Κριτόβουλον ἐνόμιζες εἶναι τῶν σωφρονικῶν ἀνθρώπων

 $<sup>^5</sup>$  Quadraginta fere lineis ante  $\vec{\alpha}\lambda\lambda\hat{\alpha}$  erasis in PHeid. 206 (s. III  $^{\rm in}$ a. C.) lacunam statuit Bandini

#### MEMORABILIA I. 3.5-3.9

possible to imagine a man doing so little work as not to earn enough to satisfy the needs of Socrates. He ate just enough food to make eating a pleasure, and he was so ready for his food that he found appetite the best sauce:25 and any kind of drink he found pleasant, because he drank only when he was thirsty. Whenever he accepted an invitation to dinner, he resisted without difficulty the common temptation to exceed the limit of satiety; and he advised those who could not do likewise to avoid appetizers that encouraged them to eat and drink what they did not want: for these were the ruin of stomachs, brains, and souls. I believe, he said in jest, that it was by providing a feast of such things that Circe made pigs; and it was partly by the prompting of Hermes, 26 partly through his own selfrestraint and avoidance of overindulgence in such things. that Odysseus was not turned into a pig. This was how he would talk on the subject, half joking, half in earnest.

Of sexual relations with beautiful people he advised resolute avoidance:<sup>27</sup> it is not easy to control yourself once you meddle with that sort of thing. <...> Moreover, on hearing that Critobulus had kissed Alcibiades' handsome boy,<sup>28</sup> he put this question to Xenophon in Critobulus' presence: "Tell me, Xenophon, did you not consider Cri-

<sup>25</sup> Cyr. 1.5.12.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>26</sup> Hom. Od. 10.281-82.

<sup>27</sup> Pl. Smp. 4.10-26.

 $<sup>^{28}</sup>$  Clinias ( $Smp.\ 4.12$ ), probably Alcibiades' cousin (Pl.  $Euth.\ 275b).$ 

μάλλον ἢ τῶν θρασέων καὶ τῶν προνοητικῶν μάλλον ἢ τῶν ἀνοήτων τε καὶ ῥιψοκινδύνων;

Πάνυ μὲν οὖν, ἔφη ὁ Ξενοφῶν.

Νῦν τοίνυν νόμιζε αὐτὸν θερμουργότατον εἶναι καὶ λεωργότατον· οὖτος κἂν εἰς μαχαίρας κυβιστήσειε κἂν εἰς πῦρ ἄλοιτο.

Καὶ τί δή, ἔφη ὁ Ξενοφῶν, ἰδῶν ποιοῦντα τοιαῦτα κατέγνωκας αὐτοῦ;

Οὐ γὰρ οὖτος, ἔφη, ἐτόλμησε τὸν Ἀλκιβιάδου υίὸν φιλῆσαι, ὄντα εὐπροσωπότατον καὶ ὡραιότατον;

'Αλλ' εἰ μέντοι, ἔφη ὁ Ξενοφῶν, τοιοῦτόν ἐστι τὸ ριψοκίνδυνον ἔργον, κἂν ἐγώ μοι δοκῶ τὸν κίνδυνον τοῦτον ὑποστῆναι.6

<sup>3</sup>Ω τλήμον, ἔφη ὁ Σωκράτης, καὶ τί ἂν οἴει παθεῖν καλὸν φιλήσας; ἄρ' οὐκ ἂν αὐτίκα μάλα δοῦλος μὲν εἶναι ἀντ' ἐλευθέρου, πολλὰ δὲ δαπανᾶν εἰς βλαβερὰς ἡδονάς, πολλὴν δὲ ἀσχολίαν ἔχειν τοῦ ἐπιμεληθῆναί τινος καλοῦ κἀγαθοῦ, σπουδάζειν δ' ἀναγκασθῆναι ἐφ' οἶς οὐδ' ἂν μαινόμενος σπουδάσειεν;

<sup>°</sup>Ω Ἡράκλεις, ἔφη ὁ Ξενοφῶν, ὡς δεινήν τινα λέγεις τοῦ φιλήματος δύναμιν εἶναι.

Καὶ τοῦτο, ἔφη ὁ Σωκράτης, θαυμάζεις; οὐκ οἶσθα, ἔφη, τὰ φαλάγγια οὐδ' ἡμιωβολιαῖα ὄντα τὸ μέγεθος ὅσον μόνον ἁψάμενα τῷ στόματι ταῖς ὀδύναις τε ἐπιτρίβει τοὺς ἀνθρώπους καὶ τοῦ φρονεῖν ἐξίστησι;

Ναὶ μὰ Δί', ἔφη ὁ Ξενοφῶν· ἐνίησι γάρ τι τὰ φαλάγγια κατὰ τὸ δῆγμα.

13 ηωρε, ἔφη ὁ Σωκράτης, τοὺς δὲ καλοὺς οὐκ οἴει

10

11

## MEMORABILIA I. 3.9-3.13

tobulus to be a sober person rather than a rash one, and prudent rather than thoughtless and reckless?"

"Certainly," said Xenophon.

"Then you are to consider him henceforth as utterly hotheaded and reckless: the man would do a somersault into a ring of knives; he would jump into fire."

"What on earth has he done to make you think so badly

of him?" asked Xenophon.

"Hasn't the man dared to kiss Alcibiades' boy, who is very good-looking and attractive?"

"Oh, if that sort of behavior is tossing caution to the

wind, I think I might run the risk myself."

"Pitiful! What do you think will happen to you through kissing a handsome face? Won't you lose your liberty at once and become a slave, begin spending large sums on harmful pleasures, have no time to give to anything fit for a gentleman, be forced to concern yourself with things that not even a lunatic would take seriously?"

"Heracles! what alarming power in a kiss!" cried Xeno-

phon.

"What? Does that surprise you?" continued Socrates. "Don't you know that poisonous spiders, though smaller than a penny, need only fasten their fangs on people to inflict excruciating pain and drive them out of their minds?"

"I surely do; for spiders inject something by their biting."

"Simpleton! You don't think that handsome people in-

10

11

12

<sup>6</sup> PHeid. 206: ὑπομεῖναι codd.

φιλοῦντας ἐνιέναι τι, ὅτι σὰ οὐχ ὁρậς; οὐκ οἶσθ', ὅτι τοῦτο τὸ θηρίον, ὁ καλοῦσι καλὸν καὶ ὡραῖον, τοσούτῳ δεινότερόν ἐστι τῶν φαλαγγίων, ὅσῷ ἐκεῖνα μὲν ἁψάμενα, τοῦτο δὲ οὐδ' ἀπτόμενον, ἐὰν δέ τις αὐτὸ θεᾶται, ἐνίησί τι καὶ πάνυ πρόσωθεν τοιοῦτον, ὥστε μαίνεσθαι ποιεῖν;

["Ισως δὲ καὶ οἱ "Ερωτες τοξόται διὰ τοῦτο καλοῦνται, ὅτι καὶ πρόσωθεν οἱ καλοὶ τιτρώσκουσιν.]<sup>7</sup>

'Αλλὰ συμβουλεύω σοι, ὧ Ξενοφῶν, ὁπόταν ἴδης τινὰ καλόν, φεύγειν προτροπάδην, σοὶ δ', ὧ Κριτό-βουλε, συμβουλεύω ἀπενιαυτίσαι μόλις γὰρ ἂν ἐν τοσούτω χρόνω τὸ δῆγμα ὑγιὴς γένοιο.

Οὕτω δὴ καὶ ἀφροδισιάζειν τοὺς μὴ ἀσφαλῶς ἔχοντας πρὸς ἀφροδίσια ῷετο χρῆναι πρὸς τοιαῦτα, οἶα μὴ πάνυ μὲν δεομένου τοῦ σώματος οὐκ ἂν προσδέξαιτο ἡ ψυχή, δεομένου δὲ οὐκ ἂν πράγματα παρέχοι. αὐτὸς δὲ πρὸς ταῦτα φανερὸς ἢν οὕτω παρεσκευασμένος, ὥστε ῥῷον ἀπέχεσθαι τῶν καλλίστων καὶ ὡραιοτάτων ἢ οἱ ἄλλοι τῶν αἰσχίστων καὶ ἀωροτάτων. περὶ μὲν δὴ βρώσεως καὶ πόσεως καὶ ἀφροδισίων οὕτω κατεσκευασμένος ἦν, καὶ ἤετο οὐδὲν ἂν ἦττον ἀρκούντως8 ἤδεσθαι τῶν πολλὰ ἐπὶ τούτοις πραγματευομένων, λυπεῖσθαι δὲ πολὺ ἔλαττον.

4. Εἰ δέ τινες Σωκράτην νομίζουσιν, οἶς ἔνιοι γράφουσί τε καὶ λέγουσι περὶ αὐτοῦ τεκμαιρόμενοι, προτρέψασθαι μὲν ἀνθρώπους ἐπ' ἀρετὴν κράτιστον γεγονέναι, προαγαγεῖν δ' ἐπ' αὐτὴν οὐχ ἱκανόν, σκε-

14

ject something when they kiss, just because you don't see it? Don't you know that this creature, that they call young and good-looking, is more dangerous than spiders, seeing that it need not even come in contact, like the spiders, but at any distance can inject something maddening into anyone who but looks at it?

["Maybe, too, the loves are called archers for this reason, that the fair can wound even at a distance."]

"No, I advise you, Xenophon, as soon as you see a handsome face, to take to your heels and flee: and you, Critobulus, I advise to spend a year abroad. It will certainly take you at least that long to recover from the bite."

Thus in the matter of sexual passions he held that those whose passions were not under complete control should limit themselves to such indulgence as the soul would reject unless the need of the body were pressing, and such as would do no harm when the need arose. As for his own conduct in this matter, it was evident that he had trained himself to avoid the handsomest and most attractive youths more easily than others avoid the ugliest and least attractive. Concerning eating and drinking then and carnal indulgence such were his views, and he thought that a due portion of pleasure would be no more lacking to him than to those who give themselves much to these, and that much less trouble would fall to his lot.

4. If any hold the opinion expressed in some written or spoken accounts based on inferences about Socrates, that although he was consummate in exhorting people to virtue, he was an incompetent to guide them to it, let them 14

<sup>7</sup> del. Dindorf

<sup>8</sup> ἀρκούντως . . . 4.3 ἀνδριαντοποιία suppetit PLitLond 149

ψάμενοι μὴ μόνον ἃ ἐκεῖνος κολαστηρίου ἔνεκα τοὺς πάντ' οἰομένους εἰδέναι ἐρωτῶν ἤλεγχεν, ἀλλὰ καὶ ἃ λέγων συνημέρευε τοῖς συνδιατρίβουσι, δοκιμαζόντων, εἰ ἰκανὸς ἦν βελτίους ποιεῖν τοὺς συνόντας. λέξω δὲ πρῶτον ἄ ποτε αὐτοῦ ἤκουσα περὶ τοῦ δαιμονίου διαλεγομένου πρὸς ᾿Αριστόδημον τὸν μικρὸν ἐπικαλούμενον. καταμαθῶν γὰρ αὐτὸν οὔτε θύοντα τοῖς θεοῖς οὔτ' εὐχόμενον ξῆλον ὄν>τα¹ο οὔτε μαντικῆ χρώμενον, ἀλλὰ καὶ τῶν ποιούντων ταῦτα καταγελῶντα, Εἰπέ μοι, ἔφη, ὧ ᾿Αριστόδημε, ἔστιν οὕστινας ἀνθρώπους τεθαύμακας ἐπὶ σοφία;

Έγωγε, ἔφη.

3

Καὶ ὅς, Λέξον ἡμῖν, ἔφη, τὰ ὀνόματα αὐτῶν.

Έπὶ μὲν τοίνυν ἐπῶν ποιήσει Ὅμηρον ἔγωγε μάλιστα τεθαύμακα, ἐπὶ δὲ διθυράμβω Μελανιππίδην, ἐπὶ δὲ τραγωδία Σοφοκλέα, ἐπὶ δὲ ἀνδριαντοποιία Πολύκλειτον, ἐπὶ δὲ ζωγραφία Ζεῦξιν.

4 Πότερά σοι δοκοῦσιν οἱ ἀπεργαζόμενοι εἴδωλα ἄφρονά τε καὶ ἀκίνητα ἀξιοθαυμαστότεροι εἶναι ἢ οἱ ζῷα ἔμφρονά τε καὶ ἐνεργά;

Πολὺ νὴ Δία οἱ ζῷα, ϵἴπερ γε μὴ τύχη τινί, ἀλλ' ἀπὸ γνώμης ταῦτα γίγνεται.

Τῶν δὲ ἀτεκμάρτως ἐχόντων ὅτου ἕνεκά ἐστι καὶ τῶν φανερῶς ἐπ᾽ ἀφελείᾳ ὄντων πότερα τύχης καὶ πότερα γνώμης ἔργα κρίνεις;

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> Portus: μὴ μαχόμενον AB: ]χομεν[ PGrenf. II 13: om. cett. <sup>10</sup> suppl. Marchant, cf. 1.1.2: ]τα PGrenf. II 13: om. codd.

#### MEMORABILIA I. 4.1-4.4

consider not only the searching cross-examination with which he chastised those who thought themselves omniscient<sup>29</sup> but his daily talks with his familiar friends, and then judge whether he was capable of improving his associates. I will first state what I once heard him say about the divinity in conversation with Aristodemus the dwarf, as he was called.<sup>30</sup> On learning that he was not known to sacrifice to the gods or pray or use divination and actually made fun of those who did so, he said: "Tell me, Aristodemus, do you admire any human beings for wisdom?"

"I do," he answered.

"Tell us their names."

"In epic poetry Homer comes first, in my opinion; in dithyramb, Melanippides; in tragedy, Sophocles; in sculpture, Polyclitus; in painting, Zeuxis."

"Which do you think deserve greater admiration, the creators of likenesses thoughtless and motionless or the creators of living beings endowed with thought and action?"

"Living beings by far, provided only they are created by design and not mere chance."

"Suppose that it is impossible to guess the purpose of one creature's existence, and obvious that another's serves a useful end, which, in your judgment, is the work of chance, and which of design?"

 $<sup>^{29}\,\</sup>mathrm{The}$  Sophists, such as Euthydemus and Dionysodorus in Pl. Euth.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>30</sup> Pl. Smp. 173b.

Πρέπει μὲν τὰ ἐπ' ἀφελείᾳ γιγνόμενα γνώμης εἶναι ἔργα.

Οὔκουν δοκεί σοι ὁ ἐξ ἀρχῆς ποιῶν ἀνθρώπους ἐπ' ώφελεία προσθείναι αὐτοῖς δι' ὧν αἰσθάνονται ἕκαστα, ὀφθαλμοὺς μὲν ὥσθ' ὁρᾶν τὰ ὁρατά, ὧτα δὲ ώστ' ἀκούειν τὰ ἀκουστά; ὀσμῶν γε μήν, εἰ μη ρίνες προσετέθησαν, τί αν ημιν ὄφελος ην; τίς δ' αν αἴσθησις ἦν γλυκέων καὶ δριμέων καὶ πάντων τῶν διὰ στόματος ήδέων, εί μη γλώττα τούτων γνώμων ένειργάσθη; πρὸς δὲ τούτοις οὐ δοκεί σοι καὶ τόδε προνοίας ἔργοις ἐοικέναι, τὸ ἐπεὶ ἀσθενὴς μέν ἐστιν ἡ όψις, βλεφάροις αὐτὴν θυρῶσαι, ἃ ὅταν μὲν αὐτῆ χρησθαί τι δέη, ἀναπετάννυται, ἐν δὲ τῶ ὕπνω συγκλείεται; ώς δ' ἂν μηδε ἄνεμοι βλάπτωσιν, ήθμον βλεφαρίδας έμφυσαι όφρύσι τε άπογεισώσαι τὰ ύπερ των όμματων, ως μηδ' ό έκ της κεφαλης ίδρως κακουργή· τὸ δὲ τὴν ἀκοὴν δέχεσθαι μὲν πάσας φωνάς, ἐμπίπλασθαι δὲ μήποτε καὶ τοὺς μὲν πρόσθεν όδόντας πασι ζώοις οίους τέμνειν είναι, τοὺς δὲ γομφίους οἴους παρὰ τούτων δεξαμένους λεαίνειν καὶ στόμα μέν, δι' οδ ὧν ἐπιθυμεῖ τὰ ζῶα εἰσπέμπεται, πλησίον ὀφθαλμῶν καὶ ῥινῶν καταθεῖναι: ἐπεὶ δὲ τὰ άποχωροῦντα δυσχερή, ἀποστρέψαι τοὺς τούτων όχετοὺς καὶ ἀπενεγκεῖν ή δυνατὸν προσωτάτω ἀπὸ τῶν αἰσθήσεων ταῦτα οὕτω προνοητικώς πεπραγμένα ἀπορείς πότερα τύχης ἢ γνώμης ἔργα ἐστίν;

Οὐ μὰ τὸν Δί', ἔφη, ἀλλ' οὕτω γε σκοπουμένω πάνυ

7

## MEMORABILIA I. 4.4-4.7

"Presumably the creature that serves some useful end is the work of design."

"Do you not think then that the original creator of mankind had some useful end in view when he endowed us with our several senses, giving eyes to see visible objects and ears to hear sounds? Would odors again be of any use to us had we not been endowed with nostrils? What perception should we have of sweet and bitter and all things pleasant to the palate had we no tongue in our mouth to discriminate between them? Besides these, are there not other contrivances that look like the results of forethought? Thus the eyeballs, being weak, are set behind eyelids, that open like doors when we want to see, and close when we sleep: on the lids grow lashes through which the very winds filter harmlessly: above the eyes is a coping of brows that lets no drop of sweat from the head hurt them. The ears catch all sounds, but are never choked with them. Again, the incisors of all creatures are adapted for cutting, the molars for receiving food from them and grinding it. And again, the mouth, through which the food they want goes in, is set near the eyes and nostrils; but since what goes out is unpleasant, the ducts through which it passes are turned away and removed as far as possible from the organs of sense. With such signs of forethought in these arrangements, can you doubt whether they are the works of chance or design?"

"No, of course not. When I regard them in this light

ἔοικε ταῦτα σοφοῦ τινος δημιουργοῦ καὶ φιλοζώου τεχνήμασι.

Τὸ δὲ ἐμφῦσαι μὲν ἔρωτα τῆς τεκνοποιίας, ἐμφῦσαι δὲ ταῖς γειναμέναις ἔρωτα τοῦ ἐκτρέφειν, τοῖς δὲ τραφεῖσι μέγιστον μὲν πόθον τοῦ ζῆν, μέγιστον δὲ φόβον τοῦ θανάτου;

'Αμέλει καὶ ταῦτα ἔοικε μηχανήμασί τινος ζῷα εἶναι βουλευσαμένου.

Σὺ δὲ σαυτὸν φρόνιμόν τι δοκεῖς ἔχειν;

Έρώτα γ' οὖν καὶ ἀποκρινοῦμαι.

"Αλλοθι δὲ οὐδαμοῦ οὐδὲν οἴει φρόνιμον εἶναι; καὶ ταῦτ' εἰδώς, ὅτι γῆς τε μικρὸν μέρος ἐν τῷ σώματι πολλῆς οὔσης ἔχεις καὶ ὑγροῦ βραχὺ πολλοῦ ὄντος καὶ τῶν ἄλλων δήπου μεγάλων ὅντων ἐκάστου μικρὸν μέρος λαβόντι τὸ σῶμα συνήρμοσταί σοι νοῦν δὲ μόνον ἄρα οὐδαμοῦ ὄντα σε εὐτυχῶς πως δοκεῖς συναρπάσαι καὶ τάδε τὰ ὑπερμεγέθη καὶ πλῆθος ἄπειρα δι' ἀφροσύνην τινὰ οὕτως οἴει εὐτάκτως ἔχειν;

Μὰ Δί', οὐ γὰρ ὁρῶ τοὺς κυρίους, ὥσπερ τῶν ἐνθάδε γιγνομένων τοὺς δημιουργούς.

Οὐδὲ γὰρ τὴν σαυτοῦ σύγε ψυχὴν ὁρậς, ἢ τοῦ σώματος κυρία ἐστίν ὥστε κατά γε τοῦτο ἔξεστί σοι λέγειν, ὅτι οὐδὲν γνώμη, ἀλλὰ τύχη πάντα πράττεις.

Καὶ ὁ ᾿Αριστόδημος, Οὕτοι, ἔφη, ἐγώ, ὧ Σώκρατες, ὑπερορῶ τὸ δαιμόνιον, ἀλλ᾽ ἐκεῖνο μεγαλοπρεπέστερον ἡγοῦμαι ἢ ὡς τῆς ἐμῆς θεραπείας προσδεῖσθαι.

Οὐκοῦν, ἔφη, ὅσω μεγαλοπρεπέστερον ὂν ἀξιοῖ σε θεραπεύειν, τοσούτω μᾶλλον τιμητέον αὐτό.

8

9

### MEMORABILIA I. 4.7-4.10

they do look very like the handiwork of an ingenious craftsman fond of living creatures."

"What of the natural desire to beget children, the mother's desire to nurture her young, the child's mighty will to live and mighty fear of death?"

"Undoubtedly these, too, look like the contrivances of one who deliberately planned the existence of living creatures."

"And you, do you think you have any wisdom yourself?"
"Well, ask me a question and judge from my answer."

"Do you think that wisdom is nowhere else to be found, although you know that you have a mere speck of all the

although you know that you have a mere speck of all the earth in your body and a mere drop of all the water, and that of all the other presumably mighty elements you received just a scrap toward the fashioning of your body? And do you think that you alone by some lucky accident have caught a mind existing nowhere else, and that the orderly ranks of all these elements, huge in size and infinite in number, are due to a sort of absurdity, as you suppose?"

"Yes I do; for I don't see these masters, whereas I see the makers of things in this world."

"Neither do you see your own soul,<sup>31</sup> which has mastery of the body; so that, as far as that goes, you may say that you do nothing by design and everything by chance."

Here Aristodemus said, "Really, Socrates, I don't despise the divinity but think it too great to need extra service from me."

"Then the greater the power that deigns to serve you, the more honor it should have." 9

<sup>31</sup> Cyr. 8.7.17.

Εὖ ἴσθι, ἔφη, ὅτι εἰ νομίζοιμι θεοὺς ἀνθρώπων τι 11 φροντίζειν, οὐκ ἂν ἀμελοίην αὐτῶν.

Έπειτ' οὐκ οἴει φροντίζειν; οἳ πρῶτον μὲν μόνον των ζώων ἄνθρωπον ὀρθὸν ἀνέστησαν ἡ δὲ ὀρθότης καὶ προοράν πλέον ποιεί δύνασθαι καὶ τὰ ὕπερθεν μᾶλλον θεᾶσθαι καὶ ἦττον κακοπαθεῖν ἔπειτα τοῖς μὲν ἄλλοις έρπετοῖς πόδας ἔδωκαν, οἱ τὸ πορεύεσθαι μόνον παρέχουσιν, άνθρώπω δὲ καὶ χείρας προσέθεσαν, αι τὰ πλείστα, οίς εὐδαιμονέστεροι ἐκείνων έσμέν, έξεργάζονται. καὶ μὴν γλῶττάν γε πάντων τῶν ζώων έχόντων μόνην την των άνθρώπων έποίησαν οἵαν ἄλλοτε ἀλλαχή ψαύουσαν τοῦ στόματος ἀρθροῦν τε τὴν φωνὴν καὶ σημαίνειν πάντα ἀλλήλοις, ἃ βουλόμεθα. τὸ δὲ καὶ τὰς τῶν ἀφροδισίων ἡδονὰς τοῖς μὲν ἄλλοις ζώοις δοῦναι περιγράψαντας τοῦ ἔτους χρόνον, ἡμῖν δὲ συνεχῶς μέχρι γήρως ταῦτα παρέχειν;

Οὐ τοίνυν μόνον ἤρκεσε τῷ θεῷ τοῦ σώματος ἐπιμεληθήναι, άλλ' ὅπερ μέγιστόν ἐστι, καὶ τὴν ψυχὴν κρατίστην τῷ ἀνθρώπῳ ἐνέφυσε, τίνος γὰρ ἄλλου ζώου ψυχὴ πρῶτα μὲν θεῶν τῶν τὰ μέγιστα καὶ κάλλιστα συνταξάντων ήσθηται ὅτι εἰσί; τί δὲ φῦλον άλλο ἢ ἄνθρωποι θεοὺς θεραπεύουσι; ποία δὲ ψυχὴ της ανθρωπίνης ίκανωτέρα προφυλάττεσθαι η λιμον η δίψος η ψύχη η θάλπη η νόσοις ἐπικουρήσαι η ρώμην ἀσκήσαι ἢ πρὸς μάθησιν ἐκπονήσαι, ἢ ὅσα αν ἀκούση ἢ ἴδη ἢ μάθη ἱκανωτέρα ἐστὶ διαμεμνῆσθαι; οὐ γὰρ πάνυ σοι κατάδηλον, ὅτι παρὰ τἆλλα 14

12

#### MEMORABILIA I. 4.11-4.14

"Rest assured, if I believed that the gods give any thought to humankind, I would not neglect them."

"Then do you really think that they give no thought? In the first place, the human is the only living creature that they have made to stand upright; and the upright position gives him a wider range of vision in front and a better view of things above, and exposes him less to injury. Secondly, to other terrestrial creatures they have given feet that afford only the power of moving, whereas they have endowed humans with hands, which accomplish most of the things that make us more fortunate than the others. Again, though all creatures have a tongue, the tongue of humankind alone has been formed by them to be capable of contact with different parts of the mouth, so as to enable us to articulate the voice and express to one another everything we wish. Once more, for all other creatures they have prescribed a fixed season of sexual pleasures, while for us they provide them continuously until old age.

"What is more, the deity was not content to care for the body but, most important, also implanted in the human being the soul and made it dominant. For what other creature's soul, in the first place, has apprehended the existence of gods who set in order the vastness and great beauty of the universe? And what race of living things other than man worships gods? And what soul is more apt than man's to make provision against hunger and thirst, cold and heat, to relieve sickness and promote health, to acquire knowledge by toil, and to remember accurately all that is heard, seen, or learned? For is it not quite obvious

14

11

12

ζφα ὥσπερ θεοὶ ἄνθρωποι βιοτεύουσι, φύσει καὶ τῷ σώματι καὶ τῇ ψυχῇ κρατιστεύοντες; οὔτε γὰρ βοὸς ἄν ἔχων σῶμα, ἀνθρώπου δὲ γνώμην ἐδύνατ' ἄν πράττειν ἃ ἐβούλετο, οὔθ' ὅσα χεῖρας ἔχει, ἄφρονα δ' ἐστί, πλέον οὐδὲν ἔχει. σὰ δ' ἀμφοτέρων τῶν πλείστου ἀξίων τετυχηκὼς οὖκ οἴει σου θεοὺς ἐπιμελεῖσθαι; ἀλλ' ὅταν τί ποιήσωσι, νομιεῖς αὐτούς σου φροντίζειν;

Όταν πέμπωσιν, ὥσπερ σὰ φὴς πέμπειν αὐτούς, συμβούλους ὅτι χρὴ ποιείν καὶ μὴ ποιείν.

Όταν δὲ Ἀθηναίοις, ἔφη, πυνθανομένοις τι διὰ μαντικής φράζωσιν, οὐ καὶ σοὶ δοκεῖς φράζειν αὐτούς; οὐδ' ὅταν τοῖς Ελλησι τέρατα πέμποντες προσημαίνωσιν, οὐδ' ὅταν πᾶσιν ἀνθρώποις, ἀλλὰ μόνον σὲ έξαιροῦντες ἐν ἀμελεία κατατίθενται: οἴει δ' ἂν τοὺς θεούς τοῖς ἀνθρώποις δόξαν ἐμφῦσαι, ὡς ἱκανοί εἰσιν εὖ καὶ κακῶς ποιεῖν, εἰ μὴ δυνατοὶ ἦσαν, καὶ τοὺς άνθρώπους έξαπατωμένους τὸν πάντα χρόνον οὐδέποτ' αν αισθέσθαι; ούχ όρας, ὅτι τὰ πολυχρονιώτατα καὶ σοφώτατα τῶν ἀνθρωπίνων, πόλεις καὶ ἔθνη, θεοσεβέστατά έστι καὶ αἱ φρονιμώταται ἡλικίαι θεῶν έπιμελέσταται; ώγαθέ, ἔφη, κατάμαθε, ὅτι καὶ ὁ σὸς νοῦς ἐνὼν τὸ σὸν σῶμα ὅπως βούλεται μεταχειρίζεται. οἴεσθαι οὖν χρὴ καὶ τὴν ἐν ‹τῷ› παντὶ φρόνησιν τὰ πάντα ὅπως ἂν αὐτῆ ἡδὺ ἦ, οὕτω τίθεσθαι, καὶ μὴ τὸ σὸν μὲν ὄμμα δύνασθαι ἐπὶ πολλὰ στάδια ἐξικνεῖσθαι, τὸν δὲ τοῦ θεοῦ ὀφθαλμὸν ἀδύνατον εἶναι ἄμα πάντα όραν, μηδε την σην μεν ψυχην καὶ περὶ των

15

16

#### MEMORABILIA I. 4.14-4.17

to you that, in comparison with the other animals, humans live like gods, naturally excelling them both in body and in soul? For with a human mind and an ox's body we could not carry out our wishes, nor does the possession of hands without reason provide any advantages. So do you, having received both these priceless gifts, still not think that the gods care about you? What are they to do, to make you believe that you are in their thoughts?"

"When they send advisors, as you declare they do, tell-

ing you what to do and what not to do."

"But when the Athenians inquire of them by divination and they reply, do you not suppose that they are telling you too? Or when they send portents for warning to the Greeks or to all the world? Are you their one exception, the only one consigned to neglect? Or do you suppose that the gods would have put into mankind a belief in their ability to help and harm if they had not that power; and that mankind throughout the ages would never have detected the fraud? Do you not see that the wisest and most enduring of human institutions, cities and nations, are most god-fearing, and that the most thoughtful periods of life are the most religious? Be well assured, my good friend, that the mind within you directs your body as it wishes; and equally you must think that the thought in the universe disposes everything as it pleases. Nor think that, though your eye can travel over many miles, the god's eye cannot see the whole world at once, and that, though your

71

15

16

ἐνθάδε καὶ περὶ τῶν ἐν Αἰγύπτῳ καὶ ἐν Σικελίᾳ δύνασθαι φροντίζειν, τὴν δὲ τοῦ θεοῦ φρόνησιν μὴ ἰκανὴν εἶναι ἄμα πάντων ἐπιμελεῖσθαι. ἢν μέντοι ὥσπερ ἀνθρώπους θεραπεύων γιγνώσκεις τοὺς ἀντιθεραπεύειν ἐθέλοντας καὶ χαριζόμενος τοὺς ἀντιχαριζομένους καὶ συμβουλευόμενος καταμανθάνεις τοὺς φρονίμους, οὕτω καὶ τῶν θεῶν πεῖραν λαμβάνης θεραπεύων, εἴ τί σοι θελήσουσι περὶ τῶν ἀδήλων ἀνθρώποις συμβουλεύειν, γνώση τὸ θεῖον ὅτι τοσοῦτον καὶ τοιοῦτόν ἐστιν, ὥσθ᾽ ἄμα πάντα ὁρᾶν καὶ πάντα ἀκούειν καὶ πανταχοῦ παρεῖναι καὶ ἄμα πάντων ἐπιμελεῖσθαι.

Έμοι μεν οὖν ταῦτα λέγων οὐ μόνον τοὺς συνόντας εδόκει ποιεῖν, ὁπότε ὑπὸ τῶν ἀνθρώπων ὁρῷντο, ἀπεκεσθαι τῶν ἀνοσίων τε καὶ ἀδίκων καὶ αἰσχρῶν, ἀλλὰ καὶ ὁπότε ἐν ἐρημίᾳ εἶεν, ἐπείπερ ἡγήσαιντο μηδὲν ἄν ποτε ὧν πράττοιεν θεοὺς διαλαθεῖν.

5. Εἰ δὲ δὴ καὶ ἐγκράτεια καλόν τε κἀγαθὸν ἀνδρὶ κτῆμά ἐστιν, ἐπισκεψώμεθα εἴ τι προὐβίβαζε λέγων εἰς ταύτην τοιάδε·

<sup>8</sup>Ω ἄνδρες, εἰ πολέμου ἡμῖν γενομένου βουλοίμεθα έλέσθαι ἄνδρα, ὑφ' οὖ μάλιστ' ἂν αὐτοὶ μὲν σωζοίμεθα, τοὺς δὲ πολεμίους χειροίμεθα, ἄρ' ὄντιν' ἂν αἰσθανοίμεθα ἥττω γαστρὸς ἢ οἴνου ἢ ἀφροδισίων ἢ πόνου ἢ ὕπνου, τοῦτον ἂν αἰροίμεθα; καὶ πῶς ἂν οἰηθείημεν τὸν τοιοῦτον ἢ ἡμᾶς σώσειν ἢ τοὺς πολεμίους κρατήσειν; εἰ δ' ἐπὶ τελευτῆ τοῦ βίου γενόμενοι βουλοίμεθά τῷ ἐπιτρέψαι ἢ παΐδας ἄρρενας παιδεῦσαι ἢ θυγατέρας παρθένους διαφυλάξαι ἢ χρήματα διασῶ-

18

#### MEMORABILIA I. 4.17–5.2

soul can ponder on matters here and in Egypt and Sicily,<sup>32</sup> the god's thought is insufficient to take care of the whole world at once. Indeed, just as by serving men you find out who is willing to serve you in return, by being kind who will be kind to you in return, and by taking counsel discover the masters of thought, so try the gods by serving them, and see whether they will consent to counsel you in matters hidden from mankind. Then you will know that such is the greatness and such the nature of the deity that it sees everything<sup>33</sup> and hears everything alike, and is present in everywhere and takes care of everything."

To me at least it seemed that by these sayings he kept his companions from impiety, injustice, and baseness, not only when they might be seen by people but even in solitude, since they always felt that no deed of theirs could at any time escape divine notice.

5. If indeed self-control too is a fair and noble possession, let us now consider whether he led people closer to it by conversing in the following way:

"Gentlemen, if we were at war and wanted to choose a leader most capable of helping us to save ourselves and conquer the enemy, would we choose one whom we could tell was no match for the belly, for wine, lust, toil, or sleep? How could we expect that such a man would either save us or defeat the enemy? Or if at the end of our life we should wish to entrust someone with educating our boys or protecting our girls or safeguarding our property, would

18

<sup>32</sup> Places distant but familiar to Athenians.

<sup>33</sup> Cyr. 8.7.22.

σαι, ἆρ' ἀξιόπιστον είς ταῦτα ἡγησαίμεθ' ἂν τὸν άκρατη; δούλω δ' άκρατει έπιτρέψαιμεν αν η βοσκήματα ἢ ταμιεῖα ἢ ἔργων ἐπιστασίαν; διάκονον δὲ καὶ άγοραστήν τοιούτον έθελήσαιμεν αν προίκα λαβείν; άλλὰ μὴν εἴ γε μηδὲ δοῦλον ἀκρατῆ δεξαίμεθ' ἄν, πως οὐκ ἄξιον αὐτόν γε φυλάξασθαι τοιοῦτον γενέσθαι; καί γὰρ οὐχ ὥσπερ οἱ πλεονέκται τῶν ἄλλων άφαιρούμενοι χρήματα έαυτοὺς δοκοῦσι πλουτίζειν, ούτως ὁ ἀκρατὴς τοῖς μὲν ἄλλοις βλαβερός, ἑαυτῷ δ' ώφέλιμος, άλλὰ κακοῦργος μὲν τῶν ἄλλων, έαυτοῦ δὲ πολύ κακουργότερος, εί γε κακουργότατόν έστι μή μόνον τὸν οἶκον τὸν ἑαυτοῦ φθείρειν, ἀλλὰ καὶ τὸ σωμα καὶ τὴν ψυχήν. ἐν συνουσία δὲ τίς ἂν ἡσθείη τῷ τοιούτω, ὃν εἰδείη τῷ ὄψω τε καὶ τῷ οἴνω χαίροντα μάλλον ἢ τοῖς φίλοις καὶ τὰς πόρνας ἀγαπῶντα μάλλον ἢ τοὺς ἐταίρους; ἆρά γε οὐ χρὴ πάντα ἄνδρα ήγησάμενον την έγκράτειαν άρετης είναι κρηπίδα ταύτην πρώτον έν τῆ ψυχῆ κατασκευάσασθαι; τίς γὰρ ἄνευ ταύτης ἢ μάθοι τι ἂν ἀγαθὸν ἢ μελετήσειεν άξιολόγως: η τίς ούκ αν ταις ήδοναις δουλεύων αίσχρώς διατεθείη καὶ τὸ σώμα καὶ τὴν ψυχήν: ἐμοὶ μὲν δοκεῖ νὴ τὴν Ἡραν ἐλευθέρω μὲν ἀνδρὶ εὐκτὸν εἶναι μὴ τυχεῖν δούλου τοιούτου, δουλεύοντι δὲ ταῖς τοιαύταις ήδοναις ικετεύειν τους θεους δεσποτών άγαθων τυχείν ούτως γαρ αν μόνως ό τοιούτος σωθείη.

Τοιαῦτα δὲ λέγων ἔτι ἐγκρατέστερον τοῖς ἔργοις ἢ τοῖς λόγοις ἑαυτὸν ἐπεδείκνυεν οὐ γὰρ μόνον τῶν διὰ τοῦ σώματος ἡδονῶν ἐκράτει, ἀλλὰ καὶ τῆς διὰ τῶν

# MEMORABILIA I. 5.2-5.6

we consider the man lacking self-control trustworthy for these matters? Would we entrust livestock or storehouses or project management to a slave lacking self-control? Would we be willing to accept someone like that as a servant or purveyor even as a free gift? If in fact we would reject even a slave lacking self-control, surely the master should take care that he does become like that himself. For whereas the greedy, by robbing others of their goods, seem to enrich themselves, a man lacking self-control reaps no advantage from the harm he does to others. No, he is a wrongdoer to others but much more so to himself, if indeed the greatest wrong of all is to ruin not only one's home but also one's body and the soul. In society too, what pleasure could you find in such a man, knowing that he prefers the food and wine to his friends, and likes the whores<sup>34</sup> better than his companions? Should every man not hold self-control to be the foundation of all virtue, and first lay this foundation firmly in his soul? For who without this can learn any good or practice it creditably? Or what man that is the slave of his pleasures would not be in a sorry plight body and soul alike? By Hera I declare that every free man should pray not to get such a slave; and every man who is a slave to such pleasures should entreat the gods to give him good masters: thus and only thus would such a man find salvation."

Such were his words; but his own self-control was shown yet more clearly by his deeds than by his words. For he kept in subjection not only the pleasures of the body,

<sup>34</sup> Women who performed at banquets for a fee or for gifts were less pejoratively referred to as "girlfriends" (*hetaerae*).

χρημάτων, νομίζων τον παρά τοῦ τυχόντος χρήματα λαμβάνοντα δεσπότην έαυτοῦ καθιστάναι καὶ δουλεύειν δουλείαν οὐδεμιᾶς ἦττον αἰσχράν.

6. Άξιον δ' αὐτοῦ καὶ ἃ πρὸς Άντιφῶντα τὸν σοφιστὴν διελέχθη μὴ παραλιπεῖν. ὁ γὰρ Άντιφῶν ποτε βουλόμενος τοὺς συνουσιαστὰς αὐτοῦ παρελέσθαι προσελθῶν τῷ Σωκράτει παρόντων αὐτῶν ἔλεξε τάδε·

\*Ω Σώκρατες, ἐγὼ μὲν ῷμην τοὺς φιλοσοφοῦντας εὐδαιμονεστέρους χρῆναι γίγνεσθαι· σὺ δέ μοι δοκεῖς τἀναντία τῆς φιλοσοφίας ἀπολελαυκέναι. ζῆς γοῦν οὕτως, ὡς οὐδ' ἄν εἶς δοῦλος ὑπὸ δεσπότη διαιτώμενος μείνειε· σιτία τε σιτῆ καὶ ποτὰ πίνεις τὰ φαυλότατα καὶ ἱμάτιον ἠμφίεσαι οὐ μόνον φαῦλον, ἀλλὰ τὸ αὐτὸ θέρους τε καὶ χειμῶνος, ἀνυπόδητός τε καὶ ἀχίτων διατελεῖς. καὶ μὴν χρήματά γε οὐ λαμβάνεις, ἃ καὶ κτωμένους εὐφραίνει καὶ κεκτημένους ἐλευθερι- ώτερόν τε καὶ ἤδιον ποιεῖ ζῆν. εἰ οὖν ὥσπερ καὶ τῶν ἄλλων ἔργων οἱ διδάσκαλοι τοὺς μαθητὰς μιμητὰς έαυτῶν ἀποδεικνύουσιν, οὕτω καὶ σὺ τοὺς συνόντας διαθήσεις, νόμιζε κακοδαιμονίας διδάσκαλος εἶναι.

Καὶ ὁ Σωκράτης πρὸς ταῦτα εἶπε· Δοκεῖς μοι, ὧ ἀντιφῶν, ὑπειληφέναι με οὕτως ἀνιαρῶς ζῆν, ὥστε πέπεισμαι σὲ μᾶλλον ἀποθανεῖν ἂν ἐλέσθαι ἢ ζῆν ὥσπερ ἐγώ. ἴθι οὖν ἐπισκεψώμεθα, τί χαλεπὸν ἤσθησαι τοὐμοῦ βίου. πότερον ὅτι τοῖς μὲν λαμβάνουσιν ἀργύριον ἀναγκαῖόν ἐστιν ἀπεργάζεσθαι τοῦτο, ἐφ΄ ὧ ἂν μισθὸν λαμβάνωσιν, ἐμοὶ δὲ μὴ λαμβάνοντι οὐκ

4

# MEMORABILIA I. 5.6-6.5

but those too that money brings, in the belief that he who takes money from any casual giver puts himself under a master and endures the basest form of slavery.

6. It is fair to him not to leave unrecorded a conversation he had with Antiphon the Sophist.<sup>35</sup> On one occasion Antiphon, wishing to take Socrates' companions away from him, approached him in their presence and spoke this way:

"Socrates, I supposed that those practicing philosophy ought to grow happier, but the benefits you have derived from philosophy are apparently very different. I mean you are living a life that would drive even a slave to desert his master. Your food and drink are of the poorest, the cloak you wear is not only a poor thing but is never changed summer or winter, and you never wear shoes or a coat. Besides you refuse to take money, the mere getting of which is a joy, while its possession gives one a more independent and pleasant life. So if you are like the teachers of other occupations, who make their pupils copy them, and intend to make your own companions do so, you must consider yourself a teacher of unhappiness."

To this Socrates replied: "Antiphon, you seem to have a notion that my life is so miserable that I feel sure you would choose death in preference to a life like mine. Come then, let us consider together what hardship you have noticed in my life. Is it that those who take money are bound to carry out the work for which they get a fee, while I, because I refuse to take it, am not obliged to talk

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>35</sup> Not certainly identifiable (the name was common) but possibly Antiphon of Rhamnous, who participated in the oligarchy of 411 and was subsequently executed.

άνάγκη διαλέγεσθαι ὧ ἂν μη βούλωμαι: ἢ την δίαιτάν μου φαυλίζεις ώς ήττον μεν ύγιεινα έσθίοντος έμου η σού, ήττον δε ισχύν παρέχοντα; η ώς χαλεπώτερα πορίσασθαι τὰ ἐμὰ διαιτήματα τῶν σῶν διὰ τὸ σπανιώτερά τε καὶ πολυτελέστερα εἶναι: ἢ ὡς ἡδίω σοι ἃ σὺ παρασκευάζη ὄντα ἢ ἐμοὶ ἃ ἐγώ; οὐκ οἶσθ', ότι ὁ μὲν ἥδιστα ἐσθίων ἥκιστα ὄψου δεῖται, ὁ δὲ ήδιστα πίνων ήκιστα τοῦ μὴ παρόντος ἐπιθυμεῖ ποτοῦ; τά γε μὴν ἱμάτια οἶσθ' ὅτι οἱ μεταβαλλόμενοι ψύχους καὶ θάλπους ένεκα μεταβάλλονται καὶ ὑποδήματα ύποδοῦνται, ὅπως μὴ διὰ τὰ λυποῦντα τοὺς πόδας κωλύωνται πορεύεσθαι ήδη οὖν ποτε ήσθου έμε ἢ διὰ ψύχος μᾶλλόν του ἔνδον μένοντα ἢ διὰ θάλπος μαχόμενόν τω περί σκιᾶς ἢ διὰ τὸ ἀλγείν τοὺς πόδας οὐ βαδίζοντα ὅπου ἂν βούλωμαι; οὐκ οἶσθ', ὅτι οἱ φύσει ἀσθενέστατοι τῶ σώματι μελετήσαντες των ισχυροτάτων άμελησάντων κρείττους τε γίγνονται πρὸς ἃν μελετῶσι καὶ ῥᾶον αὐτὰ φέρουσιν; έμε δε άρα οὐκ οἴει τῷ σώματι ἀεὶ τὰ συντυγχάνοντα μελετώντα καρτερείν πάντα ράον φέρειν σοῦ μη μελετώντος; τοῦ δὲ μὴ δουλεύειν γαστρὶ μηδ' ὕπνω καὶ λαγνεία οἴει τι ἄλλο αἰτιώτερον εἶναι ἢ τὸ ἔτερα ἔχειν τούτων ήδίω, α οὐ μόνον ἐν χρεία ὄντα εὐφραίνει, άλλὰ καὶ ἐλπίδας παρέχοντα ώφελήσειν ἀεί; καὶ μὴν τοῦτό γε οἶσθα, ὅτι οἱ μὲν οἰόμενοι μηδὲν εὖ πράττειν οὐκ εὐφραίνονται, οἱ δὲ ἡγούμενοι καλῶς προχωρεῖν έαυτοις η γεωργίαν η ναυκληρίαν η άλλ' ότι αν τυγχάνωσιν έργαζόμενοι ώς εὖ πράττοντες εὐφραίνονται.

# MEMORABILIA I. 6.5-6.8

with anyone against my will? Or do you think my food poor because it is less wholesome than yours or less nourishing? or because my meals are harder to get than yours, being scarcer and more expensive? or because your diet is more enjoyable than mine? Do you not know that the greater the enjoyment of eating the less the need of condiment; the greater the enjoyment of drinking, the less the desire for drinks that are not available? As for cloaks, they are changed, as you know, on account of cold or heat. And shoes are worn to protect the feet against pain and inconvenience in walking. Now did you ever know me to stay indoors more than others on account of the cold, or to fight with any man for the shade because of the heat, or to be prevented by sore feet from walking anywhere I please? Do you not know that by training, a puny weakling comes to be better at any form of exercise he practices and gets more staying power than the muscular prodigy who neglects to train? Seeing then that I am always training my body to answer any and every call on its powers, do you not think that I can stand every strain better than you can without training? For avoiding slavery to the belly, to sleepiness, and to lustfulness, do you think there is anything more effective than the possession of other and greater pleasures, which are delightful not only to enjoy but also because they arouse hopes of lasting benefit? And again, you surely know that people who think they can do nothing successfully are unhappy, whereas those who consider themselves successful in farming or shipping or any other activity are happy in the thought of their success.

9 οἴει οὖν ἀπὸ πάντων τούτων τοσαύτην ἡδονὴν εἶναι ὅσην ἀπὸ τοῦ ἑαυτόν τε ἡγεῖσθαι βελτίω γίγνεσθαι καὶ φίλους ἀμείνους κτᾶσθαι; ἐγὼ τοίνυν διατελῶ ταῦτα νομίζων.

Έαν δὲ δὴ φίλους ἢ πόλιν ὡφελεῖν δέῃ, ποτέρῳ ἡ πλείων σχολὴ τούτων ἐπιμελεῖσθαι, τῷ ὡς ἐγὼ νῦν ἢ τῷ ὡς σὰ μακαρίζεις διαιτωμένῳ; στρατεύοιτο δὲ πότερος ἂν ῥῷον, ὁ μὴ δυνάμενος ἄνευ πολυτελοῦς διαίτης ζῆν ἢ ῷ τὸ παρὸν ἀρκοίη; ἐκπολιορκηθείη δὲ πότερος ἂν θᾶττον, ὁ τῶν χαλεπωτάτων εὐρεῖν δεόμενος ἢ ὁ τοῖς ῥᾳστοις ἐντυγχάνειν ἀρκούντως χρώμενος;

Έσικας, ὧ 'Αντιφών, τὴν εὐδαιμονίαν οἰομένῳ τρυφὴν καὶ πολυτέλειαν εἶναι ἐγὼ δὲ νομίζω τὸ μὲν μηδενὸς δεῖσθαι θεῖον εἶναι, τὸ δ' ὡς ελαχίστων ἐγγυτάτω τοῦ θείου, καὶ τὸ μὲν θεῖον κράτιστον, τὸ δ' ἐγγυτάτω τοῦ θείου ἐγγυτάτω τοῦ κρατίστου.

Πάλιν δέ ποτε ὁ ἀντιφῶν διαλεγόμενος τῷ Σωκράτει εἶπεν· το Σώκρατες, ἐγώ τοί σε δίκαιον μὲν νομίζω, σοφὸν δὲ οὐδ' ὁπωστιοῦν· δοκεῖς δέ μοι καὶ αὐτὸς τοῦτο γιγνώσκειν· οὐδένα γοῦν τῆς συνουσίας ἀργύριον πράττη. καίτοι τό γε ἱμάτιον ἢ τὴν οἰκίαν ἢ ἄλλο τι ὧν κέκτησαι νομίζων ἀργυρίου ἄξιον εἶναι οὐδενὶ ἂν μὴ ὅτι προῖκα δοίης, ἀλλ' οὐδ' ἔλαττον τῆς ἀξίας λαβών. δῆλον δή, ὅτι εἰ καὶ τὴν συνουσίαν ῷου τινὸς ἀξίαν εἶναι, καὶ ταύτης ἂν οὐκ ἔλαττον τῆς ἀξίας ἀργύριον ἐπράττου. δίκαιος μὲν οὖν ἂν εἴης, ὅτι

10

11

# MEMORABILIA I. 6.9-6.12

Do you think then that out of all this thinking there comes anything so pleasant as the thought: 'I am growing in goodness and I am making better friends?' And that, I may say, is my constant thought.

"Further, if help is wanted by friends or city, which of the two has more leisure to supply their needs, someone who lives as I am living or someone whose life you call blessed? Which will find soldiering the easier task, the one who cannot exist without expensive food or the one satisfied with what he can get? Which when besieged will surrender first, the one who wants what is very hard to come by or the one who can make do with whatever is at hand?

"You seem, Antiphon, to imagine that happiness consists in luxury and extravagance. But my belief is that to have no wants is godlike; <sup>36</sup> to have as few as possible comes next to the godlike; and as that which is godlike is supreme, so that which approaches nearest to its nature is nearest to the supreme."

In another conversation with Socrates Antiphon said: "Socrates, I for my part consider you a just but by no means a wise man, and I think you realize it yourself. Anyhow, you decline to take money for your company. Yet if you believed your cloak or house or anything you possess to be worth money, you would not part with it for nothing or even for less than its value. Clearly, then, if you set any value on your company, you would insist on getting the proper price for that too. It may well be that you are a just

10

11

<sup>36</sup> Cyr. 8.3.40.

οὐκ ἐξαπατậς ἐπὶ πλεονεξία, σοφὸς δὲ οὐκ ἄν, μηδενός γε ἄξια ἐπιστάμενος.

Ό δὲ Σωκράτης πρὸς ταῦτα εἶπεν. δ ἀντιφῶν. παρ' ἡμῖν νομίζεται τὴν ὥραν καὶ τὴν σοφίαν ὁμοίως μεν καλόν, όμοίως δε αίσχρον διατίθεσθαι είναι, τήν τε γὰρ ὥραν ἐὰν μέν τις ἀργυρίου πωλή τῶ βουλομένω, πόρνον αὐτὸν ἀποκαλοῦσιν, ἐὰν δέ τις ὃν ἂν γνῶ καλόν τε κάγαθὸν ἐραστὴν ὄντα, τοῦτον φίλον έαυτῶ ποιῆται, σώφρονα νομίζομεν καὶ τὴν σοφίαν ώσαύτως τοὺς μὲν ἀργυρίου τῶ βουλομένω πωλοῦντας σοφιστάς [ωσπερ πόρνους] 11 ἀποκαλοῦσιν, ὅστις δὲ ὃν ἂν γνῶ εὐφυᾶ ὄντα διδάσκων ὅτι ἂν ἔχη ἀγαθὸν φίλον ποιείται, τούτον νομίζομεν ἃ τῷ καλῷ κάγαθῷ πολίτη προσήκει, ταῦτα ποιείν, ἐγὼ δ' οὖν καὶ αὐτός, ὧ Άντιφων, ὥσπερ ἄλλος τις ἢ ἵππω ἀγαθω ἢ κυνὶ ἢ όρνιθι ήδεται, ούτω καὶ έτι μᾶλλον ήδομαι φίλοις άγαθοῖς καὶ ἐάν τι ἔχω ἀγαθόν, διδάσκω καὶ ἄλλοις συνίστημι, παρ' ὧν ἂν ἡγῶμαι ὦφελήσεσθαί τι αὐτοὺς εἰς ἀρετήν, καὶ τοὺς θησαυροὺς τῶν πάλαι σοφων ανδρων, ους έκεινοι κατέλιπον έν βιβλίοις γράψαντες, ἀνελίττων κοινή σύν τοῖς φίλοις διέρχομαι, καὶ ἄν τι ὁρῶμεν ἀγαθόν, ἐκλεγόμεθα καὶ μέγα νομίζομεν κέρδος, έὰν ἀλλήλοις ὡφέλιμοι γιγνώμεθα.

Έμοὶ μὲν δὴ ταῦτα ἀκούοντι ἐδόκει αὐτός τε μακάριος εἶναι καὶ τοὺς ἀκούοντας ἐπὶ καλοκἀγαθίαν ἄγειν.

Καὶ πάλιν ποτὲ τοῦ ἀντιφῶντος ἐρομένου αὐτόν,

15

13

### MEMORABILIA I. 6.12-6.15

man because you do not cheat people from avarice; but wise you cannot be, since your knowledge is worthless."

To this Socrates replied: "Antiphon, it is common opinion among us in regard to beauty and wisdom that there is an honorable and a shameful way of bestowing them. For to offer one's beauty for money to all comers is called prostitution, but we consider it virtuous to become friendly with a lover who is known to be a gentleman. So is it with wisdom: those who offer it to all comers for money are known as sophists, but we think that someone who befriends anyone he finds to be gifted by nature, and teaches him all the good he can, fulfills the duty of a citizen and a gentleman. That is my own view, Antiphon. Others have a yen for a good horse or dog or bird: my yen, stronger even than theirs, is for good friends. And I teach them all the good I can, and recommend them to others from whom I think they will get some moral benefit. And the treasures that the wise men of old have left us in their writings I open and explore with my friends. If we come on anything good we extract it, and we set much store on being useful to one another."

For my part, when I heard these words of his I judged him to be a happy man himself and to be guiding his hearers toward becoming gentlemen.

On yet another occasion Antiphon asked him how he

13

14

<sup>11</sup> del. Ruhnken

πῶς ἄλλους μὲν ἡγοῖτο πολιτικοὺς ποιεῖν, αὐτὸς δὲ οὐ πράττοι τὰ πολιτικά, εἴπερ ἐπίσταιτο·

Ποτέρως δ' ἄν, ἔφη, ὧ ἀντιφῶν, μᾶλλον τὰ πολιτικὰ πράττοιμι, εἰ μόνος αὐτὰ πράττοιμι ἢ εἰ ἐπιμελοίμην τοῦ ὡς πλείστους ἱκανοὺς εἶναι πράττειν αὐτά;

7. Ἐπισκεψώμεθα δέ, εἰ καὶ ἀλαζονείας ἀποτρέπων τοὺς συνόντας ἀρετῆς ἐπιμελεῖσθαι προέτρεπεν ἀεὶ γὰρ ἔλεγεν, ὡς οἰκ εἴη καλλίων ὁδὸς ἐπ' εὐδοξίαν ἢ δι' ἦς ἄν τις ἀγαθὸς τοῦτο γένοιτο, ὃ καὶ δοκεῖν βούλοιτο.

Ότι δ' άληθη έλεγεν, ὧδ' έδίδασκεν Ένθυμώμεθα γάρ, ἔφη, εἴ τις μὴ ὢν ἀγαθὸς αὐλητὴς δοκεῖν βούλοιτο, τί αν αὐτῷ ποιητέον εἴη. ἀρ' οὐ τὰ ἔξω τῆς τέχνης μιμητέον τοὺς ἀγαθοὺς αὐλητάς; καὶ πρῶτον μεν ὅτι ἐκεῖνοι σκεύη τε καλὰ κέκτηνται καὶ ἀκολούθους πολλούς περιάγονται, καὶ τούτω ταῦτα ποιητέον ἔπειτα ὅτι ἐκείνους πολλοὶ ἐπαινοῦσι, καὶ τούτω πολλούς έπαινέτας παρασκευαστέον, άλλα μην έργον γε οὐδαμοῦ ληπτέον ἢ εὐθὺς ἐλεγχθήσεται γελοῖος ὢν καὶ οὐ μόνον αὐλητὴς κακός, άλλὰ καὶ ἄνθρωπος άλαζών, καίτοι πολλά μεν δαπανών, μηδεν δ' ώφελούμενος, πρός δε τούτοις κακοδοξών πώς οὐκ ἐπιπόνως τε καὶ ἀλυσιτελώς καὶ καταγελάστως βιώσεται; ώς δ' αὔτως εἴ τις βούλοιτο στρατηγὸς ἀγαθὸς μὴ ὢν φαίνεσθαι η κυβερνήτης, έννοωμεν, τί αν αὐτώ συμβαίνοι. ἆρ' οὐκ ἄν, εἰ μὲν ἐπιθυμῶν τοῦ δοκεῖν ἱκανὸς είναι ταῦτα πράττειν μὴ δύναιτο πείθειν, τοῦτ' εἴη λυπηρόν, εἰ δὲ πείσειεν, ἔτι ἀθλιώτερον; δῆλον γὰρ

### MEMORABILIA I. 6.15-7.3

supposed that he was making politicians of others when he himself avoided politics, if indeed he even understood the subject.

"Well now, Antiphon," he retorted, "could I play a more active role in politics by engaging on my own or by taking pains to turn out as many competent politicians as possible?"

7. Let us next consider whether by discouraging imposture he encouraged his companions to cultivate virtue.<sup>37</sup> For he always said that the best road to good repute is the one where a man can become good in the way he wishes to be thought good. And this was how he demonstrated the truth of his words:

"Suppose a bad pipe player wants to be thought a good one, let us note what he must do. Must he not imitate good players in the accessories of the art? First, as they have fine equipment and travel with many attendants, he must do the same. Further, seeing that they win the applause of crowds, he must provide himself with a large *claque*. But, of course, he must never accept an engagement, or he will promptly expose himself to ridicule as an incompetent player and an impostor to boot. And so, what with incurring heavy expense and gaining nothing, and bringing disgrace on himself as well, he will make his life burdensome, unprofitable, and ridiculous. So too if a man who is not a general or a pilot wanted to be thought a good one, let us imagine what would happen to him. If his efforts to seem proficient in these duties failed to carry conviction, would not his failure be galling to him? if they succeeded, would not his success be still more disastrous? for it is certain

<sup>37</sup> Cyr. 1.6.22.

ότι κυβερναν κατασταθεις ὁ μὴ ἐπιστάμενος ἢ στρατηγειν ἀπολέσειεν ἂν ους ἥκιστα βούλοιτο καὶ αὐτὸς αἰσχρως ἂν καὶ κακως ἀπαλλάξειεν.

'Ωσαύτως δὲ καὶ τὸ πλούσιον καὶ τὸ ἀνδρεῖον καὶ τὸ ἰσχυρὸν μὴ ὄντα δοκεῖν ἀλυσιτελὲς ἀπέφαινε· προστάττεσθαι γὰρ αὐτοῖς ἔφη μείζω ἢ κατὰ δύναμιν καὶ μὴ δυναμένους ταῦτα ποιεῖν δοκοῦντας ἰκανοὺς εἶναι συγγνώμης οὐκ ἂν τυγχάνειν. ἀπατεῶνα δ' ἐκάλει οὐ μικρὸν μέν, εἴ τις ἀργύριον ἢ σκεῦος παρά του πειθοῖ λαβὼν ἀποστεροίη, πολὺ δὲ μέγιστον ὅστις μηδενὸς ἄξιος ὢν ἐξηπατήκοι πείθων, ὡς ἰκανὸς εἴη τῆς πόλεως ἡγεῖσθαι.

Έμοὶ μὲν οὖν ἐδόκει καὶ τοῦ ἀλαζονεύεσθαι ἀποτρέπειν τοὺς συνόντας τοιάδε διαλεγόμενος.

#### MEMORABILIA I. 7.3-7.5

that if a man who knew nothing about piloting a ship or commanding an army were appointed to such work, he would destroy those whom he least wanted to destroy and would bring ruin and disgrace on himself."

By similar reasoning he would show how unprofitable is a reputation for wealth or courage or strength when it is undeserved. "Tasks beyond their powers," he would say, "are laid on the incompetent, and they are not forgiven when they disappoint the expectation formed of their capability. The man who persuades you to lend him money or goods and then keeps them is without doubt a cheat; but much the greatest cheat of all is the man who, though worthless, has gulled his city into the belief that he is fit to direct it."

For my part I thought that such talks did discourage imposture among his companions.

1. Έδόκει δέ μοι καὶ τοιαῦτα λέγων προτρέπειν τοὺς συνόντας ἀσκεῖν ἐγκράτειαν [πρὸς ἐπιθυμίαν] βρωτοῦ καὶ ποτοῦ καὶ λαγνείας καὶ ὕπνου καὶ ῥίγους καὶ θάλπους καὶ πόνου. γνοὺς γάρ τινα τῶν συνόντων ἀκολαστοτέρως ἔχοντα πρὸς τὰ τοιαῦτα, Εἰπέ μοι, ἔφη, ὧ ᾿Αρίστιππε, εἰ δέοι σε παιδεύειν παραλαβόντα δύο τῶν νέων, τὸν μὲν ὅπως ἱκανὸς ἔσται ἄρχειν, τὸν δ' ὅπως μηδ' ἀντιποιήσεται ἀρχῆς, πῶς ἂν ἑκάτερον παιδεύοις; βούλει σκοπῶμεν ἀρξάμενοι ἀπὸ τῆς τροφῆς ὥσπερ ἀπὸ τῶν στοιχείων;

Καὶ ὁ ᾿Αρίστιππος ἔφη· Δοκεῖ γοῦν μοι ἡ τροφὴ ἀρχὴ εἶναι· οὐδὲ γὰρ ζώη γ᾽ ἄν τις, εἰ μὴ τρέφοιτο.

Οὐκοῦν τὸ μὲν βούλεσθαι σίτου ἄπτεσθαι, ὅταν ὅρα ἥκῃ, ἀμφοτέροις εἰκὸς παραγίγνεσθαι;

Εἰκὸς γάρ, ἔφη.

Τὸ οὖν προαιρεῖσθαι τὸ κατεπεῖγον μᾶλλον πράττειν ἢ τῆ γαστρὶ χαρίζεσθαι πότερον ἃν αὐτῶν ἐθίζοιμεν;

Τον εἰς το ἄρχειν, ἔφη, νη Δία παιδευόμενον, ὅπως μη τὰ τῆς πόλεως ἄπρακτα γίγνηται παρὰ τὴν ἐκείνου ἀρχήν.

# **BOOK II**

1. In other conversations I thought that he exhorted his companions to practice self-control as regards eating and drinking, sexual indulgence, sleeping, and endurance of cold and heat and toil. Aware that one of his companions was rather intemperate in such matters, he said: "Tell me, Aristippus, if you were required to take charge of two youths and educate them so that the one would be fit to rule and the other would never think of putting himself forward, how would you educate them? Shall we consider it, beginning with the elementary question of food?"

"Oh yes," replied Aristippus, "food does seem to come first: for one can't live without food."

"Well now, won't a desire for food naturally arise in both at certain times?"

"Yes, naturally."

"So which of the two should we train in the habit of transacting urgent business before he satisfies his hunger?"

"The one who is being trained to rule, undoubtedly; otherwise state business might be neglected during his tenure."

Οὐκοῦν, ἔφη, καὶ ὅταν πιεῖν βούλωνται, τὸ δύνασθαι διψῶντα ἀνέχεσθαι τῷ αὐτῷ προσθετέον;

Πάνυ μεν οὖν, ἔφη.

3

4

Τὸ δὲ ὕπνου ἐγκρατῆ εἶναι, ὥστε δύνασθαι καὶ ὀψὲ κοιμηθῆναι καὶ πρωὶ ἀναστῆναι καὶ ἀγρυπνῆσαι, εἴ τι δέοι, ποτέρῳ ἂν προσθείημεν;

Καὶ τοῦτο, ἔφη, τῷ αὐτῷ.

Τί δέ, ἔφη, τὸ ἀφροδισίων ἐγκρατῆ εἶναι, ὥστε μὴ διὰ ταῦτα κωλύεσθαι πράττειν, εἴ τι δέοι;

Καὶ τοῦτο, ἔφη, τῷ αὐτῷ.

Τί δέ, τὸ μὴ φεύγειν τοὺς πόνους, ἀλλ' ἐθελοντὴν ὑπομένειν, ποτέρῳ ἂν προσθείημεν;

Καὶ τοῦτο, ἔφη, τῷ ἄρχειν παιδευομένω.

Τί δέ, τὸ μαθεῖν εἴ τι ἐπιτήδειόν ἐστι μάθημα πρὸς τὸ κρατεῖν τῶν ἀντιπάλων ποτέρῳ ἂν προσθεῖναι μᾶλλον πρέποι;

Πολὺ νὴ Δί, ἔφη, τῷ ἄρχειν παιδευομένῳ· καὶ γὰρ τῶν ἄλλων οὐδὲν ὄφελος ἄνευ τῶν τοιούτων μαθημάτων.

Οὐκοῦν ὁ οὕτω πεπαιδευμένος ἦττον ἂν δοκεῖ σοι ὑπὸ τῶν ἀντιπάλων ἢ τὰ λοιπὰ ζῷα άλίσκεσθαι; τούτων γὰρ δήπου τὰ μὲν γαστρὶ δελεαζόμενα, καὶ μάλα ἔνια δυσωπούμενα, ὅμως τἢ ἐπιθυμίᾳ τοῦ φαγεῖν ἀγόμενα πρὸς τὸ δέλεαρ άλίσκεται, τὰ δὲ ποτῷ ἐνεδρεύεται.

Πάνυ μεν οὖν, ἔφη.

Οὐκοῦν καὶ ἄλλα ὑπὸ λαγνείας, οἶον οἴ τε ὅρτυγες καὶ οἱ πέρδικες, πρὸς τὴν τῆς θηλείας φωνὴν τῆ ἐπι-

# MEMORABILIA II. 1.2-1.4

"And must not the same one be given power to resist thirst when both want to drink?"

"Certainly."

"And to which shall we give the power of limiting his sleep so that he can go late to bed and get up early, and do without sleep if need be?"

"To the same again."

"And the power to control his sexual passions, so that he may not be hindered in taking action if need be?"

"To the same again."

"And to which shall we give the habit of not shirking a task but undertaking it willingly?"

"That too will go to the one who is being trained to rule."

"And to which would the knowledge needed for overcoming adversaries be more appropriately given?"

"Without doubt to the one who is being trained to rule; for the other lessons would be useless without such knowledge."

"Don't you think that with this education he will be less likely than other creatures to be caught by his adversaries? Some of them, you know, are so greedy that in spite of extreme timidity in some cases, they are drawn irresistibly to the bait to get food and are caught; and others are snared by drink."

"Yes, certainly."

"Others again—quails and partridges, for instance are so lecherous that when they hear the cry of the female

θυμία καὶ τἢ ἐλπίδι τῶν ἀφροδισίων φερόμενοι καὶ ἐξιστάμενοι τοῦ τὰ δεινὰ ἀναλογίζεσθαι τοῦς θη-ράτροις ἐμπίπτουσι;

Συνέφη καὶ ταῦτα.

5

Οὐκοῦν δοκεῖ σοι αἰσχρὸν εἶναι ἀνθρώπῳ ταὐτὰ πάσχειν τοῖς ἀφρονεστάτοις τῶν θηρίων; ὤσπερ οἱ μοιχοὶ εἰσέρχονται εἰς τὰς εἰρκτὰς εἰδότες, ὅτι κίνδυνος τῷ μοιχεύοντι ἄ τε ὁ νόμος ἀπειλεῖ παθεῖν καὶ ἐνεδρευθῆναι καὶ ληφθέντα ὑβρισθῆναι καὶ τηλικούτων μὲν ἐπικειμένων τῷ μοιχεύοντι κακῶν τε καὶ αἰσχρῶν, ὄντων δὲ πολλῶν τῶν ἀπολυσόντων τῆς τῶν ἀφροδισίων ἐπιθυμίας ἐν ἀδείᾳ, ὅμως εἰς τὰ ἐπικίνδυνα φέρεσθαι, ἄρ' οὐκ ήδη τοῦτο παντάπασι κακοδαιμονῶντός ἐστιν;

"Εμοιγε δοκεῖ, ἔφη.

Τὸ δὲ εἶναι μὲν τὰς ἀναγκαιοτάτας πλείστας πράξεις τοῖς ἀνθρώποις ἐν ὑπαίθρῳ, οἶον τάς τε πολεμικὰς καὶ τὰς γεωργικὰς καὶ τῶν ἄλλων οὐ τὰς ἐλαχίστας, τοὺς δὲ πολλοὺς ἀγυμνάστως ἔχειν πρός τε ψύχη καὶ θάλπη οὐ δοκεῖ σοι πολλὴ ἀμέλεια εἶναι;

Συνέφη καὶ τοῦτο.

Οὐκοῦν δοκεῖ σοι τὸν μέλλοντα ἄρχειν ἀσκεῖν δεῖν καὶ ταῦτα εὐπετῶς φέρειν;

Πάνυ μὲν οὖν, ἔφη.

Οὐκοῦν εἰ τοὺς ἐγκρατεῖς τούτων ἁπάντων εἰς τοὺς ἀρχικοὺς τάττομεν, τοὺς ἀδυνάτους ταῦτα ποιεῖν εἰς τοὺς μηδ' ἀντιποιησομένους τοῦ ἄρχειν τάξομεν;

Συνέφη καὶ τοῦτο.

## MEMORABILIA II. 1.4-1.7

they are carried away by desire and anticipation of sex, throw caution to the winds, and blunder into the nets. Is it not so?"

He agreed again.

"Now, don't you think it disgraceful that a human being should be in the same plight as the silliest of wild creatures? Thus adulterers enter the women's quarters, knowing that by committing adultery they risk incurring the penalties threatened by the law, and that they may be trapped, caught, and ill-treated. When such misery and disgrace hang over the adulterer's head, and there are many remedies to relieve him of his sexual desire without risk, is it not sheer lunacy to plunge headlong into danger?"

"Yes, I think it is."

"And considering that the great majority of essential occupations, warfare, agriculture and not a few others, are carried on in the open air, don't you think it gross negligence that so many men are untrained to withstand cold and heat?"

He agreed again.

"Don't you think then, that one who is going to rule must adapt himself to bear them lightly?"

"Certainly."

"If then we classify those who control themselves in all these matters as 'fit to rule,' shall we not classify those who cannot so behave as having no claim to be rulers?"

He agreed again.

Τί οὖν; ἐπειδὴ καὶ τούτων ἑκατέρου τοῦ φύλου τὴν τάξιν οἶσθα, ἤδη ποτ' ἐπεσκέψω, εἰς ποτέραν τῶν τά-ξεων τούτων σαυτὸν δικαίως ἂν τάττοις;

Ένων', ἔφη ὁ Ἀρίστιππος, καὶ οὐδαμῶς γε τάττω έμαυτὸν είς τὴν τῶν ἄρχειν βουλομένων τάξιν. καὶ γὰρ πάνυ μοι δοκεῖ ἄφρονος ἀνθρώπου εἶναι τὸ μεγάλου ἔργου ὄντος τοῦ ἐαυτῷ τὰ δέοντα παρασκευάζειν μὴ ἀρκεῖν τοῦτο, ἀλλὰ προσαναθέσθαι τὸ καὶ τοις άλλοις πολίταις ὧν δέονται πορίζειν και έαυτῶ μεν πολλά ὧν βούλεται έλλείπειν, τῆς δε πόλεως προεστώτα, έὰν μὴ πάντα, ὅσα ἡ πόλις βούλεται, καταπράττη, τούτου δίκην ὑπέχειν, τοῦτο πῶς οὐ πολλὴ άφροσύνη έστί: καὶ γὰρ άξιοῦσιν αἱ πόλεις τοῖς ἄρχουσιν ώσπερ έγω τοῖς οἰκέταις χρησθαι. έγω τε γὰρ άξιῶ τοὺς θεράποντας ἐμοὶ μὲν ἄφθονα τὰ ἐπιτήδεια παρασκευάζειν, αὐτοὺς δὲ μηδενὸς τούτων ἄπτεσθαι, αἴ τε πόλεις οἴονται χρηναι τοὺς ἄρχοντας έαυταῖς μεν ώς πλείστα άγαθὰ πορίζειν, αὐτοὺς δὲ πάντων τούτων ἀπέχεσθαι. έγω οὖν τοὺς μὲν βουλομένους πολλά πράγματα έχειν αύτοις τε και άλλοις παρέχειν ούτως ἃν παιδεύσας είς τοὺς ἀρχικοὺς καταστήσαιμι. έμαυτόν γε μέντοι τάττω είς τοὺς βουλομένους ή ραστά τε καὶ ήδιστα Βιοτεύειν.

Καὶ ὁ Σωκράτης ἔφη· Βούλει οὖν καὶ τοῦτο σκεψώμεθα, πότερον ἥδιον ζῶσιν, οἱ ἄρχοντες ἢ οἱ ἀρχόμενοι:

Πάνυ μὲν οὖν, ἔφη. Πρῶτον μὲν τοίνυν τῶν ἐθνῶν ὧν ἡμεῖς ἴσμεν ἐν μὲν τῆ ᾿Ασίᾳ Πέρσαι μὲν ἄρχουσιν,

8

9

## MEMORABILIA II. 1.7-1.10

"Well now, as you know the category to which each of these species belongs, have you ever considered in which category you ought to put yourself?"

"I have; and I do not for a moment put myself in the category of those who want to be rulers. For considering how hard a job it is to provide for one's own needs. I think it absurd not to be content to do that, but to shoulder the burden of supplying the wants of the community as well. That anyone should forego many of his own wishes and make himself accountable as head of the state for the least failure to carry out all the wishes of the community is surely the height of folly. For states think fit to treat their rulers just as I do my household staff: just as I expect my servants to provide me with necessaries in abundance but not to touch any of them, so do states think that the ruler should supply them with all manner of good things but abstain from all of them himself. And so, should anyone want to bring plenty of trouble on himself and others, I would educate him as you propose and number him with 'those suited to rule': but myself I classify with those wishing for a life of the greatest possible ease and pleasure."

Here Socrates asked: "Shall we then consider whether the rulers or the ruled live the pleasanter life?"

"Certainly," replied Aristippus. "To take first the nations known to us. In Asia the rulers are the Persians; the

<sup>1</sup> Cyr. 1.6.7, 7.2, 7.26 f.

ἄρχονται δὲ Σύροι καὶ Φρύγες καὶ Λυδοί· ἐν δὲ τῆ Εὐρώπη Σκύθαι μὲν ἄρχουσι, Μαιῶται δὲ ἄρχονται· ἐν δὲ τῆ Λιβύη Καρχηδόνιοι μὲν ἄρχουσι, Λίβυες δὲ ἄρχονται. τούτων οὖν ποτέρους ἥδιον οἴει ζῆν; ἢ τῶν Ἑλλήνων, ἐν οἶς καὶ αὐτὸς εἶ, πότερά σοι δοκοῦσιν ἥδιον, οἱ κρατοῦντες ἢ οἱ κρατούμενοι, ζῆν;

'Αλλ' έγώ τοι, ἔφη ὁ 'Αρίστιππος, οὐδὲ εἰς τὴν δουλείαν αὖ ἐμαυτὸν τάττω, ἀλλ' εἶναί τίς μοι δοκεῖ μέση τούτων ὁδός, ἣν πειρῶμαι βαδίζειν, οὔτε δι' ἀρχῆς οὔτε διὰ δουλείας, ἀλλὰ δι' ἐλευθερίας, ἥπερ μάλιστα πρὸς εὐδαιμονίαν ἄγει.

'Αλλ' εἰ μέν, ἔφη ὁ Σωκράτης, ὥσπερ οὔτε δι' ἀρχῆς οὔτε διὰ δουλείας ἡ ὁδὸς αὕτη φέρει, οὕτως μηδὲ δι' ἀνθρώπων, ἴσως ἄν τι λέγοις· εἰ μέντοι ἐν ἀνθρώποις ὧν μήτε ἄρχειν ἀξιώσεις μήτε ἄρχεσθαι μηδὲ τοὺς ἄρχοντας ἐκὼν θεραπεύσεις, οἶμαί σε ὁρᾶν, ὡς ἐπίστανται οἱ κρείττονες τοὺς ἥττονας καὶ κοινῆ καὶ ἰδία κλαίοντας καθίσαντες δούλοις χρῆσθαι. ἢ λανθάνουσί σε οἱ ἄλλων σπειράντων καὶ φυτευσάντων τόν τε σῖτον τέμνοντες καὶ δενδροκοποῦντες καὶ πάντα τρόπον πολιορκοῦντες τοὺς ἥττονας καὶ μὴ θέλοντας θεραπεύειν, ἔως ἂν πείσωσιν ἐλέσθαι δουλεύειν ἀντὶ τοῦ πολεμεῖν τοῖς κρείττοσι; καὶ ἰδία αὖ οἱ ἀνδρεῖοι καὶ δυνατοὶ τοὺς ἀνάνδρους καὶ ἀδυνάτους οὐκ οἶσθα ὅτι καταδουλωσάμενοι καρποῦνται;

'Αλλ' έγώ τοι, ἔφη, ἵνα μὴ πάσχω ταῦτα, οὐδ' εἰς πολιτείαν ἐμαυτὸν κατακλείω, ἀλλὰ ξένος πανταχοῦ εἰμι.

11

12

# MEMORABILIA II. 1.10-1.13

Syrians, Lydians and Phrygians are the ruled. In Europe the Scythians rule, and the Maeotians are ruled. In Africa the Carthaginians rule, and the Libvans are ruled. Which of the two classes, think you, enjoys the pleasanter life? Or take the Greeks, of whom you yourself are one; do you think that the controlling or the controlled communities enjoy the pleasanter life?"

"For my part," replied Aristippus, "I am no candidate for slavery; but there is, I think, a middle path in which I try to walk. That way leads neither through rule nor slavery but through liberty, which is the high road to happiness."

"Ah," said Socrates, "if only that path can avoid the world as well as rule and slavery, there may be something in what you say. But, since you are in the world, if you intend neither to rule nor to be ruled, and do not choose to truckle to the rulers—I think you must see that the stronger have a way of making the weaker rue their lot both in public and in private life, and treating them like slaves. You cannot be unaware that where some have sown and planted, others cut their corn and fell their trees, and in every way harass the weaker if they refuse to bow down, until they convince them to prefer slavery to war with the stronger. So, too, in private life do not brave and mighty men enslave and plunder the cowardly and feeble?"

"Yes, but my plan for avoiding such treatment is this. I do not shut myself up in the four corners of a community, but am a stranger in every land."

11

12

13

Καὶ ὁ Σωκράτης ἔφη· Τοῦτο μέντοι ἤδη λέγεις 14 δεινον πάλαισμα, τους γαρ ξένους, έξ οδ ὅ τε Σίνις καὶ ὁ Σκείρων καὶ ὁ Προκρούστης ἀπέθανον, οὐδεὶς ἔτι ἀδικεῖ· ἀλλὰ νῦν οἱ μὲν πολιτευόμενοι ἐν ταῖς πατρίσι καὶ νόμους τίθενται, ἵνα μὴ ἀδικῶνται, καὶ φίλους πρὸς τοῖς ἀναγκαίοις καλουμένοις ἄλλους κτώνται βοηθούς καὶ ταῖς πόλεσιν ἐρύματα περιβάλλονται καὶ ὅπλα κτῶνται οἷς ἀμυνοῦνται τοὺς ἀδικοῦντας, καὶ πρὸς τούτοις ἄλλους ἔξωθεν συμμάχους κατασκευάζονται καὶ οἱ μὲν πάντα ταῦτα κεκτημένοι όμως άδικοῦνται συ δε ούδεν μεν τούτων έχων, έν δε 15 ταις όδοις, ένθα πλειστοι άδικουνται, πολύν χρόνον διατρίβων, εἰς ὁποίαν δ' ἂν πόλιν ἀφίκη, τῶν πολιτῶν πάντων ήττων ὢν καὶ τοιοῦτος οἵοις μάλιστα ἐπιτίθενται οί βουλόμενοι άδικεῖν, ὅμως διὰ τὸ ξένος εἶναι οὐκ ἂν οἴει ἀδικηθηναι; ἢ διότι αἱ πόλεις σοι κηρύττουσιν ἀσφάλειαν καὶ προσιόντι καὶ ἀπιόντι, θαρρείς; η διότι καὶ δούλος αν οίει τοιούτος είναι οίος μηδενὶ δεσπότη λυσιτελεῖν; τίς γὰρ ἂν ἐθέλοι ἄνθρωπον ἐν οἰκία ἔχειν πονεῖν μὲν μηδὲν ἐθέλοντα, τῆ δὲ πολυτελεστάτη διαίτη χαίροντα;

Σκεψώμεθα δὲ καὶ τοῦτο, πῶς οἱ δεσπόται τοῖς τοιούτοις οἰκέταις χρῶνται. ἆρα οὐ τὴν μὲν λαγνείαν αὐτῶν τῷ λιμῷ σωφρονίζουσι; κλέπτειν δὲ κωλύουσιν ἀποκλείοντες ὅθεν ἄν τι λαβεῖν ἢ; τοῦ δὲ δραπετεύειν δεσμοῖς ἀπείργουσι; τὴν ἀργίαν δὲ πληγαῖς ἐξαναγκάζουσιν; ἢ σὰ πῶς ποιεῖς, ὅταν τῶν οἰκετῶν τινα τοιοῦτον ὄντα καταμανθάνης;

# MEMORABILIA II. 1.14-1.16

"That's an impressive feint!" cried Socrates, "for ever since the death of Sinis and Sceiron and Procrustes<sup>2</sup> no one wrongs strangers! And yet nowadays those who take a hand in the affairs of their homeland pass laws to protect themselves from wrongdoing, get friends to help them over and above those whom nature has given them, encompass their cities with fortresses, get themselves weapons to ward off the wrongdoers; and besides all this they seek to make allies in other lands; and in spite of all these precautions they are still victimized. But you, with none of these advantages, spend a lot of time on the open road, where so many are victimized; and in whatever city you visit you rank below all its citizens and are one of those specially marked down for attack by intending wrongdoers; and yet, because you are a stranger, do you expect not to be wronged? What makes you confident? Is it that the cities by proclamation guarantee your safety both coming and going? Or is it the thought that no master would find you worth having among his slaves? For who would care to have a man in his house who wants to do no work and has a weakness for high living?

"But now let us see how masters treat such servants. Don't they discipline their randiness by starving them? stop their stealing by locking up whatever they might get their hands on? prevent their escape by chaining them? and beat the laziness out of them with whips? What do you do when you discover a servant like that in your own house?"

14

15

19

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Bandits slain by Theseus, Plu. Thes. 100.8 f.

17 Κολάζω, ἔφη, πᾶσι κακοῖς, ἔως ἂν δουλεύειν ἀναγκάσω. ἀλλὰ γάρ, ὧ Σώκρατες, οἱ εἰς τὴν βασιλικὴν τέχνην παιδευόμενοι, ἣν δοκεῖς μοι σὰ νομίζειν εὐδαιμονίαν εἶναι, τί διαφέρουσι τῶν ἐξ ἀνάγκης κακοπαθούντων, εἴ γε πεινήσουσι καὶ διψήσουσι καὶ ριγώσουσι καὶ ἀγρυπνήσουσι καὶ τἄλλα πάντα μοχθήσουσιν ἑκόντες; ἐγὼ μὲν γὰρ οὐκ οἶδ' ὅτι διαφέρει τὸ αὐτὸ δέρμα ἑκόντα ἢ ἄκοντα μαστιγοῦσθαι ἢ ὅλως τὸ αὐτὸ σῶμα πᾶσι τοῖς τοιούτοις ἑκόντα ἢ ἄκοντα πολιορκεῖσθαι ἄλλο γε ἢ ἀφροσύνη πρόσεστι τῷ θέλοντι τὰ λυπηρὰ ὑπομένειν;

Τί δέ. ὧ Ἀρίστιππε, ὁ Σωκράτης ἔφη, οὐ δοκεῖ σοι των τοιούτων διαφέρειν τὰ έκούσια των ἀκουσίων, ή ό μεν έκων πεινών φάγοι αν όπότε βούλοιτο και ό έκων διψων πίοι και τάλλα ωσαύτως, τω δ' έξ ανάγκης ταῦτα πάσχοντι οὐκ ἔξεστιν ὁπόταν βούληται παύεσθαι; έπειτα ὁ μὲν έκουσίως ταλαιπωρῶν ἐπ' άγαθη έλπίδι πονών εύφραίνεται, οἷον οἱ τὰ θηρία θηρώντες έλπίδι τοῦ λήψεσθαι ήδέως μοχθοῦσι. καὶ τὰ μὲν τοιαῦτα ἆθλα τῶν πόνων μικροῦ τινος ἄξιά έστι τοὺς δὲ πονοῦντας, ἵνα φίλους ἀγαθοὺς κτήσωνται η όπως έχθρους χειρώσονται η ίνα δυνατοί γενόμενοι καὶ τοῖς σώμασι καὶ ταῖς ψυχαῖς καὶ τὸν έαυτῶν οἶκον καλῶς οἰκῶσι καὶ τοὺς φίλους εὖ ποιῶσι καὶ τὴν πατρίδα εὐεργετῶσι, πῶς οὐκ οἴεσθαι χρὴ τούτους καὶ πονεῖν ἡδέως εἰς τὰ τοιαῦτα καὶ ζῆν εὐφραινομένους, άγαμένους μεν έαυτούς, έπαινουμένους δὲ καὶ ζηλουμένους ὑπὸ τῶν ἄλλων; ἔτι δὲ αἱ μὲν

19

#### MEMORABILIA II. 1.17-1.20

"I use every kind of punishment until I force them to serve. But how about those who are trained in the art of kingship, Socrates, which you appear to identify with happiness? How are they better off than those whose sufferings are compulsory, if they must bear hunger, thirst, cold, sleeplessness, and endure all these tortures willingly? For if the same back gets the flogging whether its owner objects or consents, or, in short, if the same body, consenting or objecting, is besieged by all these torments, I see no difference, apart from the folly of voluntary suffering."

"What, Aristippus," exclaimed Socrates, "don't you see just this difference between these voluntary and involuntary sufferings, that if you bear hunger or thirst willingly, you can eat, drink, or whatever, as you choose, whereas compulsory suffering cannot be ended at will? Besides, he who endures willingly enjoys his work because he is comforted by hope; hunters, for instance, toil gladly in hope of game. Rewards like these are indeed of little worth after all the toil; but what of those who toil to win good friends, or to subdue enemies, or to make themselves capable in body and soul of managing their own homes well, of helping their friends and serving their country? Surely these toil gladly for such prizes and live a joyous life, well content with themselves, praised and envied by everyone else? Moreover, indolence and the moment's pleasure can

ράδιουργίαι καὶ ἐκ τοῦ παραχρῆμα ἡδοναὶ οὕτε σώματι εὐεξίαν ἱκαναί εἰσιν ἐνεργάζεσθαι, ὥς φασιν οἱ
γυμνασταί, οὕτε ψυχῆ ἐπιστήμην ἀξιόλογον οὐδεμίαν
ἐμποιοῦσιν, αἱ δὲ διὰ καρτερίας ἐπιμέλειαι τῶν καλῶν
τε κἀγαθῶν ἔργων ἐξικνεῖσθαι ποιοῦσιν, ὥς φασιν οἱ
ἀγαθοὶ ἄνδρες. λέγει δέ που καὶ Ἡσίοδος·

τὴν μὲν γὰρ κακότητα καὶ ἰλαδὸν ἔστιν ἑλέσθαι ρηιδίως λείη μὲν ὁδός, μάλα δ' ἐγγύθι ναίει. τῆς δ' ἀρετῆς ἱδρῶτα. θεοὶ προπάροιθεν ἔθηκαν ἀθάνατοι μακρὸς δὲ καὶ ὅρθιος οἶμος ἐς αὐτὴν καὶ τρηχὺς τὸ πρῶτον ἐπὴν δ' εἰς ἄκρον ἵκηαι, ρηιδίη δὴ ἔπειτα πέλει, χαλεπή περ ἐοῦσα.

μαρτυρεί δὲ καὶ Ἐπίχαρμος ἐν τῷδε·

τῶν πόνων πωλοῦσιν ἡμῖν πάντα τἀγάθ' οἱ θεοί.

καὶ ἐν ἄλλῳ δὲ τόπῳ φησίν·

ὧ πονηρέ, μὴ τὰ μαλακὰ μῶσο, μὴ τὰ σκλήρ' ἔχης.

Καὶ Πρόδικος δὲ ὁ σοφὸς ἐν τῷ συγγράμματι τῷ περὶ Ἡρακλέους, ὅπερ δὴ καὶ πλείστοις ἐπιδείκνυται, ὡσαύτως περὶ τῆς ἀρετῆς ἀποφαίνεται, ὧδέ πως λέγω, ὅσα ἐγὼ μέμνημαι.

Φησὶ γὰρ Ἡρακλέα, ἐπεὶ ἐκ παίδων εἰς ἥβην ώρμᾶτο, ἐν ἢ οἱ νέοι ἤδη αὐτοκράτορες γιγνόμενοι δηλοῦσιν, εἴτε τὴν δι᾽ ἀρετῆς ὁδὸν τρέψονται ἐπὶ τὸν βίον εἴτε τὴν διὰ κακίας, ἐξελθόντα εἰς ἡσυχίαν καθ-

## MEMORABILIA II. 1.20-1.21

never bring the body into good condition, as trainers say, nor do they create in the soul knowledge of any value, but strenuous effort paves the way to fair and fine deeds, as good men say. And so says Hesiod:<sup>3</sup>

Vice can be had in abundance easily: smooth is the road and very near she dwells. But before Virtue the gods immortal have put sweat: long and steep is the path to her and rough at first; but when you reach the top, then at length the road is easy, hard though it remains.'

"And we have the testimony of Epicharmus too in the line:

'The gods demand of us toil as the price of all good things.'

"And elsewhere he says:

'Wretch, yearn not for what's soft, lest you earn what's hard.'

"Yes, and Prodicus the wise expresses himself in the same way about Virtue in the essay 'On Heracles' that he recites to throngs of listeners. This, so far as I remember, is how he puts it:

"When Heracles was passing from boyhood to young manhood, where the young, now becoming their own masters, show whether they will approach life by the path of virtue or the path of vice, he went out into a quiet place

3 WD 285.

22 ῆσθαι ἀποροῦντα, ποτέραν τῶν ὁδῶν τράπηται καὶ φανῆναι αὐτῷ δύο γυναῖκας προσιέναι μεγάλας, τὴν μὲν ἑτέραν εὐπρεπῆ τε ἰδεῖν καὶ ἐλευθέριον φύσει, κεκοσμημένην τὸ μὲν σῶμα καθαρειότητι, τὰ δὲ ὅμματα αἰδοῖ, τὸ δὲ σχῆμα σωφροσύνη, ἐσθῆτι δὲ λευκῆ, τὴν δ' ἑτέραν τεθραμμένην μὲν εἰς πολυσαρκίαν τε καὶ άπαλότητα, κεκαλλωπισμένην δὲ τὸ μὲν χρῶμα, ὥστε λευκοτέραν τε καὶ ἐρυθροτέραν τοῦ ὄντος δοκεῖν φαίνεσθαι, τὸ δὲ σχῆμα, ὥστε δοκεῖν ὀρθοτέραν τῆς φύσεως εἶναι, τὰ δὲ ὅμματα ἔχειν ἀναπεπταμένα, ἐσθῆτα δέ, ἐξ ἦς ἂν μάλιστα ὥρα διαλάμποι, κατασκοπεῖσθαι δὲ θαμὰ ἑαυτήν, ἐπισκοπεῖν δὲ καὶ εἴ τις ἄλλος αὐτὴν θεᾶται, πολλάκις δὲ καὶ εἰς τὴν ἑαυτῆς σκιὰν ἀποβλέπειν.

'Ως δ' ἐγένοντο πλησιαίτερον τοῦ 'Ηρακλέους, τὴν μὲν πρόσθεν ῥηθείσαν ἰέναι τὸν αὐτὸν τρόπον, τὴν δ' ἐτέραν φθάσαι βουλομένην προσδραμεῖν τῷ 'Ηρακλεῖ καὶ εἰπεῖν· Ορῶ σε, ὧ 'Ηράκλεις, ἀποροῦντα, ποίαν όδὸν ἐπὶ τὸν βίον τράπη. ἐὰν οὖν ἐμὲ φίλην ποιησάμενος ἔπη,¹ τὴν ἡδίστην τε καὶ ῥάστην όδὸν ἄξω σε καὶ τῶν μὲν τερπνῶν οὐδενὸς ἄγευστος ἔση, τῶν δὲ χαλεπῶν ἄπειρος διαβιώση, πρῶτον μὲν γὰρ οὐ πολέμων οὐδὲ πραγμάτων φροντιεῖς, ἀλλὰ σκοπούμενος δοίση,² τί ἂν κεχαρισμένον ἢ σιτίον ἢ ποτὸν εὕροις ἢ τί ἂν ἰδὼν ἢ τί ἀκούσας τερφθείης ἢ τίνων ἂν ὀσφραινόμενος ἢ ἀπτόμενος ἡσθείης, τίσι δὲ παιδικοῖς ὁμιλῶν μάλιστ' ἂν εὐφρανθείης, καὶ πῶς ἂν μαλακώτατα καθεύδοις καὶ πῶς ἂν ἀπονώτατα τούτων πάντων τυγ-

23

#### MEMORABILIA II. 1.22-1.24

and sat pondering which road to take. And there appeared two women of great stature coming toward him. The one was fair to see and of noble stock; her body was adorned with purity, her eyes with modesty; sober was her figure, and her robe was white. The other had grown stout and soft with high feeding. Her skin was made up to heighten its natural white and pink, her figure to exaggerate her height. She had wide-open eyes and clothing that showcased her young beauty. She kept eyeing herself and looking to see whether anyone noticed her; and often stole a glance at her own shadow.

"When they drew closer to Heracles, the first pursued the even tenor of her way, but the other, all eager to outdo her, ran to meet him, crying: 'Heracles, I see that you are in doubt which approach to take toward life. If you make me your friend and follow me, I will lead you along the pleasantest and easiest road, and you will taste all the sweets of life but never know its hardships. First, you will give no thought to wars and business, but will ever be considering what choice food or drink you can discover, what sight or sound will please you, what touch or scent gladden you, the company of which boy love would most delight you, which bed afford the softest slumbers; and how to come by all these pleasures with least trouble.

22

24

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Marchant:  $\hat{\epsilon}\pi\hat{\iota}$  codd. del. Hirschig

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Dindorf: διέση codd.

25 χάνοις. ἐὰν δέ ποτε γένηταί τις ὑποψία σπάνεως ἀφ' ὧν ἔσται ταῦτα, οὐ φόβος, μή σε ἀγάγω ἐπὶ τὸ πονοῦντα καὶ ταλαιπωροῦντα τῷ σώματι καὶ τῆ ψυχῆ ταῦτα πορίζεσθαι, ἀλλ' οἶς ἂν οἱ ἄλλοι ἐργάζωνται, τούτοις σὺ χρήση, οὐδενὸς ἀπεχόμενος ὅθεν ἂν δυνατὸν ἢ τι κερδᾶναι. πανταχόθεν γὰρ ἀφελεῖσθαι τοῖς ἐμοὶ συνοῦσιν ἐξουσίαν ἐγὼ παρέχω.

Καὶ ὁ Ἡρακλῆς ἀκούσας ταῦτα, ¾ γύναι, ἔφη, ὅνομα δέ σοι τί ἐστιν; ἡ δέ, Οἱ μὲν ἐμοὶ φίλοι, ἔφη, καλοῦσί με Εὐδαιμονίαν, οἱ δὲ μισοῦντές με ὑποκοριζόμενοι ὀνομάζουσι Κακίαν.

Καὶ ἐν τούτω ἡ ἑτέρα γυνὴ προσελθοῦσα εἶπε· Καὶ έγὼ ήκω πρὸς σέ, ὧ Ἡράκλεις, εἰδυῖα τοὺς γεννήσαντάς σε καὶ τὴν φύσιν τὴν σὴν ἐν τῆ παιδεία καταμαθοῦσα ἐξ ὧν ἐλπίζω, εἰ τὴν πρὸς ἐμὲ ὁδὸν τράποιο, σφόδρ' ἄν σε τῶν καλῶν καὶ σεμνῶν ἐργάτην ἀγαθὸν γενέσθαι καὶ έμὲ ἔτι πολὺ ἐντιμοτέραν καὶ ἐπ' ἀγαθοίς διαπρεπεστέραν φανήναι, οὐκ έξαπατήσω δέ σε προοιμίοις ήδονης, άλλ' ήπερ οἱ θεοὶ διέθεσαν τὰ οντα διηγήσομαι μετ' άληθείας. των γάρ οντων άγαθῶν καὶ καλῶν οὐδὲν ἄνευ πόνου καὶ ἐπιμελείας θεοὶ διδόασιν άνθρώποις, άλλ' εἴτε τοὺς θεοὺς ἵλεως εἶναί σοι βούλει, θεραπευτέον τοὺς θεούς, είτε ὑπὸ φίλων έθέλεις άγαπᾶσθαι, τοὺς φίλους εὐεργετητέον, εἴτε ύπό τινος πόλεως ἐπιθυμεῖς τιμᾶσθαι, τὴν πόλιν ώφελητέον, εἴτε ὑπὸ τῆς Ἑλλάδος πάσης ἀξιοῖς ἐπ' ἀρετῆ θαυμάζεσθαι, τὴν Ἑλλάδα πειρατέον εὖ ποιεῖν, εἴτε γην βούλει σοι καρπούς άφθόνους φέρειν, την γην

26

27

## MEMORABILIA II. 1.25-1.28

And should there arise misgiving that lack of means may stint these enjoyments, never fear that I may lead you into winning them by toil and anguish of body and soul. No, you will have the fruits of others' toil and refrain from nothing that can bring you gain. For to my companions I give authority to pluck advantage wherever they want.'

"Now when Heracles heard this, he asked, 'Lady, what is your name?'

"'My friends call me Happiness,' she said, 'but among those that hate me I am nicknamed Vice.'

"Meanwhile the other had drawn near, and she said; I. too, have come to you, Heracles: I know your parents and have taken note of your character during the time of your education, and so I hope that, if you take the road that leads to me, you will turn out very much a good doer of fine and noble deeds, and I will be yet more highly honored and more illustrious for the blessings I bestow. But I will not deceive you by a pleasant prelude: I will rather tell you truly the way things are, as the gods have ordained them. For of all things good and fair, the gods give nothing to man without toil and effort. If you want the favor of the gods, you must worship the gods: if you desire the love of friends, you must do good to your friends: if you crave honor from a city, you must aid that city: if you expect to win the admiration of all Hellas for virtue, you must strive to do good to Hellas: if you want land to yield you fruits in abundance, you must cultivate that land: if you are deter-

26

27

28

θεραπευτέον, εἴτε ἀπὸ βοσκημάτων οἴει δεῖν πλουτίζεσθαι, τῶν βοσκημάτων ἐπιμελητέον, εἴτε διὰ πολέμου ὁρμậς αὔξεσθαι καὶ βούλει δύνασθαι τούς τε φίλους ἐλευθεροῦν καὶ τοὺς ἐχθροὺς χειροῦσθαι, τὰς πολεμικὰς τέχνας αὐτάς τε παρὰ τῶν ἐπισταμένων μαθητέον καὶ ὅπως αὐταῖς δεῖ χρῆσθαι ἀσκητέον· εἰ δὲ καὶ τῷ σώματι βούλει δυνατὸς εἶναι, τῆ γνώμη ὑπηρετεῖν ἐθιστέον τὸ σῶμα καὶ γυμναστέον σὺν πόνοις καὶ ἱδρῶτι.

Καὶ ἡ Κακία ὑπολαβοῦσι εἶπεν, ὥς φησι Πρόδικος Ἐννοεῖς, ὧ Ἡράκλεις, ὡς χαλεπὴν καὶ μακρὰν ὁδὸν ἐπὶ τὰς εὐφροσύνας ἡ γυνή σοι αὕτη διηγεῖται; ἐγὼ δὲ ῥαδίαν καὶ βραχεῖαν ὁδὸν ἐπὶ τὴν εὐδαιμονίαν ἄξω σε.

Καὶ ἡ ᾿Αρετὴ εἶπεν· ϶Ω τλημον, τί δὲ σὺ ἀγαθὸν ἔχεις; ἢ τί ἡδὺ οἶσθα μηδὲν τούτων ἔνεκα πράττειν ἐθέλουσα; ἤτις οὐδὲ τὴν τῶν ἡδέων ἐπιθυμίαν ἀναμένεις, ἀλλὰ πρὶν ἐπιθυμῆσαι πάντων ἐμπίπλασαι, πρὶν μὲν πεινῆν ἐσθίουσα, πρὶν δὲ διψῆν πίνουσα, καὶ ἵνα μὲν ἡδέως φάγης, ὀψοποιοὺς μηχανωμένη, ἵνα δὲ ἡδέως πίης, οἴνους τε πολυτελεῖς παρασκευάζη καὶ τοῦ θέρους χιόνα περιθέουσα ζητεῖς, ἵνα δὲ καθυπνώσης ἡδέως, οὐ μόνον τὰς στρωμνὰς μαλακάς, ἀλλὰ καὶ τὰ ὑπόβαθρα ταῖς κλίναις παρασκευάζη· οὐ γὰρ διὰ τὸ πονεῖν, ἀλλὰ διὰ τὸ μηδὲν ἔχειν ὅ τι ποιῆς ὅπνου ἐπιθυμεῖς. τὰ δ᾽ ἀφροδίσια πρὸ τοῦ δεῖσθαι ἀναγκάζεις, πάντα μηχανωμένη καὶ γυναιξὶ τοῖς ἀνδράσι χρωμένη· οὕτω γὰρ παιδεύεις τοὺς σεαυτῆς

29

## MEMORABILIA II. 1.28-1.30

mined to get wealth from flocks, you must care for those flocks: if you aim to grow great through war and want power to liberate your friends and subdue your foes, you must learn the arts of war from those who know them and must practice their right use: and if you want your body to be strong, you must accustom your body to be the servant of your mind, and train it with toil and sweat.'

"And Vice, as Prodicus tells it, said in response: 'Heracles, do you see what a hard and long road to joy this woman describes? I will lead you by an easy and short road to happiness.'

"And Virtue said: 'How sad! What good do you have or what pleasure do you know, if you do nothing to get them? You don't even await the desire for pleasant things but fill yourself with all things before you desire them: eating before you're hungry, drinking before you're thirsty; for good eating getting yourself cooks, for good drinking buying expensive wines and running around in the summertime in search of snow; for good sleeping you buy not only soft blankets but bed frames too. For it is not toil but the tedium of having nothing to do that makes you long for sleep. You force lust when there is no need, by all kinds of tricks and by using men as women: thus you train your own

29

φίλους, της μεν νυκτὸς ύβρίζουσα, της δ' ημέρας τὸ χρησιμώτατον κατακοιμίζουσα, άθάνατος δὲ οὖσα ἐκ θεών μεν ἀπέρριψαι, ὑπὸ δε ἀνθρώπων ἀγαθών ἀτιμάζη τοῦ δὲ πάντων ἡδίστου ἀκούσματος, ἐπαίνου έαυτης, άνηκοος εἶ καὶ τοῦ πάντων ηδίστου θεάματος άθέατος οὐδὲν γὰρ πώποτε σεαυτῆς ἔργον καλὸν τεθέασαι, τίς δ' ἄν σοι λεγούση τι πιστεύσειε; τίς δ' ἂν δεομένη τινὸς ἐπαρκέσειεν; ἢ τίς ἂν εὖ φρονῶν τοῦ σοῦ θιάσου τολμήσειεν εἶναι: οἱ νέοι μὲν ὄντες τοῖς σώμασιν άδύνατοί είσι, πρεσβύτεροί τε γενόμενοι ταις ψυχαις ανόητοι, απόνως μεν λιπαροί δια νεότητος τρεφόμενοι, έπιπόνως δε αύχμηροι δια γήρως περώντες, τοίς μέν πεπραγμένοις αἰσχυνόμενοι, τοίς δὲ πραττομένοις βαρυνόμενοι, τὰ μὲν ἡδέα ἐν τῆ νεότητι διαδραμόντες, τὰ δὲ χαλεπὰ εἰς τὸ γῆρας ἀποθέμενοι. έγω δε σύνειμι μεν θεοίς, σύνειμι δε άνθρωποις τοις ἀγαθοις ἔργον δὲ καλὸν οὕτε θείον οὕτ' άνθρώπινον χωρίς έμοῦ γίγνεται, τιμώμαι δὲ μάλιστα πάντων καὶ παρὰ θεοῖς καὶ παρ' ἀνθρώποις οἷς προσήκω,3 άγαπητή μεν συνεργός τεχνίταις, πιστή δε φύλαξ οἴκων δεσπόταις, εὐμενης δὲ παραστάτις οίκέταις, άγαθη δε συλλήπτρια των εν ειρήνη πόνων, Βεβαία δὲ τῶν ἐν πολέμω σύμμαχος ἔργων, ἀρίστη δὲ φιλίας κοινωνός. ἔστι δὲ τοῖς ἐμοῖς φίλοις ἡδεῖα μεν καὶ ἀπράγμων σίτων καὶ ποτών ἀπόλαυσις ἀνέχονται γάρ, ξως ἂν ἐπιθυμήσωσιν αὐτῶν, ὕπνος δ' αὐτοῖς πάρεστιν ἡδίων ἢ τοῖς ἀμόχθοις καὶ οὔτε ἀπολείποντες αὐτὸν ἄχθονται οὔτε διὰ τοῦτον μεθιᾶσι τὰ

31

32

## MEMORABILIA II. 1.30-1.33

friends, running riot at night and sleeping through the best part of the day. You are immortal yet cast out by the gods and scorned by good men. Praise, sweetest of all things to hear, you never hear, and the sweetest of all sights you never see, for never yet have you beheld a good work of your own doing. Who will believe what you say? who will grant what you request? Or what sane man will dare join your club? While your votaries are young their bodies are weak, when they grow old their souls are mindless; idle and sleek they thrive in youth, withered and weary they journey through old age, and their past deeds bring them shame, their present deeds distress. Pleasure they ran through in their youth, hardship they laid up for their old age. But I keep company with gods and good men, and no fair deed of god or man is done without my aid. I am first in honor among the gods and among men that are akin to me: to craftsmen a cherished fellow worker, to masters a faithful guardian of the house, to servants a kindly protector: a good helpmate in the toils of peace, a staunch ally in the deeds of war, and the best partner in friendship. To my friends food and drink bring sweet and simple enjoyment: for they wait till they desire them. And a sweeter sleep falls on them than on the idle: they are not annoyed at waking from it nor for its sake do they neglect to do their

31

32

<sup>3</sup> Schneider: -ήκει codd.

δέοντα πράττειν. καὶ οἱ μὲν νέοι τοῖς τῶν πρεσβυτέρων ἐπαίνοις χαίρουσιν, οἱ δὲ γεραίτεροι ταῖς τῶν νέων τιμαῖς ἀγάλλονται καὶ ἡδέως μὲν τῶν παλαιῶν πράξεων μέμνηνται, εὖ δὲ τὰς παρούσας ἤδονται πράττοντες, δι' ἐμὲ φίλοι μὲν θεοῖς ὄντες, ἀγαπητοὶ δὲ φίλοις, τίμιοι δὲ πατρίσιν. ὅταν δ' ἔλθη τὸ πεπρωμένον τέλος, οὐ μετὰ λήθης ἄτιμοι κεῖνται, ἀλλὰ μετὰ μνήμης τὸν ἀεὶ χρόνον ὑμνούμενοι θάλλουσι. τοιαῦτά σοι, ὧ παῖ τοκέων ἀγαθῶν Ἡράκλεις, ἔξεστι διαπονησαμένῳ τὴν μακαριστοτάτην εὐδαιμονίαν κεκτήσθαι.

34 Οὕτω πως διώκει Πρόδικος τὴν ὑπ' ᾿Αρετῆς Ἡρακλέους παίδευσιν, ἐκόσμησε μέντοι τὰς γνώμας ἔτι μεγαλειοτέροις ῥήμασιν ἢ ἐγὼ νῦν. σοὶ δ' οὖν ἄξιον, ὧ ᾿Αρίστιππε, τούτων ἐνθυμουμένῳ πειρᾶσθαί τι καὶ τῶν εἰς τὸν μέλλοντα χρόνον τοῦ βίου φροντίζειν.

2. Αἰσθόμενος δέ ποτε Λαμπροκλέα, τὸν πρεσβύτατον υίὸν αὐτοῦ, πρὸς τὴν μητέρα χαλεπαίνοντα, Εἰπέ μοι, ἔφη, ὧ παῖ, οἶσθά τινας ἀνθρώπους ἀχαρίστους καλουμένους;

Καὶ μάλα, ἔφη ὁ νεανίσκος.

Καταμεμάθηκας οὖν, τοὺς τί ποιοῦντας τὸ ὄνομα τοῦτο ἀποκαλοῦσιν;

"Εγωγ', έφη· τοὺς γὰρ εὖ παθόντας, ὅταν δυνάμενοι χάριν ἀποδοῦναι μὴ ἀποδῶσιν, ἀχαρίστους καλοῦσιν.

Οὐκοῦν δοκοῦσί σοι ἐν τοῖς ἀδίκοις καταλογίζεσθαι τοὺς ἀχαρίστους;

## MEMORABILIA II. 1.33-2.1

duties. The young rejoice to win the praise of the old; the elders are glad to be honored by the young: with joy they recall their deeds past and are happy that they are doing well in the present, for through me they are dear to the gods, cherished by friends, precious to their native land. And when the appointed end comes, they lie not forgotten and dishonored but live on, sung and remembered for all time. Heracles, son of goodly parents, if you will labor earnestly in this way, you may have for your own the most blessed happiness.'

"Such, in outline, is Prodicus' story of the training of Heracles by Virtue; only he has clothed the thoughts in even finer phrases than I have done just now. But anyway, Aristippus, you would do well to take all this to heart and try to show some regard for the life that lies before you."

2. On noticing that his eldest son, Lamprocles, was cross with his mother, he said: "Tell me, my boy, do you know that some men are called ingrates?"

"Sure I do," replied the young man.

"Do you realize how they come to have this bad label?"

"I do; those are called ingrates who don't show the gratitude that they are able to show for benefits received."

"You take it, then, that ingrates are reckoned among the unjust?"

"Εμοιγε, ἔφη;

2

"Ηδη δέ ποτ' ἐσκέψω, εἰ ἄρα ὥσπερ τὸ ἀνδραποδίζεσθαι τοὺς μὲν φίλους ἄδικον εἶναι δοκεῖ, τοὺς δὲ πολεμίους δίκαιον, καὶ τὸ ἀχαριστεῖν πρὸς μὲν τοὺς φίλους ἄδικόν ἐστι, πρὸς δὲ τοὺς πολεμίους δίκαιον;

Καὶ μάλα, ἔφη· καὶ δοκεῖ μοι, ὑφ' οὖ ἄν τις εὖ παθὼν εἴτε φίλου εἴτε πολεμίου μὴ πειρᾶται χάριν ἀποδιδόναι, ἄδικος εἶναι.

3 Οὐκοῦν εἴ γ' οὕτως ἔχει τοῦτο, εἰλικρινής τις ἂν εἴη ἀδικία ἡ ἀχαριστία;

Συνωμολόγει.

Οὐκοῦν ὅσῷ ἄν τις μείζω ἀγαθὰ παθὼν μὴ ἀποδιδῷ χάριν, τοσούτῷ ἀδικώτερος ἂν εἴη;

Συνέφη καὶ τοῦτο.

Τίνας οὖν, ἔφη, ὑπὸ τίνων εὕροιμεν ἂν μείζω εὐεργετημένους ἢ παίδας ὑπὸ γονέων; οὖς οἱ γονεῖς ἐκ μὲν οὐκ ὄντων ἐποίησαν εἶναι, τοσαῦτα δὲ καλὰ ἰδεῖν καὶ τοσούτων ἀγαθῶν μετασχεῖν, ὅσα οἱ θεοὶ παρέχουσι τοῖς ἀνθρώποις· ἃ δὴ καὶ οὕτως ἡμῖν δοκεῖ παντὸς ἄξια εἶναι, ὥστε πάντες τὸ καταλιπεῖν αὐτὰ πάντων μάλιστα φεύγομεν· καὶ αἱ πόλεις ἐπὶ τοῖς μεγίστοις ἀδικήμασι ζημίαν θάνατον πεποιήκασιν, ὡς οὐκ ἂν μείζονος κακοῦ φόβω τὴν ἀδικίαν παύσαντες. καὶ μὴν οὐ τῶν γε ἀφροδισίων ἔνεκα παιδοποιεῖσθαι τοὺς ἀνθρώπους ὑπολαμβάνεις, ἐπεὶ τούτου γε τῶν ἀπολυσύντων μεσταὶ μὲν αἱ ὁδοί, μεστὰ δὲ τὰ οἰκήματα. φανεροὶ δ᾽ ἐσμὲν καὶ σκοπούμενοι, ἐξ ὁποίων ἂν γυναικῶν βέλτιστα ἡμῖν τέκνα γένοιτο, αἷς συνελθόντες

#### MEMORABILIA II 2 1-2 4

"Yes."

"Now, seeing that enslavement is considered a just or an unjust act depending on whether the victims are friends or enemies, have you ever considered whether the case of ingratitude is analogous, ingratitude being unjust toward friends but just toward enemies?"

"Yes I have; and I think that it is always unjust not to show gratitude for a favor from whomever it is received, be he friend or enemy."

"If that is so, must not ingratitude be injustice pure and simple?"

He agreed.

"Therefore the greater the benefits received the greater the injustice of not showing gratitude?"

He agreed again.

"Now what deeper obligation can we find than that of children to their parents? To their parents children owe their existence and their portion of all fair sights and all blessings that the gods bestow on humanity—gifts we prize so highly that all will sacrifice anything rather than lose them; and the reason why governments have made death the penalty for the greatest crimes is that the fear of it is the strongest deterrent against crime. Of course you don't suppose that lust provokes men to beget children, when the streets and the brothels are full of means to satisfy that? We obviously select for wives the women who will bear us the best children and then marry them to raise

5 τεκνοποιούμεθα. καὶ ὁ μέν γε ἀνὴρ τήν τε συντεκνοποιήσουσαν ἐαυτῷ τρέφει καὶ τοῖς μέλλουσιν ἔσεσθαι 
παισὶ προπαρασκευάζει πάντα, ὅσα ἂν οἴηται συνοίσειν αὐτοῖς πρὸς τὸν βίον, καὶ ταῦτα ὡς ἂν δύνηται 
πλεῖστα· ἡ δὲ γυνὴ ὑποδεξαμένη τε φέρει τὸ φορτίον 
τοῦτο βαρυνομένη τε καὶ κινδυνεύουσα περὶ τοῦ βίου 
καὶ μεταδιδοῦσα τῆς τροφῆς, ἢ καὶ αὐτὴ τρέφεται, 
καὶ σὺν πολλῷ πόνῳ διενεγκοῦσα καὶ τεκοῦσα τρέφει 
τε καὶ ἐπιμελεῖται, οὕτε προπεπονθυῖα οὐδὲν ἀγαθὸν 
οὕτε γιγνῶσκον τὸ βρέφος, ὑφ' ὅτου εὖ πάσχει οὐδὲ 
σημαίνειν δυνάμενον, ὅτου δεῖται, ἀλλ' αὐτὴ στοχαζομένη τά τε συμφέροντα καὶ τὰ κεχαρισμένα πειρᾶται ἐκπληροῦν καὶ τρέφει πολὺν χρόνον καὶ ἡμέρας 
καὶ νυκτὸς ὑπομένουσα πονεῖν, οὐκ εἰδυῖα, τίνα τούτων χάριν ἀπολήψεται.

Καὶ οὐκ ἀρκεῖ θρέψαι μόνον, ἀλλὰ καὶ ἐπειδὰν δόξωσιν ἱκανοὶ εἶναι οἱ παίδες μανθάνειν τι, ἃ μὲν ἂν αὐτοὶ ἔχωσιν οἱ γονεῖς ἀγαθὰ πρὸς τὸν βίον διδάσκουσιν, ἃ δ' ἂν οἴωνται ἄλλον ἱκανώτερον εἶναι διδάξαι, πέμπουσι πρὸς τοῦτον δαπανῶντες καὶ ἐπιμελοῦνται πάντα ποιοῦντες, ὅπως οἱ παίδες αὐτοῖς γένωνται ὡς δυνατὸν βέλτιστοι.

Πρὸς ταῦτα ὁ νεανίσκος εἶπεν ἀλλά τοι εἰ καὶ πάντα ταῦτα πεποίηκε καὶ ἄλλα τούτων πολλαπλάσια, οὐδεὶς ἂν δύναιτο αὐτῆς ἀνασχέσθαι τὴν χαλεπότητα.

Καὶ ὁ Σωκράτης, Πότερα δέ, ἔφη, οἴει θηρίου ἀγριότητα δυσφορωτέραν εἶναι ἢ μητρός;

a family. The man supports the woman who is to share with him the duty of parentage and provides for the expected children whatever he thinks will contribute to their benefit in life, and accumulates as much of it as he can. The woman conceives and bears her burden in travail, risking her life and giving of her own food; and, with much labor, having endured to the end and brought forth her child, she rears and cares for it, although she has not received any good thing, and the baby neither recognizes its benefactress nor can make its wants known to her: still she guesses what is good for it and what it likes, and seeks to supply these things, and rears it for a long time, putting up with toil day and night, not knowing what return she will get.

"Nor are the parents content just to supply food, but as soon as their children seem capable of learning something they teach them whatever good lessons for life they have, and if they think that someone else is more competent to teach them something, they send them to him at a cost, and do their utmost that the children may turn out as well as possible."

To this the young man replied: "Yes, but even if she has done all this and far more than this, no one could put up with her vile temper."

"Which, do you think," asked Socrates, "is the harder to bear, a wild beast's ferocity or a mother's?"

Έγὼ μὲν οἶμαι, ἔφη, μητρὸς τῆς γε τοιαύτης.

"Ηδη πώποτε οὖν ἢ δακοῦσα κακόν τί σοι ἔδωκεν ἢ λακτίσασα, οἷα ὑπὸ θηρίων ἤδη πολλοὶ ἔπαθον;

8 'Αλλὰ νὴ Δί', ἔφη, λέγει ἃ οὐκ ἄν τις ἐπὶ τῷ βίῳ παντὶ βούλοιτο ἀκοῦσαι.

Σὺ δὲ πόσα, ἔφη ὁ Σωκράτης, οἴει ταύτη [δυσάνεκτα] καὶ τῆ φωνῆ καὶ τοῖς ἔργοις ἐκ παιδίου δυσκολαίνων καὶ ἡμέρας καὶ νυκτὸς πράγματα παρασχεῖν, πόσα δὲ λυπῆσαι κάμνων;

'Αλλ' οὐδεπώποτε αὐτήν, ἔφη, οὔτ' εἶπα οὔτ' ἐποίησα οὐδέν, ἐφ' ῷ ἠσχύνθη.

Τί δέ; οἴει, ἔφη, χαλεπώτερον εἶναί σοι ἀκούειν ὧν αὕτη λέγει ἢ τοῖς ὑποκριταῖς, ὅταν ἐν ταῖς τραγφδίαις ἀλλήλους τὰ ἔσχατα λέγωσιν;

'Αλλ', οἶμαι, ἐπειδὴ οὐκ οἴονται τῶν λεγόντων οὔτε τὸν ἐλέγχοντα ἐλέγχειν, ἵνα ζημιώση, οὔτε τὸν ἀπειλοῦντα ἀπειλεῖν, ἵνα κακόν τι ποιήση, ῥαδίως φέρουσι.

Σὺ δ' εὖ εἰδώς, ὅτι ἃ λέγει σοι ἡ μήτηρ, οὐ μόνον οὐδὲν κακὸν νοοῦσα λέγει, ἀλλὰ καὶ βουλομένη σοι ἀγαθὰ εἶναι ὅσα οὐδενὶ ἄλλῳ, χαλεπαίνεις; ἢ νομίζεις κακόνουν τὴν μητέρα σοι εἶναι;

Οὐ δῆτα, ἔφη, τοῦτό γε οὐκ οἶμαι.

Καὶ ὁ Σωκράτης, Οὐκοῦν, ἔφη, σὰ ταύτην, εὔνουν τέ σοι οὖσαν καὶ ἐπιμελομένην ὡς μάλιστα δύναται κάμνοντος, ὅπως ὑγιανεῖς τε καὶ ὅπως τῶν ἐπιτηδείων μηδενὸς ἐνδεὴς ἔση, καὶ πρὸς τούτοις πολλὰ τοῖς θεοῖς εὐχομένην ἀγαθὰ ὑπὲρ σοῦ καὶ εὐχὰς ἀποδιδοῦ-

9

# MEMORABILIA II. 2.7-2.10

"I should say a mother's, when she is like mine."

"Well now, many people get bitten or kicked by wild beasts; has she ever done you an injury of that sort?"

"Oh no, but she says things you wouldn't listen to for

anything in the world."

"Well, how much trouble do you think you have given her by your cranky voice and behavior day and night since you were a little child; and how much pain when you were ill?"

"But I have never yet said or done anything to cause her shame."

"Now do you really think it harder for you to listen to what she says than for actors when they say the worst things to one another in a tragedy?"

"But an actor, I suppose, doesn't think that a question put to him will lead to punishment, or that a threat means any harm: and so he takes it lightly."

"And why should you be annoyed? You know well that there is no malice in what your mother says to you; on the contrary, she wants blessings for you above all others—unless you suppose that your mother bears you malice?"

"Oh no, I don't think that."

"So this mother of yours," said Socrates, "is kindly disposed toward you; she nurses you devotedly in sickness and sees that you want for nothing; more than that, she prays the gods to bless you abundantly and pays vows on

9

σαν, χαλεπὴν εἶναι φής; έγὼ μὲν οῗμαι, εἰ τοιαύτην μὴ δύνασαι φέρειν μητέρα, τἀγαθά σε οὐ δύνασθαι 11 φέρειν. εἰπὲ δέ μοι, ἔφη, πότερον ἄλλον τινὰ οἴει δεῖν θεραπεύειν; ἢ παρεσκεύασαι μηδενὶ ἀνθρώπων πειρᾶσθαι ἀρέσκειν μηδὲ πείθεσθαι μήτε στρατηγῷ μήτε ἄλλῳ ἄρχοντι;

Ναὶ μὰ Δι' ἔγωγε, ἔφη.

Οὐκοῦν, ἔφη ὁ Σωκράτης, καὶ τῷ γείτονι βούλει σὰ ἀρέσκειν, ἵνα σοι καὶ πῦρ ἐναύῃ, ὅταν τούτου δέῃ, καὶ ἀγαθοῦ τέ σοι γίγνηται συλλήπτωρ καί, ἄν τι σφαλλόμενος τύχῃς, εὐνοϊκῶς ἐγγύθεν βοηθῆ σοι;

Έγωγε, ἔφη.

12

13

Τί δέ; συνοδοιπόρον ἢ σύμπλουν ἢ εἴ τῳ ἄλλῳ ἐντυγχάνοις, οὐδὲν ἄν σοι διαφέροι φίλον ἢ ἐχθρὸν γενέσθαι ἢ καὶ τῆς παρὰ τούτων εὐνοίας οἴει δεῖν ἐπιμελεῖσθαι;

"Εγωγε, ἔφη.

Εἶτα τούτων μὲν ἐπιμελεῖσθαι παρεσκεύασαι, τὴν δὲ μητέρα τὴν πάντων μάλιστά σε φιλοῦσαν οὐκ οἴει δεῖν θεραπεύειν; οὐκ οἶσθ', ὅτι καὶ ἡ πόλις ἄλλης μὲν ἀχαριστίας οὐδεμιᾶς ἐπιμελεῖται οὐδὲ δικάζει, ἀλλὰ περιορῷ τοὺς εὖ πεπονθότας χάριν οὐκ ἀποδιδόντας, ἐὰν δέ τις γονέας μὴ θεραπεύῃ, τούτῳ δίκην τε ἐπιτίθησι καὶ ἀποδοκιμάζουσα οὐκ ἐῷ ἄρχειν τοῦτον, ὡς οὕτε ἄν τὰ ἱερὰ εὐσεβῶς θυόμενα ὑπὲρ τῆς πόλεως τούτου θύοντος οὕτε ἄλλο καλῶς καὶ δικαίως οὐδὲν ἂν τούτου πράξαντος; καὶ νὴ Δία ἐάν τις τῶν γονέων τελευτησάντων τοὺς τάφους μὴ κοσμῷ, καὶ τοῦτο ἐξε-

#### MEMORABILIA II. 2.10-2.13

your behalf; and yet you say she is difficult! It seems to me that, if you can't endure a mother like her, you can't endure what's good. Now tell me, is there any other being whom you feel bound to care for? Or are you set on trying to please nobody, and obeying neither general nor other ruler?"

"Of course not!"

"Do you want to please your neighbor, for instance, so that he will light a fire for you when you need one, will support you in prosperity, and in case of accident or failure will be ready to hold out a helping hand?"

"Yes, I do."

"When you find yourself with a traveling companion on land or at sea, or happen to meet someone, does it make any difference to you whether he proves a friend or an enemy? Or do you think his goodwill worth cultivating?"

"Yes, I do."

"And yet, when you are prepared to cultivate them, you don't think courtesy is due to your mother, who loves you most of all? Don't you know that even the state ignores all other forms of ingratitude and pronounces no judgment on them, a caring nothing if the recipient of a favor neglects to thank his benefactor, but inflicts penalties on the man who is discourteous to his parents and rejects him as unworthy of office, holding that it would be sacrilege for him to offer sacrifices on behalf of the state and that he is unlikely to do anything else honorably and rightly? Yes, and if someone fails to honor his parents' graves, the state inquires into that too, when it examines the candidates for

11

12

<sup>4</sup> Cyr. 1.2.7.

- 14 τάζει ἡ πόλις ἐν ταῖς τῶν ἀρχόντων δοκιμασίαις. σὸ οὖν, ὧ παῖ, ἐὰν σωφρονῆς, τοὺς μὲν θεοὺς παραιτήση σνγγνώμονάς σοι εἶναι, εἴ τι παρημέληκας τῆς μητρός, μή σε καὶ οὖτοι νομίσαντες ἀχάριστον εἶναι οὐκ ἐθελήσωσιν εὖ ποιεῖν, τοὺς δὲ ἀνθρώπους φυλάξη, μή σε αἰσθόμενοι τῶν γονέων ἀμελοῦντα πάντες ἀτιμάσωσιν, εἶτα ἐν ἐρημία φίλων ἀναφανῆς. εἰ γάρ σε ὑπολάβοιεν πρὸς τοὺς γονεῖς ἀχάριστον εἶναι, οὐδεὶς ἂν νομίσειεν εὖ σε ποιήσας χάριν ἀπολήψεσθαι.
  - 3. Χαιρεφώντα δέ ποτε καὶ Χαιρεκράτην, άδελφὼ μεν ὄντε ἀλλήλοιν, έαυτῷ δε γνωρίμω, αἰσθόμενος διαφερομένω, ίδων τον Χαιρεκράτην, Είπέ μοι, έφη, ὧ Χαιρέκρατες, οὐ δήπου καὶ σὺ εἶ τῶν τοιούτων άνθρώπων, οι χρησιμώτερον νομίζουσι χρήματα η άδελφούς; καὶ ταῦτα τῶν μὲν ἀφρόνων ὄντων, τοῦ δὲ φρονίμου, καὶ τῶν μὲν βοηθείας δεομένων, τοῦ δὲ βοηθείν δυναμένου, καὶ πρὸς τούτοις τῶν μὲν πλειόνων ύπαρχόντων, τοῦ δὲ ένός. θαυμαστὸν δὲ καὶ τοῦτο, εἴ τις τοὺς μὲν ἀδελφοὺς ζημίαν ἡγεῖται, ὅτι οὐ καὶ τὰ τῶν ἀδελφῶν κέκτηται, τοὺς δὲ πολίτας οὐχ ἡγεῖται ζημίαν, ὅτι οὐ καὶ τὰ τῶν πολιτῶν ἔχει, ἀλλ' ἐνταῦθα μεν δύνανται λογίζεσθαι, ὅτι κρεῖττον σὺν πολλοῖς οἰκοῦντα ἀσφαλῶς τάρκοῦντα ἔχειν ἢ μόνον διαιτώμενον τὰ τῶν πολιτῶν ἐπικινδύνως πάντα κεκτῆσθαι, έπὶ δὲ τῶν ἀδελφῶν τὸ αὐτὸ τοῦτο ἀγνοοῦσι. καὶ οἰκέτας μὲν οἱ δυνάμενοι ώνοῦνται, ἵνα συνεργοὺς έχωσι, καὶ φίλους κτῶνται ὡς βοηθῶν δεόμενοι, τῶν δ' άδελφῶν ἀμελοῦσιν, ὥσπερ ἐκ πολιτῶν μὲν γιγνο-

office. Therefore, my boy, if you are prudent, you will pray the gods to pardon your neglect of your mother, so that they in turn don't refuse to be kind to you, considering you an ingrate; and you will beware of men, so that all don't cast you out, perceiving that you care nothing for your parents, and in the end you are found to be without a friend. For if men suppose you to be ungrateful to your parents, none would think you would be grateful for any favor they might do you."

3. On another occasion he found that two brothers, Chaerephon and Chaerecrates, whom he knew well, were quarreling. On seeing the latter, he said, "Surely, Chaerecrates, you are not one of those who believe there is more value in goods and chattels than in a brother, when they are unconscious but he is conscious; they are helpless but he is helpful; when, moreover, you have many goods but only one brother. It is strange too that a man should consider his brothers a liability because he cannot have their possessions as well as his own, and yet should not consider his fellow citizens a liability because their possessions are not his; and although in this case men can reflect that it is better to belong to a community, secure in having enough, than to live alone with a precarious hold on all the property of their fellow citizens, they fail to see that the same principle applies to brothers. Again, those who have the means buy servants to relieve them of work and make friends because they want help, but they neglect their brothers, as though friendship can exist between fellow

2

4 μένους φίλους, ἐξ ἀδελφῶν δὲ οὐ γιγνομένους. καὶ μὴν πρὸς φιλίαν μέγα μὲν ὑπάρχει τὸ ἐκ τῶν αὐτῶν φῦναι, μέγα δὲ τὸ ὁμοῦ τραφῆναι, ἐπεὶ καὶ τοῖς θηρίοις πόθος τις ἐγγίγνεται τῶν συντρόφων πρὸς δὲ τούτοις καὶ οἱ ἄλλοι ἄνθρωποι τιμῶσί τε μᾶλλον τοὺς συναδέλφους ὄντας τῶν ἀναδέλφων καὶ ἦττον τούτοις ἐπιτίθενται.

Καὶ ὁ Χαιρεκράτης εἶπεν ἀλλὶ εἰ μέν, ὧ Σώκρατες, μὴ μέγα εἴη τὸ διάφορον, ἴσως ἂν δέοι φέρειν τὸν ἀδελφὸν καὶ μὴ μικρῶν ἔνεκα φεύγειν ἀγαθὸν γάρ, ὥσπερ καὶ σύ λέγεις, ἀδελφὸς ὢν οἷον δεῦ ὁπότε μέντοι παντὸς ἐνδέοι καὶ πῶν τὸ ἐναντιώτατον εἴη, τί ἄν τις ἐπιχειροίη τοῦς ἀδυνάτοις;

Καὶ ὁ Σωκράτης ἔφη· Πότερα δέ, ὧ Χαιρέκρατες, οὐδενὶ ἀρέσαι δύναται Χαιρεφῶν, ὥσπερ οὐδὲ σοί, ἢ ἔστιν οἷς καὶ πάνυ ἀρέσκει;

Διὰ τοῦτο γάρ τοι, ἔφη, ὧ Σώκρατες, ἄξιόν ἐστιν ἐμοὶ μισεῖν αὐτόν, ὅτι ἄλλοις μὲν ἀρέσκειν δύναται, ἐμοὶ δὲ ὅπου ἂν παρῆ πανταχοῦ καὶ ἔργῳ καὶ λόγῳ ζημία μᾶλλον ἢ ὡφέλειά ἐστιν.

³Αρ' οὖν, ἔφη ὁ Σωκράτης, ὥσπερ ἵππος τῷ ἀνεπιστήμονι μέν, ἐγχειροῦντι δὲ χρῆσθαι ζημία ἐστίν, οὕτω καὶ ἀδελφός, ὅταν τις αὐτῷ μὴ ἐπιστάμενος ἐγχειρῆ χρῆσθαι, ζημία ἐστί;

Πῶς δ' ἂν ἐγώ, ἔφη ὁ Χαιρεκράτης, ἀνεπιστήμων εἴην ἀδελφῷ χρῆσθαι, ἐπιστάμενός γε καὶ εὖ λέγειν τὸν εὖ λέγοντα καὶ εὖ ποιεῖν τὸν εὖ ποιοῦντα; τὸν μέντοι καὶ λόγῳ καὶ ἔργῳ πειρώμενον ἐμὲ ἀνιᾶν οὐκ

5

6

### MEMORABILIA II. 3.4-3.8

citizens but not between brothers! Yet common parentage and common upbringing are strong ties of affection,5 for even wild beasts reared together feel a natural yearning for one another. Besides, our fellow men respect those of us who have brothers more than those who have none, and are less ready to quarrel with them."

"If only the difference between us were a slight one, Socrates," replied Chaerecrates, "perhaps I should put up with my brother and not allow trifles to separate us. For a brother who behaves like a brother is, as you say, a good thing; but if his conduct is nothing like that, and is in fact just the opposite of what it should be, what is the use of attempting impossibilities?"

"Does everyone find Chaerephon as disagreeable as you do, Chaerecrates, or do some people find him very pleasant?"

"Ah, Socrates," replied he, "this is precisely my reason for hating him: he is pleasant enough to other people, but whenever he is near me he invariably says and does more to hurt than to help me."

"Well now," said Socrates, "if you try to manage a horse without knowing the right way, he hurts you. Is it so with a brother? Is he hurtful if you try to deal with him when you don't know the way?"

"What," exclaimed Chaerecrates, "don't I know how to deal with a brother, when I know how to requite a kind word and a generous deed? But I can't speak or act kindly

6

<sup>5</sup> Cyr. 2.1.28.

αν δυναίμην οὕτ' εὖ λέγειν οὕτ' εὖ ποιεῖν, ἀλλ' οὐδὲ πειράσομαι.

Καὶ ὁ Σωκράτης ἔφη· Θαυμαστά γε λέγεις, ὧ Χαιρέκρατες, εἰ κύνα μέν, εἴ σοι ἦν ἐπὶ προβάτοις ἐπιτήδειος ὢν καὶ τοὺς μὲν ποιμένας ἤσπάζετο, σοὶ δὲ
προσιόντι ἐχαλέπαινεν, ἀμελήσας ὢν τοῦ ὀργίζεσθαι
ἐπειρῶ εὖ ποιήσας πραΰνειν αὐτόν, τὸν δὲ ἀδελφὸν
φὴς μὲν μέγα ὢν ἀγαθὸν εἶναι ὄντα πρὸς σὲ οἷον δεῖ,
ἐπίστασθαι δὲ ὁμολογῶν καὶ εὖ ποιεῖν καὶ εὖ λέγειν
οὐκ ἐπιχειρεῖς μηχανῶσθαι, ὅπως σοι ὡς βέλτιστος
ἦ.

10 Καὶ ὁ Χαιρεκράτης, Δέδοικα, ἔφη, ὧ Σώκρατες, μὴ οὐκ ἔχω ἐγὼ τοσαύτην σοφίαν, ὥστε Χαιρεφῶντα ποιῆσαι πρὸς ἐμὲ οἷον δεῖ.

Καὶ μὴν οὐδέν γε ποικίλου, ἔφη ὁ Σωκράτης, οὐδὲ καινὸν δεῖ ἐπ' αὐτόν, ὡς ἐμοὶ δοκεῖ, μηχανᾶσθαι, οἷς δὲ καὶ σὐ ἐπίστασαι αὐτὸς οἴομαι ἃν αὐτὸν ἁλόντα περὶ πολλοῦ ποιεῖσθαί σε.

Οὐκ ἂν φθάνοις, ἔφη, λέγων, εἴ τι ἤσθησαί με φίλτρον ἐπιστάμενον, ὃ ἐγὼ εἰδὼς λέληθα ἐμαυτόν.

Λέγε δή μοι, ἔφη, εἴ τινα τῶν γνωρίμων βούλοιο κατεργάσασθαι, ὁπότε θύοι, καλεῖν σε ἐπὶ δεῖπνον, τί ἂν ποιοίης;

Δήλον ὅτι κατάρχοιμι ἃν τοῦ αὐτός, ὅτε θύοιμι, καλεῖν ἐκεῖνον.

12 Εἰ δὲ βούλοιο τῶν φίλων τινὰ προτρέψασθαι, ὁπότε ἀποδημοίης, ἐπιμελεῖσθαι τῶν σῶν, τί ἂν ποιοίης;

9

# MEMORABILIA II. 3.8-3.12

to one who tries to annoy me by his words and actionsand what's more, I won't try."

"Chaerecrates, you astonish me! Had you a sheep dog that was friendly to the shepherds but growled when you came near him, it would never occur to you to get angry, but you would try to tame him by kindness. You say that, if your brother treated you like a brother, he would be a great blessing, and you confess that you know how to speak and act kindly: yet you don't set yourself to contriving that he will be the greatest possible blessing to vou."

"I fear, Socrates, that I lack the wisdom to make Chae-

rephon treat me as he should."

"And yet," said Socrates, "there is no need, so far as I see, of any subtle or strange contriving on your part: I think you know the way to win him and to get his good opinion."

"If you have observed that I know some spell without

being aware of it, please tell me at once."

"Then tell me, now; if you wanted to get an invitation to dine with an acquaintance when he offers sacrifice, what would you do?"

"Of course I would begin by inviting him myself when I offered sacrifice."

"And suppose you wanted to encourage one of your friends to look after your affairs during your absence from home, what would you do?"

127

9

10

11

Δήλον ὅτι πρότερος ἃν ἐγχειροίην ἐπιμελεῖσθαι τῶν ἐκείνου, ὁπότε ἀποδημοίη.

Εἰ δὲ βούλοιο ξένον ποιῆσαι ὑποδέχεσθαι σεαυτόν, ὁπότε ἔλθοις εἰς τὴν ἐκείνου, τί ἂν ποιοίης;

Δήλον ὅτι καὶ τοῦτον πρότερος ὑποδεχοίμην ἄν, ὑπότε ἔλθοι ᾿Αθήναζε· καὶ εἴ γε βουλοίμην αὐτὸν προθυμεῖσθαι διαπράττειν μοι ἐφ' ἃ ἥκοιμι, δήλον ὅτι καὶ τοῦτο δέοι ἂν πρότερον αὐτὸν ἐκείνω ποιεῖν.

Πάντ' ἄρα σύγε τὰ ἐν ἀνθρώποις φίλτρα ἐπιστάμενος πάλαι ἀπεκρύπτου ἢ ὀκνεῖς, ἔφη, ἄρξαι, μὴ
αἰσχρὸς φανῆς, ἐὰν πρότερος τὸν ἀδελφὸν εὖ ποιῆς;
καὶ μὴν πλείστου γε δοκεῖ ἀνὴρ ἐπαίνου ἄξιος εἶναι,
δς ἂν φθάνη τοὺς μὲν πολεμίους κακῶς ποιῶν, τοὺς
δὲ φίλους εὐεργετῶν. εἰ μὲν οὖν ἐδόκει μοι Χαιρεφῶν
ἡγεμονικώτερος εἶναι σοῦ πρὸς τὴν φιλίαν ταύτην,
ἐκεῖνον ἂν ἐπειρώμην πείθειν πρότερον ἐγχειρεῖν τῷ
σὲ φίλον ποιεῖσθαι νῦν δέ μοι σὺ δοκεῖς ἡγούμενος
μᾶλλον ἂν ἐξεργάζεσθαι τοῦτο.

Καὶ ὁ Χαιρεκράτης εἶπεν ᾿Ατοπα λέγεις, ὧ Σώκρατες, καὶ οὐδαμῶς πρὸς σοῦ, ὅς γε κελεύεις ἐμὲ νεώτερον ὅντα καθηγεῖσθαι καίτοι τούτου γε παρὰ πασιν ἀνθρώποις τἀναντία νομίζεται, τὸν πρεσβύτερον ἡγεῖσθαι παντὸς καὶ ἔργου καὶ λόγου.

Πῶς; ἔφη ὁ Σωκράτης· οὐ γὰρ καὶ ὁδοῦ παραχωρησαι τὸν νεώτερον πρεσβυτέρω συντυγχάνοντι πανταχοῦ νομίζεται καὶ καθήμενον ὑπαναστῆναι καὶ κοίτη μαλακῆ τιμησαι καὶ λόγων ὑπείξαι; ἀγαθέ, μὴ ὄκνει, ἔφη, ἀλλ' ἐγχείρει τὸν ἄνδρα καταπραΰνειν· καὶ

13

14

15

### MEMORABILIA II. 3.12-3.16

"Of course I should first undertake to look after his affairs in his absence"

"And suppose you wanted a stranger to entertain you when you visited his city, what would you do?"

"Obviously I should first entertain him when he came to Athens. Yes, and if I wanted him to be eager to carry out the business on which I had come, obviously I would first have to do the same by him."

"It seems that you have been hiding a knowledge of all spells that were ever discovered. Or is it that you hesitate to make a beginning for fear of disgracing yourself by first showing kindness to your brother? Yet it is generally thought worthy of the highest praise to anticipate the malevolence of an enemy and the benevolence of a friend. So if I thought Chaerephon more capable than you of showing the way to this friendship, I would try to persuade him to take the first step toward an understanding with you. But as things are, I think the enterprise more likely to succeed under your direction."

"Strange sentiments, Socrates! It's quite unlike you to urge me, the younger, to lead the way; and surely all hold the contrary opinion, that the older should always act and speak first."

"How so?" said Socrates. "Is it not the general opinion that a young man should make way for an older when they meet, 6 offer his seat to him, give him a comfortable bed, let him have the first word? My good friend, don't hesitate, but take up the task of pacifying your man, and in no time

13

15

<sup>6</sup> Cyr. 8.7.10.

πάνυ ταχύ σοι ύπακούσεται. οὐχ ὁρậς, ὡς φιλότιμός ἐστι καὶ ἐλευθέριος; τὰ μὲν γὰρ πονηρὰ ἀνθρώπια οὐκ ἂν ἄλλως μᾶλλον ἕλοις ἢ εἰ δοίης τι, τοὺς δὲ καλοὺς κἀγαθοὺς ἀνθρώπους προσφιλώς χρώμενος μάλιστ' ἂν κατεργάσαιο.

17 Καὶ ὁ Χαιρεκράτης εἶπεν· Ἐὰν οὖν ἐμοῦ ταῦτα ποιοῦντος ἐκεῖνος μηδὲν βελτίων γίγνηται;

Τί γὰρ ἄλλο, ἔφη ὁ Σωκράτης, ἢ κινδυνεύσεις ἐπιδείξαι σὰ μὲν χρηστός τε καὶ φιλάδελφος εἶναι, ἐκείνος δὲ φαῦλός τε καὶ οὐκ ἄξιος εὐεργεσίας; ἀλλ' οὐδὲν οἶμαι τούτων ἔσεσθαι· νομίζω γὰρ αὐτόν, ἐπειδὰν αἴσθηταί σε προκαλούμενον ἑαυτὸν εἰς τὸν ἀγῶνα τοῦτον, πάνυ φιλονεικήσειν, ὅπως περιγένηταί σου καὶ λόγω καὶ ἔργω εὖ ποιῶν.

Νῦν μὲν γὰρ οὕτως, ἔφη, διάκεισθον, ὥσπερ εἰ τὼ χεῖρε, ἃς ὁ θεὸς ἐπὶ τῷ συλλαμβάνειν ἀλλήλαις ἐποίησεν, ἀφεμένω τούτου τράποιντο πρὸς τὸ διακωλύειν ἀλλήλω ἢ εἰ τὼ πόδε θεία μοίρα πεποιημένω πρὸς τὸ συνεργεῖν ἀλλήλοιν ἀμελήσαντε τούτου ἐμποδίζοιεν ἀλλήλω. οὐκ ἂν πολλὴ ἀμαθία εἴη καὶ κακοδαιμονία τοῖς ἐπ᾽ ἀφελεία πεποιημένοις ἐπὶ βλάβη χρῆσθαι; καὶ μὴν ἀδελφώ γε, ὡς ἐμοὶ δοκεῖ, ὁ θεὸς ἐποίησεν ἐπὶ μείζονι ἀφελεία ἀλλήλοιν ἢ χεῖρε τε καὶ πόδε καὶ ὀφθαλμὼ καὶ τἆλλα, ὅσα ἀδελφὰ ἔφυσεν ἀνθρώποις. χεῖρες μὲν γάρ, εἰ δέοι αὐτὰς τὰ πλέον ὀργυιᾶς διέχοντα ἄμα ποιῆσαι οὐκ ἂν δύναιντο· πόδες δὲ οὐδ᾽ ἂν ἐπὶ τὰ ὀργυιὰν διέχοντα ἔλθοιεν ἄμα· ὀφθαλμοὶ δὲ οἱ καὶ δοκοῦντες ἐπὶ πλεῖστον ἐξικνεῖ-

18

# MEMORABILIA II. 3.16-3.19

he will respond to your overtures. Don't you see how eager and frank he is? You will most readily catch the low types, it is true, by giving them something, but kindness is the weapon most likely to prevail with the gentlemen."

"And what," asked Chaerecrates, "if all my efforts lead

to no improvement?"

"Well, in that case, I presume you will have shown that you are honest and brotherly, he that he is base and unworthy of kindness. But I am confident that no such result will follow; for I think that as soon as he is aware of your challenge to this contest, he will be quite eager to outdo your kind words and actions.

"Now what if a pair of hands," he said, "refused the office of mutual help for which the god made them and tried to thwart each other; or if a pair of feet neglected the duty of working together, for which they were fashioned, and took to hampering each other? That is how you two are behaving at present. Would it not be utterly ignorant and disastrous to use for hindrance instruments that were made for help? And, moreover, a pair of brothers, in my judgment, were made by the god to render better service to one another than a pair of hands and feet and eyes and all the instruments that he meant to be used as partners. For the hands cannot deal simultaneously with things that are more than six feet or so apart: the feet cannot reach in a single stride things that are even six feet apart: and the eyes, though they seem to have a longer range, cannot at

131

17

18

σθαι οὐδ' ἃν τῶν ἔτι ἐγγυτέρω ὅντων τὰ ἔμπροσθεν ἄμα καὶ τὰ ὅπισθεν ἰδεῖν δύναιντο· ἀδελφὼ δὲ φίλω ὅντε καὶ πολὺ διεστῶτε πράττετον ἄμα καὶ ἐπ' ὡφελείᾳ ἀλλήλοιν.

4. "Ηκουσα δέ ποτε αὐτοῦ καὶ περὶ φίλων διαλεγομένου, ἐξ ὧν ἔμοιγε ἐδόκει μάλιστ' ἄν τις ὡφελεῖσθαι πρὸς φίλων κτῆσίν τε καὶ χρείαν.

Τοῦτο μὲν γὰρ δὴ πολλῶν ἔφη ἀκούειν, ὡς πάντων κτημάτων κράτιστον είη φίλος σαφής καὶ ἀγαθός. έπιμελομένους δε παντός μαλλον όραν έφη τοὺς πολλοὺς ἢ φίλων κτήσεως, καὶ γὰρ οἰκίας καὶ ἀγροὺς καὶ άνδράποδα καὶ βοσκήματα καὶ σκεύη κτωμένους τε έπιμελως όραν έφη και τὰ όντα σώζειν πειρωμένους, φίλον δέ, δ μέγιστον άγαθὸν εἶναί φασιν, δρᾶν ἔφη τοὺς πολλοὺς οὔτε ὅπως κτήσονται φροντίζοντας οὔτε όπως οἱ όντες ἑαυτοῖς σώζωνται, ἀλλὰ καὶ καμνόντων φίλων τε καὶ οἰκετῶν ὁρᾶν τινας ἔφη τοῖς μὲν οἰκέταις καὶ ἰατροὺς εἰσάγοντας καὶ τἆλλα τὰ πρὸς ὑγίειαν έπιμελώς παρασκευάζοντας, των δε φίλων όλιγωροῦντας, ἀποθανόντων τε ἀμφοτέρων ἐπὶ μὲν τοῖς οἰκέταις άχθομένους τε καὶ ζημίαν ἡγουμένους, ἐπὶ δὲ τοῖς φίλοις οὐδὲν οἰομένους έλαττοῦσθαι, καὶ τῶν μὲν ἄλλων κτημάτων οὐδὲν ἐωντας ἀθεράπευτον οὐδ' ἀνεπίσκεπτον, των δε φίλων επιμελείας δεομένων αμελούντας. ἔτι δὲ πρὸς τούτοις ὁρᾶν ἔφη τοὺς πολλοὺς τῶν μεν ἄλλων κτημάτων καὶ πάνυ πολλών αὐτοῖς ὄντων τὸ πληθος εἰδότας, τῶν δὲ φίλων ὀλίγων ὄντων οὐ μόνον τὸ πληθος ἀγνοοῦντας, ἀλλὰ καὶ τοῖς πυνθα-

#### MEMORABILIA II. 3.19-4.4

the same moment see things still nearer than that, if some are in front and some behind. But two brothers, when they are friends, act simultaneously for mutual benefit, however far separate one from the other."

4. Again, I once heard a conversation of his about friendship<sup>7</sup> that I thought likely to be of great help in acquiring and making use of friends.

For he said that he often heard it stated that of all possessions the most precious is a good and sincere friend. "And yet," he said, "there is no transaction most men are so careless about as the acquisition of friends. For I find that they are careful about getting houses and lands and slaves and cattle and furniture, and anxious to keep what they have; but though they claim that a friend is the greatest blessing, I find that most men take no thought how to get new friends or keep their old ones. Indeed, if one of their friends and one of their servants get sick at the same time, I find that some call in the doctor to attend the servant and are careful to provide everything that may contribute to his recovery, whereas they pay no attention to the friend. In the event that both die, they are annoyed at losing the servant and consider it a loss, but don't feel that the death of the friend matters in the least. And though none of their other possessions is uncared for and unconsidered, they neglect their friends' need of attention. And besides all this. I find that most men know the number of their other possessions, however great it may be, yet cannot tell the number of their friends, few as they are, and

<sup>7</sup> Cyr. 8.7.13.

νομένοις τοῦτο καταλέγειν έγχειρήσαντας οὓς έν τοῖς φίλοις έθεσαν, πάλιν τούτους άνατίθεσθαι τοσούτον αὐτοὺς τῶν φίλων φροντίζειν, καίτοι πρὸς ποῖον κτήμα των άλλων παραβαλλόμενος φίλος άγαθὸς οὐκ ἂν πολλῶ κρείττων φανείη; ποῖος γὰρ ἵππος ἢ ποῖον ζεῦγος οὕτω χρήσιμον ὥσπερ ὁ χρηστὸς φίλος; ποῖον δὲ ἀνδράποδον οὕτως εὔνουν καὶ παραμόνιμον; ἢ ποῖον ἄλλο κτῆμα οὕτω πάγχρηστον; ὁ γὰρ ἀγαθὸς φίλος έαυτὸν τάττει πρὸς πᾶν τὸ ἐλλεῖπον τῷ φίλω καὶ τῆς τῶν ἰδίων κατασκευῆς καὶ τῶν κοινῶν πράξεων, καὶ ἄν τέ τινα εὖ ποιῆσαι δέη, συνεπισχύει, ἄν τέ τις φόβος ταράττη, συμβοηθεί τὰ μὲν συναναλίσκων, τὰ δὲ συμπράττων καὶ τὰ μὲν συμπείθων, τὰ δὲ βιαζόμενος καὶ εὖ μὲν πράττοντας πλείστα εὐφραίνων, σφαλλομένους δὲ πλείστα ἐπανορθῶν. ἃ δὲ αἴ τε χείρες έκάστω ύπηρετοῦσι καὶ οἱ ὀφθαλμοὶ προορῶσι καὶ τὰ ὧτα προακούουσι καὶ οἱ πόδες διανύτουσι, τούτων φίλος εὐεργετῶν οὐδενὸς λείπεται πολλάκις δὲ ἃ πρὸ αύτοῦ τις ἢ οὐκ έξειργάσατο ἢ οὐκ εἶδεν ἢ οὐκ ἤκουσεν ἢ οὐ διήνυσε, ταῦθ' ὁ φίλος πρὸ τοῦ φίλου ἐξήρκεσεν. ἀλλ' ὅμως ἔνιοι δένδρα μὲν πειρώνται θεραπεύειν τοῦ καρποῦ ἔνεκεν, τοῦ δὲ παμφορωτάτου κτήματος, δ καλείται φίλος, άργῶς καὶ ἀνειμένως οἱ πλεῖστοι ἐπιμέλονται.

5. "Ηκουσα δέ ποτε καὶ ἄλλον αὐτοῦ λόγον, ὃς ἐδόκει μοι προτρέπειν τὸν ἀκούοντα ἐξετάζειν ἑαυτόν, ὁπόσου τοῖς φίλοις ἄξιος εἴη. ἰδὼν γάρ τινα τῶν συνόντων ἀμελοῦντα φίλου πενία πιεζομένου ἤρετο ἀντι-

# MEMORABILIA II. 4.4-5.1

if asked to try to make a list they will insert names and presently remove them. So much for the thought they give to their friends! Yet surely there is no other possession that can compare with a good friend. For what horse, what yoke of oxen is so good a servant as the good friend? what slave so loval and constant? or what possession so serviceable? The good friend is on the watch to supply whatever his friend wants for building up his private fortune and forwarding his public career. If generosity is called for, he does his part: if fear harasses, he comes to the rescue, shares expenses, helps to persuade, bears down opposition: he is foremost in delighting him when he is prosperous and raising him up when he falls. Of all that a man can do with his hands, see for himself with his eyes, hear for himself with his ears or accomplish with his feet, in nothing is a friend backward in helping. Nevertheless, while some strive to cultivate a tree for its fruit, most bestow but an idle and listless care on their most fruitful possession, the name of which is 'friend.'"

5. Again, I once heard him urge a listener—for so I interpreted his words—to examine himself and to ask how much he was worth to his friends. For he had noticed that one of his companions was neglecting a poverty-stricken friend; so he put a question to Antisthenes in the pres-

σθένη έναντίον τοῦ ἀμελοῦντος αὐτοῦ καὶ ἄλλων πολ-2 λων, Αρ', έφη, ω Αντίσθενες, εἰσί τινες ἀξίαι φίλων, ὥσπερ οἰκετῶν; τῶν γὰρ οἰκετῶν ὁ μέν που δυοῖν μναῖν ἄξιός ἐστιν, ὁ δὲ οὐδ' ἡμιμναίου, ὁ δὲ πέντε μνών, ὁ δὲ καὶ δέκα. Νικίας δὲ ὁ Νικηράτου λέγεται έπιστάτην είς τάργύρεια πρίασθαι ταλάντου. σκοποῦμαι δη τοῦτο, ἔφη, εἰ ἄρα ὥσπερ τῶν οἰκετῶν, οὕτω καὶ τῶν φίλων εἰσὶν ἀξίαι.

Ναὶ μὰ Δί', ἔφη ὁ ἀντισθένης ἐγὼ γοῦν βουλοίμην αν τὸν μέν τινα φίλον μοι εἶναι μαλλον η δύο μνας. τὸν δ' οὐδ' ἂν ἡμιμναίου προτιμησαίμην, τὸν δὲ καὶ δέκα μνῶν έλοίμην ἄν, τὸν δὲ πρὸ πάντων χρημάτων καὶ πόνων πριαίμην ἂν φίλον μοι εἶναι.

Οὐκοῦν, ἔφη ὁ Σωκράτης, εἴ γε ταῦτα τοιαῦτά ἐστι, καλώς αν έχοι έξετάζειν τινα έαυτόν, πόσου άρα τυγχάνει τοῖς φίλοις ἄξιος ὤν, καὶ πειρᾶθαι ὡς πλείστου άξιος είναι, ίνα ήττον αὐτὸν οἱ φίλοι προδιδώσιν. έγώ γάρ τοι, ἔφη, πολλάκις ἀκούω τοῦ μέν, ὅτι προὕδωκεν αὐτὸν φίλος ἀνήρ, τοῦ δ', ὅτι μνῶν ἀνθ' ἐαυτοῦ μῶλλον είλετο ἀνήρ, ὃν ὤετο Φίλον εἶναι. τὰ τοιαῦτα 5 πάντα σκοπώ, μη ώσπερ όταν τις οἰκέτην πονηρον πωλή καὶ ἀποδίδοται τοῦ εύρόντος, οὕτω καὶ τὸν πονηρὸν φίλον, ὅταν ἐξῆ τὸ πλέον τῆς ἀξίας λαβεῖν, έπαγωγὸν ή ἀποδίδοσθαι, τοὺς δὲ χρηστοὺς οὔτε οἰκέτας πάνυ τι πωλουμένους όρω οὔτε φίλους προδιδομένους.

6. Ἐδόκει δέ μοι καὶ εἰς τὸ δοκιμάζειν φίλους ὁποίους ἄξιον κτᾶσθαι φρενοῦν τοιάδε λέγων.

3

#### MEMORABILIA II. 5.2-6.1

ence of several others, including the neglectful friend. "Antisthenes," he said, "have friends like servants their own value? For one servant, I suppose, may be worth two minas, 8 another less than half a mina, another five minas, another no less than ten. Nicias, son of Niceratus, is said to have given a whole talent for a manager of his silver mine. So I'm led to inquire whether friends too may differ in value."

"Oh yes," replied Antisthenes, "there are men whose friendship I for one would rather have than two minas: others I should value at less than half a mina: others I would prefer to ten minas: others I would part with any sum and take any trouble to count among my friends."

"If that's so," said Socrates, "then wouldn't it be well to ask ourselves how much we are really worth to our friends and try to make ourselves as precious as possible, so that our friends won't be tempted to betray us? For my part, I often hear complaints of this sort: 'A friend betrayed me,' one I regarded as my friend gave me up for the sake of a mina.' I ponder all this and reflect that, when a man sells a bad slave he takes anything he can get for him; and perhaps it is tempting to sell a bad friend when there is a chance of getting more than he is worth. Good servants, I find, are not offered for sale, nor are good friends betrayed."

6. In the following conversation I thought he gave instruction for testing the qualities that make a friendship worth acquiring.

2

3

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> One mina = 100 drachmas = 600 obols, roughly a month's income for a skilled worker.

<sup>9</sup> One talent = 600 minas.

Εἰπέ μοι, ἔφη, ὧ Κριτόβουλε, εἰ δεοίμεθα φίλου ἀγαθοῦ, πῶς ἂν ἐπιχειροίημεν σκοπεῖν; ἄρα πρῶτον μὲν ζητητέον, ὅστις ἄρχει γαστρός τε καὶ φιλοποσίας καὶ λαγνείας καὶ ὕπνου καὶ ἀργίας; ὁ γὰρ ὑπὸ τούτων κρατούμενος οὕτ' αὐτὸς ἑαυτῷ δύναιτ' ἃν οὕτε φίλῳ τὰ δέοντα πράττειν.

 $M\grave{a}$   $\Delta \hat{\iota}$  οὐ  $\delta \hat{\eta} \tau a$ , ἔ $\phi \eta$ .

Οὐκοῦν τοῦ μὲν ὑπὸ τούτων ἀρχομένου ἀφεκτέον δοκεῖ σοι εἶναι;

Πάνυ μὲν οὖν, ἔφη.

Τί γάρ; ἔφη, ὅστις δαπανηρὸς ὢν μὴ αὐτάρχης ἐστίν, ἀλλ' ἀεὶ τῶν πλησίον δεῖται καὶ λαμβάνων μὲν μὴ δύναται ἀποδιδόναι, μὴ λαμβάνων δὲ τὸν μὴ διδόντα μισεῖ, οὐ δοκεῖ σοι καὶ οὖτος χαλεπὸς φίλος εἶναι;

Πάνυ γ', ἔφη.

Οὐκοῦν ἀφεκτέον καὶ τούτου;

Άφεκτέον μέντοι, ἔφη.

3 Τί γάρ; ὅστις χρηματίζεσθαι μὲν δύναται, πολλῶν δὲ χρημάτων ἐπιθυμεῖ καὶ διὰ τοῦτο δυσσύμβολός ἐστι καὶ λαμβάνων μὲν ἥδεται, ἀποδιδόναι δὲ μὴ βούλεται;

Έμοὶ μὲν δοκεῖ, ἔφη, οὖτος ἔτι πονηρότερος ἐκείνου εἶναι.

Τί δ'; ὅστις διὰ τὸν ἔρωτα τοῦ χρηματίζεσθαι μηδὲ πρὸς ἐν ἄλλο σχολὴν ποιεῖται ἢ ὁπόθεν αὐτὸς κερδανεῖ:

## MEMORABILIA II. 6.1-6.4

"Tell me, Critobulus," he said, "if we wanted a good friend, how should we start on the search? Should we seek first for one who is no slave to eating and drinking, lust, sleep, idleness? For someone mastered by these cannot do his duty by himself or a friend."

"No, of course not."

"I do, certainly."

"Now what about the spendthrift who is never satisfied, is always appealing to his neighbors for help, does not repay what he receives, and is resentful if he receives nothing? Don't you think he too is a troublesome friend?"

"Certainly."

"Then we must avoid him too?"

"We must indeed."

"Again, what about the able businessman who is eager 3 to make money and consequently drives a hard bargain, who likes to receive but is disinclined to repay?"

"So far as I see, he is even worse than the last."

"And what of the man with such a passion for business 4 that he has no time for anything but the selfish pursuit of gain?"

'Αφεκτέον καὶ τούτου, ὡς ἐμοὶ δοκεῖ· ἀνωφελὴς γὰρ α̈ν εἴη τῷ χρωμένῳ.

Τί δέ; ὅστις στασιώδης τέ ἐστι καὶ θέλων πολλοὺς τοῖς φίλοις ἐχθροὺς παρέχειν;

Φευκτέον νη Δία καὶ τοῦτον.

Εἰ δέ τις τούτων μὲν τῶν κακῶν μηδὲν ἔχοι, εὖ δὲ πάσχων ἀνέχεται, μηδὲν φροντίζων τοῦ ἀντευεργετεῖν;

Άνωφελης ἃν εἴη καὶ οὖτος. ἀλλὰ ποῖον, ὧ Σώκρατες, ἐπιχειρήσομεν φίλον ποιεῖσθαι;

Οἷμαι μέν, ὅστις τἀναντία τούτων ἐγκρατὴς μέν ἐστι τῶν διὰ τοῦ σώματος ἡδονῶν, εὔοικος⁴ δὲ καὶ εὐσύμβολος ὢν τυγχάνει καὶ φιλόνικος πρὸς τὸ μὴ ἐλλείπεσθαι εὖ ποιῶν τοὺς εὐεργετοῦντας αὐτόν, ὥστε λυσιτελεῖν τοῖς χρωμένοις.

6 Πως οὖν ἂν ταῦτα δοκιμάσαιμεν, ὧ Σωκρατες, πρὸ τοῦ χρῆσθαι;

Τοὺς μὲν ἀνδριαντοποιούς, ἔφη, δοκιμάζομεν οὐ τοῖς λόγοις αὐτῶν τεκμαιρόμενοι, ἀλλ' ὃν ἂν ὁρῶμεν τοὺς πρόσθεν ἀνδριάντας καλῶς εἰργασμένον, τούτῷ πιστεύομεν καὶ τοὺς λοιποὺς εὖ ποιήσειν.

Καὶ ἄνδρα δὴ λέγεις, ἔφη, ὃς ἂν τοὺς φίλους τοὺς πρόσθεν εὖ ποιῶν φαίνηται, δῆλον εἶναι καὶ τοὺς ὕστερον εὐεργετήσοντα;

Καὶ γὰρ ἵπποις, ἔφη, ὃν ἃν ὁρῶ τοῖς πρόσθεν καλῶς χρώμενον, τοῦτον κἂν ἄλλοις οἶμαι καλῶς χρῆσθαι.

# MEMORABILIA II. 6.4-6.7

"We must avoid him too, I think. There is no profit in knowing him."

"And what of the quarrelsome person who is willing to provide his friends with plenty of enemies?"

"We must shun him too, of course."

"Suppose that a man is free from all these faults, but stoops to receive kindness with no thought of returning it?"

"There is no profit in him either. But for what qualities will we try to acquire a friend, Socrates?"

"The opposite of these, I suppose. We shall look for one who has control of his bodily pleasures, who is truly hospitable 10 and fair in his dealings and eager to do as much for his benefactors as he receives from them, so that he is worth knowing."

"Then how can we test these qualities, Socrates, before familiarity begins?"

"What test do we apply to a sculptor? We don't judge by what he says but we look at his statues, and if we see that the works he has already produced are beautiful, we feel confident that his future works will be as good."

"You mean that anyone whose good treatment of his old friends is manifest will clearly prove a benefactor to new friends also?"

"Yes, as when I find that someone has habitually treated his horses well I think that he will treat other horses equally well."

 $^{10}$  Or  $\epsilon \tilde{v}\nu o v s$  (loyal), or  $\epsilon \tilde{v}o \rho \kappa o s$  (scrupulous, a man of his word).

<sup>4</sup> εὔνους Α: εὔορκος C alii

Εἶεν, ἔφη· ὃς δ' ἂν ἡμῖν ἄξιος φιλίας δοκῆ εἶναι, πῶς χρὴ φίλον τοῦτον ποιεῖσθαι;

Πρῶτον μέν, ἔφη, τὰ παρὰ τῶν θεῶν ἐπισκεπτέον, εἰ συμβουλεύουσιν αὐτὸν φίλον ποιεῖσθαι.

Τί οὖν; ἔφη, ὃν ἃν ἡμῶν τε δοκῆ καὶ οἱ θεοὶ μὴ ἐναντιῶνται, ἔχεις εἰπεῖν ὅπως οὖτος θηρατέος;

Μὰ Δί', ἔφη, οὐ κατὰ πόδας ὥσπερ ὁ λαγῶς οὐδ' ἀπάτη ὥσπερ αἱ ὄρνιθες οὐδὲ βία ὥσπερ οἱ ἐχθροί. ὅ ἄκοντα γὰρ φίλον ἑλεῖν ἐργῶδες· χαλεπὸν δὲ καὶ δήσαντα κατέχειν ὥσπερ δοῦλον· ἐχθροὶ γὰρ μᾶλλον ἢ φίλοι γίγνονται οἱ τοιαῦτα πάσχοντες.

Φίλοι δὲ πῶς; ἔφη.

Εἶναι μέν τινάς φασιν ἐπφδάς, ἃς οἱ ἐπιστάμενοι ἐπάδοντες οἷς ἃν βούλωνται φίλους αὐτοὺς ποιοῦνται, εἶναι δὲ καὶ φίλτρα, οἷς οἱ ἐπιστάμενοι πρὸς οὺς ἂν βούλωνται χρώμενοι φιλοῦνται ὑπ' αὐτῶν.

Πόθεν οὖν, ἔφη, ταῦτα μάθοιμεν ἄν;

' Αμεν αί Σειρηνες επήδον τῷ 'Οδυσσεῖ, ἤκουσας Όμήρου, ὧν ἐστιν ἀρχὴ τοιάδε τις·

δεῦρ' ἄγε δή, πολύαιν' Ὀδυσεῦ, μέγα κῦδος ἀχαιῶν.

Ταύτην οὖν, ἔφη, τὴν ἐπῳδήν, ὧ Σώκρατες, καὶ τοῖς ἄλλοις ἀνθρώποις αἱ Σειρῆνες ἐπᾳδουσαι κατεῖχον, ὥστε μὴ ἀπιέναι ἀπ' αὐτῶν τοὺς ἐπᾳσθέντας;

Οὐκ ἀλλὰ τοῖς ἐπ' ἀρετῆ φιλοτιμουμένοις οὕτως ἐπῆδον.

8

9

10

11

## MEMORABILIA II. 6.8-6.12

"Granted! And once we have found a man who seems worthy of our friendship, how are we to set about making him our friend?"

"First we should seek guidance from the gods, whether they counsel us to make a friend of him."

"And next? Supposing that we have chosen and the gods approve him, can you say how is he to be hunted?"

"Surely not like a hare by swift pursuit, nor like birds by cunning, nor like enemies<sup>11</sup> by force. It's hard work to capture a friend against his will and difficult to bind him like a slave. Hatred rather than friendship comes of that treatment."

"But how does friendship happen?"

"There are spells, they say, which those who know them can use to bewitch whomever they want and make them friends, and there are drugs that those who know about them can give to whomever they want and win their love."

How then can we acquire this knowledge?"

"You have heard from Homer the spell that the Sirens put on Odysseus. It begins like this:

This way, come this way, renowned Odysseus, great glory of the Achaeans.  $^{'12}$ 

"Then did the Sirens chant this spell for other people too, Socrates, so as to keep the spellbound from leaving them?"

"No, only for those who yearned for the fame that virtue gives."

11 Or with Ernesti's emendation, "boars." 12 Od. 12.184.

143

10

11

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> κάπροι Ernesti

Σχεδόν τι λέγεις τοιαθτα χρήναι έκάστω ἐπάδειν, οἷα μὴ νομιεῖ ἀκούων τὸν ἐπαινοθντα καταγελώντα λέγειν.

Οὕτω μὲν γὰρ ἐχθίων τ' ἂν εἴη καὶ ἀπελαύνοι τοὺς ἀνθρώπους ἀφ' ἑαυτοῦ, εἰ τὸν εἰδότα, ὅτι μικρός τε καὶ αἰσχρὸς καὶ ἀσθενής ἐστιν, ἐπαινοίη λέγων, ὅτι καλός τε καὶ μέγας καὶ ἰσχυρός ἐστιν.

Άλλας δέ τινας οἶσθα ἐπῳδάς;

Οὐκ ἀλλ' ἤκουσα μέν, ὅτι Περικλῆς πολλὰς ἐπίσταιτο, ἃς ἐπάδων τῆ πόλει ἐποίει αὐτὴν φιλεῖν αύτόν.

Θεμιστοκλής δὲ πῶς ἐποίησε τὴν πόλιν φιλείν αὐτόν;

Μὰ Δί οὐκ ἐπάδων, ἀλλὰ περιάψας τι ἀγαθὸν αὐτῆ.

14 Δοκείς μοι λέγειν, ὧ Σώκρατες, ὡς εἰ μέλλομεν ἀγαθόν τινα κτήσεσθαι φίλον, αὐτοὺς ἡμᾶς ἀγαθοὺς δεῖ γενέσθαι λέγειν τε καὶ πράττειν.

Σὺ δ' ὤου, ἔφη ὁ Σωκράτης, οἶόν τ' εἶναι καὶ πονηρὸν ὄντα χρηστοὺς φίλους κτήσασθαι;

Έωρων γάρ, ἔφη ὁ Κριτόβουλος, ῥήτοράς τε φαύλους ἀγαθοῖς δημηγόροις φίλους ὄντας καὶ στρατηγεῖν οὐχ ἱκανοὺς πάνυ στρατηγικοῖς ἀνδράσιν ἐταίρους.

¾ρ' οὖν, ἔφη, καί, περὶ οὖ διαλεγόμεθα, οἶσθά τινας, οἳ ἀνωφελεῖς ὅντες ὡφελίμους δύνανται φίλους ποιεῖσθαι;

Μὰ Δί' οὐ δητ', ἔφη· ἀλλ' εἰ ἀδύνατόν ἐστι πονηρὸν

13

15

### MEMORABILIA II. 6.12-6.16

"You mean, I take it, that the spell must be fitted to the listener, so that he won't take the praise for mockery."

"Yes; for to praise for beauty, stature and strength one who is aware that he is short, ugly and puny, is the way to repel him and make him dislike you more."

"Do you know any other spells?"

"No, but I have heard that Pericles knew many and cast them on the city, and so made her love him."

"And how did Themistocles make the city love him?"

"Not by spells: no, no; but by hanging some good amulet about her."  $^{13}$ 

"I think you mean, Socrates, that if we are to win a good man's friendship, we ourselves must be good in word and deed alike?"

"Did you imagine that a bad man could win the friendship of honest men?"

"I did," answered Critobulus, "for I saw that poor orators have good speakers among their friends, and some who are incapable of commanding an army are intimate with great generals."

"Coming then to the point under discussion, do you know cases of useless persons making useful friends?"

"Assuredly not; but if it is impossible that the bad

<sup>13</sup> I.e., not by his words, but by protecting Athens with ships and fortifications.

13

14

15

όντα καλούς κάγαθούς φίλους κτήσασθαι, έκείνο ήδη μέλει μοι, εἰ ἔστιν αὐτὸν κάλὸν κάγαθὸν γενόμενον ἐξ έτοίμου τοῖς καλοῖς κάγαθοῖς φίλον εἶναι.

°Ο ταράττει σε, ὧ Κριτόβουλε, ὅτι πολλάκις ἄν-17 δρας καὶ τὰ καλὰ πράττοντας καὶ τῶν αἰσχρῶν ἀπεχομένους όρας αντί του φίλους είναι στασιάζοντας άλλήλοις καὶ χαλεπώτερον χρωμένους τῶν μηδενὸς άξίων ἀνθρώπων.

Καὶ οὐ μόνον γ', ἔφη ὁ Κριτόβουλος, οἱ ἰδιῶται τοῦτο ποιοῦσιν, ἀλλὰ καὶ πόλεις αἱ τῶν τε καλῶν μάλιστα ἐπιμελόμεναι καὶ τὰ αἰσχρὰ ἥκιστα προσιέμεναι πολλάκις πολεμικώς έχουσι πρὸς ἀλλήλας. ἃ λογιζόμενος πάνυ ἀθύμως ἔχω πρὸς τὴν τῶν Φίλων κτήσιν οὔτε γὰρ τοὺς πονηροὺς ἀλλήλοις δυναμένους είναι πως γαρ αν η αχάριστοι η αμελείς η πλεονέκται ἢ ἄπιστοι ἢ ἀκρατεῖς ἄνθρωποι δύναιντο φίλοι γενέσθαι; οί μεν οὖν πονηροὶ πάντως ἔμοιγε δοκοῦσιν άλλήλοις έχθροὶ μᾶλλον ἢ φίλοι πεφυκέναι. άλλὰ 20 μήν, ώσπερ σὺ λέγεις, οὐδ ἂν τοῖς χρηστοῖς οἱ πονηροί ποτε συναρμόσειαν είς φιλίαν. πώς γάρ οί τὰ πονηρά ποιούντες τοίς τὰ τοιαύτα μισούσι φίλοι γένοιντ' άν: εἰ δὲ δὴ καὶ οἱ ἀρετὴν ἀσκοῦντες στασιάζουσι τε περί τοῦ πρωτεύειν ἐν ταῖς πόλεσι καὶ φθονοῦντες έαυτοῖς μισοῦσιν ἀλλήλους, τίνες ἔτι φίλοι ἔσονται καὶ ἐν τίσιν ἀνθρώποις εὔνοια καὶ πίστις ἔσται:

Άλλ' ἔχει μέν, ἔφη ὁ Σωκράτης, ποικίλως πως 21 ταῦτα, ὦ Κριτόβουλε. φύσει γὰρ ἔχουσιν οἱ ἄνθρω-

18

## MEMORABILIA II. 6.16-6.21

should gain the friendship of gentlemen, then I am anxious to know whether it is quite easy for a gentleman as a matter of course to be the friend of gentlemen?"

"Your trouble, Critobulus, is that you often find men who do good and shun evil not on friendly terms but apt to quarrel and treat one another more harshly than worthless people."

"Yes." said Critobulus, "and such conduct is not confined to individuals, but even the states that care most for the right and have least liking for the wrong are often at enmity. These thoughts discourage me about the acquisition of friends. For I see on the one hand that good-fornothings cannot be friends with one another—for how could the ungrateful, the careless, the selfish, the faithless, the incontinent, form friendships? I feel sure, then, that good-for-nothings are by their nature enemies rather than friends. But then, as you point out, neither can good-fornothings ever join in friendship with honest men, for how can wrongdoers become friendly with those who hate their conduct? And if we must add that the practitioners of virtue strive with one another for leadership in states, and envy and hate one another, who then will be friends and where will loyalty and faithfulness be found?"

"Wait, Critobulus, there is a subtle complication in all this. Some elements in human nature make for friendship:

17

18

19

ποι τὰ μὲν φιλικά: δέονταί τε γὰρ ἀλλήλων καὶ ἐλεοῦσι καὶ συνεργοῦντες ὡφελοῦσι καὶ τοῦτο συνιέντες χάριν ἔχουσιν ἀλλήλοις τὰ δὲ πολεμικά τά τε γὰρ αὐτὰ καλὰ καὶ ἡδέα νομίζοντες ὑπὲρ τούτων μάχονται καὶ διχογνωμονοῦντες ἐναντιοῦνται. πολεμικὸν δὲ καὶ έρις καὶ ὀργή· καὶ δυσμενὲς μὲν ὁ τοῦ πλεονεκτεῖν έρως, μισητὸν δὲ ὁ φθόνος. ἀλλ' ὅμως διὰ τούτων πάντων ή φιλία διαδυομένη συνάπτει τοὺς καλούς τε κάγαθούς. διὰ γὰρ τὴν ἀρετὴν αίροῦνται μὲν ἄνευ πόνου τὰ μέτρια κεκτήσθαι μᾶλλον ἢ διὰ πολέμου πάντων κυριεύειν καὶ δύνανται πεινώντες καὶ διψώντες ἀλύπως σίτου καὶ ποτοῦ κοινωνείν καὶ τοῖς τῶν ώραίων άφροδισίοις ήδόμενοι καρτερείν, ώστε μή λυπείν οθς μη προσήκει δύνανται δε καὶ χρημάτων οὐ μόνον τοῦ πλεονεκτεῖν ἀπεχόμενοι νομίμως κοινωνεῖν, άλλὰ καὶ ἐπαρκεῖν ἀλλήλοις. δύνανται δὲ καὶ τὴν ἔριν οὐ μόνον ἀλύπως, ἀλλὰ καὶ συμφερόντως ἀλλήλοις διατίθεσθαι καὶ τὴν ὀργὴν κωλύειν εἰς τὸ μεταμελησόμενον προϊέναι, τὸν δὲ φθόνον παντάπασιν ἀφαιροῦσι τὰ μὲν έαυτῶν ἀγαθὰ τοῖς φίλοις οἰκεῖα παρέχοντες, τὰ δὲ τῶν φίλων ξαυτῶν νομίζοντες. πῶς οὖν ούκ είκὸς τοὺς καλοὺς κάγαθοὺς καὶ τῶν πολιτικῶν τιμών μη μόνον άβλαβεῖς, άλλὰ καὶ ώφελίμους άλλήλοις κοινωνούς εἶναι; οἱ μὲν γὰρ ἐπιθυμοῦντες ἐν ταῖς πόλεσι τιμᾶσθαί τε καὶ ἄρχειν, ἵνα έξουσίαν έχωσι χρήματά τε κλέπτειν καὶ ἀνθρώπους βιάζεσθαι καὶ ήδυπαθεῖν, ἄδικοί τε καὶ πονηροὶ ἂν εἶεν καὶ ἀδύνατοι ἄλλω συναρμόσαι, εἰ δέ τις ἐν πόλει τιμᾶσθαι

22

23

24

### MEMORABILIA II. 6.21-6.25

people need one another, feel pity, work together for their common good, and, conscious of this, are grateful to one another. But other elements are hostile: holding the same things to be honorable and desirable, people fight for them, fall out, and take sides. Strife and anger lead to hostility, covetousness to enmity, jealousy to hatred. Nevertheless through all these barriers friendship slips, and unites the best people: thanks to their excellence they prize the untroubled security of moderate possessions above sovereignty won by war; despite hunger and thirst, they can share their food and drink without a pang; and although they delight in the charms of beauty they can resist the lure and avoid offending those whom they should respect; they can not only share wealth lawfully and keep from covetousness, but also supply one another's wants; they can settle strife not only without pain, but with advantage to one another, and prevent anger from pursuing its way toward remorse: but jealousy they take away entirely, regarding their own good things as belonging to their friends, and thinking their friend's good things to be their own. Surely, then, it is likely that the best people will share public honors too not only without harm to one another, but to their common benefit? For those who desire to win honor and to rule in their states that they may have power to embezzle, to treat others with violence, to live in luxury, are bound to be unjust, unscrupulous, incapable of unity. But if a man seeks to be honored in a state

149

22

23

24

Βουλόμενος, ὅπως αὐτός τε μὴ άδικῆται καὶ τοῖς φίλοις τὰ δίκαια βοηθεῖν δύνηται, καὶ ἄρξας ἀγαθόν τι ποιείν τὴν πατρίδα πειράται, διὰ τί ὁ τοιοῦτος άλλω τοιούτω οὐκ ἂν δύναιτο συναρμόσαι: πότερον τοὺς φίλους ώφελεῖν μετὰ τῶν καλῶν κάγαθῶν ἦττον δυνήσεται ἢ τὴν πόλιν εὐεργετεῖν ἀδυνατώτερος ἔσται καλούς κάγαθούς έχων συνεργούς; άλλα και έν τοις γυμνικοίς άγωσι δηλόν έστιν, ὅτι εἰ έξην τοίς κρατίστοις συνθεμένους έπὶ τοὺς χείρους ἰέναι, πάντας ἂν τοὺς ἀνῶνας οὖτοι ἐνίκων καὶ πάντα τὰ ἇθλα οὖτοι έλαμβανον, έπεὶ οὖν ἐκεῖ μὲν οὐκ ἐῶσι τοῦτο ποιεῖν. έν δὲ τοῖς πολιτικοῖς, έν οἷς οἱ καλοὶ κάγαθοὶ κρατιστεύουσιν, οὐδεὶς κωλύει μεθ' οὖ ἄν τις βούληται τὴν πόλιν εὐεργετείν, πῶς οὐ λυσιτελεί τοὺς βελτίστους φίλους κτησάμενον πολιτεύεσθαι, τούτοις κοινωνοίς καὶ συνεργοῖς τῶν πράξεων μᾶλλον ἢ ἀνταγωνισταῖς χρώμενον: ἀλλὰ μὴν κάκεῖνο δήλον, ὅτι κἂν πολεμή τίς τινι, συμμάχων δεήσεται καὶ τούτων πλειόνων, έὰν καλοῖς κάγαθοῖς ἀντιτάττηται. καὶ μὴν οἱ συμμαχείν εθέλοντες εὖ ποιητέοι, ἵνα θέλωσι προθυμεῖσθαι. πολύ δὲ κρεῖττον τοὺς βελτίστους ἐλάττονας εὖ ποιεῖν ἢ τοὺς χείρονας πλείονας ὄντας οἱ γὰρ πονηροὶ πολὺ πλειόνων εὐεργεσιῶν ἢ οἱ χρηστοὶ δέονται. ἀλλὰ θαρρών, ἔφη, ὧ Κριτόβουλε, πειρώ ἀγαθὸς γίγνεσθαι καὶ τοιοῦτος γενόμενος θηρᾶν ἐπιχείρει τοὺς καλούς τε κάγαθούς. ἴσως δ' ἄν τί σοι κάγὼ συλλαβεῖν εἰς τὴν τῶν καλῶν τε κάγαθῶν θήραν ἔχοιμι διὰ τὸ ἐρωτικὸς εἶναι. δεινῶς γὰρ ὧν ἂν ἐπιθυμήσω ἀνθρώπων

26

27

#### MEMORABILIA II. 6.25-6.28

that he may not be the victim of injustice himself and may help his friends in a just cause, and when he takes office may try to do some good to his country, why should he be unable to join with one like himself? Will his connection with other gentlemen render him less capable of serving his friends? Will be be less able to benefit his state with the help of other gentlemen? Even in the public games it is clear that, if the strongest competitors were allowed to join forces against the weaker, they would win all the events, they would carry off all the prizes. True, that is not permitted in the games; but in politics, where the gentlemen are the strongest, nobody prevents anyone from forming any combination he may choose for the benefit of the state; surely, then, in public life it is a gain to make friends with the best, and to see in them partners and fellow workers in a common cause, and not rivals. But, again, it is equally clear that anyone who goes to war will need allies, and more of them if he is to fight an army of gentlemen. Moreover, those who are willing to fight at your side must be well treated, so that they will be willing to exert themselves; and it is a far sounder plan to treat the best well, who are fewer in number, than the worst, who are the more numerous; for the bad want many more favors than the good. Take heart, Critobulus; try to be good, and when you have achieved that, set about catching your gentlemen. Perhaps I myself, as an expert in love, can lend you a hand in the pursuit of gentlemen. For when I want

26

27

ὅλος ὥρμημαι ἐπὶ τὸ φιλῶν τε αὐτοὺς ἀντιφιλεῖσθαι ὑπ' αὐτῶν καὶ ποθῶν ἀντιποθεῖσθαι καὶ ἐπιθυμῶν συνεῖναι καὶ ἀντεπιθυμεῖσθαι τῆς συνουσίας. ὁρῶ δὲ καὶ σοὶ τούτων δεῆσον, ὅταν ἐπιθυμήσης φιλίαν πρός τινας ποιεῖσθαι. μὴ οὖν ἀποκρύπτου με οἶς ἂν βούλοιο φίλος γενέσθαι· διὰ γὰρ τὸ ἐπιμελεῖσθαι τοῦ ἀρέσαι τῷ ἀρέσκοντί μοι οὐκ ἀπείρως οἶμαι ἔχειν πρὸς θήραν ἀνθρώπων.

Καὶ ὁ Κριτόβουλος ἔφη· Καὶ μήν, ὧ Σώκρατες, τούτων ἐγὼ τῶν μαθημάτων πάλαι ἐπιθυμῶ ἄλλως τε καὶ εἰ ἐξαρκέσει μοι ἡ αὐτὴ ἐπιστήμη ἐπὶ τοὺς ἀγαθοὺς τὰς ψυχὰς καὶ ἐπὶ τοὺς καλοὺς τὰ σώματα.

Καὶ ὁ Σωκράτης ἔφη· ᾿Αλλ᾽, ὧ Κριτόβουλε, οὐκ ἔνεστιν ἐν τῆ ἐμῆ ἐπιστήμη τὸ τὰς χεῖρας προσφέροντα ποιεῖν ὑπομένειν τοὺς καλούς. πέπεισμαι δὲ καὶ ἀπὸ τῆς Σκύλλης διὰ τοῦτο φεύγειν τοὺς ἀνθρώπους, ὅτι τὰς χεῖρας αὐτοῖς προσέφερε· τὰς δέ γε Σειρῆνας, ὅτι τὰς χεῖρας οὐδενὶ προσέφερον, ἀλλὰ πᾶσι πόρρωθεν ἐπῆδον, πάντας φασὶν ὑπομένειν καὶ ἀκούοντας αὐτῶν κηλεῖσθαι.

Καὶ ὁ Κριτόβουλος ἔφη· ʿΩς οὐ προσοίσοντος τὰς χεῖρας, εἴ τι ἔχεις ἀγαθὸν εἰς φίλων κτῆσιν, δίδασκε.

Οὐδὲ τὸ στόμα οὖν, ἔφη ὁ Σωκράτης, πρὸς τὸ στόμα προσοίσεις;

Θάρρει, ἔφη ὁ Κριτόβουλος· οὐδὲ γὰρ τὸ στόμα προσοίσω οὐδενί, ἐὰν μὴ καλὸς ἢ.

Εὐθύς, ἔφη, σύγε, ὧ Κριτόβουλε, τοὖναντίον τοῦ συμφέροντος εἴρηκας. οἱ μὲν γὰρ καλοὶ τὰ τοιαῦτα

29

30

31

#### MEMORABILIA II. 6.28-6.32

to catch anyone it's surprising how I strain every nerve to have my love returned, my longing reciprocated by him, in my eagerness that he will want me as much as I want him. I see that you too will feel this need when you want to form a friendship. So do not hide from me the names of those whom you wish to make your friends; for I am careful to please him who pleases me, and so, I think, I am not without experience in the pursuit of men."

"Well, Socrates," said Critobulus in reply, "these are the lessons I have long wished to learn, especially if the same skill will serve to win those with good souls as well as those with good bodies."

"No, no, Critobulus," said Socrates, "it's not part of my skill to lay hands on the handsome ones and force them to submit. I am convinced that the reason why men fled from Scylla was that she laid hands on them; but the Sirens laid hands on no man; from far away they sang to all, and therefore, we are told, all submitted, and hearing were enchanted." <sup>14</sup>

"I'm not going to put a hand on anyone," said Critobulus, "so teach me any good plan you know for making friends."

"Then won't you put lip to lip either?"

"Don't worry!" answered Critobulus, "I won't touch a lip with mine either—unless the owner is handsome!"

"That's an unfortunate beginning for you, Critobulus! The handsome<sup>15</sup> won't submit to such conduct; but the

29

30

31

<sup>14</sup> Hom. Od. 12.39 f., adapted.

<sup>15</sup> I.e., handsome in character (soul).

οὐχ ὑπομένουσιν, οἱ δὲ αἰσχροὶ καὶ ἡδέως προσίενται, νομίζοντες διὰ τὴν ψυχὴν καλοὶ καλεῖσθαι.

Καὶ ὁ Κριτόβουλος ἔφη: Ως τοὺς μὲν καλοὺς φιλήσοντός μου, τοὺς δ' ἀγαθοὺς καταφιλήσοντος, θαρρῶν δίδασκε τῶν φίλων τὰ θηρατικά.

Καὶ ὁ Σωκράτης ἔφη· Ὅταν οὖν, ὧ Κριτόβουλε, φίλος τινὶ βούλη γενέσθαι, ἐάσεις με κατειπεῖν σου πρὸς αὐτόν, ὅτι ἄγασαί τε αὐτοῦ καὶ ἐπιθυμεῖς φίλος αὐτοῦ εἶναι;

Κατηγόρει, ἔφη ὁ Κριτόβουλος οὐδένα γὰρ οἶδα μισοῦντα τοὺς ἐπαινοῦντας.

Έὰν δέ σου προσκατηγορήσω, ἔφη, ὅτι διὰ τὸ ἄγασθαι αὐτοῦ καὶ εὐνοϊκῶς ἔχεις πρὸς αὐτόν, ἆρα μὴ διαβάλλεσθαι δόξεις ὑπ' ἐμοῦ;

'Αλλὰ καὶ αὐτῷ μοι, ἔφη, ἐγγίγνεται εὔνοια πρὸς οὺς ἂν ὑπολάβω εὐνοϊκῶς ἔχειν πρὸς ἐμέ.

Ταῦτα μὲν δή, ἔφη ὁ Σωκράτης, ἐξέσται μοι λέγειν περὶ σοῦ πρὸς οῦς ἂν βούλῃ φίλους ποιήσασθαι ἐὰν δέ μοι ἔτι ἐξουσίαν δῷς λέγειν περὶ σοῦ, ὅτι ἐπιμελής τε τῶν φίλων εἶ καὶ οὐδενὶ οὕτω χαίρεις ὡς φίλοις ἀγαθοῖς καὶ ἐπί τε τοῖς καλοῖς ἔργοις τῶν φίλων ἀγάλλῃ οὐχ ἦττον ἢ ἐπὶ τοῖς σαυτοῦ καὶ ἐπὶ τοῖς ἀγαθοῖς τῶν φίλων χαίρεις οὐδὲν ἦττον ἢ ἐπὶ τοῖς σαυτοῦ, ὅπως τε ταῦτα γίγνηται τοῖς φίλοις οὐκ ἀποκάμνεις μηχανώμενος, καὶ ὅτι ἔγνωκας ἀνδρὸς ἀρετὴν εἶναι νικᾶν τοὺς μὲν φίλους εὖ ποιοῦντα, τοὺς δ' ἐχθροὺς κακῶς, πάνυ ἂν οἶμαί σοι ἐπιτήδειον εἶναί με σύνθηρον τῶν ἀγαθῶν φίλων.

33

34

### MEMORABILIA II. 6.32-6.35

ugly like it, supposing that they are called handsome for the beauty of their souls."

"A kiss for the handsome," exclaimed Critobulus, "and a thousand kisses for the good! That will be my motto, so take courage, and teach me the art of catching friends."

"Well then, Critobulus," said Socrates, "when you want to make a new friend, will you let me warn him that you admire him and want his friendship?"

"Warn him by all means: no one hates those who offer praise, so far as I know."

"Suppose I go on to warn him that your admiration makes you well disposed toward him, you won't think I'm slandering you, will you?"

"No; when I guess that someone feels well disposed toward me, similar goodwill toward him arises in me."

"Then you will permit me to say this about you to those whose friendship you desire. Now if you will give me permission to tell them besides that you are devoted to your friends and nothing gives you so much pleasure as good friends; that you take as much pride in your friends' fine achievements as in your own, and as much pleasure in your friends' good as in your own, and never weary of contriving it for your friends'; and you have made up your mind that a man's excellence consists in outdoing his friends in kindness and his enemies in mischief; then I think you will find me a useful companion in the quest for good friends."

155

33

34

36

37

38

Τί οὖν, ἔφη ὁ Κριτόβουλος, ἐμοὶ τοῦτο λέγεις, ὅσπερ οὐκ ἐπὶ σοὶ ὂν ὅ τι ἂν βούλῃ περὶ ἐμοῦ λέγειν;

Μὰ Δί οὕχ, ὥς ποτε ἐγὼ Ασπασίας ἤκουσα ἔφη γὰρ τὰς ἀγαθὰς προμνηστρίδας μετὰ μὲν ἀληθείας τἀγαθὰ διαγγελλούσας δεινὰς εἶναι συνάγειν ἀνθρώπους εἰς κηδείαν, ψευδομένας δ' οὐκ ἐθέλειν ἐπαινεῖν τοὺς γὰρ ἐξαπατηθέντας ἄμα μισεῖν ἀλλήλους τε καὶ τὴν προμνησαμένην. ἃ δὴ καὶ ἐγὼ πεισθεὶς ὀρθῶς ἔχειν ἡγοῦμαι οὐκ ἐξεῖναί μοι περὶ σοῦ λέγειν ἐπαινοῦντι οὐδὲν ὅ τι ἂν μὴ ἀληθεύω.

Σὺ μὲν ἄρα, ἔφη ὁ Κριτόβουλος, τοιοῦτός μοι φίλος εἶ, ὧ Σώκρατες, οἶος, ἂν μέν τι αὐτὸς ἔχω ἐπιτήδειον εἰς τὸ φίλους κτήσασθαι, συλλαμβάνειν μοι· εἰ δὲ μή, οὐκ ἂν ἐθέλοις πλάσας τι εἰπεῖν ἐπὶ τῆ ἐμῆ ώφελεία.

Πότερα δ' ἄν, ἔφη ὁ Σωκράτης, ὧ Κριτόβουλε, δοκῶ σοι μᾶλλον ἀφελεῖν σε τὰ ψευδῆ ἐπαινῶν ἢ πείθων πειρασθαί σε ἀγαθὸν ἄνδρα γενέσθαι; εἰ δὲ μὴ φανερὸν οὕτω σοι, ἐκ τῶνδε σκέψαι· εἰ γάρ σε βουλόμενος φίλον ποιῆσαι ναυκλήρω ψευδόμενος ἐπαινοίην, φάσκων ἀγαθὸν εἶναι κυβερνήτην, ὁ δέ μοι πεισθεὶς ἐπιτρέψειέ σοι τὴν ναῦν μὴ ἐπισταμένω κυβερναν, ἔχεις τινὰ ἐλπίδα μὴ ἂν σαυτόν τε καὶ τὴν ναῦν ἀπολέσαι; ἢ εἴ σοι πείσαιμι κοινῆ τὴν πόλιν ψευδόμενος ὡς ἂν στρατηγικῷ τε καὶ δικαστικῷ καὶ πολιτικῷ ἑαυτὴν ἐπιτρέψαι, τί ἂν οἴει σεαυτὸν καὶ τὴν πόλιν ὑπὸ σοῦ παθεῖν; ἢ εἴ τινας ἰδία τῶν πολιτῶν πείσαιμι ψευδόμενος ὡς ὄντι οἰκονομικῷ τε καὶ ἐπιμε-

"Now why do you say this to me? as if you were not free to say what you like about me."

"But that's not so, as I once heard from Aspasia. <sup>16</sup> She explained that good matchmakers are successful in making marriages only when the good reports that they circulate are true; false reports she would not recommend, for the victims of deception hate one another and the matchmaker too. I am convinced that this is sound, and so I think it is not open to me to say anything in your praise that I can't say truthfully."

"It appears, Socrates, that you are the sort of friend to help me if I am in any way qualified to make friends, but if not, you won't make up a story to help me."

"How do you think I will help you best, Critobulus, by false praise or by urging you to try to be a good man? If you don't yet see clearly, take the following cases as illustrations. Suppose that I wanted to get a shipmaster to make you his friend, and as a recommendation told him that you are a good skipper, which is untrue; and suppose that he believed me and put you in charge of his ship in spite of your not knowing how to steer it: have you any reason to expect that you would not lose the ship and your life as well? Or suppose that I falsely represented to the Assembly that you are a born general, jurist and statesman in one, and so persuaded the state to commit its fortunes to you, what do you suppose would happen to the state and to yourself under your guidance? Or again, suppose that I falsely described you to certain citizens in private as a

<sup>16</sup> Frequently mentioned or featured in Socratic works as an expert not only on politics and rhetoric but also on marriage and homemaking; cf. *Oec.* 3.14.

36

37

λεῖ τὰ ἐαυτῶν ἐπιτρέψαι, ἆρ' οὐκ ἂν πεῖραν διδοὺς ἄμα τε βλαβερὸς εἴης καὶ καταγέλαστος φαίνοιο; 39 ἀλλὰ συντομωτάτη τε καὶ ἀσφαλεστάτη καὶ καλλίστη ὁδός, ὧ Κριτόβουλε, ὅ τι ἂν βούλη δοκεῖν ἀγαθὸς εἶναι, τοῦτο καὶ γενέσθαι ἀγαθὸν πειρᾶσθαι. ὅσαι δ' ἐν ἀνθρώποις ἀρεταὶ λέγονται, σκοπούμενος εὐρήσεις πάσας μαθήσει τε καὶ μελέτη αὐξανομένας. ἐγὼ μὲν οὖν, ὧ Κριτόβουλε, οὕτως οἶμαι δεῖν ἡμᾶς <ποιεῖν.> εἰ δὲ σύ πως ἄλλως γιγνώσκεις, δίδασκε.

Καὶ ὁ Κριτόβουλος, ἀλλὶ αἰσχυνοίμην ἄν, ἔφη, ὧ Σώκρατες, ἀντιλέγων τούτοις οὔτε γὰρ καλὰ οὔτε ἀληθῆ λέγοιμ ἄν.

7. Καὶ μὴν τὰς ἀπορίας γε τῶν φίλων τὰς μὲν δι' ἄγνοιαν ἐπειρᾶτο γνώμη ἀκεῖσθαι, τὰς δὲ δι' ἔνδειαν διδάσκων κατὰ δύναμιν ἀλλήλοις ἐπαρκεῖν. ἐρῶ δὲ καὶ ἐν τούτοις ἃ σύνοιδα αὐτῷ.

'Αρίσταρχον γάρ ποτε όρων σκυθρωπως έχοντα, Έοικας, έφη, ω 'Αρίσταρχε, βαρέως φέρειν τι. χρη δε του βάρους τοις φίλοις μεταδιδόναι 'ἴσως γαρ ἄν τί σε καὶ ἡμεις κουφίσαιμεν.

Καὶ ὁ ἀρίσταρχος, ἀλλὰ μήν, ἔφη, ὧ Σώκρατες, ἐν πολλῆ γέ εἰμι ἀπορίᾳ. ἐπεὶ γὰρ ἐστασίασεν ἡ πόλις, πολλῶν φυγόντων εἰς τὸν Πειραιᾶ, συνεληλύθασιν ὡς ἐμὲ καταλελειμμέναι ἀδελφαί τε καὶ ἀδελφιδαῖ καὶ ἀνεψιαὶ τοσαῦται, ὥστ' εἶναι ἐν τῆ οἰκίᾳ τέτταρας καὶ δέκα τοὺς ἐλευθέρους. λαμβάνομεν δὲ οὔτε ἐκ τῆς γῆς οὐδέν οἱ γὰρ ἐναντίοι κρατοῦσιν αὐτῆς· οὕτ' ἀπὸ τῶν οἰκιῶν ὀλιγανθρωπία γὰρ ἐν τῷ

thrifty, careful person, and persuaded them to place their affairs in your hands, wouldn't you do them harm and look ridiculous when you came to the test? No, Critobulus, if you want to be thought good at anything you must try to be so; that is the quickest, the surest, the best way.<sup>17</sup> You will find on reflection that every kind of excellence that people recognize is enhanced by study and practice. Such is the view I take of our duty, Critobulus. If you have anything to say against it, tell me."

"Why, Socrates," said Critobulus, "I would be ashamed to contradict you, for I should be saying what is neither honorable nor true."

7. To pass to another subject: the difficulties of his friends that arose from ignorance he tried to cure by advice, those due to want by telling them how to help one another according to their power. On this subject too I will state what I know about him.

One day, noticing that Aristarchus looked glum, he said: "Aristarchus, you seem to have a burden on your mind. You should let your friends share it; possibly we can do something to relieve you."

"Ah yes, Socrates," replied Aristarchus, "I am in great difficulty. Since the civil unrest there has been an exodus to the Piraeus, and a crowd of my womenfolk, being left behind, have come to me—sisters, nieces and cousins—so that we are fourteen in the house without counting the slaves. We get nothing from our land because our enemies have seized it, and nothing from our house property

<sup>17</sup> Cyr. 1.6.22.

ἄστει γέγονε. τὰ ἔπιπλα δὲ οὐδεὶς ἀνεῖται οὐδὲ δανείσασθαι οὐδαμόθεν ἔστιν ἀργύριον, ἀλλὰ πρότερον ἄν τίς μοι δοκεῖ ἐν τἢ ὁδῷ ζητῶν εὐρεῖν ἢ δανειζόμενος λαβεῖν. χαλεπὸν μὲν οὖν ἐστιν, ὧ Σώκρατες, τοὺς οἰκείους περιορᾶν ἀπολλυμένους, ἀδύνατον δὲ τοσούτους τρέφειν ἐν τοιούτοις πράγμασιν.

ἀκούσας οὖν ταῦτα ὁ Σωκράτης, Τί ποτέ ἐστιν, ἔφη, ὅτι Κεράμων μὲν πολλοὺς τρέφων οὐ μόνον ἑαυτῷ τε καὶ τούτοις τἀπιτήδεια δύναται παρέχειν, ἀλλὰ καὶ περιποιεῖται τοσαῦτα, ὥστε καὶ πλουτεῖν, σὺ δὲ πολλοὺς τρέφων δέδοικας, μὴ δι' ἔνδειαν τῶν ἐπιτηδείων ἄπαντες ἀπόλησθε;

"Οτι νη Δί', έφη, ὁ μὲν δούλους τρέφει, ἐγὼ δ' ἐλευθέρους.

Καὶ πότερον, ἔφη, τοὺς παρὰ σοὶ ἐλευθέρους οἴει βελτίους εἶναι ἢ τοὺς παρὰ Κεράμωνι δούλους;

Έγὼ μὲν οἶμαι, ἔφη, τοὺς παρ' ἐμοὶ ἐλευθέρους.

Οὐκοῦν, ἔφη, αἰσχρὸν τὸν μὲν ἀπὸ τῶν πονηροτέρων εὐπορεῖν, σὲ δὲ πολλῷ βελτίους ἔχοντα ἐν ἀπορία εἶναι;

Nη Δί', ἔφη· ὁ μὲν γὰρ τεχνίτας τρέφει, ἐγὼ δ' ἐλευθερίως πεπαιδευμένους.

'Αρ' οὖν, ἔφη, τεχνῖταί εἰσιν οἱ χρήσιμόν τι ποιεῖν ἐπιστάμενοι;

Μάλιστά γ', ἔφη.

Οὐκοῦν χρήσιμά γ' ἄλφιτα;

Σφόδρα γε.

Τί δ' ἄρτοι;

5

### MEMORABILIA II. 7.2-7.5

now that there are so few residents in the city. Portable property finds no buyers, and it's quite impossible to borrow money anywhere: I really think a search in the street would turn out better than an application for a loan. It's hard, Socrates, to let one's people die but impossible to support so many in times like these."

When Socrates heard this, he asked: "How come Ceramon, with so many mouths to feed, not only contrives to provide for the needs of himself and his family but actually saves enough to get rich, whereas you, with so many mouths to feed. fear you will all be starved to death?"

"The explanation, of course, is this: my dependants are free, his are slaves."

"And which do you think are the better, his slaves or your free folk?"

"My free folk, I think."

"Then isn't disgraceful that he does well by his lower types while you with your better types are in difficulty?"

"Of course his dependants are skilled workers while mine have had a liberal education."

"What is a skilled worker? one who knows how to produce something useful?"

"Certainly."

"Are groats useful?"

"Yes, very."

"And bread?"

Οὐδὲν ἡττον.

6

Τί γάρ; ἔφη, ἱμάτιά τε ἀνδρεῖα καὶ γυναικεῖα καὶ χιτωνίσκοι καὶ χλαμύδες καὶ έξωμίδες;

Σφόδρα γ', ἔφη, καὶ πάντα ταῦτα χρήσιμα.

Έπειτα, ἔφη, οἱ παρὰ σοὶ τούτων οὐδὲν ἐπίστανται ποιεῖν;

Πάντα μὲν οὖν, ὡς ἐγῷμαι.

Εἶτ' οὐκ οἶσθ', ὅτι ἀφ' ἑνὸς μὲν τούτων, ἀλφιτοποιίας, Ναυσικύδης οὐ μόνον ἑαυτόν τε καὶ τοὺς οἰκέτας τρέφει, ἀλλὰ πρὸς τούτοις καὶ ὖς πολλὰς καὶ βοῦς, καὶ περιποιεῖται τοσαῦτα, ὥστε καὶ τῆ πόλει πολλάκις λειτουργεῖν, ἀπὸ δὲ ἀρτοποιίας Κύρηβος τήν τε οἰκίαν πᾶσαν διατρέφει καὶ ζῆ δαψιλῶς, Δημέας δ' ὁ Κολλυτεὺς ἀπὸ χλαμυδουργίας, Μένων δ' ἀπὸ χλανιδοποιίας, Μεγαρέων δ' οἱ πλεῖστοι ἀπὸ ἐξωμιδοποιίας διατρέφονται;

Νη Δί', ἔφη· οὖτοι μὲν γὰρ ἀνούμενοι βαρβάρους ἀνθρώπους ἔχουσιν, ὥστ' ἀναγκάζειν ἐργάζεσθαι ἃ καλῶς ἔχει· ἐγὼ δ' ἐλευθέρους τε καὶ συγγενεῖς.

"Επειτ', ἔφη, ὅτι ἐλεύθεροί τ' εἰσὶ καὶ συγγενεῖς σοι, οἴει χρῆναι αὐτοὺς μηδὲν ἄλλο ποιεῖν ἢ ἐσθίειν καὶ καθεύδειν; πότερον καὶ τῶν ἄλλων ἐλευθέρων τοὺς οὕτω ζῶντας ἄμεινον διάγοντας ὁρῷς καὶ μᾶλλον εὐδαιμονίζεις ἢ τοὺς ἃ ἐπίστανται χρήσιμα πρὸς τὸν βίον τούτων ἐπιμελομένους; ἢ τὴν μὲν ἀργίαν καὶ τὴν ἀμέλειαν αἰσθάνη τοῖς ἀνθρώποις πρός τε τὸ μαθεῖν ἃ προσήκει ἐπίστασθαι καὶ πρὸς τὸ μνημονεύειν ἃ ἂν μάθωσι καὶ πρὸς τὸ ὑγιαίνειν τε καὶ ἰσχύειν τοῖς

"No less so."

"What about men's and women's coats, shirts, jackets, tunics?"

"Yes, all these things too are very useful."

"Then don't the members of your household know how to make any of these?"

"I believe they can make all of them."

"Then aren't you aware that by manufacturing one of these commodities, namely groats, Nausicydes supports not only himself and his family but large herds of pigs and cattle as well, and has so much to spare that he often undertakes costly public works; that Cyrebus feeds his whole family well and lives in luxury by baking bread, Demeas of Collytus by making jackets, Menon by making cloaks; and that most of the Megarians make a good living out of tunics?"

"Yes, of course; they buy foreign slaves and can force them to make what does well, but my household is free folk and relatives."

"And so, just because they are free and related to you, you think they should do nothing but eat and sleep? Do you find that other free folk who live this sort of life are better off and happier than those who are usefully employed in work that they understand? Or is it your experience that idleness and carelessness help people to learn what they ought to know and remember what they learn, to make themselves healthy and strong, and to get and

σώμασι καὶ πρὸς τὸ κτήσασθαί τε καὶ σώζειν τὰ χρήσιμα πρὸς τὸν βίον ὡφέλιμα ὄντα, τὴν δ' ἐργασίαν καὶ τὴν ἐπιμέλειαν οὐδὲν χρήσιμα; ἔμαθον δὲ ἃ φης αὐτὰς ἐπίστασθαι πότερον ώς οὕτε χρήσιμα όντα πρὸς τὸν βίον οὕτε ποιήσουσαι αὐτῶν οὐδὲν ἢ τούναντίον ώς καὶ ἐπιμελησόμεναι τούτων καὶ ώφεληθησόμεναι ἀπ' αὐτῶν; ποτέρως γὰρ ἂν μᾶλλον άνθρωποι σωφρονοίεν, άργοῦντες ἢ τῶν χρησίμων έπιμελόμενοι; ποτέρως δ' αν δικαιότεροι είεν, εί έργάζοιντο ἢ εἰ ἀργοῦντες βουλεύοιντο περὶ τῶν ἐπιτηδείων; άλλὰ καὶ νῦν μέν, ώς ἐγὧμαι, οὕτε σὺ ἐκείνας φιλείς οὔτ' ἐκείναι σέ, σὰ μὲν ἡγούμενος αὐτὰς ἐπιζημίους εἶναι σεαυτῷ, ἐκεῖναι δὲ σὲ ὁρῶσαι ἀχθόμενον έφ' έαυταῖς. ἐκ δὲ τούτων κίνδυνος μείζω τε άπέχθειαν γίγνεσθαι καὶ τὴν προγεγονυῖαν χάριν μειοῦσθαι. ἐὰν δὲ προστατήσης, ὅπως ἐνεργοὶ ὧσι, σὺ μὲν ἐκείνας φιλήσεις ὁρῶν ὡφελίμους σεαυτῷ οὔσας, ἐκεῖναι δὲ σὲ ἀγαπήσουσιν αἰσθόμεναι χαίροντα αὐταῖς, τῶν δὲ προγεγονυιῶν εὐεργεσιῶν ήδιον μεμνημένοι την ἀπ' ἐκείνων χάριν αὐξήσετε καὶ ἐκ τούτων φιλικώτερον τε καὶ οἰκειότερον ἀλλήλοις έξετε. εἰ μὲν τοίνυν αἰσχρόν τι ἔμελλον ἐργάσεσθαι, θάνατον ἀντ' αὐτοῦ προαιρετέον ἦν νῦν δὲ ἃ μὲν δοκεῖ κάλλιστα καὶ πρεπωδέστατα γυναιξὶν εἶναι ἐπίστανται, ὡς *ἔοικε. πάντες δὲ ἃ ἐπίστανται ῥᾶστά τε καὶ τάχιστα* καὶ κάλλιστα καὶ ἥδιστα ἐργάζονται. μὴ οὖν ὄκνει, έφη, ταῦτα εἰσηγεῖσθαι αὐταῖς, ἃ σοί τε λυσιτελήσει κάκείναις, καί, ώς εἰκός, ήδέως ὑπακούσονται.

10

#### MEMORABILIA II. 7.7-7.10

keep things that are of practical use, but industry and carefulness are useless things? When these women learned what you say they know, did they regard it as of no practical use, and had they no intention of taking it up, or did they mean to occupy themselves in it and obtain some benefit from it? Which makes men more prudent, idleness or useful employment? Which makes people more just, work or idle discussion about supplies? Besides, at present, I imagine, you don't like these women and they don't like you: you think they're a drain on you and they see that you consider them a burden. And the danger in this situation is that dislike may grow and their former gratitude might fade away; but if you exert your authority and make them work, you will like them when you find that they are profitable to you, and they will be fond of you when they feel that you are pleased with them. Both you and they will like to recall past kindnesses and will strengthen the feeling of gratitude that these engender; thus you will be better friends and feel more at home. To be sure, if they were going to do something disgraceful, death would be a better fate. But in fact what they know how to do is what is considered the most honorable and the most suitable for women, it seems to me; and everyone does what they know with the greatest ease, speed, pride and pleasure. So don't hesitate to offer them work that will profit both you and them, and probably they will welcome your proposal."

165

8

Άλλὰ νὴ τοὺς θεούς, ἔφη ὁ Ἀρίσταρχος, οὕτως μοι 11 δοκείς καλώς λέγειν, ὧ Σώκρατες, ὥστε πρόσθεν μὲν οὐ προσιέμην δανείσασθαι είδώς, ὅτι ἀναλώσας ὁ ἂν λάβω οὐχ ἔξω ἀποδοῦναι, νῦν δέ μοι δοκῶ εἰς ἔργων άφορμην ύπομενείν αὐτὸ ποιήσαι.

Έκ τούτων δὲ ἐπορίσθη μὲν ἀφορμή, ἐωνήθη δὲ έρια, καὶ έργαζόμεναι μὲν ἡρίστων, ἐργασάμεναι δὲ έδείπνουν, ίλαραὶ δὲ ἀντὶ σκυθρωπῶν ἦσαν καὶ ἀντὶ ύφορωμένων έαυτοὺς ήδέως ἀλλήλους έώρων, καὶ αί μεν ώς κηδεμόνα εφίλουν, ο δε ώς ώφελίμους ήγάπα. τέλος δὲ ἐλθὼν πρὸς τὸν Σωκράτην χαίρων διηγεῖτο ταθτά τε καὶ ὅτι αἰτιῶνται αὐτὸν μόνον τῶν ἐν τῆ οἰκία ἀργὸν ἐσθίειν.

Καὶ ὁ Σωκράτης ἔφη: Εἶτ' οὐ λέγεις αὐταῖς τὸν τοῦ κυνὸς λόγον; φασὶ γάρ, ὅτε φωνήεντα ἦν τὰ ζῷα, τὴν οίν πρὸς τὸν δεσπότην εἰπείν. Θαυμαστὸν ποιείς, ὃς ήμιν μεν ταις και έριά σοι και άρνας και τυρον παρεχούσαις οὐδὲν δίδως ὅ τι ἂν μὴ ἐκ τῆς γῆς λάβωμεν, τῷ δὲ κυνί, ος οὐδὲν τοιοῦτόν σοι παρέχει, μεταδίδως οῦπερ αὐτὸς ἔχεις σίτου. τὸν κύνα οὖν ἀκούσαντα 14 εἰπεῖν· Ναὶ μὰ Δί'· ἐγὼ γάρ εἰμι ὁ καὶ ὑμᾶς αὐτὰς σώζων, ὥστε μήτε ὑπ' ἀνθρώπων κλέπτεσθαι μήτε ύπὸ λύκων άρπάζεσθαι, ἐπεὶ ὑμεῖς γε, εἰ μὴ ἐγὼ προφυλάττοιμι ύμᾶς, οὐδ' ἂν νέμεσθαι δύναισθε φοβούμεναι, μη ἀπόλησθε, ούτω δη λέγεται καὶ τὰ πρόβατα συγχωρήσαι τὸν κύνα προτιμᾶσθαι. καὶ σὺ οὖν έκείναις λέγε, ὅτι ἀντὶ κυνὸς εἶ φύλαξ καὶ ἐπιμελητὴς

12

#### MEMORABILIA II. 7.11-7.14

"Well I swear, Socrates," said Aristarchus, "your advice seems so good that I think I'll up and borrow capital to make a start in business. Before now I've had no inclination to do so, knowing that when I'd spent the loan I wouldn't have the wherewithal to repay it."

The consequence was that capital was provided and wool purchased. The women worked during breakfast and stopped at the lunch hour. There were happy instead of gloomy faces; suspicious glances were exchanged for pleasant smiles. They liked him as a guardian and he was fond of them because they were useful. Finally Aristarchus came to Socrates and told him this with delight. "Their only complaint about me," he added, "is that I'm the only member of the household who doesn't work for his food."

"Then why not tell them the story of the dog?" asked Socrates. "They say that when animals could talk, a sheep said to her master: 'It's strange that you give us sheep nothing but what we get from the land, though we supply you with wool and lambs and cheese, and yet you share your own food with your dog, who supplies you with none of these things.' The dog heard this and said: 'Of course he does. Don't I keep you from being stolen by thieves and carried off by wolves? Why, but for my protection you couldn't even eat for fear of being killed.' And so, they say, the sheep admitted the dog's claim to preference. So tell these women that you are their watchdog and keeper, and

12

11

13

καὶ διὰ σὲ οὐδ' ὑφ' ένὸς ἀδικούμεναι ἀσφαλῶς τε καὶ ἡδέως ἐργαζόμεναι ζῶσιν.

8. Άλλον δέ ποτε ἀρχαῖον έταῖρον διὰ χρόνου ἰδών, Πόθεν, ἔφη, Εὔθηρε, φαίνη;

Ύπο μὲν τὴν κατάλυσιν τοῦ πολέμου, ἔφη, ὧ Σώκρατες, ἐκ τῆς ἀποδημίας, νυνὶ μέντοι αὐτόθεν. ἐπειδὴ γὰρ ἀφηρέθην μὲν τὰ ἐν τῆ ὑπερορία κτήματα, ἐν δὲ τῆ ἀττικῆ ὁ πατήρ μοι οὐδὲν κατέλιπεν, ἀναγκάζομαι νῦν ἐπιδημήσας τῷ σώματι ἐργαζόμενος τὰ ἐπιτήδεια πορίζεσθαι. δοκεῖ δέ μοι τοῦτο κρεῖττον εἶναι ἢ δεῖσθαί τινος ἀνθρώπων, ἄλλως τε καὶ μηδὲν ἔχοντα, ἐφ' ὅτω ἂν δανειζοίμην.

Καὶ πόσον ἃν χρόνον οἴει σοι, ἔφη, τὸ σῶμα ίκανὸν εἶναι μισθοῦ τὰ ἐπιτήδεια ἐργάζεσθαι;

Μὰ τὸν Δί, ἔφη, οὐ πολὺν χρόνον.

Καὶ μήν, ἔφη, ὅταν γε πρεσβύτερος γένη, δῆλον ὅτι δαπάνης μὲν δεήση, μισθὸν δὲ οὐδείς σοι ἐθελήσει τῶν τοῦ σώματος ἔργων διδόναι.

 $\Lambda$ ληθη λέγεις, έφη.

Οὐκοῦν, ἔφη, κρεῖττόν ἐστιν αὐτόθεν τοῖς τοιούτοις τῶν ἔργων ἐπιτίθεσθαι, ἃ καὶ πρεσβυτέρῳ γενομένῳ ἐπαρκέσει, καὶ προσελθόντα τῳ τῶν πλείονα χρήματα κεκτημένων, τῷ δεομένῳ τοῦ συνεπιμελησομένου, ἔργων τε ἐπιστατοῦντα καὶ συγκομίζοντα τοὺς καρποὺς καὶ συμφυλάττοντα τὴν οὐσίαν ἀφελοῦντα ἀντωφελεῖσθαι.

4 Χαλεπῶς ἄν, ἔφη, ἐγώ, ὧ Σώκρατες, δουλείαν ὑπομείναιμι.

#### MEMORABILIA II. 7.14–8.4

it is due to you that they live and work in safety and comfort, with none to harm them."

8. Again, on meeting an old comrade after a long time apart he said: "Where have *you* been, Eutherus?"

"I came home when the war ended, Socrates, and I'm now living here," he replied. "Since we have lost our foreign property, and my father left me nothing in Attica, I am forced to settle down here now and work for my living with my hands. I think it's better than begging, especially as I have no security to offer for a loan."

"And how long will you have the strength, do you think, to earn your living by working?"

"Oh, not long, of course."

"And remember, when you get old you will have to spend money, and nobody will be willing to pay you for your labor."

"True."

"Then it would be better to take up some kind of work at once that will assure you a living when you get old, and to go to somebody who is better off and wants an assistant, and get a return for your services by acting as his foreman, helping to get in his crops and looking after his property."

"I wouldn't like to make myself a slave, Socrates."

169

3

Καὶ μὴν οἵ γε ἐν ταῖς πόλεσι προστατεύοντες καὶ τῶν δημοσίων ἐπιμελόμενοι οὐ δουλοπρεπέστεροι ἔνεκα τούτου, ἀλλ' ἐλευθεριώτεροι νομίζονται.

Όλως, ἔφη, ὧ Σώκρατες, τὸ ὑπαίτιον εἶναί τινι οὐ πάνυ προσίεμαι.

Καὶ μήν, ἔφη, Εὔθηρε, οὐ πάνυ γε ῥάδιόν ἐστιν εὐρεῖν ἔργον, ἐφ' ῷ οὐκ ἄν τις αἰτίαν ἔχοι. χαλεπὸν γὰρ οὕτω τι ποιῆσαι, ὥστε μηδὲν ἁμαρτεῖν, χαλεπὸν δὲ καὶ ἀναμαρτήτως τι ποιήσαντα μὴ ἀγνώμονι κριτῆ περιτυχεῖν ἐπεὶ καὶ οἷς νῦν ἐργάζεσθαι φὴς θαυμάζω εἰ ῥάδιόν ἐστιν ἀνέγκλητον διαγίγνεσθαι. χρὴ οὖν πειρᾶσθαι τούς τε φιλαιτίους φεύγειν καὶ τοὺς εὐγνώμονας διώκειν καὶ τῶν πραγμάτων ὅσα μὲν δύνασαι ποιεῖν ὑπομένειν, ὅσα δὲ μὴ δύνασαι φυλλάττεσθαι, ὅ τι δ' ἂν πράττης, τούτου ὡς κάλλιστα καὶ προθυμότατα ἐπιμελεῖσθαι. οὕτω γὰρ ἥκιστ' ἂν μέν σε οἷμαι ἐν αἰτίᾳ εἶναι, μάλιστα δὲ τὴ ἀπορίᾳ βοήθειαν εὐρεῖν, ῥậστα δὲ καὶ ἀκινδυνότατα ζῆν καὶ εἰς τὸ γῆρας διαρκέστατα.

9. Οἶδα δέ ποτε αὐτὸν καὶ Κρίτωνος ἀκούσαντα, ὡς χαλεπὸν ὁ βίος ᾿Αθήνησιν εἴη ἀνδρὶ βουλομένω τὰ ἐαυτοῦ πράττειν. Νῦν γάρ, ἔφη, ἐμέ τινες εἰς δίκας ἄγουσιν, οὐχ ὅτι ἀδικοῦνται ὑπ᾽ ἐμοῦ, ἀλλ᾽ ὅτι νομί-ζουσιν ἤδιον ἄν με ἀργύριον τελέσαι ἢ πράγματα ἔχειν.

Καὶ ὁ Σωκράτης, Εἰπέ μοι, ἔφη, ὧ Κρίτων, κύνας δὲ τρέφεις, ἵνα σοι τοὺς λύκους ἀπὸ τῶν προβάτων ἀπερύκωσι;

2

5

# MEMORABILIA II. 8.4-9.2

"But surely those who control their cities and take charge of public affairs are thought more respectable, not more slavish on that account."

"Briefly, Socrates, I have no inclination to expose myself to any man's censure."

"But you see, Eutherus, it is by no means easy to find a job in which one is not liable to censure. Whatever one does, it is difficult to avoid mistakes, and it is difficult to escape unfair criticism even if one makes no mistakes. I wonder if you find it easy to avoid complaints entirely even from your present employers. You should try, therefore, to have no truck with grumblers and to attach yourself to considerate masters; to undertake such duties as you can perform and beware of any that are too much for you, and, whatever you do, to give of your best and put your heart into the job. In this way, I think, you are most likely to escape censure, find relief from your difficulties, live in ease and security, and obtain ample funds for old age."

9. I remember that he once heard Crito say that life at Athens was difficult for a man who wanted to mind his own business. "At this moment," Crito added, "actions are pending against me not because I have done the plaintiffs an injury, but because they think that I would sooner pay than have trouble."

"Tell me, Crito," said Socrates, "do you keep dogs to fend the wolves from your sheep?"

Καὶ μάλα, ἔφη· μᾶλλον γάρ μοι λυσιτελεῖ τρέφειν η̈ μή.

Οὐκ ἂν οὖν θρέψαις καὶ ἄνδρα, ὅστις ἐθέλοι τε καὶ δύναιτό σου ἀπερύκειν τοὺς ἐπιχειροῦντας ἀδικείν σε;

Ἡλέως τὰ ἄν ἄνας εἰ μὰ ἀροβοίμαν, ὅπως μὰ ἐπὸς καὶ ἐπὸς καὶ

'Ηδέως γ' ἄν, ἔφη, εἰ μὴ φοβοίμην, ὅπως μὴ ἐπ' αὐτόν με τράποιτο.

Τί δ'; ἔφη, οὐχ ὁρậς, ὅτι πολλῷ ἥδιόν ἐστι χαριζόμενον οἴῳ σοὶ ἀνδρὶ ἢ ἀπεχθόμενον ὡφελεῖσθαι; εὖ ἴσθι, ὅτι εἰσὶν ἐνθάδε τῶν τοιούτων ἀνδρῶν οἳ πάνυ ἂν φιλοτιμηθεῖεν φίλῳ σοι χρῆσθαι.

Καὶ ἐκ τούτων ἀνευρίσκουσιν Άρχέδημον, πάνυ μεν ίκανὸν είπεῖν τε καὶ πράξαι, πένητα δέ οὐ γὰρ ην οίος ἀπὸ παντὸς κερδαίνειν, ἀλλὰ φιλόχρηστός τε καὶ ἔφη ράστον εἶναι ἀπὸ τῶν συκοφαντῶν λαμβάνειν. τούτω οὖν ὁ Κρίτων, ὁπότε συγκομίζοι ἢ σῖτον η έλαιον η οίνον η έρια ή τι άλλο των έν άγρω γιγνομένων χρησίμων πρὸς τὸν βίον, ἀφελών ἐδίδου καὶ ὁπότε θύοι, ἐκάλει καὶ τὰ τοιαῦτα πάντα ἐπεμελείτο. νομίσας δε ό Άρχεδημος αποστροφήν οί τον Κρίτωνος οἶκον μάλα περιεῖπεν αὐτόν, καὶ εὐθὺς τῶν συκοφαντούντων τὸν Κρίτωνα ἀνευρίσκει πολλὰ μὲν άδικήματα, πολλούς δ' έχθρούς, καὶ αὐτῶν τινα προσεκαλέσατο είς δίκην δημοσίαν, εν ή αὐτὸν έδει κριθήναι, ὅ τι δεῖ παθεῖν ἢ ἀποτῖσαι. ὁ δὲ συνειδώς αύτῷ πολλὰ καὶ πονηρὰ πάντ' ἐποίει, ὥστε ἀπαλλαγηναι τοῦ ἀρχεδήμου, ὁ δὲ ἀρχέδημος οὐκ ἀπηλλάττετο, έως τόν τε Κρίτωνα ἀφηκε καὶ αὐτῷ χρήματα έδωκεν. ἐπεὶ δὲ τοῦτό τε καὶ ἄλλα τοιαῦτα ὁ Ἀρχέδη-

3

4

5

#### MEMORABILIA II. 9.2-9.7

"Certainly," replied Crito, "because it pays me better to keep them."

"Then why not keep a man who may be able and willing to fend off the attempts to injure you?"

"I would gladly do so if I were not afraid that he might turn on me."

"What? Don't you see that it is much more pleasant to profit by humoring a man like you than by quarreling with him? I assure you there are men in this city who would take pride in your friendship."

At that they sought out Archedemus, an excellent speaker and man of affairs, but poor. For he was not one of those who make money unscrupulously but an honest man, and he would say that it was easy to take forfeit from false accusers. So whenever Crito was storing corn, oil, wine, wool or other farm produce, he would make a present of a portion to Archedemus, and when he sacrificed, he invited him, and in fact lost no similar opportunity of showing courtesy. Archedemus came to regard Crito's house as a haven of refuge and constantly paid his respects to him. He soon found out that Crito's false accusers had much to answer for and many enemies. He brought one of them to trial on a charge involving damages or imprisonment. The defendant, conscious that he was guilty on many counts, did all he could to get free of Archedemus. But Archedemus refused to let him off until he withdrew the action against Crito and compensated him. Archedemus carried through several other enterprises of a similar

5

6

μος διεπράξατο, ήδη τότε, ὥσπερ ὅταν νομεὺς ἀγαθὸν κύνα έχη, καὶ οἱ ἄλλοι νομεῖς βούλονται πλησίον αὐτοῦ τὰς ἀγέλας ἱστάναι, ἵνα τοῦ κυνὸς ἀπολαύωσιν, οὕτω δὴ καὶ Κρίτωνος πολλοὶ τῶν φίλων ἐδέοντο καὶ σφίσι παρέχειν φύλακα τὸν Άρχέδημον, ὁ δὲ Άρχέδημος τῶ Κρίτωνι ἡδέως ἐχαρίζετο, καὶ οὐχ ὅτι μόνος ὁ Κρίτων ἐν ἡσυχία ἦν, ἀλλὰ καὶ οἱ φίλοι αὐτοῦ, εἰ δέ τις αὐτῶ τούτων, οἷς ἀπήχθετο, ὀνειδίζοι, ώς ύπὸ Κρίτωνος ώφελούμενος κολακεύοι αὐτόν, Πότερον οὖν, ἔφη ὁ ᾿Αρχέδημος, αἰσχρόν ἐστιν εὐεργετούμενον ύπὸ χρηστῶν ἀνθρώπων καὶ ἀντευεργετοῦντα τοὺς μὲν τοιούτους φίλους ποιείσθαι, τοῖς δὲ πονηροίς διαφέρεσθαι, ή τους μέν καλούς κάγαθούς άδικείν πειρώμενον έχθρους ποιείσθαι, τοίς δε πονηροίς συνεργούντα πειρασθαι φίλους ποιείσθαι καὶ χρησθαι τούτοις άντ' ἐκείνων;

Έκ δὲ τούτου εἶς τε τῶν Κρίτωνος φίλων Ἀρχέδημος ἦν καὶ ὑπὸ τῶν ἄλλων Κρίτωνος φίλων ἐτιμᾶτο.

10. Οἶδα δὲ καὶ Διοδώρφ αὐτὸν ἑταίρφ ὄντι τοιάδε διαλεχθέντα·

Εἰπέ μοι, ἔφη, ὧ Διόδωρε, ἄν τίς σοι τῶν οἰκετῶν ἀποδρᾳ, ἐπιμελῆ, ὅπως ἀνασώση;

Καὶ ἄλλους γε νὴ Δι, ἔφη, παρακαλῶ σῶστρα τούτου ἀνακηρύττων.

Τί γάρ; ἔφη, ἐάν τίς σοι κάμνη τῶν οἰκετῶν, τούτου ἐπιμελῆ καὶ παρακαλεῖς ἰατρούς, ὅπως μὴ ἀποθάνη;

Σφόδρα γ', ἔφη.

Εἰ δέ τίς σοι τῶν γνωρίμων, ἔφη, πολὺ τῶν οἰκετῶν

### MEMORABILIA II. 9.7-10.2

kind; and now many of Crito's friends begged him to make Archedemus their protector, just as when a shepherd has a good dog the other shepherds want to pen their flocks near his, in order to get the benefit of his dog. Archedemus was glad to humor Crito, and so there was peace not only for Crito but for his friends as well. If anyone whom he had offended reproached Archedemus with flattering Crito because he found him useful, he would answer: "Which, then, is disgraceful: to have honest men for your friends, by accepting and returning their favors, and to fall out with bad people; or to treat gentlemen as enemies by trying to injure them, and to make friends of bad people by siding with them, and to prefer their company?" 18

Henceforward Archedemus was respected by Crito's friends and was himself counted among them.

10. Again I recall the following conversation between him and his companion Diodorus.

"Tell me, Diodorus," he said, "if one of your servants runs away, do you take steps to bring him back safe?"

"Yes, of course," he replied, "and I invite others to help by offering a reward for his recovery."

"And further, if one of your servants is ill, do you take care of him and call in doctors to prevent his death?"

"Indeed I do."

"Well, suppose that one of your acquaintances, who is

<sup>18</sup> Xenophon's Archedemus surpasses even his Socrates in the art of dressing up the obvious in the guise of a conundrum.

χρησιμώτερος ὢν κινδυνεύοι δι' ἔνδειαν ἀπολέσθαι, οὐκ οἴει σοι ἄξιον εἶναι ἐπιμεληθῆναι, ὅπως διασωθῆ; καὶ μὴν οἶσθά γε, ὅτι οὐκ ἀγνώμων ἐστὶν Ἑρμογένης· αἰσχύνοιτο δ' ἄν, εἰ ἀφελούμενος ὑπὸ σοῦ μὴ ἀντωφελοίη σε. καίτοι τὸ ὑπηρέτην ἐκόντα τε καὶ εὔνουν καὶ παραμόνιμον καὶ τὸ κελευόμενον ἱκανὸν ὄντα ποιεῖν ἔχειν καὶ μὴ μόνον τὸ κελευόμενον ἱκανὸν ὄντα ποιεῖν, ἀλλὰ δυνάμενον καὶ ἀφ' ἐαυτοῦ χρήσιμον εἶναι καὶ προνοεῖν καὶ προβουλεύεσθαι πολλῶν οἰκετῶν οἶμαι ἀντάξιον εἶναι. οἱ μέντοι ἀγαθοὶ οἰκονόμοι, ὅταν τὸ πολλοῦ ἄξιον μικροῦ ἐξῆ πρίασθαι, τότε φασὶ δεῖν ἀνεῖσθαι. νῦν δὲ διὰ τὰ πράγματα εὐωνοτάτους ἔστι φίλους ἀγαθοὺς κτήσασθαι.

Καὶ ὁ Διόδωρος, ἀλλὰ καλῶς γε, ἔφη, λέγεις, ὧ Σώκρατες, καὶ κέλευσον ἐλθεῖν ὡς ἐμὲ τὸν Ἑρμογένην.

Μὰ Δί', ἔφη, οὐκ ἔγωγε· νομίζω γὰρ οὕτε σοὶ κάλλιον εἶναι τὸ καλέσαι ἐκεῖνον τοῦ αὐτὸν ἐλθεῖν πρὸς ἐκεῖνον οὕτ' ἐκείνω μεῖζον ἀγαθὸν τὸ πραχθῆναι ταῦτα ἢ σοί.

Οὕτω δὴ ὁ Διόδωρος ἄχετο πρὸς τὸν Ἑρμογένην, καὶ οὐ πολὺ τελέσας ἐκτήσατο φίλον, ὃς ἔργον εἶχε σκοπεῖν ὅ τι ἂν ἢ λέγων ἢ πράττων ὡφελοίη τε καὶ εὐφραίνοι Διόδωρον.

3

5

### MEMORABILIA II. 10.2-10.6

much more useful than your servants, is near being ruined by want, don't you think it worth your while to take steps to save him? Now you know that Hermogenes is a conscientious man and would be ashamed to take a favor from you without making a return. Yet surely it is worth many servants to have a willing, loyal, staunch subordinate, capable of doing what he is told, and not only so, but able to make himself useful without being told, to think clearly and give advice. Good householders, you know, say that the right time to buy is when a valuable article can be bought at a low price; and in these times the circumstances afford an opportunity of acquiring good friends very cheap."

"Thank you, Socrates," said Diodorus, "and do invite Hermogenes to call on me."

"I will not," he replied; "for in my opinion it is at least as good for you to go to him yourself as to invite him to come to you, and you have quite as much to gain by doing so as he does."

And so Diodorus took off to visit Hermogenes; and in freturn for a small sum he acquired a friend who made a point of thinking how he could help and please him either by word or deed.

177

3

1. Ότι δὲ τοὺς ὀρεγομένους τῶν καλῶν ἐπιμελεῖς ὧν ορέγοιντο ποιῶν ὡφέλει, νῦν τοῦτο διηγήσομαι, ἀκούσας γάρ ποτε Διονυσόδωρον είς την πόλιν ήκειν έπαγγελλόμενον στρατηγείν διδάξειν, έλεξε πρός τινα τῶν συνόντων, ὃν ἠσθάνετο βουλόμενον τῆς τιμῆς ταύτης έν τη πόλει τυχείν. Αἰσχρὸν μέντοι, ὧ νεανία, τὸν βουλόμενον ἐν τῆ πόλει στρατηγεῖν, ἐξὸν τοῦτο μαθείν, ἀμελήσαι αὐτοῦ· καὶ δικαίως ἂν οὖτος ὑπὸ τῆς πόλεως ζημιοῖτο πολὺ μᾶλλον ἢ εἴ τις ἀνδριάντας έργολαβοίη μὴ μεμαθηκώς ἀνδριαντοποιείν. ὅλης γὰρ τῆς πόλεως ἐν τοῖς πολεμικοῖς κινδύνοις ἐπιτρεπομένης τῷ στρατηγῷ, μεγάλα τά τε ἀγαθὰ κατορθοῦντος αὐτοῦ καὶ τὰ κακὰ διαμαρτάνοντος εἰκὸς γίγνεσθαι. πῶς οὖν οὐκ ἂν δικαίως ὁ τοῦ μὲν μανθάνειν τοῦτο ἀμελῶν, τοῦ δὲ αἱρεθῆναι ἐπιμελόμενος ζημιοῖτο:

Τοιαῦτα μὲν δὴ λέγων ἔπεισεν αὐτὸν ἐλθόντα μανθάνειν. ἐπεὶ δὲ μεμαθηκὼς ἡκε, προσέπαιζεν αὐτῷ λέγων Οὐ δοκεῖ ὑμῖν, ὧ ἄνδρες, ὥσπερ Ὅμηρος τὸν ᾿Αγαμέμνονα γεραρὸν ἔφη εἶναι, καὶ ὅδε στρατηγεῖν μαθὼν γεραρώτερος φαίνεσθαι; καὶ γὰρ ὥσπερ ὁ

2.

# BOOK III

1. I will now explain how he helped those who were eager to win distinction by making them qualify themselves for the honors they aimed for. He once heard that Dionysodorus had arrived at Athens and was proclaiming his intention to teach generalship. Aware that one of his companions wished to obtain the office of general from the state, he had a word with him: "Young man, surely it would be disgraceful for one who wishes to be a general in the state to neglect the opportunity of learning the duties, and he would deserve to be punished by the state much more than one who carved statues without having learned to be a sculptor. For in the dangerous times of war the whole state is in the general's hands, and great good may come from his success and great evil from his failure. Therefore anyone who exerts himself to gain the votes, but neglects to learn the business, deserves punishment."

This speech persuaded the man to go and learn. When he had learned his lesson and returned, Socrates began to tease him. "Gentlemen," he said, "don't you think that our friend looks more 'majestic,' as Homer called Agamemnon, now that he has learned generalship? For just as one

2

κιθαρίζειν μαθών καὶ ἐὰν μὴ κιθαρίζη, κιθαριστής ἐστι καὶ ὁ μαθών ἰᾶσθαι κἂν μὴ ἰατρεύη, ὅμως ἰατρός ἐστιν, οὕτω καὶ ὅδε ἀπὸ τοῦδε τοῦ χρόνου διατελεῖ στρατηγὸς ὤν, κἂν μηδεὶς αὐτὸν ἔληται. ὁ δὲ μὴ ἐπιστάμενος οὕτε στρατηγὸς οὕτε ἰατρός ἐστιν, οὐδ' ἐὰν ὑπὸ πάντων ἀνθρώπων αἰρεθῆ. ἀτάρ, ἔφη, ἵνα καὶ ἐὰν ἡμῶν τις ἢ ταξιαρχῆ ἢ λοχαγῆ σοι, ἐπιστημονέστεροι τῶν πολεμικῶν ὧμεν, λέξον ἡμῖν, πόθεν ἤρξατό σε διδάσκειν τὴν στρατηγίαν.

Καὶ ὅς, Ἐκ τοῦ αὐτοῦ, ἔφη, εἰς ὅπερ καὶ ἐτελεύτα· τὰ γὰρ τακτικὰ ἐμέ γε καὶ ἄλλο οὐδὲν ἐδίδαξεν.

Άλλὰ μήν, ἔφη ὁ Σωκράτης, τοῦτό γε πολλοστὸν μέρος έστὶ στρατηγίας, καὶ γὰρ παρασκευαστικὸν τῶν εἰς τὸν πόλεμον τὸν στρατηγὸν εἶναι χρὴ καὶ ποριστικον των έπιτηδείων τοις στρατιώταις καὶ μηχανικόν καὶ έργαστικόν καὶ έπιμελή καὶ καρτερικόν καὶ ἀγχίνουν καὶ φιλόφρονά τε καὶ ώμὸν καὶ ἁπλοῦν τε καὶ ἐπίβουλον καὶ φυλακτικόν τε καὶ κλέπτην καὶ προετικον και άρπαγα και φιλόδωρον και πλεονέκτην καὶ ἀσφαλή καὶ ἐπιθετικόν, καὶ ἄλλα πολλὰ καὶ φύσει καὶ ἐπιστήμη δεῖ τὸν εὖ στρατηγήσοντα ἔχειν. καλὸν δὲ καὶ τὸ τακτικὸν εἶναι πολὺ γὰρ διαφέρει στράτευμα τεταγμένον ἀτάκτου, ὥσπερ λίθοι τε καὶ πλίνθοι καὶ ξύλα καὶ κέραμος ἀτάκτως μὲν ἐρριμμένα οὐδὲν χρήσιμά ἐστιν, ἐπειδὰν δὲ ταχθῆ κάτω μὲν καὶ έπιπολής τὰ μήτε σηπόμενα μήτε τηκόμενα, οἵ τε λίθοι καὶ ὁ κέραμος, ἐν μέσω δὲ αἴ τε πλίνθοι καὶ τὰ ξύλα, ὥσπερ ἐν οἰκοδομία συντίθενται, τότε γίγνεται πολλοῦ ἄξιον κτῆμα οἰκία.

5

### MEMORABILIA III. 1.4-1.7

who has learned to play the harp is a harper even when he doesn't play, and one who has studied medicine is a doctor even though he doesn't practice, so our friend will be a general for ever, even if no one votes for him. But your ignoramus is neither general nor doctor, even if he gets every vote. But," he continued, "in order that any one of us who may happen to command a regiment or platoon under you may have a better knowledge of warfare, tell us the first lesson he gave you in generalship."

"The first was like the last," he replied; "he taught me tactics—nothing else."

"But then that is only a small part of generalship. For a general must also be capable of furnishing military equipment and providing supplies for the men;1 he must be resourceful, active, careful, hardy and quick-witted; he must be both gentle and brutal, at once straightforward and designing, capable of both caution and surprise, lavish and rapacious, generous and grasping, skillful in defense and attack; and there are many other qualifications, some natural, some acquired, that are necessary to one who would succeed as a general. It is well to understand tactics too; for there is a wide difference between right and wrong disposition of the troops,2 just as stones, bricks, timber and tiles flung together any which way are useless, whereas when the materials that neither rot nor decay. that is the stones and tiles, are placed at the bottom and the top, and the bricks and timber are put together in the middle, as in building, the result is something of great value, a house in fact."

5

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Cyr. 1.6.14.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Cyr. 6.3.25.

ἀλλὰ πάνυ, ἔφη ὁ νεανίσκος, ὅμοιον, ὧ Σώκρατες, εἴρηκας. καὶ γὰρ ἐν τῷ πολέμῳ τοὺς ἀρίστους πρώτους δεῖ τάττειν καὶ τελευταίους, ἐν μέσῳ δὲ τοὺς χειρίστους, ἵνα ὑπὸ μὲν τῶν ἄγωνται, ὑπὸ δὲ τῶν ὠθῶνται.

Εἰ μὲν τοίνυν, ἔφη, καὶ διαγιγνώσκειν σε τοὺς ἀγαθοὺς καὶ τοὺς κακοὺς ἐδίδαξεν· εἰ δὲ μή, τί σοι ὄφελος ὧν ἔμαθες; οὐδὲ γὰρ εἴ σε ἀργύριον ἐκέλευσε πρῶτον μὲν καὶ τελευταῖον τὸ κάλλιστον τάττειν, ἐν μέσφ δὲ τὸ χείριστον, μὴ διδάξας διαγιγνώσκειν τό τε καλὸν καὶ τὸ κίβδηλον, οὐδὲν ἄν σοι ὄφελος ἦν.

'Αλλὰ μὰ Δί', ἔφη, οὐκ ἐδίδαξεν· ὥστε αὐτοὺς ἂν ἡμᾶς δέοι τούς τε ἀγαθοὺς καὶ τοὺς κακοὺς κρίνειν.

Τί οὖν οὐ σκοποῦμεν, ἔφη, πῶς ἂν αὐτῶν μὴ διαμαρτάνοιμεν;

Βούλομαι, ἔφη ὁ νεανίσκος.

Οὐκοῦν, ἔφη, εἰ μὲν ἀργύριον δέοι ἁρπάζειν, τοὺς φιλαργυρωτάτους πρώτους καθιστάντες ὀρθῶς ἂν τάττοιμεν;

"Εμοιγε δοκεῖ.

Τί δὲ τοὺς κινδυνεύειν μέλλοντας; ἆρα τοὺς φιλοτιμοτάτους προτακτέον;

Οὖτοι γοῦν εἰσιν, ἔφη, οἱ ἕνεκα ἐπαίνου κινδυνεύειν ἐθέλοντες. οὐ τοίνυν οὖτοί γε ἄδηλοι, ἀλλ' ἐπιφανεῖς πανταχοῦ ὄντες εὐεύρετοι ἂν εἶεν.

'Ατάρ, ἔφη, πότερά σε τάττειν μόνον ἐδίδαξεν ἢ καὶ ὅπη καὶ ὅπως χρηστέον ἑκάστῳ τῶν ταγμάτων;

8

9

10

### MEMORABILIA III. 1.8-1.11

"Your analogy is perfect, Socrates," said the youth; "for in war one must put the best men in the van and the rear,<sup>3</sup> and the worst in the center, so that they're led by the van and driven forward by the rearguard."

"Well and good, provided that he taught you also to distinguish the good men and the bad. If not, what have you gained by your lessons? No more than you would have gained if he had ordered you to put the best money at the head and tail, and the worst in the middle, without telling you how to distinguish the good from the counterfeit."

"No, that he didn't teach us: we would have to judge for ourselves which are the good men and which are the had"

"Then we had better consider how we can avoid mistaking them."

"I agree," said the youth.

"Well now," said Socrates, "if we had to lay hands on a sum of money, would not the right arrangement be to put the greediest men in the front?"

"I think so."

"And what should we do with those who are going to face danger? Should our first line consist of the most ambitious?"

"Oh yes: they are the men who will face danger for the sake of glory. About these, now, there is no mystery: they are conspicuous everywhere, and so it is easy to find them."

"But," said Socrates, "did he teach you only the disposition of an army, or did he include where and how to use each formation?"

8

10

<sup>3</sup> Cyr. 7.5.4.

Οὐ πάνυ, ἔφη.

Καὶ μὴν πολλά γ' ἐστί, πρὸς ἃ οὔτε τάττειν οὔτε ἄγειν ὡσαύτως προσήκει.

Άλλὰ μὰ Δί', ἔφη, οὐ διεσαφήνιζε ταῦτα.

Νη Δί', ἔφη, πάλιν τοίνυν ἐλθὼν ἐπανερώτα ἢν γὰρ ἐπίστηται καὶ μὴ ἀναιδης ἢ, αἰσχυνεῖται ἀργύριον εἰληφὼς ἐνδεᾶ σε ἀποπέμψασθαι.

2. Ἐντυχὼν δέ ποτε στρατηγεῖν ἡρημένῳ τῳ, Τοῦ ἔνεκεν, ἔφη, Ὁμηρον οἴει τὸν Ἁγαμέμνονα προσαγορεῦσαι ποιμένα λαῶν; ἄρά γε ὅτι ισπερ τὸν ποιμένα δεῖ ἐπιμελεῖσθαι, ὅπως σῶαί τε ἔσονται αὶ οἶες καὶ τὰ ἐπιτήδεια ἔξουσι, καὶ οὖ ἔνεκα τρέφονται, τοῦτο ἔσται, οῦτω καὶ τὸν στρατηγὸν ἐπιμελεῖσθαι δεῖ, ὅπως σῷοί τε οἱ στρατιῶται ἔσονται καὶ τὰ ἐπιτήδεια ἔξουσι, καὶ οὖ ἔνεκα στρατεύονται, τοῦτο ἔσται; στρατεύονται δέ, ἵνα κρατοῦντες τῶν πολεμίων εὐδαιμονέστεροι ιστν. ἢ τί δήποτε οὕτως ἐπήνεσε τὸν Ἁγαμέμνονα εἰπών.

ἀμφότερον, βασιλεύς τ' ἀγαθὸς κρατερός τ' αἰχμητής;

ἄρά γε ὅτι αἰχμητής τε κρατερὸς ἃν εἴη, οὐκ εἰ μόνος αὐτὸς εὖ ἀγωνίζοιτο πρὸς τοὺς πολεμίους, ἀλλ' εἰ καὶ παντὶ τῷ στρατοπέδῳ τούτου αἴτιος εἴη, καὶ βασιλεὺς ἀγαθός, οὐκ εἰ μόνου τοῦ ἑαυτοῦ βίου καλῶς προεστήκοι, ἀλλ' εἰ καὶ ὧν βασιλεύοι, τούτοις εὐδαιμονίας αἴτιος εἴη; καὶ γὰρ βασιλεὺς αἰρεῖται οὐχ ἵνα ἑαυτοῦ καλῶς ἐπιμελῆται, ἀλλ' ἵνα καὶ οἱ ἑλόμενοι δι' αὐτὸν εὖ πράττωσι· καὶ στρατεύονται δὲ πάντες, ἵνα ὁ βίος

"Not at all."

"And yet there are many situations that call for a modification of tactics and strategy."

"I assure you he didn't explain that."

"Then do go back and ask him. If he knows and has a conscience, he will be ashamed to send you home deficient, after taking your money."

2. One day when he met a man who had been chosen general, he asked him,4 "Why do you think Homer dubs Agamemnon 'shepherd of the people'?5 Is it because a shepherd should care that his sheep are safe and have what they need, and that the purpose for which they are kept is achieved, and a general should take care that his men are safe and have what they need, and that the purpose for which they fight is achieved? And do they fight so that that victory over the enemy will add to their happiness? Or what reason can Homer have had for praising Agamemnon as 'both a good king and a strong warrior too'?6 Is it that he would be 'a strong warrior too' not if he alone were a good fighter but if he made all his men like himself; and 'a good king' not if he merely ordered his own life well but if he made his subjects happy as well? Because a king is chosen not to take good care of himself but for the good of those who have chosen him;7 and all men fight in order that they may get the best life possible,

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Cyr. 8.11.14.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> Il. 2.243.

<sup>6</sup> Il. 3.179.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> Cyr. 1.6.8.

αὐτοῖς ὡς βέλτιστος ἢ, καὶ στρατηγοὺς αἱροῦνται τούτου ἔνεκα, ἴνα πρὸς τοῦτο αὐτοῖς ἡγεμόνες ὦσι. δεῖ οὖν τὸν στρατηγοῦντα τοῦτο παρασκευάζειν τοῖς έλομένοις αὐτὸν στρατηγόν καὶ γὰρ οὔτε κάλλιον τούτου ἄλλο ῥάδιον εὑρεῖν οὔτε αἴσχιον τοῦ ἐναντίου.

Καὶ οὕτως ἐπισκοπῶν, τίς εἴη ἀγαθοῦ ἡγεμόνος ἀρετή, τὰ μὲν ἄλλα περιήρει, κατέλειπε δὲ τὸ εὐδαίμονας ποιεῖν ὧν ἂν ἡγῆται.

3. Καὶ ἱππαρχεῖν δε τινι ἢρημένω οἶδά ποτε αὐτὸν τοιάδε διαλεχθέντα:

Έχοις ἄν, ἔφη, ὧ νεανία, εἰπεῖν ἡμῖν, ὅτου ἔνεκα ἐπεθύμησας ἱππαρχεῖν; οὐ γὰρ δὴ τοῦ πρῶτος τῶν ἱππέων ἐλαύνειν· καὶ γὰρ οἱ ἱπποτοξόται τούτου γε ἀξιοῦνται· προελαύνουσι γοῦν καὶ τῶν ἱππάρχων.

'Λληθη̂ λέγεις, ἔφη.

'Αλλὰ μὴν οὐδὲ τοῦ γνωσθῆναί γε· ἐπεὶ καὶ οἱ μαινόμενοί γε ὑπὸ πάντων γιγνώσκονται.

Άληθές, ἔφη, καὶ τοῦτο λέγεις.

'Αλλ' ἄρα ὅτι τὸ ἱππικὸν οἴει ἃν τῆ πόλει βέλτιον ποιήσας παραδοῦναι, καὶ εἴ τις χρεία γίγνοιτο ἱππέων, τούτων ἡγούμενος ἀγαθοῦ τινος αἴτιος γενέσθαι τῆ πόλει;

Καὶ μάλα, ἔφη.

Καὶ ἔστι γε νὴ Δί, ἔφη ὁ Σωκράτης, καλόν, ἐὰν δύνη ταῦτα ποιῆσαι. ἡ δὲ ἀρχή που, ἐφ' ἣν ἥρησαι, ἵππων τε καὶ ἀμβατῶν ἐστιν.

"Εστι γὰρ οὖν, ἔφη.

and choose generals to guide them to it. Therefore it is the commander's duty to deliver this for those who have chosen him as general. For anything more honorable than that is not easy to find, or anything more disgraceful than its opposite."

By these reflections on what constitutes a good leader he stripped away all other virtues and left just the power to make his followers happy.

3. Again, when someone had been chosen a leader of cavalry, I remember that Socrates conversed with him in the following manner:

"Young man," he said, "can you tell us why you hankered after a cavalry command? I presume it was not to be first of the cavalry in the charge; for that privilege belongs to the mounted archers; at any rate they ride ahead of their commanders even."

"True."

"Nor was it to get yourself known either. Even madmen are known to everyone."  $\,$ 

"True again."

"But perhaps you think you can hand over the cavalry in better condition to the state when you retire, and can do something for the good of the state as a cavalry leader in case there is any occasion to employ the cavalry?"

"Yes, certainly," said he.

"Yes," said Socrates, "and no doubt it's a fine thing if you can do that. The command, I presume, for which you have been chosen, is the command of horses and riders."

"Indeed it is."

Καὶ ὅς, ἀλλὰ τοῦτο μέν, ἔφη, οὐκ ἐμὸν οἶμαι τὸ ἔργον εἶναι, ἀλλὰ ἰδίᾳ ἕκαστον δεῖν τοῦ ἑαυτοῦ ἵππου ἐπιμελεῖσθαι.

'Εὰν οὖν, ἔφη ὁ Σωκράτης, παρέχωνταί σοι τοὺς ἵππους οἱ μὲν οὕτως κακόποδας ἢ κακοσκελεῖς ἢ ἀσθενεῖς, οἱ δὲ οὕτως ἀτρόφους, ὥστε μὴ δύνασθαι ἀκολουθεῖν, οἱ δὲ οὕτως ἀναγώγους, ὥστε μὴ μένειν ὅπου ἂν σὺ τάξης, οἱ δὲ οὕτως λακτιστάς, ὥστε μηδὲ τάξαι δυνατὸν εἶναι, τί σοι τοῦ ἱππικοῦ ὄφελος ἔσται; ἢ πῶς δυνήση τοιούτων ἡγούμενος ἀγαθόν τι ποιῆσαι τὴν πόλιν:

Καὶ ὅς, ἀλλὰ καλῶς τε λέγεις, ἔφη, καὶ πειράσομαι τῶν ἵππων εἰς τὸ δυνατὸν ἐπιμελεῦσθαι.

Τί δέ; τοὺς ἱππέας οὐκ ἐπιχειρήσεις, ἔφη, βελτίονας ποιῆσαι;

"Ε $\gamma\omega\gamma$ ', έ $\phi\eta$ .

Οὐκοῦν πρῶτον μὲν ἀναβατικωτέρους ἐπὶ τοὺς ἵππους ποιήσεις αὐτούς;

 $\Delta \epsilon \hat{\imath}$  γοῦν, ἔφη· καὶ γὰρ εἴ τις αὐτῶν καταπέσοι, μᾶλλον ἃν οὕτω σώζοιτο.

Τί γάρ; ἐάν που κινδυνεύειν δέη, πότερον ἐπάγειν τοὺς πολεμίους ἐπὶ τὴν ἄμμον κελεύσεις, ἔνθαπερ εἰώθατε ἱππεύειν, ἢ πειράση τὰς μελέτας ἐν τοιούτοις ποιεῖσθαι χωρίοις, ἐν οἴοισπερ οἱ πόλεμοι γίγνονται;

Βέλτιον γοῦν, ἔφη.

4

5

### MEMORABILIA III. 3.3-3.6

"Come then, tell us first how you propose to improve the horses."

"Oh, but I don't think that is my business. Every man must look after his own horse."

"Then if some of your men appear on parade with their horses sick or suffering from bad feet or sore legs, others with underfed animals that can't keep the pace, or so disobedient that they won't stay where you line them up, or such bad kickers that it's impossible to line them up at all, what use will your cavalry be to you? How will you be able to do the state any good with a command like that?"

"I am much obliged to you," he replied, "and I will try to look after the horses carefully."

"Won't you also try to improve the men?" said Socrates.
"I will."

"Then will you first train them to mount better?"

"Oh yes, I must, so that if anyone is thrown he may have a better chance of saving himself."

"Further, when there is some danger before you, will you order them to draw the enemy into the sandy ground where your maneuvers are held, or will you try to carry out your training in the kind of country that the enemy occupy?"

"Oh yes, that is the better way."

7 Τί γάρ; τοῦ βάλλειν ὡς πλείστους ἀπὸ τῶν ἵππων ἐπιμέλειάν τινα ποιήσει;

Βέλτιον γοῦν, ἔφη, καὶ τοῦτο.

Θήγειν δὲ τὰς ψυχὰς τῶν ἱππέων καὶ ἐξοργίζειν πρὸς τοὺς πολεμίους, ἄπερ ἀλκιμωτέρους ποιεῖ, δια-νενόησαι;

Εἰ δὲ μή, ἀλλὰ νῦν γε πειράσομαι, ἔφη.

Όπως δέ σοι πείθωνται οἱ ἱππεῖς, πεφρόντικάς τι; ἄνευ γὰρ δὴ τούτου οὔτε ἵππων οὔτε ἱππέων ἀγαθῶν καὶ ἀλκίμων οὐδὲν ὄφελος.

Άληθη λέγεις, ἔφη· ἀλλὰ πῶς ἄν τις μάλιστα, ὧ Σώκρατες, ἐπὶ τοῦτο αὐτοὺς προτρέψαιτο;

Ἐκεῖνο μὲν δήπου οἶσθα, ὅτι ἐν παντὶ πράγματι οἱ ἄνθρωποι τούτοις μάλιστα ἐθέλουσι πείθεσθαι, οὓς ἂν ἡγῶνται βελτίστους εἶναι. καὶ γὰρ ἐν νόσῳ ὃν ἂν ἡγῶνται ἰατρικώτατον εἶναι, τούτῳ μάλιστα πείθονται, καὶ ἐν πλῷ ὃν ἂν κυβερνητικώτατον, καὶ ἐν γεωργίᾳ ὃν ἂν γεωργικώτατον.

Καὶ μάλα, ἔφη.

Οὐκοῦν εἰκός, ἔφη, καὶ ἐν ἱππικῆ ὃς ἂν μάλιστα εἰδὼς φαίνηται ἃ δεῖ ποιεῖν, τούτῳ μάλιστα ἐθέλειν τοὺς ἄλλους πείθεσθαι.

10 'Εὰν οὖν, ἔφη, ἐγώ, ὧ Σώκρατες, βέλτιστος ὢν αὐτῶν δῆλος ὧ, ἀρκέσει μοι τοῦτο εἰς τὸ πείθεσθαι αὐτοὺς ἐμοί;

Ἐάν γε πρὸς τούτω, ἔφη, διδάξης αὐτούς, ὡς τὸ πείθεσθαί σοι κάλλιόν τε καὶ σωτηριώτερον αὐτοῖς ἔσται.

8

#### MEMORABILIA III. 3.7-3.10

"And again, will you have a care to bring down as many of the enemy as possible without dismounting?"

"Oh yes, that too is the better way."

"Have you thought of fostering a keen spirit among the men and hatred of the enemy, so as to make them more gallant in action?"

"Well, I will certainly try to do so now!"

"And have you considered how to make the men obey you? Because without that horses and men, however good and gallant, are of no use."

"True, but what is the best way of encouraging them to obey, Socrates?"

"Well, I suppose you know that under all conditions human beings are most willing to obey those whom they believe to be the best.<sup>8</sup> Thus in sickness they most readily obey the doctor, on board ship the pilot, on a farm the farmer whom they think to be most capable at farming."

"Yes. certainly."

"Then it is likely that in horsemanship too, one who clearly knows best what ought to be done will most easily gain the obedience of the others."

"If then, Socrates, I am plainly the best horseman among them, will that suffice to gain their obedience?"

"Yes, if you also show them that it will be safer and more honorable for them to obey you."

9

<sup>8</sup> Cyr. 3.1.20.

Πῶς οὖν, ἔφη, τοῦτο διδάξω;

Πολὺ νὴ Δί, ἔφη, ῥᾶον ἢ εἴ σοι δέοι διδάσκειν, ὡς τὰ κακὰ τῶν ἀγαθῶν ἀμείνω καὶ λυσιτελέστερά ἐστι.

Λέγεις, ἔφη, σὺ τὸν ἵππαρχον πρὸς τοῖς ἄλλοις ἐπιμελεῖσθαι δεῖν καὶ τοῦ λέγειν δύνασθαι;

Σὺ δ' ὤου, ἔφη, χρῆναι σιωπῆ ἱππαρχεῖν; ἢ οὐκ ἐντεθύμησαι, ὅτι ὅσα τε νόμῳ μεμαθήκαμεν κάλλιστα ὅντα, δι' ὧν γε ζῆν ἐπιστάμεθα, ταῦτα πάντα διὰ λόγου ἐμάθομεν καὶ εἴ τι ἄλλο καλὸν μανθάνει τις μάθημα, διὰ λόγου μανθάνει καὶ οἱ ἄριστα διδάσκοντες μάλιστα λόγῳ χρῶνται καὶ οἱ τὰ σπουδαιότατα μάλιστα ἐπιστάμενοι κάλλιστα διαλέγονται; ἢ τόδε οὐκ ἐντεθύμησαι, ὡς ὅταν γε χορὸς εἶς ἐκ τῆσδε τῆς πόλεως γίγνηται, ὥσπερ ὁ εἰς Δῆλον πεμπόμενος, οὐδεὶς ἄλλοθεν οὐδαμόθεν τούτῳ ἐφάμιλλος γίγνεται οὐδὲ εὐανδρία ἐν ἄλλη πόλει ὁμοία τῆ ἐνθάδε συνάγεται;

'Λληθη̂ λέγεις, ἔφη.

13 'Αλλὰ μὴν οὔτε εὐφωνία τοσοῦτον διαφέρουσιν 'Αθηναῖοι τῶν ἄλλων οὔτε σωμάτων μεγέθει καὶ ρώμη ὅσον φιλοτιμία, ἤπερ μάλιστα παροξύνει πρὸς τὰ καλὰ καὶ ἔντιμα.

Άληθές, ἔφη, καὶ τοῦτο.

Οὐκοῦν οἴει, ἔφη, καὶ τοῦ ἱππικοῦ τοῦ ἐνθάδε εἴ τις ἐπιμεληθείη, πολὺ ἂν καὶ τούτῳ διενεγκεῖν τῶν ἄλλων ὅπλων τε καὶ ἴππων παρασκευἢ καὶ εὐταξίᾳ καὶ τῷ ἑτοίμως κινδυνεύειν πρὸς τοὺς πολεμίους, εἰ νομίσειαν ταῦτα ποιοῦντες ἐπαίνου καὶ τιμῆς τεύξεσθαι;

11

12

"How, then, shall I show that?"

"Well, it's far easier than if you had to show them that bad is better than good and more profitable."

"Do you mean that in addition to his other duties a cavalry leader must take care to be a good speaker?"

"Did you suppose that a commander of cavalry should be mum? Did you never reflect that all the best we have learned according to custom—the learning, I mean, that teaches us how to live—we learned by means of words, and that every other good lesson to be learned is learned by means of words; that the best teachers rely most on the spoken word and those with the deepest knowledge of the greatest subjects are the best talkers? Did you never reflect that, whenever one chorus is selected from the citizens of this state—for instance, the chorus that is sent to Delos—none from any other place can compare with it, and no state can collect so impressive a company?"

"True."

"And yet the reason is that Athenians excel all others not so much in singing or in stature or in strength as in love of honor, which is the strongest incentive to deeds of honor and renown."

"True again."

"Then don't you think that if one took the same pains with our cavalry, they too would greatly excel others in arms and horses and discipline and readiness to face the enemy, if they thought that they would win glory and honor by it?"

11

12

13

Εἰκός γε, ἔφη.

15

2

3

Μὴ τοίνυν ὅκνει, ἔφη, ἀλλὰ πειρῶ τοὺς ἄνδρας ἐπὶ ταῦτα προτρέπειν, ἀφ᾽ ὧν αὐτός τε ὡφελήση καὶ οἱ ἄλλοι πολῖται διὰ σέ.

Άλλὰ νὴ Δία πειράσομαι, ἔφη.

4. Ἰδων δέ ποτε Νικομαχίδην έξ ἀρχαιρεσιων ἀπιόντα ἤρετο Τίνες, ὧ Νικομαχίδη, στρατηγοὶ ἤρηνται:

Καὶ ὅς, Οὐ γάρ, ἔφη, ὧ Σώκρατες, τοιοῦτοί εἰσιν ᾿Αθηναῖοι, ὥστε ἐμὲ μὲν οὐχ εἴλοντο, ὃς ἐκ καταλόγου στρατευόμενος κατατέτριμμαι καὶ λοχαγῶν καὶ ταξιαρχῶν καὶ τραύματα ὑπὸ τῶν πολεμίων τοσαῦτα ἔχω ἄμα δὲ τὰς οὐλὰς τῶν τραυμάτων ἀπογυμνούμενος ἐπεδείκνυεν ᾿Αντισθένην δέ, ἔφη, εἴλοντο, τὸν οὕτε ὁπλίτην πω στρατευσάμενον ἔν τε τοῖς ἱππεῦσιν οὐδὲν περίβλεπτον ποιήσαντα ἐπιστάμενόν τε ἄλλο οὐδὲν ἢ χρήματα συλλέγειν;

Οὐκοῦν, ἔφη ὁ Σωκράτης, τοῦτο μὲν ἀγαθόν, εἴ γε τοῖς στρατιώταις ἱκανὸς ἔσται τὰ ἐπιτήδεια πορίζειν;

Καὶ γὰρ οἱ ἔμποροι, ἔφη ὁ Νικομαχίδης, χρήματα συλλέγειν ἱκανοί εἰσιν ἀλλ' οὐχ ἕνεκα τούτου καὶ στρατηγεῖν δύναιντ' ἄν.

Καὶ ὁ Σωκράτης ἔφη· ᾿Αλλὰ καὶ φιλόνικος ᾿Αντισθένης ἐστίν, ὁ στρατηγῷ προσείναι ἐπιτήδειόν ἐστινοὐχ ὁρậς, ὅτι καὶ ὁσάκις κεχορήγηκε, πᾶσι τοῖς χοροῖς νενίκηκε;

Μὰ Δί', ἔφη ὁ Νικομαχίδης, ἀλλ' οὐδὲν ὅμοιόν ἐστι χοροῦ τε καὶ στρατεύματος προεστάναι.

"I expect so."

"Don't hesitate then, but try to encourage this keenness among the men: both you and your fellow citizens will benefit by the results of your efforts."

"Most certainly I will try."

4. Once on seeing Nicomachides returning from the elections, he asked, "Who have been chosen generals, Nicomachides?"

"Isn't it like the Athenians?" he replied; "they haven't chosen me after all the hard work I have done since I was called up in the command of company or regiment, though I have been so often wounded in action" (and here he uncovered and showed his scars); "yet they have chosen Antisthenes, who has never served in a marching regiment nor distinguished himself in the cavalry and understands nothing but moneymaking."

"Isn't that a recommendation," said Socrates, "supposing he proves capable of supplying the men's needs?"

"Well," said Nicomachides, "merchants too are capable of making money, but that doesn't make them fit to command an army."

"But," said Socrates, "Antisthenes also is eager for victory, and that is a good point in a general. Whenever he serves as chorus master, 10 don't you know, his chorus always wins."

"No doubt," said Nicomachides, "but there is no analogy between the handling of a chorus and of an army."

9 Cyr. 1.6.18.

 $^{10}\,\mbox{\normalfont\AA}$  mong the civic duties ("liturgies") allotted to or volunteered by the wealthiest citizens.

15

2

4 Καὶ μήν, ἔφη ὁ Σωκράτης, οὐδὲ ᢤδῆς γε ὁ ἀντισθένης οὐδὲ χορῶν διδασκαλίας ἔμπειρος ὢν ὅμως ἐγένετο ἱκανὸς εὐρεῖν τοὺς κρατίστους ταῦτα.

Καὶ ἐν τῆ στρατιᾳ οὖν, ἔφη ὁ Νικομαχίδης, ἄλλους μὲν εὑρήσει τοὺς τάξοντας ἀνθ' ἑαυτοῦ, ἄλλους δὲ τοὺς μαχουμένους.

Οὐκοῦν, ἔφη ὁ Σωκράτης, ἐάν γε καὶ ἐν τοῖς πολεμικοῖς τοὺς κρατίστους, ὥσπερ ἐν τοῖς χορικοῖς, ἐξευρίσκη τε καὶ προαιρῆται, εἰκότως ἂν καὶ τούτου νικηφόρος εἴη· καὶ δαπανᾶν δ' αὐτὸν εἰκὸς μᾶλλον ἂν ἐθέλειν εἰς τὴν σὺν ὅλη τῆ πόλει τῶν πολεμικῶν νίκην ἢ εἰς τὴν σὺν τῆ φυλῆ τῶν χορικῶν.

Λέγεις σύ, ἔφη, ὧ Σώκρατες, ὡς τοῦ αὐτοῦ ἀνδρός ἐστι χορηγεῖν τε καλῶς καὶ στρατηγεῖν;

Λέγω ἔγωγ', ἔφη, ὡς ὅτου ἄν τις προστατεύη, ἐὰν γιγνώσκη τε ὧν δεῖ καὶ ταῦτα πορίζεσθαι δύνηται, ἀγαθὸς ἃν εἴη προστάτης, εἴτε χοροῦ εἴτε οἴκου εἴτε πόλεως εἴτε στρατεύματος προστατεύοι.

Καὶ ὁ Νικομαχίδης, Μὰ Δί', ἔφη, ὧ Σώκρατες, οὐκ ἄν ποτε ῷμην ἐγώ σου ἀκοῦσαι, ὡς οἱ ἀγαθοὶ οἰκονόμοι ἀγαθοὶ στρατηγοὶ ἃν εἶεν.

"Ιθι δή, ἔφη, ἐξετάσωμεν τὰ ἔργα ἐκατέρου αὐτῶν, ἵνα εἰδῶμεν, πότερον τὰ αὐτά ἐστιν ἢ διαφέρει τι.

Πάνυ γε, ἔφη.

8 Οὐκοῦν, ἔφη, τὸ μὲν τοὺς ἀρχομένους κατηκόους τε καὶ εὐπειθεῖς ἑαυτοῖς παρασκευάζειν ἀμφοτέρων ἐστὶν ἔργον;

Καὶ μάλα, ἔφη.

5

6

## MEMORABILIA III. 4.4-4.8

"But look," said Socrates, "though Antisthenes knows nothing about music or chorus training, he showed himself capable of finding the best experts in these."

"In the army too, then," said Nicomachides, "he will find others to command for him, and others to do the fighting."

"And therefore," said Socrates, "if he searches out and prefers the best men in warfare as in chorus training it is likely that he will be victorious in that too; and probably he will be more ready to spend on winning a battle for the whole state than on winning a choral competition for his tribe."

"Do you mean to say, Socrates, that the man who succeeds with a chorus will also succeed with an army?"

"I mean that whatever a man controls, if he knows what he wants and can get it he will be a good controller, whether he controls a chorus, an estate, a city, or an army."

"Really, Socrates," said Nicomachides, "I would never have expected to hear you say that good business men would make good generals."

"Come then, let's review the duties of each and find out whether they are the same or different."

"By all means."

"Is it not the duty of both to make their subordinates 8 willing and obedient?"

"Decidedly."

Τί δέ; τὸ προστάττειν ἕκαστα τοῖς ἐπιτηδείοις πράττειν;

Καὶ τοῦτ', ἔφη.

Καὶ μὴν τὸ τοὺς κακοὺς κολάζειν καὶ τοὺς ἀγαθοὺς τιμᾶν ἀμφοτέροις οἶμαι προσήκειν.

Πάνυ μεν οὖν, ἔφη.

9 Τὸ δὲ τοὺς ὑπηκόους εὐμενεῖς ποιεῖσθαι πῶς οὐ καλὸν ἀμφοτέροις;

Καὶ τοῦτ', ἔφη.

Συμμάχους δὲ καὶ βοηθοὺς προσάγεσθαι δοκεῖ σοι συμφέρειν ἀμφοτέροις ἢ οὔ;

Πάνυ μὲν οὖν, ἔφη.

'Αλλὰ φυλακτικοὺς τῶν ὄντων οὐκ ἀμφοτέρους εἶναι προσήκει;

Σφόδρα γ', ἔφη.

Οὐκοῦν καὶ ἐπιμελεῖς καὶ φιλοπόνους ἀμφοτέρους εἶναι προσήκει περὶ τὰ αὐτῶν ἔργα;

10 Ταῦτα μέν, ἔφη, πάντα ὁμοίως ἀμφοτέρων ἐστίν, ἀλλὰ τὸ μάχεσθαι οὐκέτι ἀμφοτέρων.

Άλλ' έχθροί γέ τοι ἀμφοτέροις γίγνονται;

Καὶ μάλα, ἔφη, τοῦτό γε.

Οὐκοῦν τὸ περιγενέσθαι τούτων ἀμφοτέροις συμφέρει;

11 Πάνυ γ', ἔφη ἀλλ' ἐκεῖνο παρίης, ἂν δέη μάχεσθαι, τί ἀφελήσει ἡ οἰκονομική;

Ἐνταῦθα δήπου καὶ πλεῖστον, ἔφη· ὁ γὰρ ἀγαθὸς οἰκονόμος, εἰδὼς ὅτι οὐδὲν οὕτω λυσιτελές τε καὶ κερδαλέον ἐστὶν ὡς τὸ μαχόμενον τοὺς πολεμίους νικᾶν

### MEMORABILIA III. 4.8-4.11

"And to put the right man in the right place?"11

"That is so."

"I suppose, moreover, that both should punish the bad and reward the good."

"Yes, certainly."

"Of course both will do well to win the goodwill of 9 those under them?"

"That is so."

"Do you think that it is in the interest of both to attract allies and helpers?"

"Yes, certainly."

"And shouldn't both be able to keep what they have?" "They should indeed."

"And shouldn't both be careful and industrious in their own work?"  $^{12}$ 

"All these are common to both; but fighting is not."

"But surely both are bound to find enemies?"

"Oh yes, they are."

"Then isn't it important for both to get the better of them?"

"Undoubtedly; but you don't say how business capacity 11 will help when it comes to fighting."

"That is just where it will be most helpful. For the good business man, through his knowledge that nothing profits or pays like a victory in the field, and nothing is so utterly

<sup>11</sup> Cyr. 1.6.20.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>12</sup> Cyr. 8.

οὐδὲ οὕτως ἀλυσιτελές τε καὶ ζημιῶδες ὡς τὸ ἡττᾶσθαι, προθύμως μέν τὰ πρὸς τὸ νικᾶν συμφέροντα ζητήσει καὶ παρασκευάσεται, ἐπιμελῶς δὲ τὰ πρὸς τὸ ήττασθαι φέροντα σκέψεται καὶ φυλάξεται, ένεργως δ', αν την παρασκευην όρα νικητικήν οὖσαν, μαχειται, ούχ ήκιστα δὲ τούτων, ἐὰν ἀπαράσκευος ή, φυλάξεται συνάπτειν μάχην. μη καταφρόνει, έφη, ὧ 12 Νικομαχίδη, των οἰκονομικών ἀνδρών ή γὰρ των ίδίων ἐπιμέλεια πλήθει μόνον διαφέρει τῆς τῶν κοινῶν, τὰ δ' ἄλλα παραπλήσια ἔχει, τὸ ‹δὲ›¹ μέγιστον, ότι ούτε ἄνευ ἀνθρώπων οὐδετέρα γίγνεται οὔτε δί άλλων μεν άνθρώπων τὰ ίδια πράττεται, δι' άλλων δε τὰ κοινά οὐ γὰρ ἄλλοις τισὶν ἀνθρώποις οἱ τῶν κοινῶν ἐπιμελόμενοι χρῶνται ἢ οἶσπερ οἱ τὰ ἴδια οἰκονομοῦντες οἷς οἱ ἐπιστάμενοι χρῆσθαι καὶ τὰ ἴδια καὶ τὰ κοινὰ καλῶς πράττουσιν, οἱ δὲ μὴ ἐπιστάμενοι αμφοτέρωθι πλημμελούσι.

5. Περικλεί δέ ποτε τῷ τοῦ πάνυ Περικλέους υἱῷ διαλεγόμενος, Ἐγώ τοι, ἔφη, ὦ Περίκλεις, ἐλπίδα ἔχω σοῦ στρατηγήσαντος ἀμείνω τε καὶ ἐνδοξοτέραν τὴν πόλιν εἰς τὰ πολεμικὰ ἔσεσθαι καὶ τῶν πολεμίων κρατήσειν.

Καὶ ὁ Περικλῆς, Βουλοίμην ἄν, ἔφη, ὧ Σώκρατες, ἃ λέγεις ὅπως δὲ ταῦτα γένοιτ' ἄν, οὐ δύναμαι γνῶναι.

Βούλει οὖν, ἔφη ὁ Σωκράτης, διαλογιζόμενοι περὶ αὐτῶν ἐπισκοπῶμεν, ὅπου ἤδη τὸ δυνατόν² ἐστι;

Βούλομαι, ἔφη.

## MEMORABILIA III. 4.11-5.1

unprofitable and entails such heavy loss as a defeat, will be eager to seek and furnish all aids to victory, careful to consider and avoid what leads to defeat, prompt to engage the enemy if he sees they are strong enough to win, and, above all, will avoid an engagement when he is not ready. Don't look down on business men, Nicomachides. For the management of private concerns differs only in quantity from that of public affairs. In other respects they are much alike, and particularly in this, that neither can be carried on without people, and the people employed in private and public transactions are the same: for those who take charge of public affairs employ just the same people when they attend to their own; and those who understand how to employ them are successful directors of public and private concerns, and those who do not fail at both."

5. Once when talking with the son of the great Pericles, he said: "For my part, Pericles, now that you have become general I feel hopeful that our city will be more efficient and more famous in the art of war, and will defeat our enemies."

"I could wish," answered Pericles, "that it might be as you say, Socrates; but how these changes are to come about I cannot see."

"Would you like to discuss them with me, then," said Socrates, "and consider how they can be brought about?" "I would."

 $<sup>1 \</sup>delta \hat{\epsilon}$  add. Castalio

 $<sup>^2</sup>$  ἀδύνατόν Richards

2 Οὐκοῦν οἶσθα, ἔφη, ὅτι πλήθει μὲν οὐδὲν μείους εἰσὶν ᾿Αθηναῖοι Βοιωτῶν;

Οἶδα γάρ, ἔφη.

Σώματα δὲ ἀγαθὰ καὶ καλὰ πότερον ἐκ Βοιωτῶν οἴει πλείω ἂν ἐκλεχθῆναι ἢ ἐξ ἀθηναίων;

Οὐδὲ ταύτη μοι δοκοῦσι λείπεσθαι.

Εὐμενεστέρους δὲ ποτέρους ἑαυτοῖς εἶναι νομίζεις;

' Αθηναίους ἔγωγε· Βοιωτῶν μὲν γὰρ πολλοὶ πλεονεκτούμενοι ὑπὸ Θηβαίων δυσμενῶς αὐτοῖς ἔχουσιν, ' Αθήνησι δὲ οὐδὲν ὁρῶ τοιοῦτον.

'Αλλὰ μὴν φιλοτιμότατοί γε καὶ μεγαλοφρονέστατοι πάντων εἰσίν· ἄπερ οὐχ ἥκιστα παροξύνει κινδυνεύειν ὑπὲρ εὐδοξίας τε καὶ πατρίδος.

Οὐδὲ ἐν τούτοις Ἀθηναῖοι μεμπτοί.

Καὶ μὴν προγόνων γε καλὰ ἔργα οὐκ ἔστιν οἷς μείζω καὶ πλείω ὑπάρχει ἢ Ἀθηναίοις: ῷ πολλοὶ ἐπαι-ρόμενοι προτρέπονταί τε ἀρετῆς ἐπιμελεῦσθαι καὶ ἄλ-κιμοι γίγνεσθαι.

Ταῦτα μὲν ἀληθῆ λέγεις πάντα, ὧ Σώκρατες· ἀλλ' όρῆς, ὅτι ἀφ' οὖ ἥ τε σὺν Τολμίδη τῶν χιλίων ἐν Λεβαδεία συμφορὰ ἐγένετο καὶ ἡ μεθ' Ἱπποκράτους ἐπὶ Δηλίῳ, ἐκ τούτων τεταπείνωται μὲν ἡ τῶν Ἀθηναίων δόξα πρὸς τοὺς Βοιωτούς, ἐπῆρται δὲ τὸ τῶν Θηβαίων φρόνημα πρὸς τοὺς ᾿Αθηναίους, ὥστε Βοιω-

3

 $<sup>^{13}</sup>$  At the battle of Coronea (or Lebadea) in 446 BC, the Boeotians defeated and destroyed the Athenian army and gained independence (Thuc. 1.113).

"Do you know then, that numerically the Athenians are not inferior to the Boeotians?"

"Yes. I know."

"From which side do you think the larger number of fine, well-developed men could be selected: the Boeotians or the Athenians?"

"In that respect too they seem to be at no disadvantage."

"Which do you think are the more united?"

"The Athenians, I should say, for many of the Boeotians resent the selfish behavior of the Thebans. At Athens I see nothing of that sort."

"And again, the Athenians are more ambitious and more high-minded than other peoples; and these qualities are among the strongest incentives to heroism and patriotic self-sacrifice."

"Yes, in these respects too the Athenians needn't fear criticism."

"And besides, none have inherited a past more replete with great deeds; and many are heartened by such a heritage and encouraged to care for excellence and prove their gallantry."

"All you have said is true, Socrates. But you see, since the disasters sustained by Tolmides and the Thousand at Lebadea<sup>13</sup> and by Hippocrates at Delium,<sup>14</sup> the relations of the Athenians and Boeotians are changed: the glory of the Athenians is brought low, the pride of the Thebans is exalted; and now the Boeotians, who formerly would not

 $^{14}$  The Athenians (including Socrates, cf. Pl. Smp. 220d–21e) were routed by the Boeotians at Delium in 424 BC (Thuc. 4.96–97).

203

2

3

τοὶ μὲν οἱ πρόσθεν οὐδ' ἐν τῆ ἑαυτῶν τολμῶντες Ἀθηναίοις ἄνευ Λακεδαιμονίων τε καὶ τῶν ἄλλων Πελοπονησίων ἀντιτάττεσθαι νῦν ἀπειλοῦσιν αὐτοὶ καθ' αὐτοὺς ἐμβαλεῖν εἰς τὴν Ἀττικήν, Ἀθηναῖοι δὲ οἱ πρότερον [ὅτε Βοιωτοὶ μόνοι ἐγένοντο]³ πορθοῦντες τὴν Βοιωτίαν φοβοῦνται, μὴ Βοιωτοὶ δηώσωσι τὴν Ἀττικήν.

Καὶ ὁ Σωκράτης, ᾿Αλλ᾽ αἰσθάνομαι μέν, ἔφη, ταῦτα οὕτως ἔχοντα· δοκεῖ δέ μοι ἀνδρὶ ἀγαθῷ ἄρχοντι νῦν εὐαρεστοτέρως διακεῖσθαι ἡ πόλις. τὸ μὲν γὰρ θάρρος ἀμέλειάν τε καὶ ῥᾳθυμίαν καὶ ἀπείθειαν ἐμβάλλει, ὁ δὲ φόβος προσεκτικωτέρους τε καὶ εὐπειθεστέρους καὶ ἐὐτακτοτέρους ποιεῖ. τεκμήραιο δ᾽ ἂν τοῦτο καὶ ἀπὸ τῶν ἐν ταῖς ναυσίν· ὅταν μὲν γὰρ δήπου μηδὲν φοβῶνται, μεστοί εἰσιν ἀταξίας, ἔστ᾽ ᾶν δὲ ἢ χειμῶνα ἢ πολεμίους δείσωσιν, οὐ μόνον τὰ κελευόμενα πάντα ποιοῦσιν, ἀλλὰ καὶ σιγῶσι καραδοκοῦντες τὰ προσταχθησόμενα, ὥσπερ χορευταί.

Άλλὰ μήν, ἔφη ὁ Περικλῆς, εἴ γε νῦν μάλιστα πείθοιντο, ὥρα ἃν εἴη λέγειν, πῶς ἃν αὐτοὺς προτρεψαίμεθα πάλιν ἀνερασθῆναι τῆς ἀρχαίας ἀρετῆς τε καὶ εὐκλείας καὶ εὐδαιμονίας.

Οὐκοῦν, ἔφη ὁ Σωκράτης, εἰ μὲν ἐβουλόμεθα χρημάτων αὐτοὺς ὧν οἱ ἄλλοι εἶχον ἀντιποιεῖσθαι,
ἀποδεικνύντες αὐτοῖς ταῦτα πατρῷά τε ὅντα καὶ
προσήκοντα μάλιστ' ἂν οὕτως αὐτοὺς ἐξορμῷμεν
ἀντέχεσθαι τούτων ἐπεὶ δὲ τοῦ μετ' ἀρετῆς πρωτεύειν
αὐτοὺς ἐπιμελεῖσθαι βουλόμεθα, τοῦτ' αὖ δεικτέον ἐκ

5

7

### MEMORABILIA III 54-58

dare, even in their own country, to face the Athenians without help from Sparta and the rest of the Peloponnese, threaten to invade Attica by themselves, and the Athenians, who formerly overran Boeotia, fear that the Boeotians may plunder Attica."

"I am quite aware of that," answered Socrates; "but the disposition of our city is now more to a good ruler's liking. For confidence breeds carelessness, slackness, disobedience: fear makes men more attentive, more obedient, more amenable to discipline. The behavior of sailors is a case in point: so long as they have nothing to fear they are, I believe, an unruly lot, but when they expect a storm or an attack not only do they carry out all orders, but they watch in silence for the word of command like choristers."

"Well," said Pericles, "if they are now in the mood for obedience, it seems time to say how we can revive in them a longing for the old excellence and fame and happiness."

"If then," said Socrates, "we wanted them to claim money that others held, the best way of egging them on to seize it would be to show them that it was their fathers' money and belongs to them. As we want them to strive for preeminence in excellence, we must show that this be-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> del. Cobet

παλαιοῦ μάλιστα προσήκον αὐτοῖς καὶ ὡς τούτου ἐπιμελόμενοι πάντων ἂν εἶεν κράτιστοι.

Πῶς οὖν ἂν τοῦτο διδάσκοιμεν;

Οἷμαι μέν, εἰ τούς γε παλαιοτάτους ὧν ἀκούομεν προγόνους αὐτῶν ἀναμιμνήσκοιμεν αὐτοὺς ἀκηκοότας ἀρίστους γεγονέναι.

<sup>9</sup>Αρα λέγεις τὴν τῶν θεῶν κρίσιν, ἣν οἱ περὶ Κέκροπα δι' ἀρετὴν ἔκριναν;

Λέγω γάρ, καὶ τὴν Ἐρεχθέως γε τροφὴν καὶ γένεσιν καὶ τὸν πόλεμον τὸν ἐπ' ἐκείνου γενόμενον πρὸς τοὺς ἐκ τῆς ἐχομένης ἤπείρου πάσης καὶ τὸν ἐφ' Ἡρακλειδῶν πρὸς τοὺς ἐν Πελοποννήσω καὶ πάντας τοὺς ἐπὶ Θησέως πολεμηθέντας, ἐν οἶς πᾶσιν ἐκείνοι δῆλοι γεγόνασι τῶν καθ' ἑαυτοὺς ἀνθρώπων ἀριστεύσαντες· εἰ δὲ βούλει, ἃ ὕστερον οἱ ἐκείνων μὲν ἀπόγονοι, οὐ πολὺ δὲ πρὸ ἡμῶν γεγονότες ἔπραξαν, τὰ μὲν αὐτοὶ καθ' αὐτοὺς ἀγωνιζόμενοι πρὸς τοὺς κυριεύοντας τῆς τε ᾿Ασίας πάσης καὶ τῆς Εὐρώπης μέχρι Μακεδονίας καὶ πλείστην τῶν προγεγονότων δύναμιν καὶ ἀφορμὴν κεκτημένους καὶ μέγιστα ἔργα κατειργασμένους, τὰ δὲ καὶ μετὰ Πελοποννησίων ἀριστεύοντες καὶ κατὰ γῆν καὶ κατὰ θάλατταν· οἳ δὴ καὶ λέγονται πολὺ διενεγκεῖν τῶν καθ' αὐτοὺς ἀνθρώπων.

Λέγονται γάρ, ἔφη.

Τοιγαροῦν πολλῶν μὲν μεταναστάσεων ἐν τῆ Ἑλ-

9

10

11

 $<sup>^{\</sup>rm 15}\,\rm When$  Poseidon and Athena contested the possession of Attica.

#### MEMORABILIA III. 5.8-5.12

longed to them in the old days and that by striving for it they will surpass all other men."

"How then can we teach this?"

9

"I think by reminding them that their earliest ancestors of whom we have any account were, as they themselves have been told, the most valiant."

"Do you refer to the judgment of the gods, which Cecrops delivered in his court because of his excellence?" <sup>15</sup>

10

11

"Yes, and the care and birth of Erectheus, <sup>16</sup> and the war waged in his day with all the adjacent country, and the war between the sons of Heracles<sup>17</sup> and the Peloponnesians, and all the wars waged in the days of Theseus, <sup>18</sup> in all of which they were manifest champions among the men of their time. You may add the victories of their descendants, <sup>19</sup> who lived not long before our own day: some they gained unaided in their struggle with the lords of all Asia and of Europe as far as Macedonia, the owners of more power and wealth than the world had ever seen, who had wrought deeds that none had equaled; in others they were fellow champions with the Peloponnesians both on land and sea. These men, like their fathers, are reported to have been far superior to all other men of their time."

"Yes, that is their reputation."

"Therefore, though there have been many migrations

12

 $^{16}\,\mathrm{Born}$  from the earth and reared by Athena, cf. Hom. Il. 546 ff.

 $^{17}$  The Athenians claimed that it was through their assistance that the sons of Heracles gained the victory (Hdt. 9.27).

<sup>18</sup> Against the Amazons and Thracians.

<sup>19</sup> In the great Persian wars.

λάδι γεγονυιῶν διέμειναν ἐν τἢ ἑαυτῶν, πολλοὶ δὲ ὑπὲρ δικαίων ἀντιλέγοντες ἐπέτρεπον ἐκείνοις, πολλοὶ δὲ ὑπὸ κρειττόνων ὑβριζόμενοι κατέφευγον πρὸς ἐκείνους.

Καὶ ὁ Περικλης, Καὶ θαυμάζω γ', ἔφη, ὧ Σώκρατες, ή πόλις ὅπως ποτ' ἐπὶ τὸ χεῖρον ἔκλινεν.

Έγω μέν, ἔφη, οἶμαι, ὁ Σωκράτης, ὥσπερ καὶ ἀθληταί τινες διὰ τὸ πολὺ ὑπερενεγκεῖν καὶ κρατιστεῦσαι καταρραθυμήσαντες ὑστερίζουσι τῶν ἀντιπάλων, οὕτω καὶ ᾿Αθηναίους πολὺ διενεγκόντας ἀμελῆσαι ἑαυτῶν καὶ διὰ τοῦτο χείρους γεγονέναι.

Νῦν οὖν, ἔφη, τί ἂν ποιοῦντες ἀναλάβοιεν τὴν ἀρχαίαν ἀρετήν;

Καὶ ὁ Σωκράτης· Οὐδὲν ἀπόκρυφον δοκεῖ μοι εἶναι, ἀλλ' εἰ μὲν ἐξευρόντες τὰ τῶν προγόνων ἐπιτηδεύματα μηδὲν χεῖρον ἐκείνων ἐπιτηδεύοιεν, οὐδὲν ἂν χείρους ἐκείνων γενέσθαι· εἰ δὲ μή, τούς γε νῦν πρωτεύοντας μιμούμενοι καὶ τούτοις τὰ αὐτὰ ἐπιτηδεύοντες, ὁμοίως μὲν τοῖς αὐτοῖς χρώμενοι οὐδὲν ἂν χείρους ἐκείνων εἶεν, εἰ δ' ἐπιμελέστερον, καὶ βελτίους.

Λέγεις, ἔφη, πόρρω που εἶναι τῆ πόλει τὴν καλοκἀγαθίαν. πότε γὰρ οὕτως ᾿Αθηναῖοι ὥσπερ Λακεδαιμόνιοι ἢ πρεσβυτέρους αἰδέσονται, οἳ ἀπὸ τῶν πατέρων ἄρχονται καταφρονεῖν τῶν γεραιτέρων, ἢ σωμασκήσουσιν οὕτως, οἳ οὐ μόνον αὐτοὶ εὐεξίας ἀμελοῦσιν, ἀλλὰ καὶ τῶν ἐπιμελομένων καταγελῶσι; πότε δὲ οὕτω πείσονται τοῖς ἄρχουσιν, οἳ καὶ ἀγάλλονται ἐπὶ τῷ καταφρονεῖν τῶν ἀρχόντων, ἢ πότε

13

14

15

## MEMORABILIA III. 5.12-5.16

in Greece, they continued to inhabit their own land: many referred to them their rival claims, many found a refuge with them from the brutality of oppressors."

"Yes, Socrates," said Pericles, "and I wonder how our 13

city can have declined so badly."

"My own view," replied Socrates, "is that as a consequence of their great superiority the Athenians grew careless of themselves and have thus fallen into decline, much as athletes who are in a class by themselves and easily win the championship are apt to grow slack and fall behind their rivals."

"How, then, can they now recover their old excellence?"

"I see no mystery about it. If they find out the practices of their ancestors and practice them as well as they did, they will come to be as good as they were; or failing that, they need but to imitate those who now hold preeminence and follow their practices, and if they are equally careful in observing them, they will be as good as they, and, if more careful, even better."

"You're talking about perfection being a long way off for our city. For when will Athenians show the Spartan reverence for age, seeing that they despise all their elders, beginning with their own fathers? When will they adopt the Spartan system of training, seeing that they not only neglect to make themselves fit, but laugh at those who take the trouble to do so? When will they reach that standard of obedience to their rulers, seeing that they make con-

209

14

15

οὕτως ὁμονοήσουσιν, οἴ γε ἀντὶ μὲν τοῦ συνεργεῖν ἐαυτοῖς τὰ συμφέροντα ἐπηρεάζουσιν ἀλλήλοις καὶ φθονοῦσιν ἑαυτοῖς μᾶλλον ἢ τοῖς ἄλλοις ἀνθρώποις, μάλιστα δὲ πάντων ἔν τε ταῖς ἰδίαις συνόδοις καὶ ταῖς κοιναῖς διαφέρονται· καὶ πλείστας δίκας ἀλλήλοις δικάζονται καὶ προαιροῦνται μᾶλλον οὕτω κερδαίνειν ἀπ' ἀλλήλων ἢ συνωφελοῦντες αὐτούς, τοῖς δὲ κοινοῖς ὥσπερ ἀλλοτρίοις χρώμενοι περὶ τούτων αὖ μάχονται καὶ ταῖς εἰς τὰ τοιαῦτα δυνάμεσι μάλιστα χαίρουσιν; ἐξ ὧν πολλὴ μὲν ἀτηρία καὶ κακία τἢ πόλει ἐμφύεται, πολλὴ δὲ ἔχθρα καὶ μῦσος ἀλλήλων τοῖς πολίταις ἐγγίγνεται, δι' ἃ ἔγωγε μάλα φοβοῦμαι ἀεί, μή τι μεῖζον ἢ ὥστε φέρειν δύνασθαι κακὸν τἢ πόλει συμβŷ.

Μηδαμῶς, ἔφη ὁ Σωκράτης, ὧ Περίκλεις, οὕτως ἡγοῦ ἀνηκέστῳ πονηρία νοσεῖν ἀθηναίους. οὐχ ὁρᾳς, ὡς εὕτακτοι μέν εἰσιν ἐν τοῖς ναυτικοῖς, εὐτάκτως δ' ἐν τοῖς γυμνικοῖς ἀγῶσι πείθονται τοῖς ἐπιστάταις, οὐδένων δὲ καταδεέστερον ἐν τοῖς χοροῖς ὑπηρετοῦσι τοῖς διδασκάλοις:

19 Τοῦτο γάρ τοι, ἔφη, καὶ θαυμαστόν ἐστι, τὸ τοὺς μὲν τοιούτους πειθαρχεῖν τοῖς ἐφεστῶσι, τοὺς δὲ ὁπλίτας καὶ τοὺς ἱππεῖς, οῖ δοκοῦσι καλοκάγαθίᾳ προκεκρίσθαι τῶν πολιτῶν, ἀπειθεστάτους εἶναι πάντων.

Καὶ ὁ Σωκράτης ἔφη· Ἡ δὲ ἐν Ἡρείῳ πάγῳ βουλή, ὧ Περίκλεις, οὐκ ἐκ τῶν δεδοκιμασμένων καθίσταται; Καὶ μάλα, ἔφη.

17

18

## MEMORABILIA III. 5.16-5.20

tempt of rulers a point of honor? Or when will they attain that harmony, seeing that instead of working together for the general good<sup>20</sup> they are more envious and bitter against one another than against the rest of the world, are the most quarrelsome of men in public and private assemblies, most often go to law with one another, and would rather make profit from one another that way than by mutual service, and while regarding public affairs as alien to themselves yet fight over them too, and find their chief enjoyment in having the means to carry on such strife? So it happens that mischief and evil grow abundantly in the city, enmity and mutual hatred spring up among the people, so that I am always dreading that some unbearable evil may befall the city."

"No no, Pericles, don't think the wickedness of the Athenians so utterly past remedy. Don't you see what good discipline they maintain in their fleets, how well they obey the umpires in athletic contests, how they take orders from the chorus trainers as readily as any?"

"Ah yes, and it's strange indeed that such groups submit themselves to their masters, and yet the infantry and cavalry, who are supposed to be the pick of the citizens for good character, are the most insubordinate."

Then Socrates asked, "But what of the Court of the Areopagus, Pericles? Aren't its members people who have won approval?"

"Certainly."

20 Cyr. 8.1.2.

17

18

19

Οἶσθα οὖν τινας, ἔφη, κάλλιον ἢ νομιμώτερον ἢ σεμνότερον ἢ δικαιότερον τάς τε δίκας δικάζοντας καὶ τἆλλα πάντα πράττοντας;

Οὐ μέμφομαι, ἔφη, τούτοις.

Οὐ τοίνυν, ἔφη, δεῖ ἀθυμεῖν ὡς οὐκ εὐτάκτων ὄντων Ἀθηναίων.

Καὶ μὴν ἔν γε τοῖς στρατιωτικοῖς, ἔφη, ἔνθα μάλιστα δεῖ σωφρονεῖν τε καὶ εὐτακτεῖν καὶ πειθαρχεῖν, οὐδενὶ τούτων προσέχουσιν.

Ίσως γάρ, ἔφη ὁ Σωκράτης, ἐν τούτοις οἱ ἥκιστα έπιστάμενοι ἄρχουσιν αὐτῶν, οὐχ ὁρᾶς ὅτι κιθαριστών μεν καὶ χορευτών καὶ ὀρχηστών οὐδε εἶς ἐπιχειρεί ἄρχειν μη έπιστάμενος ούδε παλαιστών ούδε παγκρατιαστών; άλλὰ πάντες οἱ τούτων ἄρχοντες έχουσι δείξαι, όπόθεν έμαθον ταῦτα, ἐφ' οἷς ἐφεστάσι των δε στρατηγών οι πλείστοι αὐτοσχεδιάζουσιν. οὐ μέντοι σέ γε τοιοῦτον ἐγὼ νομίζω εἶναι, ἀλλ' οἷμαί σε οὐδὲν ήττον ἔχειν εἰπεῖν, ὁπότε στρατηγεῖν η όπότε παλαίειν ήρξω μανθάνειν καὶ πολλὰ μὲν οἷμαί σε τῶν πατρώων στρατηγημάτων παρειληφότα διασώζειν, πολλά δὲ πανταχόθεν συνηχέναι, ὁπόθεν οἷόν τε ἦν μαθεῖν τι εἰς στρατηγίαν ὡφέλιμον. οἶμαι δέ σε πολλὰ μεριμνᾶν, ὅπως μὴ λάθης σεαυτὸν άγνοῶν τι τῶν εἰς στρατηγίαν ὡφελίμων, καὶ ἐάν τι τοιούτον αἴσθη σεαυτὸν μὴ εἰδότα, ζητεῖν τοὺς ἐπισταμένους ταῦτα, οὔτε δώρων οὔτε χαρίτων φειδόμενον, ὅπως μάθης παρ' αὐτῶν ἃ μὴ ἐπίστασαι καὶ συνεργούς άγαθούς έχης.

21

22

## MEMORABILIA III. 5.20-5.23

"Then do you know of any who decide the cases that come before them and perform all their other functions more honorably, more in accordance with law, with more dignity and justice?"

"I am not finding fault with the Areopagus."

"Then you must not despair of Athenian discipline."

"But look, in the army, where good conduct, discipline, submission are most necessary, our people pay no attention to them."

ne, 21 n-

"This," said Socrates, "may be due to the incompetence of their officers. You must have noticed that no one attempts to exercise authority over our harpists, choristers and dancers if he is incompetent, nor over wrestlers or pancratiasts? All who have authority over them can tell where they learned their business; but most of our generals are improvisers. I don't, however, suppose you are one of this sort, and I imagine you're as sure about when you began to learn strategy as when you began wrestling. Many of the principles, I think, you have inherited from your father, and many others you have gathered from every source from which you could learn anything useful to a general. I think, too, that you are very careful not unconsciously to lack any knowledge useful to a general; and if you find that you don't know something you seek out those who do know, grudging neither gifts nor thanks so as to learn from them what you don't know and get the benefit of good coaching."

23

24 Καὶ ὁ Περικλῆς, Οὐ λανθάνεις με, ὧ Σώκρατες, ἔφη, ὅτι οὐδ' οἰόμενός με τούτων ἐπιμελεῖσθαι ταῦτα λέγεις, ἀλλ' ἐγχειρῶν με διδάσκειν, ὅτι τὸν μέλλοντα στρατηγεῖν τούτων ἀπάντων ἐπιμελεῖσθαι δεῖ. ὁμολογῶ μέντοι κἀγώ σοι ταῦτα.

Τοῦτο δ', ἔφη, ὧ Περίκλεις, κατανενόηκας, ὅτι πρόκειται τῆς χώρας ἡμῶν ὅρη μεγάλα, καθήκοντα ἐπὶ τὴν Βοιωτίαν, δι' ὧν εἰς τὴν χώραν εἴσοδοι στεναί τε καὶ προσάντεις εἰσί, καὶ ὅτι μέση διέζωσται ὅρεσιν ἐρυμνοῖς;

Καὶ μάλα, ἔφη.

25

26

27

28

Τί δέ; ἐκεῖνο ἀκήκοας, ὅτι Μυσοὶ καὶ Πισίδαι ἐν τἢ βασιλέως χώρα κατέχοντες ἐρυμνὰ πάνυ χωρία καὶ κούφως ὡπλισμένοι δύνανται πολλὰ μὲν τὴν βασιλέως χώραν καταθέοντες κακοποιεῖν, αὐτοὶ δὲ ζῆν ἐλεύθεροι;

Καὶ τοῦτό γ', ἔφη, ἀκούω.

'Αθηναίους δ' οὐκ ἂν οἴει, ἔφη, μέχρι τῆς ἐλαφρᾶς ἡλικίας ὡπλισμένους κουφοτέροις ὅπλοις καὶ τὰ προκείμενα τῆς χώρας ὅρη κατέχοντας βλαβεροὺς μὲν τοῖς πολεμίοις εἶναι, μεγάλην δὲ προβολὴν τοῖς πολίταις τῆς χώρας κατεσκευάσθαι;

Καὶ ὁ Περικλῆς, Πάντ'<sup>4</sup> οἶμαι, ἔφη, ὧ Σώκρατες, καὶ ταῦτα χρήσιμα εἶναι.

Εἰ τοίνυν, ἔφη ὁ Σωκράτης, ἀρέσκει σοι ταῦτα, ἐπιχείρει αὐτοῖς, ὡ ἄριστε· ὅ τι μὲν γὰρ ἂν τούτων καταπράξης, καὶ σοὶ καλὸν ἔσται καὶ τῆ πόλει ἀγαθον· ἐὰν δέ τι αὐτῶν ἀδυνατῆς, οὕτε τὴν πόλιν βλάψεις οὕτε σαυτὸν καταισχυνεῖς.

#### MEMORABILIA III, 5,24-5,28

"I can see, Socrates, that in saying this you don't really think I study these things but are trying to show me that one who is going to command an army must study all of them; and of course I admit that you are right." 24

"Have you observed, Pericles, that our frontier is protected by great mountains extending to Boeotia, through which there are steep and narrow passes leading into our land, and that the interior is cut across by rugged mountains?"

25

"Certainly."

26

"Further, have you heard that the Mysians and Pisidians, occupying very rugged country in the Great King's territory and lightly armed, manage to overrun and damage the King's territory and to preserve their own freedom?" <sup>21</sup>

27

"Yes, I have heard that."

. .

"And don't you think that active young Athenians, more lightly armed and occupying the mountains that protect our country, would prove a thorn in the side of the enemy and a strong bulwark of defense to our people?"

"Socrates," replied Pericles, "I think all these suggestions too have a practical value."

"Well, since you like them, adopt them, sir. Any part of them that you carry out will bring honor to you and good to the state; and should you fail in part, you will neither harm the state nor disgrace yourself."

28

<sup>21</sup> An. 2.5.13.

<sup>4</sup> Πάνν Hude

6. Γλαύκωνα δὲ τὸν ᾿Αρίστωνος, ὅτ᾽ ἐπεχείρει δημηγορεῖν, ἐπιθυμῶν προστατεύειν τῆς πόλεως οὐδέπω εἴκοσιν ἔτη γεγονώς, τῶν ἄλλων οἰκείων τε καὶ φίλων οὐδεὶς ἐδύνατο παῦσαι ἐλκόμενόν τε ἀπὸ τοῦ βήματος καὶ καταγέλαστον ὅντα· Σωκράτης δὲ εὔνους ὢν αὐτῷ διά τε Χαρμίδην τὸν Γλαύκωνος καὶ διὰ Πλάτωνα μόνος ἔπαυσεν.

Έντυχων γὰρ αὐτῷ πρῶτον μὲν εἰς τὸ ἐθελῆσαι ἀκούειν τοιάδε λέξας κατέσχεν <sup>\*</sup>Ω Γλαύκων, ἔφη, προστατεύειν ἡμῖν διανενόησαι τῆς πόλεως;

"Εγωγ', έφη, ὧ Σώκρατες.

Νὴ Δί, ἔφη, καλὸν γάρ, εἴπερ τι καὶ ἄλλο τῶν ἐν ἀνθρώποις. δῆλον γάρ, ὅτι ἐὰν τοῦτο διαπράξη, δυνατὸς μὲν ἔση αὐτὸς τυγχάνειν ὅτου ἃν ἐπιθυμῆς, ἱκανὸς δὲ τοὺς φίλους ὡφελεῖν, ἐπαρεῖς δὲ τὸν πατρῷον οἶκον, αὐξήσεις δὲ τὴν πατρίδα, ὀνομαστὸς δ' ἔση πρῶτον μὲν ἐν τῆ πόλει, ἔπειτα ἐν τῆ Ἑλλάδι, ἴσως δὲ ὥσπερ Θεμιστοκλῆς καὶ ἐν τοῖς βαρβάροις· ὅπου δ' ἂν ἦς, πανταχοῦ περίβλεπτος ἔση.

Ταῦτ' οὖν ἀκούων ὁ Γλαύκων ἐμεγαλύνετο καὶ ἡδέως παρέμενε.

Μετὰ δὲ ταῦτα ὁ Σωκράτης, Οὐκοῦν, ἔφη, τοῦτο μέν, ὧ Γλαύκων, δῆλον, ὅτι εἴπερ τιμᾶσθαι βούλει, ὡφελητέα σοι ἡ πόλις ἐστί;

Πάνυ μεν οὖν, ἔφη.

Πρὸς θεῶν, ἔφη, μὴ τοίνυν ἀποκρύψη, ἀλλ' εἶπον ἡμῖν, ἐκ τίνος ἄρξη τὴν πόλιν εὐεργετεῖν.

4 Έπεὶ δὲ ὁ Γλαύκων διεσιώπησεν, ὡς ἂν τότε σκο-

2

6. Ariston's son, Glaucon, was attempting to become an orator and striving for leadership in the state, though he was less than twenty years old; and none of his friends or relations could dissuade him, though he would get himself dragged from the platform and make himself a laughingstock. Only Socrates, who took an interest in him for the sake of Plato and Glaucon's<sup>22</sup> son Charmides, managed to dissuade him.

For once on meeting him, he stopped him and managed to engage his attention by saying: "Glaucon, have you made up your mind to be our head of state?"

"I have. Socrates."

"Well, there's certainly no more honorable ambition in the world; for obviously, if you succeed you will be able to get whatever you want, and you will have the means of helping your friends: you will lift up your father's house and exalt your fatherland; and you will make a name for yourself first at home, later on in Greece, and possibly, like Themistocles, in foreign lands as well; wherever you go, vou will be a celebrity."

When Glaucon heard this, he felt proud and gladly lingered.

Next Socrates asked, "Well, Glaucon, since you want to win honor, isn't it obvious that you must benefit your city?" "Most certainly."

"Please don't be reticent then, but tell us how you propose to begin your services to the state."

When Glaucon remained dumb, apparently consider-

22 I.e., the elder Glaucon. This is the only mention of Plato in Xenophon's works.

2

πῶν, ὁπόθεν ἄρχοιτο, ᾿Αρ᾽, ἔφη ὁ Σωκράτης, ὥσπερ φίλου οἶκον εἰ αὐξῆσαι βούλοιο, πλουσιώτερον αὐτὸν ἐπιχειροίης ἂν ποιεῖν, οὕτω καὶ τὴν πόλιν πειράση πλουσιωτέραν ποιῆσαι;

Πάνυ μεν οὖν, έφη.

Οὐκοῦν πλουσιωτέρα γ' ἂν εἴη προσόδων αὐτῆ πλειόνων γενομένων;

Εἰκὸς γοῦν, ἔφη.

5

Λέξον δή, ἔφη, ἐκ τίνων νῦν αἱ πρόσοδοι τἢ πόλει καὶ πόσαι τινές εἰσι; δῆλον γάρ, ὅτι ἔσκεψαι, ἵνα εἰ μέν τινες αὐτῶν ἐνδεῶς ἔχουσιν, ἐκπληρώσης, εἰ δὲ παραλείπονται, προσπορίσης.

ἀλλὰ μὰ Δί , ἔφη ὁ Γλαύκων, ταῦτά γε οὐκ ἐπέσκεμμαι.

'Αλλ' εἰ τοῦτο, ἔφη, παρέλιπες, τάς γε δαπάνας τῆς πόλεως ἡμῖν εἰπέ· δῆλον γάρ, ὅτι καὶ τούτων τὰς περιττὰς ἀφαιρεῖν διανοεῖ.

'Αλλὰ μὰ τὸν Δί', ἔφη, οὐδὲ πρὸς ταῦτά πω ἐσχόλασα.

Οὐκοῦν, ἔφη, τὸ μὲν πλουσιωτέραν τὴν πόλιν ποιεῖν ἀναβαλούμεθα· πῶς γὰρ οἶόν τε μὴ εἰδότα γε τὰ ἀναλώματα καὶ τὰς προσόδους ἐπιμεληθῆναι τούτων;

'Αλλ', ὧ Σώκρατες, ἔφη ὁ Γλαύκων, δυνατόν ἐστι καὶ ἀπὸ πολεμίων τὴν πόλιν πλουτίζειν.

Νὴ Δία σφόδρα γ', ἔφη ὁ Σωκράτης, ἐάν τις αὐτῶν κρείττων ἦ· ἥττων δὲ ὢν καὶ τὰ ὄντα προσαποβάλοι ἄν.

Άλη $\theta$ η λέγεις, ἔφη.

#### MEMORABILIA III. 6.4-6.7

ing for the first time how to begin, Socrates said: "If you wanted to add to a friend's fortune, you would set about making him richer. Will you try, then, to make your city richer?"

"Certainly."

"Wouldn't she be richer if she had a larger revenue?" "She probably would."

"Now tell me, from what sources are the city's revenues at present derived and what is their total? No doubt you have gone into this matter in order to raise the amount of any that are deficient and supply any that are lacking."

"Why, no," said Glaucon, "I haven't gone into that."

"Well, if you have left that out, tell us the expenditures of the city; no doubt you intend to cut back any that are excessive."

"The fact is, I haven't had time for that either."

"Oh, then we'll postpone the matter of making the city richer; for how is it possible to look after income and expenditure without knowing what they are?"

"Well, Socrates, one can make enemies contribute to the city's wealth."

"Yes of course, provided he is stronger than they; but if he be weaker he may lose what the city has got instead."

"True."

Οὐκοῦν, ἔφη, τόν γε βουλευσόμενον, πρὸς οὕστινας δεῖ πολεμεῖν, τήν τε τῆς πόλεως δύναμιν καὶ τὴν τῶν ἐναντίων εἰδέναι δεῖ, ἴνα ἐὰν μὲν ἡ τῆς πόλεως κρείττων ἢ, συμβουλεύῃ ἐπιχειρεῖν τῷ πολέμῳ, ἐὰν δὲ ἡ τῶν ἐναντίων, εὐλαβεῖσθαι πείθη.

'Ορθῶς λέγεις, ἔφη.

8

9

10

11

Πρώτον μὲν τοίνυν, ἔφη, λέξον ἡμῖν τῆς πόλεως τήν τε πεζικὴν καὶ τὴν ναυτικὴν δύναμιν, εἶτα τὴν τῶν ἐναντίων.

'Αλλὰ μὰ τὸν Δί', ἔφη, οὐκ ἂν ἔχοιμί σοι οὕτω γε ἀπὸ στόματος εἰπεῖν.

'Αλλ' εἰ γέγραπταί σοι, ἔνεγκε, ἔφη· πάνυ γὰρ ἡδέως ἂν τοῦτο ἀκούσαιμι.

Άλλὰ μὰ τὸν Δί', ἔφη, οὐδὲ γέγραπταί μοί πω.

Οὐκοῦν, ἔφη, καὶ περὶ πολέμου συμβουλεύειν τήν γε πρώτην ἐπισχήσομεν ἴσως γὰρ καὶ διὰ τὸ μέγεθος αὐτῶν ἄρτι ἀρχόμενος τῆς προστατείας οὔπω ἐξήτακας. ἀλλά τοι περί γε φυλακῆς τῆς χώρας οἶδ ὅτι σοι ἤδη μεμέληκε καὶ οἶσθα, ὁπόσαι τε φυλακαὶ ἐπίκαιροί εἰσι καὶ ὁπόσαι μὴ καὶ ὁπόσοι τε φρουροὶ ἱκανοί εἰσι καὶ ὁπόσοι μή εἰσι καὶ τὰς μὲν ἐπικαίρους φυλακὰς συμβουλεύσεις μείζονας ποιεῖν, τὰς δὲ περιττὰς ἀφαιρεῖν.

Νὴ Δί', ἔφη ὁ Γλαύκων, ἁπάσας μὲν οὖν ἔγωγε ἕνεκά γε τοῦ οὕτως αὐτὰς φυλάττεσθαι, ὥστε κλέπτεσθαι τὰ ἐκ τῆς χώρας.

Έαν δέ τις ἀφέλη γ', ἔφη, τὰς φυλακάς, οὐκ οἴει καὶ ἀρπάζειν ἐξουσίαν ἔσεσθαι τῶ βουλομένω; ἀτάρ,

## MEMORABILIA III. 6.8-6.11

"Therefore, in order to advise about whom to fight, it is necessary to know the city's strength and the enemy's, so that if the city is stronger one may recommend going to war, but if weaker, being cautious."

"You are right."

"First then, tell us the naval and military strength of 9 our city, and then that of her enemies."

"No, of course I can't tell you out of my head."

"Well, if you have made notes, fetch them, for I would greatly like to hear this."

"But, I tell you, I haven't made any notes either."

"Then we will postpone offering advice about war too for the present. You are new to power and perhaps haven't had time to investigate such big problems. But the defense of the country, now, I feel sure you have thought about that, and know how many of the garrisons are well placed and how many are not, and how many of the guards are efficient and how many are not; and you will propose to strengthen the well-placed garrisons and eliminate the superfluous ones."

"No no; I will propose to eliminate them all, for the only effect of maintaining them is that our crops are stolen."

"But if you eliminate the garrisons, don't you think that anyone will be at liberty to rob us openly? However, have 10

έφη, πότερον έλθων αὐτὸς έξήτακας τοῦτο ἢ πως οἶσθα, ὅτι κακῶς φυλάττονται;

Εἰκάζω, ἔφη.

12

13

Οὐκοῦν, ἔφη, καὶ περὶ τούτων, ὅταν μηκέτι εἰκάζωμεν, ἀλλ' ἤδη εἰδῶμεν, τότε συμβουλεύσομεν;

"Ισως, έφη ὁ Γλαύκων, βέλτιον.

Εἴς γε μήν, ἔφη, τἀργύρεια οἶδ' ὅτι οὐκ ἀφῖξαι, ὥστ' ἔχειν εἰπεῖν, διότι νῦν ἐλάττω ἢ πρόσθεν προσέρχεται αὐτόθεν.

Οὐ γὰρ οὖν ἐλήλυθα, ἔφη.

Καὶ γὰρ νὴ Δι', ἔφη ὁ Σωκράτης, λέγεται βαρὺ τὸ χωρίον εἶναι, ὥστε ὅταν περὶ τούτου δέῃ συμβουλεύειν, αὕτη σοι ἡ πρόφασις ἀρκέσει.

Σκώπτομαι, ἔφη ὁ Γλαύκων.

'Αλλ' ἐκείνου γέ τοι, ἔφη, οἶδ' ὅτι οὐκ ἠμέληκας, ἀλλ' ἔσκεψαι, πόσον χρόνον ἰκανός ἐστιν ὁ ἐκ τῆς χώρας γιγνόμενος σῖτος διατρέφειν τὴν πόλιν καὶ πόσου εἰς τὸν ἐνιαυτὸν προσδεῖται, ἵνα μὴ τούτου γε λάθη σέ ποτε ἡ πόλις ἐνδεὴς γενομένη, ἀλλ' εἰδὼς ἔχης ὑπὲρ τῶν ἀναγκαίων συμβουλεύων τῆ πόλει βοηθεῖν τε καὶ σώζειν αὐτήν.

Λέγεις, ἔφη ὁ Γλαύκων, παμμέγεθες πρᾶγμα, εἴ γε καὶ τῶν τοιούτων ἐπιμελεῖσθαι δεήσει.

## MEMORABILIA III. 6.11-6.14

you been on a tour of inspection, or how do you know that they are badly maintained?"

"By guesswork."

"Then will we wait to offer advice on this question too until we really know, instead of merely guessing?"

"Perhaps it would be better."

"Now for the silver mines. I am sure you haven't visited them and so can't say why the amount derived from them has fallen."

"No indeed. I haven't been there."

"Of course not: the district is considered unhealthy, and so when you have to offer advice on the problem this excuse will serve."

"You're teasing me."

"Oh but there's one problem I feel sure you haven't overlooked: no doubt you have calculated how long the grain grown in the country will maintain the population and how much is needed annually, so that should the city at any time run short you will not be caught napping but come to the rescue and relieve the city by giving expert advice about food."

"You're talking about an overwhelming task, if one must include things like that in one's duties!"

"But you know, no one will ever manage even his own household successfully unless he knows all its needs and sees that they are all supplied. Seeing that our city contains more than ten thousand houses, and it is difficult to look after so many families at once, you must have tried to

223

12

13

οἴκων ἐπιμελεῖσθαι, πῶς οὐχ ἔνα τὸν τοῦ θείου πρῶτον ἐπειράθης αὐξῆσαι; δεῖται δέ. κἂν μὲν τοῦτον δύνη, καὶ πλείοσιν ἐπιχειρήσεις· ἔνα δὲ μὴ δυνάμενος ἀφελῆσαι πῶς ἂν πολλούς γε δυνηθείης; ὥσπερ εἴ τις εν τάλαντον μὴ δύναιτο φέρειν, πῶς οὐ φανερόν, ὅτι πλείω γε φέρειν οὐδ' ἐπιχειρητέον αὐτῷ;

'Αλλ' έγωγ', έφη ὁ Γλαύκων, ώφελοίην ἂν τὸν τοῦ θείου οἶκον, εἴ μοι ἐθέλοι πείθεσθαι.

Είτα, ἔφη ὁ Σωκράτης, τὸν θείον οὐ δυνάμενος πείθειν Άθηναίους πάντας μετὰ τοῦ θείου νομίζεις δυνήσεσθαι ποιήσαι πείθεσθαί σοι; φυλάττου, έφη, ὧ Γλαύκων, ὅπως μὴ τοῦ εὐδοξεῖν ἐπιθυμῶν εἰς τοὐναντίον έλθης. η ούχ όρας, ως σφαλερόν έστι τὸ α μη οἶδέ τις, ταῦτα ἢ λέγειν ἢ πράττειν; ἐνθυμοῦ δὲ τῶν άλλων, όσους οἶσθα τοιούτους, οἷοι φαίνονται καὶ λέγοντες ἃ μὴ ἴσασι καὶ πράττοντες, πότερά σοι δοκοῦσιν ἐπὶ τοῖς τοιούτοις ἐπαίνου μᾶλλον ἢ ψόγου τυγχάνειν καὶ πότερον θαυμάζεσθαι μᾶλλον ἢ κατα-Φρονείσθαι ένθυμοῦ δὲ καὶ τῶν εἰδότων ὅ τι τε λέγουσι καὶ ὅ τι ποιοῦσι, καί, ὡς ἐγὼ νομίζω, εύρήσεις έν πᾶσιν ἔργοις τοὺς μὲν εὐδοκιμοῦντάς τε καὶ θαυμαζομένους έκ των μάλιστα έπισταμένων όντας, τούς δὲ κακοδοξοῦντας τε καὶ καταφρονουμένους ἐκ τῶν άμαθεστάτων, εἰ οὖν ἐπιθυμεῖς εὐδοκιμεῖν τε καὶ θανμάζεσθαι έν τη πόλει, πειρώ κατεργάσασθαι ώς μάλιστα τὸ εἰδέναι ἃ βούλει πράττειν ἐὰν γὰρ τούτω διενεγκών των άλλων ἐπιχειρῆς τὰ τῆς πόλεως πράττειν, οὐκ ἂν θαυμάσαιμι, εἰ πάνυ ραδίως τύχοις ὧν έπιθυμείς.

15

16

17

#### MEMORABILIA III. 6.14-6.18

make a start by doing something for one, I mean your uncle's? It needs it; and if you succeed with that one, you can set to work on a larger number. But if you can't do anything for one, how are you going to succeed with many? If a man can't carry one talent it's absurd for him to try to carry more than one, isn't it?"

"Well, I could do something for uncle's household if only he would listen to me."

"What? You can't persuade your uncle, and yet you suppose you will be able to persuade all the Athenians. including your uncle, to listen to you? Do take care, Glaucon, that your daring ambition doesn't lead to a fall! Don't you see how risky it is to say or do what you don't understand? Think of others whom you know to be the sort of men who say and do what they obviously don't understand. Do you think they get praise or blame for it? And think of those who understand what they say and what they do. You will find, I think, that the men who are famous and admired are always among those who have the widest knowledge, and the infamous and despised among the most ignorant. Therefore, if you want to win fame and admiration in public life, try to get a thorough knowledge of what you propose to do. If you enter on a public career with this advantage over others, I should not be surprised if you gained the object of your ambition quite easily."

15

16

17

7. Χαρμίδην δὲ τὸν Γλαύκωνος ὁρῶν ἀξιόλογον μὲν ἄνδρα ὅντα καὶ πολλῷ δυνατώτερον τῶν τὰ πολιτικὰ τότε πραττόντων, ὀκνοῦντα δὲ προσιέναι<sup>5</sup> τῷ δήμῳ καὶ τῶν τῆς πόλεως πραγμάτων ἐπιμελεῖσθαι, Εἰπέ μοι, ἐφη, ὧ Χαρμίδη, εἴ τις ἱκανὸς ὢν τοὺς στεφανίτας ἀγῶνας νικᾶν καὶ διὰ τοῦτο αὐτός τε τιμᾶσθαι καὶ τὴν πατρίδα ἐν τῆ Ἑλλάδι εὐδοκιμωτέραν ποιεῖν μὴ θέλοι ἀγωνίζεσθαι, ποῖόν τινα τοῦτον νομίζοις ἂν τὸν ἄνδρα εἶναι;

Δῆλον ὅτι, ἔφη, μαλακόν τε καὶ δειλόν.

Εἰ δέ τις, ἔφη, δυνατὸς ὢν τῶν τῆς πόλεως πραγμάτων ἐπιμελόμενος τήν τε πόλιν αὕξειν καὶ αὐτὸς διὰ τοῦτο τιμᾶσθαι ὀκνοίη δὴ τοῦτο πράττειν, οὐκ ἂν εἰκότως δειλὸς νομίζοιτο;

Ίσως, ἔφη· ἀτὰρ πρὸς τί με ταῦτ' ἐρωτῷς;

Ότι, ἔφη, οἶμαί σε δυνατὸν ὅντα ὀκνεῖν ἐπιμελεῖσθαι, καὶ ταῦτα ὧν ἀνάγκη σοι μετέχειν πολίτη γε ὅντι.

3 Τὴν δὲ ἐμὴν δύναμιν, ἔφη ὁ Χαρμίδης, ἐν ποίῳ ἔργῳ καταμαθὼν ταῦτά μου καταγιγνώσκεις;

Έν ταῖς συνουσίαις, ἔφη, αἷς σύνει τοῖς τὰ τῆς πόλεως πράττουσι καὶ γὰρ ὅταν τι ἀνακοινῶνταί σοι, ὁρῶ σε καλῶς συμβουλεύοντα καὶ ὅταν τι ἁμαρτάνωσιν, ὀρθῶς ἐπιτιμῶντα.

4 Οὐ ταὐτόν ἐστιν, ἔφη, ὧ Σώκρατες, ἰδία τε διαλέγεσθαι καὶ ἐν τῷ πλήθει ἀγωνίζεσθαι.

Καὶ μήν, ἔφη, ὅ γε ἀριθμεῖν δυνάμενος οὐδὲν ἦττον ἐν τῷ πλήθει ἢ μόνος ἀριθμεῖ καὶ οἱ κατὰ μόνας

# MEMORABILIA III. 7.1-7.4

7. Seeing that Glaucon's son, Charmides, was a respectable man and far more capable than the politicians of the day but nevertheless shrank from speaking in the assembly and taking a part in politics, he said: "Tell me, Charmides, what would you think of a man who was capable of gaining a victory in the great games and consequently of winning honor for himself and adding to his country's fame in the Greek world, and yet refused to compete?"

"I should think him a sissy and a coward, of course."

"Then if a man were to shrink from state business though capable of discharging it with advantage to the state and honor to himself, wouldn't it be reasonable to think him a coward?"

"Perhaps; but why ask me that?"

"Because I think that you shrink from work that is within your powers, work in which it is your duty as a citizen to take a hand."

"What makes you think so? In what sort of work have you discovered my powers?"

"In your associations with public men. Whenever they take counsel with you I find that you give excellent advice, and whenever they make a mistake your criticism is sound."

"A private conversation is a very different thing from a crowded debate, Socrates."

"But look, a man who is good at figures counts as well

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> παριέναι Hude

ἄριστα καθαρίζοντες οὖτοι καὶ ἐν τῷ πλήθει κρατιστεύουσιν.

Αἰδῶ δὲ καὶ φόβον, ἔφη, οὐχ ὁρậς ἔμφυτά τε ἀνθρώποις ὅντα καὶ πολλῷ μᾶλλον ἐν τοῖς ὅχλοις ἢ ἐν ταῖς ἰδίαις ὁμιλίαις παριστάμενα;

Καὶ σέ γε διδάξων, ἔφη, ὥρμημαι, ὅτι οὕτε τοὺς φρονιμωτάτους αίδούμενος ούτε τοὺς ἰσχυροτάτους φοβούμενος έν τοῖς ἀφρονεστάτοις τε καὶ ἀσθενεστάτοις αἰσχύνει λέγειν. πότερον γὰρ τοὺς κναφεῖς αὐτῶν ἢ τοὺς σκυτεῖς ἢ τοὺς τέκτονας ἢ τοὺς χαλκεῖς η τους γεωργούς η τους έμπόρους η τους έν τη άγορα μεταβαλλομένους καὶ φροντίζοντας ὅ τι ἐλάττονος πριάμενοι πλείονος ἀποδώνται αἰσχύνει; ἐκ γὰρ τούτων άπάντων ή έκκλησία συνίσταται. τί δὲ οἴει διαφέρειν δ σὺ ποιεῖς ἢ τῶν ἀσκητῶν ὄντα κρείττω τοὺς ίδιώτας φοβείσθαι; σὺ γὰρ τοῖς πρωτεύουσιν ἐν τῆ πόλει, ὧν ἔνιοι καταφρονοῦσί σου, ραδίως διαλεγόμενος καὶ τῶν ἐπιμελομένων τοῦ τῆ πόλει διαλέγεσθαι πολύ περιων έν τοις μηδεπώποτε φροντίσασι των πολιτικών μηδέ σοῦ καταπεφρονηκόσιν ὀκνεῖς λέγειν δεδιώς, μη καταγελασθής.

Τί δ'; ἔφη, οὐ δοκοῦσί σοι πολλάκις οἱ ἐν τῆ ἐκκλησία τῶν ὀρθῶς λεγόντων καταγελᾶν;

Καὶ γὰρ οἱ ἔτεροι, ἔφη· διὸ καὶ θαυμάζω σου, εἰ ἐκείνους, ὅταν τοῦτο ποιῶσι, ῥαδίως χειρούμενος τούτοις μηδένα τρόπον οἴει δυνήσεσθαι προσενεχθηναι. ἀγαθέ, μὴ ἀγνόει σεαυτὸν μηδὲ ἀμάρτανε ἃ οἱ πλεῖστοι ἁμαρτάνουσιν· οἱ γὰρ πολλοὶ ὡρμηκότες ἐπὶ τὸ

5

6

8

## MEMORABILIA III, 7.4-7.9

in a crowd as in solitude; and those who play the harp best in private excel no less in a crowd."

"But surely you see that bashfulness and timidity come natural to a man and affect him far more powerfully in the presence of a multitude than in private society?"

"Yes, and I mean to give you a lesson. The wisest do not make you bashful and the strongest do not make you timid; yet you are ashamed to address an audience of mere dunces and weaklings. Who are they that make you ashamed? The fullers or the cobblers or the builders or the smiths or the farmers or the merchants, or the traffickers in the marketplace who think of nothing but buying cheap and selling dear? For these are the people who make up the Assembly. You're no different than a man who can beat trained athletes but fears amateurs! You are at your ease when you talk with the first men in the state, some of whom despise you, and you are a far better talker than the ordinary run of politicians; and yet you are shy of addressing people who never gave a thought to public affairs and haven't learned to despise you—all because you fear being laughed at!"

"Well, don't you think those with sound arguments in the Assembly often get laughed at?"

"Yes, and so do the others; and that's why I am surprised that you, who find it easy to manage them when they do it, think you will be quite unable to deal with the Assembly. My good man, don't be ignorant of yourself: don't fall into the common error. For so many are in such

5

σκοπείν τὰ τῶν ἄλλων πράγματα οὐ τρέπονται ἐπὶ τὸ ἐαυτοὺς ἐξετάζειν. μὴ οὖν ἀπορραθύμει τούτου, ἀλλὰ διατείνου μᾶλλον πρὸς τὸ σαυτῷ προσέχειν· καὶ μὴ ἀμέλει τῶν τῆς πόλεως, εἴ τι δυνατόν ἐστι διὰ σὲ βέλτιον ἔχειν. τούτων γὰρ καλῶς ἐχόντων οὐ μόνον οἱ ἄλλοι πολίται, ἀλλὰ καὶ οἱ σοὶ φίλοι καὶ αὐτὸς σὺ οὐκ ἐλάχιστα ἀφελήση.

8. 'Αριστίππου δὲ ἐπιχειροῦντος ἐλέγχειν τὸν Σωκράτην, ὥσπερ αὐτὸς ὑπ' ἐκείνου τὸ πρότερον ἠλέγχετο, βουλόμενος τοὺς συνόντας ὡφελεῖν ὁ Σωκράτης ἀπεκρίνατο οὐχ ὥσπερ οἱ φυλαττόμενοι, μή πη ὁ λόγος ἐπαλλαχθῆ, ἀλλ' ὡς ἂν πεπεισμένοι μάλιστα πράττειν τὰ δέοντα.

Ὁ μὲν γὰρ αὐτὸν ἤρετο, εἴ τι εἰδείη ἀγαθόν, ἵνα εἴ τι εἴποι τῶν τοιούτων, οἶον ἢ σιτίον ἢ ποτὸν ἢ χρήματα ἢ ὑγίειαν ἢ ῥώμην ἢ τόλμαν, δεικνύοι δὴ τοῦτο κακὸν ἐνίοτε ὄν. ὁ δὲ εἰδώς, ὅτι ἐάν τι ἐνοχλῆ ἡμᾶς, δεόμεθα τοῦ παύσοντος, ἀπεκρίνατο ἦπερ καὶ ποιεῖν κράτιστον Ἦρά γε, ἔφη, ἐρωτῆς με, εἴ τι οἶδα πυρετοῦ ἀγαθόν;

Οὐκ ἔγωγ', ἔφη. 'Αλλ' ὀφθαλμίας; Οὐδὲ τοῦτο. 'Αλλὰ λιμοῦ; Οὐδὲ λιμοῦ.

'Αλλὰ μήν, ἔφη, εἴ γ' ἐρωτᾶς με, εἴ τι ἀγαθὸν οἶδα ο μηδενὸς ἀγαθόν ἐστιν, οὕτ' οἶδα, ἔφη, οὕτε δέομαι.

#### MEMORABILIA III. 7.9-8.3

a hurry to pry into other people's business that they never turn aside to examine themselves. Don't refuse to face this duty then: strive more earnestly to pay heed to yourself; and don't neglect public affairs, if you have the power to improve them. If they go well, not only the people but your friends and you yourself will profit at least as much as they will."

8. When Aristippus attempted to cross-examine Socrates in the same fashion as he had been cross-examined by him in their previous encounter, Socrates, wishing to benefit his companions, answered like a man resolved to do what is right and not like a debater guarding against any distortion of the argument.

Aristippus asked if he knew of anything good, so that if Socrates mentioned some good thing, such as food, drink, money, health, strength, or daring, he might show that it is sometimes bad. But Socrates, knowing that when anything troubles us we need what will put an end to the trouble, gave the best answer: "Are you asking me," he said, "whether I know of anything good for a fever?"

"No, not that."

"For ophthalmia?"

"Not that either."

"For hunger?"

"No, not for hunger either."

"Well, if you are asking me whether I know of anything good in relation to nothing, I don't know or want to know."

4 Πάλιν δὲ τοῦ ᾿Αριστίππου ἐρωτῶντος αὐτόν, εἴ τι εἰδείη καλόν, Καὶ πολλά, ἔφη.

Αρ' οὖν, ἔφη, πάντα ὅμοια ἀλλήλοις;

΄ Ως οἷόν τε μὲν οὖν, ἔφη, ἀνομοιότατα ἔνια.

Πῶς οὖν, ἔφη, τὸ τῷ καλῷ ἀνόμοιον καλὸν ἃν εἴη; "Ότι νὴ Δι', ἔφη, ἔστι μὲν τῷ καλῷ πρὸς δρόμον ἀνθρώπῳ ἄλλος ἀνόμοιος καλὸς πρὸς πάλην, ἔστι δὲ ἀσπὶς καλὴ πρὸς τὸ προβάλλεσθαι ὡς ἔνι ἀνομοιοτάτη τῷ ἀκοντίῳ καλῷ πρός τὸ σφόδρα τε καὶ ταχὺ φέρεσθαι.

Οὐδὲν διαφερόντως, ἔφη, ἀποκρίνη μοι ἢ ὅτε σε ἠρώτησα, εἴ τι ἀγαθὸν εἰδείης.

Σὺ δ' οἴει, ἔφη, ἄλλο μὲν ἀγαθόν, ἄλλο δὲ καλὸν εἶναι; οὐκ οἶσθ', ὅτι πρὸς ταὐτὰ πάντα καλά τε κἀγαθά ἐστι; πρῶτον μὲν γὰρ ἡ ἀρετὴ οὐ πρὸς ἄλλα μὲν ἀγαθόν, πρὸς ἄλλα δὲ καλόν ἐστιν· ἔπειτα οἱ ἄνθρωποι τὸ αὐτό τε καὶ πρὸς τὰ αὐτὰ καλοί τε κἀγαθοὶ λέγονται· πρὸς τὰ αὐτὰ δὲ καὶ τὰ σώματα τῶν ἀνθρώπων καλά τε κἀγαθὰ φαίνεται, πρὸς ταὐτὰ δὲ καὶ τἄλλα πάντα, οἶς ἄνθρωποι χρώνται, καλά τε κἀγαθὰ νομίζεται, πρὸς ἄπερ ἂν εὕχρηστα ἢ.

Ãρ' οὖν, ἔφη, καὶ κόφινος κοπροφόρος καλόν ἐστι; Νὴ Δί', ἐφη, καὶ χρυσῆ γε ἀσπὶς αἰσχρόν, ἐὰν πρὸς τὰ ἑαυτῶν ἔργα ὁ μὲν καλῶς πεποιημένος ἢ, ἡ δὲ κακῶς.

Λέγεις σύ, ἔφη, καλά τε καὶ αἰσχρὰ τὰ αὐτὰ εἶναι; Καὶ νὴ Δί᾽ ἔγωγ᾽, ἔφη, ἀγαθά τε καὶ κακά· πολλάκις γὰρ τό τε λιμοῦ ἀγαθὸν πυρετοῦ κακόν ἐστι καὶ

5

6

### MEMORABILIA III. 8.4-8.7

Again Aristippus asked him whether he knew of any- 4 thing beautiful: "Yes, many things," he replied.

"All like one another?"

"On the contrary, some are as unlike as they can be."

"How then can that which is unlike the beautiful be beautiful?"

"The reason, of course, is that a beautiful wrestler is unlike a beautiful runner, a shield beautiful for defense is utterly unlike a javelin beautiful for swift and powerful hurling."

"That is the same answer as you gave to my question whether you knew of anything good."

"You think, do you, that good is one thing and beautiful another? Don't you know that all things are both beautiful and good in relation to the same things? In the first place, excellence is not a good thing in relation to some things and a beautiful thing in relation to others. Men, again, are called 'beautiful and good' in the same respect and in relation to the same things: it is in relation to the same things that men's bodies look beautiful and good and that all other things men use are thought beautiful and good, namely, in relation to those things for which they are useful."

"Is a dung basket beautiful then?"

"Of course, and a golden shield is ugly, if the one is well made for its special work and the other badly."

"Do you mean that the same things are both beautiful and ugly?"

"Of course—and both good and bad. For what is good for hunger is often bad for fever, and what is good for fever bad for hunger; what is beautiful for running is often ugly

5

τὸ πυρετοῦ ἀγαθὸν λιμοῦ κακόν ἐστι· πολλάκις δὲ τὸ μὲν πρὸς δρόμον καλὸν πρὸς πάλην αἰσχρόν, τὸ δὲ πρὸς πάλην καλὸν πρὸς δρόμον αἰσχρόν· πάντα γὰρ ἀγαθὰ μὲν καὶ καλά ἐστι πρὸς ἃ ἂν εὖ ἔχη, κακὰ δὲ καὶ αἰσχρὰ πρὸς ἃ ἂν κακῶς.

Καὶ οἰκίας δὲ λέγων τὰς αὐτὰς καλάς τε εἶναι καὶ χρησίμους παιδεύειν ἔμοιγ' ἐδόκει, οἵας χρὴ οἰκοδομεῖσθαι.

Ἐπεσκόπει δὲ ὧδε· Ἦρά γε τὸν μέλλοντα οἰκίαν οἴαν χρὴ ἔχειν τοῦτο δεῖ μηχανᾶσθαι, ὅπως ἡδίστη τε ἐνδιαιτᾶσθαι καὶ χρησιμωτάτη ἔσται;

Τούτου δὲ ὁμολογουμένου, Οὐκοῦν ἡδὺ μὲν θέρους ψυχεινὴν ἔχειν, ἡδὺ δὲ χειμῶνος ἀλεεινήν;

Ἐπειδὴ δὲ καὶ τοῦτο συμφαῖεν, Οὐκοῦν ἐν ταῖς πρὸς μεσημβρίαν βλεπούσαις οἰκίαις τοῦ μὲν χειμῶνος ὁ ἥλιος εἰς τὰς παστάδας ὑπολάμπει, τοῦ δὲ θέρους ὑπὲρ ἡμῶν αὐτῶν καὶ τῶν στεγῶν πορευόμενος σκιὰν παρέχει. οὐκοῦν εἴ γε καλῶς ἔχει ταῦτα οὕτω γίγνεσθαι, οἰκοδομεῖν δεῖ ὑψηλότερα μὲν τὰ πρὸς μεσημβρίαν, ἵνα ὁ χειμερινὸς ἥλιος μὴ ἀποκλείηται, χθαμαλώτερα δὲ τὰ πρὸς ἄρκτον, ἵνα οἱ ψυχροὶ μὴ ἐμπίπτωσιν ἄνεμοι ὡς δὲ συνελόντι εἰπεῖν, ὅποι πάσας ὥρας αὐτός τε ἂν ἥδιστα καταφεύγοι καὶ τὰ ὄντα ἀσφαλέστατα τίθοιτο, αὕτη ἂν εἰκότως ἡδίστη τε καὶ καλλίστη οἴκησις εἴη. γραφαὶ δὲ καὶ ποικιλίαι πλείονας εὐφροσύνας ἀποστεροῦσιν ἢ παρέχουσι.

Ναοῖς γε μὴν καὶ βωμοῖς χώραν ἔφη εἶναι πρεπω-

8

9

#### MEMORABILIA III. 8.7-8.10

for wrestling, and what is beautiful for wrestling ugly for running. For all things are good and beautiful in relation to those purposes for which they are well adapted, bad and ugly in relation to those for which they are poorly adapted."

Again his dictum about houses, that the same house is both beautiful and useful, was a lesson in the art of building houses as they ought to be.

He approached the problem this way: "When we mean to have the right sort of house, should we arrange to make it as pleasant to live in and as useful as can be?"

And this being admitted, "Is it pleasant," he asked, "to have it cool in summer and warm in winter?"

And when they agreed with this also, "Now in houses with a southern exposure, the sun's rays penetrate into the porticoes in winter but in summer the path of the sun is right over our heads and above the roof, so that there is shade. If, then, this is the best arrangement, we should build the south side higher to get the winter sun and the north side lower to keep out the cold winds. In brief, the house where the owner can find a pleasant retreat at all seasons and can store his belongings safely is presumably at once the most pleasant and the most beautiful. As for paintings and decorations, they rob us of more delights than they give."

For temples and altars the most suitable setting, he

δεστάτην, ήτις ἐμφανεστάτη οὖσα ἀστιβεστάτη εἴη· ήδὺ μὲν γὰρ ἰδόντας προσεύξασθαι, ήδὺ δὲ ἁγνῶς ἔχοντας προσιέναι.

9. Πάλιν δὲ ἐρωτώμενος, ἡ ἀνδρεία πότερον εἴη διδακτὸν ἢ φυσικόν, Οἶμαι μέν, ἔφη, ὥσπερ σῶμα σώματος ἰσχυρότερον πρὸς τοὺς πόνους φύεται, οὕτω καὶ ψυχὴν ψυχῆς ἐρρωμενεστέραν πρὸς τὰ δεινὰ φύσει γίγνεσθαι, όρω γὰρ ἐν τοῖς αὐτοῖς νόμοις τε καὶ έθεσι τρεφομένους πολύ διαφέροντας άλλήλων τόλμη. νομίζω μέντοι πάσαν φύσιν μαθήσει καὶ μελέτη πρὸς άνδρείαν αὔξεσθαι. δηλον μὲν γάρ, ὅτι Σκύθαι καὶ Θρᾶκες οὐκ ἂν τολμήσειαν ἀσπίδας καὶ δόρατα λαβόντες Λακεδαιμονίοις διαμάχεσθαι φανερον δέ, ὅτι Λακεδαιμόνιοι οὔτ' ἂν Θραξὶ πέλταις καὶ ἀκοντίοις οὔτε Σκύθαις τόξοις ἐθέλοιεν ἂν διαγωνίζεσθαι, ὁρῶ δ' ἔγωγε καὶ ἐπὶ τῶν ἄλλων πάντων ὁμοίως καὶ φύσει διαφέροντας άλλήλων τοὺς άνθρώπους καὶ ἐπιμελεία πολύ ἐπιδιδόντας. ἐκ δὲ τούτων δῆλόν ἐστιν, ὅτι πάντας χρη καὶ τοὺς εὐφυεστέρους καὶ τοὺς ἀμβλυτέρους την φύσιν έν οξε αν άξιόλογοι βούλωνται γενέσθαι. ταῦτα καὶ μανθάνειν καὶ μελετᾶν.

Σοφίαν δὲ καὶ σωφροσύνην οὐ διώριζεν, ἀλλὰ τὸ τὰ καλά τε κἀγαθὰ γιγνώσκοντα χρῆσθαι αὐτοῖς καὶ τὸ τὰ αἰσχρὰ εἰδότα εὐλαβεῖσθαι σοφόν τε καὶ σῶφρον ἔκρινε. προσερωτώμενος δέ, εἰ τοὺς ἐπισταμένους μὲν ἃ δεῖ πράττειν, ποιοῦντας δὲ τἀναντία σοφούς τε καὶ ἐγκρατεῖς εἶναι νομίζοι, Οὐδέν γε μᾶλλον, ἔφη, ἢ ἀσόφους τε καὶ ἀκρατεῖς· πάντας γὰρ οἶμαι

said, was a conspicuous site remote from traffic; for it is pleasant to breathe a prayer at the sight of them, and pleasant to approach them in a pure state.

9. When asked again whether courage could be taught or came naturally, he replied: "I think that just as one man's body is naturally stronger than another's for labor, so one man's soul is naturally braver than another's in danger. For I notice that men brought up under the same laws and customs differ widely in daring. Nevertheless, I think that every man's nature acquires more courage by learning and practice. Of course Scythians and Thracians would not dare to take bronze shield and spear and fight Spartans; and of course Spartans would not be willing to face Thracians with leather shields and javelins, nor Scythians with bows for weapons. And similarly in all other points, I find that human beings naturally differ one from another and greatly improve by application. Hence it is clear that all men, whatever their natural gifts, the talented and the dullards alike, must learn and practice what they want to excel in."

Between wisdom and prudence he drew no distinction; but if a man knows and practices what is beautiful and good, knows and avoids what is base, that man he judged to be both wise and prudent. When asked further whether he thought that those who know what they ought to do and yet do the opposite are at once wise and vicious, he answered: "No; not so much that, as both unwise and vicious. For I think that all men have a choice between various

2

 $<sup>^{6}</sup>$  τὸ . . . τὸ BL: τὸν . . . τὸν cett.: τ $\hat{\varphi}$  . . . τ $\hat{\varphi}$  Heindorf

προαιρουμένους ἐκ τῶν ἐνδεχομένων ἃ οἴονται συμφορώτατα αὐτοῖς εἶναι, ταῦτα πράττειν. νομίζω οὖν τοὺς μὴ ὀρθῶς πράττοντας οὕτε σοφοὺς οὕτε σώφρονας εἶναι.

Έφη δὲ καὶ τὴν δικαιοσύνην καὶ τὴν ἄλλην πᾶσαν ἀρετὴν σοφίαν εἶναι. τά τε γὰρ δίκαια καὶ πάντα, ὅσα ἀρετῆ πράττεται, καλά τε καὶ ἀγαθὰ εἶναι· καὶ οὕτ αν τοὺς ταῦτα εἰδότας ἄλλο ἀντὶ τούτων οὐδὲν προελέσθαι οὕτε τοὺς μὴ ἐπισταμένους δύνασθαι πράττειν, ἀλλὰ καὶ ἐὰν ἐγχειρῶσιν, ἁμαρτάνειν. οὕτω καὶ τὰ καλά τε καὶ ἀγαθὰ τοὺς μὲν σοφοὺς πράττειν, τοὺς δὲ μὴ σοφοὺς οὐ δύνασθαι, ἀλλὰ καὶ ἐὰν ἐγχειρῶσιν, ἁμαρτάνειν. ἐπεὶ οὖν τά τε δίκαια καὶ τἆλλα καλά τε καὶ ἀγαθὰ πάντα ἀρετῆ πράττεται, δῆλον εἶναι, ὅτι καὶ δικαιοσύνη καὶ ἡ ἄλλη πᾶσα ἀρετὴ σοφία ἐστί.

Μανίαν γε μὴν ἐναντίον μὲν ἔφη εἶναι σοφία, οὐ μέντοι γε τὴν ἀνεπιστημοσύνην μανίαν ἐνόμιζε. τὸ δὲ ἀγνοεῖν ἑαυτὸν καὶ ἃ μὴ οἶδε δοξάζειν τε καὶ οἴεσθαι γιγνώσκειν ἐγγυτάτω μανίας ἐλογίζετο εἶναι. τοὺς μέντοι πολλοὺς ἔφη ἃ μὲν οἱ πλεῖστοι ἀγνοοῦσι, τοὺς διημαρτηκότας τούτων οὐ φάσκειν μαίνεσθαι, τοὺς δὲ διημαρτηκότας ὧν οἱ πολλοὶ γιγνώσκουσι μαινομένους καλεῖν· ἐάν τε γάρ τις μέγας οὕτως οἴηται εἶναι, ὥστε κύπτειν τὰς πύλας τοῦ τείχους διεξιών, ἐάν τε οὕτως ἰσχυρός, ὥστ' ἐπιχειρεῖν οἰκίας αἴρεσθαι ἣ ἄλλω τω ἐπιτίθεσθαι τῶν πᾶσι δήλων ὅτι ἀδύνατά ἐστι, τοῦτον μαίνεσθαι φάσκειν· τοὺς δὲ μικρῶν δια-

5

### MEMORABILIA III. 9.4-9.7

courses, and choose and follow the one which they think conduces most to their advantage. Therefore I think that those who follow the wrong course are neither wise nor prudent."

He said that justice and every other form of excellence is wisdom. "For just actions and all forms of virtuous activity are beautiful and good. He who knows the beautiful and good will never choose anything else, he who is ignorant of them cannot do them, and even if he tries, will fail. And so the wise do what is beautiful and good, the unwise cannot and fail if they try. Therefore since just actions and all other forms of beautiful and good activity are virtuous actions, it is clear that justice and every other form of excellence is wisdom."

Madness, again, according to him, was the opposite of wisdom. Nevertheless he did not identify ignorance with madness; but not to know yourself, and to assume and think that you know what you do not, he put next to madness. "Most people, however," he said, "do not call those mad who err in matters that lie outside the knowledge of ordinary people: madness is the name they give to errors in matters of common knowledge. For instance, if a man imagines himself to be so tall as to stoop when he goes through the gateways in the wall, or so strong as to try to lift houses or to perform any other feat that everybody knows is impossible, they say he's mad. They don't think a

5

6

μαρτάνοντας οὐ δοκείν τοίς πολλοίς μαίνεσθαι, άλλ' ώσπερ την ἰσχυρὰν ἐπιθυμίαν ἔρωτα καλοῦσιν, οὕτω καὶ τὴν μεγάλην παράνοιαν μανίαν αὐτοὺς καλεῖν.

Φθόνον δὲ σκοπῶν ὅ τι ϵἴη λύπην μέν τινα ἐξεύρισκεν αὐτὸν ὄντα, οὕτε μέντοι τὴν ἐπὶ φίλων ἀτυχίαις οὕτε τὴν ἐπ' ἐχθρῶν εὐτυχίαις γιγνομένην, ἀλλὰ μόνους ἔφη φθονείν τοὺς ἐπὶ ταίς τῶν φίλων εὐπραξίαις άνιωμένους. θαυμαζόντων δέ τινων, εί τις φιλών τινα έπὶ τῆ εὐπραξία αὐτοῦ λυποῖτο, ὑπεμίμνησκεν, ὅτι πολλοὶ οὕτω πρός τινας ἔχουσιν, ὥστε κακῶς μὲν πράττοντας μη δύνασθαι περιοράν, άλλα βοηθείν άτυχοῦσιν, εὐτυχούντων δὲ λυπεῖσθαι. τοῦτο μέντοι φρονίμω μεν άνδρι οὐκ ἂν συμβήναι, τοὺς ἡλιθίους δὲ ἀεὶ πάσχειν αὐτό.

Σχολην δὲ σκοπῶν τί εἴη ποιοῦντας μέν τι τοὺς πλείστους εύρίσκειν έφη καὶ γὰρ τοὺς πεττεύοντας καὶ τοὺς γελωτοποιοῦντας ποιεῖν τι, πάντας δὲ τούτους έφη σχολάζειν έξειναι γὰρ αὐτοις ιέναι πράξοντας τὰ βελτίω τούτων. ἀπὸ μέντοι τῶν βελτιόνων ἐπὶ τὰ χείρω ιέναι οὐδένα σχολάζειν εί δέ τις ίοι, τοῦτον ἀσχολίας αὐτῷ οὔσης κακῶς ἔφη τοῦτο πράττειν.

Βασιλείς δὲ καὶ ἄρχοντας οὐ τοὺς τὰ σκῆπτρα έχοντας έφη είναι οὐδε τοὺς ὑπὸ τῶν τυχόντων αίρεθέντας οὐδὲ τοὺς κλήρω λαχόντας οὐδὲ τοὺς βιασαμένους οὐδὲ τοὺς έξαπατήσαντας, ἀλλὰ τοὺς ἐπισταμένους ἄρχειν. ὁπότε γάρ τις ὁμολογήσειε τοῦ 11 μεν ἄρχοντος είναι τὸ προστάττειν ὅ τι χρὴ ποιείν. τοῦ δὲ ἀρχομένου τὸ πείθεσθαι, ἐπεδείκνυεν ἔν τε νηὶ

8

9

slight error implies madness, but just as they call strong desire love, so they name a great delusion madness."23

Considering the nature of envy, he found it to be a kind of pain, not, however, at a friend's misfortune nor at an enemy's good fortune, but the envious are those only who are annoyed at their friends' successes. Some expressed surprise that anyone who loves another should be pained at his success, but he reminded them that many stand in this relation toward others, that they cannot disregard them in time of trouble but aid them in their misfortune. and yet they are pained to see them prospering. This, however, could not happen to a man of sense but is always the case with fools.

Considering the nature of leisure, he said his conclusion was that almost all men do something. Even dice players and jesters do something, but all these are at leisure, for they might go and do something better. But nobody has leisure to go from a better to a worse occupation. If anyone does so, he acts wrongly, having no leisure.

Kings and rulers, he said, are not those who hold the scepter, nor those who are chosen by the multitude, nor those on whom the lot falls, nor those who owe their power to force or deception; but those who know how to rule.<sup>24</sup> For once it was granted that it is the business of the ruler to give orders and of the ruled to obey, he went on to show

8

9

10

<sup>23</sup> The last sentence cannot imply that Socrates thought selfignorance "a slight error," but must be merely a further elucidation of popular nomenclature. But it comes very awkwardly here. <sup>24</sup> Cyr. 1.1.3.

τὸν μὲν ἐπιστάμενον ἄρχοντα, τὸν δὲ ναύκληρον καὶ τοὺς ἄλλους τοὺς ἐν τῆ νηὶ πάντας πειθομένους τῷ ἐπισταμένῳ, καὶ ἐν γεωργία τοὺς κεκτημένους ἀγροὺς καὶ ἐν νόσῳ τοὺς νοσοῦντας καὶ ἐν σωμασκία τοὺς σωμασκοῦντας καὶ τοὺς ἄλλους πάντας, οἶς ὑπάρχει τι ἐπιμελείας δεόμενον, ἂν μὲν αὐτοὶ ἡγῶνται ἐπίστασθαι ἐπιμελείσθαι· εἰ δὲ μή, τοῖς ἐπισταμένοις οὐ μόνον παροῦσι πειθομένους ἀλλὰ καὶ ἀπόντας μεταπεμπομένους, ὅπως ἐκείνοις πειθόμενοι τὰ δέοντα πράττωσιν· ἐν δὲ ταλασία καὶ τὰς γυναῖκας ἐπεδείκνυεν ἀρχούσας τῶν ἀνδρῶν διὰ τὸ τὰς μὲν εἰδέναι, ὅπως χρὴ ταλασιουργεῖν, τοὺς δὲ μὴ εἰδέναι.

Εἰ δέ τις πρὸς ταῦτα λέγοι, ὅτι τῷ τυράννῳ ἔξεστι μὴ πείθεσθαι τοῖς ὀρθῶς λέγουσι, Καὶ πῶς ἄν, ἔφη, ἐξείη μὴ πείθεσθαι, ἐπικειμένης γε ζημίας, ἐάν τις τῷ εὖ λέγοντι μὴ πείθηται; ἐν ῷ γὰρ ἄν τις πράγματι μὴ πείθηται τῷ εὖ λέγοντι, ἀμαρτήσεται δήπου, ἁμαρτάνων δὲ ζημιωθήσεται.

Εἰ δὲ φαίη τις τῷ τυράννῳ ἐξεῖναι καὶ ἀποκτεῖναι τὸν εὖ φρονοῦντα, Τὸν δὲ ἀποκτείναντα, ἔφη, τοὺς κρατίστους τῶν συμμάχων οἴει ἀζήμιον γίγνεσθαι ἢ ὡς ἔτυχε ζημιοῦσθαι; πότερα γὰρ ἂν μᾶλλον οἴει σώ-ζεσθαι τὸν τοῦτο ποιοῦντα ἢ οὕτω καὶ τάχιστ' ἂν ἀπολέσθαι;

#### MEMORABILIA III 9 11-9 14

that on a ship the one who knows rules, and the owner and all the others on board obey the one who knows: in farming the landowners, in illness the patients, in training those who are in training, in fact everybody concerned with anything that needs care, look after it themselves if they think they know how, but, if not, they obey those who know, and not only when such are present but they even send for them when absent, that they may obey them and do the right thing. In spinning wool, again, he would point out, the women govern the men because they know how to do it and men do not.

If anyone objected that a despot may refuse to obey a good counselor, "How can he refuse," he would ask, "when a penalty waits on disregard of good counsel? All disregard of good counsel is bound surely to result in error, and his error will not go unpunished."

If anyone said that a despot can kill a loyal subject, "Do 13 you think," he said, "that he who kills the best of his allies suffers no loss or that his loss is trifling? Do you think that this conduct brings him safety or rather swift destruction?"

When someone asked him what seemed to him the best pursuit for a man, he answered: "Doing well." Questioned further, whether he thought good luck a pursuit, he said: "On the contrary, I think luck and doing are opposite

243

12

τύχην καὶ πράξιν ἡγοῦμαι τὸ μὲν γὰρ μὴ ζητοῦντα ἐπιτυχεῖν τινι τῶν δεόντων εὐτυχίαν οἶμαι εἶναι, τὸ δὲ μαθόντα τε καὶ μελετήσαντά τι εὖ ποιεῖν εὐπραξίαν νομίζω, καὶ οἱ τοῦτο ἐπιτηδεύοντες δοκοῦσί μοι εὖ πράττειν. καὶ ἀρίστους δὲ καὶ θεοφιλεστάτους ἔφη εἶναι ἐν μὲν γεωργία τοὺς τὰ γεωργικὰ εὖ πράττοντας, ἐν δ᾽ ἰατρεία τοὺς τὰ ἰατρικά, ἐν δὲ πολιτεία τοὺς τὰ πολιτικά: τὸν δὲ μηδὲν εὖ πράττοντα οὔτε χρήσιμον οὐδὲν ἔφη εἶναι οὔτε θεοφιλῆ.

10. 'Αλλὰ μὴν καὶ εἴ ποτε τῶν τὰς τέχνας ἐχόντων καὶ ἐργασίας ἔνεκα χρωμένων αὐταῖς διαλέγοιτό τινι, καὶ τούτοις ἀφέλιμος ἦν.

Εἰσελθὼν μὲν γάρ ποτε πρὸς Παρράσιον τὸν ζωγράφον καὶ διαλεγόμενος αὐτῷ, ᾿Αρα, ἔφη, ὧ Παρράσιε, γραφική ἐστιν εἰκασία τῶν ὁρωμένων; τὰ γοῦν κοῖλα καὶ τὰ ὑψηλὰ καὶ τὰ σκοτεινὰ καὶ τὰ φωτεινὰ καὶ τὰ σκληρὰ καὶ τὰ μαλακὰ καὶ τὰ τραχέα καὶ τὰ λεῖα καὶ τὰ νέα καὶ τὰ παλαιὰ σώματα διὰ τῶν χρωμάτων ἀπεικάζοντες ἐκμιμεῖσθε.

Αληθη λέγεις, έφη.

Καὶ μὴν τά γε καλὰ εἴδη ἀφομοιοῦντες, ἐπειδὴ οὐ ῥάδιον ἐνὶ ἀνθρώπῳ περιτυχεῖν ἄμεμπτα πάντα ἔχοντι, ἐκ πολλῶν συνάγοντες τὰ ἐξ ἑκάστου κάλλιστα οὕτως ὅλα τὰ σώματα καλὰ ποιεῖτε φαίνεσθαι.

Ποιοῦμεν γάρ, ἔφη, οὕτω.

Τί γάρ; ἔφη, τὸ πιθανώτατον καὶ ἥδιστον καὶ φιλικώτατον καὶ ποθεινότατον καὶ ἐρασμιώτατον ἀπομιμεῖσθε τῆς ψυχῆς ἦθος; ἢ οὐδὲ μιμητόν ἐστι τοῦτο;

2

3

# MEMORABILIA III. 9.14-10.3

poles. To hit on something right by luck without a search I call good luck, to do something well after study and practice I call doing well; and those who pursue this seem to me to do well. And the best men and dearest to the gods," he added, "are those who do their work well; if it is farming, as good farmers; if medicine, as good doctors; if politics, as good politicians. He who does nothing well is neither useful in any way nor dear to the gods."

10. Then again, whenever he talked with artists who pursued their art as a business, he was as useful to them as to others.

Thus, on entering the house of Parrhasius the painter one day, he asked in the course of a conversation with him: "Is painting a representation of things seen, Parrhasius? Anyhow, you painters with your colors represent and reproduce figures high and low, in light and in shadow, hard and soft, rough and smooth, young and old."

"True."

"And further, when you copy types of beauty, it is so difficult to find a perfect model that you combine the most beautiful details of several, and thus contrive to make the whole figure look beautiful."

"Yes, we do!"

"Well now, do you also reproduce the character of the soul, the character that is in the highest degree captivating, delightful, friendly, fascinating, lovable? Or is it impossible to imitate that?"

3

Πῶς γὰρ ἄν, ἔφη, μιμητὸν εἴη, ὧ Σώκρατες, ὃ μήτε συμμετρίαν μήτε χρῶμα μήτε ὧν σὰ εἶπας ἄρτι μη-δὲν ἔχει μηδὲ ὅλως ὁρατόν ἐστιν;

4 ἦΑρ' οὖν, ἔφη, γίγνεται ἐν ἀνθρώπῳ τό τε φιλοφρόνως καὶ τὸ ἐχθρῶς βλέπειν πρός τινας:

"Εμοιγε δοκεῖ, ἔφη.

Οὐκοῦν τοῦτό γε μιμητὸν ἐν τοῖς ὅμμασι;

Καὶ μάλα, ἔφη.

Έπὶ δὲ τοῖς τῶν φίλων ἀγαθοῖς καὶ τοῖς κακοῖς ὁμοίως σοι δοκοῦσιν ἔχειν τὰ πρόσωπα οἴ τε φροντίζοντες καὶ οἱ μή;<sup>7</sup>

Μὰ Δί οὐ δῆτα, ἔφη· ἐπὶ μὲν γὰρ τοῖς ἀγαθοῖς φαιδροί, ἐπὶ δὲ τοῖς κακοῖς σκυθρωποὶ γίγνονται.

Οὐκοῦν, ἔφη, καὶ ταῦτα δυνατὸν ἀπεικάζειν;

Καὶ μάλα, ἔφη.

Άλλὰ μὴν καὶ τὸ μεγαλοπρεπές τε καὶ ἐλευθέριον καὶ τὸ ταπεινόν τε καὶ ἀνελεύθερον καὶ τὸ σωφρονικόν τε καὶ φρόνιμον καὶ τὸ ὑβριστικόν τε καὶ ἀπειρόκαλον καὶ διὰ τοῦ προσώπου καὶ διὰ τῶν σχημάτων καὶ ἑστώτων καὶ κινουμένων ἀνθρώπων διαφαίνει.

Άληθη λέγεις, έφη.

Οὐκοῦν καὶ ταῦτα μιμητά;

Καὶ μάλα, ἔφη.

Πότερον οὖν, ἔφη, νομίζεις ἥδιον ὁρᾶν τοὺς ἀνθρώπους δι' ὧν τὰ καλά τε καὶ ἀγαθὰ καὶ ἀγαπητὰ ἤθη φαίνεται ἢ δι' ὧν τὰ αἰσχρά τε καὶ πονηρὰ καὶ μιστητά;

# MEMORABILIA III. 10.3-10.5

"Oh no, Socrates; for how could one imitate what lacks shape and color and any of the qualities you mentioned just now, and is not even visible?"

"Do human beings commonly express the feelings of 4 sympathy and aversion by their looks?"

"I think so."

"Then can't that much be imitated in the eyes?"

"Undoubtedly."

"Do you think that the joys and sorrows of their friends produce the same expression on people's faces, whether they really care or not?"

"Oh no, of course not: they look radiant at their joys, downcast at their sorrows."

"Then is it possible to represent these looks too?"

"Undoubtedly."

"And further, nobility and dignity, self-abasement and servility, prudence and understanding, insolence and vulgarity: these are reflected in the face and in the attitudes of the body whether still or in motion."

"True."

"Then these too can be imitated, can they not?"

"Undoubtedly."

"Now which do you think the more pleasing sight, one whose features and bearing reflect a beautiful and good and lovable character, or one who is the embodiment of what is ugly and deprayed and hateful?"

 $<sup>^7</sup>$ οΐ  $\tau\epsilon\ldots\mu\dot{\eta}$  susp. Hartman

Πολὺ νὴ Δί', ἔφη, διαφέρει, ὧ Σώκρατες.

Πρὸς δὲ Κλείτωνα τὸν ἀνδριαντοποιὸν εἰσελθών ποτε καὶ διαλεγόμενος αὐτῷ, Ὅτι μέν, ἔφη, ὧ Κλείτων, καλοὶ οῦς<sup>8</sup> ποιεῖς δρομεῖς τε καὶ παλαιστὰς καὶ πύκτας καὶ παγκρατιαστάς, ὁρῶ τε καὶ οἶδα· ὁ δὲ μάλιστα ψυχαγωγεῖ διὰ τῆς ὄψεως τοὺς ἀνθρώπους, τὸ ζωτικὸν φαίνεσθαι, πῶς τοῦτο ἐνεργάζῃ τοῖς ἀνδριᾶσιν;

Ἐπεὶ δὲ ἀπορῶν ὁ Κλείτων οὐ ταχὺ ἀπεκρίνατο, ਜρ', ἔφη, τοῖς τῶν ζώντων εἴδεσιν ἀπεικάζων τὸ ἔργον ζωτικωτέρους ποιεῖς φαίνεσθαι τοὺς ἀνδριάντας;

Καὶ μάλα, ἔφη.

6

7

8

Οὐκοῦν τά τε ὑπὸ τῶν σχημάτων κατασπώμενα<sup>9</sup> καὶ τἀνασπώμενα ἐν τοῖς σώμασι καὶ τὰ συμπιεζόμενα καὶ τὰ διελκόμενα καὶ τὰ ἐντεινόμενα καὶ τὰ ἀνιέμενα ἀπεικάζων ὁμοιότερά τε τοῖς ἀληθινοῖς καὶ πιθανώτερα ποιεῖς φαίνεσθαι;

Πάνυ μὲν οὖν, ἔφη.

Τὸ δὲ καὶ τὰ πάθη τῶν ποιούντων τι σωμάτων ἀπομιρεῖσθαι οὐ ποιεῖ τινα τέρψιν τοῖς θεωμένοις;

Εἰκὸς γοῦν, ἔφη.

Οὐκοῦν καὶ τῶν μὲν μαχομένων ἀπειλητικὰ τὰ ὅμματα ἀπεικαστέον, τῶν δὲ νενικηκότων εὐφραινομένων ἡ ὄψις μιμητέα;

Σφόδρα γ', ἔφη.

Δεῖ ἄρα, ἔφη, τὸν ἀνδριαντοποιὸν τὰ τῆς ψυχῆς ἔργα τῷ εἴδει προσεικάζειν.

9 Πρὸς δὲ Πιστίαν τὸν θωρακοποιὸν εἰσελθών, ἐπι-

"No doubt there is a great difference, Socrates."

On another occasion he visited Cleiton the sculptor, and while conversing with him said: "Cleiton, that your statues of runners, wrestlers, boxers and fighters are beautiful I see and know. But how do you produce in them that illusion of life which is their most alluring charm to the beholder?"

As Cleiton was puzzled and did not reply at once, "Is it," he added, "by faithfully representing the form of living beings that you make your statues look as if they are alive?"

"Undoubtedly."

"Then isn't it by accurately representing the different parts of the body as they are affected by the pose—the flesh wrinkled or tense, the limbs compressed or outstretched, the muscles taut or loose—that you make them look more like real parts and more convincing?"

"Yes, certainly."

"Doesn't the exact imitation of the feelings that affect bodies in action also produce a sense of satisfaction in the spectators?"

"Oh yes, presumably."

"Then must not the threatening look in the eyes of fighters be accurately represented, and the triumphant expression on the face of victors be imitated?"

"Most certainly."

"It follows, then, that the sculptor must represent in his figures the activities of the soul."

On visiting Pistias the armorer, who showed him some

<sup>8</sup> καλοὶ οὖς Dindorf: ἀλλοίους codd. et Stobaeus

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> καταρτώμενα Stobaeus

δείξαντος αὐτοῦ τῷ Σωκράτει θώρακας εὖ εἰργασμένους, Νὴ τὴν Ἦραν, ἔφη, καλόν γε, ὦ Πιστία, τὸ εὕρημα τὸ τὰ μὲν δεόμενα σκέπης τοῦ ἀνθρώπου σκεπάζειν τὸν θώρακα, ταῖς δὲ χερσὶ μὴ κωλύειν χρῆσθαι. ἀτάρ, ἔφη, λέξον μοι, ὦ Πιστία, διὰ τί οὕτ ἰσχυροτέρους οὕτε πολυτελεστέρους τῶν ἄλλων ποιῶν τοὺς θώρακας πλείονος πωλεῖς;

Ότι, ἔφη, ὧ Σώκρατες, εὐρυθμοτέρους ποιῶ.

Τον δε ρυθμόν, έφη, πότερα μέτρω η σταθμώ αποδεικνύων πλείονος τιμά; οὐ γὰρ δη ἴσους γε πάντας οὐδε ὁμοίους οἶμαί σε ποιεῖν, εἴ γε άρμόττοντας ποιεῖς.

'Αλλὰ νὴ  $\Delta \hat{\iota}$ , ἔφη, ποιῶ· οὐδὲν γὰρ ὄφελός ἐστι θώρακος ἄνευ τούτου.

11 Οὐκοῦν, ἔφη, σώματά γε ἀνθρώπων τὰ μὲν εὔρυθμά ἐστι, τὰ δὲ ἄρρυθμα;

Πάνυ μὲν οὖν, ἔφη.

Πῶς οὖν, ἔφη, τῷ ἀρρύθμῳ σώματι ἁρμόττοντα τὸν θώρακα εὔρυθμον ποιεῖς;

ναπερ καὶ άρμόττοντα, ἔφη· ὁ άρμόττων γάρ ἐστιν εὔρυθμος.

12 Δοκεῖς μοι, ἔφη ὁ Σωκράτης, τὸ εὔρυθμον οὐ καθ' ἑαυτὸ λέγειν, ἀλλὰ πρὸς τὸν χρώμενον ὤσπερ ἂν εἰ φαίης ἀσπίδα, ὧ ἂν ἀρμόττη, τούτῳ εὔρυθμον εἶναι, καὶ χλαμύδα καὶ τἆλλα ὡσαύτως ἔοικεν ἔχειν τῷ σῷ
13 λόγῳ. ἴσως δὲ καὶ ἄλλο τι οὐ μικρὸν ἀγαθὸν τῷ ἁρμόττειν πρόσεστι.

Δίδαξον, ἔφη, ὧ Σώκρατες, εἴ τι ἔχεις.

# MEMORABILIA III. 10.9-10.13

well-made breastplates, Socrates said: "By Hera, Pistias, it's a beautiful invention, for the breastplate covers the parts that need protection without impeding the use of the hands. But tell me, Pistias," he added, "why do you charge more for your breastplates than any other maker, though they are no stronger and cost no more to make?"

"Because the proportions of mine are better, Socrates."

"And how do you show their proportions when you ask a higher price—by weight or measure? For I presume you don't make them all the same weight or the same size, that is, if you make them to fit."

"Fit? Why, of course! A breastplate is useless without that!"

"Then aren't some human bodies well proportioned, 11 others poorly?"

"Certainly."

"Then if a breastplate is to fit an ill-proportioned body, how do you make it well proportioned?"

"By making it fit; for if it is a good fit it is well proportioned."

"Apparently you mean well proportioned not absolutely but in relation to the wearer, as you might call a shield well proportioned for the man whom it fits, or a military cape—and this seems to apply to everything according to you. And perhaps there is another important advantage in a good fit."

"Tell me, if you know one, Socrates."

10

12

\*Ηττον, ἔφη, τῷ βάρει πιέζουσιν οἱ ἀρμόττοντες τῶν ἀναρμόστων τὸν αὐτὸν σταθμὸν ἔχοντες. οἱ μὲν γὰρ ἀνάρμοστοι ἢ ὅλοι ἐκ τῶν ὅμων κρεμάμενοι ἢ καὶ ἄλλο τι τοῦ σώματος σφόδρα πιέζοντες δύσφοροι καὶ χαλεποὶ γίγνονται οἱ δὲ ἀρμόττοντες, διειλημμένοι τὸ βάρος τὸ μὲν ὑπὸ τῶν κλειδῶν καὶ ἐπωμίδων, τὸ δ᾽ ὑπὸ τῶν ἄμων, τὸ δὲ ὑπὸ τοῦ στήθους, τὸ δὲ ὑπὸ τοῦ νώτου, τὸ δὲ ὑπὸ τῆς γαστρός, ὀλίγου δεῖν οὐ φορήματι, ἀλλὰ προσθήματι ἐοίκασιν.

Εἴρηκας, ἔφη, αὐτό, δι' ὅπερ ἔγωγε τὰ ἐμὰ ἔργα πλείστου ἄξια νομίζω εἶναι ἔνιοι μέντοι τοὺς ποικίλους καὶ τοὺς ἐπιχρύσους θώρακας μᾶλλον ἀνοῦνται.

'Αλλὰ μήν, ἔφη, εἴ γε διὰ ταῦτα μὴ ἁρμόττοντας ἀνοῦνται, κακὸν ἔμοιγε δοκοῦσι ποικίλον τε καὶ ἐπίχρυσον ἀνεῖσθαι. ἀτάρ, ἔφη, τοῦ σώματος μὴ μένοντος, ἀλλὰ τοτὲ μὲν κυρτουμένου, τοτὲ δὲ ὀρθουμένου, πῶς ἂν ἀκριβεῖς θώρακες ἁρμόττοιεν;

Οὐδαμῶς, ἔφη.

Λέγεις, ἔφη, ἁρμόττειν οὐ τοὺς ἀκριβεῖς, ἀλλὰ τοὺς μὴ λυποῦντας ἐν τῆ χρείᾳ.

Αὐτός, ἔφη, τοῦτο λέγεις, ὧ Σώκρατες, καὶ πάνυ ὀρθῶς ἀποδέχη.

11. Γυναικὸς δέ ποτε οὕσης ἐν τῆ πόλει καλῆς, ἦ ὅνομα ἦν Θεοδότη, καὶ οἵας συνεῖναι τῷ πείθοντι, μνησθέντος αὐτῆς τῶν παρόντων τινὸς καὶ εἰπόντος, ὅτι κρεῖττον εἴη λόγου τὸ κάλλος τῆς γυναικός, καὶ ζωγράφους φήσαντος εἰσιέναι πρὸς αὐτὴν ἀπεικασο-

14

# MEMORABILIA III. 10.13-11.1

"The good fit is less heavy to wear than the misfit, though both weigh the same. For the misfit, hanging entirely from the shoulders or pressing on some other part of the body, proves unwieldy and irritating; but the good fit, with its weight distributed over the collarbone and shoulder blades, the shoulders, chest, back and stomach, may almost be called an accessory rather than an encumbrance"

"The advantage you speak of is the very one that I think makes my work worth a high price. Some, however, prefer to buy the ornamented and the gold-plated breastplates."

"Still, if the result is that they buy misfits, it seems to me they buy ornamented and gold-plated trash. Since the body is not rigid, however, but now bent, now straight, how can tight breastplates fit?"

"They can't."

"You mean that the good fits are not the tight ones but those that don't chafe the wearer?"

"That is your own meaning, Socrates, and you have hit the right nail on the head."

11. At one time there was in Athens a beautiful woman named Theodoté, who was ready to keep company with anyone who pleased her. One of the bystanders mentioned her name, declaring that words failed him to describe the lady's beauty, and adding that artists visited her to paint

14

μένους, οἷς ἐκείνην ἐπιδεικνύειν ἑαυτῆς ὅσα καλῶς ἔχοι, Ἰτέον ἃν εἴη θεασομένους, ἔφη ὁ Σωκράτης· οὐ γὰρ δὴ ἀκούσασί γε τὸ λόγου κρεῖττον ἔστι καταμαθεῖν.

Καὶ ὁ διηγησάμενος, Οὐκ ἂν φθάνοιτ', ἔφη, ἀκολουθοῦντες. οὕτω μὲν δὴ πορευθέντες πρὸς τὴν Θεοδότην καὶ καταλαβόντες ζωγράφω τινὶ παρεστηκυῖαν ἐθεάσαντο.

Παυσαμένου δὲ τοῦ ζωγράφου, <sup>3</sup>Ω ἄνδρες, ἔφη ὁ Σωκράτης, πότερον ἡμᾶς δεῖ μᾶλλον Θεοδότη χάριν ἔχειν, ὅτι ἡμῖν τὸ κάλλος ἑαυτῆς ἐπέδειξεν, ἢ ταύτην ἡμῖν, ὅτι ἐθεασάμεθα; ἄρ' εἰ μὲν ταύτη ἀφελιμωτέρα ἐστὶν ἡ ἐπίδειξις, ταύτην ἡμῖν χάριν ἑκτέον, εἰ δὲ ἡμῖν ἡ θέα, ἡμᾶς ταύτη;

Εἰπόντος δέ τινος, ὅτι δίκαια λέγοι, Οὐκοῦν, ἔφη, αὕτη μὲν ἤδη τε τὸν παρ' ἡμῶν ἔπαινον κερδαίνει καὶ ἐπειδὰν εἰς πλείους διαγγείλωμεν, πλείω ὡφελήσεται ἡμεῖς δὲ ἤδη τε ὧν ἐθεασάμεθα ἐπιθυμοῦμεν ἄψασθαι καὶ ἄπιμεν ὑποκνιζόμενοι καὶ ἀπελθόντες ποθήσομεν. ἐκ δὲ τούτων εἰκὸς ἡμᾶς μὲν θεραπεύειν, ταύτην δὲ θεραπεύεσθαι.

Καὶ ἡ Θεοδότη, Νὴ Δί', ἔφη, εἰ τοίνυν ταῦθ' οὕτως ἔχει, ἐμὲ ἂν δέοι ὑμῖν τῆς θέας χάριν ἔχειν.

'Εκ δὲ τούτου ὁ Σωκράτης ὁρῶν αὐτήν τε πολυτελῶς κεκοσμημένην τὴν μητέρα παροῦσαν αὐτἢ ἐν ἐσθῆτι καὶ θεραπεία οὐ τἢ τυχούση καὶ θεραπαίνας πολλὰς καὶ εὐειδεῖς καὶ οὐδὲ ταύτας ἠμελημένως ἐχούσας καὶ τοῖς ἄλλοις τὴν οἰκίαν ἀφθόνως κατεσκευασμένην.

2

3

# MEMORABILIA III. 11.1-11.4

her portrait, and she showed them as much as decency allowed. "We had better go and see her," cried Socrates; "of course what beggars description can't very well be learned by hearsay."

"Come with me at once," returned his informant. So off they went to Theodoté's house, where they found her posing before a painter, and looked on.

When the painter had finished, Socrates said: "My friends, ought we to be more grateful to Theodoté for showing us her beauty or she to us for looking at it? Does the obligation rest with her if she profits more by showing it, but with us if we profit more by looking?"

When someone answered that this was a fair way of putting it, "Well now," he went on, "she already has our praise to her credit, and when we spread the news she'll profit still more; whereas we already long to touch what we've seen and we'll go away aroused and will miss her when we're gone. The natural consequence is that we become her adorers, she the adored."

"Then, if that's so," said Theodoté, "of course I ought to be grateful to you for looking."

At this point Socrates noticed that she was sumptuously dressed and that her mother at her side was wearing fine clothes and jewelry; and she had many pretty maids, who also were well cared for, and her house was lavishly furnished.

Εἰπέ μοι, ἔφη, ὧ Θεοδότη, ἔστι σοι ἀγρός;

Οὐκ ἔμοιγ', ἔφη.

Άλλ' ἄρα οἰκία προσόδους έχουσα;

Οὐδὲ οἰκία, ἔφη.

Άλλὰ μὴ χειροτέχναι τινές;

Οὐδὲ χειροτέχναι, ἔφη.

Πόθεν οὖν, ἔφη, τἀπιτήδεια ἔχεις;

Έάν τις, ἔφη, φίλος μοι γενόμενος εὖ ποιεῖν ἐθέλη, οὖτός μοι βίος ἐστί.

Νὴ τὴν Ἡραν, ἔφη, ὧ Θεοδότη, καλόν γε τὸ κτῆμα καὶ πολλῷ κρεῖττον ἢ οἰῶν τε καὶ αἰγῶν καὶ βοῶν φίλων ἀγέλην κεκτῆσθαι. ἀτάρ, ἔφη, πότερον τῆ τύχη ἐπιτρέπεις, ἐάν τίς σοι φίλος ὥσπερ μυῖα πρόσπτηται, ἢ καὶ αὐτή τι μηχανῷ;

Πῶς δ' ἄν, ἔφη, ἐγὼ τούτου μηχανὴν εὕροιμι;

Πολὺ νὴ Δί, ἔφη, προσηκόντως μᾶλλον ἢ αἱ φάλαγγες οἶσθα γάρ, ὡς ἐκεῖναι θηρῶσι τὰ πρὸς τὸν βίον ἀράχνια γὰρ δήπου λεπτὰ ὑφηνάμεναι ὅ τι ἂν ἐνταῦθα ἐμπέση, τούτῳ τροφῆ χρῶνται.

Καὶ ἐμοὶ οὖν, ἔφη, συμβουλεύεις ὑφήνασθαί τι θήρατρον;

Οὐ γὰρ δὴ οὕτως γε ἀτέχνως οἴεσθαι χρὴ τὸ πλείστου ἄξιον ἄγρευμα φίλους θηράσειν. οὐχ ὁρậς, ὅτι καὶ τὸ μικροῦ ἄξιον τοὺς λαγῶς θηρῶντες πολλὰ τεχνάζουσιν; ὅτι μὲν γὰρ τῆς νυκτὸς νέμονται, κύνας νυκτερευτικὰς πορισάμενοι ταύταις αὐτοὺς θηρῶσινοτι δὲ μεθ' ἡμέραν ἀποδιδράσκουσιν, ἄλλας κτῶνται κύνας, αἴτινες ἢ ἂν ἐκ τῆς νομῆς εἰς τὴν εὐνὴν ἀπέλ-

5

6

# MEMORABILIA III. 11.4-11.8

"Tell me, Theodoté," he said, "have you a farm?"

"Not I," she answered.

"Or a house, perhaps, that brings in money?"

"No house either."

"Some craftsmen, perhaps?"

"No craftsmen."

"Then how do you afford your things?"

"If one of my boyfriends wants to be generous, that's my livelihood."

"By Hera, Theodoté, a flock of friends is a fine property, and much better than a flock of sheep and goats and oxen. But," he went on, "do you trust to luck, waiting for friends to settle on you like flies, or do you have some scheme of your own?"

"How could I invent a scheme for that?"

"Much more conveniently, I assure you, than the spiders. For you know how they hunt for a living: they weave a thin web, I believe, and feed on anything that gets into it."

"So are you advising me to weave a trap of some sort?"

"Of course not. Don't suppose you are going to hunt friends, the noblest game in the world, by such crude methods. Don't you notice that many tricks are employed even for hunting such a poor thing as the hare?<sup>25</sup> Since hares feed by night, hounds specially adapted for night work are provided to hunt them; and since they run away at daybreak, another pack of hounds is obtained for track-

5

<sup>25</sup> Cyr. 1.6.40.

θωσι, τῆ ὀσμῆ αἰσθανόμεναι εὐρίσκουσιν αὐτούς ὅτι δὲ ποδώκεις εἰσίν, ὥστε καὶ ἐκ τοῦ φανεροῦ τρέχοντες ἀποφεύγειν, ἄλλας αὖ κύνας ταχείας παρασκευάζονται, ἵνα κατὰ πόδας ἀλίσκωνται ὅτι δὲ καὶ ταύτας αὐτῶν τινες ἀποφεύγουσι, δίκτυα ἱστᾶσιν εἰς τὰς ἀτραπούς, ἡ φεύγουσιν, ἵν' εἰς ταῦτα ἐμπίπτοντες συμποδίζωνται.

Τίνι οὖν, ἔφη, τοιούτω φίλους ἂν ἐγὼ θηρώην;

Έὰν νὴ Δί, ἔφη, ἀντὶ κυνὸς κτήση ὅστις σοι ἰχνεύων μὲν τοὺς φιλοκάλους καὶ πλουσίους εὑρήσει, εὑρὼν δὲ μηχανήσεται, ὅπως ἐμβάλη αὐτοὺς εἰς τὰ σὰ δίκτυα.

Καὶ ποῖα, ἔφη, ἐγὼ δίκτυα ἔχω;

Έν μὲν δήπου, ἔφη, καὶ μάλα εὖ περιπλεκόμενον, τὸ σῶμα· ἐν δὲ τοὐτῷ ψυχήν, ἢ καταμανθάνεις καὶ ὡς ἄν ἐμβλέπουσα χαρίζοιο καὶ ὅ τι ἄν λέγουσα εὐφραίνοις καὶ ὅτι δεῖ τὸν μὲν ἐπιμελόμενον ἀσμένως ὑποδέχεσθαι, τὸν δ' ἐντρυφῶντα ἀποκλείειν καὶ ἀρρωστήσαντός γε φίλου φροντιστικῶς ἐπισκέψασθαι καὶ καλόν τι πράξαντος σφόδρα συνησθῆναι καὶ τῷ σφόδρα σοῦ φροντίζοντι ὅλη τἢ ψυχῆ κεχαρίσθαι. φιλεῖν γε μὴν εὖ οἶδ' ὅτι ἐπίστασαι οὐ μόνον μαλακῶς, ἀλλὰ καὶ εὐνοϊκῶς· καὶ ὅτι ἀρεστοί σοί εἰσιν οἱ φίλοι, οἶδ' ὅτι οὐ λόγῷ ἀλλ' ἔργῷ ἀναπείθεις.

Μὰ τὸν Δί, ἔφη ἡ Θεοδότη, ἐγὼ τούτων οὐδὲν μηχανῶμαι.

11 Καὶ μήν, ἔφη, πολὺ διαφέρει τὸ κατὰ φύσιν τε καὶ ὀρθῶς ἀνθρώπῳ προσφέρεσθαι. καὶ γὰρ δὴ βία μὲν

9

#### MEMORABILIA III. 11.8-11.11

ing them by the scent along the run from the feeding ground to the nest; and since they are so nimble that once they are off they actually escape in the open, yet a third pack of speedy hounds is formed to catch them by hot pursuit; and as some escape even so, nets are set up in the tracks where they escape, so they can be driven into them and stopped cold."

"Then can I adapt this plan to the pursuit of friends?"
"Of course you can, if for the hound you substitute
an agent who will track and find rich men with an eye

for beauty and will then contrive to drive them into your nets."

"Nets! What nets have I got?"

"One, surely, that entangles quite nicely—your body! And inside it you have a soul that teaches you what glance will please, what words delight, and tells you that you should give a warm welcome to an eager suitor but slam the door on a roughhouser; yes, and when a friend has fallen sick, to show your anxiety by visiting him; and when he has had a stroke of good fortune, to congratulate him eagerly; and if he is eager in his suit, to put yourself at his service heart and soul. As for loving, you know how to do that, I am sure, both tenderly and thoughtfully; and that your friends please you, you convince them, I know, not by words but by deeds."

"No indeed," said Theodoté, "I don't contrive any of those things."

"Nevertheless," he continued, "it is very important that your behavior to a man should be both natural and cor11

οὖτ' ἂν ἔλοις οὖτε κατάσχοις φίλον, εὖεργεσία δὲ καὶ ἡδονἢ τὸ θηρίον τοῦτο ἀλώσιμόν τε καὶ παραμόνιμόν ἐστιν.

 $\lambda$   $\lambda$   $\eta$   $\theta$   $\hat{\eta}$   $\lambda$   $\epsilon$   $\gamma$   $\epsilon$   $\iota$   $\epsilon$   $\phi$   $\eta$ .

12 Δεῖ τοίνυν, ἔφη, πρῶτον μὲν τοὺς φροντίζοντάς σου τοιαῦτα ἀξιοῦν, οἶα ποιοῦσιν αὐτοῖς μικρότατα μελήσει· ἔπειτα δὲ αὐτὴν ἀμείβεσθαι χαριζομένην τὸν αὐτὸν τρόπον. οὕτω γὰρ ἂν μάλιστα φίλοι γίγνοιντο καὶ πλεῖστον χρόνον φιλοῖεν καὶ μέγιστα εὐεργετοῖεν.
13 χαρίζοιο δ' ἂν μάλιστα, εἰ δεομένοις δωροῖο τὰ παρὰ σεαυτῆς. ὁρῷς γάρ, ὅτι καὶ τῶν βρωμάτων τὰ ἥδιστα, ἐὰν μέν τις προσφέρη πρὶν ἐπιθυμεῖν, ἀηδῆ φαίνεται, κεκορεσμένοις δὲ καὶ βδελυγμίαν παρέχει· ἐὰν δέ τις προσφέρη λιμὸν ἐμποιήσας, κἂν φαυλότερα ἦ, πάνυ ἡδέα φαίνεται.

14 Πῶς οὖν ἄν, ἔφη, ἐγὼ λιμὸν ἐμποιεῖν τῳ τῶν παρ' ἐμοὶ δυναίμην;

Εἰ νὴ Δι', ἔφη, πρῶτον μὲν τοῖς κεκορεσμένοις μήτε προσφέροις μήτε ὑπομιμνήσκοις, ἕως ἂν τῆς πλησμονής παυσάμενοι πάλιν δέωνται, ἔπειτα τοὺς δεομένους ὑπομιμνήσκοις ὡς κοσμιωτάτη τε ὁμιλία καὶ τῷ μὴ φαίνεσθαι βουλομένη ⟨μὴ⟩ιο χαρίζεσθαι καὶ διαφεύγουσα, ἔως ἂν ὡς μάλιστα δεηθῶσι· τηνικαῦτα γὰρ πολὺ διαφέρει τὰ αὐτὰ δῶρα ἢ πρὶν ἐπιθυμῆσαι διδόναι.

15 Καὶ ἡ Θεοδότη, Τί οὖν οὐ σύ μοι, ἔφη, ὧ Σώκρατες, ἐγένου συνθηρατὴς τῶν φίλων;

Έάν γε νη Δί, ἔφη, πείθης με σύ.

# MEMORABILIA III. 11.11-11.15

rect. For assuredly you can neither catch a friend nor keep him by force;<sup>26</sup> it is kindness and sweetness that catch the creature and hold him fast."

"True," she said.

"First, then, you must ask such favors of your suitors as they will grant without a moment's hesitation; and next you must repay their favors in the same coin; for in this way they will prove most sincerely your friends, most constant in their affection and most generous. And they will appreciate your favors most highly if you wait till they ask for them. The most delicious foods, you see, if served before they are wanted, seem unpleasant, and to those who have had enough they are positively nauseating; but even poor fare is very welcome when offered to a hungry man."

"And how can I make them hunger for my fare?"

"First, you shouldn't offer it to them when they've had enough or prompt them until they've stopped feeling full and start to want more; then, when they feel the want, you should prompt them by behaving as a model of propriety, by a show of reluctance to yield, and by holding back until they are as eager as can be; for then the same gifts mean much more to the recipient than when they are offered before they are desired."

"Then, Socrates," said Theodoté, "why don't you become my partner in the pursuit of friends?"

"By all means—if you persuade me."

<sup>26</sup> Cyr. 8.7.13.

12

13

14

<sup>10</sup> add. Richards

Πῶς οὖν ἄν, ἔφη, πείσαιμί σε;

Ζητήσεις, έφη, τοῦτο αὐτὴ καὶ μηχανήση, ἐάν τί μου δέη.

Εἴσιθι τοίνυν, ἔφη, θαμινά.

Καὶ ὁ Σωκράτης ἐπισκώπτων τὴν αὐτοῦ ἀπραγμοσύνην, 'Αλλ', ὧ Θεοδότη, ἔφη, οὐ πάνυ μοι ῥάδιόν ἐστι σχολάσαι· καὶ γὰρ ἴδια πράγματα πολλὰ καὶ δημόσια παρέχει μοι ἀσχολίαν· εἰσὶ δὲ καὶ φίλαι μοι, αὶ οὔτε ἡμέρας οὔτε νυκτὸς ἀφ' αὐτῶν ἐάσουσί με ἀπιέναι φίλτρα τε μανθάνουσαι παρ' ἐμοῦ καὶ ἐπφδάς.

Έπίστασαι γάρ, ἔφη, καὶ ταῦτα, ὧ Σώκρατες;

'Αλλὰ διὰ τί οἴει, ἔφη, 'Απολλόδωρόν τε τόνδε καὶ 'Αντισθένην οὐδέποτέ μου ἀπολείπεσθαι; διὰ τί δὲ καὶ Κέβητα καὶ Σιμμίαν Θήβηθεν παραγίγνεσθαι; εὖ ἴσθι, ὅτι ταῦτα οὐκ ἄνευ πολλῶν φίλτρων τε καὶ ἐπφδῶν καὶ ἰύγγων ἐστί.

18 Χρῆσον τοίνυν μοι, ἔφη, τὴν ἴυγγα, ἵνα ἐπὶ σοὶ πρῶτον ἔλκω αὐτήν.

'Αλλὰ μὰ Δί', ἔφη, οὐκ αὐτὸς ἔλκεσθαι πρὸς σὲ βούλομαι, ἀλλὰ σὲ πρὸς ἐμὲ πορεύεσθαι.

Αλλὰ πορεύσομαι, ἔφη· μόνον ὑποδέχου.

'Αλλ' ὑποδέξομαί σε, ἔφη, ἐὰν μή τις φιλωτέρα σου ἔνδον ἢ.

12. Ἐπιγένην δὲ τῶν συνόντων τινά, νέον τε ὅντα καὶ τὸ σῶμα κακῶς ἔχοντα, ἰδών, ʿΩς ἰδιωτικῶς, ἔφη, τὸ σῶμα ἔχεις, ὦ Ἐπίγενες.

Καὶ ὅς, Ἰδιώτης γάρ, ἔφη, εἰμί, ὧ Σώκρατες.

# MEMORABILIA III. 11.15-12.1

"And how am I to persuade you?"

"You'll figure that out for yourself, if you want my help."

"Come and see me often, then."

"Well, Theodoté," said Socrates, making fun of his own leisurely habits, "it's not so easy for me to find time. I have a lot of business to occupy me, private and public; and I have female friends who won't leave me day or night; they are studying potions with me, and spells."

"So you understand these things too, Socrates?"

"Well, why do you suppose that Apollodorus here and Antisthenes never leave me? And why do Cebes and Simmias come to me from Thebes? I assure you this doesn't happen without the help of many potions and spells and magic wheels."

"Do lend me your wheel, so I can spin it first to attract you."

"But of course I don't want to be attracted to you: I want you to come to me."

"Oh, I'll come: only be sure you welcome me."

"Oh, you shall be welcome—unless there's a dearer girl with me!"

12. He noticed that Epigenes, one of his companions, was in poor shape for a young man, and said: "You take amateurish care of your physique, Epigenes."

"In fact," he replied, "I am an amateur, Socrates."

16

17

Οὐδέν γε μᾶλλον, ἔφη, τῶν ἐν Ὀλυμπία μελλόντων άγωνίζεσθαι ή δοκεί σοι μικρός είναι ό περί τής ψυχής πρὸς τοὺς πολεμίους ἀγών, ὃν Ἀθηναῖοι θήσουσιν, ὅταν τύχωσι; καὶ μὴν οὐκ ὀλίγοι μὲν διὰ τὴν τοῦ σώματος καχεξίαν ἀποθνήσκουσί τε ἐν τοῖς πολεμικοίς κινδύνοις καὶ αἰσχρώς σώζονται πολλοὶ δὲ δι' αὐτὸ τοῦτο ζῶντές τε ἁλίσκονται καὶ ἁλόντες ἤτοι δουλεύουσι τὸν λοιπὸν βίον, ἐὰν οὕτω τύχωσι, τὴν γαλεπωτάτην δουλείαν, η είς τὰς ἀνάγκας τὰς ἀλγεινοτάτας έμπεσόντες καὶ ἐκτίσαντες ἐνίοτε πλείω των ύπαρχόντων αὐτοῖς τὸν λοιπὸν βίον ἐνδεεῖς των άναγκαίων όντες καὶ κακοπαθούντες διαζώσι πολλοὶ δὲ δόξαν αἰσχρὰν κτῶνται διὰ τὴν τοῦ σώματος άδυναμίαν δοκοῦντες ἀποδειλιᾶν. ἢ καταφρονεῖς τῶν ἐπιτιμίων της καχεξίας τούτων καὶ ραδίως αν οἴει φέρειν τὰ τοιαῦτα; καὶ μὴν οἶμαί γε πολλώ ῥάω καὶ ἡδίω τούτων είναι α δει ύπομένειν τον έπιμελόμενον της τοῦ σώματος εὐεξίας ἢ ὑγιεινότερόν τε καὶ εἰς τἆλλα χρησιμώτερον νομίζεις εἶναι τὴν καχεξίαν τῆς εὐεξίας: ἢ τῶν διὰ τὴν εὐεξίαν γιγνομένων καταφρονεῖς: καὶ μὴν πάντα γε τἀναντία συμβαίνει τοῖς εὖ τὰ σώματα έχουσιν ή τοις κακώς, και γαρ ύγιαίνουσιν οί τὰ σώματα εὖ ἔχοντες καὶ ἰσχύουσι καὶ πολλοὶ μὲν διὰ τοῦτο ἐκ τῶν πολεμικῶν ἀγώνων σώζονταί τε εὐσχημόνως καὶ τὰ δεινὰ πάντα διαφεύγουσι, πολλοὶ δὲ φίλοις τε βοηθοῦσι καὶ τὴν πατρίδα εὐεργετοῦσι καὶ διὰ ταῦτα χάριτός τε ἀξιοῦνται καὶ δόξαν μεγάλην κτώνται καὶ τιμών καλλίστων τυγχάνουσι καὶ

### MEMORABILIA III 12 1-12 4

"No more so than the competitors entered at Olympia," he said. "Or do you count but a small thing the life and death struggle with their enemies that the Athenians will enter when the time comes? Not a few, thanks to their bad conditioning, lose their lives in the perils of war or save them disgracefully; and many, for this same reason, are taken prisoner and then either pass the rest of their days perhaps in slavery of the hardest kind, or, after meeting with cruel sufferings and sometimes paying more than they have, live on, destitute and in misery. Many, again, by their bodily weakness earn a bad reputation, being thought cowards. Or do you care little about these rewards of bad conditioning and think that you can easily endure such results? And yet I suppose that what has to be borne by anyone who takes care to keep his body in good condition is far lighter and far more pleasant than all this. Or is it that you think bad conditioning healthier and generally more serviceable than good, or do you care little about the effects of good conditioning? And yet the results of physical fitness are the direct opposite of those that follow from unfitness. The fit are healthy and strong; and consequently many save themselves decorously on the battlefield and escape all the dangers of war; many help friends and do good for their country and on that account they earn gratitude, get great glory and gain very high honors, and on

9.

διὰ ταῦτα<sup>11</sup> τόν τε λοιπὸν βίον ἥδιον καὶ κάλλιον διαζῶσι καὶ τοῖς ἑαυτῶν παισὶ καλλίους ἀφορμὰς εἰς τὸν βίον καταλείπουσιν.

Οὔτοι χρη ὅτι ἡ πόλις οὐκ ἀσκεῖ δημοσία τὰ πρὸς τὸν πόλεμον, διὰ τοῦτο καὶ ἰδία ἀμελεῖν, ἀλλὰ μηδὲν ηττον ἐπιμελεῖσθαι. εὖ γὰρ ἴσθι, ὅτι οὐδὲ ἐν ἄλλω ούδενὶ ἀγῶνι οὐδὲ ἐν πράξει οὐδεμιᾶ μεῖον ἕξεις διὰ τὸ βέλτιον τὸ σῶμα παρεσκευάσθαι πρὸς πάντα γάρ, ὅσα πράττουσιν ἄνθρωποι, χρήσιμον τὸ σῶμά έστιν έν πάσαις δὲ ταῖς τοῦ σώματος χρείαις πολὺ διαφέρει ώς βέλτιστα τὸ σῶμα ἔχειν ἐπεὶ καὶ ἐν ὧ δοκείς έλαχίστην σώματος χρείαν είναι, έν τῶ διανοεῖσθαι, τίς οὐκ οἶδεν, ὅτι καὶ ἐν τούτω πολλοὶ μεγάλα σφάλλονται διὰ τὸ μὴ ὑγιαίνειν τὸ σῶμα; καὶ λήθη δὲ καὶ ἀθυμία καὶ δυσκολία καὶ μανία πολλάκις πολλοίς διὰ τὴν τοῦ σώματος καχεξίαν εἰς τὴν διάνοιαν έμπίπτουσιν ούτως, ώστε καὶ τὰς ἐπιστήμας ἐκβάλλειν. τοῖς δὲ τὰ σώματα εὖ ἔχουσι πολλὴ ἀσφάλεια καὶ οὐδεὶς κίνδυνος διά γε τὴν τοῦ σώματος καχεξίαν τοιοῦτόν τι παθείν, εἰκὸς δὲ μᾶλλον πρὸς τὰ ἐναντία των διὰ τὴν καχεξίαν γιγνομένων τὴν εὐεξίαν χρήσιμον είναι, καίτοι των γε τοίς είρημένοις έναντίων **ἔνεκα τί οὐκ ἄν τις νοῦν ἔχων ὑπομείνειεν**;

Αἰσχρὸν δὲ καὶ τὸ διὰ τὴν ἀμέλειαν γηρᾶναι, πρὶν ἰδεῖν ἑαυτὸν ποῖος ἂν κάλλιστος καὶ κράτιστος τῷ σώματι γένοιτο. ταῦτα δὲ οὐκ ἔστιν ἰδεῖν ἀμελοῦντα· οὐ γὰρ ἐθέλει αὐτόματα γίγνεσθαι.

8

### MEMORABILIA III. 12.4-12.8

that account they live henceforth a better and more pleasant life, and leave to their children better means of winning a livelihood.

"Because military training is not publicly supported by the state, you should not make that an excuse for being any the less careful in attending to it yourself. For you may rest assured that there is no kind of struggle, apart from war, and no undertaking in which you will be worse off by keeping your body in better shape. For in everything that men do the body is useful; and in all uses of the body it is very important to keep the body in as optimal condition as possible. Even in the process of thinking, where the use of the body seems minimal, everyone knows that grave mistakes can often be traced to bad health. And because the body is in a bad condition, loss of memory, depression, bad temper, and insanity often assail the mind so violently as to drive whatever knowledge it contains clean out of it. But a sound and healthy body is a strong protection to those who have it, and at least there is no danger then of such a calamity happening to them through physical weakness: on the contrary, it is likely that their sound condition will serve to produce effects the opposite of those that arise from bad condition. And surely a man of sense would submit to anything to obtain the effects that are the opposite of those mentioned in my list.

"Besides, it is a disgrace to grow old through sheer carelessness before seeing what manner of man you may become by developing your bodily strength and beauty to their highest potential. But you cannot see it if you are careless, for it won't come of its own accord." 5

6

<sup>11</sup> om. Bessario, del. Sauppe

13. 'Οργιζομένου δέ ποτέ τινος, ὅτι προσειπών τινα χαίρειν οὐκ ἀντιπροσερρήθη, Γελοῖον, ἔφη, τὸ εἰ μὲν τὸ σῶμα κάκιον ἔχοντι ἀπήντησάς τῳ, μὴ ἂν ὀργίζεσθαι, ὅτι δὲ τὴν ψυχὴν ἀγροικοτέρως διακειμένῳ περιέτυχες, τοῦτό σε λυπεῖν.

Ἄλλου δὲ λέγοντος, ὅτι ἀηδῶς ἐσθίοι, ᾿Ακουμενός, ἔφη, τούτου φάρμακον ἀγαθὸν διδάσκει. ἐρομένου δέ, Ποῖον; Παύσασθαι ἐσθίοντα, ἔφη· καὶ ἥδιόν τε καὶ εὐτελέστερον καὶ ὑγιεινότερον διάξειν παυσάμενον.

"Αλλου δ' αὖ λέγοντος, ὅτι θερμὸν εἴη παρ' έαυτῷ τὸ ὕδωρ, ὁ πίνοι, "Όταν ἄρ', ἔφη, βούλη θερμῷ λούσασθαι, ἔτοιμον ἔσται σοι.

Άλλὰ ψυχρόν, ἔφη, ἐστὶν ὥστε λούσασθαι.

<sup>8</sup>Αρ' οὖν, ἔφη, καὶ οἱ οἰκέται σου ἄχθονται πίνοντές τε αὐτὸ καὶ λούμενοι αὐτῷ;

Μὰ τὸν Δί', ἔφη· ἀλλὰ καὶ πολλάκις τεθαύμακα, ώς ἡδέως αὐτῷ πρὸς ἀμφότερα ταῦτα χρῶνται.

Πότερον δέ, ἔφη, τὸ παρὰ σοὶ ὕδωρ θερμότερον πιεῖν ἐστιν ἢ τὸ ἐν ἀσκληπιοῦ;

Τὸ ἐν ᾿Ασκληπιοῦ, ἔφη.

Πότερον δὲ λούσασθαι ψυχρότερον, τὸ παρὰ σοὶ ἢ τὸ ἐν Ἀμφιαράου;

Τὸ ἐν ᾿Αμφιαράου, ἔφη.

Ένθυμοῦ οὖν, ἔφη, ὅτι κινδυνεύεις δυσαρεστότερος εἶναι τῶν τε οἰκετῶν καὶ τῶν ἀρρωστούντων.

Κολάσαντος δέ τινος ἰσχυρῶς ἀκόλουθον, ἤρετο, τί χαλεπαίνοι τῷ θεράποντι.

Ότι, έφη, ὀψοφαγίστατός τε ὢν βλακότατός ἐστι καὶ φιλαργυρώτατος ὢν ἀργότατος.

2.

#### MEMORABILIA III. 13.1-13.4

13. On a man who was angry because his greeting was not returned: "Ridiculous!" he said; "You would not have been angry if you had met a man in worse health; and yet you are annoyed because you have come across someone with ruder manners!"

On another who declared that he found no pleasure in eating: "Acumenus," he said, "has a good prescription for that ailment." And when asked "What?" he answered, "Stop eating; and you will then find life pleasanter, cheaper, and healthier."

On yet another who complained that the drinking water at home was warm: "Consequently," he said, "when you want warm water to wash in, you will have it at hand."

"But it's too cold for washing," said the other.

"Then do your servants complain when they use it both for drinking and washing?"

"Oh no, and I've often felt surprised that they are content with it for both these purposes."

"Which is the warmer to drink, the water in your house or Epidaurus water?" <sup>27</sup>

"Epidaurus water."

"And which is the colder to wash in, yours or Oropus water?"  $^{28}$ 

"Oropus water."

"Then reflect that you are apparently harder to please than servants and invalids."

When someone punished his footman severely, he 4 asked why he was angry with his servant.

"Because," said the other, "he's surpassingly gluttonous and blockheaded and greedy and lazy."

 $^{27}\,\mathrm{The}$  hot spring in the precincts of Asclepius' temple at Epidaurus.  $^{28}\,\mathrm{The}$  spring by the temple of Amphiaraus at Oropus in Boeotia.

2

"Ηδη ποτὲ οὖν ἐπεσκέψω, πότερος πλειόνων πληγῶν δεῖται, σὺ ἢ ὁ θεράπων;

Φοβουμένου δέ τινος τὴν εἰς 'Ολυμπίαν ὁδόν, Τί, ἔφη, φοβῆ τὴν πορείαν; οὐ καὶ οἴκοι σχεδὸν ὅλην τὴν ἡμέραν περιπατεῖς; καὶ ἐκεῖσε πορευόμενος περιπατήσας ἀριστήσεις, περιπατήσας δειπνήσεις καὶ ἀναπαύση. οὐκ οἶσθα, ὅτι εἰ ἐκτείναις τοὺς περιπάτους, οὺς ἐν πέντε ἢ ἔξ ἡμέραις περιπατεῖς, ῥαδίως ἂν 'λθήνηθεν εἰς 'Ολυμπίαν ἀφίκοιο; χαριέστερον δὲ καὶ προεξορμᾶν ἡμέρα μιᾶ μᾶλλον ἢ ὑστερίζειν. τὸ μὲν γὰρ ἀναγκάζεσθαι περαιτέρω τοῦ μετρίου μηκύνειν τὰς ὁδοὺς χαλεπόν, τὸ δὲ μιᾶ ἡμέρα πλείονας πορευθῆναι πολλὴν ῥαστώνην παρέχει. κρεῖττον οὖν ἐν τῆ ὁρμῆ σπεύδειν ἢ ἐν τῆ ὁδῶ.

Άλλου δὲ λέγοντος, ώς παρετάθη μακρὰν ὁδὸν πορευθείς, ἤρετο αὐτόν, εἰ καὶ φορτίον ἔφερε.

Μὰ Δί οὐκ ἔγωγ, ἔφη, ἀλλὰ τὸ ἱμάτιον.

Μόνος δ' ἐπορεύου, ἔφη, ἢ καὶ ἀκόλουθός σοι ἠκολούθει:

'Ηκολούθει, ἔφη.

Πότερον κενός, έφη, η φέρων τι;

Φέρων νη Δί', ἔφη, τά τε στρώματα καὶ τἆλλα σκεύη.

Καὶ πῶς, ἔφη, ἀπήλλαχεν ἐκ τῆς ὁδοῦ;

Έμοὶ μὲν δοκείν, ἔφη, βέλτιον ἐμοῦ.

Τί οὖν; ἔφη, εἰ τὸ ἐκείνου φορτίον ἔδει σε φέρειν, πῶς ἂν οἴει διατεθῆναι;

Κακώς νη  $\Delta \hat{\iota}$ , έφη· μᾶλλον δὲ οὐδ' ἂν ήδυνήθην κομίσαι.

5

## MEMORABILIA III. 13.4-13.6

"Have you ever considered, then, who deserves the bigger beating, the master or the servant?"

When someone was afraid of the journey to Olympia, he said: "Why do you fear the distance? When you're at home, don't you spend most of the day walking about? On your way there you will take a walk before breakfast, and another before lunch, and then take a rest. Don't you know that if you put together the walks you take in five or six days, you can easily cover the distance from Athens to Olympia? It is more comfortable, too, to start a day early rather than a day late, since to be forced to make the stages of the journey unduly long is unpleasant; but to take a day extra on the way makes easy going. So it is better to hurry over the start than on the road."

When another said that he was worn out after a long journey, he asked him whether he had carried a load.

"Oh no," said the man; "only my coat."

"Were you alone, or did you have a footman with you?"
"I had."

"Empty-handed or carrying anything?"

"He carried the rugs and the rest of the baggage, of course."

"And how has he come out of the journey?"

"Better than I, so far as I can tell."

"Well then, if you had been forced to carry his load, how would you have felt, do you suppose?"

"Bad, of course; or rather, I couldn't have done it."

Τὸ οὖν τοσούτῳ ἦττον τοῦ παιδὸς δύνασθαι πονεῖν πῶς ἠσκημένου δοκεῖ σοι ἀνδρὸς εἶναι;

14. Όπότε δὲ τῶν συνιόντων ἐπὶ δεῖπνον οἱ μὲν μικρὸν ὄψον, οἱ δὲ πολὺ φέροιεν, ἐκέλευεν ὁ Σωκράτης τὸν παίδα τὸ μικρὸν ἢ εἰς τὸ κοινὸν τιθέναι ἢ διανέμειν ἑκάστῳ τὸ μέρος. οἱ οὖν τὸ πολὺ φέροντες ἢσχύνοντο τό τε μὴ κοινωνεῖν τοῦ εἰς τὸ κοινὸν τιθεμένου καὶ τὸ μὴ ἀντιτιθέναι τὸ ἑαυτῶν. ἐτίθεσαν οὖν καὶ τὸ ἑαυτῶν εἰς τὸ κοινόν καὶ ἐπεὶ οὐδὲν πλέον εἶχον τῶν μικρὸν φερομένων, ἐπαύοντο πολλοῦ ὀψωνοῦντες.

Καταμαθών δέ ποτε τών συνδειπνούντων τινὰ τοῦ μὲν σίτου πεπαυμένον, τὸ δὲ ὅψον αὐτὸ καθ' αὐτὸ ἐσθίοντα, λόγου ὅντος περὶ ὀνομάτων, ἐφ' οῖῳ ἔργῳ ἔκαστον εἴη, Ἔχοιμεν ἄν, ἔφη, ὧ ἄνδρες, εἰπεῖν, ἐπὶ ποίῳ ποτὲ ἔργῳ ἄνθρωπος ὀψοφάγος καλεῖται; ἐσθίουσι μὲν γὰρ δὴ πάντες ἐπὶ τῷ σίτῳ ὅψον, ὅταν παρῆ ἀλλ' οὐκ οἶμαί πω ἐπὶ τούτῳ γε ὀψοφάγοι καλοῦνται.

Οὐ γὰρ οὖν, ἔφη τις τῶν παρόντων.

Τί γάρ; ἔφη, ἐάν τις ἄνευ τοῦ σίτου τὸ ὄψον αὐτὸ ἐσθίῃ μὴ ἀσκήσεως, ἀλλ' ἡδονῆς ἕνεκα, πότερον ὀψοφάγος εἶναι δοκεῖ ἢ οὕ;

 $\Sigma$ χολ $\hat{\eta}$  γ' ἄν, ἔφη, ἄλλος τις ὀψοφάγος εἴη.

Καί τις ἄλλος τῶν παρόντων, Ὁ δὲ μικρῷ σίτῳ, ἔφη, πολὺ ὄψον ἐπεσθίων;

Έμοὶ μέν, ἔφη ὁ Σωκράτης, καὶ οὖτος δοκεῖ δικαίως ầν ὀψοφάγος καλεῖσθαι· καὶ ὅταν γε οἱ ἄλλοι ἄνθρωποι τοῖς θεοῖς εὕχωνται πολυκαρπίαν, εἰκότως ἂν οὖτος πολυοψίαν εὕχοιτο.

4 Ταῦτα δὲ τοῦ Σωκράτους εἰπόντος, νομίσας ὁ νεα-

2

## MEMORABILIA III. 13.6-14.4

"Indeed! do you think a trained man ought to be so much less capable of work than his servant?"

14. Whenever some of the members of a dining club brought more appetizers<sup>29</sup> than others, Socrates would tell the waiter either to put the small contribution into the common stock or to portion it out equally among the diners. So the high contributors felt obliged not only to take their share of the pool, but to pool their own supplies in return; and so they put their own supplies also into the common stock. And since they got no more that way than those who brought little with them, they gave up spending a lot on appetizers.

He observed on one occasion that one of the company at dinner had stopped eating bread and ate only the appetizers. Now the talk was of names and the actions to which they are properly applied. "Can we say, my friends," said Socrates, "what is the nature of the action for which a man is called greedy? For all, I presume, eat appetizers with their bread when they get the chance: but I don't think there is so far any reason for calling them greedy?"

"No, certainly not," said one of the company.

"Well, suppose he eats the appetizers alone, without the bread, not because he's in training but to tickle his palate, does he seem greedy or not?"

"If not, it's hard to say who does," was the reply.

Here another of the company asked, "And what about eating a scrap of bread with a large helping of appetizers?"

"I think that one too deserves the label," said Socrates. "And when others pray for a good wheat harvest, he presumably would pray for a good supply of appetizers."

The young man, guessing that these remarks of Socra-

2

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>29</sup> ὄψον, literally a tidbit eaten with bread; Latin *pulmentum*.

νίσκος εἰς αὑτὸν εἰρῆσθαι τὰ λεχθέντα τὸ μὲν ὄψον οὐκ ἐπαύσατο ἐσθίων, ἄρτον δὲ προσέλαβε. καὶ ὁ Σωκράτης καταμαθών, Παρατηρεῖτ, ἔφη, τοῦτον οἱ πλησίον, ὁπότερα τῷ σίτῳ ὄψῳ ἢ τῷ ὄψῳ σίτῳ χρήσεται.

Άλλον δέ ποτε των συνδείπνων ίδων ἐπὶ τῷ ένὶ ψωμῶ πλειόνων ὄψων γευόμενον, Άρα γένοιτ' ἄν, ἔφη, πολυτελεστέρα ὀψοποιία ἢ μᾶλλον τὰ ὄψα λυμαινομένη ἢ ἡν ὀψοποιεῖται ὁ ἄμα πολλὰ ἐσθίων καὶ ἄμα παντοδαπὰ ἡδύσματα εἰς τὸ στόμα λαμβάνων; πλείω μέν γε τῶν ὀψοποιῶν συμμιγνύων πολυτελέστερα ποιεί: α δε εκείνοι μη συμμιγνύουσιν ως ούχ αρμόττοντα, ὁ συμμιγνύων, εἴπερ ἐκεῖνοι ὀρθῶς ποιοῦσιν, άμαρτάνει τε καὶ καταλύει τὴν τέχνην αὐτῶν. καίτοι πως οὐ γελοῖόν ἐστι παρασκευάζεσθαι μὲν ὀψοποιοὺς τοὺς ἄριστα ἐπισταμένους, αὐτὸν δὲ μηδ' ἀντιποιούμενον τῆς τέχνης ταύτης τὰ ὑπ' ἐκείνων ποιούμενα μετατιθέναι; καὶ ἄλλο δέ τι προσγίγνεται τῷ ἄμα πολλὰ ἐσθίειν ἐθισθέντι μὴ παρόντων γὰρ πολλῶν μειονεκτείν ἄν τι δοκοίη ποθών τὸ σύνηθες ὁ δὲ συνεθισθείς τὸν ἕνα ψωμὸν ένὶ ὄψω προπέμπειν, ὅτε μὴ παρείη πολλά, δύναιτ' ἂν ἀλύπως τῷ ένὶ χρῆσ $\theta$ αι.

Έλεγε δὲ καὶ ὡς τὸ εὐωχεῖσθαι ἐν τῆ ᾿Αθηναίων γλώττη ἐσθίειν καλοῖτο· τὸ δὲ εὖ προσκεῖσθαι ἔφη ἐπὶ τῷ ταῦτα ἐσθίειν, ἃ μήτε τὴν ψυχὴν μήτε τὸ σῶμα λυποίη μηδὲ δυσεύρετα εἴη· ὥστε καὶ τὸ εὐωχεῖσθαι τοῖς κοσμίως διαιτωμένοις ἀνετίθει.

#### MEMORABILIA III. 14.4-14.7

tes applied to him, did not stop eating his appetizers but took some bread with them. When Socrates observed this, he said: "Watch that one, you who are near him, and see whether he treats the bread as his appetizer or the appetizer as his bread."

On another occasion he noticed one of the company at dinner tasting several appetizers with each bite of bread. "Can you imagine," he asked, "a course more extravagant and more ruinous to the appetizers than the one consumed by a man who eats many things together and crams all sorts of sauces into his mouth at once? At any rate by mixing more ingredients than the cooks, he adds to the cost, and since he mixes ingredients that they regard as unsuitable in a mixture, if they are right, then he is wrong and is ruining their art. Yet it is surely ridiculous for a host to obtain highly skilled cooks, and then, though he claims no knowledge of the art, to alter their dishes? There's another drawback, too, attaching to the habit of eating many things together. For if many dishes are not provided, one seems to go short because one misses the usual variety: whereas he who is accustomed to take one kind of appetizer along with one bit of bread can make the best of one dish when more are not forthcoming."

He used to say too that the term "good feeding" in Attic was a synonym for "eating." The "good" in the compound implied the eating of food that could harm neither body nor soul and was not hard to come by. Thus he attributed even good feeding to sober livers.

275

5

c

\_

'

1. Οὕτω δὲ Σωκράτης ἢν ἐν παντὶ πράγματι καὶ πάντα τρόπον ἀφέλιμος, ὥστε σκοπουμένῳ τῷ καὶ μετρίως αἰσθανομένῳ φανερὸν εἶναι, ὅτι οὐδὲν ἀφελιμότερον ἢν τοῦ Σωκράτει συνεῖναι καὶ μετ' ἐκείνου διατρίβειν ὁπουοῦν καὶ ἐν ὁτῳοῦν πράγματι ἐπεὶ καὶ τὸ ἐκείνου μεμνῆσθαι μὴ παρόντος οὐ μικρὰ ἀφέλει τοὺς εἰωθότας τε αὐτῷ συνεῖναι καὶ ἀποδεχομένους ἐκεῖνον. καὶ γὰρ παίζων οὐδὲν ἦττον ἢ σπουδάζων ἐλυσιτέλει τοῖς συνδιατρίβουσι.

Πολλάκις γὰρ ἔφη μὲν ἄν τινος ἐρᾶν, φανερὸς δ' ἢν οὐ τῶν τὰ σώματα πρὸς ὥραν, ἀλλὰ τῶν τὰς ψυχὰς πρὸς ἀρετὴν εὖ πεφυκότων ἐφιέμενος. ἐτεκμαίρετο δὲ τὰς ἀγαθὰς φύσεις ἐκ τοῦ ταχύ τε μανθάνειν οῗς προσέχοιεν καὶ μνημονεύειν ἃ μάθοιεν καὶ ἐπιθυμεῖν τῶν μαθημάτων πάντων, δι' ὧν ἔστιν οἷκόν¹ τε καλῶς οἰκεῖν καὶ πόλιν καὶ τὸ ὅλον ἀνθρώποις τε καὶ τοῖς ἀνθρωπίνοις πράγμασιν εὖ χρῆσθαι τοὺς γὰρ τοιούτους ἡγεῖτο παιδευθέντας οὐκ ἃν μόνον αὐτούς τε εὐδαίμονας εἶναι καὶ τοὺς ἑαυτῶν οἴκους καλῶς οἰκεῖν, ἀλλὰ καὶ ἄλλους ἀνθρώπους καὶ πόλεις δύνασθαι εὐδαίμονας ποιεῖν. οὐ τὸν αὐτὸν δὲ τρόπον ἐπὶ πάντας

# BOOK IV

1. Socrates was so useful in all circumstances and in all ways that any observer gifted with ordinary perception can see that nothing was more useful than the companionship of Socrates and time spent with him in any place and in any circumstances. The very recollection of him in absence brought no small benefit to his constant companions and followers; for even in his light moods they gained no less from his society than when he was serious.

Thus he would often say he was "in love" with someone; but his heart was obviously set not on those who were good looking but on those whose souls naturally inclined to excellence. These excellent beings he recognized by their quickness to learn whatever subject they studied, ability to remember what they learned, and desire for every kind of knowledge on which depend good management of a household and state and tactful dealing with people and people's affairs. For education would make such beings not only happy in themselves and successful in the management of their households, but capable of conferring happiness on other people and states alike. His method of

<sup>1</sup> Hirschig: οἰκίαν codd. Stobaeus

ήει, άλλὰ τοὺς μὲν οἰομένους φύσει ἀγαθοὺς εἶναι, μαθήσεως δε καταφρονούντας εδίδασκεν, ὅτι αἱ ἄρισται δοκούσαι εἶναι φύσεις μάλιστα παιδείας δέονται, ἐπιδεικνύων τῶν τε ἵππων τοὺς εὐφυεστάτους θυμοειδείς τε καὶ σφοδρούς ὄντας, εἰ μὲν ἐκ νέων δαμασθείεν, εύχρηστοτάτους καὶ ἀρίστους γιγνομένους, εἰ δὲ ἀδάμαστοι γένοιντο, δυσκαθεκτοτάτους καὶ φαυλοτάτους, καὶ τῶν κυνῶν τῶν εὐφυεστάτων, φιλοπόνων τε οὐσῶν καὶ ἐπιθετικῶν τοῖς θηρίοις, τὰς μέν καλώς ἀχθείσας ἀρίστας γίνεσθαι πρὸς τὰς θήρας καὶ χρησιμωτάτας. (τὰς)2 ἀνανώνους δὲ νιννομένας ματαίους τε καὶ μανιώδεις καὶ δυσπειθεστάτας. όμοίως δὲ καὶ τῶν ἀνθρώπων τοὺς εὐφυεστάτους, ἐρρωμενεστάτους τε ταις ψυχαις όντας και έξεργαστικωτάτους ὧν ἂν ἐγχειρῶσι, παιδευθέντας μὲν καὶ μαθόντας ἃ δεῖ πράττειν ἀρίστους τε καὶ ώφελιμωτάτους γίγνεσθαι πλείστα γὰρ καὶ μέγιστα ἀγαθὰ έργάζεσθαι άπαιδεύτους δε καὶ άμαθεῖς γενομένους κακίστους τε καὶ βλαβερωτάτους γίγνεσθαι κρίνειν γαρ οὐκ ἐπισταμένους ἃ δεῖ πράττειν πολλάκις πονηροίς ἐπιχειρείν πράγμασι, μεγαλείους δὲ καὶ σφοδρούς όντας δυσκαθέκτους τε καὶ δυσαποτρέπτους εἶναι διὸ πλεῖστα καὶ μέγιστα κακὰ ἐργάζεσθαι.

Τοὺς δ' ἐπὶ πλούτῳ μέγα φρονοῦντας καὶ νομίζοντας οὐδὲν προσδεῖσθαι παιδείας, ἐξαρκέσειν δὲ σφίσι τὸν πλοῦτον οἰομένους πρὸς τὸ διαπράττεσθαί τε ὅ τι ἂν βούλωνται καὶ τιμᾶσθαι ὑπὸ τῶν ἀνθρώπων, ἐφρένου λέγων, ὅτι μῶρος μὲν εἴη εἴ τις οἴεται μὴ μαθὼν

#### MEMORABILIA IV. 1.3-1.5

approach varied. To those who thought themselves possessed of natural endowments and despised learning he explained that the greater the natural gifts the greater the need of education, pointing out that thoroughbreds by their spirit and mettle develop into serviceable and splendid creatures if they are broken in as colts, but if unbroken they prove intractable and sorry nags; and highbred puppies, keen workers and good tacklers of game, make firstrate hounds and useful dogs if well trained, but if untrained they turn out stupid, crazy, and utterly disobedient. It is the same with human beings. The most highly gifted, the youths of ardent soul, capable of doing whatever they attempt, if educated and taught their duty grow into excellent and useful men; for manifold and great are their good deeds. But untrained and untaught, they turn out utterly evil and destructive; for without knowledge to discern their duty, they often put their hand to vile deeds, and through the very grandeur and vehemence of their nature they are uncontrollable and intractable; therefore manifold and great are their evil deeds.1

Those who prided themselves on riches and thought they had no need of education, supposing that their wealth would suffice for gaining the objects of their wishes and winning people's respect, he admonished thus. "Only a fool," he said, "can think it possible to distinguish between

1 Is Alcibiades in his mind?

4

<sup>2</sup> add. Richards

τά τε ἀφέλιμα καὶ τὰ βλαβερὰ τῶν πραγμάτων διαγνώσεσθαι, μῶρος δ' εἴ τις μὴ διαγιγνώσκων μὲν ταῦτα, διὰ δὲ τὸν πλοῦτον ὅ τι ἃν βούληται ποριζόμενος οἴεται δυνήσεσθαι τὰ συμφέροντα πράττειν, ἠλίθιος δ' εἴ τις μὴ δυνάμενος τὰ συμφέροντα πράττειν εὖ τε πράττειν οἴεται καὶ τὰ πρὸς τὸν βίον αὐτῷ [ἢ καλῶς ἢ]³ ἱκανῶς παρεσκευάσθαι, ἠλίθιος δὲ καὶ εἴ τις οἴεται διὰ τὸν πλοῦτον μηδὲν ἐπιστάμενος δόξειν τι ἀγαθὸς εἶναι ἢ μηδὲν ἀγαθὸς εἶναι δοκῶν εὐδοκιμήσειν.

2. Τοῖς δὲ νομίζουσι παιδείας τε τῆς ἀρίστης τετυχηκέναι καὶ μέγα φρονοῦσιν ἐπὶ σοφία ὡς προσεφέρετο, νῦν διηγήσομαι. καταμαθὼν γὰρ Εὐθύδημον τὸν καλὸν γράμματα πολλὰ συνειλεγμένον ποιητῶν τε καὶ σοφιστῶν τῶν εὐδοκιμωτάτων καὶ ἐκ τούτων ἤδη τε νομίζοντα διαφέρειν τῶν ἡλικιωτῶν ἐν σοφία καὶ μεγάλας ἐλπίδας ἔχοντα παντων διοίσειν τῷ δύνασθαι λέγειν τε καὶ πράττειν πρῶτον μὲν, αἰσθανόμενος αὐτὸν διὰ νεότητα οὔπω εἰς τὴν ἀγορὰν εἰσιόντα, εἰ δὲ τι βούλοιτο διαπράξασθαι, καθίζοντα εἰς ἡνιοποιείον τι τῶν ἐγγὺς τῆς ἀγορᾶς, εἰς τοῦτο καὶ αὐτὸς ἤει τῶν μεθ' ἑαυτοῦ τινας ἔχων.

Καὶ πρώτον μὲν πυνθανομένου τινός, πότερον Θεμιστοκλῆς διὰ συνουσίαν τινὸς τῶν σοφῶν ἢ φύσει τοσοῦτον διήνεγκε τῶν πολιτῶν, ἄστε πρὸς ἐκείνον ἀποβλέπειν τὴν πόλιν, ὁπότε σπουδαίου ἀνδρὸς δεηθείη;

ό Σωκράτης βουλόμενος κινείν τὸν Εὐθύδημον εὔη-

what is useful and what is harmful without learning: only a fool can think that without distinguishing these he will get all he wants by means of his wealth and be able to do what is expedient: only a simpleton can think that without the power to do what is expedient he is doing well and has made good or sufficient provision for his life: only a simpleton can think that by his wealth alone without knowledge he will be reputed good at something or will enjoy a good reputation without being reputed good at anything in particular.

2. I will now describe his method of dealing with those who thought they had received the best education and prided themselves on wisdom. He was informed that Euthydemus, the handsome one, had formed a large collection of the works of celebrated poets and thinkers and therefore supposed himself to be a prodigy of wisdom for his age and was confident of surpassing all competitors in power of speech and action. At present, Socrates observed, he did not enter the marketplace owing to his youth, but when he wanted to get anything done he would be found sitting in a saddler's shop near the market. So to make an opening Socrates went to this shop with some of his companions.

At the first visit, one of them asked, "Was it by constantly being with some wise man or by natural ability that Themistocles stood out among his fellow citizens as the man to whom the city naturally looked when it felt the want of a great leader?"

In order to set Euthydemus thinking, Socrates said: "If

<sup>3</sup> del Dindorf

θες ἔφη εἶναι τὸ οἴεσθαι τὰς μὲν ὀλίγου ἀξίας τέχνας μὴ γίγνεσθαι σπουδαίους ἄνευ διδασκάλων ἱκανῶν, τὸ δὲ προεστάναι πόλεως, πάντων ἔργων μέγιστον ὄν, ἀπὸ ταὐτομάτου παραγίγνεσθαι τοῖς ἀνθρώποις.

Πάλιν δέ ποτε παρόντος τοῦ Εὐθυδήμου, ὁρῶν αὐτὸν ἀποχωροῦντα τῆς συνεδρίας καὶ φυλαττόμενον, μὴ δόξη τὸν Σωκράτην θαυμάζειν ἐπὶ σοφία, "Ότι μέν, ἔφη, ὧ ἄνδρες, Εὐθύδημος ούτοσὶ ἐν ἡλικία γενόμενος, τῆς πόλεως λόγον περί τινος προτιθείσης, οὐκ ἀφέξεται τοῦ συμβουλεύειν, εὕδηλόν ἐστιν ἐξ ὧν ἐπιτηδεύει· δοκεῖ δέ μοι καλὸν προοίμιον τῶν δημηγοριῶν παρασκευάσασθαι φυλαττόμενος, μὴ δόξη μανθάνειν τι παρά του. δῆλον γὰρ ὅτι λέγειν ἀρχόμενος ὧδε προοιμιάσεται·

Παρ' οὐδενὸς μὲν πώποτε, ὧ ἄνδρες Ἀθηναῖοι, οὐδὲν ἔμαθον οὐδ' ἀκούων τινὰς εἶναι λέγειν τε καὶ πράττειν ἱκανοὺς ἐζήτησα τούτοις ἐντυχεῖν οὐδ' ἐπεμελήθην τοῦ διδάσκαλόν τινά μοι γενέσθαι τῶν ἐπισταμένων, ἀλλὰ καὶ τἀναντία· διατετέλεκα γὰρ φεύγων οὐ μόνον τὸ μανθάνειν τι παρά τινος, ἀλλὰ καὶ τὸ δόξαι. ὅμως δὲ ὅ τι ἂν ἀπὸ ταὐτομάτου ἐπίη μοι, συμβουλεύσω ὑμῖν.

Άρμόσειε δ' αν οὕτω προοιμιάζεσθαι καὶ τοῖς βουλομένοις παρὰ τῆς πόλεως ἰατρικον ἔργον λαβεῖν ἐπιτήδειόν γ' αν αὐτοῖς εἴη τοῦ λόγου ἄρχεσθαι ἐντεῦθεν

Παρ' οὐδενὸς μὲν πώποτε, ὧ ἄνδρες Άθηναῖοι, τὴν ἰατρικὴν τέχνην ἔμαθον οὐδ' ἐζήτησα διδάσκαλον

5

#### MEMORABILIA IV. 2.2-2.5

in the minor arts great achievement is impossible without competent masters, surely it is absurd to imagine that the art of statesmanship, the greatest of all accomplishments, comes to a man of its own accord."

Some time afterward, meeting Euthydemus again, he saw that he was reluctant to join the circle and anxious not to betray any admiration for the wisdom of Socrates: "Well, gentlemen," he said, "when our friend Euthydemus here has attained majority and some question of policy is before the Assembly, he won't be backward in offering advice: that is obvious from his behavior. I imagine that he has prepared a noble exordium to his addresses, with due care not to give the impression that he is indebted to anyone for his knowledge. No doubt he will begin his speech with this introduction:

"'Gentlemen of Athens, I have never yet learned anything from anyone, nor when I have been told of any man's ability in speech and in action have I sought to meet him, nor have I taken the trouble to find a teacher among the men who know. On the contrary, I have constantly avoided learning anything from anyone, and even the appearance of it. Nevertheless I shall recommend to your consideration anything that comes into my head."

"This exordium might be adapted so as to suit candidates for the office of public physician. They might begin their speeches in this strain:

"Men of Athens, I have never yet studied medicine, nor sought to find a teacher among our physicians; for I

5

έμαυτῷ γενέσθαι τῶν ἰατρῶν οὐδένα· διατετέλεκα γὰρ φυλαττόμενος οὐ μόνον τὸ μαθεῖν τι παρὰ τῶν ἰατρῶν, ἀλλὰ καὶ τὸ δόξαι μεμαθηκέναι τὴν τέχνην ταύτην. ὅμως δέ μοι τὸ ἰατρικὸν ἔργον δότε· πειράσομαι γὰρ ἐν ὑμῖν ἀποκινδυνεύων μανθάνειν.

Πάντες οὖν οἱ παρόντες ἐγέλασαν ἐπὶ τῷ προοιμίῳ. Έπεὶ δὲ φανερὸς ἦν ὁ Εὐθύδημος ἤδη μὲν οἷς ὁ Σωκράτης λέγοι προσέχων, ἔτι δὲ φυλαττόμενος αὐτός τι φθέγγεσθαι καὶ νομίζων τῆ σιωπῆ σωφροσύνης δόξαν περιβάλλεσθαι, τότε ὁ Σωκράτης Βουλόμενος αὐτὸν παῦσαι τούτου, Θαυμαστὸν γάρ, ἔφη, τί ποτε οί βουλόμενοι κιθαρίζειν η αὐλεῖν η ίππεύειν η άλλο τι των τοιούτων ίκανοὶ γενέσθαι πειρώνται ώς συνεχέστατα ποιείν ὅ τι ἂν βούλωνται δυνατοὶ γενέσθαι καὶ οὐ καθ' έαυτούς, ἀλλὰ παρὰ τοῖς ἀρίστοις δοκοῦσιν εἶναι, πάντα ποιοῦντες καὶ ὑπομένοντες ένεκα τοῦ μηδὲν ἄνευ τῆς ἐκείνων γνώμης ποιείν, ὡς οὐκ ἂν ἄλλως ἀξιόλογοι γενόμενοι, τῶν δὲ βουλομένων δυνατών γενέσθαι λέγειν τε καὶ πράττειν τὰ πολιτικά νομίζουσί τινες ἄνευ παρασκευής καὶ ἐπιμελείας αὐτόματοι έξαίφνης δυνατοί ταῦτα ποιείν ἔσεσθαι, καίτοι γε τοσούτω ταῦτα ἐκείνων δυσκατεργαστότερα φαίνεται, ὅσωπερ πλειόνων περὶ ταῦτα πραγματευομένων έλάττους οἱ κατεργαζόμενοι γίγνονται. δήλον οὖν ὅτι καὶ ἐπιμελείας δέονται πλείονος καὶ ἰσχυροτέρας οἱ τούτων ἐφιέμενοι ἢ οἱ ἐκείνων.

Κατ' ἀρχὰς μὲν οὖν ἀκούοντος Εὐθυδήμου τοιούτους λόγους ἔλεγε Σωκράτης· ὡς δ' ἤσθετο αὐτὸν ἑτοιμότε-

8

#### MEMORABILIA IV. 2.5-2.8

have constantly avoided learning anything from the physicians and even the appearance of having studied their art. Nevertheless I ask you to appoint me to the office of physician, and I will endeavor to learn by experimenting on you."

The exordium set all the company laughing.

Now when it became evident that Socrates had gained the attention of Euthydemus but that Euthydemus still avoided breaking silence himself, and thought that he assumed an air of prudence by remaining mute, Socrates wanted to put an end to that affectation. "How strange it is," he said, "that those who want to play the harp or the pipes, or to ride or to get skill in any similar accomplishment, work hard at the art they mean to master, and not by themselves but under the tuition of the most eminent practitioners, doing and bearing anything in their anxiety to do nothing without their mentors' guidance, simply because that is the only way to become proficient: and yet, among those who want to shine as speakers in the Assembly and as statesmen, there are some who think that they will be able to do so all of a sudden, by instinct, without training or study. Yet surely these arts are much the harder to learn; for many more are interested in them and far fewer succeed. Clearly then these arts demand a longer and more intense application than the others."

For a time then, Socrates continued to talk in this strain, while Euthydemus listened. But on finding him

ρον ὑπομένοντα, ὅτε διαλέγοιτο, καὶ προθυμότερον ἀκούοντα, μόνος ἦλθεν εἰς τὸ ἡνιοποιεῖον· παρακαθε-ζομένου δ' αὐτῷ τοῦ Εὐθυδήμου, Εἰπέ μοι, ἔφη, ὧ Εὐθύδημε, τῷ ὄντι, ὥσπερ ἐγὼ ἀκούω, πολλὰ γράμματα συνῆχας τῶν λεγομένων σοφῶν ἀνδρῶν γεγονέναι:

Καὶ ὁ Εὐθύδημος, Νὴ τὸν Δί, ἔφη, ὧ Σώκρατες· καὶ ἔτι γε συνάγω, ἔως ἂν κτήσωμαι ὡς ἂν δύνωμαι πλεῖστα.

9 Νὴ τὴν Ἡραν, ἔφη ὁ Σωκράτης, ἄγαμαί γέ σου, διότι οὐκ ἀργυρίου καὶ χρυσίου προείλου θησαυροὺς κεκτῆσθαι μᾶλλον ἢ σοφίας δῆλον γὰρ ὅτι νομίζεις ἀργύριον καὶ χρυσίον οὐδὲν βελτίους ποιεῖν τοὺς ἀνθρώπους, τὰς δὲ τῶν σοφῶν ἀνδρῶν γνώμας ἀρετῆ πλουτίζειν τοὺς κεκτημένους.

Καὶ ὁ Εὐθύδημος ἔχαιρεν ἀκούων ταῦτα, νομίζων δοκεῖν τῷ Σωκράτει ὀρθῶς μετιέναι τὴν σοφίαν. ὁ δὲ καταμαθὼν αὐτὸν ἡσθέντα τῷ ἐπαίνῳ τούτῳ, Τί δὲ δὴ βουλόμενος ἀγαθὸς γενέσθαι, ἔφη, ὧ Εὐθύδημε, συλλέγεις τὰ γράμματα;

Έπεὶ δὲ διεσιώπησεν ὁ Εὐθύδημος σκοπῶν, ὅ τι ἀποκρίναιτο, πάλιν ὁ Σωκράτης, Ἦρα μὴ ἰατρός; ἔφηπολλὰ γὰρ καὶ ἰατρῶν ἐστι συγγράμματα.

Καὶ ὁ Εὐθύδημος, Μὰ Δί, ἔφη, οὐκ ἔγωγε.

'Αλλὰ μὴ ἀρχιτέκτων βούλει γενέσθαι; γνωμονικοῦ γὰρ ἀνδρὸς καὶ τοῦτο δεῖ.

Οὔκουν ἔγωγ', ἔφη.

## MEMORABILIA IV. 2.8-2.10

more tolerant of his conversation and more attentive, Socrates went alone to the saddler's; and when Euthydemus had taken a seat beside him, he said: "Tell me, Euthydemus, am I rightly informed that you have a large collection of books written by the wise men of the past, as they are called?"

"By Zeus yes, Socrates," he said, "and I am still adding to it, to make it as complete as possible."

"By Hera," retorted Socrates, "I do admire you for valuing the treasures of wisdom above gold and silver. For you are evidently of the opinion that, while gold and silver cannot make men better, the thoughts of the wise enrich their possessors with excellence."

Now Euthydemus was glad to hear this, for he guessed that in Socrates' opinion he was on the road to wisdom. But Socrates, aware that he was pleased with his approbation, went on to say: "Tell me, Euthydemus, what kind of excellence do you want to achieve by collecting these books?"

And as Euthydemus was silent, considering what answer to give, "Possibly you want to be a doctor?" he guessed: "Medical treatises alone make a large collection."

"Oh no, not at all."

"Then perhaps you wish to be an architect? One needs a well-stored mind for that too."

"No, indeed I don't."

Άλλὰ μὴ γεωμέτρης ἐπιθυμεῖς, ἔφη, γενέσθαι ἀγαθός, ὤσπερ ὁ Θεόδωρος;

Οὐδὲ γεωμέτρης, ἔφη.

Άλλὰ μὴ ἀστρολόγος, ἔφη, βούλει γενέσθαι;

'Ως δὲ καὶ τοῦτο ἠρνεῖτο, 'Αλλὰ μὴ ῥαψωδός; ἔφη· καὶ γὰρ τὰ 'Ομήρου σέ φασιν ἔπη πάντα κεκτῆσθαι.

Μὰ Δί οὐκ ἔγωγ', ἔφη τοὺς γάρ τοι ῥαψωδοὺς οἶδα τὰ μὲν ἔπη ἀκριβοῦντας, αὐτοὺς δὲ πάνυ ἠλιθίους ὅντας.

11 Καὶ ὁ Σωκράτης ἔφη· Οὐ δήπου, ὧ Εὐθύδημε, ταύτης τῆς ἀρετῆς ἐφίεσαι, δι' ἣν ἄνθρωποι πολιτικοὶ γίγνονται καὶ οἰκονομικοὶ καὶ ἄρχειν ἰκανοὶ καὶ ὡφέλιμοι τοῖς τε ἄλλοις ἀνθρώποις καὶ ἑαυτοῖς;

Καὶ ὁ Εὐθύδημος, Σφόδρα γ', ἔφη, ὧ Σώκρατες, ταύτης τῆς ἀρετῆς δέομαι.

Νὴ Δί, ἔφη ὁ Σωκράτης, τῆς καλλίστης ἀρετῆς καὶ μεγίστης ἐφίεσαι τέχνης ἔστι γὰρ τῶν βασιλέων αὕτη καὶ καλεῖται βασιλική. ἀτάρ, ἔφη, κατανενόηκας, εἰ οἶόν τέ ἐστι μὴ ὄντα δίκαιον ἀγαθὸν ταῦτα γενέσθαι;

Καὶ μάλα, ἔφη, καὶ οὐχ οἶόν τέ γε ἄνευ δικαιοσύνης ἀγαθὸν πολίτην γενέσθαι.

Τί οὖν; ἔφη, σὰ δὴ τοῦτο κατείργασαι;

Οἶμαί γ', ἔφη, ὧ Σώκρατες, οὐδενὸς ἂν ἦττον φανῆναι δίκαιος.

'Αρ' οὖν, ἔφη, τῶν δικαίων ἔστιν ἔργα ὥσπερ τῶν τεκτόνων:

"Εστι μέντοι, ἔφη.

## MEMORABILIA IV. 2.10-2.12

"Well, perhaps you want to be a good mathematician, like Theodorus?" <sup>2</sup>

"No. not that either."

"Well, perhaps you want to be an astronomer?"

And as he again said no, "Perhaps a rhapsode, then? They tell me you have the complete works of Homer."

"Oh no, not at all; for your rhapsodes, I know, are consummate as reciters but they are very silly characters themselves."

Then Socrates exclaimed: "Surely, Euthydemus, you don't covet the kind of excellence that makes good statesmen and managers, competent rulers and benefactors of themselves and humanity in general?"

"Yes, I do. Socrates," answered Euthydemus, "that kind of excellence I greatly desire."

"Why," cried Socrates, "it is the noblest kind of excellence, the greatest of arts that you covet, for it belongs to kings and is dubbed 'regal.' Then again," he said, "have you reflected whether it be possible to excel in these matters without being just?"

"Certainly I have; and it is in fact impossible to be a good citizen without justice."

"Then tell me, have you accomplished that?"

"Yes, Socrates, I think I can show myself to be as just as anyone."

"Ánd have just people, like carpenters, their works?" "Yes they have."

 $^2$  Theodorus of Cyrene, who is one of the characters in the *Theaetetus* of Plato.

289

11

Άρ' οὖν, ἔφη, ὥσπερ οἱ τέκτονες ἔχουσι τὰ ἑαυτῶν ἔργα ἐπιδεῖξαι, οὕτως οἱ δίκαιοι τὰ αὑτῶν ἔχοιεν ἂν διεξηγήσασθαι;

Μὴ οὖν, ἔφη ὁ Εὐθύδημος, οὐ δύνωμαι ἐγὼ τὰ τῆς δικαιοσύνης ἔργα ἐξηγήσασθαι; καὶ νὴ Δί ἔγωγε τὰ τῆς ἀδικίας· ἐπεὶ οὐκ ὀλίγα ἔστι καθ ἑκάστην ἡμέραν τοιαῦτα ὁρῶν τε καὶ ἀκούειν.

13 Βούλει οὖν, ἔφη ὁ Σωκράτης, γράψωμεν ἐνταυθὶ μὲν δέλτα, ἐνταυθὶ δὲ ἄλφα; εἶτα ὅ τι μὲν ἂν δοκῆ ἡμῖν τῆς δικαιοσύνης ἔργον εἶναι, πρὸς τὸ δέλτα θῶμεν, ὅ τι δ' ἂν τῆς ἀδικίας, πρὸς τὸ ἄλφα;

Εἴ τί σοι δοκεῖ, ἔφη, προσδεῖν τούτων, ποίει ταῦτα. Καὶ ὁ Σωκράτης γράψας ὥσπερ εἶπεν, Οὐκοῦν, ἔφη, ἔστιν ἐν ἀνθρώποις τὸ ψεύδεσθαι;

"Εστι μέντοι, ἔφη.

Ποτέρωσε οὖν, ἔφη, θῶμεν τοῦτο;

Δηλον, ἔφη, ὅτι πρὸς την ἀδικίαν.

Οὐκοῦν, ἔφη, καὶ τὸ ἐξαπατᾶν ἔστι;

Καὶ μάλα, ἔφη.

Τοῦτο οὖν ποτέρωσε θῶμεν;

Καὶ τοῦτο δῆλον ὅτι, ἔφη, πρὸς τὴν ἀδικίαν.

Τί δὲ τὸ κακουργεῖν;

Καὶ τοῦτο, ἔφη.

Τὸ δὲ ἀνδραποδίζεσθαι;

Καὶ τοῦτο.

Πρὸς δὲ τῆ δικαιοσύνη οὐδὲν ἡμῖν τούτων κείσεται, ὧ Εὐθύδημε:

Δεινὸν γὰρ ἂν εἴη, ἔφη.

#### MEMORABILIA IV. 2.12-2.14

"And as carpenters can point to their works, should just men be able to describe theirs?"

"Do you suppose," said Euthydemus, "that I am unable to describe the works of justice? Of course I can, and the works of injustice too, since there are many opportunities to see and hear those every day."

"I propose, then, that we write J in this column and I in that, and then proceed to place under these letters, J and I, what we take to be the works of justice and injustice respectively."

"Go ahead, if you think it's of any use."

Having written down the letters as he proposed, Socrates continued: "Lying occurs among people, does it not?"

"Yes, it does."

"Under which heading, then, are we to put that?"

"Under the heading of injustice, clearly."

"Deceit, too, is found, is it not?"

"Certainly."

"Under which heading will that go?"

"Under injustice again, of course."

"What about doing mischief?"

"That too."

"Selling into slavery?"

"That too."

"Then we will assign none of these things to justice, Euthydemus?"

"No, it would be terrible to do so."

15 Τί δ'; ἐάν τις στρατηγὸς αἰρεθεὶς ἄδικόν τε καὶ ἐχθρὰν πόλιν ἐξανδραποδίσηται, φήσομεν τοῦτον ἀδικεῖν;

 $O\vec{v} \delta \hat{\eta} \tau a$ ,  $\epsilon \phi \eta$ .

Δίκαια δὲ ποιεῖν οὐ φήσομεν;

Καὶ μάλα.

Τί δ'; ἐὰν ἐξαπατῷ πολεμῶν αὐτοῖς;

Δίκαιον, ἔφη, καὶ τοῦτο.

Έὰν δὲ κλέπτη τε καὶ ἁρπάζη τὰ τούτων, οὐ δίκαια ποιήσει;

Καὶ μάλα, ἔφη, ἀλλ' ἐγώ σε τὸ πρῶτον ὑπελάμβανον πρὸς τοὺς φίλους μόνον ταῦτα ἐρωτᾶν.

Οὐκοῦν, ἔφη, ὅσα πρὸς τῆ ἀδικία ἐθήκαμεν, ταῦτα καὶ πρὸς τῆ δικαιοσύνη θετέον ἂν εἴη;

Έοικεν, ἔφη.

16

17

Βούλει οὖν, ἔφη, ταῦτα οὕτω θέντες διορισώμεθα πάλιν πρὸς μὲν τοὺς πολεμίους δίκαιον εἶναι τὰ τοιαῦτα ποιεῖν, πρὸς δὲ τοὺς φίλους ἄδικον, ἀλλὰ δεῖν πρός γε τούτους ὡς ἀπλούστατον εἶναι;

Πάνυ μὲν οὖν, ἔφη ὁ Εὐθύδημος.

Τί οὖν; ἔφη ὁ Σωκράτης, ἐάν τις στρατηγὸς ὁρῶν ἀθύμως ἔχον τὸ στράτευμα ψευσάμενος φήση συμμάχους προσιέναι καὶ τῷ ψεύδει τούτῳ παύση τῆς ἀθυμίας τοὺς στρατιώτας, ποτέρωθι τὴν ἀπάτην ταύτην θήσομεν;

Δοκεί μοι, έφη, πρὸς τὴν δικαιοσύνην.

Έὰν δέ τις υἱὸν ἑαυτοῦ δεόμενον φαρμακείας καὶ μὴ προσιέμενον φάρμακον ἐξαπατήσας ὡς σιτίον τὸ

# MEMORABILIA IV. 2.15-2.17

"Now suppose a man who has been elected general enslaves an unjust and hostile city, will we say that he acts unjustly?"

"Oh no!"

"We will say that his actions are just, will we not?"

"Certainly."

"And what if he deceives the enemy when at war?" 3

"That too is just."

"And if he steals and plunders their goods, will not his actions be just?"

"Certainly; but at first I assumed that your questions had reference only to friends."

"Then everything that we assigned to injustice should be assigned to justice also?"

"Apparently."

"Then I propose to revise our classification, and to say: It is just to do such things to enemies but unjust to do them to friends, toward whom one's conduct should be scrupulously honest."

"By all means."

"Now suppose that a general, seeing that his army is downhearted, tells a lie and says that reinforcements are coming, and by means of this lie checks discouragement among the men, under which heading will we put this deception?"

"Under justice, I think."

"Suppose, again, that a man's son refuses to take a dose of medicine when he needs it, and the father induces him 15

16

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Cyr. 1.6.31, 6.1.55.

φάρμακον δῷ καὶ τῷ ψεύδει χρησάμενος οὕτως ὑγιᾶ ποιήση, ταύτην αὖ τὴν ἀπάτην ποῦ θετέον;

Δοκεῖ μοι, ἔφη, καὶ ταύτην εἰς τὸ αὐτό.

Τί δ'; ἐάν τις, ἐν ἀθυμίᾳ ὅντος φίλου, δείσας, μὴ διαχρήσηται ἑαυτόν, κλέψη ἢ ἀρπάση ἢ ξίφος ἢ ἄλλο τι τοιοῦτον, τοῦτο αὖ ποτέρωσε θετέον;

Καὶ τοῦτο νὴ Δί', ἔφη, πρὸς τὴν δικαιοσύνην.

Λέγεις, ἔφη, σὺ οὐδὲ πρὸς τοὺς φίλους ἄπαντα δεῖν ἀπλοΐζεσθαι;

Μὰ Δί οὐ δῆτα, ἔφη ἀλλὰ μετατίθεμαι τὰ εἰρημένα, εἴπερ ἔξεστι.

Δεῖ γέ τοι, ἔφη ὁ Σωκράτης, ἐξεῖναι πολὺ μᾶλλον ἢ μὴ ὀρθῶς τιθέναι. τῶν δὲ δὴ τοὺς φίλους ἐξαπατώντων ἐπὶ βλάβη, ἵνα μηδὲ τοῦτο παραλίπωμεν ἄσκεπτον, πότερος ἀδικώτερός ἐστιν, ὁ ἑκὼν ἢ ὁ ἄκων;

'Αλλ', ὧ Σώκρατες, οὐκέτι μὲν ἔγωγε πιστεύω οἷς ἀποκρίνομαι· καὶ γὰρ τὰ πρόσθεν πάντα νῦν ἄλλως ἔχειν δοκεῖ μοι ἢ ὡς ἐγὼ τὸτε ῷμην· ὅμως δὲ εἰρήσθω μοι, ἀδικώτερον εἶναι τὸν ἑκόντα ψευδόμενον τοῦ ἄκοντος.

20 Δοκεῖ δέ σοι μάθησις καὶ ἐπιστήμη τοῦ δικαίου εἶναι ὥσπερ τῶν γραμμάτων;

"Εμοιγε.

Πότερον δὲ γραμματικώτερον κρίνεις, ὃς ἂν ἑκὼν μὴ ὀρθῶς γράφη καὶ ἀναγιγνώσκη ἢ ὃς ἂν ἄκων;

\*Os ἃν ἐκών, ἔγωγε· δύναιτο γὰρ ἄν, ὁπότε βούλοιτο, καὶ ὀρθῶς αὐτὰ ποιεῖν.

18

## MEMORABILIA IV. 2.17-2.20

to take it by pretending that it is food and cures him by means of this lie, where will we put this deception?"

"That too goes on the same side, I think."

"And again, suppose one has a friend suffering from depression and for fear that he may make away with himself he takes away his sword or something of the sort, under which heading will we put that now?"

"That too goes under justice, of course."

"You mean, do you, that even with friends straightforward dealing is not invariably right?"

"It surely isn't! I retract what I said before, if you will let me."

"I have to let you; it's far better than getting our lists wrong. But now consider deception practiced on friends to their detriment: we mustn't overlook that either. Which is the more unjust deception in that case, the intentional or unintentional?"

"Socrates, I have lost all confidence in my answers; for all the opinions that I expressed before seem now to have taken an entirely different form. Still I venture to say that the intentional deception is more unjust than the unintentional."

"Do you think there is a doctrine and science of the 20 just, as there is of letters?"

"Yes."

"Which, in your judgment, is the more literate, the man who intentionally blunders in writing and reading or the man who blunders unintentionally?"

"The one who blunders intentionally, I presume; for he can always be accurate when he chooses."

18

Οὐκοῦν ὁ μὲν ἑκὼν μὴ ὀρθῶς γράφων γραμματικὸς αν εἴη, ὁ δὲ ἄκων ἀγράμματος;

Πῶς γὰρ οὔ;

Τὰ δίκαια δὲ πότερον ὁ ἑκὼν ψευδόμενος καὶ ἐξαπατῶν οἶδεν ἢ ὁ ἄκων;

Δηλον ὅτι ὁ ἐκών.

Οὐκοῦν γραμματικώτερον μὲν τὸν ἐπιστάμενον γράμματα τοῦ μὴ ἐπισταμένου φὴς εἶναι;

Ναί.

21

22

Δικαιότερον δὲ τὸν ἐπιστάμενον τὰ δίκαια τοῦ μὴ ἐπισταμένου;

Φαίνομαι· δοκῶ δέ μοι καὶ ταῦτα οὐκ οἶδ' ὅπως λέγειν.

Τί δὲ δή, δς ἂν βουλόμενος τάληθη λέγειν μηδέποτε τὰ αὐτὰ περὶ τῶν αὐτῶν λέγη, ἀλλ' ὁδόν τε φράζων τὴν αὐτὴν τοτὲ μὲν πρὸς ἔω, τοτὲ δὲ πρὸς ἐσπέραν φράζη καὶ λογισμὸν ἀποφαινόμενος τὸν αὐτὸν τοτὲ μὲν πλείω, τοτὲ δ' ἐλάττω ἀποφαίνηται, τί σοι δοκεῦ ὁ τοιοῦτος;

Δήλος νη Δί εἶναι ὅτι α ὤετο εἰδέναι οὐκ οἶδεν.

Οἶσθα δέ τινας ἀνδραποδώδεις καλουμένους; Έγωγε.

Πότερον διὰ σοφίαν ἢ δι' ἀμαθίαν;

Δηλον ὅτι δι' ἀμαθίαν.

''Αρ' οὖν διὰ τὴν τοῦ χαλκεύειν ἀμαθίαν τοῦ ὀνόματος τούτου τυγχάνουσιν;

Οὐ δῆτα.

Άλλ' ἄρα διὰ τὴν τοῦ τεκταίνεσθαι;

## MEMORABILIA IV. 2.20-2.22

"May we not say, then, that the intentional blunderer is literate and the unintentional is illiterate?"

"Indeed we must."

"And which knows what is just, the intentional liar and deceiver, or the unintentional?"

"The intentional, clearly."

"You say then, as I understand, that the one who knows letters is more literate than the one who is ignorant of them?"

"Yes."

"And the one who knows what is just is more just than the one who does not know?"

"Apparently; but here again I don't feel sure of my own meaning."

"Now what do you think of someone who wants to tell the truth but never sticks to what he says; when he shows you the way, tells you first that the road runs east, then that it runs west; and when he adds up figures, makes the total now larger, now smaller?"

"Why, I think he shows that he doesn't know what he thought he knew."

"Are you aware that some people are called slavish?"

"Yes."

"To what do they owe the name, to knowledge or to ignorance?"

"To ignorance, obviously."

"To ignorance of the smiths' trade, shall we say?"

"Certainly not."

"Ignorance of carpentry perhaps?"

21

Οὐδὲ διὰ ταύτην.

Άλλὰ διὰ τὴν τοῦ σκυτεύειν;

Οὐδὲ δι' εν τούτων, ἔφη, ἀλλὰ καὶ τοὐναντίον· οἱ γὰρ πλείστοι τῶν γε τὰ τοιαῦτα ἐπισταμένων ἀνδραποδώδεις εἰσίν.

³Αρ' οὖν τῶν τὰ καλὰ καὶ ἀγαθὰ καὶ δίκαια μὴ εἰδότων τὸ ὄνομα τοῦτ' ἐστίν;

"Εμοιγε δοκεῖ, ἔφη.

23

24

Οὐκοῦν δεῖ παντὶ τρόπφ διατειναμένους φεύγειν, ὅπως μὴ ἀνδράποδα ὧμεν.

'Αλλὰ νὴ τοὺς θεούς, ἔφη, ὧ Σώκρατες, πάνυ ὤμην φιλοσοφείν φιλοσοφίαν, δι' ἦς ἂν μάλιστα ἐνόμιζον παιδευθῆναι τὰ προσήκοντα ἀνδρὶ καλοκάγαθίας ὀρεγομένω νῦν δὲ πῶς οἴει με ἀθύμως ἔχειν ὁρῶντα ἐμαυτὸν διὰ μὲν τὰ προπεπονημένα οὐδὲ τὸ ἐρωτώμενον ἀποκρίνεσθαι δυνάμενον ὑπὲρ ὧν μάλιστα χρὴ εἰδέναι, ἄλλην δὲ ὁδὸν οὐδεμίαν ἔχοντα, ἢν ἂν πορευ-όμενος βελτίων γενοίμην;

Καὶ ὁ Σωκράτης, Εἰπέ μοι, ἔφη, ὧ Εὐθύδημε, εἰς Δελφοὺς δὲ ἤδη πώποτε ἀφίκου;

Καὶ δίς γε νη Δί, ἔφη.

Κατέμαθες οὖν πρὸς τῷ ναῷ που γεγραμμένον τὸ Γνῶθι σαυτόν:

"Εγωγε.

Πότερον οὖν οὐδέν σοι τοῦ γράμματος ἐμέλησεν ἢ προσέσχες τε καὶ ἐπεχείρησας σαυτὸν ἐπισκοπεῖν, ὅστις εἴης;

Μὰ Δί οὐ δητα, ἔφη. καὶ γὰρ δὴ πάνυ τοῦτό γε

#### MEMORABILIA IV. 2.22-2.24

"No, not to that either."

"Of cobbling?"

"No, to none of these: on the contrary, those who are skilled in such trades are for the most part slavish."

"Then is this name given to those who are ignorant of the beautiful and good and just?"

"That is my opinion."

"Then we must strain every nerve to escape being slaves."

"I swear, Socrates, I did feel confident that I was a student of a philosophy that would provide me with the best education in all things a would-be gentleman would require. But you can imagine my dismay when I realize that in spite of all my efforts I am even incapable of answering a question about things that we should especially know and yet find no other way that will lead to my improvement."

Here Socrates said: "Tell me, Euthydemus, have you ever been to Delphi?"

"Sure: twice."

"Then did you notice somewhere on the temple the inscription 'Know thyself'?"

"I did."

"And did you pay no attention to the inscription, or did you attend to it and try to consider who you were?"

"I did not; because I felt sure that I knew that already;

23

φμην εἰδέναι· σχολῆ γὰρ ἃν ἄλλο τι ἤδειν, εἴ γε μηδ' ἐμαυτὸν ἐγίγνωσκον.

Πότερα δέ σοι δοκεί γιγνώσκειν έαυτὸν ὅστις τοὕνομα τὸ ἑαυτοῦ μόνον οἶδεν ἢ ὅστις, ὥσπερ οἱ τοὺς ἵππους ὧνούμενοι οὐ πρότερον οἴονται γιγνώσκειν ὃν ἂν βούλωνται γνῶναι, πρὶν ἂν ἐπισκέψωνται, πότερον εὐπειθής ἐστιν ἢ δυσπειθὴς καὶ πότερον ἰσχυρός ἐστιν ἢ ἀσθενὴς καὶ πότερον ταχὺς ἢ βραδὺς καὶ τἄλλα τὰ πρὸς τὴν τοῦ ἵππου χρείαν ἐπιτήδειά τε καὶ ἀνεπιτήδεια ὅπως ἔχει, οὕτως ὁ ἑαυτὸν ἐπισκεψάμενος, ὁποῖός ἐστι πρὸς τὴν ἀνθρωπίνην χρείαν, ἔγνωκε τὴν αὐτοῦ δύναμιν;

Οὕτως ἔμοιγε δοκεῖ, ἔφη, ὁ μὴ εἰδὼς τὴν αύτοῦ δύναμιν ἀγνοεῖν έαυτόν.

Ἐκεῖνο δὲ οὐ φανερόν, ἔφη, ὅτι διὰ μὲν τὸ εἰδέναι ἑαυτοὺς πλεῖστα ἀγαθὰ πάσχουσιν ἄνθρωποι, διὰ δὲ τὸ ἐψεῦσθαι ἑαυτῶν πλεῖστα κακά; οἱ μὲν γὰρ εἰδότες ἑαυτοὺς τά τε ἐπιτήδεια ἑαυτοῖς ἴσασι καὶ διαγιγνώσκουσιν ἄ τε δύνανται καὶ ἃ μὴ καὶ ἃ μὲν ἐπίστανται πράττοντες πορίζονταί τε ὧν δέονται καὶ εὖ πράττουσιν, ὧν δὲ μὴ ἐπίστανται ἀπεχόμενοι ἀναμάρτητοι γίγνονται καὶ διαφεύγουσι τὸ κακῶς πράττειν διὰ τοῦτο δὲ καὶ τοὺς ἄλλους ἀνθρώπους δυνάμενοι δοκιμάζειν καὶ διὰ τῆς τῶν ἄλλων χρείας τά τε ἀγαθὰ πορίζονται καὶ τὰ κακὰ φυλάττονται. οἱ δὲ μὴ εἰδότες, ἀλλὰ διεψευσμένοι τῆς ἑαυτῶν δυνάμεως πρός τε τοὺς ἄλλους ἀνθρώπους καὶ τἆλλα ἀνθρώπινα πράγματα ὁμοίως διάκεινται καὶ οὕτε ὧν δέονται ἴσα-

25

26

## MEMORABILIA IV. 2.24-2.27

I could hardly know anything else if I didn't even know myself."

"And what do you suppose a man must know to know himself? Merely his own name? Or must he consider what sort of a creature he is for human use and get to know his own powers; just as those who buy horses don't think that they know the animal they want to know until they have considered whether he is docile or stubborn, strong or weak, fast or slow, and generally how he stands in all that makes a useful or a useless horse?"

"That leads me to think that someone who does not know his own powers is ignorant of himself."

"Isn't it clear too that through self-knowledge men come to much good, and through self-deception to much harm? For those who know themselves know what things are expedient for themselves and discern their own powers and limitations. And by doing what they understand they get what they want and prosper: by refraining from attempting what they do not understand they make no mistakes and avoid failure. And consequently through their power of testing other men too, and through their dealings with others, they get what is good and shun what is bad. Those who do not know and are deceived in their estimate of their own powers are in the same condition with regard to other men and other human affairs. They

27

26

σιν οὔτε ὅ τι πράττουσιν οὔτε οἷς χρῶνται, ἀλλὰ πάντων τούτων διαμαρτάνοντες των τε άγαθων άποτυγχάνουσι καὶ τοῖς κακοῖς περιπίπτουσι, καὶ οἱ μὲν 28 είδότες ὅ τι ποιοῦσιν ἐπιτυγχάνοντες ὧν πράττουσιν εὔδοξοί τε καὶ τίμιοι γίγνονται καὶ οἴ τε ὅμοιοι τούτοις ήδέως χρώνται οι τε αποτυγχάνοντες τών πραγμάτων ἐπιθυμοῦσι τούτους ὑπὲρ αὐτῶν βουλεύεσθαι καὶ προΐστασθαί γε4 αύτῶν τούτους καὶ τὰς ἐλπίδας των ἀγαθων ἐν τούτοις ἔχουσι καὶ διὰ πάντα ταῦτα πάντων μάλιστα τούτους ἀγαπῶσιν, οἱ δὲ μὴ 29 είδότες ὅ τι ποιοῦσι, κακῶς δὲ αίρούμενοι καὶ οἶς ἂν έπιχειρήσωσιν ἀποτυγχάνοντες οὐ μόνον ἐν αὐτοῖς τούτοις ζημιοῦνταί τε καὶ κολάζονται, ἀλλὰ καὶ ἀδοξοῦσι διὰ ταῦτα καὶ καταγέλαστοι γίγνονται καὶ καταφρονούμενοι καὶ ἀτιμαζόμενοι ζῶσιν.

Όρậς δὲ καὶ τῶν πόλεων ὅτι ὅσαι ἂν ἀγνοήσασαι τὴν ἑαυτῶν δύναμιν κρείττοσι πολεμήσωσιν, αἱ μὲν ἀνάστατοι γίγνονται, αἱ δ' ἐξ ἐλευθέρων δοῦλαι.

Καὶ ὁ Εὐθύδημος, 'Ως πάνυ μοι δοκοῦν, ἔφη, ὧ Σώκρατες, περὶ πολλοῦ ποιητέον εἶναι τὸ ἑαυτὸν γι-γνώσκειν, οὕτως ἴσθι· ὁπόθεν δὲ χρὴ ἄρξασθαι ἐπισκοπεῖν ἑαυτόν, τοῦτο πρὸς σὲ ἀποβλέπω εἴ μοι ἐθελήσαις ἂν ἐξηγήσασθαι.

Οὐκοῦν, ἔφη ὁ Σωκράτης, τὰ μὲν ἀγαθὰ καὶ τὰ κακὰ ὁποῖά ἐστι, πάντως που γιγνώσκεις.

Νη Δί', ἔφη· εἰ γὰρ μηδὲ ταῦτα οἶδα, καὶ τῶν ἀνδραπόδων φαυλότερος ἃν εἴην.

"Ιθι δή, ἔφη, καὶ ἐμοὶ ἐξήγησαι αὐτά.

30

## MEMORABILIA IV. 2.27-2.31

know neither what they want nor what they do, nor those with whom they have dealings; but mistaken in all these respects they miss the good and stumble into the bad. Furthermore, those who know what they do win fame and honor by achieving their goals. Their equals are glad to have dealings with them; and those who miss their objectives look to them for counsel, look to them for protection, rest on them their hopes of better times, and for all these reasons cherish them above all others. But those who don't know what they're doing choose wrongly, fail in what they attempt and besides thus incurring direct loss and punishment they earn contempt through their failures, make themselves ridiculous and live in dishonor and humiliation.

"And the same is true of communities. You find that whenever a state, in ignorance of its own power, goes to war with a stronger people, it is exterminated or loses its liberty."

"Socrates," answered Euthydemus, "please rest assured that I fully appreciate the importance of knowing oneself. But where should the process of self-examination begin? I look to you for a statement, if you will."

"Well," said Socrates, "I may assume, I take it, that you know what things are good and what are evil?"

"Of course, for if I don't know so much as that, I must be worse than a slave."

"Very well, state them for my benefit."

 $\gamma\epsilon$  Stephanus:  $\tau\epsilon$  Sauppe

28

29

30

 $<sup>^4</sup>$  προίστανταί τε Richards codd. Stobaeus

'Αλλ' οὐ χαλεπόν, ἔφη· πρῶτον μὲν γὰρ αὐτὸ τὸ ὑγιαίνειν ἀγαθὸν εἶναι νομίζω, τὸ δὲ νοσεῖν κακόν, ἔπειτα καὶ τὰ αἴτια ἑκατέρου αὐτῶν καὶ ποτὰ καὶ βρωτὰ καὶ ἐπιτηδεύματα τὰ μὲν πρὸς τὸ ὑγιαίνειν φέροντα ἀγαθά, τὰ δὲ πρὸς τὸ νοσεῖν κακά.

Οὐκοῦν, ἔφη, καὶ τὸ ὑγιαίνειν καὶ τὸ νοσεῖν, ὅταν μὲν ἀγαθοῦ τινος αἴτια γίγνηται, ἀγαθὰ ἃν εἴη, ὅταν δὲ κακοῦ, κακά.

Πότε δ' ἄν, ἔφη, τὸ μὲν ὑγιαίνειν κακοῦ αἴτιον γένοιτο, τὸ δὲ νοσεῖν ἀγαθοῦ;

"Όταν νη Δί', ἔφη, στρατείας τε αἰσχρᾶς καὶ ναυτιλίας βλαβερᾶς καὶ ἄλλων πολλῶν τοιούτων οἱ μὲν διὰ ρώμην μετασχόντες ἀπόλωνται, οἱ δὲ δι' ἀσθένειαν ἀπολειφθέντες σωθῶσιν.

'Αληθη λέγεις· ἀλλ' ὁρᾶς, ἔφη, ὅτι καὶ τῶν ὡφελίμων οἱ μὲν διὰ ῥώμην μετέχουσιν, οἱ δὲ δι' ἀσθένειαν ἀπολείπονται.

Ταῦτα οὖν, ἔφη, ποτὲ μὲν ἀφελοῦντα, ποτὲ δὲ βλάπτοντα μᾶλλον ἀγαθὰ ἢ κακά ἐστιν;

Οὐδὲν μὰ Δία φαίνεται κατά γε τοῦτον τὸν λόγον. 'Αλλ' ἥ γέ τοι σοφία, ὧ Σώκρατες, ἀναμφισβητήτως ἀγαθόν ἐστιν· ποῖον γὰρ ἄν τις πρᾶγμα οὐ βέλτιον πράττοι σοφὸς ὧν ἣ ἀμαθής;

Τί δαί; τὸν Δαίδαλον, ἔφη, οὐκ ἀκήκοας ὅτι ληφθεὶς ὑπὸ Μίνω διὰ τὴν σοφίαν ἠναγκάζετο ἐκείνῳ δουλεύειν καὶ τῆς τε πατρίδος ἄμα καὶ τῆς ἐλευθερίας ἐστερήθη καὶ ἐπιχειρῶν ἀποδιδράσκειν μετὰ τοῦ υἱοῦ τόν τε παίδα ἀπώλεσε καὶ αὐτὸς οὐκ ἠδυνήθη σωθῆ-

32

### MEMORABILIA IV. 2.31-2.33

"Well, that's a simple matter. First health in itself is, I suppose, a good, sickness an evil. Next the various causes of these two conditions—meat, drink, habits—are good or evil according as they promote health or sickness."

"Then health and sickness too must be good when their effect is good, and evil when it is evil."

32

33

"But when can health possibly be the cause of evil, or sickness of good?"

"In many cases. For instance, a disastrous campaign or a fatal voyage: the able-bodied who go are lost, the weaklings who stay behind are saved."

"True; but you see, in the successful adventures too the able-bodied take part, the weaklings are left behind."

"Then since these bodily conditions sometimes lead to profit and sometimes to loss, are they any more good than evil?"

"No, certainly not; at least so it appears from the argument. But wisdom now, Socrates—that at any rate is indisputably a good thing; for what is there that a wise man would not do better than a fool?"

"Really! Have you not heard how Daedalus was seized by Minos because of his wisdom and forced to be his slave, and was robbed of his country and his liberty, and in trying to escape with his son lost the boy and could not save

ναι, ἀλλ' ἀπενεχθεὶς εἰς τοὺς βαρβάρους πάλιν ἐκεῖ ἐδούλευε:

Λέγεται νὴ Δί', ἔφη, ταῦτα.

Τὰ δὲ Παλαμήδους οὐκ ἀκήκοας πάθη; τοῦτον γὰρ δὴ πάντες ὑμνοῦσιν ὡς διὰ σοφίαν φθονηθεὶς ὑπὸ τοῦ Ὀδυσσέως ἀπόλλυται.

Λέγεται καὶ ταῦτα, ἔφη.

Άλλους δὲ πόσους οἴει διὰ σοφίαν ἀνασπάστους πρὸς βασιλέα γεγονέναι καὶ ἐκεῖ δουλεύειν;

34 Κινδυνεύει, έφη, ὧ Σώκρατες, ἀναμφιλογώτατον ἀγαθὸν εἶναι τὸ εὐδαιμονεῖν.

Εἴ γε μή τις αὐτό, ἔφη, ὧ Εὐθύδημε, ἐξ ἀμφιλόγων ἀγαθῶν συντιθείη.

Τί δ' ἄν, ἔφη, τῶν εὐδαιμονικῶν ἀμφίλογον εἴη;

Οὐδέν, ἔφη, εἴ γε μὴ προσθήσομεν αὐτῷ κάλλος ἢ ἰσχὺν ἢ πλοῦτον ἢ δόξαν ἢ καί τι ἄλλο τῶν τοιούτων.

'Αλλὰ νὴ Δία προσθήσομεν, ἔφη· πῶς γὰρ ἄν τις ἄνευ τούτων εὐδαιμονοίη;

Νὴ Δι, ἔφη, προσθήσομεν ἄρα, ἐξ ὧν πολλὰ καὶ χαλεπὰ συμβαίνει τοῖς ἀνθρώποις· πολλοὶ μὲν γὰρ διὰ τὸ κάλλος ὑπὸ τῶν ἐπὶ τοῖς ὡραίοις παρακεκινηκότων διαφθείρονται, πολλοὶ δὲ διὰ τὴν ἰσχὺν μείζοσιν ἔργοις ἐπιχειροῦντες οὐ μικροῖς κακοῖς περιπίπτουσι, πολλοὶ δὲ διὰ τὸν πλοῦτον διαθρυπτόμενοί τε καὶ ἐπιβουλευόμενοι ἀπόλλυνται, πολλοὶ δὲ διὰ δόξαν καὶ πολιτικὴν δύναμιν μεγάλα κακὰ πεπόνθασιν.

Άλλὰ μήν, ἔφη, εἴ γε μηδὲ τὸ εὐδαιμονεῖν ἐπαινῶν

35

### MEMORABILIA IV. 2.33-2.36

himself but was carried off to the barbarians and again lived as a slave there?"

"That is the story, of course."

"And haven't you heard the story of Palamedes? Of course, for all the poets sing of him: how he was envied for his wisdom and done in by Odysseus."

"Another well-known tale!"

"And how many others, do you suppose, have been kidnapped on account of their wisdom and haled off to the great King's court and live in slavery there?"

"Happiness seems to be unquestionably a good, Socrates."

"It would be so, Euthydemus, were it not made up of goods that are questionable."

"But what element in happiness can be called in question?"

"None, provided we don't include in it beauty or strength or wealth or glory or anything of the sort."

"But of course we will. How can anyone be happy without those?"

"Then of course we will also include the sources of much trouble to mankind. For many are ruined by admirers whose heads are turned at the sight of a pretty face; many are led by their strength to attempt tasks too heavy for them and meet with serious evils; many by their wealth are corrupted and fall victims to conspiracies; many through glory and political power have suffered great evils."

"Well now, if I am at fault in praising even happiness,

όρθως λέγω, όμολογω μηδ' ὅ τι πρὸς τοὺς θεοὺς εὕχεσθαι χρὴ εἰδέναι.

'Αλλὰ ταῦτα μέν, ἔφη ὁ Σωκράτης, ἴσως διὰ τὸ σφόδρα πιστεύειν εἰδέναι οὐδ' ἔσκεψαι· ἐπεὶ δὲ πόλεως δημοκρατουμένης παρασκευάζη προεστάναι, δῆλον ὅτι δημοκρατίαν γε οἶσθα τί ἐστι.

Πάντως δήπου, ἔφη.

Δοκεί οὖν σοι δυνατὸν εἶναι δημοκρατίαν εἰδέναι μὴ εἰδότα δῆμον;

Μὰ Δί οὐκ ἔμοιγε.

Καὶ δημον ἄρ' οἶσθα τί ἐστιν;

Οἶμαι ἔγωγε.

37

38

Καὶ τί νομίζεις δημον εἶναι;

Τοὺς πένητας τῶν πολιτῶν ἔγωγε.

Καὶ τοὺς πένητας ἄρα οἶσθα;

Πῶς γὰρ οὔ;

Αρ' οὖν καὶ τοὺς πλουσίους οἶσθα;

Οὐδέν γε ήττον ἢ καὶ τοὺς πένητας.

Ποίους δὲ πένητας καὶ ποίους πλουσίους καλεῖς;

Τοὺς μὲν, οἶμαι, μὴ ἱκανὰ ἔχοντας εἰς ἃ δεῖ τελεῖν πένητας, τοὺς δὲ πλείω τῶν ἱκανῶν πλουσίους.

Καταμεμάθηκας οὖν, ὅτι ἐνίοις μὲν πάνυ ὀλίγα ἔχουσιν οὐ μόνον ἀρκεῖ ταῦτα, ἀλλὰ καὶ περιποιοῦνται ἀπ' αὐτῶν, ἐνίοις δὲ πάνυ πολλὰ οὐχ ἱκανά ἐστι;

Καὶ νὴ Δι΄, ἔφη ὁ Εὐθύδημος, ὀρθῶς γάρ με ἀναμιμνήσκεις, οἶδα<sup>5</sup> καὶ τυράννους τινάς, οῖ δι᾽ ἔνδειαν ὥσπερ οἱ ἀπορώτατοι ἀναγκάζονται ἀδικεῖν.

 $<sup>^5</sup>$ o<br/>ỉδα Stobaeus: οἶδα γὰρ (γε Hude) codd.

# MEMORABILIA IV. 2.36-2.38

I confess I don't know what we should ask for in our prayers."

"But perhaps you never even thought about these things because you felt so confident that you knew them. However, as the state you are preparing yourself to direct is governed by the people, no doubt you know what popular government is?"

"I think so, certainly."

"Then do you suppose it possible to know popular gov- 37 ernment without knowing the people?"

"Indeed I don't."

"And do you know, then, what the people consists of?"
"I think so."

"Of what do you suppose it to consist?"

"The poorer classes, I presume."

"You know the poor, then?"

"Of course I do."

"And you know the rich too?"

"Yes, just as well as the poor."

"What kind of men do you call poor and rich respectively?"

"The poor, I imagine, are those who have not enough to pay for what they want; the rich those who have more than enough."

"Have you observed, then, that some who have very little not only find it enough but even manage to save out of it, whereas others cannot live within their means, however large?"

"Yes, certainly—thanks for reminding me—in fact I even know of some despots who are driven to crime by poverty, just like paupers."

39

Οὐκοῦν, ἔφη ὁ Σωκράτης, εἴ γε ταῦτα οὕτως ἔχει, τοὺς μὲν τυράννους εἰς τὸν δῆμον θήσομεν, τοὺς δὲ ὀλίγα κεκτημένους, ἐὰν οἰκονομικοὶ ὧσιν, εἰς τοὺς πλουσίους.

Καὶ ὁ Εὐθύδημος ἔφη· ἀναγκάζει με καὶ ταῦτα ὁμολογεῖν δῆλον ὅτι ἡ ἐμὴ φαυλότης· καὶ φροντίζω, μὴ κράτιστον ἢ μοι σιγᾶν· κινδυνεύω γὰρ ἀπλῶς οὐδὲν εἰδέναι. καὶ πάνυ ἀθύμως ἔχων ἀπῆλθε καὶ καταφρονήσας ἑαυτοῦ καὶ νομίσας τῷ ὄντι ἀνδράποδον εἶναι.

40 Πολλοὶ μὲν οὖν τῶν οὖτω διατεθέντων ὑπὸ Σωκράτους οὐκέτι αὐτῷ προσήεσαν, οῦς καὶ βλακοτέρους ἐνόμιζεν· ὁ δὲ Εὐθύδημος ὑπέλαβεν οὐκ ἂν ἄλλως ἀνὴρ ἀξιόλογος γενέσθαι, εἰ μὴ ὅτι μάλιστα Σωκράτει συνείη· καὶ οὐκ ἀπελείπετο ἔτι αὐτοῦ, εἰ μή τι ἀναγκαῖον εἴη· ἔνια δὲ καὶ ἐμιμεῖτο ὧν ἐκεῖνος ἐπετήδευεν. ὁ δ' ὡς ἔγνω αὐτὸν οὕτως ἔχοντα, ἥκιστα μὲν διετάραττεν, ἀπλούστατα δὲ καὶ σαφέστατα ἐξηγεῖτο ἅ τε ἐνόμιζεν εἰδέναι δεῖν καὶ ἐπιτηδεύειν κράτιστα εἶναι

3. Το μεν οὖν λεκτικοὺς καὶ πρακτικοὺς καὶ μηχανικοὺς γίγνεσθαι τοὺς συνόντας οὐκ ἔσπευδεν, ἀλλὰ πρότερον τούτων ὤετο χρῆναι σωφροσύνην αὐτοῖς ἐγγενέσθαι. τοὺς γὰρ ἄνευ τοῦ σωφρονεῖν ταῦτα δυναμένους ἀδικωτέρους τε καὶ δυνατωτέρους κακουργεῖν ἐνόμιζεν εἶναι.

Πρῶτον μὲν δὴ περὶ θεοὺς ἐπειρᾶτο σώφρονας ποιεῖν τοὺς συνόντας. ἄλλοι μὲν οὖν αὐτῶ πρὸς ἄλ-

#### MEMORABILIA IV. 2.39-3.2

"Therefore, if that is so, we will group despots among the people and men of small means, if they are thrifty, among the rich."

39

"I am forced to agree once more," said Euthydemus, "evidently by my stupidity. I am inclined to think I had better hold my tongue or I will know nothing at all presently." And so he went away very dejected, disgusted with himself and convinced that he was indeed a slave.

4(

Now many of those who were brought to this state by Socrates never went near him again and were regarded by him as mere blockheads. But Euthydemus guessed that he would never be of much account unless he spent as much time as possible with Socrates. Henceforward, unless obliged to absent himself, he never left him and even began to adopt some of his practices. Socrates, for his part, seeing how it was with him, avoided spooking him and began to expound very plainly and clearly the knowledge that he thought most needful and the practices that he held to be most excellent.

Τ,

3. Skill at speaking, therefore, practical efficiency, and technical ingenuity were not the qualities that he was eager to foster in his companions. He held that they needed first to acquire prudence. For he believed that those faculties, unless accompanied by prudence, increased in their possessors injustice and power for mischief.

,

In the first place, then, he tried to make his companions prudent toward the gods. Accordingly he addressed

λους οὕτως ὁμιλοῦντι παραγενόμενοι διηγοῦντο· ἐγὼ δέ, ὅτε πρὸς Εὐθύδημον τοιάδε διελέγετο, παρεγενόμην.

Εἰπέ μοι, ἔφη, ὧ Εὐθύδημε, ἤδη ποτέ σοι ἐπῆλθεν ἐνθυμηθῆναι, ὡς ἐπιμελῶς οἱ θεοὶ ὧν οἱ ἄνθρωποι δέονται κατεσκευάκασι:

Καὶ ὅς, Μὰ τὸν Δί', ἔφη, οὐκ ἔμοιγε.

'Αλλ' οἶσθά γ', ἔφη, ὅτι πρῶτον μὲν φωτὸς δεόμεθα, οἱ ἡμῖν οἱ θεοὶ παρέχουσι;

Nη Δί', ἔφη, ὅ γ' εἰ μη εἴχομεν, ὅμοιοι τοῖς τυφλοῖς ἂν ἦμεν ἕνεκά γε τῶν ἡμετέρων ὀφθαλμῶν.

'Αλλὰ μὴν καὶ ἀναπαύσεώς γε δεομένοις ἡμῖν νύκτα παρέχουσι κάλλιστον ἀναπαυτήριον.

Πάνυ γ', ἔφη, καὶ τοῦτο χάριτος ἄξιον.

Οὐκοῦν καὶ ἐπειδὴ ὁ μὲν ἥλιος φωτεινὸς ὢν τάς τε ὅρας τῆς ἡμέρας ἡμῖν καὶ τἆλλα πάντα σαφηνίζει, ἡ δὲ νὺξ διὰ τὸ σκοτεινὴ εἶναι ἀσαφεστέρα ἐστίν, ἄστρα ἐν τῆ νυκτὶ ἀνέφηναν, ἃ ἡμῖν τὰς ὥρας τῆς νυκτὸς ἐμφανίζει, καὶ διὰ τοῦτο πολλὰ ὧν δεόμεθα πράττομεν;

"Εστι ταῦτα, ἔφη.

Άλλὰ μὴν ἥ γε σελήνη οὐ μόνον τῆς νυκτός, ἀλλὰ καὶ τοῦ μηνὸς τὰ μέρη φανερὰ ἡμῖν ποιεῖ.

Πάνυ μεν οὖν, ἔφη.

Τὸ δ', ἐπεὶ τροφῆς δεόμεθα, ταύτην ἡμῖν ἐκ τῆς γῆς ἀναδιδόναι καὶ ὥρας άρμοττούσας πρὸς τοῦτο παρέχειν, αι ἡμῖν οὐ μόνον ὧν δεόμεθα πολλὰ καὶ παντοία παρασκευάζουσιν, ἀλλὰ καὶ οίς εὐφραινόμεθα;

5

### MEMORABILIA IV. 3.2-3.5

this topic at various times, as those who were present used to relate. The following conversation with Euthydemus I heard myself.

"Tell me, Euthydemus," he began, "has it ever occurred to you to reflect on the care the gods have taken to furnish human beings with what they need?"

"No, it certainly hasn't," replied Euthydemus.

"Well, no doubt you know that our first and foremost need is light, which is supplied to us by the gods?"

"Of course; since without light our eyes would be as useless as if we were blind."

"And again, we need rest; and therefore the gods grant us the welcome respite of night."

"Yes, for that too we owe them thanks."

"And since the night in her darkness is dim, whereas the sun in his brightness illuminates the hours of the day and everything else, have they not made stars to shine in the night, that mark the watches of night for us, and don't we thereby satisfy many of our needs?"

"That is so."

"Moreover, the moon reveals to us not only the divisions of the night but of the month too."

"Certainly."

"Now, seeing that we need food, think how they make the earth yield it and to that end provide appropriate seasons that furnish in abundance the diverse things that minister not only to our wants but to our enjoyment."

Πάνυ, ἔφη, καὶ ταῦτα φιλάνθρωπα.

Τὸ δὲ καὶ ὕδωρ ἡμῖν παρέχειν οὕτω πολλοῦ ἄξιον, ὥστε συμφύειν τε καὶ συναύξειν τῆ γῆ καὶ ταῖς ὥραις πάντα τὰ χρήσιμα ἡμῖν, συντρέφειν δὲ καὶ αὐτοὺς ἡμᾶς, καὶ μιγνύμενον πᾶσι τοῖς τρέφουσιν ἡμᾶς εὐκατεργαστότερά τε καὶ ὡφελιμώτερα καὶ ἡδίω ποιεῖν αὐτὰ καὶ ἐπειδὴ πλείστου δεόμεθα τούτου, ἀφθονέστατον αὐτὸ παρέχειν ἡμῖν;

Καὶ τοῦτο, ἔφη, προνοητικόν.

Τὸ δὲ καὶ τὸ πῦρ πορίσαι ἡμῖν ἐπίκουρον μὲν ψύχους, ἐπίκουρον δὲ σκότους, συνεργὸν δὲ πρὸς πᾶσαν τέχνην καὶ πάντα, ὅσα ἀφελείας ἔνεκα ἄνθρωποι κατασκευάζονται; ὡς γὰρ συνελόντι εἰπεῖν, οὐδὲν ἀξιόλογον ἄνευ πυρὸς ἄνθρωποι τῶν πρὸς τὸν βίον χρησίμων κατασκευάζονται.

'Υπερβάλλει, ἔφη, καὶ τοῦτο φιλανθρωπία.

Τὸ δὲ τὸν ἥλιον, ἐπειδὰν ἐν χειμῶνι τράπηται, προσιέναι τὰ μὲν άδρύνοντα, τὰ δὲ ξηραίνοντα, ὧν καιρὸς διελήλυθε, καὶ ταῦτα διαπραξάμενον μηκέτι ἐγγυτέρω προσιέναι, ἀλλ' ἀποτρέπεσθαι φυλαττόμενον, μή τι ἡμᾶς μᾶλλον τοῦ δέοντος θερμαίνων βλάψη, καὶ ὅταν αὖ πάλιν ἀπιὼν γένηται, ἔνθα καὶ ἡμῖν δῆλόν ἐστιν ὅτι εἰ προσωτέρω ἄπεισιν, ἀποπαγησόμεθα ὑπὸ τοῦ ψύχους, πάλιν αὖ τρέπεσθαι καὶ προσχωρεῖν καὶ ἐνταῦθα τοῦ οὐρανοῦ ἀναστρέφεσθαι, ἔνθα μάλιστ' ἂν ἡμᾶς ὡφελοίη;

 $N\dot{\eta}$  τὸν  $\Delta \hat{\iota}$ , ἔφη, καὶ ταῦτα παντάπασιν ἔοικεν ἀνθρώπων ἕνεκα γιγνομένοις.

6

# MEMORABILIA IV. 3.5-3.8

"Truly these too show affection for humanity."

"Think again of their precious provision of water, that aids the earth and the seasons to give birth and increase to everything useful to us and itself helps to nourish our bodies, and mingling with all that sustains us makes it more digestible, more wholesome, and more palatable: and how, because we need so much of it, they supply it unstintingly."

"That too shows design at work."

"Think again of the blessing of fire, our defense against cold and against darkness, our helpmate in every art and in all that mankind contrives for its benefit. In fact, to sum it up, nothing of any account that is useful to human life is contrived without the aid of fire."

"This too is a signal token of affection for humanity."

"Think again how the sun, when past the winter solstice, approaches, ripening some crops and withering others whose time is over; and having accomplished this he approaches no nearer but turns away, careful not to harm us by excess heat; and when once again in his retreat he reaches the point where it is clear to us that if he goes further away we would be frozen with the cold, back he turns once more and draws near and revolves in that region of the heavens where he can best serve us."

"Yes indeed, all this does seem to be done for the sake of mankind."

Τὸ δ', ἐπειδὴ καὶ τοῦτο φανερόν, ὅτι οὐκ ἂν ὑπενέγκοιμεν οὕτε τὸ καῦμα οὕτε τὸ ψῦχος, εἰ ἐξαπίνης γίγνοιτο, οὕτω μὲν κατὰ μικρὸν προσιέναι τὸν ἥλιον, οὕτω δὲ κατὰ μικρὸν ἀπιέναι, ὥστε λανθάνειν ἡμᾶς εἰς ἐκάτερα τὰ ἰσχυρότατα καθισταμένους;

Έγω μέν, ἔφη ὁ Εὐθύδημος, ἤδη τοῦτο σκοπῶ, εἰ ἄρα τί ἐστι τοῖς θεοῖς ἔργον ἢ ἀνθρώπους θεραπεύειν ἐκεῖνο δὲ μόνον ἐμποδίζει με, ὅτι καὶ τἆλλα ζῷα τούτων μετέχει.

Οὐ γὰρ καὶ τοῦτ', ἔφη ὁ Σωκράτης, φανερόν, ὅτι καὶ ταῦτα ἀνθρώπων ἔνεκα γίγνεταί τε καὶ ἀνατρέφεται; τί γὰρ ἄλλο ζῷον αἰγῶν τε καὶ οἰῶν καὶ βοῶν καὶ ἵππων καὶ ὅνων καὶ τῶν ἄλλων ζῷων τοσαῦτα ἀγαθὰ ἀπολαύει ὅσα ὁ ἄνθρωπος; ἐμοὶ μὲν γὰρ δοκεῖ πλείω ἢ τῶν φυτῶν· τρέφονται γοῦν καὶ χρηματίζονται οὐδὲν ἦττον ἀπὸ τούτων ἢ ἀπ' ἐκείνων· πολὺ δὲ γένος ἀνθρώπων τοῖς μὲν ἐκ τῆς γῆς φυομένοις εἰς τροφὴν οὐ χρῆται, ἀπὸ δὲ βοσκημάτων γάλακτι καὶ τυρῷ καὶ κρέασι τρεφόμενοι ζῶσι· πάντες δὲ τιθασεύοντες καὶ δαμάζοντες τὰ χρήσιμα τῶν ζῷων εἴς τε πόλεμον καὶ εἰς ἄλλα πολλὰ συνεργοῖς χρῶνται.

Όμογνωμονῶ σοι καὶ τοῦτ', ἔφη· ὁρῶ γὰρ αὐτῶν καὶ τὰ πολὺ ἰσχυρότερα ἡμῶν οὕτως ὑποχείρια γι-γνόμενα τοῖς ἀνθρώποις, ὥστε χρῆσθαι αὐτοῖς ὅ τι ἂν βούλωνται.

Τὸ δ', ἐπειδὴ πολλὰ μὲν καλὰ καὶ ὡφέλιμα, διαφέροντα δὲ ἀλλήλων ἐστί προσθεῖναι τοῖς ἀνθρώποις αἰσθήσεις άρμοττούσας πρὸς ἔκαστα, δι' ὧν ἀπολαύ-

11

9

### MEMORABILIA IV. 3.9-3.11

"And again, since it is evident that we could not endure the heat or the cold if it came suddenly,<sup>4</sup> the sun's approach and retreat are so gradual that we arrive at the one or the other extreme imperceptibly."

"For myself," said Euthydemus, "I begin to doubt whether after all the gods are occupied in any other work than the service of humanity. The one difficulty I feel is that the lower animals also enjoy these blessings."

"Yes," replied Socrates, "and isn't it evident that they too receive life and food for the sake of mankind? For what animal reaps so many benefits as the human being from goats and sheep and horses and oxen and asses and the other animals? We owe more to them, in my opinion, than to the fruits of the earth. At the least they are not less valuable to us for food and commerce; in fact a large portion of mankind does not use the products of the earth for food but lives on the milk and cheese and meat they get from livestock. Moreover, all people tame and domesticate the useful kinds of animals and make them their fellow workers in war and many other undertakings."

"There too I agree with you, seeing that animals far stronger than humans become so entirely subject to us that we put them to any use we choose."

"Think again of the multitude of things beautiful and useful and their infinite variety, and how the gods have endowed mankind with senses adapted for the perception

10

<sup>4</sup> Cyr. 6.2.29.

ομεν πάντων τῶν ἀγαθῶν· τὸ δὲ καὶ λογισμὸν ἡμῖν ἐμφῦσαι, ῷ περὶ ὧν αἰσθανόμεθα λογιζόμενοί τε καὶ μνημονεύοντες καταμανθάνομεν, ὅπῃ ἔκαστα συμφέρει, καὶ πολλὰ μηχανώμεθα, δι' ὧν τῶν τε ἀγαθῶν ἀπολαύομεν καὶ τὰ κακὰ ἀλεξόμεθα· τὸ δὲ καὶ ἑρμηνείαν δοῦναι, δι' ἦς πάντων τῶν ἀγαθῶν μεταδίδομέν τε ἀλλήλοις διδάσκοντες καὶ κοινωνοῦμεν καὶ νόμους τιθέμεθα καὶ πολιτευόμεθα;

Παντάπασιν ἐοίκασιν, ὧ Σώκρατες, οἱ θεοὶ πολλὴν τῶν ἀνθρώπων ἐπιμέλειαν ποιεῖσθαι.

Τὸ δὲ καὶ εἰ ἀδυνατοῦμεν τὰ συμφέροντα προνοείσθαι ὑπὲρ τῶν μελλόντων, ἡμῖν αὐτοὺς συνεργεῖν διὰ μαντικῆς τοῖς πυνθανομένοις φράζοντας τὰ ἀποβησόμενα καὶ διδάσκοντας, ἢ ἂν ἄριστα γίγνοιτο;

Σοὶ δ', ἔφη, ὧ Σώκρατες, ἐοίκασιν ἔτι φιλικώτερον ἢ τοῖς ἄλλοις χρῆσθαι, εἴ γε μηδὲ ἐπερωτώμενοι ὑπὸ σοῦ προσημαίνουσί σοι ἄ τε χρὴ ποιεῖν καὶ ἃ μή.

Ότι δὲ ἀληθη λέγω, καὶ σὺ γνώση, ἂν μὴ ἀναμένης, ἔως ἂν τὰς μορφὰς τῶν θεῶν ἴδης, ἀλλ' ἐξαρκῆ σοι τὰ ἔργα αὐτῶν ὁρῶντι σέβεσθαι καὶ τιμᾶν τοὺς θεούς. ἐννόει δέ, ὅτι καὶ αὐτοὶ οἱ θεοὶ οὕτως ὑποδεικνύουσιν οἴ τε γὰρ ἄλλοι ἡμῖν τἀγαθὰ διδόντες οὐδὲν τούτων εἰς τοὐμφανὲς ἰόντες διδόασι καὶ ὁ τὸν ὅλον κόσμον συντάττων τε καὶ συνέχων, ἐν ῷ πάντα καλὰ καὶ ἀγαθά ἐστι, καὶ ἀεὶ μὲν χρωμένοις ἀτριβῆ τε καὶ ὑγιᾶ καὶ ἀγήρατα παρέχων, θᾶττον δὲ νοήμα-

12

# MEMORABILIA IV. 3.11-3.13

of every kind, so that there is nothing good that we cannot enjoy; and again, how they have implanted in us the faculty of reasoning, whereby we are able to reason about the objects of our perceptions and commit them to memory, and so come to know what advantage every kind can yield and devise many ways to enjoy the good and drive away the bad; and think of the power of expression, which enables us to impart to one another all good things by teaching and to take our share of them, to enact laws and to administer states."

"Truly, Socrates, it does appear that the gods devote much care to mankind."

"Yet again, insofar as we are powerless by ourselves to foresee what is expedient for the future,<sup>5</sup> the gods lend us their aid, revealing the issues by divination to inquirers and teaching them how to obtain the best results."

"With you, Socrates, they seem to deal in an even more friendly way than with other men, if it is true that, even unasked, they warn you by signs what to do and what not to do."

"Yes, and you will realize the truth of what I say if instead of waiting for the gods to appear to you in bodily presence you are content to praise and worship them because you see what they do. Note that the gods themselves give the reason for doing so; for when they bestow on us their good gifts not one of them ever appears before us gift in hand; and especially the one who coordinates and holds together the universe, in which all things are fair and good, and presents them ever unimpaired and sound and ageless for our use, 6 and quicker than thought to serve us

12

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> Cyr. 1.6.46. <sup>6</sup> Cyr. 8.7.22.

τος ὑπηρετοῦντα ἀναμαρτήτως, οὖτος τὰ μέγιστα μὲν πράττων ὁρᾶται, τάδε δὲ οἰκονομῶν ἀόρατος ἡμῖν ἐστιν. ἐννόει δ', ὅτι καὶ ὁ πᾶσι φανερὸς δοκῶν εἶναι ἤλιος οὐκ ἐπιτρέπει τοῖς ἀνθρώποις ἑαυτὸν ἀκριβῶς ὁρᾶν, ἀλλ' ἐάν τις αὐτὸν ἀναιδῶς ἐγχειρῆ θεᾶσθαι, τὴν ὄψιν ἀφαιρεῖται. καὶ τοὺς ὑπηρέτας δὲ τῶν θεῶν εὑρήσεις ἀφανεῖς ὄντας· κεραυνός τε γὰρ ὅτι μὲν ἄνωθεν ἀφίεται δῆλον καὶ ὅτι οἶς ἂν ἐντύχη πάντων κρατεῖ· ὁρᾶται δ' οὕτ' ἐπιῶν οὕτε κατασκήψας οὔτε ἀπιῶν· καὶ ἄνεμοι αὐτοὶ μὲν οὐχ ὁρῶνται, ἃ δὲ ποιοῦσι φανερὰ ἡμῖν ἐστι καὶ προσιόντων αὐτῶν αἰσθανόμεθα. ἀλλὰ μὴν καὶ ἀνθρώπου γε ψυχή, ἡ εἴπερ τι καὶ ἄλλο τῶν ἀνθρωπίνων τοῦ θείου μετέχει, ὅτι μὲν βασιλεύει ἐν ἡμῖν φανερόν, ὁρᾶται δὲ οὐδ' αὐτή.

Ά χρὴ κατανοοῦντα μὴ καταφρονεῖν τῶν ἀοράτων, ἀλλ' ἐκ τῶν γιγνομένων τὴν δύναμιν αὐτῶν καταμανθάνοντα τιμᾶν τὸ δαιμόνιον.

Έγὼ μέν, ὧ Σώκρατες, ἔφη ὁ Εὐθύδημος, ὅτι μὲν οὐδὲ μικρὸν ἀμελήσω τοῦ δαιμονίου, σαφῶς οἶδα ἐκεῖνο δὲ ἀθυμῶ, ὅτι μοι δοκεῖ τὰς τῶν θεῶν εὐεργεσίας οὐδ' ἄν εἶς ποτε ἀνθρώπων ἀξίαις χάρισιν ἀμείβεσθαι.

ἀλλὰ μὴ τοῦτο ἀθύμει, ἔφη, ὧ Εὐθύδημε· ὁρậς γάρ, ὅτι ὁ ἐν Δελφοῖς θεός, ὅταν τις αὐτὸν ἐπερωτῷ, πῶς ἃν τοῖς θεοῖς χαρίζοιτο, ἀποκρίνεται νόμφ πόλεως. νόμος δὲ δήπου πανταχοῦ ἐστι κατὰ δύναμιν ἱεροῖς θεοὺς ἀρέσκεσθαι.

Πῶς οὖν ἄν τις κάλλιον καὶ εὐσεβέστερον τιμώη

14

15

# MEMORABILIA IV. 3.13-3.16

unerringly, is manifest in his supreme works, and yet is unseen by us in the ordering of them. Note that even the sun, who seems to reveal himself to all, permits no humans to look at him closely, but if anyone attempts to gaze recklessly at him, blinds their eyes. And the gods' ministers too you will find to be invisible. That the thunderbolt is hurled from above and that it overwhelms all on whom it falls is evident, but it is seen neither coming nor striking nor going. And the winds are themselves invisible, yet their effects are manifest to us and we perceive their approach. Moreover, the human soul, which more than all else human partakes of the divine, reigns manifestly within us and yet is itself unseen.

"For these reasons we should not despise things unseen but, realizing their power in their manifestations, honor the divine."

"Socrates," replied Euthydemus, "that I will in no wise be heedless of the divine I am quite sure. But my heart fails me when I think that no man can ever render due thanks to the gods for their benefactions."

"No, don't be downhearted, Euthydemus; for you know that to the inquiry, 'How am I to please the gods?' the Delphic god replies, 'Follow the custom of the state,' and everywhere, I suppose, it is the custom that people propitiate the gods with sacrifices according to their power.

"How then can anyone honor the gods more excellently

14

15

17 θεούς ἢ ὡς αὐτοὶ κελεύουσιν, οὕτω ποιῶν; ἀλλὰ χρὴ τῆς μὲν δυνάμεως μηδὲν ὑφίεσθαι· ὅταν γάρ τις τοῦτο ποιῆ, φανερὸς δήπου ἐστὶ τότε οὐ τιμῶν θεούς. χρὴ οὖν μηδὲν ἐλλείποντα κατὰ δύναμιν τιμᾶν τοὺς θεοὺς θαρρεῖν τε καὶ ἐλπίζειν τὰ μέγιστα ἀγαθά· οὐ γὰρ παρ' ἄλλων γ' ἄν τις μείζω ἐλπίζων σωφρονοίη ἢ παρὰ τῶν τὰ μέγιστα ἀφελεῖν δυναμένων οὐδ' ἂν ἄλλως μᾶλλον ἢ εἰ τούτοις ἀρέσκοι. ἀρέσκοι δὲ πῶς ἂν μᾶλλον ἢ εἰ ὡς μάλιστα πείθοιτο αὐτοῖς;

Τοιαῦτα μὲν δὴ λέγων τε καὶ αὐτὸς ποιῶν εὐσεβεστέρους τε καὶ σωφρονεστέρους τοὺς συνόντας παρεσκεύαζεν.

4. Άλλὰ μὴν καὶ περὶ τοῦ δικαίου γε οὐκ ἀπεκρύπτετο ην είχε γνώμην, άλλα και έργω άπεδείκνυτο, ίδία τε πασι νομίμως τε καὶ ώφελίμως χρώμενος καὶ κοινη ἄρχουσί τε α οἱ νόμοι προστάττοιεν πειθόμενος καὶ κατὰ πόλιν καὶ ἐν ταῖς στρατείαις οὕτως, ὥστε 2 διάδηλος εἶναι παρὰ τοὺς ἄλλους εὐτακτῶν, καὶ ὅτε έν ταις έκκλησίαις έπιστάτης γενόμενος οὐκ ἐπέτρεψε τῷ δήμω παρὰ τοὺς νόμους ψηφίσασθαι, ἀλλὰ σὺν τοις νόμοις ήναντιώθη τοιαύτη όρμη του δήμου, ην ούκ ἂν οἶμαι ἄλλον οὐδένα ἄνθρωπον ὑπομεῖναι καὶ ότε οἱ τριάκοντα προσέταττον αὐτῷ παρὰ τοὺς νόμους τι, οὐκ ἐπείθετο τοῖς τε γὰρ νέοις ἀπαγορευόντων αὐτῶν μὴ διαλέγεσθαι καὶ προσταξάντων ἐκείνω τε καὶ ἄλλοις τισὶ τῶν πολιτῶν ἀγαγεῖν τινα ἐπὶ θανάτω, μόνος οὐκ ἐπείσθη διὰ τὸ παρὰ τοὺς νόμους αὐτῷ προστάττεσθαι καὶ ὅτε τὴν ὑπὸ Μελήτου γραφὴν

#### MEMORABILIA IV. 3.17-4.4

and more devoutly than by doing as they themselves ordain? Only he must in no way fall short of his power. For when he does that, it is surely plain that he is not then honoring the gods. Therefore it is by coming in no way short of his power in honoring the gods that he is to look with confidence for the greatest blessings. For there are none from whom a man of prudence would hope for greater rewards than those who can confer the greatest benefits, nor can he show his prudence more clearly than by pleasing them. And how can he please them better than by strictly obeying them?"

Thus by precept and by example alike he strove to in-

crease in his companions piety and prudence.

4. Again, concerning justice he did not hide his opinion but proclaimed it by his actions. All his private conduct was lawful and helpful: to public authority he rendered such scrupulous obedience in all that the laws required, both in civil life and in military service, that he was a pattern of good discipline to all. When chairman in the assemblies he would not permit the people to record an illegal vote but, upholding the laws, resisted a popular impulse that might even have overborne any but himself. And when the Thirty laid a command on him that was illegal, he refused to obey. Thus he disregarded their repeated injunction not to talk with young men; and when they commanded him and certain other citizens to arrest a man on a capital charge, he alone refused, because the command laid on him was illegal. Again, when he was

17

18

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> Cyr. 1.6.4.

<sup>8</sup> Alluding to the famous case of Leon.

ἔφευγε, τῶν ἄλλων εἰωθότων ἐν τοῖς δικαστηρίοις πρὸς χάριν τε τοῖς δικασταῖς διαλέγεσθαι καὶ κολακεύειν καὶ δεῖσθαι παρὰ τοὺς νόμους καὶ διὰ τὰ τοιαῦτα πολλῶν πολλάκις ὑπὸ τῶν δικαστῶν ἀφιεμένων, ἐκεῖνος οὐδὲν ἠθέλησε τῶν εἰωθότων ἐν τῷ δικαστηρίῳ παρὰ τοὺς νόμους ποιῆσαι, ἀλλὰ ῥαδίως ἄν ἀφεθεὶς ὑπὸ τῶν δικαστῶν, εἰ καὶ μετρίως τι τούτων ἐποίησε, προείλετο μᾶλλον τοῖς νόμοις ἐμμένων ἀποθανεῖν ἢ παρανομῶν ζῆν.

Καὶ ἔλεγε δὲ οὕτως καὶ πρὸς ἄλλους μὲν πολλάκις, οἶδα δέ ποτε αὐτὸν καὶ πρὸς Ἱππίαν τὸν Ἡλεῖον περὶ τοῦ δικαίου τοιάδε διαλεχθέντα. διὰ χρόνου γὰρ ἀφικόμενος ὁ Ἱππίας Ἀθήναζε παρεγένετο τῷ Σωκράτει λέγοντι πρός τινας, ὡς θαυμαστὸν εἴη τὸ εἰ μέν τις βούλοιτο σκυτέα διδάξασθαί τινα ἢ τέκτονα ἢ χαλκέα ἢ ἱππέα, μὴ ἀπορεῖν, ὅποι ἂν πέμψας τούτου τύχοι φασὶ δέ τινες, καὶ ἵππον καὶ βοῦν τῷ βουλομένῳ δικαίους ποιήσασθαι πάντα μεστὰ εἶναι τῶν διδαξόντων ἐὰν δέ τις βούληται ἢ αὐτὸς μαθεῖν τὸ δίκαιον ἢ υἱὸν ἢ οἰκέτην διδάξασθαι, μὴ εἰδέναι ὅποι ἂν ἐλθῶν τύχοι τούτου.

Καὶ ὁ μὲν Ἱππίας ἀκούσας ταῦτα ὥσπερ ἐπισκώπτων αὐτόν, Ἔτι γὰρ σύ, ἔφη, ὧ Σώκρατες, ἐκεῖνα τὰ αὐτὰ λέγεις, ἃ ἐγὼ πάλαι ποτέ σου ἤκουσα;

Καὶ ὁ Σωκράτης, <sup>6</sup>Ο δέ γε τούτου δεινότερον, ἔφη, ὧ Ἱππία, οὐ μόνον ἀεὶ τὰ αὐτὰ λέγω, ἀλλὰ καὶ περὶ τῶν αὐτῶν· σὰ δ' ἴσως διὰ τὸ πολυμαθὴς εἶναι περὶ τῶν αὐτῶν οὐδέποτε τὰ αὐτὰ λέγεις.

5

tried on the charge brought by Meletus, whereas it is the custom of defendants to curry favor with the jury and to indulge in flattery and illegal appeals, and many by such means have been known to gain a verdict of acquittal, he rejected utterly the familiar chicanery of the courts; and though he might easily have gained a favorable verdict by even a moderate indulgence in such stratagems, he chose to die through his loyalty to the laws rather than to live through violating them.

Such views frequently found expression in his conversations with different people; I recollect the substance of one that he had with Hippias of Elis concerning justice. Hippias, who had not been in Athens for a considerable time, found Socrates talking: he was saying that if you want to have a man taught cobbling or building or smithing or riding, you know where to send him to learn the craft; some indeed declare that if you want to train up a horse or an ox in the way he should go, teachers are everywhere. And yet strangely enough, if you want to learn justice yourself, or to have your son or servant taught it, you don't know where to go for a teacher.

When Hippias heard this, "So" he cried in a tone of raillery, "still voicing the same old views, Socrates, that I heard from you so long ago?"

"Yes, Hippias," he replied, "always the same, and—what is more astonishing—on the same topics too! You are so learned that I daresay you never express the same views on the same subjects."

'Αμέλει, ἔφη, πειρῶμαι καινόν τι λέγειν ἀεί.

Πότερον, ἔφη, καὶ περὶ ὧν ἐπίστασαι, οἷον περὶ γραμμάτων ἐάν τις ἔρηταί σε, πόσα καὶ ποῖα Σωκράτους ἐστίν, ἄλλα μὲν πρότερον, ἄλλα δὲ νῦν πειρῷ λέγειν; ἢ περὶ ἀριθμῶν τοῖς ἐρωτῶσιν, εἰ τὰ δὶς πέντε δέκα ἐστίν, οὐ τὰ αὐτὰ νῦν ἃ καὶ πρότερον ἀποκρίνη;

Περὶ μὲν τούτων, ἔφη, ὧ Σώκρατες, ὥσπερ σὰ καὶ ἐγὼ ἀεὶ τὰ αὐτὰ λέγω περὶ μέντοι τοῦ δικαίου πάνυ οἶμαι νῦν ἔχειν εἰπεῖν, πρὸς ἃ οὕτε σὰ οὕτ' ἂν ἄλλος οὐδεὶς δύναιτ' ἀντειπεῖν.

Νὴ τὴν "Ηραν, ἔφη, μέγα λέγεις ἀγαθὸν εὑρηκέναι, εἰ παύσονται μὲν οἱ δικασταὶ δίχα ψηφιζόμενοι, παύσονται δὲ οἱ πολῖται περὶ τῶν δικαίων ἀντιλέγοντές τε καὶ ἀντιδικοῦντες καὶ στασιάζοντες, παύσονται δὲ αἱ πόλεις διαφερόμεναι περὶ τῶν δικαίων καὶ πολεμοῦσαι. καὶ ἐγὼ μὲν οὐκ οῗδ' ὅπως ἂν ἀπολειφθείην σου πρὸ τοῦ ἀκοῦσαι τηλικοῦτον ἀγαθὸν εὑρηκότος.

'Αλλὰ μὰ Δί', ἔφη, οὐκ ἀκούση, πρίν γ' ἂν αὐτὸς ἀποφήνη, ὅ τι νομίζεις τὸ δίκαιον εἶναι. ἀρκεῖ γὰρ, ὅτι τῶν ἄλλων καταγελậς ἐρωτῶν μὲν καὶ ἐλέγχων πάντας, αὐτὸς δ' οὐδενὶ θέλων ὑπέχειν λόγον οὐδὲ γνώμην ἀποφαίνεσθαι περὶ οὐδενός.

Τί δέ; ὧ Ἱππία, ἔφη, οὐκ ἤσθησαι, ὅτι ἐγὼ ἃ δοκεῖ μοι δίκαια εἶναι οὐδὲν παύομαι ἀποδεικνύμενος;

Καὶ ποῖος δή σοι, ἔφη, οὖτος ὁ λόγος ἐστίν;

Εἰ δὲ μὴ λόγῳ, ἔφη, ἀλλ' ἔργῳ ἀποδείκνυμαι· ἢ οὐ δοκεῖ σοι ἀξιοτεκμαρτότερον τοῦ λόγου τὸ ἔργον εἶναι;

7

8

9

# MEMORABILIA IV. 4.6-4.10

"I do try to say something fresh every time."

"Do you mean, about what you know? For example, in answer to the question, 'How many letters are there in "Socrates" and how do you spell it?' do you try to say something different now from what you said before? Or take figures: suppose you are asked if twice five are ten, don't you give the same answer now as you gave before?"

"About letters and figures, Socrates, I always say the

"About letters and figures, Socrates, I always say the same thing, just like you. As for justice, I feel confident that I can now say what neither you nor anyone else can

contradict."

"By Hera, you mean to say that you've made a great discovery, if jurymen are to stop voting different ways, citizens from disputing and litigation and wrangling about the justice of their claims, cities from quarreling about their rights and making war; and for my part, I don't see how to tear myself away from you till I have heard about your great discovery."

"But I swear you won't hear unless you first declare your own opinion about the nature of justice; for it's enough that you mock others, questioning and examining everybody, and never willing to render an account yourself or to state an opinion about anything."

"Indeed, Hippias! Haven't you noticed that I never cease to declare my notions of what is just?"

"And how can you call that an account?"

"I declare them by my deeds, anyhow, if not by my words. Don't you think that deeds are better evidence than words?"

Πολύ γε νὴ  $\Delta \hat{t}$ , ἔφη· δίκαια μὲν γὰρ λέγοντες πολλοὶ ἄδικα ποιοῦσι, δίκαια δὲ πράττων οὐδ' ἂν εἶς ἄδικος εἴη.

"Ηισθησαι οὖν πώποτέ μου ἢ ψευδομαρτυροῦντος ἢ συκοφαντοῦντος ἢ φίλους ἢ πόλιν εἰς στάσιν ἐμβάλλοντος ἢ ἄλλο τι ἄδικον πράττοντος;

Οὐκ ἔγωγ', ἔφη.

11

Τὸ δὲ τῶν ἀδίκων ἀπέχεσθαι οὐ δίκαιον ἡγῆ;

Δηλος εἶ, ἔφη, ὧ Σώκρατες, καὶ νῦν διαφεύγειν ἐγχειρῶν τὸ ἀποδείκνυσθαι γνώμην, ὅ τι νομίζεις τὸ δίκαιον· οὐ γὰρ ἃ πράττουσιν οἱ δίκαιοι, ἀλλ' ἃ μὴ πράττουσι, ταῦτα λέγεις.

12 'Αλλ' ὅμην ἔγωγ', ἔφη ὁ Σωκράτης, τὸ μὴ θέλειν ἀδικεῖν ἱκανὸν δικαιοσύνης ἐπίδειγμα εἶναι. εἰ δέ σοι μὴ δοκεῖ, σκέψαι, ἐὰν τόδε σοι μᾶλλον ἀρέσκη· φημὶ γὰρ ἐγὼ τὸ νόμιμον δίκαιον εἶναι.

Άρα τὸ αὐτὸ λέγεις, ὧ Σώκρατες, νόμιμόν τε καὶ δίκαιον εἶναι:

13 "Εγωγε, έ $\phi$ η.

Οὐ γὰρ αἰσθάνομαί σου, ὁποῖον νόμιμον ἢ ποῖον δίκαιον λέγεις.

Νόμους δὲ πόλεως, ἔφη, γιγνώσκεις;

"Εγωγε, έ $\phi$ η.

Καὶ τίνας τούτους νομίζεις;

'A οί πολίται, ἔφη, συνθέμενοι ἄ τε δεῖ ποιεῖν καὶ ὧν ἀπέχεσθαι ἐγράψαντο.

Οὐκοῦν, ἔφη, νόμιμος μὲν ἂν εἴη ὁ κατὰ ταῦτα πολιτευόμενος, ἄνομος δὲ ὁ ταῦτα παραβαίνων;

#### MEMORABILIA IV. 4.10-4.13

"Yes, much better, of course; for many say what is just and do what is unjust; but no one who does what is just can be unjust."

"Then have you ever found me dealing in perjury or extortion, or stirring up strife between friends or fellow citizens, or doing any other unjust act?"

"I have not."

"To abstain from what is unjust is just, don't you think?"

"Even now, Socrates, you are clearly trying to avoid stating what you think justice to be. You are saying not what the just do, but what they don't do."

"Well, I thought that unwillingness to do injustice was sufficient proof of justice. But if you don't think so, see whether you like this better: I say that what is lawful is just."

"Do you mean, Socrates, that lawful and just are the same thing?"

"I do."

"Because I don't see what you mean by lawful or what you mean by just."

"Does the expression 'laws of a state' make sense to you?"

"It does."

"And what do you think they are?"

"Covenants made by the citizens by which they have enacted what ought to be done and what ought to be avoided."

"Then wouldn't that citizen who acts in accordance with these act lawfully and the one who transgresses them act unlawfully?"

11

12

<sup>9</sup> Cyr. 1.3.17.

Πάνυ μὲν οὖν, ἔφη.

Οὐκοῦν καὶ δίκαια μὲν ἂν πράττοι ὁ τούτοις πειθώμενος, ἄδικα δ' ὁ τούτοις ἀπειθῶν;

Πάνυ μὲν οὖν.

Οὐκοῦν ὁ μὲν τὰ δίκαια πράττων δίκαιος, ὁ δὲ τὰ ἄδικα ἄδικος;

Πῶς γὰρ οὔ;

Ο μεν ἄρα νόμιμος δίκαιός ἐστιν, ὁ δε ἄνομος ἄδικος.

14 Καὶ ὁ Ἱππίας, Νόμους δ', ἔφη, ὧ Σώκρατες, πῶς ἄν τις ἡγήσαιτο σπουδαίον πρᾶγμα είναι ἢ τὸ πείθεσθαι αὐτοῖς, οὕς γε πολλάκις αὐτοὶ οἱ θέμενοι ἀποδοκιμάσαντες μετατίθενται;

Καὶ γὰρ πόλεμον, ἔφη ὁ Σωκράτης, πολλάκις ἀράμεναι αἱ πόλεις πάλιν εἰρήνην ποιοῦνται.

Καὶ μάλα, ἔφη.

Διάφορον οὖν τι οἴει ποιεῖν, ἔφη, τοὺς τοῖς νόμοις πειθομένους φαυλίζων, ὅτι καταλυθεῖεν ἂν οἱ νόμοι, ἢ εἰ τοὺς ἐν τοῖς πολέμοις εὐτακτοῦντας ψέγοις, ὅτι γένοιτ' ἂν εἰρήνη; ἢ καὶ τοὺς ἐν τοῖς πολέμοις ταῖς πατρίσι προθύμως βοηθοῦντας μέμφη;

Μὰ Δί οὐκ ἔγωγ', ἔφη.

Λυκοῦργον δὲ τὸν Λακεδαιμόνιον, ἔφη ὁ Σωκράτης, καταμεμάθηκας ὅτι οὐδὲν ἂν διάφορον τῶν ἄλλων πόλεων τὴν Σπάρτην ἐποίησεν, εἰ μὴ τὸ πείθεσθαι τοῦς νόμοις μάλιστα ἐνειργάσατο αὐτῆ; τῶν δὲ ἀρχόντων ἐν ταῦς πόλεσιν οὐκ οἶσθα ὅτι οἵτινες ἂν τοῦς πολίταις αἰτιώτατοι ὧσι τοῦ τοῦς νόμοις πείθεσθαι,

# MEMORABILIA IV. 4.13-4.15

"Yes, certainly."

"And wouldn't the one who obeys them do what is just and the one who disobeys them do what is unjust?"

"Certainly."

"Then wouldn't the one who does what is just be just and the one who does what is unjust be unjust?"

"Of course."

"Consequently the one who acts lawfully is just and the one who acts unlawfully is unjust."

"Laws," said Hippias, "can hardly be thought of much account, Socrates, or observance of them, seeing that the very people who passed them often reject and amend them."

"Yes," said Socrates, "and after going to war cities often make peace again."

"To be sure."

"Then is there any difference, do you think, between belittling those who obey the laws on the grounds that the laws may be annulled, and blaming those who behave well in the wars on the ground that peace may be made? Or do you really censure those who are eager to help their fatherland in the wars?"

"No. of course not."

"Lycurgus the Spartan now—have you realized that he would not have made Sparta differ from other cities in any respect had he not established obedience to the laws most securely there? Among rulers in cities, aren't you aware that those who do most to make the citizens obey the laws

15

οῦτοι ἄριστοί εἰσι καὶ πόλις, ἐν ἡ μάλιστα οἱ πολῖται τοῖς νόμοις πείθονται, ἐν εἰρήνη τε ἄριστα διάγει καὶ έν πολέμω άνυπόστατός έστιν; άλλα μην και δμόνοιά γε μέγιστόν τε άγαθὸν δοκεί ταῖς πόλεσιν εἶναι καὶ πλειστάκις έν αὐταῖς αἴ τε γερουσίαι καὶ οἱ ἄριστοι άνδρες παρακελεύονται τοῖς πολίταις ὁμονοεῖν, καὶ πανταχοῦ ἐν τῆ Ἑλλάδι νόμος κεῖται τοὺς πολίτας όμνύναι όμονοήσειν, καὶ πανταχοῦ όμνύουσι τὸν ὅρκον τοῦτον οἶμαι δ' ἐγὼ ταῦτα γίγνεσθαι οὐχ ὅπως τοὺς αὐτοὺς χοροὺς κρίνωσιν οἱ πολίται οὐδ' ὅπως τοὺς αὐτοὺς αὐλητὰς ἐπαινῶσιν οὐδ' ὅπως τοὺς αὐτοὺς ποιητὰς αίρωνται οὐδ' ἵνα τοῖς αὐτοῖς ήδωνται, άλλ' ἵνα τοῖς νόμοις πείθωνται. τουτοις γαρ τῶν πολιτων έμμενόντων, αί πόλεις ισχυρόταταί τε καὶ εὐδαιμονέσταται γίγνονται άνευ δε όμονοίας οὔτ' αν πόλις εὖ πολιτευθείη οὔτ' οἶκος καλῶς οἰκηθείη. ἰδία δὲ πῶς μὲν ἄν τις ἦττον ὑπὸ πόλεως ζημιοῖτο, πῶς δ' αν μαλλον τιμώτο η εί τοις νόμοις πείθοιτο; πως δ' αν ήττον έν τοις δικαστηρίοις ήττώτο ή πως αν μάλλον νικώη; τίνι δ' ἄν τις μᾶλλον πιστεύσειε παρακαταθέσθαι η χρήματα η υίους η θυγατέρας; τίνα δ' αν ή πόλις όλη αξιοπιστότερον ήγήσαιτο τοῦ νομίμου; παρὰ τίνος δ' ἂν μᾶλλον τῶν δικαίων τύχοιεν η γονείς η οἰκείοι η οἰκέται η φίλοι η πολίται η ξένοι; τίνι δ' αν μαλλον πολέμιοι πιστεύσειαν η άνοχας η σπονδας η συνθήκας περί εἰρήνης; τίνι δ' αν μαλλον η τῷ νομίμῳ σύμμαχοι ἐθέλοιεν γίγνεσθαι; τῷ δ' ἂν μαλλον οι σύμμαχοι πιστεύσειαν η ήγεμονίαν η

16

# MEMORABILIA IV. 4.15-4.17

are the best, and that the city in which the citizens are most obedient to the laws has the best time in peace and is irresistible in war? And again, agreement is considered the greatest blessing for cities: their senates and their best men constantly exhort the citizens to agree, and everywhere in Greece there is a law that the citizens must promise under oath to agree, and everywhere they take this oath. The object, in my opinion, is not that the citizens may vote for the same choruses, not that they may praise the same pipers, not that they may select the same poets, not that they may enjoy the same pleasures, but that they may obey the laws. For those cities whose citizens stick with them prove strongest and enjoy most happiness; but without agreement no city can be made a good city, no house can be made a prosperous house. And how is the individual citizen less likely to incur penalties from the state, and more certain to gain honor than by obeying the laws? How less likely to be defeated in the courts or more certain to win? Whom would anyone rather trust as guardian of his money or sons or daughters? Whom would the whole city think more trustworthy than the man of lawful conduct? From whom would parents or kinsfolk or servants or friends or fellow citizens or strangers more surely get their just rights? Whom would enemies rather trust in the matter of a truce or treaty or terms of peace? Whom would men rather choose for an ally? And to whom would allies rather entrust leadership or command of a garrison,

16

φρουραρχίαν ἢ πόλεις; τίνα δ' ἄν τις εὖεργετήσας ὑπολάβοι χάριν κομιεῖσθαι μᾶλλον ἢ τὸν νόμιμον; ἢ τίνα μᾶλλον ἄν τις εὖεργετήσειεν ἢ παρ' οὖ χάριν ἀπολήψεσθαι νομίζει; τῷ δ' ἄν τις βούλοιτο μᾶλλον φίλος εἶναι ἢ τῷ τοιούτῳ ἢ τῷ ἦττον ἐχθρός; τῷ δ' ἄν τις ἦττον πολεμήσειεν ἢ ῷ μάλιστα μὲν φίλος εἶναι βούλοιτο, ἤκιστα δ' ἐχθρὸς καὶ ῷ πλεῖστοι μὲν φίλοι καὶ σύμμαχοι βούλοιντο εἶναι, ἐλάχιστοι δ' ἐχθροὶ καὶ πολέμιοι;

Έγω μεν οὖν, ὧ Ἱππία, τὸ αὐτὸ ἀποδείκνυμαι νόμιμόν τε καὶ δίκαιον εἶναι σὰ δ' εἰ τἀναντία γιγνώσκεις. δίδασκε.

Καὶ ὁ Ἱππίας, ᾿Αλλὰ μὰ τὸν Δί᾽, ἔφη, ὧ Σώκρατες, οὔ μοι δοκῶ τἀναντία γιγνώσκειν οἷς εἴρηκας περὶ τοῦ δικαίου.

'Αγράφους δέ τινας οἶσθα, ἔφη, ὧ 'Ιππία, νόμους; Τούς γ' ἐν πάση, ἔφη, χώρα κατὰ ταὐτὰ νομιζομένους.

Έχοις ἃν οὖν εἰπεῖν, ἔφη, ὅτι οἱ ἄνθρωποι αὐτοὺς ἔθεντο;

Καὶ πῶς ἄν, ἔφη, οἴ γε οὔτε συνελθεῖν ἄπαντες ἂν δυνηθεῖεν οὔτε ὁμόφωνοί εἰσι;

Τίνας οὖν, ἔφη, νομίζεις τεθεικέναι τοὺς νόμους τούτους:

Έγω μέν, ἔφη, θεοὺς οἶμαι τοὺς νόμους τούτους τοῖς ἀνθρώποις θεῖναι· καὶ γὰρ παρὰ πᾶσιν ἀνθρώποις πρῶτον νομίζεται θεοὺς σέβειν.

18

### MEMORABILIA IV. 4.17-4.19

or cities? Whom would anyone more confidently expect to show gratitude for benefits received? Or whom would one rather benefit than him from whom he thinks he will receive due gratitude? Whose friendship would anyone desire, or whose enmity would he avoid more earnestly? Whom would anyone less willingly make war on than him whose friendship he most wants and whose enmity he wants least, who attracts the most friends and allies, and the fewest opponents and enemies?

"So, Hippias, I declare lawful and just to be the same thing. If you are of the contrary opinion, tell me."

"Truly, Socrates," answered Hippias, "I don't think my opinion is contrary to what you have said about justice."

"Do you know what is meant by 'unwritten laws,' Hippias?"

"Yes, those that are uniformly observed in every country."

"Could you say that humans made them?"

"And how could that be, seeing that they can't all meet together and don't speak the same language?"

"Then by whom have these laws been made, do you

suppose?"

"I think that the gods made these laws for humans. For among all humans the first law is to fear the gods."

18

20 Οὐκοῦν καὶ γονέας τιμᾶν πανταχοῦ νομίζεται;
Καὶ τοῦτο, ἔφη.

Οὐκοῦν καὶ μήτε γονέας παισὶ μίγνυσθαι μήτε παίδας γονεῦσιν;

Οὐκέτι μοι δοκεῖ, ἔφη, ὧ Σώκρατες, οὖτος θεοῦ νόμος εἶναι.

Τί δή; ἔφη.

21

22

23

Ότι, ἔφη, αἰσθάνομαί τινας παραβαίνοντας αὐτόν. Καὶ γὰρ ἄλλα πολλά, ἔφη, παρανομοῦσιν ἀλλὰ δίκην γέ τοι διδόασιν οἱ παραβαίνοντες τοὺς ὑπὸ τῶν θεῶν κειμένους νόμους, ἢν οὐδενὶ τρόπῳ δυνατὸν ἀνθρώπῳ διαφυγεῖν, ὥσπερ τοὺς ὑπ' ἀνθρώπων κειμένους νόμους ἔνιοι παραβαίνοντες διαφεύγουσι τὸ δίκην διδόναι, οἱ μὲν λανθάνοντες, οἱ δὲ βιαζόμενοι.

Καὶ ποίαν, ἔφη, δίκην, ὧ Σώκρατες, οὐ δύνανται διαφεύγειν γονεῖς τε παισὶ καὶ παΐδες γονεῦσι μιγνύμενοι:

Τὴν μεγίστην νὴ Δί', ἔφη· τί γὰρ ἂν μεῖζον πάθοιεν ἄνθρωποι τεκνοποιούμενοι τοῦ κακῶς τεκνοποιεῖσθαι;

Πῶς οὖν, ἔφη, κακῶς οὖτοι τεκνοποιοῦνται, οὕς γε οὐδὲν κωλύει ἀγαθοὺς αὐτοὺς ὄντας ἐξ ἀγαθῶν παιδοποιεῖσθαι;

Ότι νὴ Δί, ἔφη, οὐ μόνον ἀγαθοὺς δεῖ τοὺς ἐξ ἀλλήλων παιδοποιουμένους εἶναι, ἀλλὰ καὶ ἀκμάζοντας τοῖς σώμασιν ἢ δοκεῖ σοι ὅμοια τὰ σπέρματα εἶναι τὰ τῶν ἀκμαζόντων τοῖς τῶν μήπω ἀκμαζόντων ἢ τῶν παρηκμακότων;

Άλλὰ μὰ Δί', ἔφη, οὐκ εἰκὸς ὅμοια εἶναι.

### MEMORABILIA IV. 4.20-4.23

"Isn't the duty of honoring parents another universal law?"

"Yes, that's another."

"And that parents shall not have sexual intercourse with their children nor children with their parents?" <sup>10</sup>

"No, I don't think that that's a law of a god."

"Why so?"

"Because I notice that some break it."

"Yes, and they do many other things contrary to the laws. But surely the transgressors of the laws ordained by the gods pay a penalty that a human can in no way escape, just as some, when they transgress the laws ordained by humans, escape punishment, either by concealment or by violence."

"And what sort of penalty is it, Socrates, that may not be avoided by parents and children who have intercourse with one another?"

"The greatest, of course. For what greater penalty can humans incur when they beget children than begetting them badly?"

"How then do they beget children badly if, as may well happen, the fathers are good men and the mothers good women?"

"Surely because it's not enough that the two parents be good. They must also be at their physical prime, unless you suppose that those who are at their prime are no more fertile as parents than those who have not yet reached their prime or are past it."

"Of course that's unlikely."

<sup>10</sup> Cyr. 5.1.10.

337

21

20

22

Πότερα οὖν, ἔφη, βελτίω;

Δηλον ὅτι, ἔφη, τὰ τῶν ἀκμαζόντων.

Τὰ τῶν μὴ ἀκμαζόντων ἄρα οὐ σπουδαῖα;

Οὐκ εἰκὸς μὰ Δί, ἔφη.

Οὐκοῦν οὕτω γε οὐ δεῖ παιδοποιεῖσθαι;

Οὐ γὰρ οὖν, ἔφη.

Οὐκοῦν οἴ γε οὕτω παιδοποιούμενοι ὡς οὐ δεῖ παιδοποιοῦνται;

"Εμοιγε δοκεῖ, ἔφη.

Τίνες οὖν ἄλλοι, ἔφη, κακῶς ἂν παιδοποιοῖντο, εἴ γε μὴ οὖτοι;

Όμογνωμονῶ σοι, ἔφη, καὶ τοῦτο.

24 Τί δέ; τοὺς εὖ ποιοῦντας ἀντευεργετεῖν οὐ πανταχοῦ νόμιμόν ἐστι;

Νόμιμον, ἔφη· παραβαίνεται δὲ καὶ τοῦτο.

Οὐκοῦν καὶ οἱ τοῦτο παραβαίνοντες δίκην διδόασι φίλων μὲν ἀγαθῶν ἔρημοι γιγνόμενοι, τοὺς δὲ μισοῦντας ἑαυτοὺς ἀναγκαζόμενοι διώκειν ἢ οὐχ οἱ μὲν εὖ ποιοῦντες τοὺς χρωμένους ἑαυτοῖς ἀγαθοὶ φίλοι εἰσίν, οἱ δὲ μὴ ἀντευεργετοῦντες τοὺς τοιούτους διὰ μὲν τὴν ἀχαριστίαν μισοῦνται ὑπ' αὐτῶν, διὰ δὲ τὸ μάλιστα λυσιτελεῖν τοῖς τοιούτοις χρῆσθαι τούτους μάλιστα διώκουσι;

Νὴ τὸν Δί, ὧ Σώκρατες, ἔφη, θείοις ταῦτα πάντα ἔοικε τὸ γὰρ τοὺς νόμους αὐτοὺς τοῖς παραβαίνουσι τὰς τιμωρίας ἔχειν βελτίονος ἢ κατ' ἄνθρωπον νομοθέτου δοκεῖ μοι εἶναι.

# MEMORABILIA IV. 4.23-4.24

"Which are the better then?"

"Those who are at their prime, clearly."

"Consequently those who are not at prime aren't competent to become parents?"

"It is improbable, of course."

"In that case then, they ought not to have children?"

"Certainly not."

"Therefore those who produce children in such circumstances produce them wrongly?"

"I think so."

"Who then will be bad fathers and mothers, if not they?"

"I agree with you there too."

"Again, isn't the duty of requiting benefits universally recognized by law?"

"Yes, but this law too is broken."

"Then doesn't a man pay a penalty for the breach of that law too, in the gradual loss of good friends and the necessity of hunting those who hate him? Or isn't it true that whereas those who benefit an acquaintance are good friends to him, he is hated by them for his ingratitude if he makes no return, and then, because it is most profitable to enjoy the acquaintance of such people, he hunts them most assiduously?"

"Assuredly, Socrates, all this does suggest the work of the gods. For laws that involve in themselves punishment suitable to those who break them, must, I think, be framed by a better than human legislator." 25

Πότερον οὖν, ὧ Ἱππία, τοὺς θεοὺς ἡγῆ τὰ δίκαια νομοθετείν η άλλα των δικαίων;

Οὐκ ἄλλα μὰ Δί, ἔφη σχολή γὰρ ἂν ἄλλος γέ τις τὰ δίκαια νομοθετήσειεν εἰ μὴ θεός.

Καὶ τοῖς θεοῖς ἄρα, ὧ Ἱππία, τὸ αὐτὸ δίκαιόν τε καὶ νόμιμον εἶναι ἀρέσκει.

Τοιαθτα λέγων τε καὶ πράττων δικαιοτέρους ἐποίει τοὺς πλησιάζοντας.

5. Ως δὲ καὶ πρακτικωτέρους ἐποίει τοὺς συνόντας έαυτώ, νῦν αὖ τοῦτο λέξω. νομίζων γὰρ ἐγκράτειαν ύπάρχειν ἀγαθὸν εἶναι τῷ μέλλοντι καλόν τι πράξειν, πρώτον μέν αὐτὸς φανερὸς ήν τοῖς συνοῦσιν ήσκηκως αύτον μάλιστα πάντων άνθρωπων, ἔπειτα διαλεγόμενος προετρέπετο πάντων μάλιστα τοὺς συνόντας πρὸς ἐγκράτειαν, ἀεὶ μὲν οὖν περὶ τῶν πρὸς ἀρετὴν χρησίμων αὐτός τε διετέλει μεμνημένος καὶ τοὺς συνόντας πάντας ὑπομιμνήσκων οἶδα δέ ποτε αὐτὸν καὶ πρὸς Εὐθύδημον περὶ ἐγκρατείας τοιάδε διαλεχθέντα.

Εἰπέ μοι, ἔφη, ὧ Εὐθύδημε, ὧρα καλὸν καὶ μεγαλείον νομίζεις είναι καὶ ἀνδρὶ καὶ πόλει κτῆμα ἐλευθερίαν:

'Ως οἷόν τέ γε μάλιστα, ἔφη.

Όστις οὖν ἄρχεται ὑπὸ τῶν διὰ τοῦ σώματος ήδονῶν καὶ διὰ ταύτας μὴ δύναται πράττειν τὰ βέλτιστα, νομίζεις τοῦτον ἐλεύθερον εἶναι;

"Ηκιστα, ἔφη.

Ίσως γὰρ ἐλευθέριον φαίνεταί σοι τὸ πράττειν τὰ

# MEMORABILIA IV. 4.25-5.3

"Then, Hippias, do you think that the gods ordain what is just or what is otherwise?"

"Not what is otherwise—of course not; for if a god ordains not what is just, surely no other legislator can do so."

"Consequently, Hippias, the gods too accept the identification of just and lawful."

By such words and actions he encouraged justice in those who resorted to his company.

5. He also tried to make his companions efficient in affairs, as I will now show. For considering it good for anyone who means to do honorable work to have self-control, he made it clear to his companions, in the first place, that in self-control he himself had been the most assiduous of anyone; 11 moreover, in his conversation he exhorted his companions to cultivate self-control above all things. Thus he bore in mind continually the aids to excellence and reminded all his companions about them. I recall in particular the substance of a conversation he once had with Euthydemus on self-control.

"Tell me, Euthydemus," he said, "do you think that freedom is a noble and splendid possession both for individuals and for communities?"

"Yes, in the highest degree."

"Then do you consider free someone who is ruled by bodily pleasures and because of them can't do what is best?"

"By no means."

"Possibly, in fact, to do what is best appears to you to

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup> Cyr. 8.1.32.

βέλτιστα, εἶτα τὸ ἔχειν τοὺς κωλύσοντας τὰ τοιαῦτα ποιεῖν ἀνελεύθερον νομίζεις;

Παντάπασί γ', ἔφη.

4 Παντάπασιν ἄρα σοι δοκοῦσιν οἱ ἀκρατεῖς ἀνελεύθεροι εἶναι;

Νὴ τὸν Δί εἰκότως.

Πότερα δέ σοι δοκοῦσιν οἱ ἀκρατεῖς κωλύεσθαι μόνον τὰ κάλλιστα πράττειν ἢ καὶ ἀναγκάζεσθαι τὰ αἴσχιστα ποιεῖν;

Οὐδὲν ἦττον ἔμοιγ', ἔφη, δοκοῦσι ταῦτα ἀναγκάζεσθαι ἢ ἐκεῖνα κωλύεσθαι.

5 Ποίους δέ τινας δεσπότας ήγη τοὺς τὰ μὲν ἄριστα κωλύοντας, τὰ δὲ κάκιστα ἀναγκάζοντας;

'Ως δυνατὸν νὴ Δί', ἔφη, κακίστους.

Δουλείαν δὲ ποίαν κακίστην νομίζεις εἶναι;

Έγὼ μέν, ἔφη, τὴν παρὰ τοῖς κακίστοις δεσπόταις.

Τὴν κακίστην ἄρα δουλείαν οἱ ἀκρατεῖς δουλεύουσιν;

"Εμοιγε δοκεῖ, ἔφη.

Σοφίαν δὲ τὸ μέγιστον ἀγαθὸν οὐ δοκεῖ σοι ἀπείργουσα τῶν ἀνθρώπων ἡ ἀκρασία εἰς τοὐναντίον αὐτοὺς ἐμβάλλειν; ἡ οὐ δοκεῖ σοι προσέχειν τε τοῖς ἀφελοῦσι καὶ καταμανθάνειν αὐτὰ κωλύειν ἀφέλκουσα ἐπὶ τὰ ἡδέα καὶ πολλάκις αἰσθανομένους τῶν ἀγαθῶν τε καὶ τῶν κακῶν ἐκπλήξασα ποιεῖν τὸ χεῖρον ἀντὶ τοῦ βελτίονος αἰρεῖσθαι;

7 Γίγνεται τοῦτ', ἔφη.

## MEMORABILIA IV. 5.3-5.7

be freedom, and so you think that having masters who will prevent such activity is bondage?"

"I am sure of it."

"You feel sure then that the incontinent are bond 4 slaves?"

"Of course, naturally."

"And do you think that the incontinent are merely prevented from doing what is most honorable, or are they also forced to do what is most dishonorable?"

"I think that they are forced to do that just as much as they are prevented from doing the other."

"What sort of masters are they, in your opinion, who prevent the best and enforce the worst?"

"The worst possible, of course."

"And what sort of slavery do you believe to be the worst?"

"Slavery to the worst masters, I think."

"The worst slavery, therefore, is the slavery endured by the incontinent?"

"I think so."

"As for wisdom, the greatest blessing, does not incontinence exclude it and drive men to the opposite? Or don't you think that incontinence prevents them from attending to useful things and understanding them by drawing them away to things pleasant, and often so stuns their perception of good and evil that they choose the worse instead of the better?"

"That does happen."

7

Σωφροσύνης δέ, ὧ Εὐθύδημε, τίνι ἃν φαίημεν ἦττον ἢ τῷ ἀκρατεῖ προσήκειν; αὐτὰ γὰρ δήπου τὰ ἐναντία σωφροσύνης καὶ ἀκρασίας ἔργα ἐστίν.

Όμολογῶ καὶ τοῦτο, ἔφη.

Τοῦ δ' ἐπιμελεῖσθαι ὧν προσήκει οἴει τι κωλυτικώτερον εἶναι ἀκρασίας;

Οὔκουν ἔγωγ', ἔφη.

Τοῦ δὲ ἀντὶ τῶν ὡφελούντων τὰ βλάπτοντα προαιρεῖσθαι ποιοῦντος καὶ τούτων μὲν ἐπιμελεῖσθαι, ἐκείνων δὲ ἀμελεῖν πείθοντος καὶ τοῖς σωφρονοῦσι τὰ ἐναντία ποιεῖν ἀναγκάζοντος οἴει τι ἀνθρώπω κάκιον εἶναι:

Οὐδέν, ἔφη.

8

9

Οὐκοῦν τὴν ἐγκράτειαν τῶν ἐναντίων ἢ τὴν ἀκρασίαν εἰκὸς τοῖς ἀνθρώποις αἰτίαν εἶναι;

Πάνυ μὲν οὖν, ἔφη.

Οὐκοῦν καὶ τῶν ἐναντίων τὸ αἴτιον εἰκὸς ἄριστον εἶναι;

Εἰκὸς γάρ, ἔφη.

Έοικεν ἄρ', έφη, ὧ Εὐθύδημε, ἄριστον ἀνθρώπῳ έγκράτεια εἶναι;

Εἰκότως γάρ, ἔφη, ὧ Σώκρατες.

Έκεινο δέ, ὧ Εὐθύδημε, ἤδη πώποτε ἐνεθυμήθης; Ποιον; ἔφη.

Ότι καὶ ἐπὶ τὰ ἡδέα, ἐφ' ἄπερ μόνα δοκεῖ ἡ ἀκρασία τοὺς ἀνθρώπους ἄγειν, αὐτὴ μὲν οὐ δύναται ἄγειν, ἡ δ' ἐγκράτεια πάντων μάλιστα ἥδεσθαι ποιεῖ. Πῶς: ἔφη.

"With prudence, Euthydemus, who shall we say has less to do than the incontinent? For I presume that the actions prompted by prudence and incontinence are exact opposites?"

"I agree with that too."

"To caring for what is right is there any stronger hindrance, do you think, than incontinence?"

"Indeed I don't."

"And do you think there can be anything worse for a person than what causes him to choose the harmful rather than the useful, persuades him to care for the one and to be careless of the other, and forces him to do the opposite of what prudence dictates?"

"Nothing."

"And is it not likely that self-control causes actions the 8 opposite of those that are due to incontinence?"

"Certainly."

"Then isn't the cause of the opposite actions presumably a very great blessing?"

"Yes, presumably."

"Consequently we may presume, Euthydemus, that self-control is a very great blessing to a man?"

"We may presume so, Socrates."

"Has it ever occurred to you, Euthydemus—?"

"What?"

"That though pleasure is the one and only goal to which incontinence is thought to lead men, she herself cannot bring them to it, whereas nothing produces pleasure so surely as self-control?"

"How so?"

"Ωσπερ ἡ μὲν ἀκρασία οὐκ ἐῶσα καρτερεῖν οὔτε λιμὸν οὔτε δίψαν οὔτε ἀφροδισίων ἐπιθυμίαν οὔτε ἀγρυπνίαν, δι' ὧν μόνων ἔστιν ἡδέως μὲν φαγεῖν τε καὶ πιεῖν καὶ ἀφροδισιάσαι, ἡδέως δ' ἀναπαύσασθαί τε καὶ κοιμηθῆναι, καὶ περιμείναντας καὶ ἀνασχομένους, ἔως ἂν ταῦτα ὡς ἔνι ἥδιστα γένηται, κωλύει τοῖς ἀναγκαιοτάτοις τε καὶ συνεχεστάτοις ἀξιολόγως ἥδεσθαι ἡ δ' ἐγκράτεια μόνη ποιοῦσα καρτερεῖν τὰ εἰρημένα μόνη καὶ ἥδεσθαι ποιεῖ ἀξίως μνήμης ἐπὶ τοῖς εἰρημένοις.

Παντάπασιν, ἔφη, ἀληθῆ λέγεις.

ἀλλὰ μὴν τοῦ μαθεῖν τι καλὸν καὶ ἀγαθὸν καὶ τοῦ ἐπιμεληθῆναι τῶν τοιούτων τινός, δι' ὧν ἄν τις καὶ τὸ ἑαυτοῦ σῶμα καλῶς διοικήσειε καὶ τὸν ἑαυτοῦ οἶκον καλῶς οἰκονομήσειε καὶ φίλοις καὶ πόλει ὡφέλιμος γένοιτο καὶ ἐχθροὺς κρατήσειεν, ἀφ' ὧν οὐ μόνον ὡφέλειαι, ἀλλὰ καὶ ἡδοναὶ μέγισται γίγνονται, οἱ μὲν ἐγκρατεῖς ἀπολαύουσι πράττοντες αὐτά, οἱ δ' ἀκρατεῖς οὐδενὸς μετέχουσι. τῷ γὰρ ἃν ἦττον φήσαιμεν τῶν τοιούτων προσήκειν ἢ ῷ ἤκιστα ἔξεστι ταῦτα πράττειν, κατεχομένῳ ἐπὶ τῷ σπουδάζειν περὶ τὰς ἐγγυτάτω ἡδονάς;

Καὶ ὁ Εὐθύδημος, Δοκεῖς μοι, ἔφη, ὧ Σώκρατες, λέγειν, ὡς ἀνδρὶ ἥττονι τῶν διὰ τοῦ σώματος ἡδονῶν πάμπαν οὐδεμιᾶς ἀρετῆς προσήκει.

Τί γὰρ διαφέρει, ἔφη, ὧ Εὐθύδημε, ἄνθρωπος ἀκρατὴς θηρίου τοῦ ἀμαθεστάτου; ὅστις γὰρ τὰ μὲν κράτιστα μὴ σκοπεῖ, τὰ ἥδιστα δ' ἐκ παντὸς τρόπου

10

"Incontinence will not let them endure hunger or thirst or desire or lack of sleep, which are the sole causes of pleasure in eating and drinking and sexual indulgence, and in resting and sleeping, after a time of waiting and resistance until the moment comes when these will give the greatest possible satisfaction; and thus she prevents them from experiencing any pleasure worthy to be mentioned in the most elementary and recurrent forms of enjoyment. But self-control alone causes them to endure the sufferings I have named, and therefore she alone causes them to experience any pleasure worth mentioning in such enjoyments."

"What you say is entirely true."

"What's more, the delights of learning something good and excellent, and of studying some of the means by which a person knows how to regulate his body well and manage his household successfully, to be useful to his friends and city and to defeat his enemies—knowledge that yields not only very great benefits but very great pleasures—these are the delights of the self-controlled; but the incontinent have no part in them. For who, should we say, has less concern with these than he who has no power of cultivating them because all his serious purposes are centered in the pleasures that lie nearest?"

"Socrates," said Euthydemus, "I think you mean that he who is at the mercy of the bodily pleasures has no concern whatever with excellence in any form."

"Yes, Euthydemus; for how can an incontinent person be any better than the most ignorant beast? How can a person who fails to consider the things that matter most, 10

ζητεί ποιείν, τί ἂν διαφέροι τῶν ἀφρονεστάτων βοσκημάτων; ἀλλὰ τοις ἐγκρατέσι μόνοις ἔξεστι σκοπείν τὰ κράτιστα τῶν πραγμάτων καὶ λόγῳ καὶ ἔργῳ διαλέγοντας κατὰ γένη τὰ μὲν ἀγαθὰ προαιρείσθαι, τῶν δὲ κακῶν ἀπέχεσθαι.

Καὶ οὕτως ἔφη ἀρίστους τε καὶ εὐδαιμονεστάτους ἄνδρας γίγνεσθαι καὶ διαλέγεσθαι δυνατωτάτους. ἔφη δὲ καὶ τὸ διαλέγεσθαι ὀνομασθῆναι ἐκ τοῦ συνιόντας κοινῆ βουλεύεσθαι διαλέγοντας κατὰ γένη τὰ πράγματα: δεῖν οὖν πειρασθαι ὅτι μάλιστα πρὸς τοῦτο ἑαυτὸν ἔτοιμον παρασκευάζειν καὶ τούτου μάλιστα ἐπιμελεῖσθαι: ἐκ τούτου γὰρ γίγνεσθαι ἄνδρας ἀρίστους τε καὶ ἡγεμονικωτάτους καὶ διαλεκτικωτάτους.

6. 'Ως δὲ καὶ διαλεκτικωτέρους ἐποίει τοὺς συνόντας, πειράσομαι καὶ τοῦτο λέγειν. Σωκράτης γὰρ
τοὺς μὲν εἰδότας, τί ἔκαστον εἴη τῶν ὅντων, ἐνόμιζε
καὶ τοῖς ἄλλοις ἂν ἐξηγεῖσθαι δύνασθαι τοὺς δὲ μὴ
εἰδότας οὐδὲν ἔφη θαυμαστὸν εἶναι αὐτούς τε σφάλλεσθαι καὶ ἄλλους σφάλλειν ὧν ἕνεκα σκοπῶν σὺν
τοῖς συνοῦσι, τί ἕκαστον εἴη τῶν ὄντων, οὐδέποτ'
ἔληγε.

Πάντα μὲν οὖν ἢ διωρίζετο πολὺ ἔργον ἂν εἴη διεξελθεῖν· ἐν ὅσοις δὲ τὸν τρόπον τῆς ἐπισκέψεως δηλώσειν οἶμαι, τοσαῦτα λέξω.

Πρῶτον δὲ περὶ εὐσεβείας ὧδέ πως ἐσκόπει.

Εἰπέ μοι, ἔφη, ὧ Εὐθύδημε, ποῖόν τι νομίζεις εὐσέβειαν εἶναι;

2

and strives by every means to do the things that are most pleasant, be better than the stupidest of creatures? No, only the self-controlled can consider the things that matter most, and sorting them out after their kind, by word and deed alike, choose the good and reject the evil."

And thus, he said, men become supremely good and happy and skilled in discussion. The very word *discussion*, according to him, owes its name to the practice of meeting together for common deliberation and *sorting*<sup>12</sup> things after their kind: and therefore we should be especially ready and prepared for this and take special care about it; for it makes for excellence, leadership, and skill in discussion.

6. I will try also to show how he encouraged his companions to become skilled in discussion. Socrates held that those who know what any given thing is can also expound it to others; on the other hand, those who do not know are misled themselves and mislead others. For this reason he never gave up considering with his companions what any given thing is.

To go through all his definitions would be an arduous task. I will say only enough to indicate his method of analysis.

His analysis of piety—to take that first—was more or less as follows:

"Tell me, Euthydemus, what sort of thing is piety, in your opinion?"

<sup>12</sup> Etymologizing the verb-stem *leg*-, which preserves the sense of roots meaning "speak" and "sort."

12

Καὶ ὅς, Κάλλιστον νὴ Δί, ἔφη.

Έχεις οὖν εἰπεῖν, ὁποῖός τις ὁ εὐσεβής ἐστιν;

Έμοὶ μὲν δοκεῖ, ἔφη, ὁ τοὺς θεοὺς τιμῶν.

Έξεστι δὲ ὃν ἄν τις βούληται τρόπον τοὺς θεοὺς τιμᾶν;

Οὐκ ἀλλὰ νόμοι εἰσί, καθ' οὓς δεῖ τοὺς θεοὺς τιμᾶν. Οὐκοῦν ὁ τοὺς νόμους τούτους εἰδὼς εἰδείη ἄν, ὡς δεῖ τοὺς θεοὺς τιμᾶν:

Οἶμαι ἔγωγ', ἔφη.

Åρ' οὖν ὁ εἰδώς, ώς δεῖ τοὺς θεοὺς τιμᾶν, οὐκ ἄλλως οἴεται δεῖν τοῦτο ποιεῖν ἢ ώς οἶδεν;

Οὐ γὰρ οὖν, ἔφη.

Άλλως δέ τις θεούς τιμᾶ ἢ ώς οἴεται δεῖν;

Οὐκ οἶμαι, ἔφη.

3

Ό ἄρα τὰ περὶ τοὺς θεοὺς νόμιμα εἰδὼς νομίμως ἃν τοὺς θεοὺς τιμώη;

Πάνυ μὲν οὖν.

Οὐκοῦν ὅ γε νομίμως τιμῶν ὡς δεῖ τιμᾳ;

Πῶς γὰρ οὔ;

Ὁ δέ γε ώς δεῖ τιμῶν εὐσεβής ἐστι;

Πάνυ μεν οὖν, ἔφη.

Ό ἄρα τὰ περὶ τοὺς θεοὺς νόμιμα εἰδὼς ὀρθῶς ἂν ἡμῖν εὐσεβὴς ὡρισμένος εἴη;

Έμοὶ γοῦν, ἔφη, δοκεῖ.

#### MEMORABILIA IV. 6.2-6.5

"An excellent thing, to be sure," he replied.

"Can you say what sort of man is pious?"

"He who worships the gods, I think."

"May someone worship the gods according to his own will and pleasure?"

"No, there are laws to be observed in worshipping the gods!"

"Then won't someone who knows these laws know how he must worship the gods?"

"I think so."

"Then does someone who knows how he must worship the gods think that he must do so according to his knowledge and not otherwise?"

"He does indeed."

"And does everyone worship the gods as he thinks he ought and not otherwise?"

"I think so."

"Then will someone who knows what is lawful concerning the gods worship the gods lawfully?"  $\label{eq:concerning}$ 

"Certainly."

"Then doesn't someone who worships lawfully worship as he should?"

"Of course."

"Yes, but someone who worships as he should is pious?"

"Certainly."

"Shall we therefore rightly define the pious person as one who knows what is lawful concerning the gods?"

"I would think so."

"In dealing with people, again, may someone do as he 5 chooses?"

Οὐκ ἀλλὰ καὶ περὶ τούτους ἐστι<sup>6</sup> νόμιμα.<sup>7</sup>

Οὐκοῦν οἱ κατὰ ταῦτα χρώμενοι ἀλλήλοις ὡς δεῖ χρώνται;

Πῶς γὰρ οὔ;

Οὐκοῦν οἵ γε ὡς δεῖ χρώμενοι καλῶς χρῶνται;

Πάνυ μὲν οὖν, ἔφη.

Οὐκοῦν οἵ γε τοῖς ἀνθρώποις καλῶς χρώμενοι καλῶς πράττουσι τἀνθρώπεια πράγματα;

Εἰκός γ', ἔφη.

Οὐκοῦν οἱ τοῖς νόμοις πειθόμενοι δίκαια οὖτοι ποιοῦσι;

Πάνυ μεν οὖν, ἔφη.

 $\Delta$ ίκαια δ $\epsilon$ ,  $\check{\epsilon}$ φη, οἶσ $\theta$ α ὁποῖα καλ $\epsilon$ ῖται;

Α οἱ νόμοι κελεύουσιν, ἔφη.

Οἱ ἄρα ποιοῦντες ἃ οἱ νόμοι κελεύουσι δίκαιά τε ποιοῦσι καὶ ἃ δεῖ;

Πῶς γὰρ οὔ;

Οὐκοῦν οἴ γε τὰ δίκαια ποιοῦντες δίκαιοί εἰσιν; Οἷμαι ἔγωγ', ἔφη.

Οἴει οὖν τινας πείθεσθαι τοῖς νόμοις μὴ εἰδότας ἃ οἱ νόμοι κελεύουσιν;

Οὐκ ἔγωγ', ἔφη.

Εἰδότας δὲ ἃ δεῖ ποιείν οἴει τινὰς οἴεσθαι δείν μὴ ταῦτα ποιείν;

Ούκ οἶμαι, ἔφη.

Οἶσθα δέ τινας ἄλλα ποιοῦντας ἢ ἃ οἴονται δεῖν;

<sup>6</sup> ἐστι Hirschig: ὁ εἰδὼς ἃ codd. Stobaeus

"No, in the case of people too there are laws of conduct."

"Then don't those who observe them in their dealings with one another behave as they should?"

"Of course."

"And don't those who behave as they should behave well?"

"Certainly."

"And don't those who behave well toward fellow human beings act well in human affairs?"

"Presumably."

"And don't those who obey the laws do what is just?"

"Certainly."

"Do you know what sort of things are called just?"

"The things that the laws command."

"Consequently those who do what the laws command do both what is just and what they must do?"

"Of course."

"And aren't those who do what is just, just people?"

"I think so."

"Do you think, then, that any obey the laws without knowing what the laws command?"

"I do not."

"And knowing what they must do, do you suppose that any think they must not do it?"

"I don't think so."

"Do you know of any who do, not what they think they must do, but something else?"

 $<sup>^7</sup>$  νόμιμα καθ'  $\mathring{a}$  δεῖ πρὸς ἀλλήλους χρῆσθαι, νόμιμος  $\mathring{a}$ ν εἴη codd. (νόμιμος  $\mathring{a}$ ν εἴη om. Stobaeus)

Οὐκ ἔγωγ', ἔφη.

Οἱ ἄρα τὰ περὶ ἀνθρώπους νόμιμα εἰδότες οὖτοι τὰ δίκαια ποιοῦσι;

Πάνυ μὲν οὖν, ἔφη.

Οὐκοῦν οἵ γε τὰ δίκαια ποιοῦντες δίκαιοί εἰσι;

Τίνες γὰρ ἄλλοι; ἔφη.

'Ορθως ἄν ποτε ἄρα ὁριζοίμεθα ὁριζόμενοι δικαίους εἶναι τοὺς εἰδότας τὰ περὶ ἀνθρώπους νόμιμα;

"Εμοιγε δοκεῖ, ἔφη.

7

Σοφίαν δὲ τί ἂν φήσαιμεν εἶναι; εἰπέ μοι, πότερά σοι δοκοῦσιν οἱ σοφοὶ ἃ ἐπίστανται, ταῦτα σοφοὶ εἶναι ἢ εἰσί τινες ἃ μὴ ἐπίστανται σοφοί;

'A ἐπίστανται δῆλον ὅτι, ἔφη. πῶς γὰρ ἄν τις ἄ γε μὴ ἐπίσταιτο, ταῦτα σοφὸς εἴη;

Άρ' οὖν οἱ σοφοὶ ἐπιστήμη σοφοί εἰσι;

Τίνι γὰρ ἄν, ἔφη, ἄλλῳ τις εἴη σοφὸς εἴ γε μὴ ἐπιστήμη;

Άλλο δέ τι σοφίαν οἴει εἶναι ἢ ὧ σοφοί εἰσιν; Οὐκ ἔγωγε.

Έπιστήμη ἄρα σοφία ἐστίν;

"Εμοιγε δοκεί.

'Αρ' οὖν δοκεῖ σοι ἀνθρώπῳ δυνατὸν εἶναι τὰ ὄντα πάντα ἐπίστασθαι;

Οὐδὲ μὰ Δί ἔμοιγε πολλοστὸν μέρος αὐτῶν.

Πάντα μὲν ἄρα σοφὸν οὐχ οἶόν τε ἄνθρωπον εἶναι; Μὰ Δί οὐ δῆτα, ἔφη.

<sup>°</sup>Ο ἄρα ἐπίσταται ἕκαστος, τοῦτο καὶ σοφός ἐστιν; ˇΕμοιγε δοκεῖ.

## MEMORABILIA IV. 6.6-6.7

"I do not."

"Consequently those who know what is lawful concerning people do what is just?"

"Certainly."

"But aren't they who do what is just, just people?"

"Exactly."

"At last then, we may rightly define just people as those who know best what is just concerning people?"

"I think so."

"And what of wisdom? How shall we describe it? Tell me, does it seem to you that the wise are wise about what they know, or are some wise about what they don't know?"

"About what they know, obviously; for how can someone be wise about the things he doesn't know?"

"The wise, then, are wise by knowledge?"

"How else can a man be wise if not by knowledge?"

"Do you think that wisdom is anything but that by which men are wise?"

"No."

"It follows that wisdom is knowledge?"

"I think so."

"Then do you think it possible for a man to know all things?"

"Of course not-nor even a fraction of them."

"So an all-wise man is an impossibility?"

"Of course, of course."

"Consequently everyone is wise just in so far as he knows?"

"I think so."

8 <sup>3</sup>Αρ' οὖν, ὧ Εὐθύδημε, καὶ τἀγαθὸν οὕτω ζητητέον ἐστί;

 $\Pi \hat{\omega}_{S}$ ;  $\check{\epsilon} \phi \eta$ .

Δοκεί σοι τὸ αὐτὸ πᾶσιν ὤφέλιμον εἶναι;

Οὐκ ἔμοιγε.

Τί δέ; τὸ ἄλλφ ἀφέλιμον οὐ δοκεῖ σοι ἐνίοτε ἄλλφ βλαβερὸν εἶναι;

Καὶ μάλα, ἔφη.

Άλλο δ' ἄν τι φαίης ἀγαθὸν εἶναι ἢ τὸ ὡφέλιμον; Οὐκ ἔγωγ', ἔφη.

Τὸ ἄρα ὡφέλιμον ἀγαθόν ἐστιν ὅτῷ ἂν ὡφέλιμον ἢ;

Δοκεῖ μοι, ἔφη.

Τὸ δὲ καλὸν ἔχοιμεν ἄν πως ἄλλως εἰπεῖν ἢ ὀνομάζεις καλὸν ἢ σῶμα ἢ σκεῦος ἢ ἄλλ' ὁτιοῦν, ὃ οἶσθα πρὸς πάντα καλὸν ὄν;

Μὰ Δί οὐκ ἔγωγ', ἔφη.

'Αρ' οὖν πρὸς ὃ ἂν ἕκαστον χρήσιμον ἢ, πρὸς τοῦτο ἑκάστῳ καλῶς ἔχει χρῆσθαι;

Πάνυ μεν οὖν, ἔφη.

Καλὸν δὲ πρὸς ἄλλο τι ἐστὶν ἔκαστον ἢ πρὸς δ ἑκάστῳ καλῶς ἔχει χρῆσθαι;

Οὐδὲ πρὸς εν ἄλλο, ἔφη.

Τὸ χρήσιμον ἄρα καλόν ἐστι πρὸς ὁ ἂν ἢ χρήσιμον;

"Εμοιγε δοκεῖ, ἔφη.

10 'Ανδρείαν δέ, ὧ Εὐθύδημε, ἆρα τῶν καλῶν νομίζεις εἶναι;

# MEMORABILIA IV. 6.8-6.10

"Now to seek the good, Euthydemus: is this the way?"

"What do you mean?"

"Does it seem to you that the same thing is useful to everyone?"  $% \left( \frac{1}{2}\right) =\frac{1}{2}\left( \frac{1}{2}\right) =\frac{1}{2}\left($ 

"No"

"In fact, what is useful to one may sometimes be hurtful to another, don't you think?"

"Assuredly."

"Should you call anything good except what is useful?"
"No."

"Consequently what is useful is good for someone to whom it is useful?"

"I think so."

"Consider the beautiful: can we define it in any other way? Or is it possible to name a beautiful body, for instance, or vessel, or anything else that you know to be beautiful for all purposes?"

"Of course not."

"Then does the beauty in using anything consist in using it for just that purpose for which that particular thing is useful?"

"Certainly."

"And is a thing beautiful for any other purpose than that for which it is beautiful to use that particular thing?"

"For no other purpose whatever."

"The useful, then, is beautiful for any purpose for which it is useful?"

"I think so."

"Next comes courage, Euthydemus. Do you think it a 10 beautiful thing?"

Κάλλιστον μέν οὖν ἔγωγ', ἔφη.

Χρήσιμον ἄρα οὐ πρὸς τὰ ἐλάχιστα νομίζεις τὴν ἀνδρείαν;

 $N\dot{\eta} \Delta \hat{\iota}$ ,  $\check{\epsilon}\phi\eta$ ,  $\pi\rho\dot{o}s$   $\tau\dot{a}$   $\mu\dot{\epsilon}\gamma\iota\sigma\tau a$   $\mu\dot{\epsilon}\nu$   $o\mathring{v}\nu$ .

<sup>3</sup>Αρ' οὖν δοκεῖ σοι πρὸς τὰ δεινά τε καὶ ἐπικίνδυνα χρήσιμον εἶναι τὸ ἀγνοεῖν αὐτά;

"Ηκιστά γ', ἔφη.

Οἱ ἄρα μὴ φοβούμενοι τὰ τοιαῦτα διὰ τὸ μὴ εἰδέναι, τί ἐστιν, οὐκ ἀνδρεῖοί εἰσι;

Νὴ  $\Delta \hat{\iota}$ ,  $\check{\epsilon} \phi \eta$ · πολλοὶ γὰρ ἂν οὕτω γε τῶν τε μαινομένων καὶ τῶν δειλῶν ἀνδρεῖοι εἶεν.

Τί δὲ οἱ καὶ τὰ μὴ δεινὰ δεδοικότες;

Έτι  $\gamma \epsilon$   $\nu \dot{\eta}$   $\Delta i a$ ,  $\epsilon \dot{\phi} \eta$ ,  $\delta \dot{\tau} \tau o \nu$ .

'Αρ' οὖν τοὺς μὲν ἀγαθοὺς πρὸς τὰ δεινὰ καὶ ἐπικίνδυνα ὄντας ἀνδρείους ἡγῆ εἶναι, τοὺς δὲ κακοὺς δειλούς;

Πάνυ μεν οὖν, ἔφη.

Οὐκ ἀλλὰ τούτους, ἔφη.

Κακοὺς δὲ ἄρα τοὺς οἴους τούτοις κακῶς χρῆσθαι; Τίνας γὰρ ἄλλους; ἔφη.

Αρ' οὖν ἔκαστοι χρῶνται ὡς οἴονται δεῖν;

Πῶς γὰρ ἄλλως; ἔφη.

'' Αρ' οὖν οἱ μὴ δυνάμενοι καλῶς χρῆσθαι ἴσασιν, ώς δεῖ χρῆσθαι;

Οὐ δήπου γε, ἔφη.

Οἱ ἄρα εἰδότες, ὡς δεῖ χρῆσθαι, οὖτοι καὶ δύνανται;

"I prefer to say very beautiful."

"So you consider courage useful for no mean purposes?"

"Of course—or rather, for the greatest."

"Then do you think that in the pressure of terrors and dangers it is useful to be ignorant of them?"

"By no means."

"So those who feel no fear of such things because they are ignorant of them are not courageous?"

"Of course not, for in that case many madmen and cowards would be courageous."

"What of those who are afraid when there is no ground for fear?"

"Still less, of course."

"Then do you think that those who are good in the presence of terrors and dangers are courageous, and those who are bad are cowards?"

"Certainly."

"And do you think that any are good in the presence of such things except those who can deal with them well?"

"None but these."

"And bad, except such as deal badly with them?"

"These and none others."

"Then do both classes behave as they think they must?"

"How can they behave otherwise?"

"Then do those who cannot behave well know how they must behave?"

"Surely not."

"So those who know how they must behave are only those who can?"

Μόνοι γ', ἔφη.

Τί δὲ οἱ μὴ διημαρτηκότες, ἆρα κακῶς χρῶνται τοῖς τοιούτοις;

Οὐκ οἶμαι, ἔφη.

Οἱ ἄρα κακῶς χρώμενοι διημαρτήκασιν;

Εἰκός γ', ἔφη.

12

13

Οἱ μὲν ἄρα ἐπιστάμενοι τοῖς δεινοῖς τε καὶ ἐπικινδύνοις καλῶς χρῆσθαι ἀνδρεῖοί εἰσιν, οἱ δὲ διαμαρτάνοντες τούτου δειλοί;

"Εμοιγε δοκοῦσιν, ἔφη.

Βασιλείαν δὲ καὶ τυραννίδα ἀρχὰς μὲν ἀμφοτέρας ἡγεῖτο εἶναι, διαφέρειν δὲ ἀλλήλων ἐνόμιζε. τὴν μὲν γὰρ ἑκόντων τε τῶν ἀνθρώπων καὶ κατὰ νόμους τῶν πόλεων ἀρχὴν βασιλείαν ἡγεῖτο, τὴν δὲ ἀκόντων τε καὶ μὴ κατὰ νόμους, ἀλλ' ὅπως ὁ ἄρχων βούλοιτο, τυραννίδα. καὶ ὅπου μὲν ἐκ τῶν τὰ νόμιμα ἐπιτελούντων αἱ ἀρχαὶ καθίστανται, ταύτην μὲν τὴν πολιτείαν ἀριστοκρατίαν ἐνόμιζεν εἶναι, ὅπου δ' ἐκ τιμημάτων, πλουτοκρατίαν, ὅπου δ' ἐκ πάντων, δημοκρατίαν.

Εἰ δέ τις αὐτῷ περί του ἀντιλέγοι μηδὲν ἔχων σαφὲς λέγειν, ἀλλ' ἄνευ ἀποδείξεως ἤτοι σοφώτερον φάσκων εἶναι ὃν αὐτὸς λέγοι ἢ πολιτικώτερον ἢ ἀνδρειότερον ἢ ἄλλο τι τῶν τοιούτων, ἐπὶ τὴν ὑπόθεσιν ἐπανῆγεν ἂν πάντα τὸν λόγον ὧδέ πως·

14 Φὴς σὰ ἀμείνω πολίτην εἶναι ὃν σὰ ἐπαινεῖς ἢ ὃν ἐγώ;

Φημὶ γὰρ οὖν.

"Yes, only they."

"Well now, do those who are not utterly mistaken deal badly with such things?"

"I think not."

"So those who behave badly are utterly mistaken?"

"Presumably."

"It follows that those who know how to deal well with terrors and dangers are courageous, and those who utterly mistake the way are cowards?"

"That is my opinion."

Kingship and despotism, in his judgment, were both forms of government, but he held that they differed. For government of people with their consent and in accordance with the laws of the state was kingship, while government of unwilling subjects and not controlled by laws but imposed by the will of the ruler was despotism. And where the officials are chosen among those who fulfill the requirements of the laws, the constitution is an aristocracy; where ratable property is the qualification for office, you have a plutocracy; where all are eligible, a democracy.

Whenever anyone argued with him on any point without being able to make himself clear, asserting but not proving that so and so was wiser or an abler politician or braver or whatever, he would lead the whole discussion back to the definition required, much in this way:

"Do you say that your man is a better citizen than 14 mine?"

"I do indeed."

361

12

Τί οὖν οὐκ ἐκεῖνο πρῶτον ἐπεσκεψάμεθα, τί ἐστιν ἔργον ἀγαθοῦ πολίτου;

Ποιῶμεν τοῦτο.

Οὐκοῦν ἐν μὲν χρημάτων διοικήσει κρατοίη ἂν ὁ χρήμασιν εὐπορωτέραν τὴν πόλιν ποιῶν;

Πάνυ μὲν οὖν, ἔφη.

Έν δέ γε πολέμφ ὁ καθυπερτέραν τῶν ἀντιπάλων; Πῶς γὰρ οὔ;

Έν δὲ πρεσβεία ἆρ' ὃς ἂν φίλους ἀντὶ πολεμίων παρασκευάζη;

Εἰκός γε.

Οὐκοῦν καὶ ἐν δημηγορία ὁ στάσεις τε παύων καὶ ὁμόνοιαν ἐμποιῶν;

"Εμοιγε δοκεῖ.

Οὕτω δὲ τῶν λόγων ἐπαναγομένων καὶ τοῖς ἀντι15 λέγουσιν αὐτοῖς φανερὸν ἐγίγνετο τἀληθές, ὁπότε δὲ αὐτός τι τῷ λόγῳ διεξίοι, διὰ τῶν μάλιστα ὁμολογουμένων ἐπορεύετο, νομίζων ταύτην ἀσφάλειαν εἶναι λόγου, τοιγαροῦν πολὺ μάλιστα ὧν ἐγὼ οἶδα, ὅτε λέγοι, τοὺς ἀκούοντας ὁμολογοῦντας παρεῖχε, ἔφη δὲ καὶ Ὅμηρον τῷ Ὀδυσσεῖ ἀναθεῖναι τὸ ἀσφαλῆ ῥήτορα εἶναι, ὡς ἱκανὸν αὐτὸν ὅντα διὰ τῶν δοκούντων τοῖς ἀνθρώποις ἄγειν τοὺς λόγους.

7. Ότι μὲν οὖν ἁπλῶς τὴν ἑαυτοῦ γνώμην ἀπεφαίνετο Σωκράτης πρὸς τοὺς ὁμιλοῦντας αὐτῷ, δοκεῖ μοι δῆλον ἐκ τῶν εἰρημένων εἶναι ὅτι δὲ καὶ τοῦ<sup>8</sup> αὐτάρ-

 $<sup>8 \</sup>tau o \hat{v}$  B: omm. cett.

"Then why didn't we first consider what is the function of a good citizen?"

"Let's do that."

"In financial administration then, is not the better man he who makes the city wealthier?"

"Certainly."

"And in war he who makes her stronger than her rivals?"

"Of course."

"And on an embassy he who turns enemies into friends?"

"Presumably."

"And in debate he who puts down strife and produces harmony?"

"I think so."

By this process of leading back the argument even his adversary came to see the truth clearly. Whenever he himself argued out a question, he advanced by steps that gained general assent, holding this to be the only sure method. Accordingly, whenever he argued, he gained a greater measure of assent from his hearers than anyone I have known. He said that Homer gave Odysseus the credit of being a "no-risk speaker" because he had a way of leading the discussion from one acknowledged truth to another.

7. I think that I have said enough to show that Socrates stated his own opinion plainly to those who spent time with him: I will now show that he also took pains to make

<sup>13</sup> Od. 8.171.

κεις ἐν ταῖς προσηκούσαις πράξεσιν αὐτοὺς εἶναι ἐπεμελεῖτο, νῦν τοῦτο λέξω. πάντων μὲν γὰρ ὧν ἐγὼ οἶδα μάλιστα ἔμελεν αὐτῷ εἰδέναι, ὅτου τις ἐπιστήμων εἴη τῶν συνόντων αὐτῷ· ὧν δὲ προσήκει ἀνδρὶ καλῷ κἀγαθῷ εἰδέναι, ὅ τι μὲν αὐτὸς εἰδείη, πάντων προθυμότατα ἐδίδασκεν· ὅτου δὲ αὐτὸς ἀπειρότερος εἴη, πρὸς τοὺς ἐπισταμένους ἦγεν αὐτούς. ἐδίδασκε δὲ καὶ μέχρι ὅτου δέοι ἔμπειρον εἶναι ἑκάστου πράγματος τὸν ὀρθῶς πεπαιδευμένον.

Αὐτίκα γεωμετρίαν μέχρι μὲν τούτου ἔφη δεῖν μανθάνειν, ἔως ἵκανός τις γένοιτο, εἴ ποτε δεήσειε, γῆν μέτρῳ ὀρθῶς ἢ παραλαβεῖν ἢ παραδοῦναι ἢ διανεῖμαι ἢ ἔργον ἀποδείξασθαι. οὕτω δὲ τοῦτο ῥάδιον εἶναι μαθεῖν, ὥστε τὸν προσέχοντα τὸν νοῦν τἢ μετρήσει ἄμα τήν τε γῆν ὁπόση ἐστὶν εἰδέναι καὶ ὡς μετρεῖται ἐπιστάμενον ἀπιέναι. τὸ δὲ μέχρι τῶν δυσσυνέτων διαγραμμάτων γεωμετρίαν μανθάνειν ἀπεδοκίμαζεν. ὅ τι μὲν γὰρ ὡφελοίη ταῦτα, οὐκ ἔφη ὁρᾶν καίτοι οὐκ ἄπειρός γε αὐτῶν ἢν. ἔφη δὲ ταῦτα ἱκανὰ εἶναι ἀνθρώπου βίον κατατρίβειν καὶ ἄλλων πολλῶν τε καὶ ὡφελίμων μαθημάτων ἀποκωλύειν.

Ἐκέλευε δὲ καὶ ἀστρολογίας ἐμπείρους γίγνεσθαι, καὶ ταύτης μέντοι μέχρι τοῦ νυκτός τε ὥραν καὶ μηνὸς καὶ ἐνιαυτοῦ δύνασθαι γιγνώσκειν ἔνεκα τοῦ<sup>9</sup> πορείας τε καὶ πλοῦ καὶ φυλακῆς καὶ ὅσα ἄλλα ἢ νυκτὸς ἢ μηνὸς ἢ ἐνιαυτοῦ πράττεται, πρὸς ταῦτ΄ ἔχειν τεκμηρίοις χρῆσθαι τὰς ὥρας τῶν εἰρημένων διαγιγνώσκοντας, καὶ ταῦτα δὲ ῥάδια εἶναι μαθεῖν

## MEMORABILIA IV. 7.1-7.4

them independent in doing the work that they were fitted for. For I never knew anyone who was so careful to discover what each of his companions knew. Whatever it befits a gentleman to know he taught most spiritedly, so far as his own knowledge extended; if he was not entirely familiar with a subject, he took them to those who knew. He also taught them how far a well-educated person should make himself familiar with any given subject.

For instance, he said that the study of geometry should be pursued until the student was competent to measure a parcel of land accurately in case he wanted to take over, convey or divide it, or to compute the yield; and this knowledge was so easy to acquire that anyone who gave his mind to mensuration knew the size of the piece and carried away a knowledge of the principles of land measurement. He was against taking the study of geometry so far as to include the more complicated figures, on the ground that he could not see the use of them. Not that he was himself unfamiliar with them, but he said that they were enough to occupy a lifetime, to the complete exclusion of many other useful studies.

Similarly he recommended that they familiarize themselves with astronomy, but only so far as to be able to find the time of night, month and year, in order to use reliable evidence when planning a journey by land or sea, or setting the watch, and in all other affairs that are done in the night or month or year, by distinguishing the said times and seasons. This knowledge, again, was easily acquired

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> τοῦ B: omm. cett.

παρά τε νυκτοθηρών καὶ κυβερνητών καὶ ἄλλων πολλών, οἷς ἐπιμελὲς ταῦτα εἰδέναι. τὸ δὲ μέχρι τούτου ἀστρονομίαν μανθάνειν, μέχρι τοῦ καὶ τὰ μὴ ἐν τἢ αὐτἢ περιφορὰ ὅντα καὶ τοὺς πλάνητάς τε καὶ ἀσταθμήτους ἀστέρας γνώναι καὶ τὰς ἀποστάσεις αὐτῶν ἀπὸ τῆς γῆς καὶ τὰς περιόδους· καὶ τὰς αἰτίας αὐτῶν ζητοῦντας κατατρίβεσθαι, ἰσχυρῶς ἀπέτρεπεν. ἀφέλειαν μὲν γὰρ οὐδεμίαν οὐδ' ἐν τούτοις ἔφη ὁρὰν καίτοι οὐδὲ τούτων γε ἀνήκοος ἢν ἔφη δὲ καὶ ταῦτα ἱκανὰ εἶναι κατατρίβειν ἀνθρώπου βίον καὶ πολλῶν καὶ ἀφελίμων ἀποκωλύειν.

Όλως δὲ τῶν οὐρανίων, ἢ ἔκαστα ὁ θεὸς μηχανᾶται, φροντιστὴν γίγνεσθαι ἀπέτρεπεν οὕτε γὰρ εὑρετὰ ἀνθρώποις αὐτὰ ἐνόμιζεν εἶναι οὕτε χαρίζεσθαι θεοῖς ἂν ἡγεῖτο τὸν ζητοῦντα ἃ ἐκεῖνοι σαφηνίσαι οὐκ ἐβουλήθησαν. κινδυνεῦσαι δ' ἂν ἔφη καὶ παραφρονῆσαι τὸν ταῦτα μεριμνῶντα οὐδὲν ἦττον ἢ ᾿Αναξαγόρας παρεφρόνησεν ὁ μέγιστον φρονήσας ἐπὶ τῷ τὰς τῶν θεῶν μηχανὰς ἐξηγεῖσθαι.

Έκεινος γὰρ λέγων μὲν τὸ αὐτὸ εἶναι πῦρ τε καὶ ἤλιον ἠγνόει, ὅτι τὸ μὲν πῦρ οἱ ἄνθρωποι ῥαδίως καθορώσιν, εἰς δὲ τὸν ἤλιον οὐ δύνανται ἀντιβλέπειν καὶ ὑπὸ μὲν τοῦ ἡλίου καταλαμπόμενοι τὰ χρώματα μελάντερα ἔχουσιν, ὑπὸ δὲ τοῦ πυρὸς οὖ ἡγνόει δὲ καὶ ὅτι τῶν ἐκ τῆς γῆς φυομένων ἄνευ μὲν ἡλίου αὐγῆς οὐδὲν δύναται καλῶς αὕξεσθαι, ὑπὸ δὲ τοῦ πυρὸς θερμαινόμενα πάντα ἀπόλλυται φάσκων δὲ τὸν ἤλιον λίθον διάπυρον εἶναι καὶ τοῦτο ἡγνόει, ὅτι λίθος μὲν

5

6

## MEMORABILIA IV. 7.4-7.7

from night hunters and pilots and others who made it their business to know all that. But he strongly deprecated studying astronomy so far as to include the knowledge of bodies revolving in different courses, and of planets and comets, and wearing oneself out with the calculation of their distance from the earth, their periods of revolution and the causes of these. Of such researches again he said that he could not see what useful purpose they served. He had indeed attended lectures on these subjects too; but these again, he said, were enough to occupy a lifetime to the complete exclusion of many useful studies.

In general, with regard to the phenomena of the heavens, he deprecated curiosity to learn how the deity contrives them: he held that their secrets could not be discovered by man, and believed that any attempt to search out what the gods had not chosen to reveal must be displeasing to them. He said that anyone who meddles with these matters runs the risk of losing his sanity as completely as Anaxagoras, who took an insane pride in his explanation of the divine machinery.

For that sage, in declaring the sun to be fire, ignored the facts than men can look at fire without inconvenience but cannot gaze steadily at the sun; that their skin is blackened by the sun's rays but not by fire. Further, he ignored the fact that sunlight is essential to the health of all vegetation, whereas if anything is heated by fire it withers. Again, when he pronounced the sun to be a red-hot stone,

έν πυρὶ ὢν οὔτε λάμπει οὔτε πολὺν χρόνον ἀντέχει, ὁ δὲ ἥλιος τὸν πάντα χρόνον πάντων λαμπρότατος ὢν διαμένει.

Έκέλευε δὲ καὶ λογισμοὺς μανθάνειν καὶ τούτων δὲ ὁμοίως τοῖς ἄλλοις ἐκέλευε φυλάττεσθαι τὴν μάταιον πραγματείαν, μέχρι δὲ τοῦ ὡφελίμου πάντα καὶ αὐτὸς συνεσκόπει καὶ συνδιεξήει τοῖς συνοῦσι.

Προέτρεπε δὲ σφόδρα καὶ ὑγιείας ἐπιμελεῖσθαι τοὺς συνόντας παρά τε τῶν εἰδότων μανθάνοντας ὁπόσα ἐνδέχοιτο καὶ ἑαυτῷ ἔκαστον προσέχοντα διὰ παντὸς τοῦ βίου, τί βρῶμα ἢ τί πῶμα ἢ ποῖος πόνος συμφέροι αὐτῷ καὶ πῶς τούτοις χρώμενος ὑγιεινότατ ἂν διάγοι. τοῦ γὰρ οὕτω προσέχοντος ἑαυτῷ ἔργον ἔφη εἶναι εὑρεῖν ἰατρὸν τὰ πρὸς ὑγίειαν συμφέροντα αὐτῷ μᾶλλον διαγιγνώσκοντα.

Εἰ δέ τις μᾶλλον ἢ κατὰ τὴν ἀνθρωπίνην σοφίαν ἀφελεῖσθαι βούλοιτο, συνεβούλευε μαντικῆς ἐπιμελεῖσθαι. τὸν γὰρ εἰδότα, δι' ὧν οἱ θεοὶ τοῖς ἀνθρώποις περὶ τῶν πραγμάτων σημαίνουσιν, οὐδέποτ' ἔρημον ἔφη γίγνεσθαι συμβουλῆς θεῶν.

8. Εἰ δέ τις, ὅτι φάσκοντος αὐτοῦ τὸ δαιμόνιον ἐαυτῷ προσημαίνειν ἄ τε δέοι καὶ ἃ μὴ δέοι ποιεῖν ὑπὸ τῶν δικαστῶν κατεγνώσθη θάνατος, οἴεται αὐτὸν ἐλέγχεσθαι περὶ τοῦ δαιμονίου ψευδόμενον, ἐννοησάτω πρῶτον μέν, ὅτι οὕτως ἤδη τότε πόρρω τῆς ἡλικίας ἦν, ὥστ' εἰ καὶ μὴ τότε, οὐκ ἂν πολλῷ ὕστερον τελευτῆσαι τὸν βίον εἶτα ὅτι τὸ μὲν ἀχθεινότατον τοῦ βίου καὶ ἐν ῷ πάντες τὴν διάνοιαν μειοῦνται ἀπέλι-

8

9

#### MEMORABILIA IV. 7.7-8.1

he ignored the fact that a stone in fire neither glows nor can resist it for long, whereas the sun shines with unequaled brilliance forever.

He also recommended the study of arithmetic. But in this case as in the others he recommended avoidance of pointless application; and invariably, whether theories or ascertained facts formed the subject of his conversation, he limited it to what was useful.

He also strongly urged his companions to take care of their health. "You should find out all you can," he said, "from those who know. Everyone should watch himself throughout his life and notice what sort of meat and drink and what form of exercise suit his constitution, and how he should regulate them in order to enjoy good health. For by such attention to yourselves you can discover better than any doctor what suits your constitution."

When anyone was in need of help that human wisdom was unable to give, he advised him to resort to divination; for he who knew the means by which the gods give guidance to humanity concerning their affairs never lacked divine counsel.

8. As for his claim that he was forewarned by his divine sign what he ought to do and what not to do, some may think that it must have been a delusion because he was condemned to death. But they should remember two facts. First, he had already reached such an age that had he not died then, death must have come to him soon after. Second, he escaped the most irksome stage of life and the

369

πεν, άντὶ δὲ τούτου τῆς ψυχῆς τὴν ρώμην ἐπιδειξάμενος εὔκλειαν προσεκτήσατο τήν τε δίκην πάντων άνθρώπων άληθέστατα καὶ έλευθεριώτατα καὶ δικαιότατα εἰπὼν καὶ τὴν κατάγνωσιν τοῦ θανάτου πραότατα καὶ ἀνδρωδέστατα ἐνεγκών, ὁμολογεῖται γὰρ οὐδένα πω τῶν μνημονευομένων ἀνθρώπων κάλλιον θάνατον ένεγκεῖν. ἀνάγκη μὲν γὰρ ἐγένετο αὐτῶ μετὰ τὴν κρίσιν τριάκοντα ἡμέρας βιῶναι διὰ τὸ Δήλια μὲν ἐκείνου τοῦ μηνὸς εἶναι, τὸν δὲ νόμον μηδένα έᾶν δημοσία ἀποθνήσκειν, ἔως ἂν ἡ θεωρία ἐκ Δήλου ἐπανέλθη, καὶ τὸν χρόνον τοῦτον ἄπασι τοῖς συνήθεσι φανερός έγενετο οὐδεν άλλοιότερον διαβιούς ἢ τὸν ἔμπροσθεν χρόνον καίτοι τὸν ἔμπροσθέν γε πάντων άνθρώπων μάλιστα έθαυμάζετο έπὶ τῷ 3 εὐθύμως τε καὶ εὐκόλως ζῆν. καὶ πῶς ἄν τις κάλλιον η ούτως ἀποθάνοι; η ποίος αν είη θάνατος καλλίων η ον κάλλιστά τις ἀποθάνοι; ποῖος δ' ἂν γένοιτο θάνατος εὐδαιμονέστερος τοῦ καλλίστου; ἢ ποῖος θεοφιλέστερος τοῦ εὐδαιμονεστάτου;

Λέξω δὲ καὶ ἃ Ἑρμογένους τοῦ Ἱππονίκου ἤκουσα περὶ αὐτοῦ. ἔφη γάρ, ἤδη Μελήτου γεγραμμένου αὐτὸν τὴν γραφήν, αὐτὸς ἀκούων αὐτοῦ πάντα μᾶλλον ἢ περὶ τῆς δίκης διαλεγομένου λέγειν αὐτῷ, ὡς χρὴ σκοπεῖν, ὅ τι ἀπολογήσεται. τὸν δὲ τὸ μὲν πρῶτον εἰπεῖν. Οὐ γὰρ δοκῶ σοι τοῦτο μελετῶν διαβεβιωκέναι; ἐπεὶ δὲ αὐτὸν ἤρετο, ὅπως, εἰπεῖν αὐτόν, ὅτι οὐδὲν ἄλλο ποιῶν διαγεγένηται ἢ διασκοπῶν μὲν τά τε δίκαια καὶ τὰ ἄδικα, πράττων δὲ τὰ δίκαια καὶ

### MEMORABILIA IV. 8.1-8.4

inevitable diminution of mental powers, and instead won glory by the moral strength revealed in the wonderful honesty and frankness and probity of his defense, and in the equanimity and manliness with which he bore the sentence of death. In fact it is admitted that there is no record of death more nobly borne. For he was forced to live for thirty days after the verdict was given, because it was the month of the Delia festival<sup>14</sup> and the law did not allow any public execution to take place until the sacred embassy had returned from Delos. During this interval, as all his intimate acquaintances could see, he continued to live exactly as before; and in fact before that time he had been admired for his incomparable cheerfulness and serenity. How then could anyone die more nobly? Or what death could be nobler than the death most nobly faced? What death more blessed than the noblest? Or what dearer to the gods than the most blessed?

I will repeat what Hermogenes, son of Hipponicus, told me about him. "When Meletus had actually formulated his indictment," he said, "Socrates talked freely in my presence but made no reference to the case. I told him that he ought to be thinking about his defense. His first remark was, 'Don't you think that I have been preparing for it all my life?' And when I asked him how, he said that he had been constantly occupied in the consideration of right and wrong and in doing what was right and avoiding

2

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>14</sup> Thargelion (May); see Pl. Phaedo 58b.

τῶν ἀδίκων ἀπεχόμενος, ἥνπερ νομίζοι καλλίστην μελέτην ἀπολογίας εἶναι. αὐτὸς δὲ πάλιν εἰπεῖν. Οὐχ όρᾶς, ὧ Σώκρατες, ὅτι οἱ ᾿Αθήνησι δικασταὶ πολλοὺς μεν ήδη μηδεν άδικοῦντας λόγω παραχθέντες άπέκτειναν, πολλούς δὲ ἀδικοῦντας ἀπέλυσαν; Άλλὰ νὴ τὸν Δία, φάναι αὐτόν, ὧ Ἑρμόγενες, ἤδη μου ἐπιχειρούντος φροντίσαι της πρός τους δικαστάς άπολογίας ήναντιώθη τὸ δαιμόνιον, καὶ αὐτὸς εἰπεῖν. Θαυμαστὰ λέγεις, τὸν δέ, Θαυμάζεις, φάναι, εἰ τῶ θεῶ δοκεί βέλτιον είναι έμε τελευτάν τον βίον ήδη; οὐκ οἶσθ', ὅτι μέχρι μὲν τοῦδε τοῦ χρόνου ἐγὼ οὐδενὶ ἀνθρώπων ὑφείμην ἂν οὔτε βέλτιον οὔθ' ἤδιον ἐμοῦ βεβιωκέναι; ἄριστα μὲν γὰρ οἶμαι ζῆν τοὺς ἄριστα έπιμελομένους τοῦ ώς βελτίστους γίγνεσθαι, ήδιστα δὲ τοὺς μάλιστα αἰσθανομένους, ὅτι βελτίους γίγνονται. ἃ έγὼ μέχρι τοῦδε τοῦ χρόνου ἦσθανόμην έμαυτῷ συμβαίνοντα καὶ τοῖς ἄλλοις ἀνθρώποις ἐντυγχάνων καὶ πρὸς τοὺς ἄλλους ἀνθρώπους 10 παραθεωρῶν έμαυτὸν οὕτω διατετέλεκα περὶ ἐμαυτοῦ γιγνώσκων καὶ οὐ μόνον ἐγώ, ἀλλὰ καὶ οἱ ἐμοὶ φίλοι οὕτως ἔχοντες περὶ ἐμοῦ διατελοῦσιν, οὐ διὰ τὸ φιλεῖν ἐμέ, καὶ γὰρ οί τους άλλους φιλούντες ούτως αν είχον πρός τους έαυτῶν φίλους, άλλὰ διόπερ καὶ αὐτοὶ ἂν οἴονται έμοὶ συνόντες βέλτιστοι γίγνεσθαι. εί δε βιώσομαι πλείω χρόνον, ἴσως ἀναγκαῖον ἔσται τὰ τοῦ γήρως ἐπιτελεῖσθαι καὶ ὁρᾶν τε καὶ ἀκούειν ἦττον καὶ διανοεῖσθαι χείρον καὶ δυσμαθέστερον ἀποβαίνειν καὶ ἐπιλησμονέστερον καὶ ὧν πρότερον βελτίων ἦν, τούτων χείρω

# MEMORABILIA IV. 8.4-8.8

what was wrong, which he regarded as the best preparation for a defense. Then I said, 'Don't you see, Socrates, that the juries in our courts are apt to be misled by argument, so that they often put the innocent to death and acquit the guilty?" 'Ah, yes, Hermogenes,' he answered, 'but when I did try to think out my defense to the jury, the deity at once resisted.' 'Strange words,' I said; and he replied, 'Do you think it strange if it seems better to the god that I should die now? Don't you see that to this day I never would acknowledge that anyone had lived a better or more enjoyable life than I? For they live best, I think, who strive best to become as good as possible: and the most enjoyable life is theirs who are conscious that they are growing in goodness. And to this day that has been my experience; and encountering other people and closely comparing myself with other people, I have persisted in this opinion of myself. And not only I but my friends persist in feeling that way about me, not because of their love for me (for why doesn't love make others feel that way about their friends?) but because they think that they too would rise highest in goodness by keeping my company. But if I am to live on, perhaps I may be forced to pay the old man's penalty—to become dim sighted, hard of hearing and dull witted, slower to learn, quicker to forget, outstripped now by those who were behind me. Even if I

 $<sup>^{10}</sup>$  ἀνθρώπους B: omm. cett.

γίγνεσθαι. ἀλλὰ μὴν ταῦτά γε μὴ αἰσθανομένῳ μὲν ἀβίωτος ἂν εἴη ὁ βίος, αἰσθανόμενον δὲ πῶς οὐκ ἀνάγκη χεῖρόν τε καὶ ἀηδέστερον ζῆν;

ἀλλὰ μὴν εἴ γε ἀδίκως ἀποθανοῦμαι, τοῖς μὲν ἀδίκως ἐμὲ ἀποκτείνασιν αἰσχρὸν ἂν εἴη τοῦτο· εἰ γὰρ τὸ ἀδικεῖν αἰσχρόν ἐστι, πῶς οὐκ αἰσχρὸν καὶ τὸ ἀδίκως ὁτιοῦν ποιεῖν; ἐμοὶ δὲ τί αἰσχρὸν τὸ ἑτέρους μὴ δύνασθαι περὶ ἐμοῦ τὰ δίκαια μήτε γνῶναι μήτε ποιῆσαι; ὁρῶ δ' ἔγωγε καὶ τὴν δόξαν τῶν προγεγονότων ἀνθρώπων ἐν τοῖς ἐπιγιγνομένοις οὐχ ὁμοίαν καταλειπομένην τῶν τε ἀδικησάντων καὶ τῶν ἀδικηθέντων. οἶδα δέ, ὅτι καὶ ἐγὼ ἐπιμελείας τεύξομαι ὑπ' ἀνθρώπων, καὶ ἐὰν νῦν ἀποθάνω, οὐχ ὁμοίως τοῖς ἐμὲ ἀποκτείνασιν· οἶδα γὰρ ἀεὶ μαρτυρήσεσθαί μοι, ὅτι ἐγὼ ἠδίκησα μὲν οὐδένα πώποτε ἀνθρώπων οὐδὲ χείρω ἐποίησα, βελτίους δὲ ποιεῖν ἐπειρώμην ἀεὶ τοὺς ἐμοὶ συνόντας.

Τοιαῦτα μὲν πρὸς Ἑρμογένην τε διελέχθη καὶ πρὸς τοὺς ἄλλους. τῶν δὲ Σωκράτην γιγνωσκόντων οἶος ἦν οἱ ἀρετῆς ἐφιέμενοι πάντες ἔτι καὶ νῦν διατελοῦσι πάντων μάλιστα ποθοῦντες ἐκεῖνον, ὡς ὡφελιμώτατον ὄντα πρὸς ἀρετῆς ἐπιμέλειαν. ἐμοὶ μὲν δὴ τοιοῦτος ὤν, οἷον ἐγὼ διήγημαι, εὐσεβὴς μὲν οὕτως, ὥστε μηδὲν ἄνευ τῆς τῶν θεῶν γνώμης ποιεῖν, δίκαιος δέ, ὥστε βλάπτειν μὲν μηδὲ μικρὸν μηδένα, ὡφελεῖν δὲ τὰ μέγιστα τοὺς χρωμένους αὐτῷ, ἐγκρατὴς δέ, ὥστε μηδέποτε προσαιρεῖσθαι τὸ ἥδιον ἀντὶ τοῦ βελτίονος, φρόνιμος δέ, ὥστε μὴ διαμαρτάνειν κρίνων τὰ βελτίω

9

10

## MEMORABILIA IV. 8.8-8.11

were unconscious of the change, life would be a burden to me; and if I knew, misery and bitterness would surely be my lot.'

"'But now, if I am to die unjustly, those who unjustly kill me will bear the shame of it. For if to do injustice is shameful, whatever is unjustly done must surely bring shame. But to me, what shame is it that others fail to decide and act justly concerning me? I see that posterity judges differently of the dead according as they did or suffered injustice. I know that men will remember me too, and if I die now, not as they will remember those who took my life. For I know that they will ever testify of me that I wronged no one at any time nor corrupted anyone, but strove ever to make my companions better."

This was the tenor of his conversation with Hermogenes and with the others. All who knew what manner of man Socrates was and who seek after excellence continue to this day to miss him beyond all others, as the chief of helpers in the quest for excellence. For myself, I have described him as he was: so pious that he did nothing without counsel from the gods; so just that he did no injury, however small, to anyone but rather conferred the greatest benefits on all who dealt with him; so self-controlled that he never chose the more agreeable over the better course; so wise that he was unerring in his judgment of the better

375

9

10

καὶ τὰ χείρω μηδὲ ἄλλου προσδεῖσθαι, ἀλλ' αὐτάρκης εἶναι πρὸς τὴν τούτων γνῶσιν, ἱκανὸς δὲ καὶ λόγῳ εἰπεῖν τε καὶ διορίσασθαι τὰ τοιαῦτα, ἱκανὸς δὲ καὶ ἄλλους δοκιμάσαι τε καὶ ἁμαρτάνοντας ἐλέγξαι καὶ προτρέψασθαι ἐπ' ἀρετὴν καὶ καλοκἀγαθίαν, ἐδόκει τοιοῦτος εἶναι, οἷος ἃν εἴη ἄριστός τε ἀνὴρ καὶ εὐδαιμονέστατος. εἰ δέ τῳ μὴ ἀρέσκει ταῦτα, παραβάλλων τὸ ἄλλων ἦθος πρὸς ταῦτα οὕτω κρινέτω.

#### MEMORABILIA IV. 8.11

and the worse and needed no counselor, but relied on himself for his knowledge of them; masterly in expounding and defining such matters; no less masterly in putting others to the test, convincing them of error, and exhorting them to follow virtue and gentlemanliness. To me then he seemed to be all that a truly good and happy man must be. But if there is any doubter, let him set the character of others beside all this, and then let him judge.

# **OECONOMICUS**

## INTRODUCTION

Oeconomicus, a mainly didactic work about the economic, practical, and moral importance of farming and estate management, was evidently written after ca. 385, when Xenophon began to build and manage his own estate at Scillous. It reports a conversation between Socrates and the wealthy young Critobulus that falls into two parts. In the first (1-6) Socrates praises farming as enjoyable, profitable, and physically beneficial, and as a good preparation for war, for just and generous living, and for the occupations. As a worthy model he cites the Persian Cyrus (the Great and the Younger are subtly conflated). In the second part (7-21) Socrates reports his own conversation with the model Greek gentleman Ischomachus, a wealthy landowner who recounts several instructional conversations he had with his new wife upon her arrival in the household, connects the physical and moral fitness acquired on an estate with success, and instructs Socrates on the fine points of farmwork and its proper management.

Given the poverty of Socrates' own urban household and the nature of his marriage to Xanthippe (cf. Pl. *Smp.* 2.10), it is easy to understand why he can hardly be cast as the expert Critobulus needs on the subjects of farming and estate management. It is Ischomachus, not Socrates, who is clearly the expert and teacher in the practical part of the

dialogue, just as in the first part it is Socrates who searches for definitions and discusses ethical issues, and who had originally sought out Ischomachus, not as an agricultural expert, but as an exemplary gentleman. It may nevertheless be surprising, at least to readers of Plato, that Socrates would be interested in such subjects at all, much less at the level of technical detail explored in Oeconomicus. After all, Socrates was a lifelong townsman who declares that he had never been interested in moneymaking, estate management, and generalship (Ap. 36b). Still, he must have taken at least some interest in these subjects, if for no other reason than to have something to talk about with gentlemen like Xenophon. Even in Plato, Socrates notices practical and household business as he does the crafts, though they are never the principal focus of a dialogue, and the workings of the oikos, the central institution of the polis after all, are central to Republic, whose recommendations about management, and especially the fitness of women to participate, overlap to a degree with those of Oeconomicus. It would be interesting to know more about the Oeconomicus by Antisthenes and the dialogue Aspasia by Aeschines of Sphettos, which included a conversation between Xenophon and his wife with Aspasia (Cic. Inv. 1.51–52), also invoked as an expert by our Socrates (3.14).

Xenophon elsewhere displays a keen interest in economics (e.g., in *Anabasis*, *Cyropaedeia*, and *Poroi*) and clearly had considerable practical experience. Much of what he says recalls such traditional texts as Hesiod's *Works and Days*, including the virtues of hard work, expertise, good planning, honest dealing, and the value of a wife who is not an economic liability, but industrious and honest and thus helps increase the profitability of the

#### OECONOMICUS

oikos. As in Semonides (7.83-93), the good wife is like a queen bee in the beehive (7.32 ff.). But Xenophon's ideas are more advanced and enlightened than this sort of traditional wisdom, especially as regards the role of wives and slaves in estate management. For Xenophon, marriage is not simply for reproduction and labor; it is a complementary partnership in the management both of property (including slaves) and of their children's education. Women are teachable and should be taught, so that a wife, by proving her competence and trustworthiness, can acquire what Socrates calls "masculine intelligence" (10.1) and earn independence and authority, even over her husband, something not allowed, for example, by Aristotle (e.g., Pol. 1252-54, 1260), but Plato in Republic includes wives in the overall project of making everyone more competent through education and therefore more productive in society. In Smp. 2.9-12 Socrates remarks, watching a girl acrobat leap through sword points, that women are obviously capable of learning even bravery.<sup>1</sup>

Was Ischomachus, who at least to some extent must serve as a stand-in for Xenophon himself, fictitious or an actual person? If fictitious, then Xenophon might have chosen a less notorious name, for the Ischomachus who would spring first to the minds of contemporary readers was the man whose wife Chrysilla lived with the wastrel Callias in a ménage à trois involving her own daughter, was subsequently involved in a paternity suit, and died ca. 404

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Ischomachus' memorable, and of course (for propriety's sake) unnamed, wife is not the only captivating woman in Xenophon; cf. also Theodote in *Memorabilia*, Syennesis in *Anabasis*, Panthea in *Cyropaedeia*.

with his great estate astonishingly diminished.<sup>2</sup> But it is hard to see why Xenophon, who could not have been unaware of such a long-running scandal in his own social circle, would choose such a person to represent the exemplary gentleman, husband, and estate manager. Irony would be impossible to square with the general tenor and content of the dialogue. The easiest explanation is that Ischomachus is among the people whom Xenophon, like Plato, portrayed at happy (Socratic) times of their lives before their fortunes changed for the worse.

The dramatic date is a time when Critobulus is married (after 422) and Athens is at peace (between 421 and 413). Although the Stoa of Zeus Eleutherios in the agora (built in last third of the fifth century) was a popular meeting spot, and both Plato (*Theages*) and Aeschines Socraticus (*Miltiades*) had also set Socratic dialogues there, Xenophon may have chosen it as the site of Socrates' conversation with Ischomachus because it contained a painting commemorating the heroic death of his son Gryllus in 362.

## **TEXT**

Of the twenty-three manuscripts studied so far (most recently by Gil), none (including H, according to Gil) is earlier than the thirteenth century or has special authority, and although they can be sorted into two families, contamination is so pervasive that stemmatic considerations do not help in establishing the text. All the manuscripts derive from a single uncial archetype, itself of no great

 $<sup>^2\,\</sup>mathrm{For}$  the details, see Andocides 1.124–27, Lysias 19.46; in general, Pomeroy 259–64.

#### **OECONOMICUS**

quality, later than Stobaeus, and with a text different than the one reflected in the two papyrus fragments.

## **EDITIONS**

Chantraine, P. Xénophon: Économique. Paris, 1949.

Gil, J. Jenofante, Económico. Madrid, 1967.

Marchant, E. C. Xenophontis Opera<sup>2</sup>. Oxford, 1921.

Natali, C. Senofonte: L'amministrazione della casa (Economico). Venice, 2008 [1988].

Pomeroy, S. B. Xenophon Oeconomicus: A Social and Historical Commentary. Oxford, 1994.

Roscalla, F. Senofonte: Economico. Milan, 1991.

## GENERAL

Kronenberg, L. Allegories of Farming from Greece and Rome: Philosophical Satire in Xenophon, Varro, and Virgil. Cambridge, 2009.

Strauss, L. Xenophon's Socratic Discourse: Interpretation of the "Oeconomicus." Ithaca, 1970.

Waterfield, R. "Xenophon's Socratic Mission," in Tuplin, Xenophon and His World, 79–114.

1. Ἡκουσα δέ ποτε αὐτοῦ καὶ περὶ οἰκονομίας τοιάδε διαλεγομένου.

Εἰπέ μοι, ἔφη, ὧ Κριτόβουλε, ἆρά γε ἡ οἰκονομία ἐπιστήμης τινὸς ὄνομά ἐστιν, ὥσπερ ἡ ἰατρικὴ καὶ καλκευτικὴ καὶ τεκτονική;

"Εμοιγε δοκεῖ, ἔφη ὁ Κριτόβουλος.

<sup>3</sup>Η καὶ ὤσπερ τούτων τῶν τεχνῶν ἔχοιμεν ἂν εἰπεῖν ὅ τι ἔργον ἑκάστης, οὕτω καὶ τῆς οἰκονομίας δυναίμεθ΄ ἂν εἰπεῖν ὅ τι ἔργον αὐτῆς ἐστι;

Δοκεί γοῦν, ἔφη ὁ Κριτόβουλος, οἰκονόμου ἀγαθοῦ εἶναι εὖ οἰκείν τὸν ἑαυτοῦ οἶκον.

<sup>3</sup>Η καὶ τὸν ἄλλου δὲ οἶκον, ἔφη ὁ Σωκράτης, εἰ ἐπιτρέποι τις αὐτῷ, οὐκ ἂν δύναιτο, εἰ βούλοιτο, εὖ οἰκεῖν, ὥσπερ καὶ τὸν ἑαυτοῦ; ὁ μὲν γὰρ τεκτονικὴν ἐπιστάμενος ὁμοίως ἂν καὶ ἄλλῳ δύναιτο ἐργάζεσθαι ὅτιπερ καὶ ἑαυτῷ, καὶ ὁ οἰκονομικός γ' ἂν ὡσαύτως.

"Εμοιγε δοκεῖ, ὧ Σώκρατες.

2

1. I once heard him also discuss the subject of estate management as follows.

"Tell me, Critobulus, is estate management the name of a branch of knowledge, like medicine, smithing, and carpentry?"

"I think so," replied Critobulus.

"And can we say what the function of estate management is, just as we can say what is the function of each of these occupations?"

"Well,  $\hat{\mathbf{I}}$  suppose that the business of a good estate manager is to manage his own estate well."

"Yes, and in case he were put in charge of another man's estate, could he not, if he chose, manage it as well as he manages his own? Anyone who understands carpentry can do for another exactly the same work as he does for himself; and so, I presume, can a good estate manager."

"I think so, Socrates."

"Is it possible, then, for one who understands this art, even if he has no property of his own, to earn money by managing another man's estate, just as he might do by building him a house?"

2

Νη Δία καὶ πολύν γε μισθόν, ἔφη ὁ Κριτόβουλος, φέροιτ' ἄν, εἰ δύναιτο οἶκον παραλαβὼν τελεῖν τε ὅσα δεῖ καὶ περιουσίαν ποιῶν αὔξειν τὸν οἶκον.

Οἶκος δὲ δὴ τί δοκεῖ ἡμῖν εἶναι; ἆρα ὅπερ οἰκία ἢ καὶ ὅσα τις ἔξω τῆς οἰκίας κέκτηται, πάντα τοῦ οἴκου ταῦτά ἐστιν:

Έμοὶ γοῦν, ἔφη ὁ Κριτόβουλος, δοκεῖ καὶ εἰ μηδ' ἐν τἢ αὐτἢ πόλει εἴη τῷ κεκτημένῳ, πάντα τοῦ οἴκου εἶναι, ὄσα τις κέκτηται.

Οὔκουν καὶ ἐχθροὺς κέκτηνταί τινες;

Νὴ Δία καὶ πολλούς γε ἔνιοι.

<sup>3</sup>Η καὶ κτήματα αὐτῶν φήσομεν εἶναι τοὺς ἐχθρούς; Γελοῖον μεντἂν εἴη, ἔφη ὁ Κριτόβουλος, εἰ ὁ τοὺς ἐχθροὺς αὔξων προσέτι καὶ μισθὸν τούτου φέροι.

Ότι τοι ἡμῖν ἐδόκει οἶκος ἀνδρὸς εἶναι ὅπερ κτῆσις. Νὴ Δί', ἔφη ὁ Κριτόβουλος, ὅ τι γέ τις ἀγαθὸν κέκτηται· οὐ μὰ Δί' οὐκ εἴ τι κακόν, τοῦτο κτῆμα ἐγὼ καλῶ

Σὺ δ' ἔοικας τὰ ἑκάστῳ ἀφέλιμα κτήματα καλεῖν. Πάνυ μὲν οὖν, ἔφη· τὰ δέ γε βλάπτοντα ζημίαν ἔγωγε νομίζω μᾶλλον ἢ χρήματα.

Κἂν ἄρα γέ τις ἵππον πριάμενος μὴ ἐπίστηται αὐτῷ χρῆσθαι, ἀλλὰ καταπίπτων ἀπ' αὐτοῦ κακὰ λαμβάνη, οὐ χρήματα αὐτῷ ἐστιν ὁ ἵππος;

Οὔκ, εἴπερ τὰ χρήματά γ' ἐστὶν ἀγαθόν.

Οὐδ' ἄρα γε ἡ γῆ ἀνθρώπῳ ἐστὶ χρήματα, ὅστις οὕτως ἐργάζεται αὐτήν, ὥστε ζημιοῦσθαι ἐργαζόμε-νος;

5

6

7

### OECONOMICUS 1.4-1.8

"Yes, of course; and he would get a good salary if, after taking over an estate, he continued to pay all the bills, and to increase the estate by showing a balance."

"But what do we mean now by an estate? Is it the same thing as a house, or is all property that one possesses outside the house also part of the estate?"

"Well, I think that even if the property is situated in different cities, everything a man possesses is part of his estate."

"Do not some men possess enemies?"

"Of course; some in fact possess many."

"Shall we include their enemies in their possessions?"

"It would be ridiculous, surely, if one actually received a salary for increasing the number of a man's enemies!"

"Because, you know, we supposed a man's estate to be the same as his property."

"That's true—meaning at least anything good that he possesses; of course I don't call anything bad that he may possess property."

"You seem to use the word property of whatever is profitable to its owner."

"Certainly; but what is harmful I regard as loss rather than wealth."

"And so if a man buys a horse and doesn't know how to manage it, and so keeps on getting thrown and injuring himself by trying to ride it, the horse is not wealth to him, I presume?"

"Not if we assume that wealth is a good thing."

"It follows that land is not wealth either to a man who works it in such a way that his work results in loss."

5

Οὐδὲ ἡ γῆ μέντοι χρήματά ἐστιν, εἴπερ ἀντὶ τοῦ τρέφειν πεινῆν παρασκευάζει.

Οὐκοῦν καὶ τὰ πρόβατα ὡσαύτως, εἴ τις διὰ τὸ μὴ ἐπίστασθαι προβάτοις χρῆσθαι ζημιοῖτο, οὐδὲ τὰ πρόβατα χρήματα τούτῳ εἴη ἄν;

Οὔκουν ἔμοιγε δοκεῖ.

Σὰ ἄρα, ὡς ἔοικε, τὰ μὲν ὡφελοῦντα χρήματα ἡγῆ, τὰ δὲ βλάπτοντα οὐ χρήματα.

Οΰτως.

9

10

11

12

Ταὐτὰ ἄρα ὄντα τῷ μὲν ἐπισταμένῳ χρῆσθαι αὐτῶν ἑκάστοις χρήματά ἐστι, τῷ δὲ μὴ ἐπισταμένῳ οὐ χρήματα· ὥσπερ γε αὐλοὶ τῷ μὲν ἐπισταμένῳ ἀξίως λόγου αὐλεῖν χρήματά εἰσι, τῷ δὲ μὴ ἐπισταμένῳ οὐδὲν μᾶλλον ἢ ἄχρηστοι λίθοι.

Εἰ μὴ ἀποδίδοιτό γε αὐτούς.

Τοῦτ' αὖ φαίνεται ἡμῖν, ἀποδιδομένοις μὲν οἱ αὐλοὶ χρήματα, μὴ ἀποδιδομένοις δέ, ἀλλὰ κεκτημένοις οὔ, τοῖς μὴ ἐπισταμένοις αὐτοῖς χρῆσθαι.

Καὶ ὁμολογουμένως γε, ὧ Σώκρατες, ὁ λόγος ἡμῖν χωρεῖ, ἐπείπερ εἴρηται τὰ ὡφελοῦντα χρήματα εἶναι. μὴ πωλούμενοι μὲν γὰρ οὐ χρήματά εἰσιν οἱ αὐλοί· οὐδὲν γὰρ χρήσιμοί εἰσι· πωλούμενοι δὲ χρήματα.

Πρὸς ταῦτα δ' ὁ Σωκράτης εἶπεν· Ἄν ἐπίστηταί γε πωλεῖν. εἰ δὲ πωλοίη αὖ πρὸς τοῦτο, ὧ μὴ ἐπίσταιτο χρῆσθαι, οὐδὲ πωλούμενοί εἰσι χρήματα κατά γε τὸν σὸν λόγον.

Λέγειν ἔοικας, ὧ Σώκρατες, ὅτι οὐδὲ τὸ ἀργύριόν ἐστι χρήματα, εἰ μή τις ἐπίσταιτο χρῆσθαι αὐτῷ.

#### OECONOMICUS 1.8-1.12

"To be sure: not even land is wealth if it makes us starve instead of supporting us."

"And won't the same hold true of sheep? If a man loses through ignorance of sheep farming, his sheep too will not be wealth to him?"

"Not in my opinion."

"It seems, then, that in your view what is profitable is wealth, what is harmful is not wealth."

"Quite so."

"That is to say, the same things are wealth and not wealth according as one understands or does not understand how to use them. A flute, for example, is wealth to one who is competent to play it, but to an incompetent person it is no better than useless stones."

"True—unless he sells it."

"We now see that to persons who don't understand its use, a flute is wealth if they sell it, but not wealth if they keep it instead of selling."

"Yes, Socrates, and our argument runs consistently, since we have said that what is profitable is wealth. For a flute, if not put up for sale, is not wealth, because it is useless: if put up for sale it becomes wealth."

"Yes," commented Socrates, "provided he knows how to sell; but again, in case he sells it for something he doesn't know how to use, even then the sale doesn't convert it into wealth, according to you."

"You imply, Socrates, that even money isn't wealth to one who doesn't know how to use it."

9

10

11

13 Καὶ σὰ δέ μοι δοκεῖς οὕτω συνομολογεῖν, ἀφ' ὧν τις ὡφελεῖσθαι δύναται χρήματα εἶναι. εἰ γοῦν τις χρῷτο τῷ ἀργυρίῳ, ὥστε πριάμενος οἷον ἑταίραν διὰ ταύτην κάκιον μὲν τὸ σῶμα ἔχοι, κάκιον δὲ τὴν ψυχήν, κάκιον δὲ τὸν οἶκον, πῶς ἂν ἔτι τὸ ἀργύριον αὐτῶ ὡφέλιμον εἴη;

Οὐδαμῶς, εἰ μή πέρ γε καὶ τὸν ὑοσκύαμον καλούμενον χρήματα εἶναι φήσομεν, ὑφ' οὖ οἱ φαγόντες αὐτὸν παραπλῆγες γίγνονται.

14 Τὸ μὲν δὴ ἀργύριον, εἰ μή τις ἐπίσταιτο αὐτῷ χρῆσθαι, οὕτω πόρρω ἀπωθείσθω, ὧ Κριτόβουλε, ὥστε μηδὲ χρήματα εἶναι. οἱ δὲ φίλοι, ἤν τις ἐπίστηται αὐτοῖς χρῆσθαι ὥστε ὡφελεῖσθαι ἀπ' αὐτῶν, τί φήσομεν αὐτοὺς εἶναι;

Χρήματα νη Δί', ἔφη ὁ Κριτόβουλος, καὶ πολύ γε μαλλον η τοὺς βοῦς, ην ώφελιμώτεροί γε ὧσι τῶν βοῶν.

15 Καὶ οἱ ἐχθροί γε ἄρα κατά γε τὸν σὸν λόγον χρήματά εἰσι τῷ δυναμένῳ ἀπὸ τῶν ἐχθρῶν ὡφελεῖσθαι.

Έμοὶ γοῦν δοκεῖ.

Οἰκονόμου ἄρα ἐστὶν ἀγαθοῦ καὶ τοῖς ἐχθροῖς ἐπίστασθαι χρῆσθαι ὥστε ὡφελεῖσθαι ἀπὸ τῶν ἐχθρῶν.

Ίσχυρότατά γε.

Καὶ γὰρ δὴ ὁρậς, ἔφη, ὧ Κριτόβουλε, ὅσοι μὲν δὴ οἶκοι ἰδιωτῶν ηὐξημένοι εἰσὶν ἀπὸ πολέμου, ὅσοι δὲ τυράννων.

16 'Αλλὰ γὰρ τὰ μὲν καλῶς ἔμοιγε δοκεῖ λέγεσ $\theta$ αι, ὦ

#### OECONOMICUS 1.13-1.16

"And you, I think, agree with me to this extent, that what a man can derive profit from is wealth. At any rate, if a man uses his money to buy, say, a mistress who makes him worse off in body and soul and estate, how can his money be profitable to him then?"

"By no means, unless we are ready to maintain that the weed called nightshade, which drives you mad if you eat it, is wealth."

"Then money is to be kept so far away, Critobulus, if one doesn't know how to use it, that it does not even count as wealth. But how about friends? If one knows how to make use of them so as to profit by them, what are they to be called?"

"Wealth, of course, and much more so than cattle, if it's true that they are more profitable than cattle."

"Yes, and it follows from what you say that enemies too are wealth to anyone who can derive profit from them."

"Well, that is my opinion."

"Consequently it is the business of a good estate manager to know how to deal with enemies so as to derive profit from them too."

"Most decidedly."

"In fact, Critobulus, you cannot fail to notice that many private persons have been indebted to war for the increase of their estates, and many rulers too."

"Yes, so far so good, Socrates. But what about the fact 16

13

Σώκρατες, ἔφη ὁ Κριτόβουλος· ἐκεῖνο δ' ἡμῖν τί φαίνεται, ὁπόταν ὁρῶμέν τινας ἐπιστήμας μὲν ἔχοντας καὶ ἀφορμάς, ἀφ' ὧν δύνανται ἐργαζόμενοι αὔξειν τοὺς οἴκους, αἰσθανώμεθα δὲ αὐτοὺς ταῦτα μὴ θέλοντας ποιεῖν καὶ διὰ τοῦτο ὁρῶμεν ἀνωφελεῖς οὕσας αὐτοῖς τὰς ἐπιστήμας; ἄλλο τι ἢ τούτοις αὖ οὔτε αἱ ἐπιστήμαι χρήματά εἰσιν οὔτε τὰ κτήματα;

Περὶ δούλων μοι, ἔφη ὁ Σωκράτης, ἐπιχειρεῖς, ὧ Κριτόβουλε, διαλέγεσθαι;

Οὐ μὰ Δί, ἔφη, οὐκ ἔγωγε, ἀλλὰ καὶ πάνυ εὐπατριδῶν ἐνίων γε δοκούντων εἶναι, οῦς ἐγὰ ὁρῶ τοὺς μὲν καὶ πολεμικάς, τοὺς δὲ καὶ εἰρηνικὰς ἐπιστήμας ἔχοντας, ταύτας δὲ οὐκ ἐθέλοντας ἐργάζεσθαι, ὡς μὲν ἐγὰ οἶμαι, δι' αὐτὸ τοῦτο ὅτι δεσπότας οὐκ ἔχουσιν.

Καὶ πῶς ἄν, ἔφη ὁ Σωκράτης, δεσπότας οὐκ ἔχοιεν, εἰ εὐχόμενοι εὐδαιμονεῖν καὶ ποιεῖν βουλόμενοι ἀφ' ὧν ἔχοιεν ἀγαθὰ ἔπειτα κωλύονται ποιεῖν ταῦτα ὑπὸ τῶν ἀρχόντων;

Καὶ τίνες δὴ οὖτοί εἰσιν, ἔφη ὁ Κριτόβουλος, οἱ ἀφανεῖς ὄντες ἄρχουσιν αὐτῶν;

'Αλλὰ μὰ Δί', ἔφη ὁ Σωκράτης, οὐκ ἀφανεῖς εἰσιν, ἀλλὰ καὶ πάνυ φανεροί. καὶ ὅτι πονηρότατοί γε εἰσιν οὐδὲ σὲ λανθάνουσιν, εἴπερ πονηρίαν γε νομίζεις ἀργίαν τ' εἶναι καὶ μαλακίαν ψυχῆς καὶ ἀμέλειαν. καὶ ἄλλαι δ' εἰσὶν ἀπατηλαί τινες δέσποιναι προσποιούμεναι ἡδοναὶ εἶναι, κυβεῖαί τε καὶ ἀνωφελεῖς ἀνθρώπων ὁμιλίαι, αἳ προϊόντος τοῦ χρόνου καὶ αὐτοῖς τοῖς ἐξαπατηθεῖσι καταφανεῖς γίγνονται ὅτι λῦπαι ἄρα

17

18

19

#### OECONOMICUS 1.16-1.20

that we sometimes come across people who have the knowledge and means for increasing their estates if they work, yet we find that they are unwilling to do so; and consequently we see that their knowledge is without profit for them. What are we to make of that? In these cases, surely, neither their knowledge nor their property is wealth?"

"Are you trying to start a discussion about slaves, Critobulus?"

"Oh no, not at all: I mean even people regarded as men of the highest lineage, of whom I observe that some are skilled in the arts of war, some in the arts of peace, but who are unwilling to practice these arts, and the reason, I think, is precisely because they have no master over them."

"What, no master over them, when in spite of their prayers for prosperity and their desire to do what will bring them good they are thwarted in their intentions by those who rule them?"

"And who, pray, may these unseen rulers be?"

"No, not unseen, but open and undisguised, surely! And very vicious rulers they are too, as you yourself must see, if at least you regard idleness and moral cowardice and negligence as vices. And then there are some deceitful mistresses that pretend to be pleasures—such as gambling and consorting with bad companions: even the victims of their deception find as time goes on that these, after all, are really pains concealed beneath a thin veneer of plea-

395

17

18

19

ήσαν ήδοναις περιπεπεμμέναι, αι διακωλύουσιν αυτους άπο των ώφελίμων έργων κρατούσαι.

'Αλλὰ καὶ ἄλλοι, ἔφη, ὧ Σώκρατες, ἐργάζεσθαι μὲν οὐ κωλύονται ὑπὸ τούτων, ἀλλὰ καὶ πάνυ σφοδρῶς πρὸς τὸ ἐργάζεσθαι ἔχουσι καὶ μηχανᾶσθαι προσ-όδους· ὅμως δὲ καὶ τοὺς οἴκους κατατρίβουσι καὶ ἀμηχανίαις συνέχονται.

Δοῦλοι γάρ εἰσι καὶ οὖτοι, ἔφη ὁ Σωκράτης, καὶ πάνυ γε χαλεπῶν δεσποτῶν, οἱ μὲν λιχνειῶν, οἱ δὲ λαγνειών, οί δὲ οἰνοφλυγιών, οί δὲ φιλοτιμιών τινων μώρων καὶ δαπανηρών, ἃ οὕτω χαλεπώς ἄρχει² τών άνθρώπων, ὧν ἂν ἐπικρατήσωσιν, ὥσθ' ἔως μὲν ἂν όρωσιν ήβωντας αὐτοὺς καὶ δυναμένους ἐργάζεσθαι, άναγκάζουσι φέρειν α αν αυτοί έργασωνται καί τελείν είς τὰς αύτων ἐπιθυμίας, ἐπειδὰν δὲ αὐτοὺς ἀδυνάτους αἴσθωνται ὄντας ἐργάζεσθαι διὰ τὸ γῆρας. άπολείπουσι τούτους κακώς γηράσκειν, άλλοις δ' αὖ πειρώνται δούλοις χρήσθαι. άλλὰ δεῖ, ὧ Κριτόβουλε, πρὸς ταῦτα οὐχ ἦττον διαμάχεσθαι περὶ τῆς ἐλευθερίας ἢ πρὸς τοὺς σὺν ὅπλοις πειρωμένους καταδουλοῦσθαι. πολέμιοι μὲν οὖν ἤδη ὅταν καλοὶ κάγαθοὶ όντες καταδουλώσωνταί τινας, πολλούς δη βελτίους ηνάγκασαν είναι σωφρονίσαντες καὶ ράον βιοτεύειν τὸν λοιπὸν χρόνον ἐποίησαν αἱ δὲ τοιαῦται δέσποιναι αἰκιζόμεναι τὰ σώματα τῶν ἀνθρώπων καὶ τὰς ψυχὰς καὶ τοὺς οἴκους οὔποτε λήγουσιν, ἔστ' ἂν ἄρχωσιν αὐτῶν.

2. Ὁ οὖν Κριτόβουλος ἐκ τούτων ὧδέ πως εἶπεν·

21

22

#### OECONOMICUS 1.20-2.1

sures, and that they are hindering them from all profitable work by their influence over them."

"But there are others, Socrates, whose energy is not hindered by these influences, in fact they have an eager desire to work and to make an income: nevertheless they exhaust their estates and are beset with difficulties."

"Yes, they too are slaves, and hard indeed are their masters: some are in bondage to gluttony, some to lechery, some to drink, and some to foolish and costly ambitions. And so hard is the rule of these passions over every man who falls into their clutches, that so long as they see that he is strong and capable of work, they force him to pay over all the profits of his toil, and to spend it on their own desires; but no sooner do they find that he is too old to work, than they leave him to an old age of misery, and try to fasten the voke on other shoulders. No, Critobulus, we must fight for our freedom against all these as persistently as if they were armed men trying to enslave us. In fact open enemies may be gentlemen, and when they enslave us may, by chastening, purge us of our faults and cause us to live better lives in the future. But such mistresses as these never cease to plague men in body and soul and estate all the time that they have dominion over them."

2. Critobulus continued the conversation in the follow-

21

22

<sup>1</sup> δεσποινῶν Weiske

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> αΐ . . . ἄρχουσι Hirschig

Άλλὰ περὶ μὲν τῶν τοιούτων ἀρκούντως πάνυ μοι δοκῶ τὰ λεγόμενα ὑπὸ σοῦ ἀκηκοέναι αὐτὸς δ' ἐμαυτὸν ἐξετάζων δοκῶ μοι εὐρίσκειν ἐπιεικῶς τῶν τοιούτων ἐγκρατῆ ὅντα, ὥστ' εἴ μοι συμβουλεύοις, ὅ τι ἄν ποιῶν αὔξοιμι τὸν οἶκον, οὐκ ἄν μοι δοκῶ ὑπό γε τούτων ὧν σὺ δεσποινῶν καλεῖς κωλύεσθαι ἀλλὰ θαρρῶν συμβούλευε ὅ τι ἔχεις ἀγαθόν ἢ κατέγνωκας ἡμῶν, ὧ Σώκρατες, ἰκανῶς πλουτεῖν καὶ οὐδὲν δοκοῦμέν σοι προσδεῖσθαι χρημάτων;

Οὔκουν ἔγωγε, ἔφη ὁ Σωκράτης, εἰ καὶ περὶ ἐμοῦ λέγεις, οὐδέν μοι δοκῶ προσδεῖσθαι χρημάτων, ἀλλ' ἰκανῶς πλουτεῖν· σὰ μέντοι, ὧ Κριτόβουλε, πάνυ μοι δοκεῖς πένεσθαι, καὶ ναὶ μὰ Δί ἔστιν ὅτε καὶ πάνυ οἰκτείρω σε ἐγώ.

3 Καλ ὁ Κοιτόβ

2

Καὶ ὁ Κριτόβουλος γελάσας εἶπε, Καὶ πόσον ἂν πρὸς τῶν θεῶν οἴει, ὧ Σώκρατες, ἔφη, εὐρεῖν τὰ σὰ κτήματα πωλούμενα, πόσον δὲ τὰ ἐμά;

Έγω μεν οἶμαι, ἔφη ὁ Σωκράτης, εἰ ἀγαθοῦ ἀνητοῦ ἐπιτύχοιμι, εὑρεῖν ἄν μοι σὺν τῆ οἰκία καὶ τὰ ὄντα πάντα πάνυ ῥαδίως πέντε μνᾶς· τὰ μέντοι σὰ ἀκριβῶς οἶδα ὅτι πλέον ἃν εὕροι ἢ ἑκατονταπλασίονα τούτου.

4 Κἆτα οὕτως ἐγνωκὼς σὰ μὲν οὐχ ἡγῃ προσδεῖσθαι χρημάτων, ἐμὲ δὲ οἰκτείρεις ἐπὶ τῃ πενίᾳ;

Τὰ μὲν γὰρ ἐμά, ἔφη, ἱκανά ἐστιν ἐμοὶ παρέχειν τὰ ἐμοὶ ἀρκοῦντα· εἰς δὲ τὸ σὸν σχῆμα, ὁ σὺ περιβέβλησαι, καὶ τὴν σὴν δόξαν οὐδ' εἰ τρὶς ὅσα νῦν κέκτησαι προσγένοιτό σοι, οὐδ' ὧς ἂν ἱκανά μοι δοκεῖ εἶναί σοι.

#### OECONOMICUS 2.1-2.4

ing fashion: "Well, I think you have told me quite enough about such passions as these, and when I examine myself I find, I think, that I have them fairly well under control; and therefore, if you will advise me what I should do to increase my estate, I don't think those mistresses, as you call them, are likely to hinder me. So don't hesitate to give me any good advice you can. Or have you made up your mind that we are rich enough already, Socrates, and think we have no need of more money?"

"If you mean to include me, I certainly think I have no need of more money and am rich enough. But you seem to me to be quite poor, Critobulus, and at times I really do feel quite sorry for you."

"And how much, pray tell," asked Critobulus, laughing, "do you suppose your property would fetch at a sale, Socrates, and how much would mine?"

"Well, if I found a good buyer, I think the whole of my goods and chattels, including the house, might readily sell for five minae. Yours, I feel sure, would fetch more than a hundred times that much."

"And in spite of that estimate, you really think you need 4 no more money and pity me for my poverty?"

"Yes, because my property is enough to satisfy my wants, but I don't think you would have enough to keep up your style of life and your reputation, even if your fortune were three times what it is."

2

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Not enough even for hoplite status.

Πῶς δὴ τοῦτ'; ἔφη ὁ Κριτόβουλος.

Απεφήνατο ὁ Σωκράτης: "Ότι πρῶτον μὲν ὁρῶ σοι άνάγκην οὖσαν θύειν πολλά τε καὶ μεγάλα ἢ οὔτε θεούς οὔτε ἀνθρώπους οἶμαί σε ἂν ἀνασχέσθαι. έπειτα ξένους προσήκει σοι πολλούς δέχεσθαι καὶ τούτους μεγαλοπρεπώς έπειτα δε πολίτας δειπνίζειν καὶ εὖ ποιείν ἢ ἔρημον συμμάχων εἶναι. ἔτι δὲ καὶ τὴν πόλιν αἰσθάνομαι τὰ μὲν ἤδη σοι προστάττουσαν μεγάλα τελείν, ίπποτροφίας τε καὶ χορηγίας καὶ γυμνασιαρχίας καὶ προστατείας, ἢν δὲ δὴ πόλεμος γένηται, οἶδ' ὅτι καὶ τριηραρχίας [μισθοὺς] καὶ εἰσφοράς τοσαύτας σοι προστάξουσιν, όσας σὺ οὐ ραδίως ὑποίσεις. ὅπου δ' ἂν ἐνδεῶς δόξης τι τούτων ποιείν, οίδ' ὅτι σε τιμωρήσονται Αθηναίοι οὐδὲν ἡττον ἢ εἰ τὰ αύτῶν λάβοιεν κλέπτοντα. πρὸς δὲ τούτοις όρῶ σε οἰόμενον πλουτεῖν καὶ ἀμελῶς μὲν ἔχοντα πρὸς τὸ μηχανᾶσθαι χρήματα, παιδικοῖς δὲ πράγμασι προσέχοντα τὸν νοῦν, ὥσπερ ἐξόν σοι. ὧν ἕνεκα οἰκτείρω σε, μή τι ἀνήκεστον κακὸν πάθης καὶ εἰς πολλην ἀπορίαν καταστής, καὶ ἐμοὶ μέν, εἴ τι καὶ προσδεηθείην, οἶδ' ὅτι καὶ σὺ γιγνώσκεις, ὡς εἰσὶν οἳ καὶ ἐπαρκέσειαν ἄν, ὥστε πάνυ μικρὰ πορίσαντες κατακλύσειαν αν άφθονία την έμην δίαιταν οί δε σοί φίλοι πολύ άρκοῦντα σοῦ μᾶλλον ἔχοντες τῆ έαυτῶν κατασκευή ή συ τη ση όμως ώς παρά σου ώφελησόμενοι ἀποβλέπουσι.

Καὶ ὁ Κριτόβουλος εἶπεν· Ἐγὼ τούτοις, ὧ Σώκρα-

9

5

"How can that be?" exclaimed Critobulus.

"Because, in the first place," explained Socrates, "I notice that you are bound to offer many large sacrifices; otherwise, I suppose, you would get into trouble with gods and men alike. Secondly, it is your duty to entertain many foreign guests, on a generous scale too. Thirdly, you have to give dinners and play the benefactor to the citizens, or you lose your following. Moreover, I observe that already the state is exacting heavy contributions from you: you must keep horses, pay for choruses and gymnastic competitions, and accept presidencies;2 and if war breaks out, I know they will require you to maintain a ship and pay a level of taxes that you won't easily afford. Whenever you seem to fall short of what is expected of you, the Athenians will certainly punish you as though they had caught you robbing them. Besides all this, I notice that you imagine yourself to be a rich man; you are indifferent to money, and yet go courting boys as though the cost were nothing to you. And that is why I pity you, and fear that you may come to grief and find yourself reduced to abject poverty. Whereas if I ran short of money, you know just as well as I do that I would not lack helpers who would need to contribute very little to fill my cup to overflowing. But your friends, though far better supplied with means to support their style of life than you, nevertheless look to receive help from you."

"I can't deny this, Socrates," said Critobulus, "but it's

9

 $<sup>^2</sup>$  I.e., supervision of religious or civic enterprises, unlikely in this instance to mean  $\pi\rho\sigma\sigma\tau a\sigma ias$  (supervision of resident aliens), which is unattested as a liturgy.

τες, οὐκ ἔχω ἀντιλέγειν ἀλλ' ὥρα σοι προστατεύειν έμοῦ, ὅπως μὴ τῷ ὄντι οἰκτρὸς γένωμαι.

'Ακούσας οὖν ὁ Σωκράτης εἶπε· Καὶ οὐ θαυμαστὸν δοκεῖς, ὧ Κριτόβουλε, τοῦτο σαυτῷ ποιεῖν, ὅτι ὀλίγῳ μὲν πρόσθεν, ὅτε ἐγὼ ἔφην πλουτεῖν, ἐγέλασας ἐπ' ἐμοὶ ὡς οὐδὲ εἰδότι, ὅ τι εἴη πλοῦτος, καὶ πρότερον οὐκ ἐπαύσω πρὶν ἐξήλεγξάς με καὶ ὁμολογεῖν ἐποίησας μηδὲ ἑκατοστὸν μέρος τῶν σῶν κεκτῆσθαι, νῦν δὲ κελεύεις προστατεύειν μέ σου καὶ ἐπιμελεῖσθαι, ὅπως ἂν μὴ παντάπασιν ἀληθῶς πένης γένοιο;

Όρω γάρ σε, ἔφη, ὧ Σώκρατες, ἔν τι πλουτηρον ἔργον ἐπιστάμενον περιουσίαν ποιεῖν. τὸν οὖν ἀπ' ὀλίγων περιποιοῦντα ἐλπίζω ἀπὸ πολλῶν γ' ἂν πάνυ ραδίως πολλὴν περιουσίαν ποιῆσαι.

Οὔκουν μέμνησαι ἀρτίως ἐν τῷ λόγῳ, ὅτε οὐδ' ἀναγρύζειν μοι ἐξουσίαν ἐποίησας λέγων, ὅτι τῷ μὴ ἐπισταμένῳ ἵπποις χρήσθαι οὐκ εἴη χρήματα οἱ ἵπποι οὐδὲ ἡ γῆ οὐδὲ τὰ πρόβατα οὐδὲ ἀργύριον οὐδὲ ἄλλο οὐδέν, ὅτῳ τις μὴ ἐπίσταιτο χρῆσθαι; εἰσὶ μὲν οὖν αἱ πρόσοδοι ἀπὸ τῶν τοιούτων ἐμὲ δὲ πῶς τινι τούτων οἴει ἂν ἐπιστηθῆναι χρῆσθαι, ῷ τὴν ἀρχὴν οὐδὲν πώποτ' ἐγένετο τούτων;

'Αλλ' ἐδόκει ἡμῖν, καὶ εἰ μὴ χρήματά τις τύχοι ἔχων, ὅμως εἶναί τις ἐπιστήμη οἰκονομίας. τί οὖν κωλύει καὶ σὲ ἐπίστασθαι;

Όπερ νη Δία καὶ αὐλεῖν ἂν κωλύσειεν ἄνθρωπον ἐπίστασθαι, εἰ μήτε αὐτὸς πώποτε κτήσαιτο αὐλοὺς μήτε ἄλλος αὐτῷ παράσχοι ἐν τοῖς αὐτοῦ μανθάνειν

10

11

12

## OECONOMICUS 2.9-2.13

time for you to take me in hand, and see that I don't really become an object of pity."

At this Socrates exclaimed, "Odd, don't you think, Critobulus, that a little while ago, when I said I was rich, you laughed at me as though I didn't even know the meaning of the word, and wouldn't stop until you had proved me wrong and made me admit that my possessions were worth less than one-hundredth of yours. And yet now you ask me to take you in hand and see that you don't become in all actuality a poor man?"

"Well, Socrates, I see that you understand one process by which wealth is created—how to create a surplus. So a man who saves on a small income can, I suppose, very easily produce a large surplus from a large income."

"Then don't you remember saying just now in our conversation, when you wouldn't let me get a word in edgewise, that if a man doesn't know how to manage horses, his horses are not wealth to him, nor his land, sheep, money or anything else, if he doesn't know how to manage them? Now these are the sources from which income is derived: so how do you suppose that I can possibly know how to manage any of these, seeing that I never yet owned any of them?"

"Still we held that, even if a man happens to have no wealth, there is such a thing as a science of household management. So is there any reason why you shouldn't know it?"

"Exactly the same reason, of course, that a man would have for not knowing how to play the flute if he had never owned one himself and had never borrowed one to learn on. That's just my case as regards estate management; for 10

11

12

οὕτω δὴ καὶ ἐμοὶ ἔχει περὶ τῆς οἰκονομίας. οὕτε γὰρ αὐτὸς ὅργανα χρήματα ἐκεκτήμην, ὥστε μανθάνειν, οὕτε ἄλλος πώποτέ μοι παρέσχε τὰ ἑαυτοῦ διοικεῖν ἀλλὶ ἢ σὰ νυνὶ ἐθέλεις παρέχειν. οἱ δὲ δήπου τὸ πρῶτον μανθάνοντες κιθαρίζειν καὶ τὰς λύρας λυμαίνονται· καὶ ἐγὰ δὴ εἰ ἐπιχειρήσαιμι ἐν τῷ σῷ οἴκῷ μανθάνειν οἰκονομεῖν, ἴσως ἂν καταλυμηναίμην ἄν σου τὸν οἶκον.

Πρὸς ταῦτα ὁ Κριτόβουλος εἶπε· Προθύμως γε, ὧ Σώκρατες, ἀποφεύγειν μοι πειρậ μηδέν με συνωφελησαι εἰς τὸ ῥậον ὑποφέρειν τὰ ἐμοὶ ἀναγκαῖα πράγματα.

Οὐ μὰ Δί', ἔφη ὁ Σωκράτης, οὐκ ἔγωγε, ἀλλ' ὅσα ἔχω καὶ πάνυ προθύμως ἐξηγήσομαί σοι. οἶμαι δ' ἂν καὶ εἰ ἐπὶ πῦρ ἐλθόντος σου καὶ μὴ ὄντος παρ' ἐμοί, εἰ ἄλλοσε ἡγησάμην ὁπόθεν σοι εἴη λαβεῖν, οὐκ ἂν ἐμέμφου μοι, καὶ εἰ ὕδωρ παρ' ἐμοῦ αἰτοῦντί σοι αὐτὸς μὴ ἔχων ἄλλοσε καὶ ἐπὶ τοῦτο ἤγαγον, οἶδ' ὅτι οὐδ' ἂν τοῦτό μοι ἐμέμφου, καὶ εἰ βουλομένου μουσικὴν μαθεῖν σου παρ' ἐμοῦ δείξαιμί σοι πολὺ δεινοτέρους ἐμοῦ περὶ μουσικὴν καί σοι χάριν ἂν εἰδότας, εἰ ἐθέλοις παρ' αὐτῶν μανθάνειν, τί ἂν ἔτι μοι ταῦτα ποιοῦντι μέμφοιο;

Οὐδὲν ἂν δικαίως γε, ὧ Σώκρατες.

Έγὼ τοίνυν σοι δείξω, ὧ Κριτόβουλε, ὅσα νῦν λιπαρεῖς παρ' ἐμοῦ μανθάνειν, πολὺ ἄλλους ἐμοῦ δεινοτέρους περὶ ταῦτα. ὁμολογῶ δὲ μεμεληκέναι μοι, οἴτινες ἔκαστα ἐπιστημονέστατοί εἰσι τῶν ἐν τῆ πό-

14

15

## OECONOMICUS 2.13-2.16

never having possessed wealth myself, I've had no opportunity to learn on an instrument of my own, and nobody has ever let me handle his, until you made your offer. Beginners, I imagine, are even apt to damage the lyres they practice on; and if I attempted to learn to manage estates by practicing on yours, I might well totally destroy it for you."

To that Critobulus rejoined, "How eagerly, Socrates, are you trying to avoid giving me any help toward lightening the weight of my burdensome duties."

"Not at all, not at all," said Socrates, "I am all eagerness to tell you all I know. Suppose you came to my house for fire and I hadn't any but took you to some place where you could get it: I don't think you would blame me; or if you asked for water and I had none myself but brought you to some other place for it, I feel sure that you would not blame me for that either; or suppose you wanted to learn music with me and I directed you to persons far more skilled in music than I am and who would be grateful to you for taking lessons with them, on what grounds would you blame me for doing that?"

"None if I were fair, Socrates."

"Well then, Critobulus, I will direct you to others far more skilled than I in the subjects you now seek to learn from me. I confess that I have made a point of finding out who in the city are most knowledgeable in each subject. 14

15

- 17 λει. καταμαθών γάρ ποτε ἀπὸ τῶν αὐτῶν ἔργων τοὺς μὲν πάνυ ἀπόρους ὄντας, τοὺς δὲ πάνυ πλουσίους ἀπεθαύμασα καὶ ἔδοξέ μοι ἄξιον εἶναι ἐπισκέψεως, ὅ τι εἴη τοῦτο. καὶ εὖρον ἐπισκοπῶν πάνυ οἰκείως ταῦτα 8 γιγνόμενα. τοὺς μὲν γὰρ εἰκῆ ταῦτα πράττοντας ζημιουμένους ἑώρων, τοὺς δὲ γνώμη συντεταμένη ἐπιμελουμένους καὶ θᾶττον καὶ ῥᾶον καὶ κερδαλεώτερον κατέγνων πράττοντας. παρ' ὧν ἂν καὶ σὲ οἶμαι, εἰ βούλοιο, μαθόντα, εἴ σοι ὁ θεὸς μὴ ἐναντιοῖτο, πάνυ ἃν δεινὸν χρηματιστὴν γενέσθαι.
  - 3. 'Ακούσας ταῦτα ὁ Κριτόβουλος εἶπε, Νῦν τοι, ἔφη, ἐγώ σε οὐκέτι ἀφήσω, ὧ Σώκρατες, πρὶν ἄν μοι ἃ ὑπέσχησαι ἐναντίον τῶν φίλων τουτωνὶ ἀποδείξης.

Τί οὖν, ἔφη ὁ Σωκράτης, ὧ Κριτόβουλε, ἤν σοι ἀποδεικνύω πρῶτον μὲν οἰκίας τοὺς μὲν ἀπὸ πολλοῦ ἀργυρίου ἀχρήστους οἰκοδομοῦντας, τοὺς δὲ ἀπὸ πολὺ ἐλάττονος πάντα ἐχούσας ὅσα δεῖ, ἢ δόξω ἕν τί σοι τοῦτο τῶν οἰκονομικῶν ἔργων ἐπιδεικνύναι;

Καὶ πάνυ γ', ἔφη ὁ Κριτόβουλος.

- Τί δ' ην τὸ τούτου ἀκόλουθον μετὰ τοῦτό σοι ἐπιδεικνύω, τοὺς μὲν πάνυ πολλὰ καὶ παντοῖα κεκτημένους ἔπιπλα καὶ τούτοις, ὅταν δέωνται, μη ἔχοντας χρησθαι μηδὲ εἰδότας, εἰ σῶά ἐστιν αὐτοῖς, καὶ διὰ ταῦτα πολλὰ μὲν αὐτοὺς ἀνιωμένους, πολλὰ δ' ἀνιῶντας τοὺς οἰκέτας· τοὺς δὲ οὐδὲν πλέον, ἀλλὰ καὶ μείονα τούτων κεκτημένους ἔχοντας εὐθὺς ἔτοιμα ὅτων αν δέωνται χρησθαι;
- 3 "Άλλο τί οὖν τούτων ἐστίν, ὦ Σώκρατες, αἴτιον ἢ

For observing once that the same pursuits lead in one case to great poverty and in another to great wealth, I was quite amazed and thought it worthwhile to consider why this is so. And on consideration I found that this happens quite naturally. For I observed that those who follow their pursuits carelessly suffer loss, and I discovered that those who seriously devote themselves accomplish them more quickly, more easily, and more profitably. If you chose to learn from them, I think that, unless some god prevents it, you too would become a formidable businessman."

3. "Socrates," exclaimed Critobulus on hearing this, "I don't intend to let you go now, until you have proved to my satisfaction what you have promised in the presence of our friends here to prove."

"Well then," said Socrates, "what if I prove to your satisfaction, Critobulus, to begin with, that some men spend large sums in building houses that are useless, while others build houses perfect in all respects for much less? Will you think that I am putting before you one of the operations that constitute estate management?"

"Yes, certainly."

"And what if I show you next the companion to this—that some possess many costly belongings and cannot use them when they need them, and do not even know whether they are safe and sound, and so are continually distressing themselves and distressing their slaves, whereas others, though they possess not more but even less, have whatever they want ready for use?"

"Yes, but what is the reason for this, Socrates? Isn't it

18

17

ότι τοις μεν όποι έτυχεν έκαστον καταβέβληται, τοις δε έν χώρα έκαστα τεταγμένα κειται;

Ναὶ μὰ Δί', ἔφη ὁ Σωκράτης καὶ οὐδ' ἐν χώρα γε, ἐν  $\mathring{\eta}$  ἔτυχεν, ἀλλὰ ἔνθα προσήκει, ἕκαστα διατέτακται.

Λέγειν τί μοι δοκείς, ἔφη, καὶ τοῦτο, ὁ Κριτόβουλος, τῶν οἰκονομικῶν.

Τί οὖν, ἤν σοι, ἔφη, καὶ οἰκέτας αὖ ἐπιδεικνύω ἔνθα μὲν πάντας ὡς εἰπεῖν δεδεμένους καὶ τούτους θαμινὰ ἀποδιδράσκοντας, ἔνθα δὲ λελυμένους καὶ ἐθέλοντάς τε ἐργάζεσθαι καὶ παραμένειν, οὐ καὶ τοῦτό σοι δόζω ἀξιοθέατον τῆς οἰκονομίας ἔργον ἐπιδεικνύναι;

Ναὶ μὰ Δί', ἔφη ὁ Κριτόβουλος, καὶ σφόδρα γε.

"Ην δὲ καὶ παραπλησίους γεωργίας γεωργοῦντας τοὺς μὲν ἀπολωλέναι φάσκοντας ὑπὸ γεωργίας καὶ ἀποροῦντας, τοὺς δὲ ἀφθόνως καὶ καλῶς πάντα ἔχοντας, ὅσων δέονται, ἀπὸ τῆς γεωργίας;

Ναὶ μὰ Δί', ἔφη ὁ Κριτόβουλος. ἴσως γὰρ ἀναλίσκουσιν οὐκ εἰς ἃ δεῖ μόνον, ἀλλὰ καὶ εἰς ἃ βλάβην φέρει αὐτῷ καὶ τῷ οἴκῳ.

Εἰσὶ μέν τινες ἴσως, ἔφη ὁ Σωκράτης, καὶ τοιοῦτοι.
ἀλλ' ἐγὼ οὐ τούτους λέγω, ἀλλ' οῦ οὐδ' εἰς τἀναγκαῖα ἔχουσι δαπανᾶν, γεωργεῖν φάσκοντες.

Καὶ τί ἂν εἴη τούτου αἴτιον, ὧ Σώκρατες;

Έγω σε ἄξω καὶ ἐπὶ τούτους, ἔφη ὁ Σωκράτης· σὺ δὲ θεωμενος δήπου καταμαθήση.

 $Nη \Delta i$ , ϵφη, ην δύνωμαί <math>γϵ.

7 Οὐκοῦν χρὴ θεώμενον σαυτοῦ ἀποπειρᾶσθαι εἰ

4

simply that the former toss their things down anywhere while the latter have everything neatly arranged in its place?"

"Yes, of course, arranged carefully in the proper place, not just anywhere."

"Your point, I take it, is that this too is an element in estate management."

"Then what if I show you besides that in some households nearly all the slaves are in chains and yet continually try to run away, whereas in others they are under no restraint and are willing to work and to stay at their stations? Won't you think that here too I am pointing out to you a notable effect of estate management?"

"Yes, of course; very much so."

"And that when men farm the same kind of land, some are poverty-stricken and declare that they are ruined by farming, while others do well with the farm and have all they need in abundance?"

"Yes, of course; for maybe some spend money not on necessary purposes only but on what brings harm to the owner and the estate."

"Perhaps there are people like that. But I don't mean them, rather those who haven't the money to meet even the necessary expenses though claiming to be farmers."

"Now what can be the reason for that, Socrates?"

"I will take you to these too; and when you watch them, you will find out, I think."

"Of course; that is, if I can."

"Then you must watch and test yourself to see whether

5

γνώση, νῦν δ' ἐγώ σε σύνοιδα ἐπὶ μὲν κωμφδῶν θέαν καὶ πάνυ πρωὶ ἀνιστάμενον καὶ πάνυ μακρὰν ὁδὸν βαδίζοντα καὶ ἐμὲ ἀναπείθοντα προθύμως συνθεᾶσθαι: ἐπὶ δὲ τοιοῦτον οὐδέν με πώποτε ἔργον παρεκάλεσας.

Οὐκοῦν γελοῖός σοι φαίνομαι εἶναι, ὧ Σώκρατες.

Σαυτῷ δὲ πολὺ νὴ Δί, ἔφη, γελοιότερος. ἢν δὲ καὶ ἀφ' ἱππικῆς σοι ἐπιδεικνύω τοὺς μὲν εἰς ἀπορίαν τῶν ἐπιτηδείων ἐληλυθότας, τοὺς δὲ διὰ τὴν ἱππικὴν καὶ πάνυ εὐπόρους ὄντας καὶ ἄμα ἀγαλλομένους ἐπὶ τῷ κέρδει;

Οὐκοῦν τούτους μὲν καὶ ἐγὼ ὁρῶ καὶ οἶδα ἑκατέρους καὶ οὐδέν τι μᾶλλον τῶν κερδαινόντων γίγνομαι.

Θεὰ γὰρ αὐτοὺς ἦπερ τοὺς τραγφδούς τε καὶ κωμφδούς, οὐχ ὅπως ποιητὴς οἴομαι γένη, ἀλλ' ὅπως ἡσθῆς ἰδών τι ἢ ἀκούσας· καὶ ταῦτα μὲν ἴσως οὕτως ὀρθῶς ἔχει, οὐ γὰρ ποιητὴς βούλει γενέσθαι, ἱππικῆ δ' ἀναγκαζόμενος χρῆσθαι οὐ μῶρος οἴει εἶναι, εἰ μὴ σκοπεῖς, ὅπως μὴ ἰδιώτης ἔση τούτου τοῦ ἔργου, ἄλλως τε καὶ τῶν αὐτῶν ἵππων³ ἀγαθῶν εἴς τε τὴν χρῆσιν καὶ κερδαλέων εἰς πώλησιν ὄντων;

Πωλοδαμνεῖν με κελεύεις, ὧ Σώκρατες;

Οὐ μὰ Δί οὐδέν τι μᾶλλον ἢ καὶ γεωργοὺς ἐκ παιδίων ἀνούμενον κατασκευάζειν, ἀλλ' εἶναί τινές μοι δοκοῦσιν ἡλικίαι καὶ ἵππων καὶ ἀνθρώπων, αἳ εὐθύς τε χρήσιμαί εἰσι καὶ ἐπὶ τὸ βέλτιον ἐπιδιδόασιν. ἔχω δ' ἐπιδεῖξαι καὶ γυναιξὶ ταῖς γαμεταῖς τοὺς

8

9

you are capable of understanding. At present I observe that when a comedy is to be seen, you get up very early and walk a very long way and press me eagerly to go to the play with you. But you have never yet invited me to see a real-life drama like this."

"You think me ridiculous, don't you, Socrates?"

"You think yourself far more so, I'm sure. And suppose I show you that some have been brought to penury by keeping horses, while others prosper by doing so, and moreover glory in their gain?"

"Well, I see them too and know instances of both, yet I'm not one of the gainers for all that."

"The fact is you watch them just as you watch the actors in tragedy or comedy, not, I suppose, to become a playwright, but for the pleasure of seeing and hearing something. And perhaps there is no harm in that, because you don't want to write plays; but seeing that you are forced to deal with horses, don't you think you would be stupid not to look into how not to be an amateur at the business, the more so as these very horses are both good to use and profitable to sell?"

"Would you have me break in colts, Socrates?"

"Of course not, no more than I would have you buy farmers to train from childhood; but horses and human beings alike, I think, on reaching a certain age suddenly become useful and go on improving. I can also show you that in their treatment of their wives, husbands differ

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> ἵππων Graux: ὄντων codd.

μὲν οὕτω χρωμένους, ὥστε συνεργοὺς ἔχειν αὐτὰς εἰς τὸ συναύξειν τοὺς οἴκους, τοὺς δὲ  $\hat{\eta}$  ὅτι πλείστον λυμαίνονται.

11 Καὶ τούτου πότερα χρή, ὧ Σώκρατες, τὸν ἄνδρα αἰτιᾶσθαι ἢ τὴν γυναῖκα;

Πρόβατον μέν, ἔφη ὁ Σωκράτης, ὡς ἐπὶ τὸ πολὸ ἢν κακῶς ἔχη, τὸν νομέα αἰτιώμεθα, καὶ ἵππος ὡς ἐπὶ τὸ πολὸ ἢν κακουργῆ, τὸν ἱππέα κακίζομεν· τῆς δὲ γυναικός, εἰ μὲν διδασκομένη ὑπὸ τοῦ ἀνδρὸς τἀγαθὰ κακοποιεῖ, ἴσως δικαίως ἂν ἡ γυνὴ τὴν αἰτίαν ἔχοι· εἰ δὲ μὴ διδάσκων τὰ καλὰ κἀγαθὰ ἀνεπιστήμονι τούτων χρῷτο, ἄρ' οὐ δικαίως ἂν ὁ ἀνὴρ τὴν αἰτίαν ἔχοι; πάντως δ', ἔφη, ὧ Κριτόβουλε, φίλοι γάρ ἐσμεν οἱ παρόντες, ἀπαληθεῦσαι δεῖ πρὸς ἡμᾶς. ἔστιν ὅτῳ ἄλλῳ τῶν σπουδαίων πλείω ἐπιτρέπεις ἢ τῆ γυναικί;

Οὐδενί, ἔφη.

12

Έστι δὲ ὅτῳ ἐλάττονα διαλέγη ἢ τῆ γυναικί; Εἰ δὲ μή, οὐ πολλοῖς γε, ἔφη.

13 "Εγημας δὲ αὐτὴν παίδα νέαν μάλιστα καὶ ὡς ἤδύνατο ἐλάχιστα έωρακυῖαν καὶ ἀκηκουῖαν;

Μάλιστα.

Οὐκοῦν πολὺ θαυμαστότερον, εἴ τι ὧν δεῖ λέγειν ἢ πράττειν ἐπίστατο ἢ εἰ ἐξαμαρτάνοι.

14 Οἷς δὲ σὰ λέγεις ἀγαθὰς εἶναι γυναῖκας, ὧ Σώκρατες, ἦ αὐτοὶ ταύτας ἐπαίδευσαν;

Οὐδὲν οἷον τὸ ἐπισκοπεῖσθαι. συστήσω δέ σοι ἐγὼ καὶ ᾿Ασπασίαν, ἢ ἐπιστημονέστερον ἐμοῦ σοι ταῦτα πάντα ἐπιδείξει. νομίζω δὲ γυναῖκα κοινωνὸν ἀγαθὴν

# OECONOMICUS 3.10-3.15

widely, some succeeding in winning their cooperation and thereby increasing their estates, others causing utter wreckage."

"And do we blame the husband or the wife for that, 11 Socrates?"

"When a sheep is ailing," said Socrates, "we generally blame the shepherd, and when a horse is vicious we generally find fault with the rider. In the case of a wife, if she receives instruction in the right way from her husband and yet does badly, perhaps she should bear the blame; but if the husband does not instruct his wife in the right way of doing things and then finds her ignorant, shouldn't he be the one who bears the blame? Anyhow, Critobulus, you should tell us the truth, for we are all friends here. Is there anyone to whom you commit more matters of importance than to your wife?"

"There is not."

"Is there anyone with whom you talk less?"

"No, or at least not many."

"And you married her when she was a mere child and had seen and heard almost nothing?"

"Certainly."

"Then it would be far more surprising if she understood what she should say or do than if she made mistakes."

"But what of the husbands who you say have good 14 wives, Socrates? Did they train them themselves?"

"There's nothing like investigation. I will introduce Aspasia to you, and she will explain the whole matter to you with more knowledge than I have.<sup>3</sup> I think that the wife

12

13

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> See n. on *Mem*. 2.6.36.

οἴκου οὖσαν πάνυ ἀντίρροπον εἶναι τῷ ἀνδρὶ ἐπὶ τὸ ἀγαθόν. ἔρχεται μὲν γὰρ εἰς τὴν οἰκίαν διὰ τῶν τοῦ ἀνδρὸς πράξεων τὰ κτήματα ὡς ἐπὶ τὸ πολύ, δαπανᾶται δὲ διὰ τῶν τῆς γυναικὸς ταμιευμάτων τὰ πλεῖστα· καὶ εὖ μὲν τούτων γιγνομένων αὕξονται οἱ οἶκοι, κακῶς δὲ τούτων πραττομένων οἱ οἶκοι μειοῦνται. οἶμαι δέ σοι καὶ τῶν ἄλλων ἐπιστημῶν τοὺς ἀξίως λόγου ἐκάστην ἐργαζομένους ἔχειν ἃν ἐπιδεῖξαί σοι, εἴτι προσδεῖσθαι νομίζεις.

4. ἀλλὰ πάσας μὲν τί σε δεῖ ἐπιδεικνύναι, ὧ Σώκρατες; ἔφη ὁ Κριτόβουλος· οὕτε γὰρ κτήσασθαι πασῶν τῶν τεχνῶν ἐργάτας ῥάδιον οἴους δεῖ οὕτε ἔμπειρον γενέσθαι αὐτῶν οἶόν τε, ἀλλ' αι δοκοῦσι κάλλισται τῶν ἐπιστημῶν καὶ ἐμοὶ πρέποι ἂν μάλιστα ἐπιμελομένῳ, ταύτας μοι καὶ αὐτὰς ἐπιδείκνυε καὶ τοὺς πράττοντας αὐτὰς καὶ αὐτὸς δὲ ὅ τι δύνασαι συνωφέλει εἰς ταῦτα διδάσκων.

ἀλλὰ καλῶς, ἔφη, λέγεις, ὧ Κριτόβουλε. καὶ γὰρ αἴ γε βαναυσικαὶ καλούμεναι καὶ ἐπίρρητοί εἰσι καὶ εἰκότως μέντοι πάνυ ἀδοξοῦνται πρὸς τῶν πόλεων. καταλυμαίνονται γὰρ τὰ σώματα τῶν τε ἐργαζομένων καὶ τῶν ἐπιμελομένων ἀναγκάζουσαι καθῆσθαι καὶ σκιατραφεῖσθαι, ἔνιαι δὲ καὶ πρὸς πῦρ ἡμερεύειν. τῶν δὲ σωμάτων θηλυνομένων καὶ αἱ ψυχαὶ πολὺ ἀρρωστότεραι γίγνονται. καὶ ἀσχολίας δὲ μάλιστα ἔχουσι καὶ φίλων καὶ πόλεως συνεπιμελεῖσθαι αἱ βαναυσικαὶ καλούμεναι. ὥστε οἱ τοιοῦτοι δοκοῦσι κακοὶ καὶ φίλοις χρῆσθαι καὶ ταῖς πατρίσιν ἀλεξητῆρες εἶναι.

who is a good partner in the household contributes just as much as her husband to its good; because the income for the most part is the result of the husband's exertions, but the expenses are controlled mostly by the wife's management. If both do their part well, the estate is increased; if they act incompetently, it is diminished. If you need any further demonstration as regards other branches of knowledge, I think I can show you people who acquit themselves creditably in any one of them."

16

4. "Surely, Socrates, there is no need to go through the whole list. For it is not easy to get workmen who are skilled in all the occupations, nor is it possible to become an expert in them all. Please select the branches of knowledge that seem the noblest and would be most suitable for me to cultivate: show me these, and those who practice them; and from your own knowledge give me any help you can toward learning them."

2

"Very good, Critobulus; for to be sure, the so-called banausic occupations are scorned and, naturally enough, held in low regard in our states. For they spoil the bodies of the workmen and the foremen, forcing them to sit still and stay indoors, and in some cases to spend the whole day by the fire. As their bodies become womanish their souls lose strength too. Moreover, these so-called banausic occupations leave no spare time for attention to one's friends and city, so that those who follow them are reputed bad at dealing with friends and bad defenders of their country.

καὶ ἐν ἐνίαις μὲν τῶν πόλεων, μάλιστα δὲ ἐν ταῖς εὐπολέμοις δοκούσαις εἶναι οὐδ' ἔξεστι τῶν πολιτῶν οὐδενὶ βαναυσικὰς τέχνας ἐργάζεσθαι.

Ἡμῖν δὲ δὴ ποίαις συμβουλεύεις, ὧ Σώκρατες, χρῆσθαι;

Άρα, ἔφη ὁ Σωκράτης, μὴ αἰσχυνθῶμεν τὸν Περσῶν βασιλέα μιμήσασθαι; ἐκεῖνον γάρ φασιν ἐν τοῖς καλλίστοις τε καὶ ἀναγκαιοτάτοις ἡγούμενον εἶναι ἐπιμελήμασι γεωργίαν τε καὶ τὴν πολεμικὴν τέχνην τούτων ἀμφοτέρων ἰσχυρῶς ἐπιμελεῖσθαι.

Καὶ ὁ Κριτόβουλος ἀκούσας ταῦτα εἶπε, Καὶ τοῦτο, ἔφη, πιστεύεις, ὧ Σώκρατες, βασιλέα τὸν Περσῶν γεωργίας τι συνεπιμελεῖσθαι;

\*Ωδ' ἄν, ἔφη ὁ Σωκράτης, ἐπισκοποῦντες, ὧ Κριτό-βουλε, ἴσως ἂν καταμάθοιμεν, εἴ τι συνεπιμελεῖται. τῶν μὲν γὰρ πολεμικῶν ἔργων ὁμολογοῦμεν αὐτὸν ἰσχυρῶς ἐπιμελεῖσθαι, ὅτι ἐξ ὁπόσωνπερ ἐθνῶν δασμοὺς λαμβάνει ‹τι›, τέταχε τῷ ἄρχοντι ἑκάστῳ, εἰς ὁπόσους δεῖ διδόναι τροφὴν ἱππέας καὶ τοξότας καὶ σφενδονήτας καὶ γερροφόρους, οἴτινες τῶν τε ὑπ' αὐτοῦ ἀρχομένων ἱκανοὶ ἔσονται κρατεῖν καὶ ἢν πολέμιοι ἐπίωσιν, ἀρήξουσι τῆ χώρα, χωρὶς δὲ τούτων φύλακας ἐν ταῖς ἀκροπόλεσι τρέφει· καὶ τὴν μὲν τροφὴν τοῖς φρουροῖς δίδωσιν ὁ ἄρχων, ῷ τοῦτο προστέτακται, βασιλεὺς δὲ κατ' ἐνιαυτὸν ἐξέτασιν ποιεῖται τῶν μισθοφόρων καὶ τῶν ἄλλων, οῖς ὡπλίσθαι προστέτακται, πάντας ἄμα συνάγων πλὴν τοὺς ἐν ταῖς ἀκροπόλεσιν ἔνθα δὴ ὁ σύλλογος καλεῖται· καὶ τοὺς

4

# OECONOMICUS 4.3-4.6

In some states, in fact, and especially in those reputed to be warlike, it is not even lawful for any of the citizens to work in the banausic occupations."

"But what occupations, then, do you advise us to follow, Socrates?"

"Need we be ashamed of imitating the king of the Persians? For they say that he pays close attention to farming and the art of war, holding that these are two of the noblest and most essential pursuits."

"And do you really believe, Socrates," exclaimed Critobulus on hearing this, "that the king of the Persians includes farming among his occupations?"

"Perhaps, Critobulus, the following considerations will enable us to discover whether he does so. We agree that he pays close attention to warfare, because he has given a standing order to every governor of the nations from which he receives tribute, to supply maintenance for a specified number of horsemen and archers and slingers and light infantry, so that they will be strong enough to control his subjects and to protect the country in the event of an invasion; and besides these he maintains garrisons in the citadels, whose maintenance is supplied by the governor charged with this duty, and the king annually reviews the mercenaries and all the other troops ordered to be under arms, assembling all but the men in the citadels at the place of muster, as it is called: he personally inspects

417

μὲν ἀμφὶ τὴν ἑαυτοῦ οἴκησιν αὐτὸς ἐφορᾳ, τοὺς δὲ πρόσω ἀποικοῦντας πιστοὺς πέμπει ἐπισκοπεῖν· καὶ οῦ μὲν ἂν φαίνωνται τῶν φρουράρχων καὶ τῶν χιλιάρχων καὶ τῶν σατραπῶν τὸν ἀριθμὸν τὸν τεταγμένον ἔκπλεων ἔχοντες καὶ τούτους δοκίμοις ἵπποις τε καὶ ὅπλοις κατεσκευασμένους παρέχωσι, τούτους μὲν τοὺς ἄρχοντας καὶ ταῖς τιμαῖς αὕξει καὶ δώροις μεγάλοις καταπλουτίζει, οῦς δ' ἂν εὕρη τῶν ἀρχόντων ἢ καταμελοῦντας τῶν φρουρῶν⁴ ἢ κατακερδαίνοντας, τούτους χαλεπῶς κολάζει καὶ παύων τῆς ἀρχῆς ἄλλους ἐπιμελητὰς καθίστησι. τῶν μὲν δὴ πολεμικῶν ἔργων ταῦτα ποιῶν δοκεῖ ἡμῖν ἀναμφιλόγως ἐπιμελεῖσθαι.

Έτι δὲ ὁπόσην μὲν τῆς χώρας διελαύνων ἐφορᾳ αὐτὸς καὶ δοκιμάζει, ὁπόσην δὲ μὴ αὐτὸς ἐφορᾳ, πέμπων πιστοὺς ἐπισκοπείται. καὶ οῢς μὲν ἂν αἰσθάνηται τῶν ἀρχόντων συνοικουμένην τε τὴν χώραν παρεχομένους καὶ ἐνεργὸν οὖσαν τὴν γῆν καὶ πλήρη δένδρων τε ὧν ἑκάστη φέρει καὶ καρπῶν, τούτοις μὲν χώραν τε ἄλλην προστίθησι καὶ δώροις κοσμεῖ καὶ ἔδραις ἐντίμοις γεραίρει, οἶς δ' ἂν ὁρᾳ ἀργόν τε τὴν χώραν οὖσαν καὶ ὀλιγάνθρωπον ἢ διὰ χαλεπότητα ἢ διὶ ὕβριν ἢ διὶ ἀμέλειαν, τούτους δὲ κολάζων καὶ παύων τῆς ἀρχῆς ἄρχοντας ἄλλους καθίστησι. ταῦτα ποιῶν δοκεῖ ἦττον ἐπιμελεῖσθαι, ὅπως ἡ γῆ ἐνεργὸς ἔσται ὑπὸ τῶν κατοικούντων ἢ ὅπως εὖ φυλάξεται ὑπὸ τῶν φρουρούντων, καὶ εἰσὶ δὶ αὐτῷ οἱ ἄρχοντες διατεταγμένοι ἐφὶ ἐκάτερον οὐχ οἱ αὐτοί, ἀλλὶ οἱ μὲν

# OECONOMICUS 4.6-4.9

the men who are near his residence, and sends trusted agents to review those who live farther away. The officers, whether commanders of garrisons or of regiments or satraps, who turn out with a full complement of men and parade them equipped with horses and arms in good condition, he promotes in the scale of honors and enriches with valuable gifts; but those officers whom he finds to be neglecting the garrisons or making profit out of them he punishes severely, and appoints others to take their office. These actions, then, seem to us to leave no room for doubt that he pays attention to warfare.

"As for the country, he personally examines as much of it as he sees in the course of his progress through it; and he receives reports from his trusted agents on the territories that he does not see for himself. To those governors who are able to show him that their country is densely populated and that the land is in cultivation and well stocked with the trees of the district and with the crops, he assigns more territory and gives presents, and rewards them with seats of honor. Those whose territory he finds uncultivated and thinly populated either through harsh administration or arrogance or carelessness, he punishes and appoints others to take their office. By such action, does he seem to provide less for the cultivation of the land by the inhabitants than for its protection by the garrisons? And each of these duties is entrusted to a separate class of

<sup>4</sup> Cyr. 8.1.39.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Schaefer: φρουράρχων codd.

άρχουσι τῶν κατοικούντων τε καὶ τῶν ἐργατῶν καὶ δασμούς έκ τούτων έκλέγουσιν, οί δ' ἄρχουσι τῶν  $\dot{\omega}$ πλισμένων  $\langle \tau \epsilon \ \kappa \alpha i \ \tau \hat{\omega} \nu \rangle^5 \ \phi \rho o v \rho \hat{\omega} \nu . \ \kappa \hat{\alpha} \nu \ \mu \hat{\epsilon} \nu \ \delta$ 10 φρούραρχος μη ίκανως τη χώρα άρηγη, ό των ένοικούντων ἄρχων καὶ τῶν ἔργων ἐπιμελούμενος κατηγορεί του φρουράρχου, ὅτι οὐ δύνανται ἐργάζεσθαι διὰ τὴν ἀφυλαξίαν, ἂν δὲ παρέχοντος τοῦ φρουράρχου εἰρήνην τοῖς ἔργοις ὁ ἄρχων ὀλιγάνθρωπόν τε παρέχηται καὶ άργὸν τὴν χώραν, τούτου αὖ κατηγορεί ὁ Φρούραρχος, καὶ γὰρ σχεδόν τι οἱ κακῶς τὴν 11 χώραν έργαζόμενοι ούτε τοὺς φρουροὺς τρέφουσιν οὔτε τοὺς δασμοὺς δύνανται ἀποδιδόναι. ὅπου δ' ἂν σατράπης καθιστήται, ούτος άμφοτέρων τούτων έπιμελεῖται.

'Εκ τούτων ὁ Κριτόβουλος εἶπεν· Οὐκοῦν εἰ μὲν δὴ ταῦτα ποιεῖ βασιλεύς, ὧ Σώκρατες, οὐδὲν ἔμοιγε δοκεῖ ἦττον τῶν γεωργικῶν ἔργων ἐπιμελεῖσθαι ἢ τῶν πολεμικῶν.

Έτι δὲ πρὸς τούτοις, ἔφη ὁ Σωκράτης, ἐν ὁπόσαις τε χώραις ἐνοικεῖ καὶ εἰς ὁπόσας ἐπιστρέφεται, ἐπιμελεῖται τούτων, ὅπως κῆποί τε ἔσονται οἱ παράδεισοι καλούμενοι πάντων καλῶν τε κἀγαθῶν μεστοί, ὅσα ἡ γῆ φύειν θέλει, καὶ ἐν τούτοις αὐτὸς τὰ πλεῖστα διατρίβει, ὅταν μὴ ἡ ὥρα τοῦ ἔτους ἐξείργη.

Νὴ Δί', ἔφη ὁ Κριτόβουλος, ἀνάγκη τοίνυν, ὡ Σώκρατες, ἔνθα γε διατρίβει αὐτός, καὶ ὅπως ὡς κάλλιστα κατεσκευασμένοι ἔσονται οἱ παράδεισοι ἐπιμελεῖσθαι δένδρεσι καὶ τοῖς ἄλλοις ἄπασι καλοῖς, ὅσα ἡ γῆ φύει.

12

13

officers; one class governs the residents and the laborers and collects tribute from them, the other commands the men under arms and the garrisons. If the commander of a garrison inadequately protects the country, the civil governor and controller of agriculture denounces the commander on the grounds that the inhabitants are unable to work the farms for lack of protection. If, on the other hand, the commander brings peace to the farms and the governor nevertheless causes the land to be sparsely populated and idle, the commander in turn denounces the governor. For, roughly speaking, where cultivation is inefficient, the garrisons are not maintained and the tribute cannot be paid. Wherever a satrap is appointed, he attends to both these matters."

ls e 12

11

10

At this point Critobulus said: "Well, Socrates, if the Great King does this, it seems to me that he pays as much attention to farming as to warfare."

13

"And furthermore," continued Socrates, "in all the districts where he resides and visits he takes care that there are 'paradises,' as they call them, full of all the fine and beautiful plants that the soil will produce, and there he himself spends most of his time, except when the season precludes it."

14

"Then it is of course necessary, Socrates, to take care that these paradises in which the king spends his time will contain a fine stock of trees and all other beautiful plants that the soil produces."

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> suppl. Graux

Φασὶ δέ τινες, ἔφη ὁ Σωκράτης, ὧ Κριτόβουλε, καὶ ὅταν δῶρα διδῷ ὁ βασιλεύς, πρῶτον μὲν εἰσκαλεῖν τοὺς πολέμῳ ἀγαθοὺς γεγονότας, ὅτι οὐδὲν ὄφελος πολλὰ ἀροῦν, εἰ μὴ εἶεν οἱ ἀρήξοντες· δεύτερον δὲ τοὺς κατασκευάζοντας τὰς χώρας ἄριστα καὶ ἐνεργοὺς ποιοῦντας λέγοντα, ὅτι οὐδ' ἂν οἱ ἄλκιμοι δύναιντο ζῆν, εἰ μὴ εἶεν οἱ ἐργαζόμενοι. λέγεται δὲ καὶ Κῦρός ποτε, ὅσπερ εὐδοκιμώτατος δὴ βασιλεὺς γεγένηται, εἰπεῖν τοῖς ἐπὶ τὰ δῶρα κεκλημένοις, ὅτι αὐτὸς ἂν δικαίως τὰ ἀμφοτέρων δῶρα λαμβάνοι· κατασκευάζειν τε γὰρ ἄριστος εἶναι ἔφη χώραν καὶ ἀρήγειν τοῖς κατεσκευασμένοις.

Κῦρος μὲν τοίνυν, ἔφη ὁ Κριτόβουλος, ὧ Σώκρατες, καὶ ἐπηγάλλετο οὐδὲν ἦττον, εἰ ταῦτα ἔλεγεν, ἐπὶ τῷ χώρας ἐνεργοὺς ποιεῖν καὶ κατασκευάζειν ἢ ἐπὶ τῷ πολεμικὸς εἶναι.

Καὶ ναὶ μὰ Δί, ἔφη ὁ Σωκράτης, Κῦρός γε, εἰ ἐβίωσεν, ἄριστος ἂν δοκεῖ ἄρχων γενέσθαι, καὶ τούτου τεκμήρια ἄλλα τε πολλὰ παρέσχηται καὶ ὅτε περὶ τῆς βασιλείας τῷ ἀδελφῷ ἐπορεύετο μαχούμενος, παρὰ μὲν Κύρου οὐδεὶς λέγεται αὐτομολῆσαι πρὸς βασιλέα, παρὰ δὲ βασιλέως πολλαὶ μυριάδες πρὸς
Κῦρον. ἐγὰ δὲ καὶ τοῦτο ἡγοῦμαι μέγα τεκμήριον ἄρχοντος ἀρετῆς εἶναι, ῷ ἂν ἑκόντες πείθωνται καὶ ἐν τοῖς δεινοῖς παραμένειν ἐθέλωσιν. ἐκείνῳ δὲ καὶ οἱ φίλοι ζῶντί τε συνεμάχοντο καὶ ἀποθανόντι συναπέθανον πάντες περὶ τὸν νεκρὸν μαχόμενοι πλὴν ᾿Αριαίου. ᾿Αριαῖος δ᾽ ἔτυχεν ἐπὶ τῷ εὐωνύμῳ κέρατι τεταγμένος.

## OECONOMICUS 4.15-4.19

"And some say, Critobulus, that when the king bestows gifts, he first invites those who have distinguished themselves in war, because it is useless to have broad acres under tillage unless there are men to defend them; and next to them, those who best stock and cultivate the land, saying that even stouthearted warriors cannot live without the aid of workers. There is a story that Cyrus, that most illustrious king, once said to the company invited to receive his gifts, 'I myself deserve to receive the gifts awarded in both classes; for I am the best at stocking land and the best at protecting the stock."

"Well, if Cyrus said that, Socrates, he took as much pride in cultivating and stocking land as in being a warrior."

"Yes, and if Cyrus had only lived, it seems that he would surely have proved an excellent ruler.<sup>5</sup> One of the many proofs that he has given of this is the fact that, when he was on his way to fight his brother for the throne,<sup>6</sup> it is said that not a man deserted from Cyrus to the king, whereas tens of thousands deserted from the king to Cyrus. I think you have one clear proof of a ruler's excellence when men obey him willingly<sup>7</sup> and choose to stand by him in moments of danger. Now his friends all fought at his side while he was alive and after he was killed died at his side, fighting around his body, with the sole exception of Ariaeus, who happened to be posted on the left wing.<sup>8</sup>

16

17

18

 $<sup>^{5}</sup>$  Moving from Cyrus the Great to Cyrus the Younger without signaling the change.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> At Cunaxa in 401; Xenophon was present at the battle.

<sup>7</sup> Mem. 3.3.9.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> An. 1.9.31. Ariaeus fled when he saw that Cyrus had fallen.

Οὖτος τοίνυν ὁ Κῦρος λέγεται Λυσάνδρω, ὅτε ἦλ-20 θεν ἄγων αὐτῷ τὰ παρὰ τῶν συμμάχων δῶρα, ἄλλα τε φιλοφρονείσθαι, ώς αὐτὸς ἔφη ὁ Λύσανδρος ξένω ποτέ τινι ἐν Μεγάροις διηγούμενος, καὶ τὸν ἐν Σάρδεσι παράδεισον ἐπιδεικνύναι αὐτὸν ἔφη. ἐπεὶ δὲ 21 έθαύμαζεν αὐτὸν ὁ Λύσανδρος, ώς καλὰ μὲν τὰ δένδρα είη, δι' ἴσου δὲ [τὰ] πεφυτευμένα, ὀρθοὶ δὲ οί στίχοι τῶν δένδρων, εὐγώνια δὲ πάντα καλῶς εἴη, όσμαὶ δὲ πολλαὶ καὶ ἡδεῖαι συμπαρομαρτοῖεν αὐτοῖς περιπατούσι, καὶ ταύτα θαυμάζων εἶπεν 'Αλλ' ἐνώ τοι, ὧ Κῦρε, πάντα μὲν ταῦτα θαυμάζω ἐπὶ τῶ κάλλει. πολύ δὲ μᾶλλον ἄγαμαι τοῦ καταμετρήσαντός σοι καὶ διατάξαντος ἕκαστα τούτων, ἀκούσαντα δὲ ταῦτα 22 τὸν Κῦρον ἡσθηναί τε καὶ εἰπεῖν Ταῦτα τοίνυν, ὧ Λύσανδρε, έγω πάντα καὶ διεμέτρησα καὶ διέταξα. έστι δ' αὐτῶν, φάναι, ἃ καὶ ἐφύτευσα αὐτός, καὶ ὁ 23 Λύσανδρος ἔφη, ἀποβλέψας εἰς αὐτὸν καὶ ἰδὼν τῶν τε ίματίων τὸ κάλλος ὧν εἶχε καὶ τῆς ὀσμῆς αἰσθόμενος καὶ τῶν στρεπτῶν καὶ τῶν ψελίων τὸ κάλλος καὶ τοῦ ἄλλου κόσμου οὖ εἶχεν, εἰπεῖν, Τί λέγεις, φάναι, ὧ Κῦρε; ἢ γὰρ σὰ ταῖς σαῖς χερσὶ τούτων τι έφύτευσας: καὶ τὸν Κῦρον ἀποκρίνασθαι, Θαυμάζεις τοῦτο, φάναι, ὧ Λύσανδρε; ὄμνυμί σοι τὸν Μίθρην, ὅτανπερ ὑγιαίνω, μηπώποτε δειπνησαι πρὶν ίδρῶσαι η των πολεμικών τι η των γεωργικών έργων μελετών η ἀεὶ ἕν γέ τι φιλοτιμούμενος.

Καὶ αὐτὸς μέντοι ἔφη ὁ Λύσανδρος ἀκούσας ταῦτα δεξιώσασθαί τε αὐτὸν καὶ εἰπεῖν. Δικαίως μοι δοκεῖς,

## OECONOMICUS 4 20-4 25

"Furthermore, the story goes that when Lysander came to him bringing the gifts from the allies,9 this Cyrus treated him in friendly fashion, as Lysander himself related once to a stranger at Megara, adding besides that Cyrus personally showed him around his paradise at Sardis. Now Lysander admired the beauty of the trees there, the accuracy of their spacing, the straightness of the rows, the regularity of the angles, and the multitude of sweet scents that clung around them as they walked; and in amazement he exclaimed, 'Cyrus, I really do admire all this loveliness, but I am far more impressed with your agent's skill in measuring and arranging everything so exactly.' Cyrus was delighted to hear this and replied, 'Well, Lysander, the whole of the measurement and arrangement is my own work, and I did some of the planting myself." 'What did you say, Cyrus?' exclaimed Lysander, looking at him, and noting the beauty and perfume of his robes, and the splendor of the necklaces and bangles and other jewels that he was wearing; 'Did you really plant part of this with your own hands? 'Does that surprise you, Lysander?' asked Cyrus in reply. 'I swear by Mithras that I never yet sat down to dinner when in sound health, without first working up a sweat at some task of war or agriculture, or exerting myself in some sort of competition.

"Lysander himself declared, I should add, that on hearing this he congratulated him and said, 'I think you de-

..

21

22

23

24

<sup>9</sup> In 407: Hell. 1.5.1-7.

ὧ Κῦρε, εὐδαίμων εἶναι· ἀγαθὸς γὰρ ὧν ἀνὴρ εὐδαιμονεῖς.

5. Ταῦτα δέ, ὧ Κριτόβουλε, ἐγὼ διηγοῦμαι, ἔφη ὁ Σωκράτης, ὅτι τῆς γεωργίας οὐδ' οἱ πάνυ μακάριοι δύνανται ἀπέχεσθαι. ἔοικε γὰρ ἡ ἐπιμέλεια αὐτῆς εἶναι ἄμα τε ἡδυπάθειά τις καὶ οἴκου αὔξησις καὶ σωμάτων ἄσκησις είς τὸ δύνασθαι ὅσα ἀνδρὶ ἐλευθέρω προσήκει, πρώτον μεν γαρ άφ' ὧν ζώσιν οἱ ἄνθρωποι, ταῦτα ἡ γῆ φέρει ἐργαζομένοις, καὶ ἀφ' ὧν τοίνυν ήδυπαθούσι προσεπιφέρει έπειτα δὲ ὅσοις 3 κοσμούσι βωμούς καὶ ἀνάλματα καὶ οἶς αὐτοὶ κοσμοῦνται, καὶ ταῦτα μετὰ ἡδίστων ὀσμῶν καὶ θεαμάτων παρέχει έπειτα δὲ ὄψα πολλὰ τὰ μὲν φύει, τὰ δὲ τρέφει καὶ γὰρ ἡ προβατευτικὴ τέχνη συνῆπται τῆ γεωργία, ὥστε ἔχειν καὶ θεοὺς ἐξαρέσκεσθαι θύοντας καὶ αὐτοὺς χρησθαι. παρέχουσα δ' ἀφθονώτατα τάγαθὰ οὐκ έᾳ ταῦτα μετὰ μαλακίας λαμβάνειν, άλλὰ ψύχη τε χειμώνος καὶ θάλπη θέρους ἐθίζει καρτερείν. καὶ τοὺς μὲν αὐτουργοὺς διὰ τῶν χειρῶν γυμνάζουσα ἰσχὺν αὐτοῖς προστίθησι, τοῦς δὲ τῆ έπιμελεία γεωργούντας ανδρίζει πρωί τε έγείρουσα καὶ πορεύεσθαι σφοδρώς ἀναγκάζουσα, καὶ γὰρ ἐν τῷ χώρῳ καὶ ἐν τῷ ἄστει ἀεὶ ἐν ὥρᾳ αἱ ἐπικαιριώταται πράξεις εἰσίν. ἔπειτα ἤν τε σὺν ἵππω ἀρήγειν τις τῆ πόλει βούληται, τὸν ἵππον ἱκανωτάτη ἡ γεωργία συντρέφειν, ήν τε πεζή, σφοδρον το σώμα παρέχει θήραις τε ἐπιφιλοπονεῖσθαι συνεπαίρει τι ἡ γὴ καὶ κυσίν εὐπέτειαν τροφής παρέχουσα καὶ θηρία συμ-

# OECONOMICUS 4.25-5.5

serve your happiness, Cyrus, for you earn it by your virtue."

5. "I'm telling you this," continued Socrates, "because not even the wealthiest can do without farming. For the pursuit of it is in some sense a luxury as well as a means of increasing one's estate and of training the body in all that a free man should be able to do. In the first place, the earth yields to cultivators the food by which people live; she yields besides the luxuries they enjoy. Secondly, she supplies what they use to decorate altars and statues and themselves, along with most pleasant sights and scents. Thirdly, she produces or feeds the ingredients of many delicate dishes; for the art of breeding stock is closely linked with farming; so that men have victims for propitiating the gods with sacrifice and cattle for their own use. And though she supplies good things in abundance, she does not allow them to be won without work, but she accustoms men to endure winter's cold and summer's heat. She gives increased strength through exercise to those who labor with their own hands, and hardens the overseers of the work by rousing them early and forcing them to move about briskly. For on a farm no less than in the city the most important operations have their fixed times. Again, if a man wants to defend his city by serving in the cavalry, farming is his most efficient partner in furnishing upkeep for his horse; if in the infantry, it energizes his body. And the land helps in some measure to arouse enthusiasm for the labor of hunting, since it affords ready access to nourishment for the hounds and at the same time

427

2

3

παρατρέφουσα. ὡφελούμενοι δὲ καὶ οἱ ἵπποι καὶ αἱ 6 κύνες ἀπὸ τῆς γεωργίας ἀντωφελοῦσι τὸν χῶρον, ὁ μεν ίππος πρωί τε κομίζων τον κηδόμενον είς την έπιμέλειαν καὶ έξουσίαν παρέχων ὀψὲ ἀπιέναι, αἰ δὲ κύνες τά τε θηρία ἀπερύκουσαι ἀπὸ λύμης καρπῶν καὶ προβάτων καὶ τῆ ἐρημία τὴν ἀσφάλειαν συμπαρέχουσαι. παρορμά δέ τι καὶ εἰς τὸ ἀρήγειν σὺν 7 ὅπλοις τῆ χώρα καὶ ἡ γῆ τοὺς γεωργοὺς ἐν τῶ μέσω τοὺς καρποὺς τρέφουσα τῷ κρατοῦντι λαμβάνειν, καὶ 8 δραμείν δὲ καὶ βαλείν καὶ πηδήσαι τίς ίκανωτέρους τέχνη γεωργίας παρέχεται; τίς δὲ τοῖς ἐργαζομένοις πλείω τέχνη ἀντιχαρίζεται; τίς δὲ ἥδιον τὸν ἐπιμελόμενον δέχεται, προτείνουσα προσιόντι λαβείν ὅ τι χρήζει; τίς δὲ ξένους ἀφθονώτερον δέχεται; χειμάσαι 9 δὲ πυρὶ ἀφθόνω καὶ θερμοῖς λουτροῖς ποῦ πλείων εὐμάρεια ἢ ἐν χώρω τω; ποῦ δὲ ἥδιον θερίσαι ὕδασί τε καὶ πνεύμασι καὶ σκιαῖς ἢ κατ' ἀγρόν; τίς δὲ ἄλλη 10 θεοίς ἀπαρχὰς πρεπωδεστέρας παρέχει ἢ έορτὰς πληρεστέρας ἀποδεικνύει; τίς δὲ οἰκέταις προσφιλεστέρα η γυναικὶ ηδίων η τέκνοις ποθεινοτέρα η φίλοις εὐχαριστοτέρα: ἐμοὶ μὲν θαυμαστὸν δοκεῖ εἶναι, εἴ τις 11 έλεύθερος ἄνθρωπος ἢ κτῆμά τι τούτου ἥδιον κέκτηται ἢ ἐπιμέλειαν ἡδίω τινὰ ταύτης εὕρηκεν ἢ ὡφελιμωτέραν είς τὸν βίον.

Έτι δὲ ἡ γῆ θεὸς οὖσα<sup>6</sup> τοὺς δυναμένους καταμανθάνειν καὶ δικαιοσύνην διδάσκει τοὺς γὰρ ἄριστα
 θεραπεύοντας αὐτὴν πλεῖστα ἀγαθὰ ἀντιποιεῖ. ἐὰν δ' ἄρα καὶ ὑπὸ πλήθους ποτὲ στρατευμάτων τῶν ἔργων

# OECONOMICUS 5.6-5.13

nourishes the wild game. And if farming benefits horses and hounds, they benefit the farm no less, the horses by carrying the overseer early to the scene of his duties and enabling him to leave it late, the hounds by keeping the wild animals from injuring crops and sheep, and by helping to provide safety in deserted places. The land also stimulates armed protection of the country on the part of the farmers, by nourishing her crops in the open for the strongest to take. And what occupation produces better runners, throwers and jumpers than farming? What occupation rewards the worker more generously? What occupation welcomes its follower more gladly, inviting him to come and take whatever he wants? What occupation entertains guests more generously? Where is it more comfortable to pass the winter with a generous fire and warm baths than on a farm? Where is it more pleasant to spend the summer enjoying the cool waters and breezes and shade than in the country? What other occupation yields more seemly first fruits for the gods, or gives occasion for more abundant festivals? What occupation is dearer to slaves, or more pleasant to a wife, or more delightful to children, or more agreeable to friends? To me indeed it would be surprising if any free man has ever come to possess a property more pleasant than a farm, or has discovered an occupation more pleasant than this or more useful for making a living.

"Yet again, because the earth is a goddess she also teaches righteousness to those who can learn; for the better she is served, the greater the benefits she gives in return. So if at any time those who are occupied in farming 9

10

11

12

<sup>6</sup> θεὸς οὖσα Stobaeus:  $\theta \dot{\epsilon}(\lambda)$ ουσα codd.

## XENOPHON

στερηθώσιν οἱ ἐν τῆ γεωργία ἀναστρεφόμενοι καὶ σφοδρώς καὶ ἀνδρικώς παιδευόμενοι, οὖτοι εὖ παρεσκευασμένοι καὶ τὰς ψυχὰς καὶ τὰ σώματα, ἢν μὴ θεὸς ἀποκωλύη, δύνανται ἰόντες εἰς τὰς τῶν ἀποκωλυόντων λαμβάνειν ἀφ' ὧν θρέψονται. πολλάκις δ' ἐν τῷ πολέμῳ καὶ ἀσφαλέστερόν ἐστι σὺν τοῖς ὅπλοις τὴν τροφὴν μαστεύειν ἢ σὺν τοῖς γεωργικοῖς ὀργάνοις.

Συμπαιδεύει δὲ καὶ εἰς τὸ ἐπαρκεῖν ἀλλήλοις ἡ 14 γεωργία. ἐπί τε γὰρ τοὺς πολεμίους σὺν ἀνθρώποις δεί ιέναι της τε γης σὺν ἀνθρώποις ἐστὶν ἡ ἐργασία. τὸν οὖν μέλλοντα εὖ γεωργήσειν δεῖ τοὺς ἐργαστῆρας 15 καὶ προθύμους παρασκευάζειν καὶ πείθεσθαι θέλοντας τον δε έπι πολεμίους ἄγοντα ταὐτὰ δεί μηχανάσθαι δωρούμενόν τε τοις ποιούσιν α δεί ποιείν τους άγαθοὺς καὶ κολάζοντα τοὺς ἀτακτοῦντας, καὶ παρα-16 κελεύεσθαι δὲ πολλάκις οὐδὲν ήττον δεῖ τοῖς ἐργάταις τὸν γεωργὸν ἢ τὸν στρατηγὸν τοῖς στρατιώταις καὶ έλπίδων δὲ ἀγαθῶν οὐδὲν ἦττον οἱ δοῦλοι τῶν ἐλευθέρων δέονται, άλλὰ καὶ μᾶλλον, ὅπως μένειν ἐθέλωσι. καλώς δὲ κάκείνος εἶπεν, ος ἔφη τὴν γεωργίαν τῶν 17 άλλων τεχνών μητέρα καὶ τροφον εἶναι. εὖ μὲν γὰρ φερομένης της γεωργίας έρρωνται καὶ αἱ ἄλλαι τέχναι ἄπασαι, ὅπου δ' ἂν ἀναγκασθῆ ἡ γῆ χερσεύειν, ἀποσβέννυνται καὶ αἱ ἄλλαι τέχναι σχεδόν τι καὶ κατὰ γῆν καὶ κατὰ θάλατταν.

'Ακούσας δὲ ταῦτα ὁ Κριτόβουλος εἶπεν· 'Αλλὰ ταῦτα μὲν ἔμοιγε, ὧ Σώκρατες, καλῶς δοκεῖς λέγειν·

## OECONOMICUS 5.13-5.18

and are receiving a rigorous and manly teaching are forced by great armies to quit their lands, because they are men well prepared in mind and body, they can invade the country of those who keep them out of their own and take what they need to support themselves. Often in time of war it is safer to go armed in search of food than to gather it with farm implements.

"Furthermore, farming helps to train men for collaborative effort. For men are essential to an expedition against an enemy, and the cultivation of the soil demands the aid of men. Therefore nobody can be a good farmer unless he makes his laborers both eager and obedient; and the man who leads men against an enemy must contrive to secure the same results by rewarding those who act as brave men should and punishing the disobedient. And often it is no less necessary for a farmer to encourage his laborers than for a general to encourage his men. Slaves too need the stimulus of good hopes no less, indeed even more than free men, to make them willing to stay. It has been well said that farming is the mother and nurse of the other arts. For when farming flourishes, all the other arts prosper, but whenever the land is compelled to lie barren, the other arts of landsmen and seamen alike virtually perish."

"Well, Socrates," replied Critobulus, "I think you are right so far. But in farming a man can rely very little on 14

15

16

17

# XENOPHON

ὅτι δὲ τῆς γεωργικῆς τὰ πλεῖστά ἐστιν ἀνθρώπῳ ἀδύνατα προνοῆσαι «δῆλον; > ταὶ γὰρ χάλαζαι καὶ πάχναι ἐνίστε καὶ αὐχμοὶ καὶ ὅμβροι ἐξαίσιοι καὶ ἐρυσῖβαι καὶ ἄλλα πολλάκις τὰ καλῶς ἐγνωσμένα καὶ πεποιημένα ἀφαιροῦνται καὶ πρόβατα δ' ἐνίστε κάλλιστα τεθραμμένα νόσος ἐλθοῦσα κάκιστα ἀπώλεσεν.

'Ακούσας δὲ ταῦτα ὁ Σωκράτης εἶπεν 'Αλλ' ὤμην ἔγωγέ σε, ὧ Κριτόβουλε, εἰδέναι, ὅτι οἱ θεοὶ οὐδὲν ἦττόν εἰσι κύριοι τῶν ἐν τῆ γεωργία ἔργων ἢ τῶν ἐν τῷ πολέμῳ καὶ τοὺς μὲν ἐν τῷ πολέμῳ ὁρᾶς οἶμαι πρὸ τῶν πολεμικῶν πράξεων ἐξαρεσκομένους τοὺς θεοὺς καὶ ἐπερωτῶντας θυσίαις καὶ οἰωνοῖς, ὅ τι τε χρὴ ποιεῖν καὶ ὅ τι μή. περὶ δὲ τῶν γεωργικῶν πράξεων ἦττον οἴει δεῖν τοὺς θεοὺς ἱλάσκεσθαι; εὖ γὰρ ἴσθι, ἔφη, ὅτι οἱ σώφρονες καὶ ὑπὲρ ὑγρῶν καὶ ξηρῶν καρπῶν καὶ βοῶν καὶ ἵππων καὶ προβάτων καὶ ὑπὲρ πάντων γε δὴ τῶν κτημάτων τοὺς θεοὺς θεραπεύουσιν

6. Άλλὰ ταῦτα μέν, ἔφη, ὧ Σώκρατες, καλῶς μοι δοκεῖς λέγειν κελεύων πειρᾶσθαι σὺν τοῖς θεοῖς ἄρχεσθαι παντὸς ἔργου, ὡς τῶν θεῶν κυρίων ὄντων οὐδὲν ἡττον τῶν εἰρηνικῶν ἢ τῶν πολεμικῶν ἔργων. ταῦτα μὲν οὖν πειρασόμεθα οὕτω ποιεῖν. σὰ δ' ἡμῖν ἔνθεν λέγων περὶ τῆς οἰκονομίας ἀπέλιπες, πειρῶ τὰ τούτων ἐχόμενα διεκπεραίνειν, ὡς καὶ νῦν μοι δοκῶ ἀκηκοὼς ὅσα εἶπες μᾶλλόν τι ἤδη διορᾶν ἢ πρόσθεν, ὅ τι χρὴ ποιοῦντα βιοτεύειν.

19

#### OECONOMICUS 5 18-6 1

forecasts. Sometimes hailstorms and frosts, droughts, rainstorms, blight, and other factors spoil whatever has been well planned and well accomplished; and sometimes the best raised cattle are miserably destroyed by an outbreak of disease."

"Well," replied Socrates, <sup>10</sup> "I thought you knew, Critobulus, that the operations of farming lie no less in the hands of the gods than those of war. And you have noticed, I suppose, that men engaged in war try to propitiate the gods before taking action, and with sacrifices and omens try to discover what they ought to do and what not to do; and for the business of farming do you think it less necessary to ask the blessing of the gods? You may be sure that sensible people offer prayer for fruits and crops and cattle and horses and sheep, and indeed for all their possessions."

6. "Well, Socrates, I think you're right when you advise me to try to begin every undertaking with the gods' help, since the gods control the works of peace no less than of war. We will try, then, to do so. But please return to the point where you broke off in your discussion of estate management, and try to explain the subject completely step by step, since after hearing what you have said so far I already seem to perceive rather more clearly than before what I must do to earn a living."

10 Mem. 1.4.15, 4.3.12; Cyr. 1.6.46.

19

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> suppl. Reisig

Τί οὖν, ἔφη ὁ Σωκράτης, ἄρα, εἰ πρῶτον μὲν ἐπανέλθοιμεν ὅσα συνομολογοῦντες διεληλύθαμεν, ἵν', ἤν πως δυνώμεθα, πειραθῶμεν οὕτω καὶ τὰ λοιπὰ διεξιέναι συνομολογοῦντες;

Ήδὺ γοῦν ἐστιν, ἔφη ὁ Κριτόβουλος, ὥσπερ καὶ χρημάτων κοινωνήσαντας ἀναμφιλόγως διελθεῖν, οὕτω καὶ λόγων κοινωνοῦντας περὶ ὧν ἂν διαλεγώμεθα συνομολογοῦντας διεξιέναι.

Οὐκοῦν, ἔφη ὁ Σωκράτης, ἐπιστήμης μέν τινος 4 έδοξεν ήμιν ὄνομα είναι ή οίκονομία, ή δε έπιστήμη αὕτη ἐφαίνετο, ἡ οἴκους δύνανται αὕξειν ἄνθρωποι, οἶκος δ' ἡμῖν ἐφαίνετο ὅπερ κτῆσις ἡ σύμπασα, κτῆσιν δὲ τοῦτο ἔφαμεν εἶναι, ὅ τι ἑκάστω εἴη ὡφέλιμον είς τὸν βίον, ὡφέλιμα δὲ ὄντα εύρίσκετο πάντα, ὁπόσοις τις ἐπίσταιτο χρησθαι. πάσας μὲν οὖν τὰς ἐπι-5 στήμας οὖτε μαθεῖν οἷόν τε ἡμῖν ἐδόκει συναποδοκιμάζομέν τε ταις πόλεσι τὰς βαναυσικὰς καλουμένας τέχνας, ὅτι καὶ τὰ σώματα καταλυμαίνεσθαι δοκοῦσι καὶ τὰς ψυχὰς καταγνύουσι, τεκμήριον δὲ σαφέστα-6 τον γενέσθαι αν τούτου έφαμεν, εί πολεμίων είς την χώραν ἰόντων διακαθίσας τις τοὺς γεωργοὺς καὶ τοὺς τεχνίτας χωρίς έκατέρους ἐπερωτώη, πότερα δοκεῖ άρηγειν τη χώρα η ύφεμένους της γης τὰ τείχη δια-7 φυλάττειν. οὕτως γὰρ ἂν τοὺς μὲν ἀμφὶ γῆν ἔχοντας ώόμεθ' αν ψηφίζεσθαι άρήγειν, τους δε τεχνίτας μή μάχεσθαι, άλλ' ὅπερ πεπαίδευνται καθῆσθαι μήτε 8 πονοῦντας μήτε κινδυνεύοντας. έδοκιμάσαμεν δὲ ἀνδρὶ καλῶ τε κάγαθῶ ἐργασίαν εἶναι καὶ ἐπιστήμην

2

# OECONOMICUS 6.2-6.8

"I suggest then," resumed Socrates, "that we should first recapitulate those points of our discussion on which we have already reached agreement, so that we may try to agree as thoroughly when we go through the remaining steps."

"Yes, certainly: just as it is pleasant when business associates have no disagreement when reviewing the accounts, so it is for us, as the interested parties in a discussion, to agree as we go over the several steps."

"Well now, we thought that estate management is the name of a branch of knowledge, and this knowledge appeared to be that by which men can increase estates, and an estate appeared to be identical with the total of one's property, and we said that property is that which is useful for supplying a livelihood, and useful things turned out to be all those things that one knows how to use. We thought that it is impossible to learn all the branches of knowledge, and we agreed with our cities in rejecting the so-called banausic occupations because they seem to spoil the body and enervate the mind. We said! that the clearest proof of this would be evident if in the course of a hostile invasion the farmers and craftsmen were made to sit apart, and each group were asked whether they voted for defending the land or withdrawing from the open and guarding the city walls. We thought that in these circumstances the men who are occupied with the land would vote to defend it, the craftsmen not to fight but to sit still, as they have been brought up to do, and to avoid exertion and danger. We came to the conclusion that for a gentleman the best oc-

2

3

5

7

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup> There is nothing to this effect in chapter 4.

κρατίστην γεωργίαν, ἀφ' ἥς τὰ ἐπιτήδεια ἄνθρωποι 9 πορίζονται. αὕτη γὰρ ἡ ἐργασία μαθεῖν τε ῥάστη ἐδόκει εἶναι καὶ ἡδίστη ἐργάζεσθαι καὶ τὰ σώματα κάλλιστά τε καὶ εὐρωστότατα παρέχεσθαι καὶ ταῖς ψυχαῖς ἥκιστα ἀσχολίαν παρέχειν φίλων τε καὶ πόλεων συνεπιμελεῖσθαι. συμπαροξύνειν δέ τι ἐδόκει ἡμῖν καὶ εἰς τὸ ἀλκίμους εἶναι ἡ γεωργία ἔξω τῶν ἐρυμάτων τὰ ἐπιτήδεια φύουσά τε καὶ τρέφουσα τοὺς ἐργαζομένους. διὰ ταῦτα δὲ καὶ εὐδοξοτάτη εἶναι πρὸς τῶν πόλεων αὕτη ἡ βιοτεία, ὅτι καὶ πολίτας ἀρίστους καὶ εὐνουστάτους παρέχεσθαι δοκεῖ τῷ κοινῷ.

Καὶ ὁ Κριτόβουλος, "Ότι μέν, ὧ Σώκρατες, ἔφη, κάλλιστόν τε καὶ ἄριστον καὶ ἥδιστον ἀπὸ γεωργίας τὸν βίον ποιείσθαι, πάνυ μοι δοκῶ πεπεῖσθαι ἰκανῶς· ὅτι δὲ ἔφησθα καταμαθεῖν τὰ αἴτια τῶν τε οὕτω γεωργούντων, ὥστε ἀπὸ τῆς γεωργίας ἀφθόνως ἔχειν ὧν δέονται καὶ τῶν οὕτως ἐργαζομένων, ὡς μὴ λυσιτελεῖν αὐτοῖς τὴν γεωργίαν, καὶ ταῦτ' ἄν μοι δοκῶ ἡδέως ἑκάτερα ἀκούειν σου, ὅπως ἃ μὲν ἀγαθά ἐστι ποιῶμεν, ἃ δὲ βλαβερὰ μὴ ποιῶμεν.

Τί οὖν, ἔφη ὁ Σωκράτης, ὧ Κριτόβουλε, ἤν σοι ἐξ ἀρχῆς διηγήσωμαι, ὡς συνεγενόμην ποτὲ ἀνδρί, ὃς ἔμοὶ ἐδόκει εἶναι τῷ ὅντι τούτων τῶν ἀνδρῶν, ἐφ' οἶς τοῦτο τὸ ὅνομα δικαίως ἐστίν, ὃ καλεῖται καλός τε κἀγαθὸς ἀνήρ;

Πάνυ ἄν, ἔφη ὁ Κριτόβουλος, βουλοίμην ἃν οὕτως ἀκούειν, ὡς καὶ ἔγωγε ἐρῶ τούτου τοῦ ὀνόματος ἄξιος γενέσθαι.

11

## OECONOMICUS 6.8-6.12

cupation and the best branch of knowledge is farming, from which people obtain what is necessary to them. For this occupation seemed to be the easiest to learn and the most pleasant to practice, to afford the body the greatest measure of strength and beauty, and to afford the mind the greatest amount of spare time for attending to the interests of one's friends and city. Since farm crops grow and cattle graze outside the city walls, farming seemed to us to help in some measure to make those who work at it brave. And so this way of making a living appeared to be held in the highest esteem by our cities, because it seems to turn out citizens who are the bravest and most loyal to the community."

"I have already heard enough, I think, Socrates, to convince me that farming is the fairest, noblest, and most pleasant way to earn a living. But you told me that you have discovered the reasons why some farmers are so successful that farming yields them all they need in abundance, and others are so inefficient that they find farming unprofitable. I should like to hear the reasons in each case, so that we may do what is good and avoid what is harmful."

"Well then, Critobulus, what if I give you a complete account of an interview I once had with a man whom I took to be really one of those who are justly styled true gentlemen?"

"I would greatly like to hear it, Socrates, for I long to deserve that title myself."

10

11

Λέξω τοίνυν σοι, έφη ὁ Σωκράτης, ὡς καὶ ἦλθον 13 έπὶ τὴν σκέψιν αὐτοῦ. τοὺς μὲν γὰρ ἀγαθοὺς τέκτονας, άγαθούς χαλκέας, άγαθούς ζωγράφους, άγαθούς άνδριαντοποιούς καὶ τὰ ἄλλα τὰ τοιαῦτα πάνυ ὀλίγος μοι χρόνος έγένετο ίκανὸς περιελθεῖν τε καὶ θεάσασθαι τὰ δεδοκιμασμένα καλὰ ἔργα αὐτοῖς εἶναι. ὅπως 14 δὲ δὰ καὶ τοὺς ἔχοντας τὸ σεμνὸν ὄνομα τοῦτο τὸ καλός τε κάγαθὸς ἐπισκεψαίμην, τί ποτ' ἐργαζόμενοι τοῦτ' ἀξιοῖντο καλεῖσθαι, πάνυ μου ἡ ψυχὴ ἐπεθύμει αὐτῶν τινι συγγενέσθαι, καὶ πρῶτον μὲν ὅτι προσ-15 έκειτο τὸ καλὸς τῷ ἀγαθῶ, ὅντινα ἴδοιμι καλόν, τούτω προσήειν καὶ ἐπειρώμην καταμανθάνειν, εἴπου ἴδοιμι προσηρτημένον τῷ καλῷ τὸ ἀγαθόν. ἀλλ' οὐκ ἄρα 16 εἶχεν οὕτως, ἀλλὰ ἐνίους ἐδόκουν καταμανθάνειν τῶν καλών τὰς μορφὰς πάνυ μοχθηροὺς ὄντας τὰς ψυχάς. ἔδοξεν οὖν μοι ἀφέμενον τῆς καλῆς ὄψεως ἐπ' αὐτῶν τινα έλθειν των καλουμένων καλών τε κάγαθών. ἐπεὶ 17 οὖν τὸν Ἰσχόμαχον ἤκουον πρὸς πάντων καὶ ἀνδρῶν καὶ γυναικών καὶ ξένων καὶ ἀστών καλόν τε κάγαθὸν έπονομαζόμενον, έδοξε μοι τούτω πειραθήναι συνγενέσθαι.

7. Ἰδὼν οὖν ποτε αὐτὸν ἐν τἢ τοῦ Διὸς τοῦ ἐλευθερίου στοῷ καθήμενον, ἐπεί μοι ἔδοξε σχολάζειν, προσῆλθον αὐτῷ καὶ παρακαθιζόμενος εἶπον·

Τί, ὧ Ἰσχόμαχε, οὐ μάλα εἰωθὼς σχολάζειν κάθησαι; ἐπεὶ τά γε πλεῖστα ἢ πράττοντά τι ὁρῶ σε ἢ οὐ πάνυ σχολάζοντα ἐν τῆ ἀγορᾶ.

2 Οὐδὲ ἄν γε νῦν, ἔφη ὁ Ἰσχόμαχος, ὧ Σώκρατες,

# OECONOMICUS 6.13-7.2

"Then I will tell you how I came to investigate him. For it took me very little time to visit our good builders, good smiths, good painters, good sculptors, and other people of the kind, and to inspect what were considered their finest works: but my soul very much desired to meet one of those who are called by that grand name 'gentleman,' which implies 'beautiful' as well as 'good,' in order to consider what they did to deserve it. And, first, because the epithet 'beautiful' is added to 'good,' I went up to every person I noticed, and tried to discover whether I could anywhere see goodness in combination with beauty. But it was not that way at all: I thought I discovered that some who were beautiful to look at were thoroughly depraved in their souls. So I decided to let good looks go and to seek out someone known as a gentleman. And since I heard the name applied to Ischomachus by men, women, citizens, and foreigners alike, I decided to try to meet him. 12

7. So, happening one day to see him sitting in the stoa of the temple of Zeus Eleutherius apparently at leisure, I approached, and sitting down at his side, said:

"Why sitting still, Ischomachus? You are not much in the habit of doing nothing; for generally when I see you in the marketplace you are either busy or at least not completely idle."

"True, and you would not have seen me so now, Socra-

<sup>12</sup> Since for the rest of the dialogue Socrates reports his conversation with Ischomachus, narrative formulae indicating that he is still addressing Critobulus are not translated.

13

14

15

16

17

# XENOPHON

έώρας, εἰ μὴ ξένους τινὰς συνεθέμην ἀναμένειν ἐνθάδε.

"Όταν δὲ μὴ πράττης τι τοιοῦτον, πρὸς τῶν θεῶν, ἔφην ἐγώ, ποῦ διατρίβεις καὶ τί ποιεῖς; ἐγὼ γάρ τοι πάνυ βούλομαί σου πυθέσθαι, τί ποτε πράττων καλός τε κἀγαθὸς κέκλησαι, ἐπεὶ οὐκ ἔνδον γε διατρίβεις οὐδὲ τοιαύτη σου ἡ ἔξις τοῦ σώματος καταφαίνεται.

Καὶ ὁ Ἰσχόμαχος γελάσας ἐπὶ τῷ τί ποιῶν καλὸς κάγαθὸς κέκλησαι καὶ ἡσθείς, ὥς γ' ἐμοὶ ἔδοξεν, εἶ-πεν' ἀλλὶ εἰ μὲν ὅταν σοι διαλέγωνται περὶ ἐμοῦ τινες, καλοῦσί με τοῦτο τὸ ὄνομα, οὐκ οἶδα οὐ γὰρ δὴ ὅταν γέ με εἰς ἀντίδοσιν καλῶνται τριηραρχίας ἢ χορηγίας, οὐδείς, ἔφη, ζητεῖ τὸν καλόν τε κἀγαθόν, ἀλλὰ σαφῶς, ἔφη, ὀνομάζοντές με Ἰσχόμαχον πατρόθεν προσκαλοῦνται. ἐγὼ μὲν τοίνυν, ἔφη, ὧ Σώκρατες, ὅ με ἐπήρου, οὐδαμῶς ἔνδον διατρίβω. καὶ γὰρ δή, ἔφη, τά γε ἐν τῇ οἰκίᾳ μου πάνυ καὶ αὐτὴ ἡ γυνή ἐστιν ἱκανὴ διοικεῖν.

'Αλλὰ καὶ τοῦτο, ἔφην, ἔγωγε, ὧ 'Ισχόμαχε, πάνυ ἂν ἡδέως σου πυθοίμην, πότερα αὐτὸς σὺ ἐπαίδευσας τὴν γυναῖκα, ὥστε εἶναι οἵαν δεῖ, ἢ ἐπισταμένην ἔλαβες παρὰ τοῦ πατρὸς καὶ τῆς μητρὸς διοικεῖν τὰ προσήκοντα αὐτῆ.

Καὶ τί ἄν, ἔφη, ὧ Σώκρατες, ἐπισταμένην αὐτὴν παρέλαβον, ἡ ἔτη μὲν οὔπω πεντεκαίδεκα γεγονυῖα ἦλθε πρὸς ἐμέ, τὸν δ' ἔμπροσθεν χρόνον ἔζη ὑπὸ πολλῆς ἐπιμελείας, ὅπως ὡς ἐλάχιστα μὲν ὄψοιτο, ἐλάχιστα δὲ ἀκούσοιτο, ἐλάχιστα δ' ἐροίη; οὐ γὰρ ἀγαπη-

5

tes, had I not made an appointment with some guests here."

"And where do you spend your time," I asked, "and what do you do when you're not doing something of that sort? For I want very much to learn how you came to be called a gentleman, since you do not pass your time indoors and your condition does not suggest that you do so."

Smiling at my question, How did you come to be called a gentleman? and apparently pleased, Ischomachus answered, "Well, Socrates, I don't know whether people call me that when they talk to you about me. Certainly when they challenge me to an exchange of property in order to escape an obligation to maintain a warship or train a chorus, <sup>13</sup> nobody goes looking for the gentleman but the challenge refers to me as plain Ischomachus, my father's son. And, Socrates, since you ask the question, I certainly do not pass my time indoors, for my wife is quite capable of managing the household, even by herself."

"Ah, Ischomachus," I said, "that is just what I want to find out from you. Did you yourself train your wife to be of the right sort, or did she know her household duties when you received her from her father and mother?"

"And just what knowledge could she have had, Socrates, when I took her as my wife? She was not yet fifteen when she came to me, and up to that time she had lived under diligent supervision, seeing, hearing, and speaking as little as possible. If when she came she knew no more

<sup>13</sup> A citizen liable for such a liturgy (cf. 2.6) could challenge someone he deemed better able to pay to either undertake the expense or exchange estates. 5

τόν σοι δοκεῖ εἶναι, εἰ μόνον ἦλθεν ἐπισταμένη ἔρια παραλαβοῦσα ἱμάτιον ἀποδεῖξαι καὶ ἑωρακυῖα, ὡς ἔργα ταλάσια θεραπαίναις δίδοται; ἐπεὶ τά γε ἀμφὶ γαστέρα, ἔφη, πάνυ καλῶς, ὧ Σώκρατες, ἦλθε πεπαιδευμένη· ὅπερ μέγιστον ἔμοιγε δοκεῖ παίδευμα εἶναι καὶ ἀνδρὶ καὶ γυναικί.

Τὰ δ' ἄλλα, ἔφην ἐγώ, ὧ Ἰσχόμαχε, αὐτὸς ἐπαίδευσας τὴν γυναῖκα ὥστε ἱκανὴν εἶναι ὧν προσήκει ἐπιμελεῖσθαι;

Οὐ μὰ Δί, ἔφη ὁ Ἰσχόμαχος, οὐ πρίν γε καὶ ἔθυσα καὶ εὐξάμην ἐμέ τε τυγχάνειν διδάσκοντα καὶ ἐκείνην μανθάνουσαν τὰ βέλτιστα ἀμφοτέροις ἡμῖν.

Οὐκοῦν, ἔφην ἐγώ, καὶ ἡ γυνή σοι συνέθυε καὶ συνηύχετο ταὐτὰ ταῦτα;

Καὶ μάλα γ', ἔφη ὁ Ἰσχόμαχος, πολλὰ ὑποσχομένη μέν, <εὐχομένη δὲ><sup>8</sup> πρὸς τοὺς θεοὺς γενέσθαι οἵαν δεῖ, καὶ εὕδηλος ἦν ὅτι οὐκ ἀμελήσει τῶν διδασκομένων.

Πρὸς θεῶν, ἔφην ἐγώ, ὧ Ἰσχόμαχε, τί πρῶτον διδάσκειν ἤρχου αὐτήν, διηγοῦ μοι ὡς ἐγὼ ταῦτ ἀν ἤδιόν σου διηγουμένου ἀκούοιμι ἢ εἴ μοι γυμνικὸν ἢ ἱππικὸν ἀγῶνα τὸν κάλλιστον διηγοῖο.

10 Καὶ ὁ Ἰσχόμαχος ἀπεκρίνατο, Τί δέ; ἔφη, ὧ Σώκρατες, ἐπεὶ ἤδη μοι χειροήθης ἢν καὶ ἐτετιθάσευτο ὥστε διαλέγεσθαι, ἠρόμην αὐτήν, ἔφη, ὧδέ πως.

Εἰπέ μοι, ὧ γύναι, ἆρα ἤδη κατενόησας, τίνος ποτὲ ἕνεκα ἐγώ τε σὲ ἔλαβον καὶ οἱ σοὶ γονεῖς ἔδοσάν σε

8

# OECONOMICUS 7.6-7.10

than how, when given wool, to turn out a cloak, and had seen only how the spinning tasks are allocated to the slaves, isn't that as much as could be expected? For in control of her appetite, Socrates, she had been excellently trained; and I regard that sort of training to be the most important for man and woman alike."

"But in other respects, Ischomachus, did you train your wife yourself, so that she should be competent to perform her duties?"

"Oh no, Socrates, at least not until I had first offered sacrifice and prayed that I might really teach, and she really learn what was best for us both."

"Didn't your wife join with you in these same sacrifices and prayers?"

"Oh yes, and she earnestly promised <and prayed> to the gods to behave as she ought to, and it was easy to see that she would not neglect the lessons she had been taught."

"Do tell me, Ischomachus, what was the first lesson you taught her: I would sooner hear this from you than an account of the noblest athletic competition or horse race!"

"Well, Socrates, as soon as Î found her sufficiently tamed and domesticated to carry on a conversation, I questioned her along the following lines:

"'Tell me, wife, have you thought about my reasons for taking you and your parents' reasons for giving you to me?

<sup>8</sup> suppl. Marchant

έμοί; ὅτι μὲν γὰρ οὐκ ἀπορία ἦν, μεθ' ὅτον ἄλλον 11 έκαθεύδομεν ἄν, οἶδ' ὅτι καὶ σοὶ καταφανὲς τοῦτ' έστί. Βουλευόμενος δ' έγωγε ύπερ έμου και οι σοι γονείς ύπερ σου, τίν' αν κοινωνον βέλτιστον οικου τε καὶ τέκνων λάβοιμεν, έγώ τε σὲ έξελεξάμην καὶ οί σοὶ γονεῖς, ὡς ἐοίκασιν, ἐκ τῶν δυνατῶν ἐμέ, τέκνα 12 μεν οὖν ἢν θεός ποτε διδώ ἡμιν γενέσθαι, τότε βουλευσόμεθα περὶ αὐτῶν, ὅπως ὅτι βέλτιστα παιδεύσομεν αὐτά: κοινὸν γὰρ ἡμῖν καὶ τοῦτο ἀγαθόν, συμμάχων καὶ γηροβοσκών ὅτι βελτίστων τυγχάνειν νῦν δὲ δὴ οἶκος ἡμῖν ὅδε κοινός ἐστιν. ἐγώ τε γὰρ ὅσα 13 μοι ἔστιν ἄπαντα εἰς τὸ κοινὸν ἀποφαίνω σύ τε ὅσα ηνέγκω πάντα είς τὸ κοινὸν κατέθηκας, καὶ οὐ τοῦτο δεί λογίζεσθαι, πότερος ἄρα ἀριθμῷ πλείω συμβέβληται ήμων, άλλ' έκεινο εὖ είδέναι, ὅτι ὁπότερος ἂν ήμων βελτίων κοινωνὸς ή, οὖτος τὰ πλείονος ἄξια συμβάλλεται.

15 Ναὶ μὰ Δί', ἔφην ἐγώ, ὧ γύναι, καὶ γὰρ ἐμοὶ ὁ πατήρ. ἀλλὰ σωφρόνων τοί ἐστι καὶ ἀνδρὸς καὶ γυναικὸς οὕτως ποιεῖν, ὅπως τά τε ὅντα ὡς βέλτιστα ἔξει καὶ ἄλλα ὅτι πλεῖστα ἐκ τοῦ καλοῦ τε καὶ δικαίου προσγενήσεται.

Καὶ τί δή, ἔφη, ὁρậς, ἡ γυνή, ὅ τι ἂν ἐγὼ ποιοῦσα συναύξοιμι τὸν οἶκον;

# OECONOMICUS 7.11-7.16

For it's surely obvious to you that there was no shortage of other potential sleeping partners. But I for myself and your parents for you considered who was the best partner for household and children that we could get. My choice fell on you, and your parents, it appears, chose me as the best they could find. Now if the god grants us children 12 someday, then we will consider how we will best train them. For among the blessings we will share is the acquisition of the very best of allies and the very best of support in old age; but at present we share in this estate. For I 13 continue paying into the common fund all that I have, and you have put in all that you brought with you. We needn't calculate exactly which of us has contributed more, but we should be well aware that the one who proves the better partner makes the more valuable contribution. 14

"My wife's answer was as follows, Socrates: 'How can I possibly help you? What power do I have? Everything depends on you. My duty, as my mother told me, is to practice self-control.'

"'By god, wife,' I said, 'my father said the same to me. But self-control for both husband and wife means acting in such a manner that their possessions will be in the best condition possible, and that as much as possible shall be added to them by fair and honorable means.'

"'And what do you see me possibly doing to help im- 16 prove our estate?' asked my wife.

# XENOPHON

Καὶ μὰ Δί', ἔφην ἐγώ, ἄ τε οἱ θεοὶ ἔφυσάν σε δύνασθαι καὶ ὁ νόμος συνεπαινεῖ, ταῦτα πειρῶ ὡς βέλτιστα ποιεῖν.

17 Καὶ τί δὴ ταῦτά ἐστιν; ἔφη ἐκείνη.

Οἶμαι μὲν ἔγωγε, ἔφην, οὐ τὰ ἐλαχίστου ἄξια, εἰ μή πέρ γε καὶ ἡ ἐν τῶ σμήνει ἡγεμὼν μέλιττα ἐπ' έλαχίστου άξίοις έργοις έφέστηκεν. έμοὶ γάρ τοι, έφη 18 φάναι, καὶ οἱ θεοί, ὧ γύναι, δοκοῦσι πολὺ διεσκεμμένως μάλιστα τὸ ζεῦγος τοῦτο συντεθεικέναι, ὁ καλείται θήλυ καὶ ἄρρεν, ὅπως ὅτι ἀφελιμώτατον ή αύτω είς την κοινωνίαν. πρώτον μέν γάρ τοῦ μη έκλιπείν ζώων γένη τούτο τὸ ζεύγος κείται μετ' άλλήλων τεκνοποιούμενον, έπειτα τὸ γηροβοσκοὺς κεκτῆσθαι έαυτοις έκ τούτου του ζεύγους τοις γουν άνθρώποις πορίζεται: ἔπειτα δὲ καὶ ἡ δίαιτα τοῖς ἀνθρώποις οὐχ ώσπερ τοις κτήνεσιν έστιν έν υπαίθρω, άλλα στενών δείται δηλονότι. δεί μέντοι τοίς μέλλουσιν άνθρώποις 20 έξειν ὅ τι εἰσφέρωσιν εἰς τὸ στεγνὸν τοῦ ἐργασομένου τὰς ἐν τῷ ὑπαίθρω ἐργασίας, καὶ γὰρ νεατὸς καὶ σπόρος καὶ φυτεία καὶ νομαὶ ὑπαίθρια ταῦτα πάντα ἔργα ἐστίν· ἐκ τούτων δὲ τὰ ἐπιτήδεια γίγνεται. δεῖ δ' 21 αὖ, ἐπειδὰν ταῦτα εἰσενεχθη εἰς τὸ στεγνόν, καὶ τοῦ σώσοντος ταῦτα καὶ τοῦ ἐργασομένου δ' ἃ τῶν στεγνῶν ἔργα δεόμενά ἐστι. στεγνῶν δὲ δεῖται καὶ ἡ τῶν νεογνών τέκνων παιδοτροφία, στεγνών δὲ καὶ αἱ ἐκ τοῦ καρποῦ σιτοποιίαι δέονται ώσαύτως δὲ καὶ ἡ τῆς έσθητος έκ των έρίων έργασία. έπεὶ δ' άμφότερα 22 ταῦτα καὶ ἔργων καὶ ἐπιμελείας δεῖται τά τε ἔνδον καὶ

# OECONOMICUS 7.16-7.22

"'By god,' I replied 'of course you must try to do as well as possible what the gods made you capable of doing and the law encourages.'

"'And what is that?' she asked.

"Things of no small importance, I suppose,' I replied, 'unless, of course, the tasks over which the queen bee in the hive presides are of small importance! For it seems to me, wife, that the gods with great discernment have established this kind of yoking of male and female, as they are called, chiefly in order that they may form a perfect partnership in mutual service. In the first place, so that the various species of living creatures may not become extinct, the couple lies down together for the production of children. Secondly, offspring to support them in old age is provided by this union, at any rate to human beings. Thirdly, human beings do not live in the open air, like cattle, but obviously need shelter. Nevertheless, those who mean to obtain produce to fill the shelter need someone to work at the outdoor occupations, since plowing, sowing, planting, and grazing are all such outdoor jobs; and these supply the necessary provisions. And as soon as all this is stored in the shelter, then someone else is needed to keep it and to work at what must be done indoors. Shelter is needed for the nursing of newborns; shelter is needed for the making of grain into bread, and likewise for the making of clothes from wool. And since both the indoor and the outdoor jobs demand work and care, the

447

17

18

19

20

21

### XENOPHON

τὰ ἔξω, καὶ τὴν φύσιν, φάναι, εὐθὺς παρεσκεύασεν ὁ θεός, ὡς ἐμοὶ δοκεῖ, τὴν μὲν τῆς γυναικὸς ἐπὶ τὰ ἔν-δον ἔργα καὶ ἐπιμελήματα, τὴν δὲ τοῦ ἀνδρὸς ἐπὶ τὰ ἔξω ἔργα καὶ ἐπιμελήματα, <τὴν δὲ τοῦ ἀνδρὸς ἐπὶ τὰ ἔξω. Σθ

'Ρίγη μὲν γὰρ καὶ θάλπη καὶ ὁδοιπορίας καὶ στρα-23 τείας τοῦ ἀνδρὸς τὸ σώμα καὶ τὴν ψυχὴν μᾶλλον δύνασθαι καρτερείν κατεσκεύασεν ώστε τὰ ἔξω ἐπέταξεν αὐτῷ ἔργα· τῆ δὲ γυναικὶ ἦττον τὸ σῶμα δυνατὸν πρὸς ταῦτα φύσας τὰ ἔνδον ἔργα αὐτῆ, φάναι ἔφη, προστάξαι μοι δοκεί ὁ θεός. είδως δέ, ὅτι τῆ γυναικὶ 24 καὶ ἐνέφυσε καὶ προσέταξε τὴν τῶν νεογνῶν τέκνων τροφήν, καὶ τοῦ στέργειν τὰ νεογνὰ βρέφη πλείον αὐτη ἐδάσατο ἢ τῷ ἀνδρί. ἐπεὶ δὲ καὶ τὸ φυλάττειν 25 τὰ εἰσενεχθέντα τῆ γυναικὶ προσέταξε, γιγνώσκων ὁ θεός, ὅτι πρὸς τὸ φυλάττειν οὐ κάκιόν ἐστι φοβερὰν είναι τὴν ψυχήν, πλείον μέρος καὶ τοῦ φόβου ἐδάσατο τῆ γυναικὶ ἢ τῷ ἀνδρί. εἰδὼς δέ, ὅτι καὶ ἀρήγειν αὖ δεήσει, ἐάν τις ἀδικῆ, τὸν τὰ ἔξω ἔργα ἔχοντα, τούτω αὖ πλείον μέρος τοῦ θράσους ἐδάσατο, ὅτι δ΄ 26 άμφοτέρους δεί καὶ διδόναι καὶ λαμβάνειν, τὴν μνήμην καὶ τὴν ἐπιμέλειαν εἰς τὸ μέσον ἀμφοτέροις κατέθηκεν. ὥστε οὐκ ἂν ἔχοις διελεῖν, πότερα τὸ ἔθνος τὸ θηλυ η τὸ ἄρρεν τούτων πλεονεκτεί. καὶ τὸ ἐγκρατείς 27 δὲ εἶναι ὧν δεῖ εἰς τὸ μέσον ἀμφοτέροις κατέθηκε καὶ έξουσίαν ἐποίησεν ὁ θεός, ὁπότερος ἂν ἢ βελτίων, είθ' ὁ ἀνὴρ είθ' ἡ γυνή, τοῦτον καὶ πλείον φέρεσθαι τούτου τοῦ ἀγαθοῦ. διὰ δὲ τὸ τὴν φύσιν μὴ πρὸς 28

### OECONOMICUS 7.22-7.28

god from the first adapted the woman's nature, I think, to the indoor and man's to the outdoor works and cares.'

"'For he made the man's body and mind more capable 23 of enduring cold and heat, and journeys and campaigns, and thus has assigned him the outdoor tasks. To the woman, since he has made her body less capable of such endurance, I take it that the god has assigned the indoor tasks. And knowing that he had created in the woman, and 24 had imposed on her, the nurture of the newborns, he meted out to her a larger portion of affection for newborns than to the man. And since he imposed on the woman the 25 protection of what had been brought in as well, knowing that for protection a fearful disposition is no disadvantage, the god meted out a larger share of fear to the woman than to the man; and knowing that the one who deals with the outdoor tasks will have to be their defender against any wrongdoer, he meted out to him again a larger share of courage. But because both must give and take, he granted 26 to both impartially memory and attention; and so you could not distinguish whether the male or the female sex has the larger share of these. And the god also gave to both 27 impartially the power to practice self-control as needed, and gave the privilege to whichever is the better at thiswhether it be the man or the woman—to win a larger portion of the good that comes from it. And just because 28

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> suppl. Stephanus

πάντα ταὐτὰ ἀμφοτέρων εὖ πεφυκέναι, διὰ τοῦτο καὶ δέονται μᾶλλον ἀλλήλων καὶ τὸ ζεῦγος ἀφελιμώτερον έαυτῷ γεγένηται, ἃ τὸ ἔτερον ἐλλείπεται τὸ ἔτερον δυνάμενον.

Ταῦτα δέ, ἔφην, δεῖ ἡμᾶς, ὧ γύναι, εἰδότας ἃ έκατέρω ήμῶν προστέτακται ὑπὸ τοῦ θεοῦ, πειρᾶσθαι όπως ώς βέλτιστα τὰ προσήκοντα έκάτερον ἡμῶν διαπράττεσθαι, συνεπαινεί δέ, έφη φάναι, καὶ ὁ νόμος αὐτὰ συζευγνὺς ἄνδρα καὶ γυναῖκα. καὶ κοινωνοὺς ὥσπερ τῶν τέκνων ὁ θεὸς ἐποίησεν, οὕτω καὶ ὁ νόμος τοῦ οἴκου κοινωνοὺς καθίστησι. καὶ καλὰ δὲ εἶναι ὁ νόμος ἀποδείκνυσιν ἃ καὶ ὁ θεὸς ἔφυσεν ἑκάτερον μάλλον δύνασθαι. τη μέν γάρ γυναικὶ κάλλιον ἔνδον μένειν ἢ θυραυλεῖν, τῷ δὲ ἀνδρὶ αἴσχιον ἔνδον μένειν η των έξω έπιμελείσθαι. εί δέ τις παρ' α ο θεος έφυσε ποιεί, ἴσως τι καὶ ἀτακτῶν τοὺς θεοὺς οὐ λήθει καὶ δίκην δίδωσιν άμελων των έργων των έαυτοῦ ἢ πράττων τὰ τῆς γυναικὸς ἔργα, δοκεῖ δέ μοι, ἔφην, καὶ ἡ τῶν μελιττῶν ἡγεμῶν τοιαῦτα ἔργα ὑπὸ τοῦ θεοῦ προστεταγμένα διαπονεῖσθαι.

Καὶ ποῖα δή, ἔφη ἐκείνη, ἔργα ἔχουσα ἡ τῶν μελιττῶν ἡγεμῶν ἐξομοιοῦται τοῖς ἔργοις οἶς ἐμὲ δεῖ πράττειν;

Ότι, ἔφην ἐγώ, ἐκείνη γε ἐν τῷ σμήνει μένουσα οὐκ ἐᾳ ἀργοὺς τὰς μελίττας εἶναι, ἀλλ' ἃς μὲν δεῖ ἔξω ἐργάζεσθαι ἐκπέμπει ἐπὶ τὸ ἔργον καὶ ἃ ἂν αὐτῶν ἑκάστη εἰσφέρη, οἶδέ τε καὶ δέχεται καὶ σώζει ταῦτα, ἔστ' ὰν δέῃ χρῆσθαι. ἐπειδὰν δὲ ἡ ὥρα τοῦ χρῆσθαι

29

30

31

32

### OECONOMICUS 7.28-7.33

they are not equally well endowed with all the same aptitudes, they have the more need of each other, and each member of the pair is the more useful to the other, the one being competent where the other is deficient.'

"Now, wife, since we know what duties have been assigned to each of us by the god, we must try, each of us. to do the duties allotted to us as well as possible. The law encourages this, for it yokes husband and wife. And as the god has made them partners in their children, so the law appoints them partners in their household. And besides, the law declares those tasks to be seemly for which the god has made the one more naturally capable than the other. Thus for the woman it is more seemly to stay indoors than to be outside, but to the man it is unseemly rather to stay indoors than to tend to business outside. If a man acts contrary to the nature the god has given him, possibly his defiance is detected by the gods and he is punished for neglecting his own work, or meddling with his wife's. I think that the queen bee is busy with just such other tasks appointed by the god.'14

"'And how,' she asked, 'do the queen bee's tasks resemble those that I have to do?'

"'How? she stays in the hive,' I replied, 'and does not allow the bees to be idle; but those who ought to work outside she sends off to their work; and whatever each of them brings in, she knows and receives it, and keeps it till it needs to be used. And when the time comes to use it,

29

30

31

32

<sup>14</sup> Cyr. 5.1.24.

34 ἤκη, διανέμει τὸ δίκαιον ἐκάστη. καὶ ἐπὶ τοις ἔνδον δ' ἐξυφαινομένοις κηρίοις ἐφέστηκεν, ὡς καλῶς καὶ ταχέως ὑφαίνηται, καὶ τοῦ γιγνομένου τόκου ἐπιμελεῖται ὡς ἐκτρέφηται ἐπειδὰν δὲ ἐκτραφῆ καὶ ἀξιοεργοὶ οἱ νεοττοὶ γένωνται, ἀποικίζει αὐτοὺς σὺν τῶν ἐπιγόνων τινὶ ἡγεμόνι.

<sup>3</sup>Η καὶ ἐμὲ οὖν, ἔφη ἡ γυνή, δεήσει ταῦτα ποιεῖν; Δεήσει μέντοι σε, ἔφην ἐγώ, ἔνδον τε μένειν καὶ οἷς μὲν ἂν ἔξω τὸ ἔργον ἢ τῶν οἰκετῶν, τούτους συνεκπέμπειν, οἷς δ' ἂν ἔνδον ἔργον ἐργαστέον, τούτων σοι ἐπιστατητέον καὶ τά τε εἰσφερόμενα ἀποδεκτέον, καὶ ἃ μὲν ἂν αὐτῶν δέῃ δαπανᾶν, σοὶ διανεμητέον, ἃ δ' ἂν περιττεύειν δέῃ, προνοητέον καὶ φυλακτέον, ὅπως μὴ ἡ εἰς τὸν ἐνιαυτὸν κειμένη δαπάνη εἰς τὸν μῆνα δαπανᾶται. καὶ ὅταν ἔρια εἰσενεχθῆ σοι, ἐπιμελητέον, ὅπως καλῶς ἐδώδιμος γίγνηται. καὶ ὅ γε ξηρὸς σῖτος ὅπως καλῶς ἐδώδιμος γίγνηται, ἐπιμελητέον. ἐν μέντοι τῶν σοὶ προσηκόντων, ἔφην ἐγώ, ἐπιμελημάτων ἴσως ἀχαριστότερον δόξει εἶναι, ὅτι δς ἂν κάμνη τῶν οἰκετῶν, τούτων σοι ἐπιμελητέον πάντων, ὅπως θεραπεύηται.

Νη Δί, ἔφη ή γυνή, ἐπιχαριτώτατον μὲν οὖν, ἢν μέλλωσί γε οἱ καλῶς θεραπευθέντες χάριν εἴσεσθαι καὶ εὐνούστεροι ἢ πρόσθεν ἔσεσθαι.

Καὶ ἐγώ, ἔφη ὁ Ἰσχόμαχος, ἀγασθεὶς αὐτῆς τὴν ἀπόκρισιν εἶπον ἸΑρά γε, ὧ γύναι, διὰ τοιαύτας τινὰς προνοίας καὶ τῆς ἐν τῷ σμήνει ἡγεμόνος αὶ μέλιτται οὕτω διατίθενται πρὸς αὐτήν, ὥστε ὅταν ἐκείνη ἐκ-

35

36

37

she apportions a fair share to each. She likewise presides over the weaving of the combs in the hive, that they may be well and quickly woven, and cares that the brood of little ones be duly reared up. And when the young bees have been duly reared and are fit for work, she sends them off to found a colony, with a leader to guide the new generation.'

"Then shall I too have to do this?' said my wife.

"'Indeed you will,' I said; 'your duty will be to stay indoors and dispatch those slaves whose work is outside, and superintend those who are to work indoors, and to receive what comes in and dispense as much of it as must be spent, and watch over as much as is to be kept in reserve, and take care that the amount stored up for a year is not spent in a month. And when wool is brought in to you, you must see that clothing is made for those who need it. You must also see to it that the dry grain is in good condition for making food. One of the duties that fall to you, however, will perhaps seem rather thankless: you will have to see that any slave who falls ill is cared for.'

"'Oh no,' cried my wife, 'it will be charming if those who are well cared for prove to feel grateful and more loyal than before.'

"I was delighted with her answer and replied, What makes the bees so devoted to their queen in the hive, wife, that when she abandons it they all follow her and not one

453

35

36

37

### XENOPHON

λίπη, οὐδεμία οἴεται τῶν μελιττῶν ἀπολειπτέον εἶναι, ἀλλ' ἔπονται πᾶσαι:

Καὶ ἡ γυνή μοι ἀπεκρίνατο, Θαυμάζοιμ' ἄν, ἔφη, εἰ μὴ πρὸς σὲ μᾶλλον τείνοι τὰ τοῦ ἡγεμόνος ἔργα ἢ πρὸς ἐμέ. ἡ γὰρ ἐμὴ φυλακὴ τῶν ἔνδον καὶ διανομὴ γελοία τις ἄν οἶμαι φαίνοιτο, εἰ μὴ σύγε ἐπιμελοῖο, ὅπως ἔξωθέν τι εἰσφέροιτο.

Γελοία δ' αὖ, ἔφην ἐγώ, ἡ ἐμὴ εἰσφορὰ φαίνοιτ' ἄν, εἰ μὴ εἴη ὅστις τὰ εἰσενεχθέντα σώζοι. οὐχ ὁρậς, ἔφην ἐγώ, οἱ εἰς τὸν τετρημένον πίθον ἀντλεῖν λεγόμενοι ὡς οἰκτείρονται, ὅτι μάτην πονεῖν δοκοῦσι;

Νὴ  $\Delta \hat{\iota}$ , ἔφη ἡ γυνή, καὶ γὰρ τλήμονές εἰσιν, εἰ τοῦτό γε ποιοῦσιν.

Ἄλλαι δέ τοι, ἔφην ἐγώ, ἴδιαι ἐπιμέλειαι, ὧ γυναι, ἡδεῖαί σοι γίγνονται, ὁπόταν ἀνεπιστήμονα ταλασίας λαβοῦσα ἐπιστήμονα ποιήσης καὶ διπλασίου σοι ἀξία γένηται καὶ ὁπόταν ἀνεπιστήμονα ταμιείας καὶ διακονίας παραλαβοῦσα ἐπιστήμονα καὶ πιστὴν καὶ διακονικὴν ποιησαμένη παντὸς ἀξίαν ἔχης καὶ ὁπόταν τοὺς μὲν σώφρονάς τε καὶ ἀφελίμους τῷ σῷ οἴκῳ ἐξῆ σοι εὖ ποιῆσαι, ἐὰν δέ τις πονηρὸς φαίνηται, ἐξῆ σοι κολάσαι. τὸ δὲ πάντων ἤδιστον, ἐὰν βελτίων ἐμοῦ φανῆς καὶ ἐμὲ σὸν θεράποντα ποιήση καὶ μὴ δέῃ σε φοβεῖσθαι, μὴ προϊούσης τῆς ἡλικίας ἀτιμοτέρα ἐν τῷ οἴκῳ γένῃ, ἀλλὰ πιστεύῃς, ὅτι πρεσβυτέρα γιγνομένη ὅσῳ ἂν καὶ ἐμοὶ κοινωνὸς καὶ παισὶν οἴκου φύλαξ ἀμείνων γίγνῃ, τοσούτῳ καὶ τιμιωτέρα ἐν τῷ οἴκῳ ἔσῃ. τὰ γὰρ καλά τε κάγαθά, ἐγὼ ἔφην, οὐ διὰ

39

40

41

42

# OECONOMICUS 7.38-7.43

thinks of staying behind? Isn't it because of some such thoughtful acts on her part?

"'It would surprise me,' answered my wife, 'if the leader's activities did not apply to you more than me. For my care of the goods indoors and my management would look rather ridiculous, I suppose, if you did not see to it that something is gathered in from outside.'

"'And my ingathering would look ridiculous,' I countered, 'were there not someone to look after what is gathered in. Don't you see how people pity those who draw water in a leaky jar, as the saying goes, because they seem to labor in vain?'

"'Of course,' she said, 'for they are truly in a miserable plight if they do that.'

"But I assure you, wife, there are other duties particular to you that are pleasant to perform: to teach spinning to a slave who had no knowledge of it when you received her, and to double her value to you: to take in hand a girl who is ignorant of housekeeping and service, and after teaching her and making her trustworthy and serviceable to end up with someone invaluable: to have the power of rewarding the well-behaved and useful members of your household and of punishing anyone who turns out to be bad. But the most pleasant experience of all is to prove yourself better than I am, to make me your servant; and so far from having reason to fear that as you grow older you may be less honored in the household, to feel confident that with advancing years, the better partner you prove to me and the better guardian of the estate for our children, the greater will be the honor paid to you in the household. For it is not because of youthful charms that

. \_\_\_

39

40

4

42

#### XENOPHON

τὰς ώραιότητας, ἀλλὰ διὰ τὰς ἀρετὰς εἰς τὸν βίον τοῖς ἀνθρώποις ἐπαύξεται.

Τοιαῦτα μέν, ὧ Σώκρατες, δοκῶ μεμνῆσθαι αὐτῆ τὰ πρῶτα διαλεχθείς.

8. Η καὶ ἐπέγνως τι, ὧ Ἰσχόμαχε, ἔφην ἐγώ, ἐκ τούτων αὐτὴν κεκινημένην μᾶλλον πρὸς τὴν ἐπιμέλειαν; Ναὶ μὰ Δί, ἔφη ὁ Ἰσχόμαχος, καὶ δηχθεῖσάν γε οἶδα αὐτὴν καὶ ἐρυθριάσασαν σφόδρα, ὅτι τῶν εἰσενεχθέντων τι αἰτήσαντος έμοῦ οὐκ εἶχέ μοι δοῦναι, καὶ ἐγὼ μέντοι ἰδὼν ἀχθεσθεῖσαν αὐτὴν εἶπον, Μηδέν τι, έφην, άθυμήσης, ώ γύναι, ὅτι οὐκ έχεις δοῦναι ὅ σε αἰτῶν τυγχάνω. ἔστι μὲν γὰρ πενία αύτη σαφής, τὸ δεόμενόν τινος μὴ ἔχειν χρησθαι. άλυποτέρα δὲ αὕτη ἡ ἔνδεια, τὸ ζητοῦντά τι μὴ δύνασθαι λαβείν ἢ τὴν ἀρχὴν μηδὲ ζητείν εἰδότα, ὅτι οὐκ *ἔστιν.* ἀλλὰ γάρ, ἔφην ἐγώ, τούτων οὐ σὺ αἰτία, ἀλλ' έγω οὐ τάξας σοι παρέδωκα, ὅπου χρὴ ἔκαστα κεῖσθαι, ὅπως εἰδῆς, ὅπου τε δεῖ τιθέναι καὶ ὁπόθεν λαμβάνειν. ἔστι δ' οὐδὲν οὕτως, ὧ γύναι, οὕτ' εὕχρηστον οὖτε καλὸν ἀνθρώποις ὡς τάξις, καὶ γὰρ χορὸς ἐξ άνθρώπων συγκείμενός έστιν άλλ' ὅταν μὲν ποιῶσιν ο τι αν τύχη εκαστος, ταραχή τις φαίνεται καὶ θεασθαι ἀτερπές, ὅταν δὲ τεταγμένως ποιῶσι καὶ φθέγγωνται, ἄμα οἱ αὐτοὶ οὖτοι καὶ ἀξιοθέατοι δοκοῦσιν 4 είναι καὶ ἀξιάκουστοι. καὶ στρατιά γε, ἔφην ἐγώ, ὧ γύναι, ἄτακτος μεν οὖσα ταραχωδέστατον καὶ τοῖς μεν πολεμίοις εὐχειρωτότατον, τοῖς δε φίλοις ἀγλευκέστατον δράν καὶ ἀχρηστότατον, ὄνος δμοῦ, ὁπλίτης,

#### OECONOMICUS 7.43-8.4

the sum of things good and beautiful in human life is increased, but through practice of the virtues.'

"Such was the tenor of my earliest talks with her, Socrates, so far as I can recall them."

8. "And did you find, Ischomachus, that they acted as a stimulus to her diligence?" I asked.

"Yes indeed," answered Ischomachus, "and I recall that she was stung and blushed crimson because she could not give me something from the stores when I asked for it. And seeing that she was annoyed, I said: 'Don't worry, wife, because you can't give me what I happen to ask for. To be unable to use something when you need it is poverty unquestionably; but failure to lay hands on something that you're looking for is less painful than not to seek it at all because you know that it's not there. The fact is, this is not your fault, but mine, because I handed over the household to you without giving directions where anything was to be put, so that you might know where to put things and where to find them. There is nothing, wife, so convenient or so good for human beings as order. For instance, a chorus is a combination of people; but when its members do as they please, it becomes mere confusion, and there is no pleasure in watching it; but when they move and sing in an orderly fashion, then those same people at once seem worth watching and worth hearing. Again, wife, an army in disorder is a confused mass, an easy prey to enemies, a disgusting sight to allies and utterly useless,—donkey,

457

2

### XENOPHON

σκευοφόρος, ψιλός, ίππεύς, ἄμαξα. πῶς γὰρ ἂν πορευθείησαν, έὰν ἔχοντες οὕτως ἐπικωλύσωσιν ἀλλήλους, ὁ μὲν βαδίζων τὸν τρέχοντα, ὁ δὲ τρέχων τὸν έστηκότα, ή δὲ ἄμαξα τὸν ἱππέα, ὁ δὲ ὄνος τὴν ἄμαξαν, ὁ δὲ σκευοφόρος τὸν ὁπλίτην; εἰ δὲ καὶ μάχεσθαι 5 δέοι, πῶς ἂν οὕτως ἔχοντες μαχέσαιντο; οἷς γὰρ ανάγκη αὐτῶν τοὺς ἐπιόντας Φεύγειν, οὖτοι ίκανοί είσι φεύγοντες καταπατήσαι τοὺς ὅπλα ἔχοντας. τεταγμένη δὲ στρατιὰ κάλλιστον μὲν ἰδεῖν τοῖς φίλοις, δυσχερέστατον δὲ τοῖς πολεμίοις. τίς μὲν γὰρ οὐκ αν φίλος ήδέως θεάσαιτο όπλίτας πολλούς έν τάξει πορευομένους, τίς δ' οὐκ ἂν θαυμάσειεν ίππέας κατὰ τάξεις έλαύνοντας, τίς δε οὐκ ἂν πολέμιος φοβηθείη ίδων διευκρινημένους όπλίτας, ίππέας, πελταστάς, τοξότας, σφενδονήτας καὶ τοῖς ἄρχουσι τεταγμένως έπομένους; άλλὰ καὶ πορευομένων έν τάξει, κἂν πολλαὶ μυριάδες ὧσιν, ὁμοίως ὥσπερ εἶς ἔκαστος καθ' ήσυχίαν πάντες πορεύονται είς γὰρ τὸ κενούμενον άεὶ οἱ ὅπισθεν ἐπέρχονται. καὶ τριήρης δέ τοι ἡ σεσαγμένη ἀνθρώπων διὰ τί ἄλλο φοβερόν ἐστι πολεμίοις ἢ φίλοις ἀξιοθέατον ἢ ὅτι ταχὺ πλεῖ; διὰ τί δὲ ἄλλο ἄλυποι ἀλλήλοις εἰσὶν οἱ ἐμπλέοντες ἢ διότι έν τάξει μεν κάθηνται, έν τάξει δε προνεύουσιν, έν τάξει δ' ἀναπίπτουσιν, έν τάξει δ' έμβαίνουσι καὶ έκβαίνουσιν; ή δ' ἀταξία ὅμοιόν τί μοι δοκεῖ εἶναι οἷόν-9 περ εί γεωργὸς όμοῦ ἐμβάλοι κριθὰς καὶ πυροὺς καὶ ὄσπρια, κἄπειτα ὁπότε δέοι ἢ μάζης ἢ ἄρτου ἢ ὄψου, διαλέγειν δέοι αὐτῷ ἀντὶ τοῦ λαβόντα διευκρινημένοις χρησθαι.

### OECONOMICUS 8 4-8 9

trooper, carrier, light-armed, horseman, chariot, all jumbled together. 15 How are they to march in such a state, when they hamper one another, some walking while others run, some running while others stand, chariot colliding with horseman, donkey with chariot, carrier with trooper? If there is fighting to be done as well, how can they fight in such a state? For the units that were forced to run away under attack are enough to trample underfoot the heavy infantry. But an army in orderly array is a noble sight to allies, and most unwelcome to the enemy. What ally would not rejoice to watch a strong body of troopers marching in order, would not admire cavalry advancing in squadrons? And what enemy would not quake to see troopers, horsemen, light-armed, archers, slingers disposed in serried ranks and following their officers in orderly fashion? Yes, where order is kept, even on the march, though they number tens of thousands, all move steadily forward as one man; for the line behind is continually filling up the gap. Or again, why is a trireme laden with men frightening to an enemy and worth watching to allies, if not for its speed? Why do the men on board not hamper one another? Is it not precisely because they are seated in order, swing forward and backward in order, embark and disembark in order? If I want a similar example of disorder, I think of a farmer who has stored barley, wheat and beans all in one bin, and then when he wants a barley cake or bread or a side dish, must sort through the pile instead of finding them all carefully grouped and ready for use.'

15 Cyr. 6.3.25; Mem. 3.1.7.

Καὶ σὺ οὖν, ὧ γύναι, εἰ τοῦ μὲν ταράχου τούτου 10 μη δέοιο, βούλοιο δ' άκριβως διοικείν τὰ ὄντα είδεναι καὶ τῶν ὄντων εὐπόρως λαμβάνουσα ὅτω ἄν δέη χρῆσθαι καὶ ἐμοί, ἐάν τι αἰτῶ, ἐν χάριτι διδόναι, χώραν τε δοκιμασώμεθα την προσήκουσαν έκάστοις έχειν καὶ ἐν ταύτη θέντες διδάξωμεν τὴν διάκονον λαμβάνειν τε έντεῦθεν καὶ κατατιθέναι πάλιν εἰς ταύτην καὶ ούτως εἰσόμεθα τά τε σῶα ὄντα καὶ τὰ μή ἡ γὰρ χώρα αὐτὴ τὸ μὴ ὂν ποθήσει καὶ ‹τὸ›¹0 δεόμενον θεραπείας έξετάσει ή όψις καὶ τὸ εἰδέναι, ὅπου ἕκαστόν έστι, ταχὺ έγχειριεῖ, ὥστε μὴ ἀπορεῖν χρῆσθαι. 11

Καλλίστην δέ ποτε καὶ ἀκριβεστάτην ἔδοξα σκευών τάξιν ίδειν, ὧ Σώκρατες, εἰσβὰς ἐπὶ θέαν εἰς τὸ μέγα πλοίον τὸ Φοινικικόν. πλείστα γὰρ σκεύη ἐν σμικροτάτω ἀγγείω διακεχωρισμένα έθεασάμην. διὰ πολλών μεν γάρ δήπου, έφη, ξυλίνων σκευών καὶ πλεκτών δρμίζεται ναῦς καὶ ἀνάγεται, διὰ πολλών δὲ τῶν κρεμαστῶν καλουμένων πλεῖ, πολλοῖς δὲ μηχανήμασιν ἀνθώπλισται πρὸς τὰ πολέμια πλοία, πολλὰ δὲ ὅπλα τοῖς ἀνδράσι συμπεριάγει, πάντα δὲ σκεύη, οσοισπερ εν οικία χρώνται ανθρωποι, τη συσσιτία έκάστη κομίζει γέμει δὲ παρὰ πάντα φορτίων, ὅσα ναύκληρος κέρδους ένεκα ἄγεται, καὶ ὅσα λέγω, ἔφη, 13 έγώ, πάντα οὐκ έν πολλώ τινι μείζονι χώρα ἔκειτο ἢ έν < έν >δεκακλίνω 11 στέγη συμμέτρω, καὶ οὕτω κείμενα

<sup>10</sup> suppl. Hirschig

<sup>11</sup> suppl. Pomeroy

#### OECONOMICUS 8.10-8.13

"'And so, you too, wife, if you don't want such confusion but wish to know exactly how to manage our property, and to find with ease whatever we need to use, and to please me by giving me whatever I ask for, let's choose the appropriate place for each item, and when we have put everything in its place, let's instruct the maid to take it from that place and put it back there again. That way we will know what is safe and sound and what is not; for the place itself will miss whatever is not in it, and a glance will reveal anything that needs attention, and the knowledge where each thing is will quickly bring it to hand, so that we can use it without trouble.'

"Once I had an opportunity to board and look over the great Phoenician merchant ship, Socrates, and I believe I have never seen tackle so excellently and accurately arranged. For I saw a great deal of equipment stowed separately in a very small receptacle. As you know, a ship needs a great many wooden and corded implements when she comes into port or puts to sea, much rigging, as it is called, when she sails, many devices to protect her against enemy vessels; she carries a large supply of weapons for the crew, and contains all the same utensils that people use for each meal together at home. In addition to all this, she is laden with cargo which the skipper carries for profit. And all the things I mention were contained in an area not much bigger than a dining room with eleven couches. 16 And I no-

 $^{16}$  About 21 × 21 feet, large by Greek standards but appropriate for a man of Ischomachus' wealth and social status.

10

11

12

έκαστα κατενόησα, ώς οὔτε ἄλληλα ἐμποδίζει οὔτε μαστευτοῦ δεῖται οὔτε ἀσυσκεύαστά ἐστιν οὔτε δυσλύτως έχει, ώστε διατριβήν παρέχειν, όταν τω ταχύ δέη χρησθαι, τὸν δὲ τοῦ κυβερνήτου διάκονον, δς 14 πρωρεύς της νεώς καλείται, οὕτως εὖρον ἐπιστάμενον έκάστην τὴν χώραν, ώς καὶ ἀπὼν ἂν εἴποι, ὅπου έκαστα κείται καὶ ὁπόσα ἐστὶν οὐδὲν ἡττον ἢ ὁ γράμματα ἐπιστάμενος είποι ἂν Σωκράτους καὶ ὁπόσα γράμματα καὶ ὅπου ἐκάστων τέτακται, εἶδον δέ, ἔφη 15 ό Ἰσχόμαχος, καὶ έξετάζοντα τοῦτον αὐτὸν ἐν τῆ σχολή πάντα, ὁπόσοις ἄρα δεῖ ἐν τῷ πλοίῳ χρήσθαι. θαυμάσας δέ, ἔφη, τὴν ἐπίσκεψιν αὐτοῦ ἠρόμην, τί πράττοι. ὁ δ' εἶπεν, Ἐπισκοπῶ, ἔφη, ὧ ξένε, εἴ τι συμβαίνει γίγνεσθαι, πως κείται, ἔφη, τὰ ἐν τῆ νηί, η εί τι αποστατεί η εί δυστραπέλως τι σύγκειται. ού 16 γάρ, ἔφη, ἐγχωρεῖ, ὅταν χειμάζη ὁ θεὸς ἐν τῆ θαλάττη, οὔτε μαστεύειν ὅτου ἂν δέη οὔτε δυστραπέλως ἔχον διδόναι. ἀπειλεῖ γὰρ ὁ θεὸς καὶ κολάζει τοὺς βλᾶκας. έὰν δὲ μόνον μὴ ἀπολέση τοὺς μὴ ἁμαρτάνοντας, πάνυ άγαπητόν έὰν δὲ καὶ πάνυ καλῶς ὑπηρετοῦντας σώζη, πολλή χάρις, ἔφη, τοῖς θεοῖς.

Έγὼ οὖν κατιδὼν ταύτην τὴν ἀκρίβειαν τῆς κατασκευῆς ἔλεγον τῆ γυναικί, ὅτι πάνυ ἃν ἡμῶν εἴη βλακικόν, εἰ οἱ μὲν ἐν τοῖς πλοίοις καὶ μικροῖς οὖσι χώρας εὐρίσκουσι καὶ σαλεύοντες ἰσχυρῶς ὅμως σώζουσι τὴν τάξιν καὶ ὑπερφοβούμενοι ὅμως εὑρίσκουσι τὸ δέον λαμβάνειν, ἡμεῖς δὲ καὶ διηρημένων ἑκάστοις θηκῶν ἐν τῆ οἰκία μεγάλων καὶ βεβηκυίας τῆς οἰκίας

# OECONOMICUS 8.13-8.17

ticed that each kind of thing was so neatly stowed away that there was no confusion, no work for a searcher, nothing out of place, no troublesome untying to cause delay when anything was needed for immediate use. I found that the pilot's mate, who is called the lookout, knows each particular section so exactly that he can tell even when ashore where everything is kept and how much there is of it, just as well as a man who knows how to spell can tell how many letters there are in Socrates and in what order they come. Now I saw this man in his spare time inspecting everything that is needed as a matter of course on the ship.17 I was surprised to see him looking them over and asked what he was doing. 'Sir,' he answered, 'I am looking to see how the ship's equipment is stored, in case of any accident, or whether anything is missing or mixed up with other equipment. For when the god raises a storm at sea, there's no time to look around for what you need or to issue something that's all jumbled. For the god threatens and punishes slackers. You're lucky if he merely refrains from destroying the innocent; and if he also saves you when you do your work well, you have great cause to thank the gods.'

"Now after seeing the ship's tackle in such perfect order, I told my wife: 'Considering that people aboard a merchant vessel, even if it's a little one, find room for things and keep order, though tossed violently to and fro, and find what they want to get, though terror stricken, it would be utter slackness on our part if we, who have large storerooms in our house to keep everything separate and 15

16

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>17</sup> Or, more probably, "during the voyage."

#### XENOPHON

έν δαπέδω εἰ μὴ ευρήσομεν καλὴν καὶ εὐεύρετον χώραν έκάστοις αὐτῶν, πῶς οὐκ ἂν πολλὴ ἡμῶν ἀσυνεσία εἴη;

Ώς μὲν δὴ ἀγαθὸν τετάχθαι σκευῶν κατασκευὴν 18 καὶ ὡς ράδιον χώραν ἐκάστοις αὐτῶν εύρεῖν ἐν οἰκία θείναι ως έκάστοις συμφέρει, είρηται ως δε καλον 19 φαίνεται, έπειδαν ύποδήματα έφεξης κέηται, καν όποια ή, καλὸν δὲ ιμάτια κεχωρισμένα ιδείν, κἂν όποῖα ἢ, καλὸν δὲ στρώματα, καλὸν δὲ χαλκία, καλὸν δὲ τὰ ἀμφὶ τραπέζας, καλὸν δὲ καὶ ὃ πάντων καταγελάσειεν ἂν μάλιστα οὐχ ὁ σεμνὸς ἀλλ' ὁ κομψός, ότι καὶ χύτρας φημὶ εὔρυθμον φαίνεσθαι εὐκρινῶς 20 κειμένας τὰ δὲ ἄλλα ἤδη που ἀπὸ τούτου ἄπαντα καλλίω φαίνεται κατὰ κόσμον κείμενα χορὸς γὰρ σκευῶν ἔκαστα φαίνεται, καὶ τὸ μέσον δὲ πάντων τούτων καλὸν φαίνεται, ἐκποδων ἑκάστου κειμένου ώσπερ κύκλιος χορὸς οὐ μόνον αὐτὸς καλὸν θέαμά έστιν, άλλὰ καὶ τὸ μέσον αὐτοῦ καλὸν καὶ καθαρὸν φαίνεται.

21 Εἰ δ' ἀληθή ταῦτα λέγω, ἔξεστιν, ἔφην, ὧ γύναι, καὶ πεῖραν λαμβάνειν αὐτῶν οὔτε τι ζημιωθέντας οὔτε τι πολλὰ πονήσαντας. ἀλλὰ μὴν οὐδὲ τοῦτο δεῖ ἀθυμῆσαι, ὧ γύναι, ἔφην ἐγώ, ὡς χαλεπὸν εὐρεῖν τὸν μαθησόμενον τε τὰς χώρας καὶ μεμνησόμενον κατα22 χωρίζειν ἔκαστα. ἴσμεν γὰρ δήπου, ὅτι μυριοπλάσια ἡμῶν ἄπαντα ἔχει ἡ πᾶσα πόλις, ἀλλ' ὅμως ὁποῖον ἄν τῶν οἰκετῶν κελεύσης πριάμενόν τί σοι ἐξ ἀγορᾶς ἐνεγκεῖν, οὐδεὶς ἀπορήσει, ἀλλὰ πᾶς εἰδὼς φανεῖται,

### OECONOMICUS 8.17-8.22

whose house rests on solid ground, fail to find a good and handy place for everything. Would it not be sheer stupidity on our part?

"'I have already told you how fine it is to keep one's stock of utensils in order, and how easy to find a suitable place in a house for each set. And what a beautiful sight it is when shoes lie in rows, all in their own proper places! How beautiful it is to see clothes sorted, all in their own proper places! and blankets, and bronze ware, or table ware! Although a witty man might find it absolutely hilarious but not a serious man, I claim that even pots and pans look graceful when set out in discriminating fashion. It follows that everything else seems somehow more beautiful when set out in order. For each set looks like a chorus of utensils, and the space between the sets is beautiful to see when each set is kept clear of it, just as a cyclic chorus is not only a beautiful spectacle in itself but the free space looks beautiful and unencumbered.'

"'We can test the truth of what I say, wife, without any inconvenience and with very little trouble. What's more, wife, there is no reason for any misgiving that it is hard to find someone who will get to know the various places and remember to put each set in its proper place. For surely we know that the city as a whole has ten thousand times as much of everything as we have, and yet you may order any of the slaves to buy something in the market and bring it home, and none will be at a loss: every one of them is

18 The dithyrambic chorus of fifty that danced around an altar.

18

19

20

ὅποι χρὴ ἐλθόντα λαβεῖν ἔκαστα. τούτου μέντοι, ἔφην ἐγώ, οὐδὲν ἄλλο αἴτιόν ἐστιν ἢ ὅτι ἐν χώρᾳ ἔκαστον<sup>12</sup> κεῖται τεταγμένη. ἄνθρωπον δέ γε ζητῶν, καὶ ταῦτα ἐνίοτε ἀντιζητοῦντα, πολλάκις ἄν τις πρότερον πρὶν εὑρεῖν ἀπείποι. καὶ τούτου αὖ οὐδὲν ἄλλο αἴτιόν ἐστιν ἢ τὸ μὴ εἶναι τεταγμένον, ὅπου ἔκαστον δεῖ ἀναμένειν.

Περὶ μὲν δὴ τάξεως σκευῶν καὶ χρήσεως τοιαῦτα αὐτῆ διαλεχθεὶς δοκῶ μεμνῆσθαι.

9. Καὶ τί δή; ἡ γυνὴ ἐδόκει σοι, ἔφην ἐγώ, ὧ Ἰσχόμαχε, πώς τι ὑπακούειν ὧν σὺ ἐσπούδαζες διδάσκων;

Τί δέ, εἰ μὴ ὑπισχνεῖτό γε ἐπιμελήσεσθαι καὶ φανερὰ ἦν ἡδομένη ἰσχυρῶς, ὥσπερ ἐξ ἀμηχανίας εὐπορίαν τινὰ εὑρηκυῖα, καὶ ἐδεῖτό μου ὡς τάχιστα ἦπερ ἔλεγον διατάξαι.

Καὶ πῶς δή, ἔφην ἐγώ, ὧ Ἰσχόμαχε, διέταξας αὐτῆ;

Τί δέ, εἰ μὴ τῆς οἰκίας τὴν δύναμιν ἔδοξέ μοι πρῶτον ἐπιδείξαι αὐτῆ. οὐ γὰρ ποικίλμασι πολλοῖς<sup>13</sup> κεκόσμηται, ὧ Σώκρατες, ἀλλὰ τὰ οἰκήματα ὤκοδόμηται πρὸς αὐτὸ τοῦτο ἐσκεμμένα, ὅπως ἀγγεία ὡς συμφορώτατα ἢ τοῖς μέλλουσιν ἐν αὐτοῖς ἔσεσθαι, ὥστε αὐτὰ ἐκάλει τὰ πρέποντα εἶναι ἑκάστφ. ὁ μὲν γὰρ θάλαμος ἐν ὀχυρῷ ὢν τὰ πλείστου ἄξια καὶ στρώματα καὶ σκεύη παρεκάλει, τὰ δὲ ξηρὰ τῶν στεγῶν τὸν σῖτον, τὰ δὲ ψυχεινὰ τὸν οἶνον, τὰ δὲ φανὰ ὅσα φάους δεόμενα ἔργα τε καὶ σκεύη ἐστί. καὶ διαιτητήρια δὲ τοῖς ἀνθρώποις ἐπεδείκνυον αὐτῆ κεκαλ-

23

2.

bound to know where to go to get each item. Now the only reason for this is that everything is kept in a specific place. But when you are searching for a person, you often fail to find him, though he may be searching for you himself. And for this again the one reason is that no meeting place has been assigned.'

23

"That is the gist of the conversation I think I remember having with her about the arrangement of utensils and their use."

9. "And what was the result?" I asked; "Did you think, Ischomachus, that your wife paid any attention to the lessons you tried so earnestly to teach her?"

"In fact she promised to attend to them and visibly took deep pleasure in having found a solution of her perplexity, and she begged me to lose no time in arranging things as I had described."

"And how did you arrange things for her, Ischomachus?" I asked.

"Well, I decided first to show her the possibilities of our house. For it contains few elaborate decorations, Socrates; but the rooms are designed for this very purpose, to provide as convenient receptacles as possible for the things that are to be kept in them, and thus each room invited just what was suited to it. Thus the inner chamber by the security of its position called for the most valuable bedding and furniture, the dry covered rooms for the grain, the cool for the wine, the well lit for those works of art and vessels that need light. I showed her decorated living

<sup>12</sup> ἔκαστον pap.: omm. codd.

<sup>13</sup> πολλοι̂s pap.: omm. codd.

### XENOPHON

λωπισμένα τοῦ μὲν θέρους ψυχεινά, τοῦ δὲ χειμῶνος άλεεινά, καὶ σύμπασαν δὲ τὴν οἰκίαν ἐπέδειξα αὐτῆ ότι πρὸς μεσημβρίαν ἀναπέπταται, ὥστε εὔδηλον εἶναι, ὅτι χειμῶνος μὲν εὐήλιός ἐστι, τοῦ δὲ θέρους εὔσκιος, έδειξα δε καὶ τὴν γυναικωνίτιν αὐτῆ, θύρα βαλανωτή ώρισμένην άπο τής άνδρωνίτιδος, ἵνα μήτε έκφέρηται ἔνδοθεν ὅ τι μὴ δεῖ μήτε τεκνοποιῶνται οἱ οἰκέται ἄνευ τῆς ἡμετέρας γνώμης, οἱ μὲν γὰρ χρηστοὶ παιδοποιησάμενοι εὐνούστεροι ώς ἐπὶ τὸ πολύ, οί δὲ πονηροὶ συζυγέντες εὐπορώτεροι πρὸς τὸ κακουργείν γίγνονται.

Έπεὶ δὲ ταῦτα διήλθομεν, ἔφη, οὕτω δὴ ἤδη κατὰ φυλάς διεκρίνομεν τὰ ἔπιπλα. ἡρχόμεθα δὲ πρῶτον, έφη, άθροίζοντες οἷς άμφὶ θυσίας χρώμεθα. μετὰ ταῦτα κόσμον γυναικὸς τὸν εἰς έορτὰς διηροῦμεν, έσθητα άνδρὸς την είς έορτὰς καὶ πόλεμον καὶ στρώματα έν γυναικωνίτιδι, στρώματα έν άνδρωνίτιδι, 7 ύποδήματα γυναικεία, ύποδήματα ἀνδρεία. ὅπλων άλλη φυλή, άλλη ταλασιουργικών ὀργάνων, άλλη σιτοποιικών, άλλη όψοποιικών, άλλη τών άμφὶ λουτρόν, ἄλλη ἀμφὶ μάκτρας, ἄλλη ἀμφὶ τραπέζας, καὶ ταῦτα πάντα διεχωρίσαμεν, οἶς τε ἀεὶ δεῖ χρῆσθαι, καὶ τὰ θοινατικά. χωρὶς δὲ καὶ τὰ κατὰ μῆνα δαπανώμενα ἀφείλομεν, δίχα δὲ καὶ τὰ εἰς ἐνιαυτὸν ἀπολελογισμένα κατέθεμεν, ούτω γὰρ ἦττον λανθάνει, ὅπως πρὸς τὸ τέλος ἐκβήσεται. ἐπεὶ δὲ ἐχωρίσαμεν πάντα κατὰ φυλὰς τὰ ἔπιπλα, είς τὰς χώρας τὰς προσηκούσας ξκαστα διηνέγκαμεν. μετὰ δὲ τοῦτο ὅσοις μὲν

5

### OECONOMICUS 9.4-9.9

rooms for the family that are cool in summer and warm in winter. <sup>19</sup> I showed her that the whole house fronts south, so that it was obviously sunny in winter and shady in summer. I showed her the women's quarters too, separated by a bolted door from the men's, so that nothing that ought not to be moved may be taken out, and that the slaves may not breed without our permission. For honest slaves generally prove more loyal if they have produced children, while bad ones, if coupled, become all the more prone to mischief.

"And now that we had completed the tour, we set about separating the furniture 'tribe by tribe.' We began by gathering the vessels we use for sacrifices. After that we sorted the women's holiday finery, and the men's holiday and war garb, bedding in the women's, bedding in the men's quarters, women's shoes, men's shoes. Another tribe consisted of weapons, and three others of implements for spinning, for bread making, and for cooking; others again for washing, at the kneading trough, and for table use. All these we divided into two sets, things in constant use and things reserved for festivities. We also set aside the supplies that are consumed within the month and stored separately those calculated to last for a year; that way we are less likely to misjudge how much will be there at the end. When we had divided all the portable property tribe by tribe, we arranged everything in its proper place. After

<sup>19</sup> Mem. 3.8.9.

#### XENOPHON

τῶν σκευῶν καθ' ἡμέραν χρῶνται οἱ οἰκέται, οἶον σιτοποιικοῖς, ὀψοποιικοῖς, ταλασιουργικοῖς, καὶ εἴ τι ἄλλο τοιοῦτον, ταῦτα μὲν αὐτοῖς τοῖς χρωμένοις δείξαντες ὅπου δεῖ τιθέναι παρεδώκαμεν καὶ ἐπετάξαμεν σῶα παρέχειν ὅσοις δ' εἰς ἑορτὰς ἢ ξενοδοκίας χρώμεθα ἢ εἰς τὰς διὰ χρόνου πράξεις, ταῦτα δὲ τῆ ταμία παρεδώκαμεν καὶ δείξαντες τὰς χώρας αὐτῶν καὶ ἀπαριθμήσαντες καὶ γραψάμενοι ἔκαστα εἴπομεν αὐτῆ διδόναι τούτων ὅτῳ δέοι ἔκαστον, καὶ μεμνῆσθαι ὅ τι ἄν τῳ διδῷ, καὶ ἀπολαμβάνουσαν κατατιθέναι πάλιν ὅθενπερ ἂν ἔκαστα λαμβάνη.

Τὴν δὲ ταμίαν ἐποιησάμεθα ἐπισκεψάμενοι, ήτις ήμιν έδόκει είναι έγκρατεστάτη και γαστρός και οίνου καὶ ὕπνου καὶ ἀνδρῶν συνουσίας, πρὸς τούτοις δὲ ή τὸ μνημονικὸν μάλιστα ἐδόκει ἔχειν καὶ τὸ προνοεῖν, μή τι κακὸν λάβη παρ' ἡμῶν ἀμελοῦσα, καὶ σκοπείν, ὅπως χαριζομένη τι ἡμίν ὑφ' ἡμῶν ἀντιτιμήσεται. έδιδάσκομεν δε αὐτὴν καὶ εὐνοϊκῶς ἔχειν πρὸς ήμας, ὅτ' εὐφραινοίμεθα, τῶν εὐφροσυνῶν μεταδιδόντες καὶ εἴ τι λυπηρὸν εἴη, εἰς ταῦτα παρακαλοῦντες. καὶ τὸ προθυμεῖσθαι δὲ συναύξειν τὸν οἶκον ἐπαιδεύομεν αὐτὴν ἐπιγιγνώσκειν αὐτὴν ποιοῦντες καὶ τῆς εύπραγίας αὐτῆ μεταδιδόντες. καὶ δικαιοσύνην δ' αὐτή ἐνεποιοῦμεν τιμιωτέρους τιθέντες τοὺς δικαίους τῶν ἀδίκων καὶ ἐπιδεικνύοντες πλουσιώτερον καὶ έλευθεριώτερον βιοτεύοντας των άδίκων καὶ αὐτὴν δὲ έν ταύτη τῆ χώρα κατετάττομεν.

Έπὶ δὲ τούτοις πᾶσιν εἶπον, ἔφη, ὧ Σώκρατες, ἐγὼ

10

11

12

13

### OECONOMICUS 9.9-9.14

that we showed the slaves who have to use them where to keep the utensils they require daily, for baking, cooking, spinning and so forth; handed them over to their care and charged them to see that they were safe and sound. The things that we use only for festivals or entertaining guests, or on rare occasions, we handed over to the housekeeper, and after showing her their places and counting and making a written inventory of all the items, we told her to dispense what each slave needed but to remember what she had given to each of them, and when she got it back to put it in the place where she takes items of its kind.

"In appointing the housekeeper, we chose the woman whom on consideration we judged to have the most selfcontrol in eating, wine drinking, sleeping<sup>20</sup> and intercourse with men, the one, too, who seemed to have the best memory, to be most careful not to offend us by neglecting her duties, and to think most how she could earn some reward by obliging us. We also taught her to be loyal to us by making her a partner in all our joys and, if we had any trouble, inviting her to share that too. We trained her to be eager for the improvement of our estate by making her familiar with it and by allowing her to share in our success. And we developed in her a sense of justice by giving more honor to the just than to the unjust, and by showing her that the just live in greater wealth and freedom than the unjust. And so we appointed her to that position.

"When all this was done, Socrates, I told my wife that

10

11

12

13

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>20</sup> Mem. 1.5.1; Cyr. 1.6.8.

τῆ γυναικί, ὅτι πάντων τούτων οὐδὲν ὅφελος, εἰ μὴ αὐτὴ ἐπιμελήσεται, ὅπως διαμένη ἑκάστω ἡ τάξις. ἐδίδασκον δὲ αὐτήν, ὅτι καὶ ἐν ταῖς εὐνομουμέναις πόλεσιν οὐκ ἀρκεῖν δοκεῖ τοῖς πολίταις, ἢν νόμους καλοὺς γράψωνται, ἀλλὰ καὶ νομοφύλακας προσαιροῦνται, οἴτινες ἐπισκοποῦντες τὸν μὲν ποιοῦντα τὰ νόμιμα ἐπαινοῦσιν, ἢν δέ τις παρὰ τοὺς νόμους ποιῆ, ζημιοῦσι. νομίσαι οὖν ἐκέλευον, ἔφη, τὴν γυναῖκα καὶ αὐτὴν νομοφύλακα τῶν ἐν τῆ οἰκία εἶναι καὶ ἐξετάζειν δέ, ὅταν δόξη αὐτῆ, τὰ σκεύη, ὥσπερ ὁ φρούραρχος τὰς φυλακὰς ἐξετάζει, καὶ δοκιμάζειν, εἰ καλῶς ἔκαστον ἔχει, ὥσπερ ἡ βουλὴ ἵππους καὶ ἱππέας δοκιμάζει, καὶ ἐπαινεῖν δὲ καὶ τιμᾶν ὥσπερ βασίλισσαν τὸν ἄξιον ἀπὸ τῆς παρούσης δυνάμεως καὶ λοιδορεῖν καὶ κολάζειν τὸν τούτων δεόμενον.

Πρὸς δὲ τούτοις ἐδίδασκον αὐτήν, ἔφη, ὡς οὐκ ἂν ἄχθοιτο δικαίως, εἰ πλείω αὐτῆ πράγματα προστάττω ἢ τοῖς οἰκέταις περὶ τὰ κτήματα, ἐπιδεικνύων, ὅτι τοῖς μὲν οἰκέταις μέτεστι τῶν δεσποσύνων χρημάτων τοσοῦτον, ὅσον φέρειν ἢ θεραπεύειν ἢ φυλάττειν, χρῆσθαι δὲ οὐδενὶ αὐτῶν ἔξεστιν, ὅτῷ ἄν μὴ δῷ ὁ κύριος δεσπότου δὲ ἄπαντά ἐστιν ῷ ἃν βούληται ἐκάστα χρῆσθαι. ὅτῷ οὖν καὶ σωζομένων μεγίστη ὄνησις καὶ ψθειρομένων μεγίστη βλάβη, τούτῷ καὶ τὴν ἐπιμέλειαν μάλιστα προσήκουσαν ἀπέφαινον.

Τί οὖν; ἔφην ἐγώ, ὧ Ἰσχόμαχε, ταῦτα ἀκούσασα ἡ γυνή πώς σοι ὑπήκουε;

Τί δέ, ἔφη, εἰ μὴ εἶπέ γέ μοι, ὧ Σώκρατες, ὅτι οὐκ

15

16

17

# OECONOMICUS 9.14-9.18

all these measures were futile unless she saw to it herself that our arrangement was strictly adhered to in every detail. I explained that in well-ordered cities the citizens are not satisfied with passing good laws: they go further and choose guardians of the laws who act as overseers, commending the law-abiding and punishing lawbreakers. So I charged my wife to consider herself guardian of the laws to our household, and just as the commander of a garrison inspects his guards, so must she inspect the equipment whenever she thought it well to do so, and to determine whether each item is in good condition, just as the Council scrutinizes the cavalry and the horses. And like a queen, she must to the best of her ability praise and honor the deserving and scold and punish the deficient.

"Furthermore, I taught her that she would not be justifiably upset if I assigned heavier duties to her than to the slaves as regarded our possessions. Slaves, I pointed out, carry, tend, and guard their master's property and only in that sense have a share in it; they have no right to use anything except with the owner's permission; but everything belongs to the master to use as he pleases. Therefore, I explained, the one who gains most by the preservation of property and loses most by its destruction is the one who is bound to take most care of it."

"Well, then, Ischomachus," I said, "was your wife in- 18 clined to pay attention to your words?"

"In fact, Socrates," he cried, "she told me I was mis-

15

16

όρθως γιγνώσκοιμι, εί οἰοίμην χαλεπὰ ἐπιτάττειν διδάσκων, ὅτι ἐπιμελεῖσθαι δεῖ τῶν ὄντων. χαλεπώτερον γὰρ ἄν, ἔφη φάναι, εἰ αὐτῆ ἐπέταττον ἀμελεῖν των έαυτης η εί επιμελείσθαι δεήσει των οἰκείων άγαθων, πεφυκέναι γὰρ δοκεί, ἔφη, ὥσπερ καὶ τέκνων τὸ έπιμελείσθαι τη σώφρονι των έαυτης η άμελείν, ούτω καὶ τῶν κτημάτων, ὅσα ἴδια ὄντα εὐφραίνει, ἥδιον τὸ έπιμελείσθαι νομίζειν έφη είναι τή σώφρονι των έαυτης η άμελείν.

10. Καὶ ἐγὼ ἀκούσας, ἔφη ὁ Σωκράτης, ἀποκρίνασθαι τὴν γυναῖκα αὐτῷ ταῦτα, εἶπον, Νὴ τὴν Ἡραν, έφην, ὦ Ἰσχόμαχε, ἀνδρικήν γε ἐπιδεικνύεις τὴν διάνοιαν της γυναικός.

Καὶ ἄλλα τοίνυν, ἔφη ὁ Ἰσχόμαχος, θέλω σοι πάνυ μεγαλόφρονα αὐτῆς διηγήσασθαι, ἄ μου ἄπαξ ἀκούσασα ταχὺ ἐπείθετο.

Τὰ ποῖα; ἔφην ἐγώ· λέγε· ὡς ἐμοὶ πολὺ ἥδιον ζώσης άρετην γυναικός καταμανθάνειν ή εί Ζευξίς μοι καλήν εἰκάσας γραφή γυναῖκα ἐπεδείκνυεν.

Έντεθθεν δη λέγει ὁ Ἰσχόμαχος, Ἐγὼ τοίνυν, ἔφη, ίδων ποτε αὐτήν, ὧ Σωκρατες, ἐντετριμμένην πολλώ μεν ψιμυθίω, ὅπως λευκοτέρα ἔτι δοκοίη εἶναι ἢ ἦν, πολλή δ' έγχούση, ὅπως ἐρυθροτέρα φαίνοιτο τής άληθείας, ύποδήματα δ' έχουσαν ύψηλά, ὅπως μείζων 3 δοκοίη είναι ἢ ἐπεφύκει, Εἰπέ μοι, ἔφην, ὧ γύναι, ποτέρως ἄν με κρίναις άξιοφίλητον μαλλον είναι χρημάτων κοινωνόν, εί σοι αὐτὰ τὰ ὄντα ἀποδεικνύοιμι καὶ μήτε κομπάζοιμι, ώς πλείω ἔστι μοι τῶν ὄντων,

19

taken if I thought I was laying a hard task on her in telling her that she must take care of our things: it would have been harder, she said, had I required her to neglect her own possessions than to have the duty of attending to her own peculiar goods. The fact is, she added, just as it naturally comes easier to a good woman to care for her own children than to neglect them, so, I imagine, a good woman finds it more agreeable to look after her own possessions than to neglect them."

10. Now when I heard that his wife had given him this answer, I exclaimed, "By Hera, Ischomachus, by your showing, your wife has a truly masculine mind!"

"Yes," said Ischomachus, "and I am prepared to give you other examples of high-mindedness on her part, when a word from me was enough to secure her instant obedience."

"Tell me what they are," I cried; "for if Zeuxis<sup>21</sup> showed me a fair woman's portrait painted by his own hand, it would not give me half the pleasure I derive from the contemplation of a living woman's virtues."

At that, Ischomachus continued, "Well, one day, Socrates, I noticed that her face was made up: she had rubbed in a lot of white lead in order to look even whiter than she is, and alkanet juice to make her cheeks rosier than they truly were; and she was wearing boots with thick soles to appear taller than she naturally was. So I said to her, "Tell me, wife, how should I appear more worthy of your love as a partner in our goods, by disclosing to you our belongings just as they are, without boasting of imaginary posses-

<sup>21</sup> A renowned contemporary painter known especially for realism and for portraying beautiful women. 19

μήτε ἀποκρυπτοίμην τι τῶν ὄντων μηδέν, ἢ εἰ πειρώμην σε ἐξαπατᾶν λέγων τε, ὡς πλείω ἔστι μοι τῶν ὄντων, ἐπιδεικνύς τε ἀργύριον κίβδηλον καὶ ὅρμους ὑποξύλους καὶ πορφυρίδας ἐξιτήλους φαίην ἀληθινὰς εἶναι;

4 Καὶ ὑπολαβοῦσα εὐθύς, Εὐφήμει, ἔφη· μὴ γένοιο σὰ τοιοῦτος· οὐ γὰρ ἂν ἔγωγέ σε δυναίμην, εἰ τοιοῦτος εἴης, ἀσπάσασθαι ἐκ τῆς ψυχῆς.

Οὐκοῦν, ἔφην ἐγώ, συνεληλύθαμεν, ὧ γύναι, ὡς καὶ τῶν σωμάτων κοινωνήσοντες ἀλλήλοις;

Φασὶ γοῦν, ἔφη, οἱ ἄνθρωποι.

Ποτέρως ἃν οὖν, ἔφην ἐγώ, τοῦ σώματος αὖ δοκοίην εἶναι ἀξιοφίλητος μᾶλλον κοινωνός, εἴ σοι τὸ σῶμα πειρώμην παρέχειν τὸ ἐμαυτοῦ ἐπιμελόμενος ὅπως ὑγιαῖνόν τε καὶ ἐρρωμένον ἔσται καὶ διὰ ταῦτα τῷ ὄντι εὕχρως σοι ἔσομαι, ἢ εἴ σοι μίλτῳ ἀλειφόμενος καὶ τοὺς ὀφθαλμοὺς ὑπαλειφόμενος ἀνδρεικέλῳ ἐπιδεικνύοιμί τε ἐμαυτὸν καὶ συνείην ἐξαπατῶν σε καὶ παρέχων ὁρᾶν καὶ ἄπτεσθαι μίλτου ἀντὶ τοῦ ἐμαυτοῦ χρωτός;

Έγω μέν, ἔφη ἐκείνη, οὖτ' ἃν μίλτου ἁπτοίμην ήδιον ἢ σοῦ οὖτ' ἃν ἀνδρεικέλου χρωμα ήδιον ὁρώην ἢ τὸ σὸν οὖτ' ἂν τοὺς ὀφθαλμοὺς ὑπαληλιμμένους ήδιον ὁρώην τοὺς σοὺς ἢ ὑγιαίνοντας.

Καὶ ἐμὲ τοίνυν νόμιζε, εἰπεῖν ἔφη ὁ Ἰσχόμαχος, ὧ γύναι, μήτε ψιμυθίου μήτε ἐγχούσης χρώματι ἥδεσθαι μᾶλλον ἢ τῷ σῷ, ἀλλ' ὥσπερ οἱ θεοὶ ἐποίησαν ἵπποις μὲν ἵππους, βουσὶ δὲ βοῦς ἥδιστον, προβάτοις

5

6

### OECONOMICUS 10.3-10.7

sions or concealing any part of what we have, or by trying to trick you with an exaggerated account, showing you counterfeit money and wooden necklaces painted gold and describing clothes dyed purple that would fade?

"'Hush!' she broke in immediately, 'Don't be like that—I could not love you with all my heart if you were like that!'

"Then aren't we joined together by another bond of union, wife, to be partners in our bodies?"

"That's what they say."

"'How then should I seem more worthy of your love in this partnership of the body—by striving to have my body hale and strong when I present it to you, and so literally to be of a good countenance in your sight, or by smearing my cheeks with red lead and painting myself under the eyes with rouge before I show myself to you and clasp you in my arms, cheating you and offering to your eyes and hands red lead instead of my real flesh?'

"'For my part,' she cried, 'I would sooner touch you than red lead, would sooner see your own color than rouge, would sooner see your eyes bright than smeared with grease.'

"Then please assume, wife, that I do not prefer white paint and alkanet dye to your real color; but just as the gods have made horses delight in horses, cattle in cattle,

477

δὲ πρόβατα, οὕτω καὶ οἱ ἄνθρωποι ἀνθρώπου σῶμα καθαρὸν οἴονται ἥδιστον εἶναι· αἱ δ' ἀπάται αὖται τοὺς μὲν ἔξω πως δύναιντ' ἂν ἀνεξελέγκτως ἐξαπατᾶν, συνόντας δὲ ἀεὶ ἀνάγκη ἁλίσκεσθαι, ἂν ἐπιχειρῶσιν ἐξαπατᾶν ἀλλήλους. ἢ γὰρ ἐξ εὐνῆς ἁλίσκονται ἐξανιστάμενοι πρὶν παρασκευάσασθαι ἢ ὑπὸ ἱδρῶτος ἐλέγχονται ἢ ὑπὸ δακρύων βασανίζονται ἢ ὑπὸ λουτροῦ ἀληθινῶς κατωπτεύθησαν.

Τί οὖν πρὸς θεῶν, ἔφην ἐγώ, πρὸς ταῦτα ἀπεκρίνατο;

Τί δέ, ἔφη, εἰ μὴ τοῦ γε λοιποῦ τοιοῦτον μὲν οὐδὲν πώποτε ἐπραγματεύσατο, καθαρὰν δὲ καὶ πρεπόντως έχουσαν έπειρατο έαυτην έπιδεικνύναι, καὶ έμε μέντοι ήρώτα, εἴ τι ἔχοιμι συμβουλεῦσαι, ώς ἂν τῷ ὄντι καλή φαίνοιτο, άλλα μη μόνον δοκοίη, και έγω μέντοι, ὧ Σώκρατες, ἔφη, συνεβούλευον αὐτῆ μὴ δουλικῶς ἀεὶ καθῆσθαι, ἀλλὰ σὺν τοῖς θεοῖς πειρᾶσθαι δεσποτικώς πρὸς μὲν τὸν ἱστὸν προσστᾶσαν ὅ τι μὲν βέλτιον ἄλλου ἐπίσταιτο ἐπιδιδάξαι, ὅ τι δὲ χεῖρον έπιμαθείν, έπισκέψασθαι δέ καὶ τὴν σιτοποιόν, παραστήναι δὲ καὶ ἀπομετρούση τή ταμία, περιελθείν δ' έπισκοπουμένην καὶ εἰ κατὰ χώραν ἔχει ἣν δεῖ ἕκαστα. ταῦτα γὰρ ἐδόκει μοι ἄμα ἐπιμέλεια εἶναι καὶ περίπατος. ἀγαθὸν δὲ ἔφην εἶναι γυμνάσιον καὶ τὸ δεῦσαι καὶ μάξαι καὶ ἱμάτια καὶ στρώματα ἀνασεῖσαι καὶ συνθείναι, γυμναζομένην δὲ ἔφην οὕτως ἂν καὶ ἐσθίειν ἥδιον καὶ ὑγιαίνειν μᾶλλον καὶ εὐχροωτέραν φαίνεσθαι τῆ ἀληθεία. καὶ ὄψις δέ, ὁπόταν ἀντ-

8

9

10

11

# OECONOMICUS 10.7-10.12

sheep in sheep, so human beings find the human body undisguised most delightful. Tricks like these may serve to deceive outsiders, but people who live together are bound to be found out if they try to deceive one another. They're found out when they're just out of bed and not yet dressed, or they perspire and are lost, or a tear convicts them, or the bath reveals them as they truly are!'"

"My gods, what did she say to that?" I asked.

"Wouldn't you know," he said, "she gave up such practices from that day forward, and tried to let me see her unadorned and as she should be. Still, she did ask whether I could advise her on one point: how she might make herself really beautiful instead of merely seeming to be. And this was my advice, Socrates: 'Don't always be sitting around like a slave but try, with the gods' help, to act like a mistress: stand before the loom and be ready to instruct those who know less than you, and to learn from those who know more: look after the baking maid: stand by the housekeeper when she is measuring out provisions: go round and see whether everything is in its place.' For I thought that would give her a walk as well as something to do. I also said it was excellent exercise to mix flour and knead dough; and to shake and fold clothing and linens; such exercise would give her a better appetite, improve her health, and add natural color to her complexion. Be-

8

9

10

11

αγωνίζηται διακόνω καθαρωτέρα οὖσα πρεπόντως τε μᾶλλον ἡμφιεσμένη, κινητικὸν γίγνεται, ἄλλως τε καὶ όπόταν τὸ έκοῦσαν χαρίζεσθαι προσή ἀντὶ τοῦ ἀναγκαζομένην ύπηρετείν. αί δ' ἀεὶ καθήμεναι σεμνώς πρὸς τὰς κεκοσμημένας καὶ έξαπατώσας κρίνεσθαι παρέχουσιν έαυτάς, καὶ νῦν, ἔφη, ὦ Σώκρατες, οὕτως εὖ ἴσθι ἡ γυνή μου κατεσκευασμένη βιοτεύει, ὥσπερ έγω έδίδασκον αὐτὴν καὶ ώσπερ νῦν σοι λέγω.

11. Ἐντεῦθεν δ' ἐγὼ εἶπον ο Ἰσχόμαχε, τὰ μὲν δή περί των τής γυναικός έργων ίκανως μοι δοκώ άκηκοέναι την πρώτην καὶ ἄξιά γε πάνυ ἐπαίνου άμφοτέρων ύμῶν. τὰ δ' αὖ σὰ ἔργα, ἔφην ἐγώ, ἤδη μοι λέγε, ἵνα σύ τε ἐφ' οἷς εὐδοκιμεῖς διηγησάμενος ήσθης κάγω τὰ τοῦ καλοῦ κάγαθοῦ ἀνδρὸς ἔργα τελέως διακούσας καὶ καταμαθών, ἢν δύνωμαι, πολλήν σοι χάριν είδω.

Άλλὰ νὴ Δί, ἔφη ὁ Ἰσχόμαχος, καὶ πάνυ ἡδέως σοι, ὦ Σώκρατες, διηγήσομαι ἃ έγὼ ποιῶν διατελῶ, ἵνα καὶ μεταρρυθμίσης με, ἐάν τί σοι δοκῶ μὴ καλῶς ποιείν

Άλλ' έγω μεν δή, έφην, πως αν δικαίως μεταρρυθμίσαιμι ἄνδρα ἀπειργασμένον καλόν τε κάγαθόν, καὶ ταῦτα ὢν ἀνὴρ ὃς ἀδολεσχεῖν τε δοκῶ καὶ ἀερομετρείν καὶ τὸ πάντων δὴ ἀνοητότατον δοκοῦν εἶναι 4 ἔγκλημα πένης καλοῦμαι, καὶ πάνυ μεντάν, ὧ Ἰσχόμαχε, ἦν ἐν πολλη ἀθυμία τῶ ἐπικλήματι τούτω, εἰ μη πρώην ἀπαντήσας τῶ Νικίου τοῦ ἐπηλύτου<sup>14</sup> ἵππω

13

2

sides, when a wife's looks outshine a slave's, and she is fresher and more becomingly dressed, it's sexy, especially when the wife is also willing to please, whereas a slave girl is forced to do what you want. But wives who sit about like fine ladies open themselves to comparison with painted and fraudulent women. And now, Socrates, you may be sure, my wife's dress and appearance are in accord with my instructions as I have just described."

13

11. At this point I said, "Ischomachus, I think your account of your wife's activities is sufficient for the present—and very praiseworthy it is to both of you. But now tell me about your own, so that you can have the pleasure of stating the reasons why you are so highly respected, and I will be very grateful to you for a complete account of a gentleman's activities and, if I'm able, for a thorough knowledge of them."

2

"Why certainly, Socrates," answered Ischomachus, "it will be a very great pleasure to me to give you an account of my daily activities, that you may correct me if you think there is anything amiss in my conduct."

"As far as that goes," I said, "who am I to rightly remodel a perfect gentleman, and that when I'm taken to be an idle chatterer and measurer of the air, and am called—the most senseless of all charges—a poor beggar? I do assure you, Ischomachus, this last imputation would have depressed me a lot were it not that the other day I came upon the horse of Nicias the foreigner.<sup>22</sup> I saw a crowd

3

<sup>22</sup> Otherwise unknown, if the epithet is correctly transmitted.

<sup>14</sup> Νικηράτου Cobet

#### XENOPHON

είδον πολλούς ἀκολουθοῦντας αὐτῷ θεατάς, πολὺν δὲ λόγον ἐχόντων τινῶν περὶ αὐτοῦ ἤκουον· καὶ δῆτα ἤρόμην προσελθὼν τὸν ἱπποκόμον, εἰ πολλὰ εἴη χρήματα τῷ ἵππῳ. ὁ δὲ προσβλέψας με ὡς οὐδὲ ὑγιαίνοντα τῷ ἐρωτήματι εἶπε· Πῶς δ' ἂν ἵππῳ χρήματα γένοιτο; οὕτω δὴ ἐγὼ ἀνέκυψα ἀκούσας, ὅτι ἐστὶν ἄρα θεμιτὸν καὶ πένητι ἵππῳ ἀγαθῷ γενέσθαι, εἰ τὴν ψυχὴν φύσει ἀγαθὴν ἔχοι. ὡς οὖν θεμιτὸν καὶ ἐμοὶ ἀγαθῷ ἀνδρὶ γενέσθαι διηγοῦ τελέως τὰ σὰ ἔργα, ἵνα ὅ τι ἂν δύνωμαι ἀκούων καταμαθεῖν πειρῶμαι καὶ ἐγώ σε ἀπὸ τῆς αὕριον ἡμέρας ἀρξάμενος μιμεῖσθαι. καὶ γὰρ ἀγαθή ἐστιν, ἔφην ἐγώ, ἡμέρα ὡς ἀρετῆς ἄρχεσθαι.

Σὺ μὲν παίζεις, ἔφη ὁ Ἰσχόμαχος, ὧ Σώκρατες, ἐγὼ δὲ ὅμως σοι διηγήσομαι ἃ ἐγὼ ὅσον δύναμαι πειρῶμαι ἐπιτηδεύων διαπερᾶν τὸν βίον. ἐπεὶ γὰρ καταμεμαθηκέναι δοκῶ, ὅτι οἱ θεοὶ τοῦς ἀνθρώποις ἄνευ μὲν τοῦ γιγνώσκειν τε ἃ δεῖ ποιεῖν καὶ ἐπιμελεῖσθαι ὅπως ταῦτα περαίνηται οὐ θεμιτὸν ἐποίησαν εὖ πράττειν, φρονίμοις δ᾽ οὖσι καὶ ἐπιμελέσι τοῖς μὲν διδόασιν εὐδαιμονεῖν, τοῖς δ᾽ οὖ, οὕτω δὴ ἐγὼ ἄρχομαι μὲν τοὺς θεοὺς θεραπεύων, πειρῶμαι δὲ ποιεῖν, ὡς ἂν θέμις ἢ μοι εὐχομένῳ καὶ ὑγιείας τυγχάνειν καὶ ρώμης σώματος καὶ τιμῆς ἐν πόλει καὶ εὐνοίας ἐν φίλοις καὶ ἐν πολέμῳ καλῆς σωτηρίας καὶ πλούτου καλῶς αὐξομένου.

Καὶ ἐγὼ ἀκούσας ταῦτα, Μέλει γὰρ δή σοι, ὧ

9

# OECONOMICUS 11.4-11.9

walking behind it and staring, and heard some of them talking at length about it. Well, I went up to the groom and asked him if the horse had many possessions. The man looked at me as if I must be crazy to ask such a question, and asked me how a horse could own property. At that I perked up, for his answer showed that it is possible even for a poor horse to be a good one, if nature has given it a good spirit. And thus it is possible also for me to become a good man, so do give me a complete account of your activities, so that, so far as I am able, I may try to follow your example from tomorrow on; for that's a fine day for starting on a course of virtue."

"You're joking, Socrates," said Ischomachus; "but nevertheless I'll tell you what principles I try my best to follow consistently in life. For I seem to have learned that while the gods have made it impossible for people to succeed without knowing their duties and seeing that they are carried out, to some who are thoughtful and careful they grant prosperity, and to some deny it. Therefore I begin by worshipping the gods, and try to conduct myself in such a way that in answer to my prayers I may have health and physical strength, esteem in the city, the affection of my friends, safety with honor in war, and wealth increased by honest means."

"Ischomachus," I asked on hearing that, "do you really

483

5

Ίσχόμαχε, ὅπως πλουτῆς καὶ πολλὰ χρήματα ἔχων πολλὰ ἔχης πράγματα τούτων ἐπιμελόμενος;

Καὶ πάνυ γ', ἔφη ὁ Ἰσχόμαχος, μέλει μοι τούτων ὧν ἐρωτᾶς: ἡδὺ γάρ μοι δοκεῖ, ὧ Σώκρατες, καὶ θεοὺς μεγαλείως τιμᾶν καὶ φίλους, ἤν τινος δέωνται, ἐπωφελεῖν καὶ τὴν πόλιν μηδὲν τὸ κατ' ἐμὲ χρήμασιν ἀκόσμητον εἶναι.

Καὶ γὰρ καλά, ἔφην ἐγώ, ὧ Ἰσχόμαχε, ἐστὶν ἃ σὸ λέγεις καὶ δυνατοῦ γε ἰσχυρῶς ἀνδρός· πῶς γὰρ οὕ; ὅτε πολλοὶ μὲν εἰσὶν ἄνθρωποι, οι οὐ δύνανται ζῆν ἄνευ τοῦ ἄλλων δεῖσθαι, πολλοὶ δὲ ἀγαπῶσιν, ἢν δύνωνται τὰ ἑαυτοῖς ἀρκοῦντα πορίζεσθαι. οἱ δὲ δὴ δυνάμενοι μὴ μόνον τὸν ἑαυτῶν οἶκον διοικεῖν, ἀλλὰ καὶ περιποιεῖν, ὥστε καὶ τὴν πόλιν κοσμεῖν καὶ τοὺς φίλους ἐπικουφίζειν, πῶς τούτους οὐχὶ βαθεῖς τε καὶ ἐρρωμένους ἄνδρας χρὴ νομίσαι; ἀλλὰ γὰρ ἐπαινεῖν μέν, ἔφην ἐγώ, τοὺς τοιούτους πολλοὶ δυνάμεθα· σὰ δὲ μοι λέξον, ὧ Ἰσχόμαχε, ἀφ' ὧνπερ ἤρξω, πῶς ὑγιείας ἐπιμελῆ; πῶς τῆς τοῦ σώματος ῥώμης; πῶς θέμις εἶναί σοι καὶ ἐκ πολέμου καλῶς σώζεσθαι; τῆς δὲ χρημασίσεως καὶ μετὰ ταῦτα, ἔφην ἐγώ, ἀρκέσει ἀκούειν.

'Αλλ' ἔστι μέν, ἔφη ὁ Ἰσχόμαχος, ὥς γε ἐμοὶ δοκεῖ, ὧ Σώκρατες, ἀκόλουθα ταῦτα πάντα ἀλλήλων. ἐπεὶ γὰρ ἐσθίειν τις τὰ ἱκανὰ ἔχει, ἐκπονοῦντι μὲν ὀρθῶς μᾶλλον δοκεῖ μοι ἡ ὑγίεια παραμένειν, ἐκπονοῦντι δὲ μᾶλλον ἡ ῥώμη προσγίγνεσθαι, ἀσκοῦντι δὲ τὰ τοῦ πολέμου κάλλιον σώζεσθαι, ὀρθῶς δὲ ἐπιμελομένω

10

11

## OECONOMICUS 11.9-11.12

want to be rich and to have lots of possessions when you will also have lots of problems taking care of them?"

"The answer to your questions," he said, is: "Yes, I do indeed. For it is a pleasure to honor the gods in grand fashion, Socrates, to help friends if they need anything, and see to it that the city lacks no adornment that my means can supply."

"And fine principles those are, Ischomachus," I replied, "at least for a very influential man, no doubt about it! For there are many who cannot live without seeking help from others, and many who are content if they can provide enough for their own needs. Surely those who can maintain their own estate and yet have enough left to adorn the city and relieve their friends may well be thought affluent and powerful men. However," I added, "praise of such men is a commonplace among us. Rather please return to your initial statement, Ischomachus, and tell me how you take care of your health, your physical strength, how it's right for you to survive even war honorably. I will be glad to hear about your moneymaking afterward."

"Well, Socrates," replied Ischomachus, "all these things hang together, as far as I can see. For if a man has plenty to eat, and works it off properly,<sup>23</sup> I think he both insures his health and adds to his strength. By training himself in the arts of war he is more apt to survive honorably, and by

10

11

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>23</sup> Cyr. 1.2, 1.10.

καὶ μὴ καταμαλακιζομένω μᾶλλον εἰκὸς τὸν οἶκον αὕξεσθαι.

Άλλὰ μέχρι μὲν τούτου ἔπομαι, ἔφην ἐγώ, ὧ Ἰσχόμαχε, ὅτι ἐκπονοῦντα φὴς καὶ ἐπιμελόμενον καὶ
ἀσκοῦντα ἄνθρωπον μᾶλλον τυγχάνειν τῶν ἀγαθῶν,
ὁποίῳ δὲ πόνῳ χρῆ πρὸς τὴν εὐεξίαν καὶ ῥώμην καὶ
ὅπως ἀσκεῖς τὰ τοῦ πολέμου καὶ ὅπως ἐπιμελῆ τοῦ
περιουσίαν ποιεῖν ὡς καὶ φίλους ἐπωφελεῖν καὶ πόλιν
ἐπισχύειν, ταῦτα ἃν ἡδέως, ἔφην ἐγώ, πυθοίμην.

Έγω τοίνυν, ἔφη, ὧ Σώκρατες, ὁ Ἰσχόμαχος; ἀν-14 ίστασθαι μεν έξ εὐνῆς εἴθισμαι, ἡνίκ' αν ἔτι ἔνδον καταλαμβάνοιμι, εί τινα δεόμενος ιδείν τυγχάνοιμι. καν μέν τι κατά πόλιν δέη πράττειν, ταῦτα πραγματευόμενος περιπάτω τούτω χρώμαι ην δε μηδεν 15 άναγκαῖον ή κατὰ πόλιν, τὸν μὲν ἵππον ὁ παῖς προάγει είς άγρόν, έγὼ δὲ περιπάτω χρώμαι τῆ είς άγρὸν όδω ἴσως ἄμεινον, ὧ Σώκρατες, ἢ εἰ ἐν τῷ ξυστῷ περιπατοίην. ἐπειδὰν δὲ ἔλθω εἰς ἀγρόν, ἤν τέ μοι 16 φυτεύοντες τυγχάνωσιν ήν τε νειοποιούντες ήν τε σπείροντες ήν τε καρπὸν προσκομίζοντες, ταῦτα ἐπισκεψάμενος ὅπως ἔκαστα γίγνεται μεταρρυθμίζω, ἐὰν έχω τι βέλτιον τοῦ παρόντος, μετὰ δὲ ταῦτα ώς τὰ 17 πολλά άναβάς ἐπὶ τὸν ἵππον ἱππασάμην ἱππασίαν ώς ἂν ἐγὼ δύνωμαι ὁμοιοτάτην ταῖς ἐν τῷ πολέμῳ άναγκαίαις ίππασίαις, οὔτε πλαγίου οὔτε κατάντους οὔτε τάφρου οὔτε ὀχετοῦ ἀπεχόμενος, ὡς μέντοι δυνατὸν ταῦτα ποιοῦντα ἐπιμέλομαι μὴ ἀποχωλεῦσαι τὸν ἵππον. ἐπειδὰν δὲ ταῦτα γένηται, ὁ παῖς ἐξαλίσας 18

# **OECONOMICUS 11.12-11.18**

due diligence and resistance to going soft, he is more likely to increase his estate."

"So far, Ischomachus, I follow you," I answered. "You mean that by working off meals, by due diligence, and by training, a person is more apt to obtain the good things in life. But now I would like you to give me details. By what kind of work do you go about keeping your health and physical strength? How do you train yourself in the arts of war? What diligence do you use to have a surplus from which to help friends and strengthen the city?"

"Well now, Socrates," replied Ischomachus, "I get out of bed at an hour when, if I need to call on anyone, I am sure to find him still at home. If I have any business to do in town, I make it an opportunity for taking a walk. If there is nothing pressing to be done in town, my slave leads my horse to the farm and I make my walk by going there on foot, with more benefit, perhaps, Socrates, than if I walked around in the arcade. When I reach the farm, I may find planting, clearing, sowing or harvesting in progress. I superintend all the details of each such activity and make any improvements in method that I can suggest. After this, I usually mount my horse and go through exercises, imitating as closely as I can the exercises needed in warfare. I avoid neither slope nor steep incline, ditch nor watercourse, but of course I use all possible care not to lame my horse when he takes them. After I have finished, the slave

487

13

14

15

16

17

τον ἵππον οἴκαδε ἀπάγει, ἄμα φέρων ἀπο χώρου ἤν τι δεώμεθα εἰς ἄστυ. ἐγὼ δὲ τὰ μὲν βάδην τὰ δὲ ἀποδραμὼν οἴκαδε ἀπεστλεγγισάμην. εἶτα δὲ ἀριστῶ, ὧ Σώκρατες, ὅσα μήτε κενὸς μήτε ἄγαν πλήρης διημερεύειν.

Νὴ τὴν "Ηραν, ἔφην ἐγώ, ὧ Ἰσχόμαχε, ἀρεσκόντως γέ μοι ταῦτα ποιεῖς. τὸ γὰρ ἐν τῷ αὐτῷ χρόνῷ συνεσκευασμένοις χρῆσθαι τοῖς τε πρὸς τὴν ὑγίειαν καὶ τοῖς πρὸς τὴν ῥώμην παρασκευάσμασι καὶ τοῖς εἰς τὸν πόλεμον ἀσκήμασι καὶ ταῖς τοῦ πλούτου ἐπιμελείαις, ταῦτα πάντα ἀγαστά μοι δοκεῖ εἶναι. καὶ γὰρ ὅτι ὀρθῶς ἑκάστου τούτων ἐπιμελῆ, ἱκανὰ τεκμήρια παρέχη· ὑγιαίνοντά τε γὰρ καὶ ἐρρωμένον ὡς ἐπὶ τὸ πολὺ σὺν τοῖς θεοῖς σε ὁρῶμεν καὶ ἐν τοῖς ἱππικωτάτοις τε καὶ πλουσιωτάτοις λεγόμενόν σε ἐπιστάμεθα.

Ταῦτα τοίνυν ἐγὼ ποιῶν, ἔφη, ὧ Σώκρατες, ὑπὸ πολλῶν πάνυ συκοφαντοῦμαι, σὰ δ᾽ ἴσως ῷου με ἐρεῖν, ὡς ὑπὸ πολλῶν καλὸς κἀγαθὸς κέκλημαι.

'Αλλὰ καὶ ἔμελλον δὲ ἐγώ, ἔφην, ὧ 'Ισχόμαχε, τοῦτο ἐρήσεσθαι, εἴ τινα καὶ τούτου ἐπιμέλειαν ποιῆ, ὅπως δύνη λόγον διδόναι καὶ λαμβάνειν, ἤν τινί ποτε δέη.

Οὐ γὰρ δοκῶ σοι, ἔφη, ὧ Σώκρατες, αὐτὰ ταῦτα διατελεῖν μελετῶν, ἀπολογεῖσθαι μέν, ὅτι οὐδένα ἀδικῶ, εὖ δὲ ποιῶ πολλοὺς ὅσον ἂν δύνωμαι; κατηγορεῖν δὲ οὐ δοκῶ σοι μελετᾶν ἀνθρώπων, ἀδικοῦντας

19

20

21

# **OECONOMICUS 11.18-11.22**

gives the horse a roll and leads him home, bringing with him from the farm anything we happen to need in the city. I divide the return trip between walking and running. When I've arrived home, I clean myself with a strigil, and then I have lunch, Socrates, eating just enough to get through the day feeling neither empty nor too full."

"By Hera, Ischomachus," I cried, "I'm delighted with your activities. You have a package of methods for securing health and physical strength, of exercises for war, and specifics for getting rich, and you use them all at the same time. That does seem to me totally admirable! And in fact you afford convincing proofs that your method in pursuing each of these goals is sound. For we see you nearly always in good health and physically fit, thanks to the gods, and we know that you are considered one of our best horsemen and wealthiest citizens."

"And what comes of these activities, Socrates? Not, as you perhaps expected to hear, that I am generally dubbed a gentleman, but instead I am persistently slandered."

"As a matter of fact," I said, "I was meaning to ask you, Ischomachus, whether you include in your system the ability to conduct a prosecution or a defense, in case you have to appear in court?"

"Why, Socrates," he answered, "don't you realize<sup>24</sup> that this is exactly what I am constantly practicing—proving that I wrong no one and do all the good I can to many? And don't you realize that I practice making accusations

19

20

21

<sup>24</sup> Mem. 4.8 4

μεν καὶ ἰδία πολλοὺς καὶ τὴν πόλιν καταμανθάνων τινάς, εὖ δὲ ποιοῦντας οὐδένα;

'Αλλ' εἰ καὶ ἑρμηνεύειν τοιαῦτα μελετᾶς, τοῦτό μοι, ἔφην ἐγώ, ἔτι, ὧ 'Ισχόμαχε, δήλωσον.

Οὐδὲν μὲν οὖν, ὧ Σώκρατες, παύομαι, ἔφη, λέγειν μελετῶν. ἢ γὰρ κατηγοροῦντός τινος τῶν οἰκετῶν ἢ ἀπολογουμένου ἀκούσας ἐλέγχειν πειρῶμαι ἢ μέμφομαί τινα πρὸς τοὺς φίλους ἢ ἐπαινῶ ἢ διαλλάττω τινὰς τῶν ἐπιτηδείων, πειρώμενος διδάσκειν, ὡς συμφέρει αὐτοῖς φίλους εἶναι μᾶλλον ἢ πολεμίους, ἢ ἐπιτιμῶμέν τινι στρατηγῷ συμπαρόντες ἢ ἀπολογούμεθα ὑπέρ του, εἴ τις ἀδίκως αἰτίαν ἔχει, ἢ κατηγοροῦμεν πρὸς ἀλλήλους, εἴ τις ἀδίκως τιμᾶται. πολλάκις δὲ καὶ βουλευόμενοι ἃ μὲν ἂν ἐπιθυμῶμεν πράττειν, ταῦτα ἐπαινοῦμεν, ἃ δ' ἂν μὴ βουλώμεθα πράττειν, ταῦτα μεμφόμεθα. ἤδη δ', ἔφη, ὧ Σώκρατες, καὶ διειλημμένως πολλάκις ἐκρίθην ὅ τι χρὴ παθεῖν ἢ ἀποτῦσαι.

Ύπὸ τοῦ, ἔφην ἐγώ, ὧ Ἰσχόμαχε; ἐμὲ γὰρ δὴ τοῦτο ἐλάνθανεν.

'Υπὸ τῆς γυναικός, ἔφη.

Καὶ πῶς δή, ἔφην ἐγώ, ἀγωνίζη;

"Όταν μὲν ἀληθη λέγειν συμφέρη, πάνυ ἐπιεικῶς ὅταν δὲ ψευδη, τὸν ἥττω λόγον, ὧ Σώκρατες, οὐ μὰ τὸν Δί οὐ δύναμαι κρείττω ποιεῖν.

Καὶ ἐγὼ εἶπον Ἰσως γάρ, ὧ Ἰσχόμαχε, τὸ ψεῦδος οὐ δύνασαι ἀληθὲς ποιεῖν.

23

24

## **OECONOMICUS** 11.22-11.25

when I note that certain persons are wronging many individuals and the city but are doing no good to anyone?"

"But tell me one thing more, Ischomachus," I said; "do you also practice the art of expounding these matters?"

23

24

25

"Never, Socrates," he replied, "do I stop practicing the art of speaking. When one of the slaves makes an accusation or denies one, I try to cross-examine him; or I praise or blame someone before his friends; or I act as peacemaker between some of my acquaintances by trying to show them that it is in their interest to be friends rather than enemies. Or we get together and court-martial a general, or take turns defending a man who is unjustly blamed or accusing one who is unjustly honored. We often sit in counsel and speak in support of the course we want to adopt and against the course we want to avoid. I have often been singled out before now, Socrates, and condemned to suffer a punishment or pay damages."

"By whom, Ischomachus?" I asked: "I am in the dark

about that!"

"By my wife," was his answer.

"And how does your pleading go?" I said.

"Pretty well, when it's in my interest to speak the truth. But when lying is called for, Socrates, I can't make the worse argument appear the better—oh no, not at all!"

"Perhaps, Ischomachus," I commented, "you can't turn the lie into the truth!"

12. 'Αλλὰ γάρ, ἔφην ἐγώ, μή σε κατακωλύω, ὧ 'Ισχόμαχε, ἀπιέναι ἤδη βουλόμενον.

Μὰ Δί', ἔφη, ὧ Σώκρατες· ἐπεὶ οὐκ ἂν ἀπέλθοιμι, πρὶν ἂν παντάπασιν ἡ ἀγορὰ λυθῆ.

Νὴ Δί, ἔφην ἐγώ, φυλάττη γὰρ ἰσχυρῶς, μὴ ἀποβάλης τὴν ἐπωνυμίαν τὸ ἀνὴρ καλὸς κἀγαθὸς κεκλῆσθαι. νῦν γὰρ πολλῶν σοι ἴσως ὄντων ἐπιμελείας δεομένων, ἐπεὶ συνέθου τοῖς ξένοις, ἀναμένεις αὐτούς, ἵνα μὴ ψεύση.

'Αλλά τοι, ὧ Σώκρατες, ἔφη ὁ Ἰσχόμαχος, οὐδ' ἐκεῖνά μοι ἀμελεῖται, ἃ σὰ λέγεις ἔχω γὰρ ἐπιτρό-πους ἐν τοῖς ἀγροῖς.

3 Πότερα δέ, ἐγὼ ἔφην ὧ Ἰσχόμαχε, ὅταν δεηθῆς ἐπιτρόπου, καταμαθών, ἤν που ἢ ἐπιτροπευτικὸς ἀνήρ, τοῦτον πειρῷ ἀνεῖσθαι, ὥσπερ ὅταν τέκτονος δεηθῆς, καταμαθὼν εὖ οἶδ' ὅτι ἤν που ἴδης τεκτονικόν, τοῦτον πειρῷ κτὰσθαι, ἢ αὐτὸς παιδεύεις τοὺς ἐπιτρόπους;

Αὐτὸς νὴ Δί', ἔφη, ὧ Σώκρατες, πειρῶμαι παιδεύειν. καὶ γὰρ ὅστις μέλλει ἀρκέσειν, ὅταν ἐγὼ ἀπῶ, ἀντ' ἐμοῦ ἐπιμελόμενος, τί αὐτὸν καὶ δεῖ ἄλλο ἐπίστασθαι ἢ ἄπερ ἐγώ; εἴπερ γὰρ ἱκανός εἰμι τῶν ἔργων προστατεύειν, κἂν ἄλλον δήπου δυναίμην διδάξαι ἄπερ αὐτὸς ἐπίσταμαι.

Οὐκοῦν εὖνοιαν πρῶτον, ἔφην ἐγώ, δεήσει αὐτὸν ἔχειν σοὶ καὶ τοῖς σοῖς, εἰ μέλλει ἀρκέσειν ἀντὶ σοῦ παρών ἄνευ γὰρ εὐνοίας τί ὄφελος καὶ ὁποίας τινὸς οὖν ἐπιτρόπου ἐπιστήμης γίγνεται;

5

# OECONOMICUS 12.1-12.5

12. "But perhaps I'm keeping you, Ischomachus," I continued, "and you want to get away now?"

"Oh no, Socrates," he answered; "I shouldn't think of going before the market clears."

"You certainly take the utmost care," I continued, "not to forfeit your right to be called a gentleman! For I'm sure there are many things claiming your attention just now, but since you have made an appointment with those guests you are determined not to break it."

"But I assure you, Socrates, I'm not neglecting the matters you refer to, either; for I keep foremen on my farms."

"And when you want a foreman, Ischomachus, do you look out for a man qualified for such a post, and then try to buy him—when you want a builder, I feel sure you inquire for a qualified man and try to get him—or do you train your foremen yourself?"

"Of course I try to train them myself, Socrates. For the man has to be capable of taking charge in my absence; so why need he know anything but what I know myself? For if I am fit to manage the farm, I presume I can teach another man what I know myself."

"Then the first requirement will be that he should be loyal to you and yours, if he is to represent you in your absence. For if a foreman is not loyal, what's the use of any knowledge he may possess?"

3

Οὐδὲν μὰ Δί', ἔφη ὁ Ἰσχόμαχος, ἀλλά τοι τὸ εὐνοείν ἐμοὶ καὶ τοῖς ἐμοῖς ἐγὼ πρῶτον πειρῶμαι παιδεύειν.

6 Καὶ πῶς, ἐγὼ ἔφην, πρὸς τῶν θεῶν εὔνοιαν ἔχειν σοὶ καὶ τοῖς σοῖς διδάσκεις ὅντινα ἂν βούλη;

Εὐεργετῶν νὴ Δί', ἔφη ὁ Ἰσχόμαχος, ὅταν τινὸς ἀγαθοῦ οἱ θεοὶ ἀφθονίαν διδῶσιν ἡμῖν.

Τοῦτο οὖν λέγεις, ἔφην ἐγώ, ὅτι οἱ ἀπολαύοντες τῶν σῶν ἀγαθῶν εὖνοί σοι γίγνονται καὶ ἀγαθόν τί σε βούλονται πράττειν;

Τοῦτο γὰρ ὅργανον, ὧ Σώκρατες, εὐνοίας ἄριστον ὁρῶ ὄν.

8 "Ην δὲ δὴ εὔνους σοι γένηται, ἔφην, ὧ Ἰσχόμαχε, ἢ τούτου ἔνεκα ἱκανὸς ἔσται ἐπιτροπεύειν; οὐχ ὁρῷς, ὅτι καὶ ἑαυτοῖς εὖνοι πάντες ὅντες ὡς εἰπεῖν ἄνθρωποι, πολλοὶ αὐτῶν εἰσὶν οῦ οὐκ ἐθέλουσιν ἐπιμελεῖσθαι, ὅπως αὐτοῖς ἔσται ταῦτα ἃ βούλονται εἶναί σφισι τὰ ἀγαθά;

3 'Αλλὰ ναὶ μὰ Δί', ἔφη ὁ Ἰσχόμαχος, τοιούτους ὅταν ἐπιτρόπους βούλωμαι καθιστάναι, καὶ ἐπιμελεῖσθαι διδάσκω.

10 Πῶς, ἔφην ἐγώ, πρὸς τῶν θεῶν; τοῦτο γὰρ δὴ ἐγὼ παντάπασιν οὐ διδακτὸν ὤμην εἶναι, τὸ ἐπιμελῆ ποιῆσαι.

Οὐδὲ γάρ ἐστιν, ἔφη, ὧ Σώκρατες, ἐφεξῆς γε οὕτως οἷόν τε πάντας διδάξαι ἐπιμελεῖς εἶναι.

11 Ποίους μὲν δή, ἐγὼ ἔφην, οἶόν τε; πάντως μοι σαφῶς τούτους διασήμηνον.

# OECONOMICUS 12.5-12.11

"None, of course; but I may tell you, loyalty to me and mine is the first lesson I try to teach."

"And how, in heaven's name, do you teach your man to 6 be loyal to you and yours?"

"By rewarding him, of course, whenever the gods bestow some good thing on us in abundance."

"You mean, then, that those who enjoy a share of your good things are loyal to you and want you to prosper?"

"Yes, Socrates, I find that is the best instrument for producing loyalty."

"Granted he is loyal to you, Ischomachus, will that be enough to make him a competent foreman? Don't you see that though virtually all people wish themselves well, still there are many who won't take the trouble to get for themselves the good things they want to have?"

"Well, when I want to make foremen of such men, of course I teach them also to be attentive."

"And how on earth do you do that? I was under the 10 impression that attentiveness is a virtue that can't possibly be taught."

"True, Socrates, it impossible to teach everyone you come across to be attentive."

"Then what sort of men can be taught? Point these out 11 to me, at any rate."

Πρώτον μέν, ἔφη, ὧ Σώκρατες, τοὺς οἴνου ἀκρατεῖς οὐκ ἃν δύναιο ἐπιμελεῖσθαι ποιῆσαι· τὸ γὰρ μεθύειν λήθην ἐμποιεῖ πάντων τῶν πράττειν δεομένων.

Οἱ οὖν τούτου ἀκρατεῖς μόνοι, ἐγὼ ἔφην, ἀδύνατοί εἰσιν ἐπιμέλεσθαι ἢ καὶ ἄλλοι τινές;

Ναὶ μὰ Δι', ἔφη ὁ Ἰσχόμαχος, καὶ οἴ γε τοῦ ὕπνου οὕτε γὰρ ἂν αὐτὸς δύναιτο καθεύδων τὰ δέοντα ποιεῖν οὕτε ἄλλους παρέχεσθαι.

Τί οὖν; ἐγὼ ἔφην, οὖτοι αὖ μόνοι ἀδύνατοι ἡμῖν ἔσονται ταύτην τὴν ἐπιμέλειαν διδαχθῆναι ἢ καὶ ἄλλοι τινὲς πρὸς τούτοις;

Έμοιγέ τοι δοκούσιν, ἔφη ὁ Ἰσχόμαχος, καὶ οἱ τῶν ἀφροδισίων δυσέρωτες ἀδύνατοι εἶναι διδαχθήναι ἄλλου τινὸς μᾶλλον ἐπιμελεῖσθαι ἢ τούτου οὕτε γὰρ ἐλπίδα οὕτ ἐπιμέλειαν ἡδίονα ῥάδιον εὑρεῖν τῆς τῶν παιδικῶν ἐπιμελείας, οὐδὲ μὴν ὅταν παρἢ τὸ πρακτέον, τιμωρίαν χαλεπωτέραν εὐπετές ἐστι τοῦ ἀπὸ τῶν ἐρωμένων κωλύεσθαι. ὑφίεμαι οὖν καὶ οῢς ἂν τοιούτους γνῶ ὄντας μηδ' ἐπιχειρεῖν ἐπιμελητὰς τούτων τινὰς καθιστάναι.

Τί δέ, ἔφην ἐγώ, οἴτινες αὖ ἐρωτικῶς ἔχουσι τοῦ κερδαίνειν, ἢ καὶ οὖτοι ἀδύνατοί εἰσιν εἰς ἐπιμέλειαν τῶν κατ' ἀγρὸν ἔργων παιδεύεσθαι;

Οὐ μὰ Δί', ἔφη ὁ Ἰσχόμαχος, οὐδαμῶς γε, ἀλλὰ καὶ πάνυ εὐάγωγοί εἰσιν εἰς τὴν τούτων ἐπιμέλειαν οὐδὲν γὰρ ἄλλο δεῖ ἢ δεῖξαι μόνον αὐτοῖς, ὅτι κερδαλέον ἐστὶν ἡ ἐπιμέλεια.

Τοὺς δὲ ἄλλους, ἔφην ἐγώ, εἰ ἐγκρατεῖς τέ εἰσιν ὧν

12

13

14

15

### **OECONOMICUS 12.11-12.16**

"In the first place, Socrates, you can't make attentive men of hard drinkers; for drink makes them forget everything they ought to do."

"Then are drunkards the only men who will never become attentive, or are there others?"

"Of course there are: sluggards must be included; for you can't do your own business when you are asleep, nor make others do theirs."

"Well then, will these make up the total of persons we will find incapable of learning this lesson, or are there still others besides?"

"I should add that in my opinion those who fall desperately in love are incapable of paying more attention to anything other than that. For it isn't easy to find hope or occupation more delightful than devotion to the darling boys! And when the thing to be done presses, no harsher punishment can easily be imagined than blocking access to the beloved. So I avoid even trying to make a manager of anyone whom I recognize to be of this sort."

"And what about those who have a passion for making money? Are they also incapable of being trained to take charge of the work of a farm?"

"Not at all; of course not. In fact they very easily qualify for the work: it's merely necessary to point out to them that attentiveness is profitable."

"And assuming that the others are free from the faults

497

12

13

14

15

σὺ κελεύεις καὶ πρὸς τὸ φιλοκερδεῖς εἶναι μετρίως ἔχουσιν, πῶς ἐκδιδάσκεις ὧν σὺ βούλει ἐπιμελεῖς γίγνεσθαι;

Άπλως, ἔφη, πάνυ, ὧ Σώκρατες. ὅταν μὲν γὰρ ἐπιμελομένους ἴδω, καὶ ἐπαινῶ καὶ τιμᾶν πειρῶμαι αὐτούς, ὅταν δὲ ἀμελοῦντας, λέγειν τε πειρῶμαι καὶ ποιεῖν ὁποῖα δήξεται αὐτούς.

"Ιθι, ἐγὼ ἔφην, ὧ Ἰσχόμαχε, καὶ τόδε μοι παρατραπόμενος τοῦ λόγου περὶ τῶν παιδευομένων εἰς τὴν ἐπιμέλειαν δήλωσον, εἰ οἶόν τέ ἐστιν ἀμελῆ αὐτὸν ὄντα ἄλλους ποιεῖν ἐπιμελεῖς.

Οὐ μὰ Δί', ἔφη ὁ Ἰσχόμαχος, οὐδέν γε μᾶλλον ἢ άμουσον όντα αὐτὸν άλλους μουσικοὺς ποιείν. χαλεπὸν γὰρ τοῦ διδασκάλου πονηρώς τι ὑποδεικνύοντος καλώς τοῦτο ποιείν μαθείν καὶ ἀμελείν γε ὑποδεικνύοντος τοῦ δεσπότου χαλεπὸν ἐπιμελῆ θεράποντα γενέσθαι, ως δε συντόμως είπειν, πονηρού μεν δεσπότου οἰκέτας οὐ δοκῶ χρηστοὺς καταμεμαθηκέναι. χρηστοῦ μέντοι πονηρούς ήδη εἶδον, οὐ μέντοι άζημίους γε. τὸν δὲ ἐπιμελητικοὺς βουλόμενον ποιήσασθαί τινας καὶ ἐφορατικὸν δεῖ εἶναι τῶν ἔργων καὶ έξεταστικὸν καὶ χάριν θέλοντα τῶν καλῶς τελουμένων άποδιδόναι τῷ αἰτίῳ καὶ δίκην μὴ ὀκνοῦντα τὴν ἀξίαν έπιθείναι τῷ ἀμελοῦντι. καλῶς δέ μοι δοκεῖ ἔχειν, ἔφη ό Ἰσχόμαχος, καὶ ἡ τοῦ βαρβάρου λεγομένη ἀπόκρισις, ὅτε βασιλεὺς ἄρα ἵππου ἐπιτυχὼν ἀγαθοῦ παχῦναι αὐτὸν ὡς τάχιστα βουλόμενος ἤρετο τῶν δεινῶν τινα άμφ' ἵππους δοκούντων εἶναι, τί τάχιστα παχύ-

17

18

19

## OECONOMICUS 12.16-12.20

that you condemn and are interested in making a moderate profit, how do you teach them to be attentive to the affairs you want them to superintend?"

"It's very simple, Socrates: whenever I notice that they are attentive, I commend them and try to show them honor; but when they appear careless, I try to say and do the sort of things that will sting them."

"Turn now, Ischomachus, from the subject of the men in training for the occupation and tell me about the system: is it possible for anyone to make others attentive if he is careless himself?"

"Of course not: a person untrained in the arts could as soon make others artistic. For it is hard to learn to do something well when the teacher shows you ineptly; and when a master models inattentiveness, it is difficult for the slave to become attentive. In short, I don't think I've yet found a bad master with good slaves; I have, however, come across a good master with bad slaves—but they suffered for it! If you want to make men fit to take charge, you must supervise their work and examine it, and be ready to reward work well carried out and not shrink from punishing carelessness as it deserves. I like the answer that's attributed to the barbarian when the king, you know, had acquired a good horse and wanted to fatten him up as quickly as possible. So he asked one who was considered good with horses what was the quickest way of fattening

17

18

19

νει ἵππον· τὸν δ' εἰπεῖν λέγεται, ὅτι δεσπότου ὀφθαλμός. οὕτω δ', ἔφη, ὧ Σώκρατες, καὶ τἆλλά μοι δοκεῖ
δεσπότου ὀφθαλμὸς τὰ καλά τε κἀγαθὰ μάλιστα ἐργάζεσθαι.

13. Όταν δὲ παραστήσης τινί, ἔφην ἐγώ, τοῦτο καὶ πάνυ ἰσχυρῶς, ὅτι δεῖ ἐπιμελεῖσθαι ὧν ἂν σὰ βούλη, ἢ ἱκανὸς ἤδη ἔσται ὁ τοιοῦτος ἐπιτροπεύειν ἤ τι καὶ ἄλλο προσμαθητέον αὐτῷ ἔσται, εἰ μέλλει ἐπίτροπος ἱκανὸς ἔσεσθαι;

Ναὶ μὰ Δί, ἔφη ὁ Ἰσχόμαχος, ἔτι μέντοι λοιπὸν αὐτῷ ἐστι γνῶναι, ὅ τι τε ποιητέον καὶ ὁπότε καὶ ὅπως, εἰ δὲ μή, τί μᾶλλον ἐπιτρόπου ἄνευ τούτων ὄφελος ἢ ἰατροῦ, ὃς ἐπιμελοῦτο μὲν κάμνοντός τινος πρωί τε ἰὼν καὶ ὀψέ, ὅ τι δὲ συμφέρον τῷ κάμνοντι ποιεῦν εἴη, τοῦτο μὴ εἰδείη;

Έὰν δὲ μὴν καὶ τὰ ἔργα μάθη ὡς ἔστιν ἐργαστέα, ἔτι τινός, ἔφην ἐγώ, προσδεήσεται ἢ ἀποτετελεσμένος ἤδη οὖτός σοι ἔσται ἐπίτροπος;

Άρχειν γε, έφη, οἶμαι δείν αὐτὸν μαθείν τῶν ἐργαζομένων.

4 <sup>3</sup>Η οὖν, ἔφην ἐγώ, καὶ στὸ ἄρχειν ἱκανοὺς εἶναι παιδεύεις τοὺς ἐπιτρόπους;

Πειρῶμαί γε δή, ἔφη ὁ Ἰσχόμαχος.

Καὶ πῶς δή, ἔφην ἐγώ, πρὸς τῶν θεῶν τὸ ἀρχικοὺς εἶναι ἀνθρώπων παιδεύεις;

Φαύλως, ἔφη, πάνυ, ὧ Σώκρατες, ὥστε ἴσως ἂν καὶ καταγελάσαις ἀκούων.

Οὐ μὲν δὴ ἄξιόν γ', ἔφην ἐγώ, τὸ πρᾶγμα καταγέ-

5

2

# OECONOMICUS 12.20-13.5

up a horse. "Its master's eye," replied the man, and I think we may apply the answer generally, Socrates, and say that it's mainly the master's eye that does the fine and worthy work."

13. "When you have impressed on a man," I resumed, "the necessity of careful attention to the duties you assign to him, will he then be competent to act as foreman or must he learn something besides, if he is to be efficient?"

"Of course," answered Ischomachus, "he still has to understand the job and when and how to do it. Otherwise how could a foreman be more useful than a doctor who takes care to visit a patient morning and night but has no idea how to treat his illness?"

"Alright, suppose he's learned how farm work is to be done: will he still need something more, or will your man now be a perfect foreman?"

"I think he must learn to govern the workers."

"And do you train your foremen to be competent to govern too?"

"Yes: I try, anyway."

"And how on earth do you train them to be governors of men?"

"So very easily, Socrates, that maybe you'll laugh when I tell you."

"No, it's certainly no laughing matter, Ischomachus:

λωτος, ὧ Ἰσχόμαχε. ὅστις γάρ τοι ἀρχικοὺς ἀνθρώπων δύναται ποιεῖν, δῆλον ὅτι οὖτος καὶ δεσποτικοὺς ἀνθρώπων δύναται διδάσκειν, ὅστις δὲ δεσποτικούς, δύναται ποιεῖν καὶ βασιλικούς. ὥστε οὐ καταγέλωτός μοι δοκεῖ ἄξιος εἶναι, ἀλλ' ἐπαίνου μεγάλου ὁ τοῦτο δυνάμενος ποιεῖν.

Οὐκοῦν, ἔφη, ὧ Σώκρατες, τὰ μὲν ἄλλα ζῶα ἐκ 6 δυοίν τούτοιν τὸ πείθεσθαι μανθάνουσιν, ἔκ τε τοῦ όταν ἀπειθεῖν ἐπιχειρῶσι κολάζεσθαι καὶ ἐκ τοῦ ὅταν προθύμως ύπηρετῶσιν εὖ πάσχειν, οἵ τε γοῦν πῶλοι μανθάνουσιν ύπακούειν τοῖς πωλοδάμναις τῷ ὅταν μεν πείθωνται των ήδεων τι αὐτοῖς γίγνεσθαι, ὅταν δὲ ἀπειθῶσι πράγματα ἔχειν, ἔστ' ἂν ὑπηρετήσωσι κατὰ γνώμην τῷ πωλοδάμνη: καὶ τὰ κυνίδια δὲ πολὺ τῶν ἀνθρώπων καὶ τῆ γνώμη καὶ τῆ γλώττη ὑποδεέστερα όντα όμως καὶ περιτρέχειν καὶ κυβιστάν καὶ άλλα πολλὰ μανθάνει τῷ αὐτῷ τούτῳ τρόπῳ. ὅταν μέν γὰρ πείθηται, λαμβάνει τι ὧν δείται, ὅταν δὲ άμελη, κολάζεται. άνθρώπους δ' έστι πιθανωτέρους ποιείν καὶ λόγω ἐπιδεικνύοντα, ὡς συμφέρει αὐτοίς πείθεσθαι, τοις δε δούλοις και ή δοκούσα θηριώδης παιδεία εἶναι πάνυ ἐστὶν ἐπαγωγὸς πρὸς τὸ πείθεσθαι διδάσκειν τη γαρ γαστρί αὐτῶν ἐπὶ ταῖς ἐπιθυμίαις προσχαριζόμενος ἂν πολλὰ ἀνύτοις παρ' αὐτῶν. αἱ δὲ φιλότιμοι των φύσεων καὶ τω ἐπαίνω παροξύνονται. πεινώσι γὰρ τοῦ ἐπαίνου οὐχ ἦττον ἔνιαι τῶν φύσεων η άλλαι των σίτων τε καὶ ποτών, ταῦτά τε οὖν, ὅσα-10 περ αὐτὸς ποιῶν οἶμαι πιθανωτέροις ἀνθρώποις χρῆ-

### OECONOMICUS 13.5-13.10

anyone who can make men fit to govern others can also teach them to be masters of others; and if he can make them fit to be masters, he can make them fit to be kings. Anyone who can do that seems to me to deserve high praise, not laughter."

"Well now. Socrates, other creatures learn obedience in two ways: by being punished when they try to disobey, and by being rewarded when they are eager to serve you. Colts, for example, learn to obey the horse breaker by getting something they like when they are obedient and getting into trouble when they are disobedient, until they do what the horse breaker wants. Puppies, too, are far inferior to human beings in intelligence and speech, and yet they learn to run in circles and turn somersaults and do many other tricks in the same way; for when they obey they get something that they want, and when they're careless they're punished. And people can be made more obedient merely by talking to them, showing them that it is advantageous for them to obey. But in dealing with slaves the training considered suitable for wild animals is also a very effective way of teaching obedience, for you will get a lot out of them by filling their stomachs with the food they hanker for. Those of an ambitious disposition are also spurred on by praise, some natures being as hungry for praise as others for food and drink. Now these are precisely the things that I do myself with a view to making

ю

7

8

9

σθαι, διδάσκω οθς ἂν ἐπιτρόπους βούλωμαι καταστήσαι καὶ τάδε συλλαμβάνω αὐτοῖς ἱμάτιά τε γάρ, α δεί παρέχειν έμε τοίς έργαστήρσι, και ύποδήματα ούχ ὅμοια πάντα ποιῶ, ἀλλὰ τὰ μὲν χείρω, τὰ δὲ βελτίω, ΐνα ἢ τὸν κρείττω τοῖς βελτίοσι τιμᾶν, τῶ δὲ χείρονι τὰ ήττω διδόναι. πάνυ γάρ μοι δοκεῖ, ἔφη, ὧ 11 Σώκρατες, άθυμία έγγίγνεσθαι τοῖς άγαθοῖς. ὅταν όρωσι τὰ μὲν ἔργα δι' αύτων καταπραττόμενα, των δὲ όμοίων τυγχάνοντας έαυτοίς τοὺς μήτε πονείν μήτε κινδυνεύειν έθέλοντας, ὅταν δέη, αὐτός τε οὖν οὐδ' 12 όπως τι οὖν τῶν ἴσων ἀξιῶ τοὺς ἀμείνους τοῖς κακίοσι τυγχάνειν τούς τ' έπιτρόπους ὅταν μὲν είδῶ διαδεδωκότας τοῖς πλείστου ἀξίοις τὰ κράτιστα, ἐπαινῶ, ην δε ίδω η κολακεύμασί τινα προτιμώμενον η καὶ άλλη τινὶ ἀνωφελεῖ χάριτι, οὐκ ἀμελῶ, ἀλλ' ἐπιπλήττω καὶ πειρώμαι διδάσκειν, ὧ Σώκρατες, ὅτι οὐδ΄ αύτῷ σύμφορα ταῦτα ποιεῖ.

14. Όταν δέ, ὧ Ἰσχόμαχε, ἔφην ἐγώ, καὶ ἄρχειν ήδη ἱκανός σοι γένηται, ὥστε πειθομένους παρέχεσαι, ἢ ἀποτετελεσμένον τοῦτον ἡγἢ ἐπίτροπον ἢ ἔτι τινὸς προσδεῖται ὁ ταῦτα ἔχων ἃ σὰ εἴρηκας;

Ναὶ μὰ Δί, ἔφη ὁ Ἰσχόμαχος, τοῦ γε ἀπέχεσθαι τῶν δεσποσύνων καὶ μὴ κλέπτειν. εἰ γὰρ ὁ τοὺς καρποὺς μεταχειριζόμενος τολμῷη ἀφανίζειν, ὥστε μὴ λείπειν λυσιτελοῦντας τοῖς ἔργοις, τί ἂν ὄφελος εἴη τὸ διὰ τῆς τούτου ἐπιμελείας γεωργεῖν;

<sup>3</sup>Η καὶ ταύτην οὖν, ἔφην ἐγώ, τὴν δικαιοσύνην σὺ ὑποδύη διδάσκειν;

2

people more obedient. But they are not the only lessons I give to those whom I want to appoint as my foremen: I have other ways of helping them get on. For the clothes that I must provide for my work force and the shoes are not all alike; some are better than others, some worse, so that I can reward the better workers with the superior articles and give the inferior ones to the less deserving. For I think it is very disheartening to good workers, Socrates, when they see that they do all the work and others who are not willing to work hard and run risks, when need be, get the same as they do. For my part, then, I don't choose to put the better on a level with the worse, and when I know that my foremen have distributed the best things to the most deserving, I commend them; and if I see that flattery or any other useless service wins special favor, I don't overlook it but reprove the foreman, and try to show him. Socrates, that such favoritism is not even in his own interest."

14. "Now, Ischomachus," I said, "when you find your man so competent to govern that he can make his charges obedient, do you think him a perfect foreman, or does he need anything else, even with the qualifications you have mentioned?"

"Of course, Socrates," Ischomachus replied, "he must keep his hands off his master's property and not steal. For if the man who handles the crops dares to make away with them, and doesn't leave enough to make a profit from the enterprise, what good can come of farming under his management?"

"Then do you take it on yourself to teach this kind of right behavior too?"

11

Καὶ πάνυ, ἔφη ὁ Ἰσχόμαχος οὐ μέντοι γε πάντας έξ έτοίμου εύρίσκω ύπακούοντας της διδασκαλίας ταύτης, καίτοι τὰ μὲν καὶ ἐκ τῶν Δράκοντος νόμων, τὰ δὲ καὶ ἐκ τῶν Σόλωνος πειρῶμαι, ἔφη, λαμβάνων έμβιβάζειν είς την δικαιοσύνην τους οἰκέτας, δοκούσι γάρ μοι, ἔφη, καὶ οὖτοι οἱ ἄνδρες θεῖναι πολλοὺς τῶν νόμων έπὶ δικαιοσύνης τῆς τοιαύτης διδασκαλία. γέγραπται γὰρ ζημιοῦσθαι ἐπὶ τοῖς κλέμμασι καὶ δεδέσθαι, ήν τις άλω ποιών, καὶ θανατούσθαι τοὺς έγχειροῦντας. δήλον οὖν, ἔφη, ὅτι ἔγραφον αὐτὰ βουλόμενοι άλυσιτελή ποιήσαι τοῖς άδίκοις τὴν αἰσχροκέρδειαν. έγω οὖν, ἔφη, καὶ τούτων προσφέρων ἔνια καὶ ἄλλα τῶν βασιλικῶν νόμων προφερόμενος πειρωμαι δικαίους περὶ τὰ διαχειριζόμενα ἀπεργάζεσθαι τοὺς οἰκέτας, ἐκεῖνοι μὲν γὰρ οἱ νόμοι ζημίαι μόνον είσὶ τοῖς άμαρτάνουσιν, οἱ δὲ βασιλικοὶ νόμοι οὐ μόνον ζημιοῦσι τοὺς ἀδικοῦντας, ἀλλὰ καὶ ὡφελοῦσι τοὺς δικαίους ώστε όρωντες πλουσιωτέρους γιγνομένους τοὺς δικαίους τῶν ἀδίκων πολλοὶ καὶ φιλοκερδείς ὄντες εὖ μάλα ἐπιμένουσι τῷ μὴ ἀδικείν. οὓς δ' αν αισθάνωμαι, έφη, όμως καὶ εὖ πάσχοντας έτι άδικείν πειρωμένους, τούτους ώς άνηκέστους πλεονέκτας ὄντας ήδη καὶ τῆς χρήσεως ἀποπαύω. οὓς δ' ἂν αὖ καταμάθω μη τῷ πλέον ἔχειν μόνον διὰ τὴν δικαιοσύνην ἐπαιρομένους δικαίους εἶναι, ἀλλὰ καὶ τοῦ έπαινείσθαι έπιθυμοῦντας ὑπ' έμοῦ, τούτοις ὥσπερ έλευθέροις ήδη χρώμαι οὐ μόνον πλουτίζων, άλλὰ καὶ τιμών ώς καλούς τε κάγαθούς, τούτω γάρ μοι δοκεί, 10

### OECONOMICUS 14.3-14.10

"Very much so, though I don't find that all readily pay attention to this lesson. Nevertheless I guide my slaves onto the path of right behavior with the aid of maxims drawn in part from the laws of Draco, in part from the laws of Solon. For it seems to me that these worthies enacted many of their laws with an eye on this particular kind of right behavior. For it is laid down: 'thieves shall be punished for their thefts and anyone found guilty of theft shall be imprisoned, and if they attempt it shall be put to death.'25 The object of these enactments was clearly to make greed unprofitable to the offender. By applying some of these statutes and other enactments found in the Persian king's code, I try to make my slaves upright with the property that passes through their hands. For while the former laws only penalize the wrongdoer, 26 the king's code not only punishes the guilty but also benefits the upright. Thus, seeing that the honest grow richer than the dishonest, many, despite their love of profit, are careful to remain free from dishonesty. And if I notice people who attempt to persist in dishonesty even though they are well treated, I regard them as incorrigibly greedy and have nothing more to do with them. On the other hand, if I notice people who are inclined to be honest not only because they gain by this honesty but also from a desire to win my approbation, I treat them like free men by making them rich; and not only that, I also honor them like gentlemen. For I think, Socrates, that the difference between

<sup>25</sup> This is neither a clear nor an exact statement of the law attributed to Solon in Demosthenes, *Timocrates* 113; and some suspect a corruption in the text.

6

7

9

<sup>26</sup> Mem. 3.4.8.

ἔφη, ὧ Σώκρατες, διαφέρειν ἀνὴρ φιλότιμος ἀνδρὸς φιλοκερδοῦς, τῷ ἐθέλειν ἐπαίνου καὶ τιμῆς ἕνεκα καὶ πονεῖν ὅπου δεῖ καὶ κινδυνεύειν καὶ αἰσχρῶν κερδῶν ἀπέχεσθαι.

15. ἀλλὰ μέντοι ἐπειδάν γε ἐμποιήσης τινὶ τὸ βούλεσθαί σοι εἶναι τἀγαθά, ἐμποιήσης δὲ τῷ αὐτῷ τούτῳ τὸ ἐπιμελεῖσθαι, ὅπως ταῦτά σοι ἐπιτελῆται, ἔτι δὲ πρὸς τούτοις ἐπιστήμην κτήση αὐτῷ, ὡς ἂν ποιούμενα ἔκαστα τῶν ἔργων ὡφελιμώτερα γίγνοιτο, πρὸς δὲ τούτοις ἄρχειν ἱκανὸν αὐτὸν ποιήσης, ἐπὶ δὲ τούτοις πᾶσιν ἤδηταί σοι τὰ ἐκ τῆς γῆς ὡραῖα ἀποδεικνύων ὅτι πλεῖστα ὥσπερ σὰ σαυτῷ, οὐκέτι ἐρήσομαι περὶ τούτου, εἰ ἔτι τινὸς ὁ τοιοῦτος προσδεῖται πάνυ γάρ μοι δοκεῖ ἤδη πολλοῦ ἂν ἄξιος εἶναι ἐπίτροπος ῶν τοιοῦτος. ἐκεῖνο μέντοι, ἔφην ἐγώ, ὧ Ἰσχόμαχε, μὴ ἀπολίπης, ὃ ἡμῖν ἀργότατα ἐπιδεδράμηται τοῦ λόγου.

Τὸ ποῖον; ἔφη ὁ Ἰσχόμαχος.

Έλεξας δήπου, ἔφην ἐγώ, ὅτι μέγιστον εἴη μαθεῖν, ὅπως δεῖ ἐξεργάζεσθαι ἔκαστα· εἰ δὲ μή, οὐδὲ τῆς ἐπιμελείας ἔφησθα ὄφελος οὐδὲν γίγνεσθαι, εἰ μή τις ἐπίσταιτο ἃ δεῖ καὶ ὡς δεῖ ποιεῖν.

Ένταῦθα δὴ εἶπεν ὁ Ἰσχόμαχος. Τὴν τέχνην με ήδη, ὧ Σώκρατες, κελεύεις αὐτὴν διδάσκειν τῆς γεωργίας;

Αὕτη γὰρ ἴσως, ἔφην ἐγώ, ἤδη ἐστὶν ἡ ποιοῦσα τοὺς μὲν ἐπισταμένους αὐτὴν πλουσίους, τοὺς δὲ μὴ ἐπισταμένους πολλὰ πονοῦντας ἀπόρως βιοτεύειν.

2

ambition and greed consists in this, that for the sake of praise and honor the ambitious are willing to work hard, to take risks, and refrain from dishonest gain."

15. "Well, I won't go on to ask whether anything more is needed in your man, after you have implanted in him a desire for your prosperity and have made him also careful to see that you achieve it, and have obtained for him, besides, the knowledge needed to ensure that every piece of work done will add to the profits, and further, have made him capable of governing, and when besides all this, he takes as much delight in producing grand harvests for you in due season as you would take if you did the work yourself. For it seems to me that a man like that would make a very valuable foreman. Nevertheless, Ischomachus, please don't neglect the point that we have merely touched on in our discussion."

"Which point?" asked Ischomachus.

"You said, I believe, that the greatest lesson to learn is how each job ought to be done; and you added that if a man doesn't know what to do and how to do it, no good can come of his management."

Then he said, "Socrates, are you insisting now that I should teach the whole art and mystery of agriculture?"

"Yes," I said, "for maybe it is just this that makes rich men of those who understand it, and condemns the ignorant to a life of poverty, for all their hard work."

509

2

4 Νῦν τοίνυν, ἔφη, ὧ Σώκρατες, καὶ τὴν φιλανθρωπίαν ταύτης τῆς τέχνης ἀκούση. τὸ γὰρ ἀφελιμωτάτην οὖσαν καὶ ἡδίστην ἐργάζεσθαι καὶ καλλίστην καὶ προσφιλεστάτην θεοῖς τε καὶ ἀνθρώποις ἔτι πρὸς τούτοις καὶ ῥάστην εἶναι μαθεῖν πῶς οὐχὶ γενναῖόν ἐστι; γενναῖα δὲ δήπου καλοῦμεν καὶ τῶν ζώων ὁπόσα καλὰ καὶ μεγάλα καὶ ἀφέλιμα ὄντα πραέα ἐστὶ πρὸς τοὺς ἀνθρώπους.

Άλλὰ ταῦτα μὲν ἐγώ, ἔφην, ὧ Ἰσχόμαχε, ἱκανῶς 5 δοκῶ καταμεμαθηκέναι ἡ εἶπας, καθὰ δεῖ διδάσκειν τὸν ἐπίτροπον καὶ γὰρ ἡ ἔφησθα εὔνουν σοι ποιεῖν αὐτὸν μαθεῖν δοκῶ καὶ ή ἐπιμελη καὶ ἀρχικὸν καὶ δίκαιον. δ δε εἶπας ως δεῖ μαθεῖν τὸν μέλλοντα ὀρθως γεωργίας ἐπιμελεῖσθαι καὶ ἃ δεῖ ποιεῖν καὶ ὡς δεῖ καὶ όπότε ἕκαστα, ταῦτά μοι δοκοῦμεν, ἔφην ἐγώ, ἀργότερόν πως ἐπιδεδραμηκέναι τῶ λόγω ιοπερ εἰ εἴποις, ὅτι δεῖ γράμματα ἐπίστασθαι τὸν μέλλοντα δυνήσεσθαι τὰ ὑπαγορευόμενα γράφειν καὶ τὰ γεγραμμένα άναγιγνώσκειν. ταῦτα γὰρ έγὼ ἀκούσας, ότι μεν δεί γράμματα επίστασθαι ήκηκόη άν, τοῦτο δὲ είδως οὐδέν τι οἶμαι μᾶλλον ἂν ἐπισταίμην γράμματα. οὕτω δὲ καὶ νῦν ὅτι μὲν δεῖ ἐπίστασθαι γεωρ-8 γίαν τὸν μέλλοντα ὀρθώς ἐπιμελεῖσθαι αὐτῆς ῥαδίως πέπεισμαι, τοῦτο μέντοι είδως οὐδέν τι μᾶλλον ἐπίσταμαι ὅπως δεῖ γεωργεῖν, ἀλλ' εἴ μοι αὐτίκα μάλα δόξειε γεωργείν, ὅμοιος ἄν μοι δοκῶ εἶναι τῷ περιιόντι ἰατρώ καὶ ἐπισκοποῦντι τοὺς κάμνοντας, εἰδότι δὲ οὐδὲν ὅ τι συμφέρει τοῖς κάμνουσιν. ἵν' οὖν μὴ

### OECONOMICUS 15.4-15.9

"Well then, Socrates, you will now hear how kindly is this art toward mankind. Most beneficial, pleasant to work at, fine and dear to gods and men in the highest degree, it is also in the highest degree easy to learn. Noble qualities surely! As you know, we call those creatures noble that are beautiful, large, and beneficial, and yet gentle toward human beings."

"But I do think, Ischomachus, that I quite understand your account of these matters-I mean how to teach a foreman; for I think I follow your statement that you make him loyal to you, and attentive, and capable of governing, and honest. But you said that one who is to be successful in the management of a farm must learn what to do and how and when to do it. That is the subject that we have treated, it seems to me, in a rather cursory fashion, as if you said that anyone who is to be capable of writing from dictation and reading what is written must know the alphabet. For had I been told that, I should have been told, to be sure, that I must know the alphabet, but I don't think that piece of information would help me to know it. So too now; I'm easily convinced that a man who is to manage a farm successfully must understand farming, but that knowledge doesn't help me understand how to farm. Were I to decide this very moment to be a farmer, I think I would be like that doctor who goes round visiting the sick but has no knowledge of the right way to treat them. So

8

τοιοῦτος ὧ, ἔφην ἐγώ, δίδασκέ με αὐτὰ τὰ ἔργα τῆς γεωργίας.

Αλλά μήν, έφη, ὧ Σώκρατες, οὐχ ὥσπερ γε τὰς άλλας τέχνας κατατριβήναι δεί μανθάνοντας πρίν άξια της τροφης έργάζεσθαι τὸν διδασκόμενον, οὐχ οὕτω καὶ ἡ γεωργία δύσκολός ἐστι μαθεῖν, ἀλλὰ τὰ μεν ίδων αν έργαζομένους, τὰ δε ἀκούσας, εὐθὺς αν έπίσταιο, ὥστε καὶ ἄλλον, εἰ βούλοιο, διδάσκειν. οἴομαι δ', έφη, πάνυ καὶ λεληθέναι πολλά σε αὐτὸν έπιστάμενον αὐτῆς, καὶ γὰρ δὴ οἱ μὲν ἄλλοι τεχνῖται 11 ἀποκρύπτονταί πως τὰ ἐπικαιριώτατα ης ἔκαστος ἔχει τέχνης, τῶν δὲ γεωργῶν ὁ κάλλιστα μὲν φυτεύων μάλιστ' ἂν ἥδοιτο, εἴ τις αὐτὸν θεῷτο, ὁ κάλλιστα δὲ σπείρων ώσαύτως ὅ τι δὲ ἔροιο τῶν καλῶς πεποιημένων, οὐδὲν ὅ τι ἄν σε ἀποκρύψαιτο ὅπως ἐποίησεν. ούτω καὶ τὰ ἤθη, ὧ Σώκρατες, ἔφη, γενναιοτάτους τοὺς αὐτῆ συνόντας ἡ γεωργία ἔοικε παρέχεσθαι.

Άλλὰ τὸ μὲν προοίμιον, ἔφην ἐγώ, καλὸν καὶ οὐχ οἷον ἀκούσαντα ἀποτρέπεσθαι τοῦ ἐρωτήματος σὲ δὲ ότι εὐπετές ἐστι μαθεῖν, διὰ τοῦτο πολύ μοι μᾶλλον διέξιθι αὐτήν. οὐ γὰρ σοὶ αἰσχρὸν τὰ ράδια διδάσκειν έστίν, άλλ' έμοὶ πολὺ αἴσχιον μὴ ἐπίστασθαι,

άλλως τε καὶ εἰ χρήσιμα ὄντα τυγχάνει.

16. Πρῶτον μὲν τοίνυν, ἔφη, ὧ Σώκρατες, τοῦτο έπιδείξαι βούλομαί σοι, ώς οὐ χαλεπόν έστιν ο λέγουσι ποικιλώτατον της γεωργίας είναι οι λόγω μέν ακριβέστατα αὐτὴν διεξιόντες, ήκιστα δὲ ἐργαζόμενοι. φασὶ γὰρ τὸν μέλλοντα ὀρθῶς γεωργήσειν τὴν φύσιν χρηναι πρώτον της γης είδέναι.

10

12

#### OECONOMICUS 15.9-16.2

you must teach me the actual operations of farming, so I won't be like him."

"Well, Socrates, farming is not a lot of trouble to learn, unlike other arts that the student must study till he is worn out before he can earn his keep by his work. Some of the jobs you can understand by watching men at work, others by just being told, well enough to teach someone else if you wanted. And I believe that you know a good deal about it yourself without being aware of it. The truth is, whereas other artists more or less conceal the most important points in their own art, the farmer who plants best is most pleased when he is being watched, as is the one who sows best. Question him about any piece of work well done and he will tell you exactly how he did it. So farming, Socrates, more than any other calling, seems to produce a very noble disposition in its followers."

"An excellent preamble," I exclaimed, "and not such as to damp the listener's curiosity. Do describe it to me, all the more because it is so simple to learn. For it is no disgrace for you to teach what's simple, but far more a disgrace for me not to understand it, especially if it's really useful."

16. "First then, Socrates, I want to show you that what is called the most complicated problem in agriculture by the authors who write most accurately on the theory of the subject but are not practical farmers, is really a simple matter. For they tell us that to be a successful farmer one must first know the nature of the soil."

513

10

11

12

'Ορθως γε, έφην έγω, ταῦτα λέγοντες. ὁ γὰρ μὴ εἰδως, ὅ τι δύναται ἡ γῆ φέρειν, οὐδ' ὅ τι σπείρειν οἴομαι οὐδ' ὅ τι φυτεύειν δεῖ εἰδείη ἄν.

Οὐκοῦν, ἔφη ὁ Ἰσχόμαχος, καὶ ἀλλοτρίας γῆς τοῦτο ἔστι γνῶναι, ὅ τι τε δύναται φέρειν καὶ ὅ τι μὴ δύναται, ὁρῶντα τοὺς καρποὺς καὶ τὰ δένδρα. ἐπειδὰν μέντοι γνῷ τις, οὐκέτι συμφέρει θεομαχεῖν. οὐ γὰρ ἂν ὅτου δέοιτο αὐτός, τοῦτο σπείρων καὶ φυτεύων μᾶλλον ἂν ἔχοι τὰ ἐπιτήδεια ἢ ὅ τι ἡ γῆ ἥδοιτο φύουσα καὶ τρέφουσα. ἢν δ΄ ἄρα δι' ἀργίαν τῶν ἐχόντων αὐτὴν μὴ ἔχῃ τὴν ἑαυτῆς δύναμιν ἐπιδεικνύναι, ἔστι καὶ παρὰ γείτονος τόπου πολλάκις ἀληθέστερα περὶ αὐτῆς γνῶναι ἢ παρὰ γείτονος ἀνθρώπου πυθέσθαι. καὶ χερσεύουσα δὲ ὅμως ἐπιδείκνυσι τὴν αὐτῆς φύσιν ἡ γὰρ τὰ ἄγρια καλὰ φύουσα δύναται θεραπευομένη καὶ τὰ ἤμερα καλὰ ἐκφέρειν. φύσιν μὲν δὴ γῆς οὕτως καὶ οἱ μὴ πάνυ ἔμπειροι γεωργίας ὅμως δύνανται διαγιγνώσκειν.

ἀλλὰ τοῦτο μέν, ἔφην ἐγώ, ὧ Ἰσχόμαχε, ἰκανῶς ἤδη μοι δοκῶ ἀποτεθαρρηκέναι, ὡς οὐ δεῖ φοβούμενον, μὴ οὐ γνῶ τῆς γῆς φύσιν, ἀπέχεσθαι γεωργίας. καὶ γὰρ δή, ἔφην, ἀνεμνήσθην τὸ τῶν ἀλιέων, ὅτι θαλαττουργοὶ ὅντες καὶ οὕτε καταστήσαντες ἐπὶ θέαν οὕθ᾽ ἤσυχοι βαδίζοντες, ἀλλὰ παρατρέχοντες ἄμα τοὺς ἀγρούς, ὅταν ὁρῶσι τοὺς καρποὺς ἐν τῆ γῆ, ὅμως οὐκ ὀκνοῦσιν ἀποφαίνεσθαι περὶ τῆς γῆς, ὁποία τε ἀγαθή ἐστι καὶ ὁποία κακή, ἀλλὰ τὴν μὲν ψέγουσι, τὴν δ᾽ ἐπαινοῦσι. καὶ πάνυ τοίνυν τοῖς ἐμπείροις γε-

3

# OECONOMICUS 16.2-16.7

"Yes, and they're right," I remarked; "for if you don't know what the soil is capable of growing, I don't suppose you can know what to plant or what to sow."

"Yes," said Ischomachus, "but you can tell simply by looking at the crops and trees on another man's land what the soil can and cannot grow. And when you've found out, it's useless to fight against the gods, for you aren't likely to get a better yield from the land by sowing and planting what you want instead of the crops and trees that the land prefers to grow and nurture. If it happens that the land does not declare its own capabilities because its owners are lazy, you can often gather more correct information from a neighboring plot than from a neighboring farmer. Even when the land lies barren, it reveals its nature. For if the wild plants growing on the land are of fine quality, then by good farming the soil is capable of yielding cultivated crops of fine quality. That way, the nature of the soil can be ascertained even by the novice who has no experience of farming."

"Well, I think I am now confident, Ischomachus, that I need not avoid farming from fear of not knowing the nature of the soil. The fact is, I am reminded that fishermen, though their business is in the sea, and they neither stop the boat to take a look nor slow down, nevertheless, when they see the crops as they scud past the farms, they don't hesitate to express an opinion about the soil, which is the good kind and which the bad, now condemning, now praising it. And what's more, I notice that in their opinion

3

5

ωργίας όρῶ αὐτοὺς τὰ πλείστα κατὰ ταὐτὰ ἀποφαινομένους περὶ τῆς ἀγαθῆς γῆς.

Πόθεν οὖν βούλει, ἔφη, ὧ Σώκρατες, ἄρξωμαί σε τῆς γεωργίας ὑπομιμνήσκειν; οἶδα γὰρ ὅτι ἐπισταμένω σοι πάνυ πολλὰ φράσω ὡς δεῖ γεωργεῖν.

Έκεῖνό μοι δοκῶ, ἔφην ἐγώ, ὧ Ἰσχόμαχε, πρῶτον ἄν ἡδέως μανθάνειν, φιλοσόφου γὰρ μάλιστά ἐστιν ἀνδρός, ὅπως ἄν ἐγώ, εἰ βουλοίμην, γῆν ἐργαζόμενος πλείστας κριθὰς καὶ πλείστους πυροὺς λαμβάνοιμι.

10 Οὐκοῦν τοῦτο μὲν οἶσθα, ὅτι τῷ σπόρῷ νεὸν δεῖ ὑπεργάζεσθαι;

11 Οἶδα γάρ, ἔφην ἐγώ.

8

9

Εἰ οὖν ἀρχοίμεθα, ἔφη, ἀροῦν τὴν γῆν χειμῶνος; ἀλλὰ πηλὸς ἂν εἴη, ἐγὼ ἔφην.

Άλλὰ τοῦ θέρους σοι δοκεῖ;

Σκληρά, ἔφην ἐγώ, ἡ γῆ ἔσται κινεῖν τῷ ζεύγει.

12 Κινδυνεύει ἔαρος, ἔφη, εἶναι τούτου τοῦ ἔργου ἀρκτέον.

Εἰκὸς γάρ, ἔφην ἐγώ, ἐστὶ μάλιστα χεῖσθαι τὴν γῆν τηνικαῦτα κινουμένην.

Καὶ τὴν πόαν γε ἀναστρεφομένην, ἔφη, ὧ Σώκρατες, τηνικαῦτα κόπρον μὲν τῆ γῆ ἤδη παρέχειν, καρπὸν δ' οὔπω καταβαλεῖν ὥστε φύεσθαι. οἶμαι γὰρ δὴ καὶ τοῦτό σ' ἔτι γιγνώσκειν, ὅτι εἰ μέλλει ἀγαθὴ ἡ νεὸς ἔσεσθαι, ὕλης τε δεῖ καθαρὰν αὐτὴν εἶναι καὶ ὀπτὴν ὅτι μάλιστα πρὸς τὸν ἥλιον.

Πάνυ γε, ἔφην ἐγώ, καὶ ταῦτα οὕτως ἡγοῦμαι χρῆναι ἔχειν.

# **OECONOMICUS 16.7-16.13**

about the good land they generally agree exactly with experienced farmers."

"Well then, Socrates, let me refresh your memory on the subject of agriculture; but where would you like me to begin? For I'm aware that in you I will be addressing someone who already knows a lot about the right method of farming."

"First, Ischomachus, I think I would be glad to learn, for this is the philosopher's way, how I am to cultivate the land if I want to get the largest crops of wheat and barley out of it."

"Well, you know, I take it, that fallow ground must be prepared for sowing?"

"Yes. I know."

11

13

10

8

9

"Suppose, then, we start plowing in winter?"

"But the land will be a bog."

"How about starting in summer?"

"The land will be hard for the oxen to plow up."

"Then it seems that spring is the season for beginning 12 this work."

"'Yes, the land is likely to be more friable if it is turned then."

"Yes, and the grass turned up is long enough at that season to serve as fertilizer but, not having shed seed, it won't grow again. You know also, I guess, that fallow land can't be satisfactory unless it is clear of weeds and thoroughly baked in the sun?"

"Yes, certainly; that's essential, I think."

14 Ταῦτ' οὖν, ἔφη, σὰ ἄλλως πως νομίζεις μᾶλλον ἂν γίγνεσθαι ἢ εἰ ἐν τῷ θέρει ὅτι πλειστάκις μεταβάλοι τις τὴν γῆν;

Οἶδα μὲν οὖν, ἔφην, ἀκριβῶς, ὅτι οὐδαμῶς ἂν μᾶλλον ἡ μὲν ὕλη ἐπιπολάζοι καὶ αὐαίνοιτο ὑπὸ τοῦ καύματος, ἡ δὲ γὴ ὀπτῷτο ὑπὸ τοῦ ἡλίου ἢ εἴ τις αὐτὴν ἐν μέσφ τῷ θέρει καὶ ἐν μέση τῆ ἡμέρᾳ κινοίη τῷ ζεύγει.

15 Εἰ δὲ ἄνθρωποι σκάπτοντες τὴν νεὸν ποιοῖεν, ἔφη, οὐκ εὕδηλον, ὅτι καὶ τούτους δίχα δεῖ ποιεῖν τὴν γῆν καὶ τὴν ὕλην;

Καὶ τὴν μέν γε ὕλην, ἔφην ἐγώ, καταβάλλειν, ὡς αὐαίνηται, ἐπιπολῆς, τὴν δὲ γῆν στρέφειν, ὡς ἡ ὡμὴ αὐτῆς ὀπτᾶται.

17. Περὶ μὲν τῆς νεοῦ ὁρậς, ἔφη, ὧ Σώκρατες, ὡς ἀμφοτέροις ἡμῖν ταὐτὰ δοκεῖ.

 $\Delta$ οκε $\hat{i}$   $\gamma \hat{a} \rho$   $o \hat{v} \nu$ , έφην έγώ.

Περὶ γε μέντοι τοῦ σπόρου ὥρας ἄλλο τι, ἔφη, ὧ Σώκρατες, γιγνώσκεις ἢ τὴν ὥραν σπείρειν, ἢς πάντες μὲν οἱ πρόσθεν ἄνθρωποι πεῖραν λαβόντες, πάντες δὲ οἱ νῦν λαμβάνοντες ἐγνώκασι κρατίστην εἶναι; ἐπειδὰν γὰρ ὁ μετοπωρινὸς χρόνος ἔλθη, πάντες που οἱ ἄνθρωποι πρὸς τὸν θεὸν ἀποβλέπουσιν, ὁπότε βρέξας τὴν γῆν ἀφήσει αὐτοὺς σπείρειν.

Έγνωκασι δή γ', ἔφην ἐγώ, ὧ Ἰσχόμαχε, καὶ τὸ μὴ ἐν ξηρῷ σπείρειν ἑκόντες εἶναι πάντες ἄνθρωποι, δῆλον ὅτι πολλαῖς ζημίαις παλαίσαντες οἱ πρὶν κελευσθῆναι ὑπὸ τοῦ θεοῦ σπείραντες.

"Do you think that there is any better way of accomplishing that than by turning the land over as often as possible in the summer?"

"I know for certain that if you want the weeds to lie on the surface and wither in the heat, and the land to be baked by the sun, the surest way is to plow it up at midday in midsummer."

"And if people prepare the fallow by digging, isn't it obvious that they also must separate the weeds from the soil?"

"Yes, and they must throw the weeds on the surface to wither and turn up the soil so that the underside of it can be baked."

17. "You see, then, Socrates, that we agree about the fallow."

"It does seem so, to be sure."

"And now concerning the right time for sowing, Socrates. Don't you believe that the time to sow is the time that has been invariably found best by past experience and is universally approved by present practice? For as soon as autumn ends all men, I think, look anxiously to the god to see when he will send rain upon the earth and make them free to sow."

"Yes, Ischomachus, all men have made up their minds, of course, not to sow in dry ground if they can help it, clearly because those who sowed without waiting to be bidden by the god have had to grapple with many losses."

519

3 Οὐκοῦν ταῦτα μέν, ἔφη ὁ Ἰσχόμαχος, ὁμογνωμονοῦμεν πάντες οἱ ἄνθρωποι.

" γαρ ὁ θεὸς διδάσκει, ἔφην ἐγώ, οὕτω γίγνεται ὁμονοεῖν· οἷον ἄμα πᾶσι δοκεῖ βέλτιον εἶναι ἐν τῷ χειμῶνι παχέα ἱμάτια φορεῖν, ἢν δύνωνται, καὶ πῦρ κάειν ἄμα πᾶσι δοκεῖ, ἢν ξύλα ἔχωσιν.

'Αλλ' ἐν τῷδε, ἔφη ὁ Ἰσχόμαχος, πολλοὶ ἤδη διαφέρονται, ὧ Σώκρατες, περὶ τοῦ σπόρου, πότερον ὁ πρώιμος κράτιστος ἢ ὁ μέσος ἢ ὁ ὀψιμώτατος.

Καὶ ὁ θεός, ἔφην ἐγώ, οὐ τεταγμένως τὸ ἔτος ἄγει, ἀλλὰ τὸ μὲν τῷ πρωίμῳ κάλλιστα, τὸ δὲ τῷ μέσῳ, τὸ δὲ τῷ ὀψιμωτάτω.

Σὺ οὖν, ἔφη, ὧ Σώκρατες, πότερον ἡγῆ κρεῖττον εἶναι ἐνὶ τούτων τῶν σπόρων χρῆσθαι ἐκλεξάμενον, ἐάν τε πολὺ ἐάν τε ὀλίγον σπέρμα σπείρη τις, ἢ ἀρξάμενον ἀπὸ τοῦ πρωιμωτάτου μέχρι τοῦ ὀψιμωτάτου σπείρειν;

Καὶ ἐγὼ εἶπον· Ἐμοὶ μέν, ὧ Ἰσχόμαχε, δοκεῖ κράτιστον εἶναι παντὸς μετέχειν τοῦ σπόρου. πολὺ γὰρ νομίζω κρεῖττον εἶναι ἀεὶ ἀρκοῦντα σῖτον λαμβάνειν ἢ ποτὲ μὲν πάνυ πολύν, ποτὲ δὲ μηδ' ἰκανόν.

Καὶ τοῦτο τοίνυν σύγε, ἔφη, ὧ Σώκρατες, ὁμογνωμονεῖς ἐμοὶ ὁ μανθάνων τῷ διδάσκοντι, καὶ ταῦτα πρόσθεν ἐμοῦ τὴν γνώμην ἀποφαινόμενος.

Τί γάρ, ἔφην ἐγώ, ἐν τῷ ῥίπτειν τὸ σπέρμα ποικίλη τέχνη ἔνεστι;

Πάντως, ἔφη, ὧ Σώκρατες, ἐπισκεψώμεθα καὶ

5

# OECONOMICUS 17.3-17.7

"So far, then," said Ischomachus, "all the world is of 3 one mind."

"Yes," I said, "where the god is our teacher we all come to think alike. For example, all agree that it is better to wear warm clothing in winter, if they can, and all agree on the desirability of having a fire, if they have wood."

"But," said Ischomachus, "when we come to the question whether sowing is best done early or very late or at the midseason, we find much difference of opinion, Socrates."

"And the god," I said, "doesn't regulate the year by fixed laws, but in one year it may be advantageous to sow early, in another very late, in another at midseason."

"What do you think, then, Socrates? Is it better to select one of these times for sowing, whether you sow a lot or just a little, or to begin sowing at the start of the season and continue to the end?"

"For my part, Ischomachus, I think it's best to sow for succession throughout the season. For in my opinion it is much better to get enough food at all times than too much at one time and not enough at another."

"Here again then, Socrates, student and teacher are of one opinion; and what's more, you the student stated this opinion before I did."

"Well now, is scattering the seed a complex skill?"
"By all means let's take that into consideration too,

5

τοῦτο. ὅτι μὲν γὰρ ἐκ τῆς χειρὸς δεῖ ῥίπτεσθαι τὸ σπέρμα, καὶ σύ που οἶσθα, ἔφη.

Καὶ γὰρ ἐώρακα, ἔφην ἐγώ.

Υίπτειν δέ γε, ἔφη, οἱ μὲν ὁμαλῶς δύνανται, οἱ δ' οὔ.

Οὐκοῦν τοῦτο μέν, ἔφην ἐγώ, ἤδη μελέτης δεῖται, ὅσπερ τοῖς κιθαρισταῖς ἡ χείρ, ὅπως δύνηται ὑπηρετεῖν τῆ γνώμη.

Πάνυ μὲν οὖν, ἔφη· ἢν δέ γε ἢ, ἔφη, ἡ γῆ ἡ μὲν λεπτοτέρα, ἡ δὲ παχυτέρα;

Τί τοῦτο, ἐγὼ ἔφην, λέγεις; ἄρά γε τὴν μὲν λεπτοτέραν ὅπερ ἀσθενεστέραν, τὴν δὲ παχυτέραν ὅπερ ἰσχυροτέραν;

Τοῦτ', ἔφη, λέγω, καὶ ἐρωτῶ γέ σε, πότερον ἴσον ἂν ἑκατέρα τῆ γῆ σπέρμα διδοίης ἢ ποτέρα ἂν πλεῖον.

Τῷ μὲν οἴνῳ, ἔφην, ἔγωγε νομίζω τῷ ἰσχυροτέρῳ πλεῖον ἐπιχεῖν ὕδωρ καὶ ἀνθρώπῳ τῷ ἰσχυροτέρῳ πλεῖον βάρος, ἐὰν δέῃ τι φέρειν, ἐπιτιθέναι, κὰν δέῃ τρέφεσθαί τινας, τοῖς δυνατωτέροις τρέφειν ἂν τοὺς πλείους προστάξαιμι. εἰ δὲ ἡ ἀσθενὴς γῆ ἰσχυροτέρα, ἔφην ἐγώ, γίγνεται, ἤν τις πλείονα καρπὸν αὐτῆ ἐμβάλη, ὥσπερ τὰ ὑποζύγια, τοῦτο σύ με δίδασκε.

Καὶ ὁ Ἰσχόμαχος γελάσας εἶπεν, Ἰλλὰ παίζεις μὲν σύγε, ἔφη, ὧ Σώκρατες. εὖ γε μέντοι, ἔφη, ἴσθι, ἢν μὲν ἐμβαλὼν τὸ σπέρμα τῆ γῆ ἔπειτα ἐν ῷ πολλὴν ἔχει τροφὴν ἡ γῆ ἀπὸ τοῦ οὐρανοῦ χλόης γενομένης ἀπὸ τοῦ σπέρματος καταστρέψης αὐτὸ πάλιν, τοῦτο γίγνεται σῖτος τῆ γῆ, καὶ ὥσπερ ὑπὸ κόπρου ἰσχὺς

8

9

### OECONOMICUS 17.7-17.10

Socrates. I presume that you know as well as I do that the seed must be scattered by hand?"

"Yes, I have seen it."

"But some people," he said, "can scatter it evenly, and some can't."

"Then sowers no less than lyre players need practice, so that the hand may be the servant of the will."

"Certainly. But suppose that some of the soil is rather thin and some rather rich?"

"What do you mean by that?" I interjected. "By 'thin' do you mean weak and by 'rich' strong?"

"That's correct; and I'm asking you whether you would give the same quantity of seed to both kinds, or to which you would give more?"

"I for one think that the stronger the wine, the more water should be added, and the stronger the porter, the heavier the load should be put on his back; and if it is necessary to feed others, I would require the richest men to feed the greatest number. But tell me whether weak land, like draft animals, becomes stronger when you put more corn into it."

"Now you're joking, Socrates," he said, laughing, "but let me tell you that, if after putting in the seed you plow it in again as soon as green shoots have sprouted, when the land is obtaining plenty of nourishment from the sky, it makes food for the soil and strengthens it like manure. If,

αὐτἢ ἐγγίγνεται: ἢν μέντοι ἐκτρέφειν έᾳς τὴν γῆν διὰ τέλους τὸ σπέρμα εἰς καρπόν, χαλεπὸν τἢ ἀσθενεῖ γἢ ἐς τέλος πολὺν καρπὸν, χαλεπὸν τἢ συὰ δὲ ἀσθενεῖ χαλεπὸν πολλοὺς ἀδροὺς χοίρους ἐκτρέφειν.

11 Λέγεις σύ, ἔφην ἐγώ, ὧ Ἰσχόμαχε, τῆ ἀσθενεστέρα

γῆ μεῖον δεῖν τὸ σπέρμα ἐμβαλεῖν;

Ναὶ μὰ Δία, ἔφη, ὧ Σώκρατες, καὶ σύ γε συνομολογεῖς λέγων, ὅτι νομίζεις τοῖς ἀσθενεστέροις πᾶσι μείω προστάττειν πράγματα.

12 Τοὺς δὲ δὴ σκαλέας, ἔφην ἐγώ, ὧ Ἰσχόμαχε, τίνος

ένεκα *ἐμβάλλετε τῷ σίτῳ*;

Οἶσθα δήπου, ἔφη, ὅτι ἐν τῷ χειμῶνι πολλὰ ὕδατα γίγνεται.

Τί γὰρ οὔκ; ἔφην ἐγώ.

Οὐκοῦν θῶμεν τοῦ σίτου καὶ κατακρυφθῆναί τινα ὑπ' αὐτῶν ἰλύος ἐπιχυθείσης καὶ ψιλωθῆναί τινας ρίζας ὑπὸ ρεύματος. καὶ ὕλη δὲ πολλάκις ὑπὸ τῶν ὑδάτων δήπου συνεξορμᾶ τῷ σίτῷ καὶ παρέχει πνιγμὸν αὐτῷ.

Πάντα, ἔφην ἐγώ, εἰκὸς ταῦτα γίγνεσθαι.

Οὐκοῦν δοκεῖ σοι, ἔφη, ἐνταῦθα ἤδη ἐπικουρίας τινὸς δεῖσθαι ὁ σῖτος:

Πάνυ μεν οὖν, ἔφην ἐγώ.

 $T\hat{\varphi}$  οὖν κατιλυθέντι τί ἃν ποιοῦντες δοκοῦσιν ἄν σοι ἐπικουρῆσαι;

Έπικουφίσαντες, έφην έγώ, τὴν γῆν.

Τί δέ, ἔφη, τῷ ἐψιλωμένῳ τὰς ῥίζας;

Αντιπροσαμησάμενοι τὴν γῆν ἄν, ἔφην ἐγώ.

### OECONOMICUS 17.10-17.13

on the other hand, you let the seed go on growing on the land until it's mature, it's hard for weak land to yield much grain in the end, just as it's hard for a weak sow to rear a big litter of fine pigs."

"Do you mean, Ischomachus, that the weaker the soil

the less seed should be put into it?"

"Yes I do, Socrates; and you agree when you said just now that your invariable custom is to make the load light that's to be carried by the weak."

"But the hoers, now, Ischomachus, why do you put 12 them on the grain?"

"I presume you know that it rains a lot in the wintertime?"

"Of course."

"Let us assume, then, that part of the grain is waterlogged and covered with mud, and some of the roots are exposed by flooding. And it often happens, you know, that because of flooding weeds spring up amid the grain and choke it."

"All these things are likely to happen."

"Then don't you think that in such circumstances the grain needs some prompt assistance?"

"Certainly."

"What should be done, do you think, to assist the part that is under the mud?"

"The soil should be lifted."

"And the part that has its roots exposed?"

"It should have soil piled over it."

11

14 Τί γάρ, ἔφη, ἢν ὕλη πνίγη συνεξορμῶσα τῷ σίτῷ καὶ διαρπάζουσα τοῦ σίτου τὴν τροφήν, ὥσπερ οἱ κηφῆνες διαρπάζουσιν ἄχρηστοι ὄντες τῶν μελιττῶν ἃ ἂν ἐκεῖναι ἐργασάμεναι τροφὴν καταθῶνται;

Έκκόπτειν ἃν νὴ Δία δέοι τὴν ὕλην, ἔφην ἐγώ, ὅσπερ τοὺς κηφῆνας ἐκ τῶν σμηνῶν ἀφαιρεῖν.

15 Οὐκοῦν, ἔφη, εἰκότως σοι δοκοῦμεν ἐμβαλεῖν τοὺς σκαλέας:

Πάνυ γε. ἀτὰρ ἐνθυμοῦμαι, ἔφην ἐγώ, ὧ Ἰσχόμαχε, οἷόν ἐστι τὸ εὖ τὰς εἰκόνας ἐπάγεσθαι. πάνυ γὰρ σύ με ἐξώργισας πρὸς τὴν ὕλην τοὺς κηφῆνας εἰπών, πολὺ μᾶλλον ἢ ὅτε περὶ αὐτῆς τῆς ὕλης ἔλεγες.

18. ἀτὰρ οὖν, ἔφην ἐγώ, ἐκ τούτου ἄρα θερίζειν εἰκός. δίδασκε οὖν εἴ τι ἔχεις με καὶ εἰς τοῦτο.

"Ην μή γε φανής, ἔφη, καὶ εἰς τοῦτο ταὐτὰ ἐμοὶ ἐπιστάμενος. ὅτι μὲν οὖν τέμνειν τὸν σῖτον δεῖ, οἶσθα.

Τί δ' οὐ μέλλω; ἔφην ἐγώ.

Πότερ' ἂν οὖν τέμνεις, ἔφη, στὰς ἔνθα πνεῖ ἄνεμος ἢ ἀντίος;

Οὐκ ἀντίος, ἔφην, ἔγωγε· χαλεπὸν γὰρ οἶμαι καὶ τοῖς ὅμμασι καὶ ταῖς χερσὶ γίγνεται ἀντίον ἀχύρων καὶ ἀθέρων θερίζειν.

Καὶ ἀκροτομοίης δ' ἄν, ἔφη, ἢ παρὰ γῆν τέμνοις; "Ην μὲν βραχὺς ἢ ὁ κάλαμος τοῦ σίτου, ἔγωγ', ἔφην, κάτωθεν ἂν τέμνοιμι, ἵνα ἱκανὰ τὰ ἄχυρα μᾶλλον γίγνηται ἐὰν δὲ ὑψηλὸς ἢ, νομίζω ὀρθῶς ἂν ποιεῖν μεσοτομῶν, ἵνα μήτε οἱ ἀλοῶντες μοχθῶσι περιττὸν πόνον μήτε οἱ λικμῶντες ὧν οὐδὲν προσδέονται.

### OECONOMICUS 17.14-18.2

"What if weeds are springing up, choking the grain and robbing it of its nourishment, much as useless drones rob bees of the food they have laid in store by their industry?"

"The weeds must be cut, of course, just as the drones must be removed from the hive."

"Then don't you think that we have good reason for putting on men to hoe?"

"No doubt; but I am reflecting, Ischomachus, on the advantage of bringing in an apt simile, for you roused my anger against weeds by mentioning drones, much more than when you spoke of mere weeds.

18. "However," I continued, "after this comes reaping,

18. "However," I continued, "after this comes reaping, I guess. So give me any information you can about that as well."

"Yes, unless I find that you know just what I do about that subject too. You know that the grain must be cut."

"I know that, naturally."

"Are you for standing with your back to the wind when you cut corn, or facing it?"

"Not facing it, no! I think it is irritating both to the eyes and to the hands to reap with chaff and stalks blowing in your face."

"And would you cut near the top or close to the ground?"

"'If the stalk is short I would cut low down, so that the straw would be more useful, but if it's long I think it would be right to cut in the middle, so that the threshers and winnowers won't spend needless effort on what they don't

τὸ δὲ ἐν τῆ γῆ λειφθὲν ἡγοῦμαι καὶ κατακαυθὲν συνωφελεῖν ἂν τὴν γῆν καὶ εἰς κόπρον ἐμβληθὲν τὴν κόπρον συμπληθύνειν.

3 'Ορậς, ἔφη, ὧ Σώκρατες, ὡς ἁλίσκη ἐπ' αὐτοφώρῳ καὶ περὶ θερισμοῦ εἰδὼς ἄπερ ἐγώ;

Κινδυνεύω, ἔφην ἐγώ, καὶ βούλομαί γε σκέψασθαι, εἰ καὶ άλοᾶν ἐπίσταμαι.

Οὐκοῦν, ἔφη, τοῦτο μὲν οἶσθα, ὅτι ὑποζυγίῳ ἁλοῶσι τὸν σῖτον.

Τί δ' οὐκ, ἔφην ἐγώ, οἶδα; καὶ ὑποζύγιά γε καλούμενα πάντα ὁμοίως, βοῦς, ἡμιόνους, ἵππους.

Οὐκοῦν, ἔφη, ταῦτα μὲν ἡγῃ τοσοῦτον μόνον εἰδέναι, πατεῖν τὸν σῖτον ἐλαυνόμενα;

Τί γὰρ ἂν ἄλλο, ἔφην ἐγώ, ὑποζύγια εἰδείη;

5 Όπως δὲ τὸ δεόμενον κόψουσι καὶ ὁμαλιεῖται ὁ άλοητός, τίνι τοῦτο, ὧ Σώκρατες; ἔφη.

Δήλον ὅτι, ἔφην ἐγώ, τοῖς ἐπαλώσταις. στρέφοντες γὰρ καὶ ὑπὸ τοὺς πόδας ὑποβάλλοντες τὰ ἄτριπτα ἀεὶ δήλον ὅτι μάλιστα ὁμαλίζοιεν ἂν τὸν δῖνον καὶ τάχιστα ἀνύτοιεν.

Ταῦτα μὲν τοίνυν, ἔφη, οὐδὲν ἐμοῦ λείπη γιγνώσκων.

6 Οὐκοῦν, ἔφην ἐγώ, ὧ Ἰσχόμαχε, ἐκ τούτου δὴ καθαροῦμεν τὸν σῖτον λικμῶντες.

Καὶ λέξον γέ μοι, ὧ Σώκρατες, ἔφη ὁ Ἰσχόμαχος, ἢ οἶσθα, ὅτι ἢν ἐκ τοῦ προσηνέμου μέρους τῆς ἄλω ἄρχη, δι' ὅλης τῆς ἄλω οἴσεταί σοι τὰ ἄχυρα;

Άνάγκη γάρ, ἔφην ἐγώ.

# OECONOMICUS 18.2-18.6

want. I imagine that the stubble may be burned with advantage to the land, or thrown on the manure heap to increase its bulk.'

"Do you notice, Socrates, that you stand convicted of 3 knowing just what I know about reaping too?"

"Yes, it seems so; and I want to know besides whether I understand threshing as well."

"Then you know this much, that draft animals are used in threshing?"

"Yes, of course I do; and that the term draft animals 4 includes oxen, mules, and horses."

"Do you think that all the beasts know is how to tread on the grain as they're driven?"

"Why, what more should draft animals know?"

"And who sees that they tread out the right amount of grain, and that the threshing is uniform, Socrates?"

"The threshers, obviously. By continually turning the untrodden grain and throwing it under the animal's hooves they will of course keep it level on the floor and take the least time over the work."

"So far, then, your knowledge is quite as good as mine."

"Won't our next task be to clean the grain by winnowing, Ischomachus?"

"Yes, Socrates; and tell me, do you know that if you start on the windward side of the floor you'll find the chaff carried right across the floor?"

"It must be so."

7 Οὐκοῦν εἰκὸς καὶ ἐπιπίπτειν, ἔφη, αὐτὰ ἐπὶ τὸν σῖτον.

Πολὺ γάρ ἐστιν, ἔφην ἐγώ, τὸ ὑπερενεχθῆναι τὰ ἄχυρα ὑπὲρ τὸν σῖτον εἰς τὸ κενὸν τῆς ἄλω.

"Ην δέ τις, ἔφη, λικμậ ἐκ τοῦ ὑπηνέμου ἀρχόμενος; Δῆλον, ἔφην ἐγώ, ὅτι εὐθὺς ἐν τῆ ἀχυροδόκη ἔσται τὰ ἄχυρα.

Έπειδὰν δὲ καθάρης, ἔφη, τὸν σῖτον μέχρι τοῦ ἡμίσεος τῆς ἄλω, πότερον εὐθὺς οὕτω κεχυμένου τοῦ σίτου λικμήσεις τὰ ἄχυρα τὰ λοιπὰ ἢ συνώσας τὸν καθαρὸν πρὸς τὸν πόλον ὡς εἰς στενότατον;

Συνώσας νη Δί', ἔφην ἐγώ, τὸν καθαρὸν σῖτον, ἵν' ὑπερφέρηταί μοι τὰ ἄχυρα εἰς τὸ κενὸν τῆς ἄλω καὶ μὴ δὶς ταὐτὰ ἄχυρα δέη λικμᾶν.

Σὺ μὲν δὴ ἄρα, ἔφη, ὧ Σώκρατες, σῖτόν γε ὡς ἂν τάχιστα καθαρὸς γένοιτο κἂν ἄλλον δύναιο διδάσκειν.

Ταῦτα τοίνυν, ἔφην ἐγώ, ἐλελήθη ἐμαυτὸν ἐπιστάμενος. καὶ πάλαι ἐννοῶ ἄρα, εἰ λέληθα καὶ χρυσοχοεῖν καὶ αὐλεῖν καὶ ζωγραφεῖν ἐπιστάμενος. ἐδίδαξε γὰρ οὕτε ταῦτά με οὐδεὶς οὕτε γεωργεῖν· ὁρῶ δ' ὥσπερ γεωργοῦντας καὶ τὰς ἄλλας τέχνας ἐργαζομένους ἀνθρώπους.

Οὔκουν, ἔφη ὁ Ἰσχόμαχος, ἔλεγον ἐγώ σοι πάλαι, ὅτι καὶ ταύτη εἴη γενναιοτάτη ἡ γεωργικὴ τέχνη, ὅτι καὶ ῥάστη ἐστὶ μαθεῖν;

Άγε δή, ἔφην ἐγώ, οἶδα, ὦ Ἰσχόμαχε· τὰ μὲν δὴ ἀμφὶ σπόρον ἐπιστάμενος ἄρα ἐλελήθειν ἐμαυτὸν ἐπιστάμενος.

8

9

## OECONOMICUS 18.7-18.10

"Isn't it likely, then, that some will fall on the grain?"
"Yes, it is a long way for the chaff to be blown, right over the grain to the empty part of the floor."

"But what if you start winnowing against the wind?"
"Obviously the chaff will at once fall in the right place."

"And as soon as you've cleaned the grain over one half of the floor, will you at once go on winnowing the rest of the chaff while the grain lies about just as it is, or will you first sweep the clean grain toward the pivot in the middle so that it occupies the smallest area?"

"Of course I'll first sweep up the clean grain so that my chaff can be carried across into the empty area, and I needn't winnow the same grain twice."

"Well, Socrates, it seems you are capable of teaching the quickest way of cleaning grain."

"I really wasn't aware that I understood all this; and so I've been thinking for some time now whether my knowledge extends to smelting gold, playing the pipes, and painting pictures. For I've never been taught these subjects any more than I've been taught farming. But I've watched people working at these arts, just as I have watched them farming."

"And didn't I tell you just now that farming is the noblest art because, among other reasons, it's the easiest to learn?"

"Enough, Ischomachus; I know that. And I understood about sowing, apparently, though I wasn't aware that I understood!"

19. Έστιν οὖν, ἔφην ἐγώ, τῆς γεωργικῆς τέχνης καὶ ἡ τῶν δένδρων φυτεία;

Έστι γὰρ οὖν, ἔφη ὁ Ἰσχόμαχος.

Πως ἃν οὖν, ἔφην ἐγω, τὰ μὲν ἀμφὶ τὸν σπόρον ἐπισταίμην, τὰ δ' ἀμφὶ τὴν φυτείαν οὐκ ἐπίσταμαι;

Οὐ γὰρ σύ, ἔφη ὁ Ἰσχόμαχος, ἐπίστασαι;

Πως; έγω ἔφην, ὅστις μήτ' ἐν ὁποία τῆ γῆ δεῖ φυτεύειν οἶδα μήτε ὁπόσον βάθος ὀρύττειν [τὸ φυτὸν] μήτε ὁπόσον πλάτος μήτε ὁπόσον μῆκος τὸ φυτὸν ἐμβάλλειν μήτε ὅπως ἂν ἐν τῆ γῆ κείμενον τὸ φυτὸν μάλιστ' ἂν βλαστάνοι.

"Ιθι δή, ἔφη ὁ Ἰσχόμαχος, μάνθανε ὅ τι μὴ ἐπίστασαι. βοθύνους μὲν γὰρ οἵους ὀρύττουσι τοῖς φυτοῖς, οἶδ' ὅτι ἑώρακας, ἔφη.

Καὶ πολλάκις ἔγωγ', ἔφην.

"Ηδη τινὰ οὖν αὐτῶν εἶδες βαθύτερον τριπόδου; Οὐδὲ μὰ Δί' ἔγωγ', ἔφην, πενθημιποδίου.

Τί δὲ τὸ πλάτος ἤδη τινὰ τριπόδου πλέον εἶδες; Οὐδὲ μὰ Δί', ἔφην ἐγώ, διπόδου.

Οὐδὲ μὰ Δί', ἔφην, ἔγωγε τριημιποδίου. καὶ γὰρ ἐξορύττοιτο ἂν σκαπτόμενα, ἔφην ἐγώ, τὰ φυτά, εἰ λίαν γε οὕτως ἐπιπολῆς πεφυτευμένα εἴη.

Οὐκοῦν τοῦτο μέν, ἔφη, ὧ Σώκρατες, ἱκανῶς οἶσθα, ὅτι οὔτε βαθύτερον πενθημιποδίου ὀρύττουσιν οὔτε βραχύτερον τριημιποδίου.

5

2

# OECONOMICUS 19.1-19.5

19. "But is the planting of fruit trees another branch of agriculture?" I continued.

"It certainly is," answered Ischomachus.

"Then how can I know all about sowing and yet know nothing of planting?"

"What? Don't you know about it?"

"How can I, when I don't know what kind of soil to plant in, how deep a hole to dig, or how broad, or how much of the plant should be buried, or how it should be set in the ground to grow best?"

"Come then, learn whatever you don't know. I'm sure 3 you've seen the sort of trenches they dig for plants."

"Yes, often enough."

"Did you ever see one more than three feet deep?"

"No, of course not-nor more than two and a half."

"Well then, did you ever see one more than three feet wide?"  $\,$ 

"'Of course not, not even more than two feet."

"Come then, answer this question too. Did you ever see one less than a foot deep?"

"Certainly never less than a foot and a half: the plants would come out of the ground when it is stirred about them if they were put in so much too shallow."

"Then you already know this well enough, Socrates, that the trenches are never dug more than two and a half feet deep nor less than a foot and a half."

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>15</sup> del. Schneider: τῷ φυτῷ Reisig: βόθρον Schneider

'Ανάγκη γάρ, ἔφην ἐγώ, τοῦτο ὁρᾶσθαί γε οὕτω καταφανὲς ὄν.

6 Τί δέ, ἔφη, ξηροτέραν καὶ ὑγροτέραν γῆν γιγνώσκεις ὁρῶν;

Ξηρὰ μὲν γοῦν μοι δοκεῖ, ἔφην ἐγώ, εἶναι ἡ περὶ τὸν Λυκαβηττὸν καὶ ἡ ταύτῃ ὁμοία, ὑγρὰ δὲ ἡ ἐν τῷ Φαληρικῷ ἔλει καὶ ἡ ταύτῃ ὁμοία.

Πότερα οὖν, ἔφη, ἐν τῆ ξηρᾶ ἃν βαθὺν ὀρύττοις βόθρον τῷ φυτῷ ἢ ἐν τῆ ὑγρᾶ;

Έν τῆ ξηρὰ νὴ Δί, ἔφην ἐγώ· ἐπεὶ ἔν γε τῆ ὑγρὰ ὀρύττων βαθὺν ὕδωρ ἂν εὑρίσκοις καὶ οὐκ ἂν δύναιο ἔτι ἐν ὕδατι φυτεύειν.

Καλώς μοι δοκείς, έφη, λέγειν. οὐκοῦν ἐπειδὰν ὀρωρυγμένοι ὧσιν οἱ βόθροι, ὁπηνίκα δεῖ τιθέναι ἑκάτερα τὰ φυτά, ἥδη εἶδες;

Μάλιστα, ἔφην ἐγώ.

Σὺ οὖν βουλόμενος ὡς τάχιστα φῦναι αὐτὰ πότερον ὑποβαλὼν ἂν τῆς γῆς τῆς εἰργασμένης οἴει τὸν βλαστὸν τοῦ κλήματος θᾶττον χωρεῖν διὰ τῆς μαλακῆς ἢ διὰ τῆς ἀργοῦ εἰς τὸ σκληρόν;

Δηλον, ἔφην ἐγώ, ὅτι διὰ τῆς εἰργασμένης θᾶττον αν ἢ διὰ τῆς ἀργοῦ βλαστάνοι.

Οὐκοῦν ὑποβλητέα ἂν εἴη τῷ φυτῷ γῆ.

Τί δ' οὐ μέλλει; ἔφην ἐγώ.

Πότερα δὲ ὅλον τὸ κλῆμα ὀρθὸν τιθεὶς πρὸς τὸν οὐρανὸν βλέπον ἡγῃ μᾶλλον ἂν ριζοῦσθαι αὐτὸ ἢ καὶ πλάγιόν τι ὑπὸ τῇ ὑποβεβλημένῃ γῇ θείης ἄν, ὥστε κεῖσθαι ὥσπερ γάμμα ὕπτιον;

7

8

### OECONOMICUS 19.6-19.9

"It's so obvious that I had to notice it."

"Again, can you distinguish visually between dry and moist ground?"

"Oh, I should think that the land around Lycabettus and any like it is an example of dry ground, and of wet the low-lying land at Phalerum and any like it."

"In which then would you dig the hole deep for your

plant, in the dry or the wet ground?"

"In the dry, of course; because if you dug deep in the wet you would hit water, and water would stop your planting."

"I think you're quite right. Now once the holes are dug, have you ever noticed just when the plants for each kind of soil should be put in?"

"Yes I have."

"Then assuming that you want them to grow as quickly as possible, do you think that if you put some prepared soil under them the cuttings will strike sooner through soft earth into the hard stuff, or through unbroken ground?"

"Clearly they will form roots more quickly in prepared soil than in unbroken ground."

"Then soil should be placed below the plant?"

"No doubt it should."

"And if you set the whole cutting upright, pointing to the sky, do you think it would take root better, or would you lay part of it slanting under the soil that has been put below, so that it lies like an upside-down gamma?"

10 Οὕτω νὴ Δία· πλείονες γὰρ ἂν οἱ ὀφθαλμοὶ κατὰ γῆς εἶεν· ἐκ δὲ τῶν ὀφθαλμῶν καὶ ἄνω ὁρῶ βλαστάνοντα τὰ φυτά. καὶ τοὺς κατὰ τῆς γῆς οὖν ὀφθαλμοὺς ἡγοῦμαι τὸ αὐτὸ τοῦτο ποιεῖν. πολλῶν δὲ φυομένων βλαστῶν κατὰ τῆς γῆς ταχὺ ἂν καὶ ἰσχυρὸν τὸ φυτὸν ἡγοῦμαι βλαστάνειν.

Κατὰ ταὐτὰ τοίνυν, ἔφη, καὶ περὶ τούτων γιγνώσκων ἐμοὶ τυγχάνεις. ἐπαμήσαιο δ' ἂν μόνον, ἔφη, τὴν γῆν ἢ καὶ σάξαις ἂν εὖ μάλα περὶ τὸ φυτόν;

Σάττοιμ' ἄν, ἔφην, νη Δί' ἐγώ. εἰ μὲν γὰρ μὴ σεσαγμένον εἴη, ὑπὸ μὲν τοῦ ὕδατος εὖ οἶδ' ὅτι πηλὸς ἃν γίγνοιτο ἡ ἄσακτος γῆ, ὑπὸ δὲ τοῦ ἡλίου ξηρὰ μέχρι βυθοῦ, ὥστε τὰ φυτὰ κίνδυνος [ὑπὸ μὲν τοῦ ὕδατος]<sup>16</sup> σήπεσθαι μὲν δι' ὑγρότητα, αὐαίνεσθαι δὲ διὰ ξηρότητα, θερμαινομένων τῶν ριζῶν.

Καὶ περὶ ἀμπέλων ἄρα σύγε, ἔφη, φυτείας, ὧ Σώκρατες, τὰ αὐτὰ ἐμοὶ πάντα γιγνώσκων τυγχάνεις.

³Η καὶ συκῆν, ἔφην ἐγώ, οὕτω δεῖ φυτεύειν;

Οἶμαι δ', ἔφη ὁ Ἰσχόμαχος, καὶ τἆλλα ἀκρόδρυα πάντα. τῶν γὰρ ἐν τῇ τῆς ἀμπέλου φυτείᾳ καλῶς ἐχόντων τί ἂν ἀποδοκιμάσαις εἰς τὰς ἄλλας φυτείας;

Ἐλαίαν δὲ πῶς, ἔφην ἐγώ, φυτεύσομεν, ὧ Ἰσχόμαχε;

'Αποπειρậ μου καὶ τοῦτο, ἔφη, μάλιστα πάντων ἐπιστάμενος. ὁρậς μὲν γὰρ δή, ὅτι βαθύτερος ὀρύττεται τἢ ἐλαίᾳ βόθρος· καὶ γὰρ παρὰ τὰς ὁδοὺς μάλιστα ὀρύττεται· ὁρậς δ', ὅτι πρέμνα πᾶσι τοῖς φυτευτηρίοις πρόσεστιν· ὁρậς δ', ἔφη, τῶν φυτῶν πηλὸν ταῖς κεφαλαῖς πάσαις ἐπικείμενον καὶ πάντων τῶν φυτῶν ἐστεγασμένον τὸ ἄνω.

11

12

# OECONOMICUS 19.10-19.13

"The latter, of course: then there would be more buds underground; for I notice that plants shoot from the buds above ground, so I suppose that the buds under the ground do just the same; and with many shoots forming underground the plant will make strong and rapid growth, I suppose."

"Then it turns out that on these points too your opinion agrees with mine. And would you merely heap up the soil

or pack around the plant?"

"I would pack it, of course; for if it were not firm, I feel sure that the rain would make mud of the loose earth and the sun would dry it up from top to bottom, so the plants would run the risk of rotting through too much water or withering from too much heat at the roots."

"About vine planting then, Socrates, your views are again exactly the same as mine."

"Does this method of planting apply to the fig too?" I asked

"Yes, and to all other fruit trees, I think; for in planting other trees why discard anything that gives good results with the vine?"

"But the olive: how shall we plant that, Ischomachus?"

"You know quite well and are only trying to draw me out again. For I'm sure you've seen that a deeper hole is dug for the olive, since it is constantly being done on the roadside; you've seen also that all the growing shoots have stems adhering to them; and you see that all the tips of the plants are coated with clay, and the part of the plant that is above ground is wrapped up."

10

11

12

<sup>16</sup> del. Schneider

14 ΄ Όρῶ, ἔφην ἐγώ, ταῦτα πάντα.

Καὶ ὁρῶν δή, ἔφη, τί αὐτῶν οὐ γιγνώσκεις; ἢ τὸ ὅστρακον ἀγνοεῖς, ἔφη, ὧ Σώκρατες, πῶς ἂν ἐπὶ τοῦ πηλοῦ ἄνω καταθείης;

Μὰ τὸν Δί', ἔφην ἐγώ, οὐδὲν ὧν εἶπας, ὧ Ἰσχόμαχε, ἀγνοῶ, ἀλλὰ πάλιν ἐννοῶ, τί ποτε, ὅτε πάλαι ἤρου με συλλήβδην εἰ ἐπίσταμαι φυτεύειν, οὐκ ἔφην. οὐ γὰρ ἐδόκουν ἔχειν ἂν εἰπεῖν οὐδέν, ἢ δεῖ φυτεύειν ἐπεὶ δέ με καθ' ἐν ἔκαστον ἐπεχείρησας ἐρωτᾶν, ἀποκρίνομαί σοι, ὡς σὺ φής, ἄπερ σὺ γιγνώσκεις ὁ δεινὸς λεγόμενος γεωργός. ἆρα, ἔφην, ὧ Ἰσχόμαχε, ἡ ἐρώτησις διδασκαλία ἐστίν; ἄρτι γὰρ δή, ἔφην ἐγώ, καταμανθάνω, ἢ με ἐπηρώτησας ἕκαστα· ἄγων γάρ με δὶ ὧν ἐγὼ ἐπίσταμαι, ὅμοια τούτοις ἐπιδεικνὺς ἃ οὐκ ἐνόμιζον ἐπίστασθαι ἀναπείθεις οἷμαι, ὡς καὶ ταῦτα ἐπίσταμαι.

¾Αρ' οὖν, ἔφη ὁ Ἰσχόμαχος, καὶ περὶ ἀργυρίου ἐρωτῶν ἄν σε, πότερον καλὸν ἢ οὔ, δυναίμην ἄν σε πεῖσαι, ὡς ἐπίστασαι διαδοκιμάζειν τὰ καλὰ καὶ τὰ κίβδηλα ἀργύρια; καὶ περὶ αὐλητῶν ἂν δυναίμην ἀναπεῖσαι, ὡς ἐπίστασαι αὐλεῖν, καὶ περὶ ζωγράφων καὶ περὶ τῶν ἄλλων τῶν τοιούτων;

Ἰσως ἄν, ἔφην ἐγώ, ἐπειδὴ καὶ γεωργεῖν ἀνέπεισάς με ὡς ἐπιστήμων εἴην, καίπερ εἰδότα, ὅτι οὐδεὶς πώποτε ἐδίδαξέ με ταύτην τὴν τέχνην.

Οὐκ ἔστι ταῦτ', ἔφη, ὧ Σώκρατες ἀλλ' ἐγὼ καὶ πάλαι σοι ἔλεγον, ὅτι ἡ γεωργία οὕτω φιλάνθρωπός ἐστι καὶ πραεῖα τέχνη, ὥστε καὶ ὁρῶντας καὶ ἀκούον-

15

16

"Yes, I've seen all this."

"You have! Then what of all this don't you understand? Is it that you don't know how to put the crocks on top of the clay, Socrates?"

"Of course there's nothing in what you've said that I don't know, Ischomachus. But I'm again set thinking what can have made me answer No to the question you put to me a while ago, when you asked me generally, Did I understand planting? For I thought I would have nothing to say about the right method of planting. But now that you've undertaken to question me in particular, my answers, you tell me, agree exactly with the views of a farmer so famous for his skill as yourself! Can it be that questioning is a kind of teaching, Ischomachus? The fact is, I have just discovered the plan of your series of questions. You lead me by paths of knowledge familiar to me, point out things similar to what I know, and convince me that I really do know things that I thought I had no knowledge of."

"Now suppose I questioned you about money,' said Ischomachus,' whether it is good or bad, could I persuade you that you know how to distinguish genuine from counterfeit by test? And by putting questions about pipers could I convince you that you understand pipe playing; and by means of questions about painters and other artists—"

"You might, since you've convinced me that I understand farming, though I know that I have never been taught that art."

"No, it isn't possible, Socrates. I told you earlier that agriculture is such a humane and gentle art that you have but to see her and listen to her and she at once makes you

14

15

16

18 τας ἐπιστήμονας εὐθὺς ἑαυτῆς ποιεῖν. πολλὰ δ', ἔφη, καὶ αὐτὴ διδάσκει, ὡς ἂν κάλλιστά τις αὐτῆ χρῷτο. αὐτίκα ἄμπελος ἀναβαίνουσα μὲν ἐπὶ τὰ δένδρα, ὅταν ἔχῃ τι πλησίον δένδρον, διδάσκει ἱστάναι αὐτήν περιπεταννύουσα δὲ τὰ οἴναρα, ὅταν ἔτι αὐτῆ ἁπαλοὶ οἱ βότρυες ὦσι, διδάσκει σκιάζειν τὰ ἡλιούμενα
19 ταύτην τὴν ὥραν ὅταν δὲ καιρὸς ἢ ὑπὸ τοῦ ἡλίου ἤδη γλυκαίνεσθαι τὰς σταφυλάς, φυλλορροοῦσα διδάσκει ἑαυτὴν ψιλοῦν καὶ πεπαίνειν τὴν ὀπώραν, διὰ πολυφορίαν δὲ τοὺς μὲν πέπονας δεικνύουσα βότρυς, τοὺς δὲ ἔτι ὡμοτέρους φέρουσα διδάσκει τρυγὰν ἑαυτήν, ὥσπερ τὰ σῦκα συκάζουσι, τὸ ὀργῶν ἀεί.

20. Ἐνταῦθα δὴ ἐγὼ εἶπον· Πῶς οὖν, ὧ Ἰσχόμαχε, εἰ οὕτω γε καὶ ῥάδιά ἐστι μαθεῖν τὰ περὶ τὴν γεωρ-γίαν καὶ πάντες ὁμοίως ἴσασιν ἃ δεῖ ποιεῖν, οὐχὶ καὶ πάντες πράττουσιν ὁμοίως, ἀλλ' οἱ μὲν αὐτῶν ἀφθόνως τε ζῶσι καὶ περιττὰ ἔχουσιν, οἱ δ' οὐδὲ τὰ ἀναγκαῖα δύνανται πορίζεσθαι, ἀλλὰ καὶ προσοφείλουσιν;

Έγὼ δή σοί γε λέξω, ὧ Σώκρατες, ἔφη ὁ Ἰσχόμαχος. οὐ γὰρ ἡ ἐπιστήμη οὐδ' ἡ ἀνεπιστημοσύνη τῶν γεωργῶν ἐστιν ἡ ποιοῦσα τοὺς μὲν εὐπορεῖν, τοὺς δὲ 3 ἀπόρους εἶναι· οὐδ' ἄν ἀκούσαις, ἔφη, λόγου οὕτω διαθέοντος, ὅτι διέφθαρται ὁ οἶκος, διότι οὐχ ὁμαλῶς ὁ σπορεὺς ἔσπειρεν οὐδ' ὅτι οὐκ ὀρθῶς τοὺς ὅρχους ἐφύτευσεν οὐδ' ὅτι ἀγνοήσας τις τὴν<sup>17</sup> φέρουσαν ἀμπέλους ἐν ἀφόρῳ ἐφύτευσεν οὐδ' ὅτι ἡγνόησέ τις, ὅτι ἀγαθόν ἐστι τῷ σπόρῳ νεὸν προεργάζεσθαι, οὐδ' ὅτι understand her. She herself gives you many lessons in the best way of treating her. For instance, the vine climbs the nearest tree, and so teaches you that she needs support. And when her clusters are yet tender, she spreads her leaves about them, and teaches you to shade the exposed parts from the sun's rays during that period. But when it is now time for her grapes to be sweetened by the sun, she sheds her leaves, teaching you to strip her and ripen her fruit. And thanks to her teeming fertility, she shows some ripe clusters while she carries others still sour, so saying to you, Pluck my grapes as men pluck figs; choose the plump ones as they come."

20. And now I asked, "How is it then, Ischomachus, if the principles of farming are so easy to learn and all alike know what to do, that not everyone does equally well? How is it that some farmers live in abundance and have more than they want while others can't get the bare necessaries of life and even fall into debt?"

"I'll tell you, Socrates. It's not knowledge or lack of knowledge on the part of farmers that causes one to thrive while another is needy. You won't hear a story like this going the rounds: The estate has gone to ruin because the sower sowed unevenly, or because he didn't plant the rows straight, or because someone, not knowing the right soil for vines, planted them in barren ground, or because someone didn't know that it is good to prepare the fallow

2

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>17</sup> Jacob: τὴν γῆν codd.

ηγνόησε τις, ως αγαθόν έστι τῆ γῆ κόπρον μιγνύναι άλλὰ πολὺ μᾶλλον ἔστιν ἀκοῦσαι, άνὴρ οὐ λαμβάνει σίτον έκ τοῦ ἀγροῦ· οὐ γὰρ ἐπιμελεῖται, ὡς αὐτῶ σπείρηται ἢ ώς κόπρος γίγνηται, οὐδ' οἶνον ἔχει άνήρ οὐ γὰρ ἐπιμελεῖται, ὡς φυτεύση ἀμπέλους οὐδὲ αί οὖσαι ὅπως φέρωσιν αὐτῶ, οὐδὲ ἔλαιον οὐδὲ σῦκα έχει άνήρ οὐ γὰρ ἐπιμελεῖται οὐδὲ ποιεῖ, ὅπως ταῦτα έχη, τοιαῦτ', ἔφη, ἐστίν, ὧ Σώκρατες, ἃ διαφέροντες 5 άλλήλων οι γεωργοί διαφερόντως καὶ πράττουσι πολύ μᾶλλον ἢ δοκοῦντες σοφόν τι εύρηκέναι εἰς τὰ έργα, καὶ οἱ στρατηγοὶ ἔστιν ἐν οἶς τῶν στρατηγικῶν έργων οὐ γνώμη διαφέροντες άλλήλων οἱ μὲν βελτίονες οί δὲ χείρονές είσιν, άλλὰ σαφῶς ἐπιμελεία. ἃ γὰρ καὶ οἱ στρατηγοὶ γιγνώσκουσι πάντες καὶ τῶν ίδιωτών οι πλείστοι, ταθτα οι μέν ποιοθσι τών άρχόντων οί δ' οὔ, οἷον καὶ τόδε γιγνώσκουσιν ἄπαντες, ὅτι διὰ πολεμίας πορευομένους βέλτιον έστι τεταγμένους πορεύεσθαι ούτως, ώς αν άριστα μάχοιντο, εί δέοι. τοῦτο τοίνυν γιγνώσκοντες οἱ μὲν ποιοῦσιν οὕτως, οἱ δ' οὐ ποιοῦσι, φυλακὰς ἄπαντες ἴσασιν ὅτι βέλτιόν έστι καθιστάναι καὶ ἡμερινὰς καὶ νυκτερινὰς πρὸ τοῦ στρατοπέδου, άλλὰ καὶ τούτου οἱ μὲν ἐπιμελοῦνται ὡς έχη ούτως, οί δ' οὐκ ἐπιμελοῦνται. ὅταν τε αὖ διὰ στενοπόρων ἴωσιν, οὐ πάνυ χαλεπὸν εύρεῖν ὅστις οὐ γιγνώσκει, ὅτι προκαταλαμβάνειν τὰ ἐπίκαιρα κρεῖττον ἢ μή, ἀλλὰ καὶ τούτου οἱ μὲν ἐπιμελοῦνται οὕτω ποιείν, οί δ' οὔ. ἀλλὰ καὶ κόπρον λέγουσι μὲν πάντες 10 ότι ἄριστον είς γεωργίαν έστὶ καὶ ὁρῶσι δὲ αὐτομά-

#### OECONOMICUS 20 3-20 10

for sowing, or because someone didn't know that it is good to fertilize the soil. No, you are much more likely to hear people say: The man gets no grain from his field because he takes no trouble to see that it is sown or fertilized. Or, The man has got no wine, because he takes no trouble to plant vines or to make his old stock produce. Or, The man has neither olives nor figs, because he doesn't take the trouble; he does nothing to get them. It's not the farmers reputed to have introduced some innovation in the business who differ in fortune from others. Socrates, but rather factors of this sort that make all the difference. This is true of generals too: there are branches of military science in which some are better or worse than others not because they differ in intelligence but clearly in degree of attentiveness. For the things that all generals know, and most private citizens, are done by some commanders and left undone by others. For example, they all know that when marching through an enemy's country the right way is to march in the formation in which they will fight best, if need be. Yet although they know this, some carry it out, others don't. They all know that it's right to post sentries day and night before the camp; but this too is a duty that some attend to but others neglect. Again, where will you find someone who doesn't know that, in marching through narrow passes, it's better to occupy the points of vantage first? Yet this precaution too is duly taken by some and neglected by others. So too, everyone will say that in agriculture there's nothing as good as fertilizer, and they ob-

5

6

7

8

9

την γιγνομένην· ὅμως δὲ καὶ ἀκριβοῦντες ὡς γίγνεται, καὶ ράδιον ὂν πολλὴν ποιεῖν, οἱ μὲν καὶ τούτου ἐπιμελοῦνται ὅπως ἀθροίζηται, οἱ δὲ παραμελοῦσι.

11 καίτοι ὕδωρ μὲν ὁ ἄνω θεὸς παρέχει, τὰ δὲ κοῖλα πάντα τέλματα γίγνεται, ἡ γῆ δὲ ὕλην παντοίαν παρέχει· καθαίρειν δὲ δεῖ τὴν γῆν τὸν μέλλοντα σπείρειν· ἃ δ᾽ ἐκποδὼν ἀναιρεῖται, ταῦτα εἴ τις ἐμβάλλοι εἰς τὸ ὕδωρ, ὁ χρόνος ἤδη αὐτὸς ἂν ποιοίη οῗς ἡ γῆ ἤδεται. ποία μὲν γὰρ ὕλη, ποία δὲ γῆ ἐν ὕδατι στασίμῳ οὐ κόπρος γίγνεται;

Καὶ ὁπόσα δὲ θεραπείας δεῖται ἡ γῆ, ὑγροτέρα γε οὖσα πρὸς τὸν σπόρον ἢ άλμωδεστέρα πρὸς φυτείαν, καὶ ταῦτα γιγνώσκουσι μὲν πάντες καὶ ὡς τὸ ὕδωρ έξάγεται τάφροις καὶ ὡς ἡ ἄλμη κολάζεται μιγνυμένη πᾶσι τοῖς ἀνάλμοις καὶ ὑγροῖς καὶ ξηροῖς ἀλλὰ καὶ τούτων ἐπιμελοῦνται οἱ μὲν οἱ δ' οὔ. εἰ δέ τις παντάπασιν άγνως είη, τί δύναται φέρειν ή γη, καὶ μήτε ίδειν έχοι καρπὸν μηδε φυτὸν αὐτῆς μήτε ὅτου ἀκοῦσαι την άληθειαν περί αὐτης έχοι, οὐ πολύ μεν ράον γης πείραν λαμβάνειν παντί ἀνθρώπω ἢ ἵππου, πολὺ δε ράον η άνθρωπου; ου γαρ έστιν ο τι έπι απάτη δείκνυσιν, άλλ' άπλως ἄ τε δύναται καὶ ἃ μὴ σαφηνίζει τε καὶ ἀληθεύει. δοκεῖ δέ μοι ἡ γῆ καὶ τοὺς κακούς τε καὶ ἀργοὺς τῷ εὖγνωστα καὶ εὐμαθῆ πάντα παρέχειν ἄριστα έξετάζειν, οὐ γὰρ ὥσπερ τὰς ἄλλας τέχνας τοῖς μὴ ἐργαζομένοις ἔστι προφασίσασθαι ότι οὐκ ἐπίστανται γῆν δὲ πάντες ἴσασιν ὅτι εὖ πάσχουσα εὖ ποιεῖ ἀλλ' ἡ ἐν γῆ ἀργία ἐστὶ σαφὴς

12

13

14

### OECONOMICUS 20.10-20.15

serve that nature produces it. Everyone knows exactly how it's produced, and it's easy to get any amount of it, and yet, while some take care to have it collected, others pay no attention. Yet the god sends rain from above, and all the hollows become pools of water, and the earth yields weeds of every kind which the man who intends to sow must first clear off the ground; and what he removes has but to be thrown into the water and time of itself will produce what the soil likes. For every kind of vegetation, every kind of soil in stagnant water turns into fertilizer.

"And again, all the ways of treating the soil when it is too wet for sowing or too salt for planting are familiar to everyone—how the land is drained by ditches, how the salt is corrected by being mixed with salt-free substances, liquid or dry. Yet these matters, again, do not always receive attention. Suppose a man is wholly ignorant of what the earth can produce, and unable to see crop or plant on it, or to hear from anyone the truth about it, yet isn't it far easier for anyone to prove a parcel of land than to test a horse, and much easier than a human being? For the land makes no deceptive displays but reveals frankly and truthfully what she can and cannot do. Because she conceals nothing from our knowledge and understanding, the land is the surest tester of bad and lazy men. For the slothful cannot plead ignorance, as in other arts: land, as all men know, responds to good treatment. Laziness in farming is 11

12

13

14

ψυχής κατήγορος κακής. ὡς μὲν γὰρ ἃν δύναιτο ἄνθρωπος ζῆν ἄνευ τῶν ἐπιτηδείων, οὐδεὶς τοῦτο αὐτὸς αὐτὸν πείθει ὁ δὲ μήτε ἄλλην τέχνην χρηματοποιὸν ἐπιστάμενος μήτε γεωργεῖν ἐθέλων φανερὸν ὅτι κλέπων ἢ ἀρπάζων ἢ προσαιτῶν διανοεῖται βιοτεύειν ἢ παντάπασιν ἀλόγιστός ἐστι.

Μέγα δὲ ἔφη διαφέρειν εἰς τὸ λυσιτελεῖν γεωργίαν καὶ μὴ λυσιτελεῖν, ὅταν ὄντων ἐργαστήρων καὶ πλεόνων ὁ μὲν ἔχη τινὰ ἐπιμέλειαν, ὡς τὴν ὥραν αὐτῷ ἐν τω ἔργω οἱ ἐργάται ὧσιν, ὁ δὲ μὴ ἐπιμελῆται τούτου. ραδίως γὰρ ἀνὴρ εἶς παρὰ τοὺς δέκα διαφέρει τῷ ἐν ώρα ἐργάζεσθαι καὶ ἄλλος γε ἀνὴρ διαφέρει τῷ πρὸ της ώρας ἀπιέναι, τὸ δὲ δη ἐᾶν ραδιουργείν δι' ὅλης της ημέρας τοὺς ἀνθρώπους ραδίως τὸ ημισυ διαφέρει τοῦ ἔργου παντός, ὥσπερ καὶ ἐν ταῖς ὁδοιπορίαις παρὰ στάδια διακόσια ἔστιν ὅτε τοῖς ἑκατὸν σταδίοις διήνεγκαν άλλήλων άνθρωποι τῷ τάχει, άμφότεροι καὶ νέοι ὄντες καὶ ὑγιαίνοντες, ὅταν ὁ μὲν πράττη ἐφ' ὧπερ ὥρμηται βαδίζων, ὁ δὲ ῥαστωνεύη τη ψυχη καὶ παρὰ κρήναις καὶ ὑπὸ σκιαῖς ἀναπαυόμενός τε καὶ θεώμενος καὶ αὔρας θηρεύων μαλακάς. οὕτω δὲ καὶ ἐν τοῖς ἔργοις πολὺ διαφέρουσιν εἰς τὸ άνύτειν οἱ πράττοντες ἐψ' ὧπερ τεταγμένοι εἰσὶ καὶ οἱ μη πράττοντες, άλλ' ευρίσκοντες προφάσεις του μη έργάζεσθαι καὶ ἐώμενοι ῥαδιουργεῖν. τὸ δὲ δὴ καλῶς έργάζεσθαι ἢ κακῶς ἐπιμελεῖσθαι, τοῦτο δὴ τοσοῦτον διαφέρει όσον η όλως έργάζεσθαι η όλως άργον είναι. ὅταν σκαπτόντων, ἵνα ὕλης καθαραὶ αἱ ἄμπελοι

16

17

18

19

# **OECONOMICUS 20.15-20.20**

a clear indictment of a base soul. For no one persuades himself that a person could live without necessities; if a man will not farm and knows no other profit-making occupation, he clearly intends to live by theft or robbery or begging, or else he is completely irrational.

"Farming," he added, "may result in profit or in loss; it makes a great difference to the result, even when many laborers are employed, whether there is someone who sees to it that the men are working during the working hours or is careless about it. For one man in ten by working all the time may easily make a difference, and another by knocking off before the time; and of course, if the men are allowed slack off all day long, the decrease in the work done may easily amount to one half of the whole. Just as two travelers on the road, both young and in good health, will differ so much in pace that one will cover two hundred stades to the other's hundred, because the one does what he set out to do, by pressing ahead, while the other is in an easygoing mood, now resting by a fountain or in the shade, now gazing at the view, now looking for soft breezes. So in farm work there is a vast difference in effectiveness between the men who do the job they've been assigned and those who, instead of doing it, invent excuses for not working and are allowed slack off. In fact, between good work and dishonest slothfulness there is as wide a difference as between actual work and actual idleness. Suppose the vines are being hoed to clear the ground of weeds: if

16

17

18

19

γένωνται, οὕτω σκάπτωσιν, ὥστε πλείω καὶ καλλίω τὴν ὕλην γίγνεσθαι, πῶς τοῦτο οὐκ ἀργὸν ἂν φήσαις εἶναι;

Τὰ οὖν συντρίβοντα τοὺς οἴκους πολὺ μᾶλλον 21 ταῦτά ἐστιν ἢ αἱ λίαν ἀνεπιστημοσύναι, τὸ γὰρ τὰς μὲν δαπάνας χωρείν ἐντελείς ἐκ τῶν οἴκων, τὰ δὲ ἔργα μὴ τελεῖσθαι λυσιτελούντως πρὸς τὴν δαπάνην. ταῦτα οὐκέτι δεῖ θαυμάζειν ἐὰν ἀντὶ τῆς περιουσίας ένδειαν παρέχηται, τοῖς γε μέντοι ἐπιμελεῖσθαι δυναμένοις καὶ συντεταμένως γεωργοῦσιν ἀνυτικωτάτην χρημάτισιν ἀπὸ γεωργίας καὶ αὐτὸς ἐπετήδευσε καὶ έμε εδίδαξεν ο πατήρ, οὐδέποτε γαρ εία χώρον εξειργασμένον ωνείσθαι, άλλ' ὅστις ἢ δι' ἀμέλειαν ἢ δι' άδυναμίαν των κεκτημένων καὶ άργὸς καὶ άφύτευτος είη, τοῦτον ώνεῖσθαι παρήνει, τοὺς μεν γὰρ έξειρ-23 γασμένους έφη καὶ πολλοῦ ἀργυρίου γίγνεσθαι καὶ έπίδοσιν οὐκ ἔχειν τοὺς δὲ μὴ ἔχοντας ἐπίδοσιν οὐδὲ ήδονας όμοίας ένόμιζε παρέχειν, άλλα παν κτήμα καὶ θρέμμα τὸ ἐπὶ τὸ βέλτιον ἰὸν τοῦτο καὶ εὐφραίνειν μάλιστα ὤετο. οὐδὲν οὖν ἔχει πλείονα ἐπίδοσιν ἢ χώρος έξ άργοῦ πάμφορος γιγνόμενος, εὖ γὰρ ἴσθι, έφη, ὧ Σώκρατες, ὅτι τῆς ἀρχαίας τιμῆς πολλοὺς πολλαπλασίου χώρους ἀξίους ἡμεῖς ἤδη ἐποιήσαμεν. καὶ τοῦτο, ὦ Σώκρατες, ἔφη, οὕτω μὲν πολλοῦ ἄξιον τὸ ἐνθύμημα, οὕτω δὲ καὶ μαθεῖν ῥάδιον, ὥστε νυνὶ άκούσας σὺ τοῦτο ἐμοὶ ὁμοίως ἐπιστάμενος ἄπει. καὶ άλλον διδάξεις, έὰν βούλη, καὶ ὁ έμὸς δὲ πατὴρ οὕτε 25 *ἔμαθε παρ' ἄλλου τοῦτο οὕτε μεριμνῶν εὖρεν*, ἀλλὰ

# **OECONOMICUS 20.20-20.25**

the hoeing is so badly done that the weeds grow ranker and more abundant, how can you call that anything but fageness

"These then are the factors that crush estates more often than sheer lack of knowledge. For the outgoing expenses of the estate are not a penny less, while the work done is insufficient to show a profit on the expenditure; so it's no wonder if the expected surplus is converted into a loss. On the other hand, to an attentive man who works assiduously at farming, no business gives quicker returns. My father taught me that and proved it by his own practice. For he never allowed me to buy a piece of land that was well farmed but encouraged me to buy any that was uncultivated and unplanted owing to the owner's neglect or incapacity. 'Well farmed land,' he would say, 'costs a lot and can't be improved;' and he said that where there is no room for improvement there is not much pleasure to be got from the land: landed estate and livestock must be continually improving to give the fullest measure of satisfaction. And nothing improves more than a farm that's being transformed from a wilderness into fruitful fields. I assure you, Socrates, that we have often increased the value of a farm many times over. There is so much money in this idea, Socrates, and it is so easy to learn, that no sooner have you heard it from me than you know as much as I do and can go home and teach it to someone else, if you like. What's more, my father didn't get his knowledge secondhand, nor did he have to study hard to discover it;

21

23

94

διὰ τὴν φιλογεωργίαν καὶ φιλοπονίαν ἐπιθυμῆσαι ἔφη τοιούτου χώρου, ὅπως ἔχοι ὅ τι ποιοίη ἄμα καὶ ἀφελούμενος ήδοιτο. ἦν γάρ τοι, ἔφη, ὧ Σώκρατες, φύσει, ὡς ἐμοὶ δοκεῖ, φιλογεωργότατος Ἀθηναίων ὁ ἐμὸς πατήρ.

Καὶ ἐγὼ μέντοι ἀκούσας τοῦτο ἠρόμην αὐτόν Πότερα δέ, ὧ Ἰσχόμαχε, ὁπόσους ἐξειργάσατο χώρους ὁ πατὴρ πάντας ἐκέκτητο ἢ καὶ ἀπεδίδοτο, εἰ πολὺ ἀργύριον εὑρίσκοι;

Καὶ ἀπεδίδοτο νὴ  $\Delta$ ί', ἔφη ὁ Ἰσχόμαχος ἀλλὰ ἄλλον τοι εὐθὺς ἀντεωνεῖτο, ἀργὸν δέ, διὰ τὴν φιλεργίαν.

Λέγεις, ἔφην ἐγώ, ὧ Ἰσχόμαχε, τῷ ὅντι φύσει τὸν πατέρα φιλογέωργον εἶναι οὐδὲν ἦττον ἢ οἱ ἔμποροι φιλόσιτοἱ εἰσι. καὶ γὰρ οἱ ἔμποροι διὰ τὸ σφόδρα φιλεῖν τὸν σῖτον ὅπου ἂν ἀκούσωσι πλεῖστον εἶναι, ἐκεῖσε πλέουσιν ἐπ' αὐτὸν καὶ Αἰγαῖον καὶ Εὕξεινον καὶ Σικελικὸν πόντον περῶντες ἔπειτα δὲ λαβόντες ὁπόσον δύνανται πλεῖστον ἄγουσιν αὐτὸν διὰ τῆς θαλάττης, καὶ ταῦτα εἰς τὸ πλοῖον ἐνθέμενοι, ἐν ῷπερ αὐτὸν ὅποι ἂν τύχωσιν ἀπέβαλον, ἀλλ' ὅπου ἂν ἀκούσωσι τιμᾶσθαί τε μάλιστα τὸν σῖτον καὶ περὶ πλείστου αὐτὸν ποιῶνται οἱ ἄνθρωποι, τούτοις αὐτὸν ἄγοντες παραδιδόασι. καὶ ὁ σὸς δὲ πατὴρ οὕτω πως ἔοικε φιλογέωργος εἶναι.

Πρὸς ταῦτα δὲ εἶπεν ὁ Ἰσχόμαχος, Σὰ μὲν παίζεις, ἔφη, ὧ Σώκρατες· ἐγὼ δὲ καὶ φιλοικοδόμους νομίζω

26

27

28

### OECONOMICUS 20.25-20.29

but he would say that, thanks to his love of farming and hard work, he had wanted a farm of this sort in order that he would at the same time have something to do and combine profit with pleasure. For I assure you, Socrates, no Athenian, I believe, had such a strong natural love of farming as my father."

26

Now on hearing this I asked, "Did your father keep all the farms that he cultivated, Ischomachus, or did he sell when he could get a good price?"

"He sold them, of course," answered Ischomachus, "but, you see, owing to his industrious habits, he would promptly buy another that was out of cultivation."

27

"You mean, Ischomachus, that your father naturally loved farming as intensely as merchants love grain. So deep is their love of grain that on receiving reports that it is abundant anywhere, merchants will voyage in quest of it: they will cross the Aegean, the Euxine, the Sicilian sea, and when they have got as much as possible, they carry it over the sea and actually stow it in the very ship in which they themselves sail. And when they need money they don't unload the grain just anywhere, but they carry it to the place where they hear that grain is most valued and the people prize it most highly, and deliver it to them there. Yes, your father's love of farming seems to he something like that."

28

"You're joking, Socrates," rejoined Ischomachus; "but I believe a man has no less genuine a love of building if he

οὐδὲν ἦττον οἴτινες ἃν ἀποδιδῶνται ἐξοικοδομοῦντες τὰς οἰκίας, εἶτ' ἄλλας οἰκοδομῶσι.

Νη Δία, ἐγὼ δέ γέ σοι, ἔφην, ὧ Ἰσχόμαχε, ἐπομόσας λέγω ἢ μην πιστεύειν σοι φύσει [νομίζειν] 18 φιλεῖν ταῦτα πάντας, ἀφ' ὧν ἂν ἀφελεῖσθαι νομίζωσιν.

21. Άτὰρ ἐννοῶ γε, ἔφην, ὧ Ἰσχόμαχε, ὡς εὖ τῆ ὑποθέσει ὅλον τὸν λόγον βοηθοῦντα παρέσχησαι. ὑπέθου γὰρ τὴν γεωργικὴν τέχνην πασῶν εἶναι εὐμαθεστάτην, καὶ νῦν ἐγὼ ἐκ πάντων ὧν εἴρηκας τοῦθ' οὕτως ἔχειν παντάπασιν ὑπὸ σοῦ ἀναπέπεισμαι.

Νη Δί', ἔφη ὁ Ἰσχόμαχος, ἀλλὰ τόδε τοι, ὧ Σώκρατες, τὸ πάσαις κοινὸν ταῖς πράξεσι καὶ γεωργική καὶ πολιτική καὶ οἰκονομική καὶ πολεμική τὸ ἀρχικὸν εἶναι, τοῦτο δὴ συνομολογῶ σοὶ ἐγὼ πολὺ διαφέρειν γνώμη τοὺς έτέρους τῶν έτέρων οἷον καὶ ἐν τριήρει, έφη, ὅταν πελαγίζωσι καὶ δέη περάν ἡμερινοὺς πλοῦς έλαύνοντας, οί μέν τῶν κελευστῶν δύνανται τοιαῦτα λέγειν καὶ ποιείν, ὥστε ἀκονᾶν τὰς ψυχὰς τῶν ἀνθρώπων έπὶ τὸ έθελοντὰς πονείν, οἱ δὲ οὕτως ἀγνώμονές είσιν, ὥστε πλείον ἢ ἐν διπλασίω χρόνω τὸν αὐτὸν άνύτουσι πλούν, καὶ οἱ μὲν ἱδροῦντες καὶ ἐπαινοῦντες άλλήλους, ὅ τε κελεύων καὶ οἱ πειθόμενοι, ἐκβαίνουσιν, οί δὲ ἀνιδρωτὶ ήκουσι μισοῦντες τὸν ἐπιστάτην καὶ μισούμενοι. καὶ τῶν στρατηγῶν ταύτη διαφέρουσιν, ἔφη, οἱ ἔτεροι τῶν ἑτέρων οἱ μὲν γὰρ οὔτε πονεῖν έθέλοντας οὔτε κινδυνεύειν παρέχονται, πείθεσθαί τε οὐκ ἀξιοῦντας οὐδ' ἐθέλοντας ὅσον ἂν μὴ ἀνάγκη ἦ. άλλὰ καὶ μεγαλυνομένους ἐπὶ τῷ ἐναντιοῦσθαι τῷ ἄρ-

#### OECONOMICUS 20.29-21.4

sells his houses as soon as they are finished and proceeds to build others."

"Of course; and I swear that I believe you, Ischomachus, that all men naturally love whatever they think will bring them profit.

21. "But I'm pondering how skillfully you've presented the whole argument in support of your proposition, Ischomachus. For you stated that farming is the easiest of all occupations to learn, and after hearing all that you've said, I'm quite convinced that this is so."

"Of course it is," cried Ischomachus; "but I grant you, Socrates, that in respect of aptitude for governing, which is common to all forms of business alike—farming, politics, estate management, warfare—in that respect the intelligence shown by different classes of men varies greatly. For example, on a trireme, when the ship is on the high seas and the rowers must toil all day to reach port, some coxswains can say and do the right thing to sharpen the men's spirits and make them work hard, while others are so unintelligent that it takes them more than twice the time to finish the same voyage. Here they land bathed in sweat, with mutual congratulations, coxswain and seamen; there they arrive with dry skin, but hating their master and hated back. Generals, too, differ from one another in this respect. For some make their men unwilling to work hard and to take risks, disinclined and unwilling to obey except under compulsion, and actually proud of defying their

<sup>18</sup> del. Bremi

χοντι οί δε αὐτοὶ οὖτοι οὐδ' αἰσχύνεσθαι ἐπισταμένους παρέχουσιν, ήν τι των αισχρών συμβαίνη. οί δ' αὖ θεῖοι καὶ ἀγαθοὶ καὶ ἐπιστήμονες ἄρχοντες τοὺς αὐτοὺς τούτους, πολλάκις δὲ καὶ ἄλλους παραλαμβάνοντες, αἰσχυνομένους τε ἔχουσιν αἰσχρόν τι ποιείν καὶ πείθεσθαι οἰομένους βέλτιον εἶναι καὶ ἀγαλλομένους τῶ πείθεσθαι ένα έκαστον καὶ σύμπαντας, πονείν ὅταν δεήση, οὐκ ἀθύμως πονοῦντας, ἀλλ' ὥσπερ ίδιώταις έστιν οξς έγγίγνεται φίλοπονία τις, ούτω καὶ όλω τῶ στρατεύματι ὑπὸ τῶν ἀγαθῶν ἀρχόντων ἐγγίγνεται καὶ τὸ φιλοπονεῖν καὶ τὸ φιλοτιμεῖσθαι όφθηναι καλόν τι ποιούντας ύπὸ τοῦ ἄρχοντος, πρὸς οντινα δ' αν αρχοντα διατεθώσιν ούτως οι έπόμενοι, οὖτοι δὴ ἐρρωμένοι γε ἄρχοντες γίγνονται, οὐ μὰ Δί ούχ οι αντων άριστα το σώμα των στρατιωτών έχωσι καὶ ἀκοντίζωσι καὶ τοξεύωσιν ἄριστα καὶ ίππον ἄριστον ἔχοντες ὡς ἱππικώτατα ἢ πελταστικώτατα προκινδυνεύωσιν, άλλ' οι αν δύνωνται έμποιησαι τοις στρατιώταις ἀκολουθητέον είναι καὶ διὰ πυρὸς καὶ διὰ παντὸς κινδύνου, τούτους δὴ δικαίως άν τις καλοίη μεγαλογνώμονας, ὧ ἂν ταῦτα γιγνώσκοντες πολλοὶ ἔπωνται, καὶ μεγάλη χειρὶ εἰκότως οὖτος λέγοιτο πορεύεσθαι, οὖ ἂν τῆ γνώμη πολλαὶ χείρες ύπηρετείν έθέλωσι, καὶ μέγας τῷ ὄντι οὖτος άνήρ, δς ἂν μεγάλα δύνηται γνώμη διαπράξασθαι μαλλον ή ρώμη.

Οὕτω δὲ καὶ ἐν τοῖς ἰδίοις ἔργοις, ἄν τε ἐπίτροπος η̈̂ ὁ ἐφεστηκὼς ἄν τε καὶ ἐπιστάτης, δς ἂν δύνηται

### OECONOMICUS 21.4-21.9

commander: yes, and these generals produce men who have no sense of dishonor when something disgraceful occurs. Contrast the inspired, brave, and scientific leader: let him take over the command of these same troops, or of others if you like. What effect does he have on them? They are ashamed to do a disgraceful deed, think it better to obey, and take a pride in obedience, working cheerfully, every man and all together, when it is necessary to work. Just as a love of work may spring up in the mind of an individual here and there, so too a whole army under the influence of a good leader is inspired with love of work and with an ambition to distinguish itself under the commander's eye. Let this be the feeling of the rank and file for their commander; and I tell you, he is the strong leader, he, and not the sturdiest soldier, not the best with bow and javelin, not the man who rides the best horse and is foremost in facing danger, not the ideal of horseman or marksman, but the leader who can make his soldiers feel that they are bound to follow him through fire and in any risky situation. Those you may justly call high-minded who have many followers of like mind; and with reason may he be said to march 'with a strong arm' whose will many an arm is ready to serve; and truly great is he who can do great deeds by will rather than by strength.

"So too in private enterprises, the man in authority—foreman or manager—who can make the workers eager,

προθύμους καὶ ἐντεταμένους παρέχεσθαι εἰς τὸ ἔργον καὶ συνεχείς, οὖτοι δη οἱ ἀνύτοντές εἰσιν ἐπὶ τάγαθὰ καὶ πολλὴν τὴν περιουσίαν ποιοῦντες. τοῦ δὲ δε-10 σπότου ἐπιφανέντος, ὧ Σώκρατες, ἔφη, ἐπὶ τὸ ἔργον, όστις δύναται καὶ μέγιστα βλάψαι τὸν κακὸν τῶν έργατῶν καὶ μέγιστα τιμῆσαι τὸν πρόθυμον, εἰ μηδὲν έπίδηλον ποιήσουσιν οἱ ἐργάται, ἐγὼ μὲν αὐτὸν οὐκ αν αγαίμην, αλλ' ον αν ιδόντες κινηθώσι και μένος έκάστω έμπέση των έργατων καὶ φιλονεικία πρὸς άλλήλους καὶ φιλοτιμία κρατιστεῦσαι<sup>19</sup> ἐκάστω, τοῦτον έγω φαίην αν έχειν τι ήθους βασιλικού, και έστι 11 τοῦτο μέγιστον, ώς έμοὶ δοκεῖ, έν παντὶ ἔργῳ, ὅπου τι δι' ἀνθρώπων πράττεται, καὶ ἐν γεωργία δέ. οὐ μέντοι μὰ Δία τοῦτό γε ἔτι ἐγὼ λέγω ἰδόντα μαθεῖν εἶναι οὐδ' ἄπαξ ἀκούσαντα, ἀλλὰ καὶ παιδείας δεῖν φημι τῶ ταῦτα μέλλοντι δυνήσεσθαι καὶ φύσεως ἀγαθῆς ύπάρξαι καὶ τὸ μέγιστον δὴ θεῖον γενέσθαι. οὐ γὰρ 12 πάνυ μοι δοκεί όλον τουτί τὸ ἀγαθὸν ἀνθρώπινον είναι, άλλὰ θεῖον, τὸ ἐθελόντων ἄρχειν ὁ σαφῶς δίδοται τοις άληθινώς σωφροσύνη τετελεσμένοις, τὸ δὲ άκόντων τυραννείν διδόασιν, ώς έμοι δοκεί, ους αν ήγῶνται ἀξίους εἶναι βιοτεύειν ὥσπερ ὁ Τάνταλος ἐν Άιδου λέγεται τὸν ἀεὶ χρόνον διατρίβειν φοβούμενος μη δὶς ἀποθάνη.

<sup>19</sup> Heindorf: κρατιστοῦσαι vel κρατίστη οὖσα codd.

#### OECONOMICUS 21.9-21.12

industrious, and persevering—he is the man who gives a lift to the business and swells the surplus. But, Socrates, if the appearance of the master in the workplace, of the man who has the fullest power to punish the bad and reward the strenuous workmen, makes no striking impression on the men at work, I for one cannot envy him. But if at the sight of him they stir themselves and a spirit of determination and rivalry and eagerness to excel falls on every workman, then I should say: this man has a touch of the kingly nature in him. And this, in my judgment, is of chief importance in every operation that makes any demand on human labor, and therefore in farming. Mind you, I don't go so far as to say that this can be learned at sight or at a single hearing. On the contrary, to acquire these powers a man needs education; he must be possessed of great natural gifts; above all, he must be inspired. For I regard this gift as not altogether human but divine—this power to win willing obedience: it is manifestly a gift of the gods to the true votaries of self-control. Despotic rule over unwilling subjects they give, it seems to me, to those who they think deserve to live the life of Tantalus, of whom it is said that in Hades he spends eternity dreading a second death."

11



# SYMPOSIUM

# INTRODUCTION

Xenophon's Symposium must have been finished before 371: the reference in 8.34–35 to the Theban Sacred Band could have been added at any time after 378, when it was founded, but the claim of its superiority to Spartan warrior pairs could not be made after the battle of Leuctra. Plato's Symposium is datable to between 384 and 378. Though there are clear correspondences, 1 priority is impossible to determine with certainty. Most likely is Thesleff's proposal that Xenophon inspired Plato and then revised his own work, by adding a long speech on homosexual love for Socrates in §8; its unresolved relationship to the following heterosexual mime is perhaps a sign that the revision was incomplete, at least in the version that survives.

Xenophon's symposium is set in 422: the boy Autolycus has won a Great Panathenaic victory in the pankration, and his wealthy admirer Callias throws a celebratory party for him and his father, Lycon. But the main theme, as at Plato's symposium, is the nature and proper management of eros. By upper-class convention, such an occasion allowed an *erastes* (lover) to introduce his younger *erome-*

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> E.g., Xenophon's mention of the relationship between Agathon and Pausanias in 8.32 seems to assume the reader's familiarity with Plato's *Symposium*.

#### SYMPOSIUM

nos (beloved) to friends in a setting that demonstrated both the honorable intentions of the pair (emphasized by the father's presence) and the proper gentlemanly behavior expected of their associates. As Socrates demonstrates in his speech, pursuit merely of physical gratification is mean and useless, whereas inspiring the beloved's virtue while serving as his worthy role model is noble. For Xenophon this symposium was an opportunity "to relate not only the serious acts of gentlemen but also what they do in their lighter moments" (1.1). Since Xenophon was only about eight years old at the time and nowhere appears in the ensuing conversation, his further statement, "I should like to showcase those I was with when I came to this conviction" need not be a claim that he was present (as Athenaeus thought, 5.216d) but merely that he himself had attended symposia with them, which is both historically possible and likely.2

Socrates is the center of attention and the certifier of the gentlemanly codes on display. Callias, the host, was represented by the comic poets Aristophanes and Eupolis and by Plato as an indiscriminate patron of sophists and as a dissipated and spendthrift scion of a very wealthy family that had been prominent at Athens in war, sports, religion, and politics for nearly two centuries. Autolycus was the target and title figure of two plays by Eupolis (420 and 419 or 418) and his father, Lycon, a frequent butt as well. Antisthenes was a sophist and contemporary of Socrates, who lived into the 360s and was considered by some the true founder of the Cynic school of philosophy.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Similarly, Xenophon says "I heard" at the opening of *Oeconomicus* but does not take part in the conversation he reports.

Niceratus was the son of the wealthy landowner and general Nicias (who would perish in the Sicilian expedition nine years later), represented here as newly married to an Athenian girl who, we are told elsewhere, would not survive her husband when he was executed by the Thirty Tyrants: like his father, Niceratus was a democrat. Critobulus was the son of Socrates' faithful friend Crito. Callias' half brother Hermogenes, an old associate of Socrates and Xenophon's informant for Apology, is mentioned by Plato as having failed to receive his share of the ancestral wealth (he was probably illegitimate). Charmides, a favorite of Socrates, was the uncle of Plato and the cousin of Critias. chief of the Thirty Tyrants; he would be killed fighting the democrats at Munychia in 403. Philip the comedian and the Syracusan impresario are otherwise unknown. Of these participants, Antisthenes, Critobulus, and Hermogenes would be with Socrates at his death.

# TEXT

All the manuscripts of *Symposium* descend from an undatable archetype but cannot be satisfactorily stemmatized, so that an eclectic approach is justified. For details see Ollier's edition.

# **EDITIONS**

Bowen, A. J. Xenophon Symposium. Warminster, 1998. Dover, K. J. Plato. Symposium. Cambridge, 1980.

Huss, B. Xenophons Symposion. Ein Kommentar. Beiträge zur Altertumskunde 125. Stuttgart, 1999.

Marchant, E. C. Xenophontis Opera<sup>2</sup>. Oxford, 1921.

#### SYMPOSIUM

Ollier, F. Xénophon Banquet, Apologie de Socrate. Budé: Paris, 1961.

# GENERAL

- Huss, B. "The Dancing Sokrates and the Laughing Xenophon, or the Other Symposium." AJP 120 (1999): 381–410.
- Murray, O., ed. Sympotica. Oxford, 1995.
- Thesleff, H. "The Interrelationship and Date of the Symposia of Plato and Xenophon." BICS 25 (1978): 157–70.

1. ἀλλὶ ἐμοὶ δοκεῖ τῶν καλῶν κάγαθῶν ἀνδρῶν ἔργα οὐ μόνον τὰ μετὰ σπουδῆς πραττόμενα ἀξιομνημόνευτα εἶναι ἀλλὰ καὶ τὰ ἐν ταῖς παιδιαῖς. οἷς δὲ παραγενόμενος ταῦτα γιγνώσκω δηλῶσαι βούλομαι.

<sup>3</sup>Ην μεν γαρ Παναθηναίων των μεγάλων ίπποδρομία, Καλλίας δὲ ὁ Ἱππονίκου ἐρῶν ἐτύγχανεν Αὐτολύκου παιδὸς ὄντος, καὶ νενικηκότα αὐτὸν παγκράτιον ηκεν άγων έπὶ την θέαν. ώς δὲ ἡ ἱπποδρομία ἔληξεν, έχων τόν τε Αὐτόλυκον καὶ τὸν πατέρα αὐτοῦ ἀπήει είς τὴν ἐν Πειραιεί οἰκίαν συνείπετο δὲ αὐτῷ καὶ Νικήρατος, ίδων δε όμου όντας Σωκράτην τε καὶ Κριτόβουλον καὶ Έρμογένην καὶ Αντισθένην καὶ Χαρμίδην, τοῖς μὲν ἀμφ' Αὐτόλυκον ἡγεῖσθαί τινα ἔταξεν, αὐτὸς δὲ προσήλθε τοῖς ἀμφὶ Σωκρατην, καὶ εἶπεν. Είς καλόν γε ύμιν συντετύχηκα έστιαν γάρ μέλλω Αὐτόλυκον καὶ τὸν πατέρα αὐτοῦ. οἶμαι οὖν πολὺ ἂν την κατασκευήν μοι λαμπροτέραν φανήναι εί άνδράσιν ἐκκεκαθαρμένοις τὰς ψυχὰς ὥσπερ ὑμῖν ὁ ἀνδρὼν κεκοσμημένος είη μᾶλλον ἢ εί στρατηγοίς καὶ ἱππάρχοις καὶ σπουδαρχίαις.

9

1. To my mind it is worthwhile to relate not only the serious acts of gentlemen but also what they do in their lighter moments. I should like to showcase those I was with when I came to this conviction.

It was on the occasion of the horse races at the greater Panathenaic games; Callias, Hipponicus' son, happened to be courting the boy Autolycus, and in honor of his victory in the pancratium had brought him to see the spectacle. When the racing was over, Callias proceeded on his way to his house in the Peiraeus with Autolycus and the boy's father; Niceratus also was in his company. But on catching sight of a group comprising Socrates, Critobulus, Hermogenes, Antisthenes, and Charmides, Callias told one of his servants to escort Autolycus and the others, and then went over to Socrates and his companions and said, "This is an opportune meeting, for I am about to give a dinner party in honor of Autolycus and his father; and I think that my entertainment would shine much brighter if my dining room were graced with the presence of men like you, whose souls have been purified, than it would with generals and cavalry commanders and office seekers."

<sup>1</sup> The pancratium was a severe athletic contest involving a combination of boxing and wrestling and requiring on the part of the contestants unusual physique and condition.

Καὶ ὁ Σωκράτης εἶπεν ᾿Αεὶ σὺ ἐπισκώπτεις ἡμᾶς καταφρονῶν ὅτι σὺ μὲν Πρωταγόρα τε πολὺ ἀργύριον δέδωκας ἐπὶ σοφία καὶ Γοργία καὶ Προδίκω καὶ ἄλλοις πολλοῖς, ἡμᾶς δ᾽ ὁρᾶς αὐτουργούς τινας τῆς φιλοσοφίας ὄντας.

Καὶ ὁ Καλλίας, Καὶ πρόσθεν μέν γε, ἔφη, ἀπεκρυπτόμην ὑμᾶς ἔχων πολλὰ καὶ σοφὰ λέγειν, νῦν δέ, ἐὰν παρ' ἐμοὶ ἦτε, ἐπιδείξω ὑμῖν ἐμαυτὸν πάνυ πολλῆς σπουδῆς ἄξιον ὄντα.

Οἱ οὖν ἀμφὶ τὸν Σωκράτην πρῶτον μὲν ὥσπερ εἰκὸς ἦν ἐπαινοῦντες τὴν κλῆσιν οὐχ ὑπισχνοῦντο συνδειπνήσειν ὡς δὲ πάνυ ἀχθόμενος φανερὸς ἦν εἰ μὴ ἔψοιντο, συνηκολούθησαν. ἔπειτα δὲ αὐτῷ οἱ μὲν γυμνασάμενοι καὶ χρισάμενοι, οἱ δὲ καὶ λουσάμενοι παρῆλθον. Αὐτόλυκος μὲν οὖν παρὰ τὸν πατέρα ἐκαθέζετο, οἱ δ᾽ ἄλλοι ὥσπερ εἰκὸς κατεκλίθησαν.

Εὐθὺς μὲν οὖν ἐννοήσας τις¹ τὰ γιγνόμενα ἡγήσατ' ἃν φύσει βασιλικόν τι τὸ κάλλος εἶναι, ἄλλως τε καὶ ἢν μετ' αἰδοῦς καὶ σωφροσύνης καθάπερ Αὐτόλυκος τότε κεκτῆταί τις αὐτό. πρῶτον μὲν γὰρ ὥσπερ ὅταν φέγγος τι ἐν νυκτὶ φανῆ, πάντων προσάγεται τὰ ὅμματα, οὕτω καὶ τότε τοῦ Αὐτολύκου τὸ κάλλος πάντων εἶλκε τὰς ὄψεις πρὸς αὐτόν. ἔπειτα τῶν ὁρώντων οὐδεὶς οὐκ ἔπασχέ τι τὴν ψυχὴν ὑπ' ἐκείνου οἱ μέν γε σιωπηρότεροι ἐγίγνοντο, οἱ δὲ καὶ ἐσχηματίζοντό πως. πάντες μὲν οὖν οἱ ἐκ θεῶν του κατεχόμενοι ἀξι-

10

6

<sup>1</sup> τις Aristides: omm. codd.

#### SYMPOSIUM 1.5-1.10

"You're always mocking us," replied Socrates; "feeling superior because you've paid a lot of money to Protagoras, Gorgias,<sup>2</sup> Prodicus,<sup>3</sup> and many others for practical knowledge, while you view us as some kind of amateurs in philosophy."

"It's true," said Callias, "that so far I've been concealing from you my ability at many a smart discourse; but now, if you will favor me with your company, I'll prove to you that

I'm a person worth taking very seriously."

Now at first Socrates and his companions thanked him for the invitation, as might be expected, but would not promise to attend the banquet; when it became clear, however, that he was growing very annoyed at their refusal, they went with him. And so his guests arrived, some having first had their exercise and their rubdown, others with the addition of a bath. Autolycus took a seat by his father's side; the others, of course, reclined.

A person who took note of what happened would have come at once to the conclusion that beauty is something naturally regal, especially when, as in the present case of Autolycus, its possessor joins with it modesty and self-control. For in the first place, just as the sudden glow of a light at night draws all eyes to itself, so now the beauty of Autolycus compelled everyone to look at him. And second, there was not one of the onlookers who did not feel his soul stirred by the boy; some of them grew quieter than before, others even assumed some kind of a pose. Now it is true that all who are possessed by any of the gods seem

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> See 2.26n. <sup>3</sup> Protagoras of Abdera and Prodicus of Keos were frequent visitors to Athens and appear together in Callias' house in Pl. Prt. 314bc.

οθέατοι δοκοῦσιν εἶναι ἀλλ' οἱ μὲν ἐξ ἄλλων πρὸς τὸ γοργότεροἱ τε ὁρᾶσθαι καὶ φοβερώτερον φθέγγεσθαι καὶ σφοδρότεροι εἶναι φέρονται, οἱ δ' ὑπὸ τοῦ σώφρονος "Ερωτος ἔνθεοι τά τε ὅμματα φιλοφρονεστέρως ἔχουσι καὶ τὴν φωνὴν πραοτέραν ποιοῦνται καὶ τὰ σχήματα εἰς τὸ ἐλευθεριώτατον ἄγουσιν. ἃ δὴ καὶ Καλλίας τότε διὰ τὸν "Ερωτα πράττων ἀξιοθέατος ἦν τοῦς τετελεσμένοις τούτω τῷ θεῷ.

Έκεινοι μεν οὖν σιωπη εδείπνουν, ὥσπερ τοῦτο έπιτεταγμένον αὐτοῖς ὑπὸ κρείττονός τινος. Φίλιππος δ' ὁ γελωτοποιὸς κρούσας την θύραν εἶπε τῶ ὑπακούσαντι είσαγγείλαι ὅστις τε εἴη καὶ διότι κατάγεσθαι βούλοιτο συνεσκευασμένος τε παρείναι έφη πάντα τάπιτήδεια ὥστε δειπνεῖν τάλλότρια, καὶ τὸν παῖδα δὲ έφη πάνυ πιέζεσθαι διά τε τὸ φέρειν μηδεν καὶ δια τὸ άνάριστον είναι, ὁ οὖν Καλλίας ἀκούσας ταῦτα εἶπεν Άλλὰ μέντοι, ὦ ἄνδρες, αἰσχρὸν στέγης γε Φθονήσαι εἰσίτω οὖν, καὶ ἄμα ἀπέβλεψεν εἰς τὸν Αὐτόλυκον, δήλον ὅτι ἐπισκοπῶν τί ἐκείνω δόξειε τὸ σκῶμμα εἶναι. ὁ δὲ στὰς ἐπὶ τῷ ἀνδρῶνι ἔνθα τὸ δεῖπνον ἦν εἶπεν. Ότι μὲν γελωτοποιός εἰμι ἴστε πάντες ήκω δὲ προθύμως νομίσας γελοιότερον είναι τὸ ἄκλητον ἢ τὸ κεκλημένον έλθειν έπι τὸ δείπνον. Κατακλίνου τοίνυν, έφη ὁ Καλλίας καὶ γὰρ οἱ παρόντες σπουδης μέν, ὡς όρας, μεστοί, γέλωτος δὲ ἴσως ἐνδεέστεροι.

Δειπνούντων δὲ αὐτῶν ὁ Φίλιππος γελοῖόν τι εὐθὺς ἐπεχείρει λέγειν, ἵνα δὴ ἐπιτελοίη ὧνπερ ἔνεκα ἐκαλεῖτο ἑκάστοτε ἐπὶ τὰ δεῖπνα. ὡς δ' οὐκ ἐκίνησε

11

12

13

## SYMPOSIUM 1.10-1.14

well worth gazing at; but whereas in the case of other gods they have a tendency to look bugeyed, make terrifying sounds, and behave more vehemently, those who are inspired by chaste Eros have a more affectionate look, make their voices more gentle, and carry themselves in a way most befitting free men. Such was the demeanor of Callias at this time under the influence of Eros; and therefore he was an object well worth the gaze of those initiated into the worship of this god.

The company, then, were feasting in silence, as though at the command of some greater authority, when Philip the comedian knocked at the door and told the porter to announce who he was and why he desired to be admitted; he declared that with regard to food he had come fully equipped with everything needed to dine at someone else's expense, and that his servant was in great distress at having no load to carry and at having had no lunch. Hearing this, Callias said, "Well, gentlemen, we can't decently begrudge him at the least the shelter of our roof; so let him come in." At the same time he cast a glance at Autolycus, obviously trying to make out what he had thought of the joke. But Philip, standing at the threshold of the men's hall where the banquet was served, announced: "You all know that I am a comedian: and so I've come here in the firm belief that it's funnier to come to your dinner uninvited than invited." "Well, then," said Callias, "take a seat; for the guests, though well fed, as you can see, on seriousness, are perhaps rather ill supplied with laughter."

No sooner were they engaged in their dinner than Philip tried making a joke, with a view to rendering the service that secured him a dinner engagement every time;

569

11

12

13

γέλωτα, τότε μὲν ἀχθεσθεὶς φανερὸς ἐγένετο. αὖθις δ' ὀλίγον ὕστερον ἄλλο τι γελοῖον ἐβούλετο λέγειν. ὡς δὲ οὐδὲ τότε ἐγέλασαν ἐπ' αὐτῷ, ἐν τῷ μεταξὺ παυσάμενος τοῦ δείπνου συγκαλυψάμενος κατέκειτο.

Καὶ ὁ Καλλίας, Τί τοῦτ', ἔφη, ὧ Φίλιππε; ἀλλ' ἦ όδύνη σε είληφε; καὶ ὃς ἀναστενάξας εἶπε, Ναὶ μὰ  $\Delta i$ , έφη,  $\hat{\omega}$  Καλλία, μεγάλη γε· έπεὶ γὰρ γέλως έξ άνθρώπων άπόλωλεν, έρρει τὰ έμὰ πράγματα. πρόσθεν μεν γαρ τούτου ένεκα έκαλούμην έπὶ τὰ δείπνα ίνα εὐφραίνοιντο οἱ συνόντες δι' ἐμὲ γελῶντες νῦν δὲ τίνος ένεκα καὶ καλεῖ μέ τις; οὔτε γὰρ ἔγωγε σπουδάσαι ἂν δυναίμην μᾶλλον ἤπερ ἀθάνατος γενέσθαι, οὔτε μὴν ὡς ἀντικληθησόμενος καλεῖ μέ τις, ἐπεὶ πάντες ἴσασιν ὅτι ἀρχὴν οὐδὲ νομίζεται εἰς τὴν ἐμὴν οἰκίαν δεῖπνον εἰσφέρεσθαι. καὶ ἄμα λέγων ταῦτα άπεμύττετό τε καὶ τῆ φωνῆ σαφῶς κλαίειν ἐφαίνετο. πάντες μεν οὖν παρεμυθοῦντό τε αὐτὸν ώς αὖθις γελασόμενοι καὶ δειπνεῖν ἐκέλευον, Κριτόβουλος δὲ καὶ έξεκάγχασεν έπὶ τῶ οἰκτισμῶ αὐτοῦ, ὁ δ' ὡς ἤσθετο τοῦ γέλωτος, ἀνεκαλύψατό τε καὶ τῆ ψυχῆ παρακελευσάμενος θαρρείν, ὅτι ἔσονται συμβολαί, πάλιν έδείπνει.

2. Ως δ' ἀφηρέθησαν αἱ τράπεζαι καὶ ἔσπεισάν τε καὶ ἐπαιάνισαν, ἔρχεται αὐτοῖς ἐπὶ κῶμον Συρακόσιός τις ἄνθρωπος, ἔχων τε αὐλητρίδα ἀγαθὴν καὶ ὀρχηστρίδα τῶν τὰ θαύματα δυναμένων ποιεῖν, καὶ παῖδα πάνυ γε ὡραῖον καὶ πάνυ καλῶς κιθαρίζοντα

15

but when he failed to get a laugh he was visibly annoyed. A little later he tried another joke; but when they would not laugh at it this time either, he stopped in the middle of his dinner, covered his head with his cloak, and stretched out on his couch.

"What's the matter, Philip?" Callias asked. "Are you in pain?" Philip replied with a groan, "Zeus yes, Callias, severe pain; for since laughter has perished from the world, my business is ruined. For in times past, the reason I got invitations to dinner was because I might arouse laughter among the guests and put them in a good mood; but why will anyone want to invite me now? For I could no more turn serious than I could become immortal; and certainly no one will invite me in hope of a return invitation, since everyone knows it's simply never been customary at my house even to send out for dinner." As he said this, he wiped his nose, and to judge by the sound, he was evidently weeping. All tried to comfort him with the promise that they would laugh next time, and urged him to eat; and Critobulus actually burst into a guffaw at his display of self-pity. The moment Philip heard the laughter he uncovered his head, and exhorting his spirit to be of good courage—there will be contributions!4—he fell to eating again.

2. When the tables had been removed and the guests had poured a libation and sung a hymn, a man from Syracuse joined them to supply some revelry. He had with him a fine piper girl, a dancing girl—one of those skilled in acrobatic tricks,—and a very handsome boy, who was very

15

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Punning on *symbolai*, which can mean hostile encounters, agreed terms, and potluck contributions (in this case, jokes from him, laughter from the guests, food from the host).

καὶ ὀρχούμενον, ταῦτα δὲ καὶ ἐπιδεικνὺς ὡς ἐν θαύματι ἀργύριον ἐλάμβανεν, ἐπεὶ δὲ αὐτοῖς ἡ αὐλητρὶς 2 μὲν ηὔλησεν, ὁ δὲ παῖς ἐκιθάρισε, καὶ ἐδόκουν μάλα άμφότεροι ίκανῶς εὐφραίνειν, εἶπεν ὁ Σωκράτης Νὴ Δί, ὦ Καλλία, τελέως ἡμᾶς ἐστιᾶς, οὐ γὰρ μόνον δείπνον ἄμεμπτον παρέθηκας, άλλὰ καὶ θεάματα καὶ άκροάματα ἥδιστα παρέχεις. καὶ ὃς ἔφη, Τί οὖν εἰ καὶ μύρον τις ήμιν ενέγκοι, ίνα και εὐωδία έστιώμεθα; Μηδαμώς, έφη ὁ Σωκράτης, ὥσπερ γάρ τοι ἐσθης άλλη μέν γυναικί, άλλη δὲ ἀνδρὶ καλή, οὕτω καὶ όσμη άλλη μεν άνδρί, άλλη δε γυναικί πρέπει. καὶ γαρ ανδρός μεν δήπου ένεκα ανήρ ούδεις μύρω χρίεται, αί μέντοι γυναίκες, ἄλλως τε καὶ ἢν νύμφαι τύχωσιν οὖσαι, ὤσπερ ἡ Νικηράτου τοῦδε καὶ ἡ Κριτοβούλου, μύρου μεν τί καὶ προσδέονται; αὐταὶ γὰρ τούτου ὄζουσιν έλαίου δε τοῦ έν γυμνασίοις όσμη καὶ παρούσα ἡδίων ἢ μύρου γυναιξὶ καὶ ἀπούσα ποθεινοτέρα, καὶ γὰρ δὴ μύρω μὲν ὁ ἀλειψάμενος καὶ δούλος καὶ ἐλεύθερος εὐθὺς ἄπας ὅμοιον ὅζει αἱ δ΄ άπὸ τῶν ἐλευθερίων μόχθων ὀσμαὶ ἐπιτηδευμάτων τε πρώτον χρηστών² καὶ χρόνου πολλοῦ δέονται, εἰ μέλλουσιν ήδεῖαί τε καὶ έλευθέριοι ἔσεσθαι.

Καὶ ὁ Λύκων εἶπεν· Οὐκοῦν νέοις μὲν ἂν εἴη ταῦτα· ἡμᾶς δὲ τοὺς μηκέτι γυμναζομένους τίνος ὅζειν δεήσει:

Καλοκάγαθίας νη Δί, ἔφη ὁ Σωκράτης.

 $<sup>^{2}\</sup>chi\rho\eta\sigma\tau\hat{\omega}\nu$  Athenaeus: omm. codd.

#### SYMPOSIUM 2 1-2 4

good at playing the kithara and at dancing; the Syracusan made money by exhibiting their performance as an amazement.<sup>5</sup> They now played for the company, the piper girl on the pipes, the boy on the kithara; and it was agreed that both furnished satisfactory amusement when Socrates remarked, "I say, Callias, you're entertaining us perfectly: not only have you served a dinner that's above criticism. but you are also offering us very delightful sights and sounds." "Suppose we go further," said Callias, "and have some one bring us perfume, so that we may be entertained amid pleasant scents as well." "Please don't!" replied Socrates. "For just as one kind of clothing looks well on a woman and another kind on a man, so the scents appropriate to men and to women are different. No man, surely, ever puts on perfume for a man's sake. And as for the women, particularly if they happen to be brides, like the wife of Niceratus here and Critobulus' wife, how can they need any additional perfume? They already smell of it. But to women the odor of the olive oil used in the gymnasium is more delightful when you wear it than perfume, and more missed when you don't. In fact, as far as perfume is concerned, as soon as a man puts it on, the scent is the same whether he's a slave or free; but the scents that come from the exertions of free men demand primarily noble pursuits and plenty of time if they are to have the sweet smell of freedom."

"That may do for youngsters," observed Lycon, "but what about those of us who no longer exercise in the gymnasia? What should we smell like?"

"Gentlemanliness, surely!" replied Socrates.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> Or "made an amazing amount of money."

Καὶ πόθεν ἄν τις τοῦτο τὸ χρῖμα λάβοι; Οὐ μὰ Δί', ἔφη, οὐ παρὰ τῶν μυροπωλῶν. ἀλλὰ πόθεν δή; Ὁ μὲν Θέογνις ἔφη.

έσθλῶν μὲν γὰρ ἀπ' ἐσθλὰ διδάξεαι: ἢν δὲ κακοῖσι

συμμίσγης, ἀπολεῖς καὶ τὸν ἐόντα νόον.

Καὶ ὁ Λύκων εἶπεν, ᾿Ακούεις ταῦτα, ὧ υἱέ; Ναὶ μὰ Δί', ἔφη ὁ Σωκράτης, καὶ χρῆταί γε. ἐπεὶ γοῦν νικηφόρος ἐβούλετο τοῦ παγκρατίου γενέσθαι, σὺν σοὶ σκεψάμενος <. . .> αὖ, ὃς ἂν δοκῃ αὐτῷ ἱκανώτατος εἶναι εἰς τὸ ταῦτα ἐπιτηδεῦσαι, τούτῷ συνέσται.

Ένταῦθα δὴ πολλοὶ ἐφθέγξαντο καὶ ὁ μέν τις αὐτῶν εἶπε, Ποῦ οὖν εὑρήσει τούτου διδάσκαλον; ὁ δέ τις ὡς οὐδὲ διδακτὸν τοῦτο εἴη, ἔτερος δέ τις ὡς εἴπερ
τι καὶ ἄλλο καὶ τοῦτο μαθητόν.³ ὁ δὲ Σωκράτης ἔφη· Τοῦτο μὲν ἐπειδὴ ἀμφίλογόν ἐστιν, εἰς αὖθις ἀποθώμεθα· νυνὶ δὲ τὰ προκείμενα ἀποτελῶμεν. ὁρῶ γὰρ ἔγωγε τήνδε τὴν ὀρχηστρίδα ἐφεστηκυῖαν καὶ τροχούς τινα αὐτῆ προσφέροντα.

8 Ἐκ τούτου δὴ ηὔλει μὲν αὐτῆ ἡ ἑτέρα, παρεστηκὼς δέ τις τῆ ὀρχηστρίδι ἀνεδίδου τοὺς τροχοὺς μέχρι δώδεκα. ἡ δὲ λαμβάνουσα ἄμα τε ἀρχεῖτο καὶ ἀνερ-

 $<sup>^3</sup>$  μαθητόν Stephanus: μαθητέον codd.

"And where might a person get this particular scent?"
"Certainly not from the perfume market," said Socrates.

"But where, then?"
"Theognis has said:6

Good men will teach you good; society with bad Will but corrupt the good mind that you had.

"Do you hear that, son?" asked Lycon.

"Indeed he does," said Socrates; "and he puts it into practice, too. At any rate, when he wanted to be a prize-winner in the pancratium, he availed himself of your help <to discover the champions in that sport and associate with them; and so, if he desires to learn the ways of excellence >7 he will again with your help seek out the man who seems to him most proficient in that way of life and will associate with him."

At that there was a chorus of voices. "Where will he find a teacher in that subject?" someone said. Another said that it couldn't be taught at all, a third that it could be learned as readily as anything else. "Since this is a debatable matter," suggested Socrates, "let's reserve it for another time; for now, let's finish what we have on hand. For I see that the dancing girl here is standing ready, and that someone is bringing her some hoops."

At that the other girl began to accompany the dancer on the pipes, and a boy at her elbow handed her up the hoops until he had given her twelve. She took these and

<sup>6</sup> Theognis 35 f. (with  $\mu a \theta \dot{\eta} \sigma \epsilon a \iota$  for  $\delta \iota \delta \dot{a} \xi \epsilon a \iota$ ).

<sup>7</sup> The words in brackets are meant to represent approximately the sense of words that have been lost in the manuscripts.

ρίπτει δονουμένους συντεκμαιρομένη ὅσον ἔδει ἡιπτεῖν ὕψος ὡς ἐν ἡυθμῷ δέχεσθαι αὐτούς.

Καὶ ὁ Σωκράτης εἶπεν· Ἐν πολλοῖς μέν, ὧ ἄνδρες, καὶ ἄλλοις δῆλον καὶ ἐν οἶς δ' ἡ παῖς ποιεῖ ὅτι ἡ γυναικεία φύσις οὐδὲν χείρων τῆς τοῦ ἀνδρὸς οὖσα τυγχάνει, γνώμης δὲ καὶ ἰσχύος δεῖται. ὥστε εἴ τις ὑμῶν γυναῖκα ἔχει, θαρρῶν διδασκέτω ὅ τι βούλοιτ' ἂν αὐτῆ ἐπισταμένη χρῆσθαι.

Καὶ ὁ ἀντισθένης, Πῶς οὖν, ἔφη, ὧ Σώκρατες, οὕτω γιγνώσκων οὐ καὶ σὺ παιδεύεις Ξανθίππην, ἀλλὰ χρῆ γυναικὶ τῶν οὐσῶν, οἶμαι δὲ καὶ τῶν γεγενημένων καὶ τῶν ἐσομένων, χαλεπωτάτη;

Ότι, ἔφη, ὁρῶ καὶ τοὺς ἱππικοὺς βουλομένους γενέσθαι οὐ τοὺς εὐπειθεστάτους ἀλλὰ τοὺς θυμοειδεῖς ἵππους κτωμένους. νομίζουσι γάρ, ἢν τοὺς τοιούτους δύνωνται κατέχειν, ῥαδίως τοῖς γε ἄλλοις ἵπποις χρήσεσθαι. κάγὼ δὴ βουλόμενος ἀνθρώποις χρῆσθαι καὶ ὁμιλεῖν ταύτην κέκτημαι, εὖ εἰδὼς ὅτι εἰ ταύτην ὑποίσω, ῥαδίως τοῖς γε ἄλλοις ἄπασιν ἀνθρώποις συνέσομαι.

Καὶ οὖτος μὲν δὴ ὁ λόγος οὐκ ἀπὸ<sup>4</sup> τοῦ σκοποῦ ἔδοξεν εἰρῆσθαι.

Μετὰ δὲ τοῦτο κύκλος εἰσηνέχθη περίμεστος ξιφῶν ὀρθῶν. εἰς οὖν ταῦτα ἡ ὀρχηστρὶς ἐκυβίστα τε καὶ ἐξεκυβίστα ὑπὲρ αὐτῶν. ὥστε οἱ μὲν θεώμενοι ἐφοβοῦντο μή τι πάθη, ἡ δὲ θαρρούντως τε καὶ ἀσφαλῶς ταῦτα διεπράττετο.

9

10

as she danced kept tossing them whirling into the air, calculating how high to throw them so as to catch them in a regular rhythm.

As Socrates looked on he remarked: "This girl's feat, gentlemen, is only one of many proofs that woman's nature is really not at all inferior to man's, except in its lack of judgment and physical strength. So if any one of you has a wife, let him confidently set about teaching her whatever he would like to have her know."

"If that's your view, Socrates," asked Antisthenes, "how does it come that you don't practice what you preach by yourself educating Xanthippe, but live with a wife who is the hardest to get along with of all the women there are—yes, or all that ever were, I suspect, or ever will be?"

"Because," he replied, "I observe that people wishing to become expert horsemen do not acquire the most docile horses but rather those that are high-spirited, believing that if they can manage this kind, they will easily handle any other. My course is similar. Humankind at large is what I wish to deal and associate with; and so I have got her, well assured that if I can endure her, I shall have no difficulty in my relations with all the rest of humankind."

These words, in the judgment of the guests, did not go wide of the mark.

But now there was brought in a hoop set all around with upright swords; over these the dancer turned somersaults into the hoop and out again, to the dismay of the audience, who thought that she might suffer some mishap. But she went through this performance fearlessly and safely.

10

 $<sup>4 \, \</sup>tilde{a} \pi o A F$ 

- 12 Καὶ ὁ Σωκράτης καλέσας τὸν ἀντισθένην εἶπεν· Οὔτοι τούς γε θεωμένους τάδε ἀντιλέξειν ἔτι οἴομαι ὡς οὐχὶ καὶ ἡ ἀνδρεία διδακτόν, ὁπότε αὕτη καίπερ γυνὴ οὖσα οὕτω τολμηρῶς εἰς τὰ ξίφη ἵεται.
- 13 Καὶ ὁ ἀντισθένης εἶπεν· ਐΑρ' οὖν καὶ τῷδε τῷ Συρακοσίῷ κράτιστον ἐπιδείξαντι τῆ πόλει τὴν ὀρχηστρίδα εἰπεῖν, ἐὰν διδῶσιν αὐτῷ ἀθηναῖοι χρήματα, ποιήσειν πάντας ἀθηναίους τολμᾶν ὁμόσε ταῖς λόγχαις ἰέναι;
- 14 Καὶ ὁ Φίλιππος, Νὴ Δί', ἔφη, καὶ μὴν ἔγωγε ἡδέως ἄν θεώμην Πείσανδρον τὸν δημηγόρον μανθάνοντα κυβιστᾶν εἰς τὰς μαχαίρας, ὃς νῦν διὰ τὸ μὴ δύνασθαι λόγχαις ἀντιβλέπειν οὐδὲ συστρατεύεσθαι ἐθέλει.
- 15 'Εκ τούτου ὁ παῖς ὡρχήσατο. καὶ ὁ Σωκράτης εἶπεν, Εἴδετ', ἔφη, ὡς καλὸς ὁ παῖς ὢν ὅμως σὺν τοῖς σχήμασιν ἔτι καλλίων φαίνεται ἢ ὅταν ἡσυχίαν ἔχη; Καὶ ὁ Χαρμίδης εἶπεν· Ἐπαινοῦντι ἔοικας τὸν ὀρχηστοδιδάσκαλον.
- 16 Ναὶ μὰ τὸν Δί, ἔφη ὁ Σωκράτης καὶ γὰρ ἄλλο τι προσενενόησα, ὅτι οὐδὲν ἀργὸν τοῦ σώματος ἐν τῆ ὀρχήσει ἦν, ἀλλ' ἄμα καὶ τράχηλος καὶ σκέλη καὶ χεῖρες ἐγυμνάζοντο, ὥσπερ χρὴ ὀρχεῖσθαι τὸν μέλλοντα εὐφορώτερον τὸ σῶμα ἔξειν. καὶ ἐγὼ μέν, ἔφη, πάνυ ἂν ἡδέως, ὧ Συρακόσιε, μάθοιμι τὰ σχήματα παρὰ σοῦ.

Then Socrates, catching Antisthenes' attention, said: "At least the people watching this will never again deny, I imagine, that courage too is a teachable quality, when this one, in spite of being a female, keeps leaping so boldly in among the swords!"

"Well then," asked Antisthenes, "wouldn't it be best for this Syracusan to exhibit his dancer to the city and announce that if the Athenians pay him money he'll give all the men of Athens the courage to charge the spear points?"

"Well said!" interjected Philip. "I'd certainly like to watch Peisander the popular leader learning to turn somersaults into the knives; for as it is, his inability to look spears in the face makes him shrink even from going on campaign!"8

At this point the boy performed a dance, eliciting from Socrates the remark, "Did you notice that, handsome as the boy is, he looks even handsomer in the poses of the dance than when he's at rest?"

"It looks to me," said Charmides, "as if you were congratulating the dancing master."

"That's right," replied Socrates; "and I noticed something else, too: that no part of his body was idle during the dance, but neck, legs, and hands were all active together, the way you must dance if you mean to have a suppler body. As for myself," he continued, addressing the Syracusan, "I would gladly learn the figures from you."

<sup>8</sup> Peisander, mocked for cowardice also in contemporary comedy, was prominent throughout the Peloponnesian War but fled Athens after the fall of the oligarchic government in 411, which he had been instrumental in launching.

12

13

14

15

Καὶ ὅς, Τί οὖν χρήσει αὐτοῖς; ἔφη. ὀρχήσομαι νὴ Δία.

Ένταθθα δη έγελασαν απαντες, καὶ ὁ Σωκράτης 17 μάλα ἐσπουδακότι τῶ προσώπω, Γελᾶτε, ἔφη, ἐπ' έμοί; πότερον έπὶ τούτω εἰ βούλομαι γυμναζόμενος μαλλον ύγιαίνειν η εί ήδιον έσθίειν καὶ καθεύδειν η εί τοιούτων γυμνασίων έπιθυμῶ, μὴ ὥσπερ οἱ δολιχοδρόμοι τὰ σκέλη μὲν παχύνονται, τοὺς δὲ ὤμους λεπτύνονται, μηδ' ὥσπερ οἱ πύκται τοὺς μὲν ὤμους παχύνονται, τὰ δὲ σκέλη λεπτύνονται, ἀλλὰ παντὶ διαπονών τῷ σώματι πᾶν ἰσόρροπον ποιείν; ἢ ἐπ' 18 έκείνω γελατε ότι οὐ δεήσει με συγγυμναστὴν ζητεῖν, οὐδ' ἐν ὄχλω πρεσβύτην ὄντα ἀποδύεσθαι, ἀλλ' ἀρκέσει μοι οἶκος έπτάκλινος, ὥσπερ καὶ νῦν τῷδε τῷ παιδὶ ήρκεσε τόδε τὸ οἴκημα ἐνιδρῶσαι, καὶ χειμῶνος μεν έν στέγη γυμνάσομαι, ὅταν δε ἄγαν καῦμα ἢ, ἐν σκιᾶ; ἢ τόδε γελᾶτε, εἶ μείζω τοῦ καιροῦ τὴν γαστέρα 19 έχων μετριωτέραν βούλομαι ποιήσαι αὐτήν; ἢ οὐκ ἴστε ὅτι ἔναγχος ἔωθεν Χαρμίδης ούτοσὶ κατέλαβέ με όρχούμενον;

Ναὶ μὰ τὸν Δί, ἔφη ὁ Χαρμίδης· καὶ τὸ μέν γε πρῶτον ἐξεπλάγην καὶ ἔδεισα μὴ μαίνοιο· ἐπεὶ δέ σου ἤκουσα ὅμοια οἷς νῦν λέγεις, καὶ αὐτὸς ἐλθὼν οἴκαδε ὡρχούμην μὲν οὕ, οὐ γὰρ πώποτε τοῦτ' ἔμαθον, ἐχειρονόμουν δέ· ταῦτα γὰρ ἤπιστάμην.

Νη Δί', ἔφη ὁ Φίλιππος, καὶ γὰρ οὖν οὕτω τὰ σκέλη τοῖς ὤμοις φαίνη ἰσοφόρα ἔχειν ὥστε δοκεῖς

## SYMPOSIUM 2.16-2.20

"What will you do with them?" the other asked.

"I'll dance, of course."

This raised a general laugh; but Socrates, with a perfectly grave expression on his face, said: "Laughing at me, are you? Is it because I want to exercise to better my health? Or because I want to take more pleasure in my food and my sleep? Or is it because I am eager for such exercises as these, not like the long-distance runners, who develop their legs at the expense of their shoulders, nor like the prizefighters, who develop their shoulders but become thin-legged, but rather with a view to giving my body a symmetrical development by exercising it in every part? Or are you laughing because I won't need to hunt up an exercise partner, or to strip, old as I am, in a crowd, but will find a seven-couch room large enough for me, just as this room was large enough for the boy here to work up a sweat just now, and because in winter I'll exercise indoors. and when it's very hot, in the shade? Or is this why you're laughing, that I have an unduly large paunch and wish to reduce it? Don't you know that just the other day Charmides here caught me dancing early in the morning?"

"That I did," said Charmides; "and at first I was dumbfounded and feared that you were going mad; but when I heard you say more or less what you said just now, I myself went home, and though I didn't dance, for I never learned how, I did practice shadowboxing, for I knew how to do that."

"Oh yes," said Philip; "at any rate, your legs appear so nearly equal in weight to your shoulders that I imagine if

17

18

19

<sup>9</sup> Cf. Xen. Oec. 8.13.

έμοί, κἂν εἰ τοῖς ἀγορανόμοις ἀφισταίης ὅσπερ ἄρτους τὰ κάτω πρὸς τὰ ἄνω, ἀζήμιος ἂν γενέσθαι.

Καὶ ὁ Καλλίας εἶπεν $^{\circ}$   $^{\circ}$ Ω Σώκρατες, ἐμὲ μὲν παρακάλει, ὅταν μέλλης μανθάνειν ὀρχεῖσθαι, ἵνα σοι ἀντιστοιχῶ τε καὶ συμμανθάνω.

21 Ἄγε δή, ἔφη ὁ Φίλιππος, καὶ ἐμοὶ αὐλησάτω, ἵνα καὶ ἐγὼ ὀρχήσωμαι.

Ἐπειδὴ δ' ἀνέστη, διῆλθε μιμούμενος τήν τε τοῦ παιδὸς καὶ τὴν τῆς παιδὸς ὄρχησιν. καὶ πρῶτον μὲν ὅτι ἐπήνεσαν ὡς ὁ παῖς σὺν τοῖς σχήμασιν ἔτι καλλίων ἐφαίνετο, ἀνταπέδειξεν ὅ τι κινοίη τοῦ σώματος ἄπαν τῆς φύσεως γελοιότερον ὅτι δ' ἡ παῖς εἰς τοὕπισθεν καμπτομένη τροχοὺς ἐμιμεῖτο, ἐκεῖνος ταῦτα εἰς τὸ ἔμπροσθεν ἐπικύπτων μιμεῖσθαι τροχοὺς ἐπειρᾶτο. τέλος δ' ὅτι τὸν παῖδ' ἐπήνουν ὡς ἐν τῆ ὀρχήσει ἄπαν τὸ σῶμα γυμνάζοι, κελεύσας τὴν αὐλητρίδα θάττονα ῥυθμὸν ἐπάγειν ἵει ἄμα πάντα καὶ σκέλη καὶ χεῖρας καὶ κεφαλήν. ἐπειδὴ δὲ ἀπειρήκει, κατακλινόμενος εἶπε· Τεκμήριον, ὧ ἄνδρες, ὅτι καλῶς γυμνάζει καὶ τὰ ἐμὰ ὀρχήματα. ἐγὰ γοῦν διψῶ· καὶ ὁ παῖς ἐγχεάτω μοι τὴν μεγάλην φιάλην.

Νη Δί', ἔφη ὁ Καλλίας, καὶ ἡμῖν γε, ἐπεὶ καὶ ἡμεῖς δυψῶμεν ἐπὶ σοὶ γελῶντες.

Ό δ' αὖ Σωκράτης εἶπεν· 'Αλλὰ πίνειν μέν, ὧ ἄνδρες, καὶ ἐμοὶ πάνυ δοκεῖ· τῷ γὰρ ὄντι ὁ οἶνος ἄρδων τὰς ψυχὰς τὰς μὲν λύπας ὥσπερ ὁ μανδραγόρας τοὺς

22

23

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> ἀφισταίης Mehler: ἀφιστώης codd.

you went to the market commissioners and put your lower parts in the scale against your upper parts, as if they were loaves of bread, they would let you off without a fine."

"When you're ready to begin your lessons, Socrates," said Callias, "please invite me, so that I may line up opposite you and share the lessons."

"Come on," said Philip, "let me have some pipe music, so that I may dance too."

21

22

So he got up and mimicked in detail the dancing of both the boy and the girl. To begin with, since the company had applauded the way the boy's natural beauty was increased by the grace of the dancing postures, Philip made a burlesque out of the performance by rendering every part of his body that was in motion more grotesque than it naturally was; and whereas the girl had bent backward until she resembled a hoop, he tried to do the same by bending forward. Finally, since they had given the boy applause for putting every part of his body into play in the dance, he told the piper girl to quicken the tempo and danced away, flinging out legs, hands, and head all at the same time; and when he was quite exhausted, he exclaimed as he took to his couch: "Here is proof, gentlemen, that my style of dancing also affords excellent exercise; it has certainly made me thirsty; so let the slave fill me up the big goblet."

23

"By all means," replied Callias; "and the same for us, for we're thirsty from laughing at you."

Here Socrates again interposed. "Well, gentlemen," he said, "as far as drinking is concerned, you have my full approval; for wine does in fact 'moisten the soul' 10 and lull

24

<sup>10</sup> Apparently a reminiscence of Aristophanes' Knights, 96, 114.

άνθρώπους κοιμίζει, τὰς δὲ φιλοφροσύνας ὥσπερ έλαιον φλόγα έγείρει. δοκεί μέντοι μοι καὶ τὰ τῶν 25 άνδρῶν σώματα6 ταὐτὰ πάσχειν ἄπερ καὶ τὰ τῶν ἐν γη φυομένων. καὶ γὰρ ἐκεῖνα, ὅταν μὲν ὁ θεὸς αὐτὰ άγαν άθρόως ποτίζη, οὐ δύναται ὀρθοῦσθαι οὐδὲ ταῖς αύραις διαπνείσθαι όταν δ' όσω ήδεται τοσούτο πίνη, καὶ μάλα ὀρθά τε αὔξεται καὶ θάλλοντα ἀφικνεῖται είς τὴν καρπογονίαν. οὕτω δὲ καὶ ἡμεῖς ἢν μὲν άθρόον τὸ ποτὸν ἐγχεώμεθα, ταχὺ ἡμῖν καὶ τὰ σώματα καὶ αἱ γνῶμαι σφαλοῦνται, καὶ οὐδὲ ἀναπνεῖν. μὴ ὅτι λέγειν τι δυνησόμεθα ἢν δὲ ἡμῖν οἱ παίδες μικραῖς κύλιξι πυκνὰ ἐπιψακάζωσιν, ἵνα καὶ ἐγὼ ἐν Γοργιείοις ρήμασιν είπω, ούτως οὐ βιαζόμενοι ὑπὸ τοῦ οἴνου μεθύειν ἀλλ' ἀναπειθόμενοι πρὸς τὸ παιγνιωδέστερον ἀφιξόμεθα.

'Εδόκει μεν δη ταθτα πασι προσέθηκε δε ό Φίλιππος ώς χρη τους οίνοχόους μιμείσθαι τους άγαθους άρματηλάτας, θᾶττον περιελαύνοντας τὰς κύλικας, οί μεν δη οινοχόοι ουτως εποίουν.

3. Έκ δὲ τούτου συνηρμοσμένη τῆ λύρα πρὸς τὸν αὐλὸν ἐκιθάρισεν ὁ παῖς καὶ ἦσεν. ἔνθα δὴ ἐπήνεσαν μεν άπαντες ὁ δε Χαρμίδης καὶ εἶπεν ᾿Αλλ᾽ ἐμοὶ μεν δοκεί, ὧ ἄνδρες, ὥσπερ Σωκράτης ἔφη τὸν οἶνον, οὕτω καὶ αὕτη ἡ κρᾶσις τῶν τε παίδων τῆς ὥρας καὶ τῶν φθόγγων τὰς μὲν λύπας κοιμίζειν, τὴν δ' Αφροδίτην έγείρειν.

26

<sup>6</sup> σώματα Athenaeus: συμπόσια codd. Stobaeus

our pains to sleep just as mandragora lulls people, at the same time awakening kindly feelings just as oil does a flame. I suspect, however, that men's bodies fare the same as plants that grow in the ground: when the god gives the plants water in floods to drink, they can't stand up straight or let the breezes blow through them, but when they drink only as much as they enjoy, they grow up very straight and come to full and abundant fruitage. So it is with us. If we pour ourselves immense drafts, it won't be long before both our bodies and our minds start reeling, and we won't be able even to draw breath, much less to speak sensibly; but if the slaves frequently 'besprinkle' us—if I too may use a Gorgian<sup>11</sup> expression—with small cups, we will reach the merrier state not by the wine's compulsion to drunkenness but instead by its gentle persuasion."

This resolution received a unanimous vote, with an amendment added by Philip that the wine waiters should emulate skillful charioteers by driving the cups around with increasing speed. This the wine waiters proceeded to do.

3. After this the boy, attuning his lyre to the pipes, played and sang, and won the applause of all; and Charmides remarked, "It seems to me, gentlemen, that, as Socrates said of the wine, so this blending of the young people's beauty with the sounds of their music lulls one's pains to sleep and rouses Aphrodite."

<sup>11</sup> Gorgias was a Sicilian orator and teacher of rhetoric (cf. 1.5), whose pointed and poetic style much impressed the Athenians after his visit in 427 but after the war had begun to go out of fashion, cf. Arist. *Rhet*. 3.3.4/1406<sup>b</sup> 4 ff.

25

26

Έκ τούτου δε πάλιν εἶπεν ὁ Σωκράτης. Οὖτοι μεν δή, ὧ ἄνδρες, ἱκανοὶ τέρπειν ἡμᾶς φαίνονται· ἡμεῖς δε τούτων οἶδ' ὅτι πολὺ βελτίονες οἰόμεθα εἶναι· οὐκ αἰσχρὸν οὖν εἰ μηδ' ἐπιχειρήσομεν συνόντες ὡφελεῖν τι ἢ εὐφραίνειν ἀλλήλους;

Έντεθθεν εἶπον πολλοί, Σὰ τοίνυν ἡμῖν έξηγοῦ ποίων λόγων ἀπτόμενοι μάλιστ' ἂν ταῦτα ποιοῖμεν.

Έγω μεν τοίνυν, έφη, ἥδιστ' αν ἀπολάβοιμι παρὰ Καλλίου τὴν ὑπόσχεσιν. έφη γὰρ δήπου, εἰ συνδειπνοῖμεν, ἐπιδείξειν τὴν αὐτοῦ σοφίαν.

Καὶ ἐπιδείξω γε, ἔφη, ἐὰν καὶ ὑμεῖς ἄπαντες εἰς μέσον φέρητε ὅ τι ἕκαστος ἐπίστασθε ἀγαθόν.

'Αλλ' οὐδείς σοι, ἔφη, ἀντιλέγει τὸ μὴ οὐ λέξειν ὅ τι ἕκαστος ἡγεῖται πλείστου ἄξιον ἐπίστασθαι.

Καὶ ὁ ἀντισθένης εἶπε, Πότερον τέχνην τινὰ βαναυσικὴν ἢ καλοκάγαθίαν διδάσκων;

Εἰ καλοκάγαθία ἐστὶν ἡ δικαιοσύνη.

Νη Δί', ἔφη ὁ ἀντισθένης, η γε ἀναμφιλογωτάτη· ἐπεί τοι ἀνδρεία μὲν καὶ σοφία ἔστιν ὅτε βλαβερὰ καὶ φίλοις καὶ πόλει δοκεῖ εἶναι, ἡ δὲ δικαιοσύνη οὐδὲ καθ' ἐν συμμίγνυται τῆ ἀδικία.

2

 $<sup>^{12}</sup>$  The word δικαιοσύνη, translated here by "righteousness," is sometimes well represented by "justice" or "honesty." It is the

Then Socrates resumed the conversation. "These people, gentlemen," he said, "show their competence to give us pleasure, and yet I'm sure we consider ourselves far superior to them. Won't it be shameful, then, if we don't even try, while we're here together, to give one another some benefit or pleasure?"

At that many spoke up: "You lead the way, then, and tell us what topics we should take up in order best to do that."

"For my part," he answered, "I would most like to take Callias up on his promise; he said, you remember, that if we had dinner with him he would give us an exhibition of his practical knowledge."

"Yes," rejoined Callias; "and I will do so, if the rest of you also ante up any knowledge that each has that's fine."

"Well," answered Socrates, "no one objects to telling what he considers the most valuable knowledge in his possession."

"Very well, then," said Callias, "I will now tell you what I take greatest pride in. It is that I believe I have the ability to make people better."

"How?" asked Antisthenes. "By teaching them some banausic trade, or by teaching gentlemanliness?"

"The latter, if gentlemanliness equals righteousness." 12

"Certainly it does," replied Antisthenes, "and the least debatable kind, too; for though courage and sagacity sometimes seem harmful both to one's friends and to the city, righteousness and unrighteousness never overlap at a single point.

virtue discussed by Plato in the *Republic* and by Aristotle in the fifth book of his *Ethics*.

'Επειδὰν τοίνυν καὶ ὑμῶν<sup>7</sup> ἔκαστος εἴπῃ ὅ τι ὡφέλιμον ἔχει, τότε κἀγὼ οὐ φθονήσω εἰπεῖν τὴν τέχνην δι' ἦς τοῦτο ἀπεργάζομαι. ἀλλὰ σὺ αὖ, ἔφη, λέγε, ὧ Νικήρατε, ἐπὶ ποίᾳ ἐπιστήμῃ μέγα φρονεῖς.

Καὶ δς εἶπεν· Ὁ πατὴρ ἐπιμελούμενος ὅπως ἀνὴρ ἀγαθὸς γενοίμην, ἠνάγκασέ με πάντα τὰ Ὁμήρου ἔπη μαθεῖν· καὶ νῦν δυναίμην ἃν Ἰλιάδα ὅλην καὶ Ὀδύσσειαν ἀπὸ στόματος εἰπεῖν.

Έκεινο δ', ἔφη ὁ Ἀντισθένης, λέληθέ σε ὅτι καὶ οἱ ρ΄αψωδοὶ πάντες ἐπίστανται ταῦτα τὰ ἔπη;

Καὶ πῶς ἄν, ἔφη, λελήθοι ἀκροώμενόν γε αὐτῶν ολίγου ἀν' ἐκάστην ἡμέραν;

Οῗσθά τι οὖν ἔθνος, ἔφη, ἠλιθιώτερον ῥαψωδων;
Οὐ μὰ τὸν Δί', ἔφη ὁ Νικήρατος, οὔκουν ἔμοιγε
δοκεῖ

Δήλον γάρ, ἔφη ὁ Σωκράτης, ὅτι τὰς ὑπονοίας οὐκ ἐπίστανται. σὰ δὲ Στησιμβρότω τε καὶ ἀναξιμάνδρω καὶ ἄλλοις πολλοῖς πολὰ δέδωκας ἀργύριον, ὥστε οὐδέν σε τῶν πολλοῦ ἀξίων λέληθε. τί γὰρ σύ, ἔφη, ὧ Κριτόβουλε, ἐπὶ τίνι μέγιστον φρονεῖς;

Έπὶ κάλλει, ἔφη.

³Η οὖν καὶ σύ, ἔφη ὁ Σωκράτης, ἔξεις λέγειν ὅτι τῷ σῷ κάλλει ἰκανὸς εἶ βελτίους ἡμᾶς ποιεῖν;

Εἰ δὲ μή, δῆλόν γε ὅτι φαῦλος φανοῦμαι.

5

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> ὑμῶν Castalio: ἡμῶν codd.

"Well, then, when every one of you has named the benefit he can confer, I won't mind describing the art that gives me the success I speak of. And so, Niceratus," he suggested, "it's your turn; tell us what kind of knowledge you take pride in."

"My father was anxious to see me develop into a good man," said Niceratus, "so he made me to memorize all of Homer; and so even now I can repeat the whole *Iliad* and the *Odussey* by heart."

"But have you failed to observe," questioned Antisthenes, "that the rhapsodes, 13 too, all know these poems?"

"How could I," he replied, "when I listen to their recitations nearly every day?"

"Well, do you know of any tribe sillier than rhapsodes?"
"No indeed," answered Niceratus; "not as far as I'm concerned."

"No," said Socrates; "and the reason is clear: they don't know the inner meaning of the poems. But you have paid a lot of money to Stesimbrotus, Anaximander, 14 and many others, so you've missed nothing valuable that they've got. But what about you, Critobulus? What do you take greatest pride in?"

"Handsomeness," he replied.

"What?" exclaimed Socrates. "Are you too going to be able to maintain that you can make us better, and by means of your handsomeness?"

"If not, I'm clearly going to seem pretty worthless."

<sup>13</sup> These professional reciters of epic poetry are represented as being criticized by Socrates, in much the same way as here, in Xenophon's *Memorabilia* 4.2.10, and in Plato's *Ion*.

 $^{14}$  For Stesimbrotus of Thasos, cf. Pl. Ion 530d; Anaximander is otherwise unknown.

8 Τί γὰρ σύ, εἶπεν, ἐπὶ τίνι μέγα φρονεῖς, ὧ ἀντίσθενες;

Έπὶ πλούτω, ἔφη.

Ὁ μὲν δὴ Ἑρμογένης ἀνήρετο εἰ πολὺ εἴη αὐτῷ ἀργύριον. ὁ δὲ ἀπώμοσε μηδὲ ὀβολόν.

Άλλὰ γῆν πολλὴν κέκτησαι;

"Ισως ἄν, ἔφη, Αὐτολύκω τούτω ἱκανὴ γένοιτο ἐγκονίσασθαι.

9 'Ακουστέον ἂν εἴη καὶ σοῦ. τί γὰρ σύ, ἔφη, ὧ Χαρμίδη, ἐπὶ τίνι μέγα φρονεῖς;

Έγω αὖ, ἔφη, ἐπὶ πενία μέγα φρονω.

Νη Δί, ἔφη ὁ Σωκράτης, ἐπ' εὐχαρίστω γε πράγματι. τοῦτο γὰρ δη ήκιστα μὲν ἐπίφθονον, ήκιστα δὲ περιμάχητον, καὶ ἀφύλακτον ὂν σώζεται καὶ ἀμελούμενον ἰσχυρότερον γίγνεται.

Σὺ δὲ δή, ἔφη ὁ Καλλίας, ἐπὶ τίνι μέγα φρονεῖς, ὧ Σώκρατες;

Καὶ ὃς μάλα σεμνῶς ἀνασπάσας τὸ πρόσωπον, Ἐπὶ μαστροπεία, εἶπεν.

Έπεὶ δὲ ἐγέλασαν ἐπ' αὐτῷ, Ὑμεῖς μὲν γελᾶτε, ἔφη, ἐγὼ δὲ οἶδ' ὅτι καὶ πάνυ ἃν πολλὰ χρήματα λαμβά-νοιμι, εἰ βουλοίμην χρῆσθαι τῆ τέχνη.

11 Σύ γε μὴν δῆλον, ἔφη ὁ Λύκων πρὸς τὸν Φίλιππον, ὅτι ἐπὶ τῷ γελωτοποιεῖν μέγα φρονεῖς.

Δικαιότερόν γ', ἔφη, οἴομαι, ἢ Καλλιππίδης ὁ ὑποκριτής, ὃς ὑπερσεμνύνεται ὅτι δύναται πολλοὺς κλαίοντας καθίζειν.

### SYMPOSIUM 3.8-3.11

"And you, Antisthenes," said Socrates, "what do you take pride in?"

"Wealth," he replied.

Hermogenes asked him whether he had a lot of money; he swore that he hadn't even a penny.

"You own a lot of land, then?"

"Maybe enough," said he, "for Autolycus here to powder himself."  $^{15}$ 

"It looks as if we'll have to hear from you too. And how about you, Charmides?" he continued. "What do you take pride in?"

"My pride," said he, "is rather in my poverty."

"A charming thing, to be sure!" exclaimed Socrates. "It seldom inspires envy, seldom causes fights; it's safeguarded without guards, and grows stronger by neglect."

"But what about you, Socrates?" said Callias. "What are

you proud of?"

Socrates made a very solemn face and answered, "Procuring."

After the rest had laughed at him, he said, "Go ahead and laugh, but I know that I could make a lot of money if I cared to follow that trade."

"As for you," said Lycon, addressing Philip, "it is obvious that you pride yourself on getting laughs."

"And more justifiably," replied Philip, "than Callippides the actor, <sup>16</sup> who is so very smug because he can get many to sit and cry."

15 As did wrestlers, after applying oil.

<sup>16</sup> Callippides was regarded at this time and afterward as perhaps the most illustrious tragic actor of his time.

10

12 Οὐκοῦν καὶ σύ, ἔφη ὁ ἀντισθένης, λέξεις, ὧ Λύκων, ἐπὶ τίνι μέγα φρονεῖς;

Καὶ δς ἔφη, Οὐ γὰρ ἄπαντες ἴστε, ἔφη, <ὅτι> ἐπὶ τούτω τῷ υἱεῖ;

Οὖτός γε μήν, ἔφη τις, δῆλον ὅτι ἐπὶ τῷ νικηφόρος εἶναι.

Καὶ ὁ Αὐτόλυκος ἀνερυθριάσας εἶπε, Μὰ Δί οὐκ ἔγωγε.

Έπεὶ δὲ ἄπαντες ἡσθέντες ὅτι ἤκουσαν αὐτοῦ φωνήσαντος προσέβλεψαν, ἤρετό τις αὐτόν, Άλλ' ἐπὶ τῷ μήν, ὧ Αὐτόλυκε; ὁ δ' εἶπεν, Ἐπὶ τῷ πατρί, καὶ ἄμα ἐνεκλίθη αὐτῷ.

Καὶ ὁ Καλλίας ἰδών, ẵΑρ' οἶσθα, ἔφη, ὧ Λύκων, ὅτι πλουσιώτατος εἶ ἀνθρώπων;

Μὰ Δί, ἔφη, τοῦτο μέντοι ἐγὼ οὐκ οἶδα.

'Αλλὰ λανθάνει σε ὅτι οὐκ ἂν δέξαιο τὰ βασιλέως χρήματα ἀντὶ τοῦ υίοῦ;

Έπ' αὐτοφώρω εἴλημμαι, έφη, πλουσιώτατος, ώς ἔοικεν, ἀνθρώπων ὤν.

14 Σὺ δέ, ἔφη ὁ Νικήρατος, ὧ Ἑρμόγενες, ἐπὶ τίνι μάλιστα ἀγάλλη;

Καὶ ὅς, Ἐπὶ φίλων, ἔφη, ἀρετῆ καὶ δυνάμει, καὶ ὅτι τοιοῦτοι ὄντες ἐμοῦ ἐπιμέλονται.

Ένταῦθα τοίνυν πάντες προσέβλεψαν αὐτῷ, καὶ πολλοὶ ἄμα ἤροντο εἰ καὶ σφίσι δηλώσει αὐτούς, ὁ δὲ εἶπεν ὅτι οὐ φθονήσει.

4. Ἐκ τούτου ἔλεξεν ὁ Σωκράτης, Οὐκοῦν λοιπὸν ầν εἴη ἡμῖν ἃ ἕκαστος ὑπέσχετο ἀποδεικνύναι ὡς πολλοῦ ἄξιά ἐστιν.

# SYMPOSIUM 3.12-4.1

"Won't you also tell us, Lycon," said Antisthenes, "what you take pride in?"

"Don't you all know," he answered, "that it's my son here?"

"And as for him," said one, "it's plain that he's proud of being a winner."

At this Autolycus blushed and said, "Zeus no, not me."

Everyone looked his way, delighted to hear him speak, and someone asked, "Well, Autolycus, what are you proud of, then?" and he answered, "My father," and leaned close to him.

When Callias saw this, "You do realize, Lycon," said he, "that you're the richest man in the world?"

"No, indeed," the other replied, "I certainly don't know that."

"Don't you realize that you wouldn't part with your son for the wealth of the Great King?"

"I'm caught red-handed!" was the answer, "I do seem to be the richest man in the world."

"What about you, Hermogenes?" said Niceratus. "What do you delight in most?"

"In the excellence and the power of my friends," he answered, "and in the fact that such men have regard for me."

Here all eyes turned toward him, and many speaking at once asked him if he would point them out; and he answered that he wouldn't mind at all.

4. At this point Socrates said, "Well, it's up to us now to prove that what each man promised is of real worth."

12

13

'Ακούοιτ' ἄν, ἔφη ὁ Καλλίας, ἐμοῦ πρῶτον. ἐγὼ γὰρ ἐν τῷ χρόνῳ ῷ ὑμῶν ἀκούω ἀπορούντων τί τὸ δίκαιον, ἐν τούτῳ δικαιοτέρους τοὺς ἀνθρώπους ποιῶ.

Καὶ ὁ Σωκράτης, Πῶς, ὧ λῷστε; ἔφη.

Διδούς νη Δί ἀργύριον.

2 Καὶ ὁ ἀντισθένης ἐπαναστὰς μάλα ἐλεγκτικῶς αὐτὸν ἐπήρετο· Οἱ δὲ ἄνθρωποι, ὧ Καλλία, πότερον ἐν ταῖς ψυχαῖς ἢ ἐν τῷ βαλλαντίῳ τὸ δίκαιόν σοι δοκοῦσιν ἔχειν;

Έν ταῖς ψυχαῖς, ἔφη.

Κἄπειτα σὺ εἰς τὸ βαλλάντιον διδοὺς ἀργύριον τὰς ψυχὰς δικαιοτέρας ποιεῖς;

Μάλιστα.

Πῶς;

Οτι διὰ τὸ εἰδέναι ὡς ἔστιν ὅτου πριάμενοι τὰ ἐπιτήδεια ἔξουσιν οὐκ ἐθέλουσι κακουργοῦντες κινδυνεύειν.

3 <sup>3</sup> Η καί σοι, ἔφη, ἀποδιδόασιν ὅ τι ἂν λάβωσι;
Μὰ τὸν Δί, ἔφη, οὐ μὲν δή.

Τί δέ, ἀντὶ τοῦ ἀργυρίου χάριτας;

Οὐ μὰ τὸν Δί, ἔφη, οὐδὲ τοῦτο, ἀλλ' ἔνιοι καὶ ἐχθιόνως ἔχουσιν ἢ πρὶν λαβεῖν.

Θαυμαστά γ', ἔφη ὁ ἀντισθένης ἄμα εἰσβλέπων ώς ἐλέγχων αὐτόν, εἰ πρὸς μὲν τοὺς ἄλλους δύνασαι δικαίους ποιεῖν αὐτούς, πρὸς δὲ σαυτὸν οὔ.

4 Καὶ τί τοῦτ', ἔφη ὁ Καλλίας, θαυμαστόν; οὐ καὶ τέκτονάς τε καὶ οἰκοδόμους πολλοὺς ὁρậς οῦ ἄλλοις μὲν πολλοῖς ποιοῦσιν οἰκίας, ἑαυτοῖς δὲ οὐ δύνανται

### SYMPOSIUM 4.1-4.4

"You may hear me first," said Callias. "While I listen to you as you wonder what righteousness is, I'm all the time actually making people more righteous."

"Excellent man. How so?" asked Socrates.

"By giving them money, by Zeus."

Then Antisthenes got up and started to interrogate him in a very prosecutorial fashion. "Where do you think men keep their righteousness, Callias, in their souls or in their wallets?"

"In their souls," he replied.

"So you make their souls more righteous by putting money into their wallets?"

"I surely do."

"How?"

"Because they know that they have the wherewithal to buy what they need, they've no wish to risk committing crimes."

"And do they repay you," he asked, "what they get?"

"Heavens no!" he replied.

"Well, do they give thanks instead of money?"

"No indeed, not that either," he said. "On the contrary, some of them dislike me even more than before they got the money."

"Remarkable," said Antisthenes, staring at him as though he had him cornered, "if you can make them righteous toward others but not toward yourself."

"What's so remarkable about that?" asked Callias. "Don't you see plenty of carpenters and architects too, who build houses for many people but can't do it for them-

ποιῆσαι, ἀλλ' ἐν μισθωταῖς οἰκοῦσι; καὶ ἀνάσχου μέντοι, ὧ σοφιστά, ἐλεγχόμενος.

Νη Δί', ἔφη ὁ Σωκράτης, ἀνεχέσθω μέντοι· ἐπεὶ καὶ οἱ μάντεις λέγονται δήπου ἄλλοις μὲν προαγορεύειν τὸ μέλλον, ἑαυτοῖς δὲ μὴ προορᾶν τὸ ἐπιόν.

Οὖτος μὲν δὴ ὁ λόγος ἐνταῦθα ἔληξεν.

Ἐκ τούτου δὲ ὁ Νικήρατος, ἀκούοιτ' ἄν, ἔφη, καὶ ἐμοῦ ἃ ἔσεσθε βελτίονες ἢν ἐμοὶ συνῆτε. ἴστε γὰρ δήπου ὅτι Ὁμηρος ὁ σοφώτατος πεποίηκε σχεδὸν περὶ πάντων τῶν ἀνθρωπίνων. ὅστις ἃν οὖν ὑμῶν βούληται ἢ οἰκονομικὸς ἢ δημηγορικὸς ἢ στρατηγικὸς γενέσθαι ἢ ὅμοιος ἀχιλλεῖ ἢ Αἴαντι ἢ Νέστορι ἢ Ὀδυσσεῖ, ἐμὲ θεραπευέτω. ἐγὼ γὰρ ταῦτα πάντα ἐπίσταμαι.

<sup>3</sup>Η καὶ βασιλεύειν, ἔφη ὁ ἀντισθένης, ἐπίστασαι, ὅτι οἶσθα ἐπαινέσαντα αὐτὸν τὸν ἀγαμέμνονα ὡς βασιλεύς τε εἴη ἀγαθὸς κρατερός τ' αἰχμητής;

Καὶ ναὶ μὰ Δι, ἔφη, ἔγωγε ὅτι ἁρματηλατοῦντα δεῖ ἐγγὺς μὲν τῆς στήλης κάμψαι,

αὐτὸν δὲ κλινθῆναι ἐυξέστου ἐπὶ δίφρου ਜκ' ἐπ' ἀριστερὰ τοῖιν, ἀτὰρ τὸν δεξιὸν ἵππον κένσαι ὁμοκλήσαντ' εἶξαί τέ οἱ ἡνία χερσί.

7 καὶ πρὸς τούτοις γε ἄλλο οἶδα, καὶ ὑμῖν αὐτίκα μάλ' ἔξεστι πειρᾶσθαι. εἶπε γάρ που 'Όμηρος, 'Επὶ δὲ κρόμυον ποτῷ ὄψον. ἐὰν οὖν ἐνέγκῃ τις κρόμμυον, αὐτίκα μάλα τοῦτό γε ὡφελημένοι ἔσεσθε· ἤδιον γὰρ πίεσθε.

5

## SYMPOSIUM 4.4-4.7

selves, so instead live in rented places? Come now, Professor Captious, see how it feels to be refuted!"

"By all means," said Socrates, "let him. For even the soothsayers, you know, are said to prophesy the future for others while being unable to foresee what's headed their way."

Here the discussion of that point ended.

Then Niceratus remarked: "You may now hear me explain how you will be improved by associating with me. You no doubt know that the most sage Homer has expressed practically everything pertaining to humanity. So any one of you who wishes to acquire the art of the estate manager, the political leader, or the general, or to become like Achilles or Ajax or Nestor or Odysseus, should attend to me, for I understand all of this."

"Ha!" said Antisthenes; "do you understand kingship too, knowing, as you do, that Homer praised Agamemnon<sup>17</sup> for being 'a good king and spearman strong'?"

"Yes indeed!" said he; "and I know that he also says that in driving a chariot one must run close to the goalpost at the turn 18

'and lean across a little to the left upon his polished chariot, goad the right-hand horse, urge him with shouts, and let him have the reins.'19

"And I know something else too, which you can test immediately. For Homer says somewhere, 'an onion too is relish for a drink." Now if some one fetches an onion, you will get that benefit immediately; for you will drink more pleasurably."

17 *Il.* 3.179. 18 Cf. *Il.* 23.323, 23.334. 19 *Il.* 23.335–337. 20 *Il.* 11.630.

Καὶ ὁ Χαρμίδης εἶπεν· <sup>3</sup>Ω ἄνδρες, ὁ Νικήρατος κρομμύων ὄζων ἐπιθυμεῖ οἴκαδε ἐλθεῖν, ἵν' ἡ γυνὴ αὐτοῦ πιστεύῃ μη<δὲ> διανοηθῆναι μηδένα ἂν φιλῆσαι αὐτόν.

Νὴ Δί', ἔφη ὁ Σωκράτης, ἀλλ' ἄλλην που δόξαν γελοίαν κίνδυνος ἡμιν προσλαβείν. ὅψον μὲν γὰρ δὴ ὄντως ἔοικεν είναι, ὡς κρόμμυόν γε οὐ μόνον σῖτον ἀλλὰ καὶ ποτὸν ἡδύνει. εἰ δὲ δὴ τοῦτο καὶ μετὰ δείπνον τρωξόμεθα, ὅπως μὴ φήσει τις ἡμᾶς πρὸς Καλλίαν ἐλθόντας ἡδυπαθείν.

Μηδαμῶς, ἔφη, ὧ Σώκρατες. εἰς μὲν γὰρ μάχην ὁρμωμένῳ καλῶς ἔχει κρόμμυον ὑποτρώγειν, ὥσπερ ἔνιοι τοὺς ἀλεκτρυόνας σκόροδα σιτίσαντες συμβάλλουσιν ἡμεῖς δὲ ἴσως βουλευόμεθα ὅπως φιλήσομέν τινα μᾶλλον ἢ μαχούμεθα.

Καὶ οὖτος μὲν δὴ ὁ λόγος οὕτω πως ἐπαύσατο.

Ο δὲ Κριτόβουλος, Οὐκοῦν αὖ ἐγὼ λέξω, ἔφη, ἐξ ὧν ἐπὶ τῷ κάλλει μέγα φρονῶ;

Λέγε, ἔφασαν.

Εἰ μὲν τοίνυν μὴ καλός εἰμι, ὡς οἴομαι, ὑμεῖς ἂν δικαίως ἀπάτης δίκην ὑπέχοιτε· οὐδενὸς γὰρ ὁρκίζοντος ἀεὶ ὀμνύοντες καλόν μέ φατε εἶναι. κάγὼ μέντοι πιστεύω. καλοὺς γὰρ καὶ ἀγαθοὺς ὑμᾶς ἄνδρας νομίζω. εἰ δ' εἰμί τε τῷ ὄντι καλὸς καὶ ὑμεῖς τὰ αὐτὰ πρὸς ἐμὲ πάσχετε οἶάπερ ἐγὼ πρὸς τὸν ἐμοὶ δοκοῦντα καλὸν εἶναι, ὅμνυμι πάντας θεοὺς μὴ ἑλέσθαι ἂν τὴν βασιλέως ἀρχὴν ἀντὶ τοῦ καλὸς εἶναι. νῦν γὰρ ἐγὼ Κλεινίαν ἥδιον μὲν θεῶμαι ἢ τἄλλα πάντα τὰ ἐν ἀν-

8

9

10

11

## SYMPOSIUM 4.8-4.12

"Gentlemen," said Charmides, "Niceratus wants to go home smelling of onions so his wife will believe that no one would even have thought about kissing him."

"Undoubtedly," said Socrates. "But we run the risk of looking foolish in another way. For while the onion really does seem to be a relish, since it adds to our enjoyment not only of food but also of drink, yet if we nibble it not only with our dinner but after it too, make sure no one says that on our visit to Callias we were merely indulging our appetites."

"Heaven forbid, Socrates!" he said. "When heading into battle it's fine to nibble an onion, just as some people feed their roosters garlic before pitting them together in the ring; but our plans perhaps call for kissing some one rather than fighting."

This was about the way that discussion ended.

Then Critobulus said, "Shall I take my turn now and tell you my reasons for taking pride in my handsomeness?"

"Do," they said.

"Well then, if I am not handsome, as I think I am, you could fairly be sued for misrepresentation; for though no one puts you under oath, you're always swearing that I'm handsome. And I believe you, for I consider you to be real gentlemen. But if I really am handsome and you feel about me what I feel about the one I consider handsome, I swear by all the gods that I wouldn't trade being handsome for the King's empire. For as it is, I would rather gaze at Cleinias<sup>21</sup> than at everything else the world considers

8

9

10

11

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>21</sup> Probably the young cousin of Alcibiades; cf. Mem. 1.3.8.

θρώποις καλά τυφλὸς δὲ τῶν ἄλλων ἁπάντων μᾶλλον αν δεξαίμην είναι η Κλεινίου ένος όντος άχθομαι δὲ καὶ νυκτὶ καὶ ὕπνω ὅτι ἐκεῖνον οὐχ ὁρῶ, ἡμέρα δὲ καὶ ἡλίω τὴν μεγίστην χάριν οἶδα ὅτι μοι Κλεινίαν ἀναφαίνουσιν. ἄξιόν γε μὴν ἡμῖν τοῖς καλοῖς καὶ 13 έπὶ τοῖσδε μέγα φρονεῖν, ὅτι τὸν μὲν ἰσχυρὸν πονοῦντα δεῖ κτᾶσθαι τάγαθὰ καὶ τὸν ἀνδρεῖον κινδυνεύοντα, τὸν δέ γε σοφὸν λέγοντα ὁ δὲ καλὸς καὶ ἡσυγίαν έχων πάντ' ἂν διαπράξαιτο, έγω γοῦν καίπερ 14 είδως ὅτι χρήματα ήδὺ κτήμα ήδιον μὲν ἂν τὰ ὄντα Κλεινία διδοίην ἢ ἔτερα παρ' ἄλλου λαμβάνοιμι, ήδιον δ' αν δουλεύοιμι η έλεύθερος είην, εί μου Κλεινίας ἄρχειν έθέλοι, καὶ γὰρ πονοίην ἂν ράον ἐκείνω η άναπαυοίμην, καὶ κινδυνεύοιμ' αν πρὸ ἐκείνου ήδιον η ἀκίνδυνος ζώην, ὥστε εἰ σύ, ὧ Καλλία, μέγα φρο-15 νείς ὅτι δικαιοτέρους δύνασαι ποιείν, ἐγὼ πρὸς πᾶσαν άρετὴν δικαιότερος σοῦ εἰμι ἄγειν ἀνθρώπους. διὰ γὰρ τὸ ἐμπνεῖν τι ἡμᾶς τοὺς καλοὺς τοῖς ἐρωτικοῖς έλευθεριωτέρους μεν αὐτοὺς ποιοῦμεν εἰς χρήματα, φιλοπονωτέρους δὲ καὶ φιλοκαλωτέρους ἐν τοῖς κινδύνοις, καὶ μὴν αἰδημονεστέρους τε καὶ ἐγκρατεστέρους, οί γε καὶ ὧν δέονται μάλιστα ταῦτ' αἰσχύνονται. μαί-16 νονται δέ καὶ οί μὴ τοὺς καλοὺς στρατηγοὺς αίρούμενοι. έγω γοῦν μετὰ Κλεινίου κᾶν διὰ πυρὸς ἰοίην οίδα δ' ὅτι καὶ ὑμεῖς μετ' ἐμοῦ. ὥστε μηκέτι ἀπόρει, ὧ Σώκρατες, εἴ τι τουμὸν κάλλος ἀνθρώπους ὡφελήσει. ἀλλ' οὐδὲ μέντοι ταύτη γε ἀτιμαστέον τὸ κάλλος 17

## SYMPOSIUM 4.12-4.17

handsome. I would rather be blind to everything else than to Cleinias alone. I'm annoyed by both night and sleep because then I can't see him; I feel the deepest gratitude to day and the sun because they reveal Cleinias to me. We handsome people have a right to be proud of this fact too: that whereas the strong man must get the good things he wants by toiling, and the brave man by running risks, and the sage man by speaking, the handsome man can have it all without doing anything. I do realize that money is good to have, but I'd be happier giving what I have to Cleinias than getting more from someone else; and I'd be happier being a slave than being a free man, if Cleinias were willing to be my master. For I should find it easier to work for him than to rest, and I'd be happier to risk my life for him than to live in safety. And so, Callias, if you're proud of your ability to make people more righteous, I have a better right than you to claim that I can influence men toward every sort of excellence. Because of the inspirational effect we handsome ones have on our inamorati, we make them more generous about money, more eager for toil and glory amid dangers, and yes, more modest and selfcontrolled too, since they feel ashamed about precisely what they most want. People who don't elect the handsome men as generals are crazy: I'd even go through fire with Cleinias, and I know that with me you would also. So puzzle no more, Socrates, over the question whether or not my handsomeness will in any way benefit humanity. What's more, handsomeness is not to be scorned because

8 Κλεινίου Diogenes Laërtius: ἐκείνου vel κείνου vel ἐκείνου καὶ codd.

13

14

15

16

ώς ταχὺ παρακμάζον, ἐπεὶ ὤσπερ γε παῖς γίγνεται καλός, οὕτω καὶ μειράκιον καὶ ἀνὴρ καὶ πρεσβύτης. τεκμήριον δέ· θαλλοφόρους γὰρ τῆ ᾿Αθηνᾳ τοὺς καλοὺς γέροντας ἐκλέγονται, ὡς συμπαρομαρτοῦντος πάση ἡλικίᾳ τοῦ κάλλους. εἰ δὲ ἡδὺ τὸ παρ᾽ ἐκόντων διαπράττεσθαι ὧν τις δέοιτο, εὖ οἶδ᾽ ὅτι καὶ νυνὶ θᾶττον ἂν ἐγὼ καὶ σιωπῶν πείσαιμι τὸν παῖδα τόνδε καὶ τὴν παῖδα φιλῆσαί με ἢ σύ, ὧ Σώκρατες, εἰ καὶ πάνυ πολλὰ καὶ σοφὰ λέγοις.

Τί τοῦτο; ἔφη ὁ Σωκράτης· ὡς γὰρ καὶ ἐμοῦ καλλίων ὢν ταῦτα κομπάζεις;

Νὴ Δι, ἔφη ὁ Κριτόβουλος, ἢ πάντων Σειληνῶν τῶν ἐν τοῖς σατυρικοῖς αἴσχιστος ἂν ἔιην.

[Ο δὲ Σωκράτης καὶ ἐτύγχανε προσεμφερὴς τούτοις  $\mathring{\omega}v$ .]9

Άγε νυν, ἔφη ὁ Σωκράτης, ὅπως μεμνήσει διακριθήναι περὶ τοῦ κάλλους, ἐπειδὰν οἱ προκείμενοι λόγοι περιέλθωσι. κρινάτω δ' ἡμᾶς μὴ ἀλλέξανδρος ὁ Πριάμου, ἀλλ' αὐτοὶ οὖτοι οὕσπερ σὰ οἴει ἐπιθυμεῖν σε φιλῆσαι.

Κλεινία δ', ἔφη, ὧ Σώκρατες, οὐκ ἃν ἐπιτρέψαις; Καὶ ὃς εἶπεν, Οὐ γὰρ παύση σὰ Κλεινίου μεμνημένος;

\*Ήν δὲ μὴ ὀνομάζω, ἦττόν τί με οἴει μεμνῆσθαι

<sup>9</sup> del. Orelli

18

19

20

2.1

it soon passes its prime; for just as a boy can be handsome, so can a youth, a grown man, and a senior. Here's proof: in selecting bearers of the olive shoots for Athena they choose handsome old men, thus intimating that handsomeness attends every stage of life. And if it's pleasurable to get people to do what you want willingly, I'm positive that here and now, without uttering a word, I could persuade this boy or the girl to give me a kiss sooner than you could, Socrates, even if you made many clever arguments." "What do you mean?" exclaimed Socrates. "You boast

"What do you mean?" exclaimed Socrates. "You boast as if you actually think you're handsomer than me!"

"Ábsolutely," said Critobulus; "otherwise I'd be the ugliest of all the Silens in the satyr plays."

[Now Socrates, as fortune would have it, really resembled these creatures.]<sup>22</sup>

"Very well, then," said Socrates; "see that you remember to enter a beauty contest with me when the present discussion has gone the rounds. And let our judges be not Alexander, Priam's son,<sup>23</sup> but these very persons you think are eager to kiss you."

"Wouldn't you entrust the judgment to Cleinias, Soc- 21 rates?"

"Can't you get your mind off Cleinias?" was the reply. "If I stop mentioning him, do you think he'll be on my

<sup>22</sup> Probably an interpolated comment, though doubtless true enough: Plato (*Smp.* 215a-b, e; 216c, d; 221d, e; cf. 222d) has Alcibiades compare Socrates to Silens and particularly to the satyr Marsyas, and tells us that Socrates shared with them (as in vase paintings and statues) a snub nose and bulging eyes (*Tht.* 143e).

<sup>23</sup> Usually called Paris, who judged the beauty contest between Hera, Athena, and Aphrodite.

18

19

αὐτοῦ; οὐκ οἶσθα ὅτι οὕτω σαφὲς ἔχω εἴδωλον αὐτοῦ ἐν τῇ ψυχῇ ὡς εἰ πλαστικὸς ἢ ζωγραφικὸς ἦν, οὐδὲν ἂν ἦττον ἐκ τοῦ εἰδώλου ἢ πρὸς αὐτὸν ὁρῶν ὅμοιον αὐτῷ ἀπειργασάμην;

22 Καὶ ὁ Σωκράτης ὑπέλαβε, Τί δῆτα οὕτως ὅμοιον εἴδωλον ἔχων πράγματά μοι παρέχεις ἄγεις τε αὐτὸν ὅπου ὅψει:

Ότι, ὧ Σώκρατες, ἡ μὲν αὐτοῦ ὄψις εὐφραίνειν δύναται, ἡ δὲ τοῦ εἰδώλου τέρψιν μὲν οὐ παρέχει, πόθον δὲ ἐμποιεῖ.

Καὶ ὁ Ἑρμογένης εἶπεν ᾿Αλλ᾽ ἐγώ, ὧ Σώκρατες, οὐδὲ πρὸς σοῦ ποιῶ τὸ περιιδεῖν Κριτόβουλον οὕτως ὑπὸ τοῦ ἔρωτος ἐκπλαγέντα.

Δοκεῖς γάρ, ἔφη ὁ Σωκράτης, ἐξ οὖ ἐμοὶ σύνεστιν οὕτω διατεθῆναι αὐτόν;

Άλλὰ πότε μήν;

Οὐχ ὁρậς ὅτι τούτῳ μὲν παρὰ τὰ ὧτα ἄρτι ἴουλος καθέρπει, Κλεινία δὲ πρὸς τὸ ὅπισθεν ἤδη ἀναβαίνει; οὖτος οὖν συμφοιτῶν εἰς ταὐτὰ διδασκαλεῖα ἐκείνῳ τότε ἰσχυρῶς προσεκαύθη. ἃ δὴ αἰσθόμενος ὁ πατὴρ παρέδωκέ μοι αὐτόν, εἴ τι δυναίμην ὡφελῆσαι. καὶ μέντοι πολὺ βέλτιον ἤδη ἔχει. πρόσθεν μὲν γὰρ ὥσπερ οἱ τὰς Γοργόνας θεώμενοι λιθίνως ἔβλεπε πρὸς αὐτὸν καὶ [λιθίνως]10 οὐδαμοῦ ἀπήει ἀπ' αὐτοῦ· νῦν δὲ δὴ εἶδον αὐτὸν καὶ σκαρδαμύξαντα. καίτοι νὴ τοὺς θεούς, ὧ ἄνδρες, δοκεῖ μοί γ', ἔφη, ὡς ἐν ἡμῦν αὐτοῖς εἰρῆσθαι, οὖτος καὶ πεφιληκέναι τὸν Κλεινίαν· οὖ ἔρωτος οὐδέν ἐστι δεινότερον ὑπέκκαυμα. καὶ γὰρ

### **SYMPOSIUM 4.21-4.25**

mind any the less? Don't you know that I have so clear an image of him in my soul that if had talent as a sculptor or painter I could produce as good a likeness of him from that image as if I were seeing him in person?"

"Well, if you have such a faithful image of him, why do you put me to all the bother of taking me where you can see him in person?"

"Because, Socrates, the sight of him in person has the power to delight me, whereas the sight of the image affords no pleasure but engenders longing."

Here Hermogenes commented, "But Socrates, I don't think it's at all like you to countenance such lovesickness in Critobulus."

"What?" " asked Socrates, "do you think he's been like this only since he began associating with me?"

"When else?"

"Don't you notice that peach fuzz is just beginning to creep down past his ears, while on Cleinias it's already coming up behind? So he began burning hot in the days when they started going to the same school. His father caught on and put him into my care, hoping I might do him some good. And sure enough he's already doing much better. Before then he was like people who look at the Gorgons, gazing at Cleinias like a stone and nowhere leaving his presence, but nowadays I've actually seen him blink. But to tell you the truth, gentlemen," he continued, "by heaven it does seem to me—to speak confidentially—as if he had also kissed Cleinias, and there's no faster way to fire lust: it's insatiable and holds out seductive hopes.

22

23

<sup>10</sup> del. Ernesti

26 ἄπληστον καὶ ἐλπίδας τινὰς γλυκείας παρέχει.<sup>11</sup> οὖ ἔνεκα ἀφεκτέον ἐγώ φημι εἶναι φιλημάτων ‹τῶν› ὡραίων τῷ σωφρονεῖν δυνησομένῳ.

Καὶ ὁ Χαρμίδης εἶπεν ἀλλὰ τί δή ποτε, ὧ Σώκρατες, ἡμᾶς μὲν οὕτω τοὺς φίλους μορμολύττη ἀπὸ τῶν καλῶν, αὐτὸν δὲ σέ, ἔφη, ἐγὼ εἶδον ναὶ μὰ τὸν ἀπόλλω, ὅτε παρὰ τῷ γραμματιστῆ ἐν τῷ αὐτῷ βιβλίῳ ἀμφότεροι ἐμαστεύετέ τι, τὴν κεφαλὴν πρὸς τῆ κεφαλῆ καὶ τὸν ὧμον γυμνὸν πρὸς γυμνῷ τῷ Κριτοβούλου ὤμῳ ἔχοντα;

Καὶ ὁ Σωκράτης, Φεῦ, ἔφη, ταῦτ' ἄρα ἐγὰ ὥσπερ ὑπὸ θηρίου τινὸς δεδηγμένος τόν τε ὧμον πλεῖον ἢ πέντε ἡμέρας ὥδαξον καὶ ἐν τῆ καρδία ὤσπερ κνῆσμάι² τι ἐδόκουν ἔχειν. ἀλλὰ νῦν τοί σοι, ἔφη, ὧ Κριτόβουλε, ἐναντίον τοσούτων μαρτύρων προαγορεύω μὴ ἄπτεσθαί μου πρὶν ἂν τὸ γένειον τῆ κεφαλῆ ὁμοίως κομήσης.

Καὶ οὖτοι μὲν δὴ οὕτως ἀναμὶξ ἔσκωψάν τε καὶ ἐσπούδασαν.

Ο δὲ Καλλίας, Σὸν μέρος, ἔφη, λέγειν, ὧ Χαρμίδη, δι' ὅ τι ἐπὶ πενία μέγα φρονείς.

Οὐκοῦν τόδε μέν, ἔφη, ὁμολογεῖται, κρεῖττον εἶναι θαρρεῖν ἢ φοβεῖσθαι καὶ ἐλεύθερον εἶναι μᾶλλον ἢ δουλεύειν καὶ θεραπεύεσθαι μᾶλλον ἢ θεραπεύειν καὶ πιστεύεσθαι ὑπὸ τῆς πατρίδος μᾶλλον ἢ ἀπιστεῖ-

11 Codd. add here ἴσως δὲ καὶ διὰ τὸ μόνον πάντων ἔργων τὸ τοῖς στόμασι (Wyttenbach: σώμασι codd.) συμψαύειν ὁμώ

27

28

That's why I maintain that anyone who intends to be capable of self-control must refrain from kissing the prime specimens."<sup>24</sup>

"But why in the world, Socrates," Charmides now asked, "are you trying to scare your friends away from the beauties, when you yourself—I've seen you, by Apollo," he continued, "when the two of you were hunting down something in the same book at the school, sitting head to head, with your naked shoulder pressing against Critobulus' naked shoulder?"

"Dear me!" exclaimed Socrates. "So that's what affected me like the bite of some wild animal! And for over five days my shoulder smarted and I felt as if I had something like a sting in my heart. But now, Critobulus," he said, "in the presence of all these witnesses I warn you not to lay a finger on me until you get as much hair on your chin as you have on your head."

Such was their mingled jesting and seriousness.

But Callias now remarked, "It's your turn, Charmides, to tell us why poverty makes you feel proud."

"Very well," he said. "Every one agrees about this: confidence is preferable to fear, freedom to slavery, getting attention to giving it, the trust of one's country to its dis-

<sup>24</sup> As Socrates had advised Xenophon himself, Mem. 1.3.8–13.

2627

νυμον εἶναι τῷ ταῖς ψυχαῖς φιλεῖσθαι ἐντιμότερόν ἐστιν (del. Dindorf), "Possibly the fact also that of all our behavior, touching one another with the lips is the only one whose name also denotes heartfelt affection gives it greater esteem"  $(\phi\iota\lambda\epsilon \hat{\iota}\nu)$  meaning either "to hold in affection" or "to kiss").

<sup>12</sup> κνίσμα Schneider

σθαι. έγω τοίνυν έν τηδε τη πόλει ὅτε μὲν πλούσιος 30 ην πρώτον μεν εφοβούμην μή τίς μου την οἰκίαν διορύξας καὶ τὰ χρήματα λάβοι καὶ αὐτόν τί με κακὸν έργάσαιτο έπειτα δε καὶ τοὺς συκοφάντας έθεράπευον, είδως ὅτι παθεῖν μᾶλλον κακῶς ἱκανὸς εἴην ἣ ποιήσαι ἐκείνους, καὶ γὰρ δὴ καὶ προσετάττετο μὲν ἀεί τί μοι δαπανᾶν ὑπὸ τῆς πόλεως, ἀποδημῆσαι δὲ οὐδαμοῦ ἐξῆν. νῦν δ' ἐπειδὴ τῶν ὑπερορίων στέρομαι 31 καὶ τὰ ἔγγεια οὐ καρποῦμαι καὶ τὰ ἐκ τῆς οἰκίας πέπραται, ήδέως μὲν καθεύδω ἐκτεταμένος, πιστὸς δὲ τῆ πόλει γεγένημαι, οὐκέτι δὲ ἀπειλοῦμαι, ἀλλ' ἤδη άπειλω άλλοις, ως έλευθέρω τε έξεστί μοι καὶ άποδημεῖν καὶ ἐπιδημεῖν· ὑπανίστανται δέ μοι ἤδη καὶ θάκων καὶ όδων ἐξίστανται οἱ πλούσιοι, καὶ εἰμὶ νῦν 32 μέν τυράννω ἐοικώς, τότε δὲ σαφῶς δοῦλος ἦν καὶ τότε μὲν ἐγὼ φόρον ἀπέφερον τῶ δήμω, νῦν δὲ ἡ πόλις τέλος φέρουσα τρέφει με, άλλὰ καὶ Σωκράτει, ότε μεν πλούσιος ήν, έλοιδόρουν με ότι συνήν, νῦν δ' έπεὶ πένης γεγένημαι, οὐκέτι οὐδεν μέλει οὐδενί. καὶ μὴν ὅτε μέν γε πολλὰ εἶχον, ἀεί τι ἀπέβαλλον ἢ ὑπὸ της πόλεως η ύπο της τύχης νῦν δὲ ἀποβάλλω μὲν οὐδέν, οὐδὲ γὰρ ἔχω, ἀεὶ δέ τι λήψεσθαι ἐλπίζω.

Οὐκοῦν, ἔφη ὁ Καλλίας, καὶ εὕχη μηδέποτε πλουτεῖν, καὶ ἐάν τι ὄναρ ἀγαθὸν ἴδης, τοῖς ἀποτροπαίοις θύεις:

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>25</sup> At odds with the dramatic date of 422, since Charmides was convicted in 415 in connection with the mutilation of herms.

trust. Now, as for my situation in our city, when I was rich, 30 first of all I dreaded some one tunneling into my house and not only taking my money but also doing me harm; and second, I paid court to the blackmailers, quite aware that I was more liable to suffer injury from them than inflict it. Then too, I was forever being ordered by the government to undertake some expenditure or other, and I could never leave town. Whereas now, since I'm stripped 31 of my property over the border, get no income from my holdings in Attica, and my household goods have been sold.<sup>25</sup> I stretch out and sleep well, I've gained the trust of the city, I get no more threats—I do the threatening now -and I have the free man's choice of leaving town or staying home. People now actually rise from their seats in deference to me, and rich men get out of my way in the street. Now I am like a despot; then I was clearly a slave. 32 Then I paid tribute to the Sovereign People; now I live on the tribute<sup>26</sup> that the city pays to me.<sup>27</sup> What's more, when I was rich, people used to vilify me for consorting with Socrates, but now that I'm poor no one cares about that at all any more. And when my property was large, I was continually losing some of it either to the city or to bad luck, but now I lose nothing because I have nothing, but I'm always expecting to get something."

"So do you also pray," asked Callias, "never to be rich, and if you have a good dream do you sacrifice to the averters of disaster?"

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>26</sup> Pay for jury service.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>27</sup> The classic portrait of the democratic juryman is Philocleon in Aristophanes' *Wasps*, produced in 422.

Μὰ Δία τοῦτο μέντοι, ἔφη, ἐγὼ οὐ ποιῶ, ἀλλὰ μάλα φιλοκινδύνως ὑπομένω, ἤν ποθέν τι ἐλπίζω λήψεσθαι.

'Αλλ' ἄγε δή, ἔφη ὁ Σωκράτης, σὰ αὖ λέγε ἡμῖν, ὧ 'Αντίσθενες, πῶς οὕτω βραχέα ἔχων μέγα φρονεῖς ἐπὶ πλούτῳ.

Ότι νομίζω, ὦ ἄνδρες, τοὺς ἀνθρώπους οὐκ ἐν τῷ οἴκω τὸν πλοῦτον καὶ τὴν πενίαν ἔχειν ἀλλ' ἐν ταῖς ψυχαίς, όρω γάρ πολλούς μεν ίδιώτας, οἱ πάνυ πολλά έγοντες γρήματα ούτω πένεσθαι ήγοῦνται ώστε πάντα μεν πόνον, πάντα δε κίνδυνον ύποδύονται εφ' ῷ πλείονα κτήσονται, οἶδα δὲ καὶ ἀδελφούς, οἳ τὰ ἴσα λαχόντες ὁ μὲν αὐτῶν τάρκοῦντα ἔχει καὶ περιττεύοντα της δαπάνης, ὁ δὲ τοῦ παντὸς ἐνδεῖται αἰσθάνομαι δὲ καὶ τυράννους τινάς, οι ούτω πεινώσι χρημάτων ὥστε ποιοῦσι πολὺ δεινότερα τῶν ἀπορωτάτων. δι' ἔνδειαν γὰρ δήπου οἱ μὲν κλέπτουσιν, οἱ δὲ τοιχωρυχοῦσιν, οἱ δὲ ἀνδραποδίζονται τύραννοι δ' εἰσί τινες οι όλους μεν οίκους άναιρούσιν, άθρόους δ' άποκτείνουσι, πολλάκις δὲ καὶ ὅλας πόλεις χρημάτων ένεκα έξανδραποδίζονται, τούτους μέν οὖν έγωγε καὶ πάνυ οἰκτίρω τῆς ἄγαν χαλεπῆς νόσου, ὅμοια γάρ μοι δοκοῦσι πάσχειν ὥσπερ εἴ τις πολλὰ ἔχων καὶ πολλὰ ἐσθίων μηδέποτε ἐμπίπλαιτο. ἐγὼ δὲ οὕτω μὲν πολλὰ ἔχω ὡς μόλις αὐτὰ καὶ ἐγὼ αὐτὸς εύρίσκω. όμως δὲ περίεστί μοι καὶ ἐσθίοντι ἄχρι τοῦ μὴ πεινῆν άφικέσθαι καὶ πίνοντι μέχρι τοῦ μὴ διψην καὶ άμφιέννυσθαι ώστε έξω μεν μηδεν μαλλον Καλλίου τούτου τοῦ πλουσιωτάτου ριγών έπειδάν γε μην έν

34

35

36

37

## SYMPOSIUM 4.33-4.38

"Not at all" he replied; "I don't go as far as that; I accept the outcome like a daredevil if I'm hoping to get something from somewhere."

"Come now, Antisthenes," said Socrates, "take your turn and tell us how it is that with such slender means you base your pride on wealth."

"Because, gentlemen, I think that people's wealth and poverty are to be found not in their estates but in their hearts. For I see many private citizens who have plenty of money but consider themselves so poor that they undertake any toil and any risk that might make them more money; and I know of brothers with equal shares in their inheritance where one of them has enough and more than enough to meet expenses, while the other is always short of everything. I know of certain despots, too, who have so great an appetite for money that they commit much more dreadful crimes than the most destitute: for because of want some steal, others break in, others follow the slave trade, but there are some despots who destroy whole families, carry out mass killings, and often enslave even whole cities for the sake of money. I greatly pity such people their malignant affliction, for I think they have the same problem as the person who has a lot and eats a lot but never feels full. As for me, I've got so much that I can hardly find it all myself, yet I have enough so that I can eat until I reach a point where I no longer feel hungry and drink until I don't feel thirsty and put on enough clothing that I'm no colder outside than my super-rich friend Callias here, and when I get into the house my walls are like cozy 34

35

τη οἰκία γένωμαι, πάνυ μεν άλεεινοί χιτώνες οἱ τοῖχοί μοι δοκούσιν είναι, πάνυ δε παχείαι έφεστρίδες οί όροφοι, στρωμνήν γε μην ούτως άρκοῦσαν έχω ώστ' έργον μέ γ' έστὶ καὶ ἀνεγεῖραι. ἢν δέ ποτε καὶ ἀφροδισιάσαι τὸ σῶμά μου δεηθη, οὕτω μοι τὸ παρὸν ἀρκεί ώστε αἷς ἂν προσέλθω ὑπερασπάζονταί με διὰ τὸ μηδένα ἄλλον αὐταῖς ἐθέλειν προσιέναι. καὶ πάντα 39 τοίνυν ταθτα οὕτως ήδέα μοι δοκεῖ εἶναι ώς μᾶλλον μεν ήδεσθαι ποιών έκαστα αὐτών οὐκ ἂν εὐξαίμην. ηττον δέ· οὕτω μοι δοκεῖ ἔνια αὐτῶν ηδίω εἶναι τοῦ συμφέροντος, πλείστου δ' ἄξιον κτήμα ἐν τῶ ἐμῶ 40 πλούτω λογίζομαι είναι έκεινο, ὅτι εἴ μού τις καὶ τὰ νῦν ὄντα παρέλοιτο, οὐδὲν οὕτως ὁρῶ φαῦλον ἔργον όποιον ούκ άρκουσαν αν τροφην έμοι παρέχοι. και 41 γαρ όταν ήδυπαθήσαι βουληθώ, οὐκ ἐκ τῆς ἀγορας τὰ τίμια ώνοῦμαι, πολυτελή γὰρ γίγνεται, άλλ' ἐκ τῆς ψυχής ταμιεύομαι, καὶ πολύ πλείον διαφέρει πρὸς ήδονήν, όταν αναμείνας τὸ δεηθήναι προσφέρωμαι ή όταν τινὶ τῶν τιμίων χρῶμαι, ὥσπερ καὶ νῦν τῷδε τῷ Θασίω οἴνω ἐντυχὼν οὐ διψῶν πίνω αὐτόν. ἀλλὰ μὴν 42 καὶ πολύ δικαιοτέρους γε είκὸς εἶναι τοὺς εὐτέλειαν μάλλον ἢ πολυχρηματίαν σκοποῦντας, οἶς γὰρ μάλιστα τὰ παρόντα ἀρκεῖ ἥκιστα τῶν ἀλλοτρίων ὀρέγονται. ἄξιον δ' ἐννοῆσαι ώς καὶ ἐλευθερίους ὁ τοιοῦτος 43 πλούτος παρέχεται. Σωκράτης τε γάρ ούτος, παρ' ού έγὼ τοῦτον ἐκτησάμην, οὕτ' ἀριθμῷ οὕτε σταθμῷ έπήρκει μοι, άλλ' δπόσον έδυνάμην φέρεσθαι, τοσοῦτόν μοι παρεδίδου έγω τε νῦν οὐδενὶ φθονω, ἀλλὰ

# **SYMPOSIUM 4.38-4.43**

shirts and the roof like a thick robe, and the blankets I own are so satisfactory that it's real work to get me up. If I'm feeling a physical urge for lovemaking, what I've got is so adequate that the women I approach are more than glad to welcome me because no one else wants to approach them. In a word, all this seems to me so pleasurable that I wouldn't pray for greater pleasure in doing any of it but rather for less—so much more pleasurable do I regard some of it than is appropriate. But the most valuable asset among my riches I reckon is this, that even if someone robbed me of what I now possess, I see no occupation so humble that it wouldn't provide me an adequate living. For whenever I feel like pampering myself, I don't buy fancy things at the market—they're expensive—but draw from the pantry of my soul. It makes a big difference to my enjoyment whether I partake after waiting until I feel the need or I consume something fancy, like this Thasian wine that I happen to be drinking without being thirsty. In fact the people who are likelier to be honest are those who set their sights on frugality rather than on moneymaking; those who are most contented with what they have are least likely to covet what belongs to others. And it's worth noting that wealth of this kind makes people act free, too. For example Socrates here, from whom I acquired this wealth, never supplied me by number or weight but kept on handing me however much I could manage to carry; on my side, I now begrudge no one but display my abundance

39

40

41

42

πᾶσι τοῖς φίλοις καὶ ἐπιδεικνύω τὴν ἀφθονίαν καὶ μεταδίδωμι τῷ βουλομένῳ τοῦ ἐν τῇ ἐμῇ ψυχῇ πλού44 του. καὶ μὴν καὶ τὸ άβρότατόν γε κτῆμα τὴν σχολὴν ἀεὶ ὁρᾶτέ μοι παροῦσαν, ὥστε καὶ θεᾶσθαι τὰ ἀξιοθέατα καὶ ἀκούειν τὰ ἀξιάκουστα καὶ ὁ πλείστου ἐγὼ τιμῶμαι, Σωκράτει σχολάζων συνδιημερεύειν. καὶ οὖτος δὲ οὐ τοὺς πλεῖστον ἀριθμοῦντας χρυσίον θαυμάζει, ἀλλ' οἱ ἂν αὐτῷ ἀρέσκωσι τούτοις συνὼν διατελεῖ.

Οὖτος μὲν οὖν οὔτως εἶπεν. ὁ δὲ Καλλίας, Νὴ τὴν Ἡραν, ἔφη, τά τε ἄλλα ζηλῶ σε τοῦ πλούτου καὶ ὅτι οὔτε ἡ πόλις σοι ἐπιτάττουσα ὡς δούλῳ χρῆται οὔτε οἱ ἄνθρωποι, ἢν μὴ δανείσης, ὀργίζονται.

'Αλλὰ μὰ Δί', ἔφη ὁ Νικήρατος, μὴ ζήλου ἐγὼ γὰρ ἤξω παρ' αὐτοῦ δανεισόμενος τὸ μηδενὸς προσδεῖσθαι οὕτω δὲ πεπαιδευμένος ὑπὸ 'Ομήρου ἀριθμεῖν

ἔπτ' ἀπύρους τρίποδας, δέκα δὲ χρυσοῖο τάλαντα, αἴθωνας δὲ λέβητας ἐείκοσι, δώδεκα δ' ἵππους,

σταθμῷ καὶ ἀριθμῷ, ὡς πλείστου πλούτου ἐπιθυμῶν οὐ παύομαι· ἐξ ὧν ἴσως καὶ φιλοχρηματώτερός τισι δοκῶ εἶναι.

Ένθα δη ἀνεγέλασαν ἄπαντες, νομίζοντες τὰ ὅντα εἰρηκέναι αὐτόν.

Έκ τούτου εἶπέ τις: Σὸν ἔργον, ὧ Ἑρμόγενες, λέγειν τε τοὺς φίλους οἵτινές εἰσι καὶ ἐπιδεικνύναι ὡς μέγα τε δύνανται καὶ σοῦ ἐπιμέλονται, ἵνα δοκῆς δικαίως ἐπ' αὐτοῖς μέγα φρονεῖν.

46

# SYMPOSIUM 4.43-4.46

to all my friends and share the wealth of my soul with whomever wants it. But you're always beholding my most exquisite possession: leisure time. I can see what's worth seeing, hear what's worth hearing, and—what I prize highest—pass the whole day, untroubled by business, with Socrates. Like me, he's not impressed by those who count the most gold but spends his time with those congenial to him."

That was the line taken by Antisthenes. "So help me Hera," commented Callias, "among my reasons for congratulating you on your wealth is that the city doesn't order you around and treat you like a slave, another is that people don't get angry if you don't make them a loan."

"Don't be envying him," said Niceratus; "because I'm about to get him to make me a loan—of his contentment with his lot, schooled as I am by Homer to count

'Seven pots unfired, ten talents' weight of gold, A score of gleaming cauldrons, chargers twelve,'28

weighing and calculating until I'm never done with yearning for as much as possible; maybe that's why people regard me as rather fond of money."

Everyone had a good laugh at this, thinking that he had stated the facts.

"Hermogenes, it's up to you," some one now remarked, "to tell us who your friends are and to demonstrate their great power and their solicitude for you, so that your pride in them may appear justified."

28 Il. 9, 122 f., 264 f.

44

Οὐκοῦν ὡς μὲν καὶ Ελληνες καὶ βάρβαροι τοὺς 47 θεοὺς ἡγοῦνται πάντα εἰδέναι τά τε ὄντα καὶ τὰ μέλλοντα εὔδηλον, πᾶσαι γοῦν αἱ πόλεις καὶ πάντα τὰ έθνη διὰ μαντικής ἐπερωτῶσι τοὺς θεοὺς τί τε χρή καὶ τί οὐ χρὴ ποιεῖν. καὶ μὴν ὅτι νομίζομέν γε δύνασθαι αὐτοὺς καὶ εὧ καὶ κακῶς ποιεῖν καὶ τοῦτο σαφές. πάντες γοῦν αἰτοῦνται τοὺς θεοὺς τὰ μὲν φαῦλα ἀποτρέπειν, τάγαθὰ δὲ διδόναι. οὖτοι τοίνυν οἱ πάντα μὲν 48 είδότες πάντα δὲ δυνάμενοι θεοὶ οὕτω μοι φίλοι εἰσὶν ώστε διὰ τὸ ἐπιμελεῖσθαί μου οὔποτε λήθω αὐτοὺς οὔτε νυκτὸς οὔθ' ἡμέρας οὔθ' ὅποι ἂν ὁρμῶμαι οὔθ' ὅ τι ἂν μέλλω πράττειν. διὰ δὲ τὸ προειδέναι καὶ ὅ τι έξ ξκάστου ἀποβήσεται σημαίνουσί μοι πέμποντες άγγέλους φήμας καὶ ἐνύπνια καὶ οἰωνοὺς ἅ τε δεῖ καὶ ἃ οὐ χρη ποιείν, οἷς έγὼ ὅταν μὲν πείθωμαι, οὐδέποτέ μοι μεταμέλει ήδη δέ ποτε καὶ ἀπιστήσας ἐκολά- $\sigma\theta\eta\nu$ .

Καὶ ὁ Σωκράτης εἶπεν ᾿Αλλὰ τούτων μὲν οὐδὲν ἄπιστον. ἐκεῖνο μέντοι ἔγωγε ἡδέως ἂν πυθοίμην, πῶς αὐτοὺς θεραπεύων οὕτω φίλους ἔχεις.

Ναὶ μὰ τὸν Δί, ἔφη ὁ Ἑρμογένης, καὶ μάλα εὐτελῶς. ἐπαινῶ τε γὰρ αὐτοὺς οὐδὲν δαπανῶν, ὧν τε διδόασιν ἀεὶ αὖ παρέχομαι, εὐφημῶ τε ὅσα ἂν δύνωμαι καὶ ἐφ' οἶς ἂν αὐτοὺς μάρτυρας ποιήσωμαι ἑκὼν οὐδὲν ψεύδομαι.

Νὴ  $\Delta \hat{\iota}$ , ἔφη ὁ Σωκράτης, εἰ ἄρα τοιοῦτος ὢν φίλους αὐτοὺς ἔχεις, καὶ οἱ  $\theta$ εοί, ὡς ἔοικε, καλοκάγα $\theta$ ία ήδονται.

"Very well; in the first place, both Greeks and barbar-47 ians quite obviously believe that the gods know everything both present and to come; at any rate, all cities and all races ask the gods, through the diviner's art, for advice on what to do and what to avoid. Second, it is also clear that we consider them able to do us good or ill; in any event, everyone prays the gods to avert evil and grant blessings. Well, these gods, omniscient and omnipotent, feel so 48 friendly toward me that their watchfulness never lets me out of their sight night or day, wherever my destination or whatever my business. And knowing also the outcome of any act, they send me as messengers, omens of sounds, dreams, and birds, to indicate what I ought to do and what not. And when I pay heed I never regret it, whereas the times I've disregarded them I've been punished."

"None of these statements," said Socrates, "is incredible. But what I'd very much like to know is how you cul-

tivate them to keep them so friendly."

"Very economically, by Zeus!" responded Hermogenes. "I sound their praises,—which costs nothing; I always return to them part of what they give me; I avoid irreverent speech as far as I can; and I never knowingly lie in matters where I have invoked them as witnesses."

"By Zeus," said Socrates, "if it's by conduct like this that you keep their friendship, then the gods also, it seems, take delight in gentlemanliness!"

617

Οὖτος μὲν δὴ ὁ λόγος οὕτως ἐσπουδαιολογήθη. Ἐπειδὴ δὲ εἰς τὸν Φίλιππον ἦκον, ἠρώτων αὐτὸν τί ὁρῶν ἐν τῆ γελωτοποιία μέγα ἐπ' αὐτῆ φρονοίη.

Οὐ γὰρ ἄξιον, ἔφη, ὁπότε γε πάντες εἰδότες ὅτι γελωτοποιός εἰμι, ὅταν μέν τι ἀγαθὸν ἔχωσι, παρακαλοῦσί με ἐπὶ ταῦτα προθύμως, ὅταν δέ τι κακὸν λάβωσι, φεύγουσιν ἀμεταστρεπτί, φοβούμενοι μὴ καὶ ἄκοντες γελάσωσι:

51 Καὶ ὁ Νικήρατος εἶπε· Νὴ Δία, σὺ τοίνυν δικαίως μέγα φρονεῖς. ἐμοὶ γὰρ αὖ τῶν φίλων οἱ μὲν εὖ πράττοντες ἐκποδὼν ἀπέρχονται, οῦ δ' ἃν κακόν τι λάβωσι, γενεαλογοῦσι τὴν συγγένειαν καὶ οὐδέποτέ μου ἀπολείπονται.

52 Εἶεν· σὺ δὲ δή, ἔφη ὁ Χαρμίδης, ὧ Συρακόσιε, ἐπὶ τῷ μέγα φρονεῖς; ἢ δῆλον ὅτι ἐπὶ τῷ παιδί;

Μὰ τὸν Δι', ἔφη, οὐ μὲν δή ἀλλὰ καὶ δέδοικα περὶ αὐτοῦ ἰσχυρῶς. αἰσθάνομαι γάρ τινας ἐπιβουλεύοντας διαφθείραι αὐτόν.

Καὶ ὁ Σωκράτης ἀκούσας, Ἡράκλεις, ἔφη, τί τοσοῦτον νομίζοντες ἠδικῆσθαι ὑπὸ τοῦ σοῦ παιδὸς ὥστε ἀποκτεῖναι αὐτὸν βούλεσθαι;

'Αλλ' οὔτοι, ἔφη, ἀποκτεῖναι βούλονται, ἀλλὰ πεῖσαι αὐτὸν συγκαθεύδειν αὐτοῖς.

Σὺ δ', ὡς ἔοικας, εἰ τοῦτο γένοιτο, νομίζεις ἂν διαφθαρῆναι αὐτόν;

Ναὶ μὰ Δί', ἔφη, παντάπασί γε.

54 Οὐδ' αὐτὸς ἄρ', ἔφη, συγκαθεύδεις αὐτῷ;

 $N\dot{\eta}$   $\Delta \hat{\iota}$  ὅλας  $\gamma \epsilon$  καὶ πάσας τὰς νύκτας.

50

## SYMPOSIUM 4.50-4.54

Such was the serious turn given to the discussion of this topic.

When they got around to Philip, they asked him what 50 he saw in the comedian's profession to feel proud about.

"Why shouldn't I be proud," he said, "when everyone knows that I get laughs, so whenever they have something good they give me a hearty invitation to join them, and whenever they're in some trouble they run from me with never a backward glance, afraid they may be forced to laugh in spite of themselves?"

"Your pride is abundantly justified," said Niceratus. "My case is the opposite: those friends who enjoy success keep out of my way, but those that run into some mishap reckon up their kinship to me on the family tree, and I can't get rid of them."

"No doubt," said Charmides, and then, "What is it you're proud of, Syracusan? The boy, I suppose?"

"Quite the contrary," was the reply; "though I do worry about him very much, because I'm aware that there are people plotting his ruin."

On hearing this Socrates exclaimed, "Good Heavens! 53 What wrong do they imagine your lad has done them to want to kill him?"

SYR. "Oh no, they don't want to kill him, they want to persuade him to sleep with them."

Soc. "So your belief, I suppose, is that if this happened he would be ruined?"

SYR. "Yes, utterly!"

Soc. "Then you don't sleep with him either?"

SYR. "I certainly do, all night and every night."

51

52

Νὴ τὴν Ἡραν, ἔφη ὁ Σωκράτης, εὐτύχημά γέ σου μέγα τὸ τὸν χρῶτα τοιοῦτον φῦναι ἔχοντα ὥστε μόνον μὴ διαφθείρειν τοὺς συγκαθεύδοντας. ὥστε σοί γε εἰ μὴ ἐπ' ἄλλῳ ἀλλ' ἐπὶ τῷ χρωτὶ ἄξιον μέγα φρονεῖν.

'Αλλὰ μὰ Δί', ἔφη, οὐκ ἐπὶ τούτῳ μέγα φρονῶ. 'Αλλ' ἐπὶ τῷ μήν;

Έπὶ νὴ Δία τοῖς ἄφροσιν. οὖτοι γὰρ τὰ ἐμὰ νευρόσπαστα θεώμενοι τρέφουσί με.

Ταῦτα γάρ, ἔφη ὁ Φίλιππος, καὶ πρώην ἐγώ σου ἤκουον εὐχομένου πρὸς τοὺς θεοὺς ὅπου ἂν ἦς διδόναι καρποῦ μὲν ἀφθονίαν, φρενῶν δὲ ἀφορίαν.

Εἶεν, ἔφη ὁ Καλλίας· σὰ δὲ δή, ὧ Σώκρατες, τί ἔχεις εἰπεῖν ὡς ἄξιόν σοί ἐστι μέγα φρονεῖν ἐφ' ἡ εἶπας οὕτως ἀδόξω οὔση τέχνη;

Καὶ δς εἶπεν· 'Ομολογησώμεθα πρῶτον ποῖά ἐστιν ἔργα τοῦ μαστροποῦ· καὶ ὅσα ἂν ἐρωτῶ μὴ ὀκνεῖτε ἀποκρίνεσθαι, ἵνα εἰδῶμεν ὅσα ἂν συνομολογῶμεν. καὶ ὑμῖν οὕτω δοκεῖ; ἔφη.

Πάνυ μὲν οὖν, ἔφασαν. ὡς δ᾽ ἄπαξ εἶπον Πάνυ μὲν οὖν, τοῦτο πάντες ἐκ τοῦ λοιποῦ ἀπεκρίναντο.

Οὐκοῦν ἀγαθοῦ μέν, ἔφη, ὑμῖν δοκεῖ μαστροποῦ ἔργον εἶναι ἣν ἂν ἢ ὃν ἂν μαστροπεύη ἀρέσκοντα τοῦτον ἀποδεικνύναι οἷς ἂν συνῆ;

Πάνυ μεν οὖν, ἔφασαν.

Οὐκοῦν εν μέν τί ἐστιν εἰς τὸ ἀρέσκειν ἐκ τοῦ πρέπουσαν ἔχειν σχέσιν καὶ τριχῶν καὶ ἐσθῆτος;

Πάνυ μὲν οὖν, ἔφασαν.

55

56

## SYMPOSIUM 4.54-4.57

Soc. "By Hera, you're very lucky to be formed of such flesh that you're unique in not ruining those who sleep with you. And so you have a right to be proud of your flesh if of nothing else."

SYR. "And yet that's not my great pride."

Soc. "What then?"

SYR. "Fools, for sure: they make me my living by coming to watch my marionettes."

"Aha!" said Philip; "that explains the prayer I heard you making the other day, that wherever you were the gods would grant you an abundant harvest of grain but a dearth of brains!"

"Good!" said Callias. "And now, Socrates, what can you say to justify your pride in that disreputable profession that you mentioned?"

"Let us first come to an agreement," he said, "on the functions of the procurer. Don't hesitate to answer all the questions I ask you, so that we may know our points of agreement. Is that acceptable?" he asked.

"Certainly," was their reply; and when they had once started with "certainly," that was the answer they all made to each of his questions thereafter.

Soc. "Well, then, you consider it the function of a good procurer to render the man or the woman whom he is serving attractive to his or her associates?"

ALL. "Certainly."

Soc. "Now, one thing that contributes to rendering a person attractive is a comely arrangement of hair and clothing, isn't it?"

ALL. "Certainly."

621

55

58 Οὐκοῦν καὶ τόδε ἐπιστάμεθα ὅτι ἔστιν ἀνθρώπῳ τοῖς αὐτοῖς ὅμμασι καὶ φιλικῶς καὶ ἐχθρῶς πρός τινας βλέπειν;

Πάνυ μεν οὖν.

Τί δέ; τῆ αὐτῆ φωνῆ ἔστι καὶ αἰδημόνως καὶ θρασώς φθέγγεσθαι;

Πάνν μὲν οὖν.

Τί δέ; λόγοι οὐκ εἰσὶ μέν τινες ἀπεχθανόμενοι, εἰσὶ δέ τινες οἱ πρὸς φιλίαν ἄγουσι;

Πάνυ μὲν οὖν.

59

60

Οὐκοῦν τούτων ὁ ἀγαθὸς μαστροπὸς τὰ συμφέροντα εἰς τὸ ἀρέσκειν διδάσκοι ἄν;

Πάνυ μεν οὖν.

'Αμείνων δ' ἃν εἴη, ἔφη, ὁ ἐνὶ δυνάμενος ἀρεστοὺς ποιεῖν ἢ ὄστις καὶ πολλοῖς;

Ένταῦθα μέντοι ἐσχίσθησαν, καὶ οἱ μὲν εἶπον Δῆλον ὅτι ὅστις πλείστοις, οἱ δὲ Πάνυ μὲν οὖν.

Ό δ' εἰπὼν ὅτι καὶ τοῦτο ὁμολογεῖται ἔφη· Εἰ δέ τις καὶ ὅλη τῆ πόλει ἀρέσκοντας δύναιτο ἀποδεικνύναι, οὐχ οὖτος παντελῶς ἃν ἤδη ἀγαθὸς μαστροπὸς εἴη;

Σαφῶς γε νὴ Δία, πάντες εἶπον.

Οὐκοῦν εἴ τις τοιούτους δύναιτο ἐξεργάζεσθαι ὧν προστατοίη, δικαίως ἂν μέγα φρονοίη ἐπὶ τῆ τέχνη καὶ δικαίως ἂν πολὺν μισθὸν λαμβάνοι;

61 Ἐπεὶ δὲ καὶ ταῦτα πάντες συνωμολόγουν, Τοιοῦτος μέντοι, ἔφη, μοι δοκεῖ ἀντισθένης εἶναι οῧτος.

### SYMPOSIUM 4.58-4.61

"Don't we also know that it is possible for one pair of 58 eyes to express both friendship and hostility?"

"Certainly."

"And again, it is possible to speak both modestly and boldly with the same voice?"

"Certainly."

"And again, aren't there words that arouse animosity and others conducive to friendliness?"

"Certainly."

"Now the good procurer would teach only the words 59 that tend to make one attractive, would he not?"

"Certainly."

"Which one would be the better?" he continued, "the one who could make people attractive to a single person or the one who could make them attractive to many?"

This question brought a division; some said, "Clearly the one who could make them attractive to a great many"; the others merely repeated, "Certainly."

Declaring that they were agreed on this point too, he continued: "If a person could render people attractive to the entire city, wouldn't he be hands-down an ideal procurer?"

"Clearly yes," they all said.

"And so, if someone could turn his clients into that sort of person, he would be entitled to feel proud of his profession and to receive good pay, wouldn't he?"

All agreeing on this point, too, he added, "Antisthenes 6 here seems to me to be just that sort of man."

Καὶ ὁ ἀντισθένης, Ἐμοί, ἔφη, παραδίδως, ὧ Σώκρατες, την τέχνην;

Ναὶ μὰ Δί, ἔφη, ὁρῶ γάρ σε καὶ τὴν ἀκόλουθον ταύτης πάνυ έξειργασμένον.

Τίνα ταύτην:

Τὴν προαγωγείαν, ἔφη.

Καὶ δς μάλα ἀχθεσθεὶς ἐπήρετο. Καὶ τί μοι σύνοι-62 σθα, ὧ Σώκρατες, τοιοῦτον εἰργασμένω;

Οίδα μέν, έφη, σε Καλλίαν τουτονί προαγωγεύσαντα τῷ σοφῷ Προδίκῳ, ὅτε έώρας τοῦτον μὲν φιλοσοφίας έρωντα, έκεινον δε χρημάτων δεόμενον οἶδα δέ σε Ἱππία τῶ Ἡλείω, παρ' οὖ οὖτος καὶ τὸ μνημονικὸν ἔμαθεν ἀφ' οὖ δὴ καὶ ἐρωτικώτερος γεγένηται διὰ τὸ ὅ τι ἂν καλὸν ἴδη μηδέποτε ἐπιλανθάνεσθαι, έναγχος δε δήπου καὶ πρὸς έμε ἐπαινῶν τὸν Ήρακλεώτην ξένον ἐπεί με ἐποίησας ἐπιθυμεῖν αὐτοῦ, συνέστησάς μοι αὐτόν. καὶ χάριν μέντοι σοι ἔχω. πάνυ γὰρ καλὸς κάγαθὸς δοκεῖ μοι εἶναι. Αἰσχύλον δὲ τὸν Φλειάσιον πρὸς ἐμὲ ἐπαινῶν καὶ ἐμὲ πρὸς ἐκεῖνον ούχ ούτω διέθηκας ώστε διὰ τοὺς σοὺς λόγους έρωντες έκυνοδρομούμεν άλλήλους ζητούντες; ταύτα 64 οὖν ὁρῶν δυνάμενόν σε ποιεῖν ἀγαθὸν νομίζω προαγωγὸν εἶναι. ὁ γὰρ οἷός τε ὢν γιγνώσκειν τοὺς ώφελίμους αύτοις και τούτους δυνάμενος ποιείν έπιθυμείν άλλήλων, ούτος άν μοι δοκεί και πόλεις δύνασθαι φίλας ποιείν καὶ γάμους ἐπιτηδείους συνάγειν,

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>29</sup> Zeuxippus, the painter. Cf. Pl. Prt. 318b, c.

Antisthenes replied, "Are you resigning your profession to me. Socrates?"

"Assuredly," was the answer. "For I see that you have brought to a high state of perfection the profession that follows it."

"What is that?"

"The profession of pandering," he said.

Antisthenes was much incensed and asked," What knowledge can you possibly have of my doing such a thing?"

"I know," he said, "that you acted the part between Callias here and the wise Prodicus when you saw that Callias lusted for philosophy and that Prodicus needed money. I also know that you did the same for Hippias the Elean, from whom Callias got his memory system; and ever since then Callias has become more lustful than ever, because he never forgets any beauty he sees. And just recently, you remember, you were commending your visitor from Heraclea<sup>29</sup> to me, and after arousing my keen interest in him you sat him next to me. And of course I'm grateful, for he seems a real gentleman. And didn't you commend Aeschylus the Phleiasian<sup>30</sup> to me and me to him until you brought us to such a state that in mutual yearning, excited by your words, we went coursing like hounds to find each other? It is witnessing your ability at accomplishing all this that makes me consider you an ideal panderer. Someone able to recognize people who are equipped to be mutually helpful and can make them desire one another's acquaintance, that man, in my opinion, could also create friendships between cities and arrange

<sup>30</sup> Otherwise unknown.

καὶ πολλοῦ ἂν ἄξιος εἶναι καὶ πόλεσι καὶ φίλοις καὶ συμμάχοις κεκτῆσθαι. σὸ δὲ ὡς κακῶς ἀκούσας ὅτι ἀγαθόν σε ἔφην προαγωγὸν εἶναι, ὡργίσθης.

'Αλλὰ μὰ Δί', ἔφη, οὐ νῦν ἔτι. ἐὰν γὰρ ταῦτα δύνωμαι, σεσαγμένος δὴ παντάπασι πλούτου τὴν ψυχὴν ἔσομαι.

Καὶ αὕτη μὲν δὴ ἡ περίοδος τῶν λόγων οὕτως ἀπετελέσθη.

5. Ὁ δὲ Καλλίας ἔφη· Σὺ δὲ δή, ὧ Κριτόβουλε, εἰς τὸν περὶ τοῦ κάλλους ἀγῶνα πρὸς Σωκράτην οὐκ ἀνθίστασαι;

Νη Δί', ἔφη ὁ Σωκράτης, ἴσως γὰρ εὐδοκιμοῦντα τὸν μαστροπὸν παρὰ τοῖς κριταῖς ὁρᾳ.

'Αλλ' ὅμως, ἔφη ὁ Κριτόβουλος, οὖκ ἀναδύομαι ἀλλὰ δίδασκε, εἴ τι ἔχεις σοφόν, ὡς καλλίων εἶ ἐμοῦ. μόνον, ἔφη, τὸν λαμπτῆρα ἐγγὺς προσενεγκάτω.

Εἰς ἀνάκρισιν τοίνυν σε, ἔφη, πρῶτον τῆς δίκης καλοῦμαι ἀλλ' ἀποκρίνου.

Σὺ δέ γε ἐρώτα.

3 Πότερον οὖν ἐν ἀνθρώπῳ μόνον νομίζεις τὸ καλὸν εἶναι ἢ καὶ ἐν ἄλλῳ τινί;

Έγω μὲν ναὶ μὰ Δί', ἔφη, καὶ ἐν ἵππω καὶ βοῒ καὶ ἐν ἀψύχοις πολλοῖς. οἶδα γοῦν οὖσαν καὶ ἀσπίδα καλὴν καὶ ξίφος καὶ δόρυ.

4 Καὶ πῶς, ἔφη, οἶόν τε ταῦτα μηδὲν ὅμοια ὅντα ἀλλήλοις πάντα καλὰ εἶναι;

suitable marriages, and would be a very valuable acquisition as friend or ally for cities and individuals and allies. But you got indignant, as if you had received an affront, when I said that you were an ideal panderer."

"By Zeus, not any longer," he replied; "for if that's my power I'll find my soul chock-full of riches."

And that round of discussion was thus brought to a close.

5. Callias now said, "Critobulus, are you going to refuse to enter the beauty contest with Socrates?"

"Undoubtedly!" said Socrates; "for probably he notices that the procurer stands high in the favor of the judges."

"In spite of that," said Critobulus, "I'm not shunning the contest. So make your case, if you have some clever proof that you're handsomer than me. Only," he added, "let the lamp be brought close."

"The first step, then, in my suit," said Socrates, "is to summon you to the preliminary hearing; now answer my questions."

"And you proceed to put them."

"Do you believe, then, that beauty is to be found only in man, or also in something else?"

CRIT. "Certainly the latter: also in a horse and an ox and in any number of inanimate objects; I know, at any rate, that there's a beautiful shield, and sword, and spear."

Soc. "And how can it be that all these things are beautiful when they are entirely dissimilar?"

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>13</sup> πόλει καὶ φίλοις σύμμαχος Cobet: πόλεσι καὶ ἰδιώταις φίλος καὶ σύμμαχος Finckh: καὶ συμμάχοις del. Sauppe

"Ην νὴ Δί', ἔφη, πρὸς τὰ ἔργα ὧν ἕνεκα ἕκαστα κτώμεθα εὖ εἰργασμένα ἢ ἢ εὖ πεφυκότα πρὸς ἃ ἂν δεώμεθα, καὶ ταῦτ', ἔφη ὁ Κριτόβουλος, καλά.

Οἶσθα οὖν, ἔφη, ὀφθαλμῶν τίνος ἕνεκα δεόμεθα; Δῆλον, ἔφη, ὅτι τοῦ ὁρᾶν.

Οὕτω μὲν τοίνυν ἤδη οἱ ἐμοὶ ὀφθαλμοὶ καλλίονες αν τῶν σῶν εἴησαν.

Πῶς δή;

5

6

7

Οτι οἱ μὲν σοὶ τὸ κατ' εὐθὺ μόνον ὁρῶσιν, οἱ δὲ ἐμοὶ καὶ τὸ ἐκ πλαγίου διὰ τὸ ἐπιπόλαιοι εἶναι.

Λέγεις σύ, ἔφη, καρκίνον εὐοφθαλμότατον εἶναι τῶν ζώων;

Πάντως δήπου, ἔφη· ἐπεὶ καὶ πρὸς ἰσχὺν τοὺς ὀφθαλμοὺς ἄριστα πεφυκότας ἔχει.

Εἶεν, ἔφη, τῶν δὲ ῥινῶν ποτέρα καλλίων, ἡ σὴ ἢ ἡ ἐμή;

Έγω μέν, ἔφη, οἶμαι τὴν ἐμήν, εἴπερ γε τοῦ ὀσφραίνεσθαι ἕνεκ' ἐνεποίησαν ἡμῖν ῥῖνας οἱ θεοί. οἱ μὲν γὰρ σοὶ μυκτῆρες εἰς γῆν ὁρῶσιν, οἱ δὲ ἐμοὶ ἀναπέπτανται, ὥστε τὰς πάντοθεν ὀσμὰς προσδέχεσθαι.

Τὸ δὲ δὴ σιμὸν τῆς ἡινὸς πῶς τοῦ ὀρθοῦ κάλλιον; "Οτι, ἔφη, οὐκ ἀντιφράττει, ἀλλ' ἐᾳ εὐθὺς τὰς ὄψεις ὁρᾶν ἃ ἂν βούλωνται· ἡ δὲ ὑψηλὴ ῥὶς ὥσπερ ἐπηρεάζουσα διατετείχικε τὰ ὄμματα.

Τοῦ γε μὴν στόματος, ἔφη ὁ Κριτόβουλος, ὑφίεμαι.

 $<sup>^{31}</sup>$  Critobulus gets into trouble by his poor definition of beauty. In the Greek, the ensuing discussion is plausible because the

## SYMPOSIUM 5.4-5.7

"Surely: they're beautiful<sup>31</sup> if they're well made for the respective functions for which we obtain them, or if they are naturally well constituted to serve our needs."

Soc. "Do you know the reason why we need eyes?"

CRIT. "Obviously to see with."

"In that case, and without further ado, my eyes would be more beautiful than yours."

"How so?"

"Because, while yours see only straight ahead, mine, by bulging out as they do, see also to the sides."

CRIT. "Do you mean to say that a crab is better equipped visually than any other creature?"

Soc. "Absolutely, for its eyes are also best set to ensure strength."

CRIT. "Very well. But whose nose is more beautiful, yours or mine?"

Soc. "Mine, I consider, granting that the gods made us noses to smell with. Your nostrils look down to the ground, while mine are wide open so as to catch scents from all about."

CRIT. "But how do you make a snub nose handsomer than a straight one?"

Soc. "Because it doesn't put a barricade between the eyes but allows them unobstructed vision of whatever they want to see; whereas a high nose, as if in spite, walls the eyes off from each other."

"As for the mouth," said Critobulus, "I concede that

word  $\kappa \alpha \lambda \delta s$  means not only "beautiful, handsome" but also "glorious, noble, excellent, fine"; and though starting with the first meaning, it soon shifts to the last, so that the translator must use different terms in the two sections of the argument.

εί γὰρ τοῦ ἀποδάκνειν ἔνεκα πεποίηται, πολὺ ἂν σὺ μεῖζον ἢ ἐγὼ ἀποδάκοις. διὰ δὲ τὸ παχέα ἔχειν τὰ χείλη οὐκ οἴει καὶ μαλακώτερόν σου ἔχειν τὸ φίλημα;

Έοικα, ἔφη, ἐγὼ κατὰ τὸν σὸν λόγον καὶ τῶν ὅνων αἴσχιον τὸ στόμα ἔχειν. ἐκεῖνο δὲ οὐδὲν τεκμήριον λογίζη ὡς ἐγὼ σοῦ καλλίων εἰμί, ὅτι καὶ Ναΐδες θεαὶ οὖσαι τοὺς Σειληνοὺς ἐμοὶ ὁμοιοτέρους τίκτουσιν ἢ σοί:

Καὶ ὁ Κριτόβουλος, Οὐκέτι, ἔφη, ἔχω πρὸς σὲ ἀντιλέγειν, ἀλλὰ διαφερόντων, ἔφη, τὰς ψήφους, ἵνα ὡς τάχιστα εἰδῶ ὅ τι με χρὴ παθεῖν ἢ ἀποτεῖσαι. μόνον, ἔφη, κρυφῆ φερόντων δέδοικα γὰρ τὸν σὸν καὶ ἀντισθένους πλοῦτον μή με καταδυναστεύση.

Ἡ μὲν δὴ παῖς καὶ ὁ παῖς κρύφα ἀνέφερον. ὁ δὲ Σωκράτης ἐν τούτῳ διέπραττε τόν τε λύχνον ἀντιπροσενεγκεῖν τῷ Κριτοβούλῳ, ὡς μὴ ἐξαπατηθείησαν οἱ κριταί, καὶ τῷ νικήσαντι μὴ ταινίας ἀλλὰ φιλήματα ἀναδήματα παρὰ τῶν κριτῶν γενέσθαι. ἐπεὶ δὲ ἐξέπεσον αἱ ψῆφοι καὶ ἐγένοντο πᾶσαι σὺν Κριτοβούλῳ, Παπαῖ, ἔφη ὁ Σωκράτης, οὐχ ὅμοιον ἔοικε τὸ σὸν ἀργύριον, ὧ Κριτόβουλε, τῷ Καλλίου εἶναι. τὸ μὲν γὰρ τούτου δικαιοτέρους ποιεῖ, τὸ δὲ σὸν ὥσπερ τὸ πλεῖστον διαφθείρειν ἱκανόν ἐστι καὶ δικαστὰς καὶ κριτάς.

6. Ἐκ δὲ τούτου οἱ μὲν τὰ νικητήρια φιλήματα ἀπολαμβάνειν τὸν Κριτόβουλον ἐκέλευον, οἱ δὲ τὸν κύριον πείθειν, οἱ δὲ καὶ ἄλλα ἔσκωπτον. ὁ δὲ Ἑρμογένης κἀνταῦθα ἐσιώπα. καὶ ὁ Σωκράτης ὀνομάσας

8

9

point. For if it is created for the purpose of biting off food, you could bite off a lot more than I could. And don't you think that your kiss is also the more tender because you have thick lips?"

Soc. "By your argument I apparently have a mouth even uglier than a donkey's. But don't you reckon it a proof of my superior beauty that the Naiads, goddesses as they are, bear as their offspring the Silens, who look more like me than you?"

"I can't counter your arguments any longer," answered Critobulus: "let them distribute the ballots, so that I may know as soon as possible what fine or punishment I must suffer. Only," he said, "let the balloting be secret, for I am afraid that the 'wealth' you and Antisthenes possess will overmaster me."

So the boy and girl turned in secret ballots. Meanwhile Socrates saw to it that the light should be placed in front of Critobulus so that the judges would not be misled, and stipulated that the prize given by the judges to crown the victor should be kisses and not ribbons. When the ballots were turned out of the urn and proved to be a unanimous for Critobulus, "Bah!" exclaimed Socrates; "your money, Critobulus, does not appear to resemble Callias': his makes people more honest, while yours, like most, has the power to corrupt, whether jurymen or judges."

6. At this some of the company urged Critobulus to take his victory kisses; others advised him to get the consent of the legal guardian; and others made other jokes. But even then Hermogenes kept silent. And Socrates, call-

αὐτόν, Έχοις ἄν, ἔφη, ὧ Ἑρμόγενες, εἰπεῖν ἡμῖν τί ἐστὶ παροινία;

Καὶ ὃς ἀπεκρίνατο· Εἰ μὲν ὅ τι ἐστὶν ἐρωτậς, οὐκ οἶδα· τὸ μέντοι μοι δοκοῦν εἴποιμ' ἄν.

Άλλ' ὁ δοκεῖ, τοῦτ', ἔφη.

2

3

Τὸ τοίνυν παρ' οἶνον λυπεῖν τοὺς συνόντας, τοῦτ' ἐγὼ κρίνω παροινίαν.

Oloθ' οὖν, ἔφη, ὅτι καὶ σὰ νῦν ἡμᾶς λυπεῖς σιω-πῶν;

' Η καὶ ὅταν λέγητ'; ἔφη.

Οὔκ, ἀλλ' ὅταν διαλίπωμεν.

³Η οὖν λέληθέ σε ὅτι μεταξὺ τοῦ ὑμᾶς λέγειν οὐδ᾽ α̈ν τρίχα, μὴ ὅτι λόγον ἄν τις παρείρειε;

Καὶ ὁ Σωκράτης, <sup>3</sup>Ω Καλλία, ἔχοις ἄν τι, ἔφη, ἀνδρὶ ἐλεγχομένω βοηθῆσαι;

Έγωγ', ἔφη. ὅταν γὰρ ὁ αὐλὸς φθέγγηται, παντάπασι σιωπῶμεν.

Καὶ ὁ Ἑρμογένης, ἢΗ οὖν βούλεσθε, ἔφη, ὥσπερ Νικόστρατος ὁ ὑποκριτὴς τετράμετρα πρὸς τὸν αὐλὸν κατέλεγεν, οὕτω καὶ ὑπὸ τοῦ αὐλοῦ ὑμῖν διαλέγωμαι;

Καὶ ὁ Σωκράτης, Πρὸς τῶν θεῶν, ἔφη, Ἑρμόγενες, οὕτω ποίει. οἶμαι γάρ, ὥσπερ ἡ ὧδὴ ἡδίων πρὸς τὸν αὐλόν, οὕτω καὶ τοὺς σοὺς λόγους ἡδύνεσθαι ἄν τι ὑπὸ τῶν φθόγγων, ἄλλως τε καὶ εἰ μορφάζοις ὥσπερ ἡ αὐλητρὶς καὶ σὺ πρὸς τὰ λεγόμενα.

Καὶ ὁ Καλλίας ἔφη· "Όταν οὖν ὁ 'Αντισθένης ὅδ' ἐλέγχη τινὰ ἐν τῷ συμποσίῳ, τί ἔσται τὸ αὔλημα;

ing him by name, inquired, "Hermogenes, could you define 'wine abuse' for us?"

"If you're asking me what it actually is," he answered, "I don't know; but I can tell you what I think it is."

Soc. "Very well, tell us that."

HERM. "My definition of 'wine abuse' is annoying one's companions because of wine."

Soc. "Well, do you realize that at the present moment you are annoying us with your silence?"

HERM. "Even while you are all talking?"

"No. but in the intervals."

"You do see that no one could insert even a hair in the intervals of your talk, much less a word?"

"Callias," said Socrates, "could you come to the rescue of a man hard pressed for an answer?"

"I can," he said: "we're absolutely quiet every time the pipes are played."

Hermogenes retorted, "Is it your wish that I should converse with you to the accompaniment of the pipes, the way the actor Nicostratus used to recite tetrameter verses?"

"In heaven's name, do that, Hermogenes!" urged Socrates. "For I believe that precisely as a song is more agreeable when accompanied on the pipes, so your discourse would be embellished somewhat by the music, especially if you were to strike poses, like the piper girl, to point your words."

"What is the tune to be," asked Callias, "when Antisthenes here gets some one at the banquet cornered in an argument?"

Καὶ ὁ ἀντισθένης εἶπε, Τῷ μὲν ἐλεγχομένῳ οἶμαι ἄν, ἔφη, πρέπειν συριγμόν.

Τοιούτων δὲ λόγων ὅντων ὡς ἑώρα ὁ Συρακόσιος τῶν μὲν αὐτοῦ ἐπιδειγμάτων ἀμελοῦντας, ἀλλήλοις δὲ ήδομένους, φθονῶν τῷ Σωκράτει εἶπεν Ἦρα σύ, ὧ Σώκρατες, ὁ φροντιστὴς ἐπικαλούμενος;

Οὔκουν κάλλιον, ἔφη, ἢ εἰ ἁφρόντιστος<sup>14</sup> ἐκαλούμην;

Εἰ μή γε ἐδόκεις τῶν μετεώρων φροντιστὴς εἶναι. Οἶσθα οὖν, ἔφη ὁ Σωκράτης, μετεωρότερόν τι τῶν θεῶν:

'Αλλ' οὐ μὰ Δί', ἔφη, οὐ τούτων σε λέγουσιν ἐπιμελεῖσθαι, ἀλλὰ τῶν ἀνωφελεστάτων.

Οὐκοῦν καὶ οὕτως ἄν, ἔφη, θεῶν ἐπιμελοίμην· ἄνωθεν μέν γε ὕοντες ὡφελοῦσιν, ἄνωθεν δὲ φῶς παρέχουσιν. εἰ δὲ ψυχρὰ λέγω, σὰ αἴτιος, ἔφη, πράγματά μοι παρέχων.

Ταῦτα μέν, ἔφη, ἔα· ἀλλ' εἰπέ μοι πόσους ψύλλης πόδας ἐμοῦ ἀπέχεις. ταῦτα γάρ σέ φασι γεωμετρεῖν.

Καὶ ὁ ἀντισθένης εἶπε· Σὰ μέντοι δεινὸς εἶ, ὧ Φίλιππε, εἰκάζειν· οὐ δοκεῖ σοι ὁ ἀνὴρ οὖτος λοιδορεῖσθαι βουλομένω ἐοικέναι;

14 άφρόντιστος Capps: άφρόντιστος codd.

6

<sup>32</sup> Literally "the things above," applied first to astronomical and then to philosophical (especially ontological) inquiries, which in the popular mind were characteristic of radical thinkers (cf. the

"For the one refuted," said Antisthenes, "I think the appropriate music would be hissing."

The Syracusan, seeing that with such conversation going on the banqueters were paying no attention to his show, but were enjoying one another's company, said spitefully to Socrates, "Socrates, are you the one nicknamed the 'Thinker'?"

"Well, isn't that preferable," he rejoined, "to being called the 'Thoughtless'?"

"Yes, if it were not that you're supposed to be a thinker on celestial subjects."  $^{32}$ 

"Do you know," asked Socrates, "anything more celestial than the gods?"

SYR. "Zeus no, it's not the gods that people say you're interested in, but the most airheaded matters."

Soc. "Even granting the expression, I would still be interested in gods: they help us by sending rain through the air overhead and they produce light from the air overhead. If my play on words is strained," he added, "you have only yourself to blame, for annoying me."

SYR. "Well, let that pass. Tell me instead the distance 8 between us in flea's feet; for that's how people say you measure things." 33

At this Antisthenes said, "You're awfully good at making comparisons, Philip; wouldn't you say that our friend here resembles someone bent on trading insults?"

caricature of Socrates hanging from the sky in a basket in Aristophanes' *Clouds* of 423) and which figured in his indictment.

<sup>33</sup> In *Clouds* (144 ff., cf. 830 f.) Socrates and Chaerephon measure a flea's jump in terms of its own feet.

Ναὶ μὰ τὸν Δί, ἔφη, καὶ ἄλλοις γε πολλοῖς.

'Αλλ' ὅμως, ἔφη ὁ Σωκράτης, σὰ αὐτὸν μὴ εἴκαζε, ἴνα μὴ καὶ σὰ λοιδορουμένω ἐοίκης.

'Αλλ' εἴπερ γε τοῖς πᾶσι καλοῖς καὶ τοῖς βελτίστοις εἰκάζω αὐτόν, ἐπαινοῦντι μᾶλλον ἢ λοιδορουμένῳ δικαίως ἂν εἰκάζοι μέ τις.

Καὶ νῦν σύγε λοιδορουμένω ἔοικας, εἰ πάντα τὰ αὐτοῦ βελτίω φὴς εἶναι.

Άλλὰ βούλει πονηροτέροις εἰκάζω αὐτόν;

Μηδὲ πονηροτέροις.

Άλλὰ μηδενί;

9

10

Μηδενὶ μηδὲν τοῦτον εἴκαζε.

'Αλλ' οὐ μέντοι γε σιωπῶν οἶδα ὅπως ἄξια τοῦ δείπνου ἐργάσομαι.

Καὶ ράδίως γ', ἂν ἃ μὴ δεῖ λέγειν, ἔφη, σιωπᾶς.

Αύτη μὲν δὴ ἡ παροινία οὕτω κατεσβέσθη.

7. Ἐκ τούτου δὲ τῶν ἄλλων οἱ μὲν ἐκέλευον εἰκάζειν, οἱ δὲ ἐκώλυον. θορύβου δὲ ὄντος ὁ Σωκράτης αὖ πάλιν εἶπεν ᾿Αρα ἐπειδὴ πάντες ἐπιθυμοῦμεν λέγειν, νῦν ἂν μάλιστα καὶ ἄμα ἄσαιμεν; καὶ εὐθὺς τοῦτ εἰπὼν ἦρχεν ٺδῆς. ἐπεὶ δ' ἦσαν, εἰσεφέρετο τῆ ὀρχηστρίδι τροχὸς τῶν κεραμικῶν, ἐφ' οὖ ἔμελλε θαυματουργήσειν.

Ένθα δὴ εἶπεν ὁ Σωκράτης· Ὠ Συρακόσιε, κινδυνεύω ἐγώ, ὥσπερ σὰ λέγεις, τῷ ὅντι φροντιστὴς εἶναι· νῦν γοῦν<sup>15</sup> σκοπῶ ὅπως ἂν ὁ μὲν παῖς ὅδε ὁ σὸς καὶ

 $<sup>^{15}</sup>$  γοῦν L. Dindorf: οὖν codd.

#### SYMPOSIUM 6.8-7.2

"Yes, indeed," came the answer; "and so do many others."

"Nevertheless," said Socrates, "don't you draw the comparison, or you might resemble a troublemaker too."

"But suppose I compare him to all the very best gentlemen; then I would deserve to be compared to a eulogist and not a detractor."

"You're like the latter right now, because you're asserting that every one is better than him!"

"Do you want me to compare him to those who are 10 viler, then?"

"No, not the viler, either."

"To no one, then?"

"Don't compare him to any one in any way."

"But if I say nothing, I don't understand how I can do a job worthy of my dinner."

"Easily," said Socrates, "if you say nothing about what you shouldn't be saying."

Thus was quenched this bit of wine abuse.

7. At that point some kept urging Philip to go on with his comparisons, while others tried to stop it. Amid the clamor, Socrates spoke again: "Since we all want to talk, wouldn't this be a fine time to join in singing?" And with those words he began a song. When they had finished, a potter's wheel was brought in for the dancing girl, on which she was to put on a show.

This prompted Socrates to observe, "Syracusan, I'm afraid that, to use your words, I really am a 'thinker'; at any rate, I'm now considering how this boy and girl of

ή παις ήδε ως ράστα διάγοιεν, ήμεις δ' αν μάλιστ' αν εύφραινοίμεθα θεώμενοι αὐτούς ὅπερ εὖ οἶδα ὅτι 3 καὶ σὺ βούλει. δοκεί οὖν μοι τὸ μὲν εἰς μαχαίρας κυβιστάν κινδύνου έπίδειγμα είναι, δ συμποσίω ούδὲν προσήκει. καὶ μὴν τό γε ἐπὶ τοῦ τροχοῦ ἄμα περιδινουμένου γράφειν τε καὶ ἀναγιγνώσκειν θαθμα μὲν ἴσως τί ἐστιν, ἡδονὴν δὲ οὐδὲ ταῦτα δύναμαι γνῶναι τίν' ἂν παράσχοι. οὐδὲ μὴν τό γε διαστρέφοντας τὰ σώματα καὶ τροχούς μιμουμένους ήδιον ἡ ἡσυχίαν έχοντας τοὺς καλοὺς καὶ ώραίους θεωρείν. καὶ γὰρ δὴ οὐδὲ πάνυ τι σπάνιον τό γε θαυμασίοις ἐντυχεῖν, εἴ τις τούτου δείται, άλλ' έξεστιν αὐτίκα μάλα τὰ παρόντα θαυμάζειν, τί ποτε ὁ μὲν λύχνος διὰ τὸ λαμπρὰν φλόγα ἔχειν φῶς παρέχει, τὸ δὲ χαλκεῖον λαμπρὸν ὂν φως μεν οὐ ποιεί, εν αύτω δε άλλα εμφαινόμενα παρέχεται καὶ πῶς τὸ μὲν ἔλαιον ὑγρὸν ὂν αὔξει τὴν φλόγα, τὸ δὲ ὕδωρ, ὅτι ὑγρόν ἐστι, κατασβέννυσι τὸ πῦρ. ἀλλὰ γὰρ καὶ ταῦτα μὲν οὐκ εἰς ταὐτὸν τῷ οἴνῳ έπισπεύδει εί δε όρχοιντο πρός τον αὐλον σχήματα έν οἷς Χάριτές τε καὶ "Ωραι καὶ Νύμφαι γράφονται, πολύ ἂν οἶμαι αὐτούς τε ράον διάγειν καὶ τὸ συμπόσιον πολύ ἐπιχαριτώτερον εἶναι.

Ό οὖν Συρακόσιος, Άλλὰ ναὶ μὰ τὸν Δί', ἔφη, ὧ Σώκρατες, καλῶς τε λέγεις καὶ ἐγὼ εἰσάξω θεάματα ἐφ' οἶς ὑμεῖς εὐφρανεῖσθε.

8. Ὁ μὲν δὴ Συρακόσιος ἐξελθών συνεκροτείτο ὁ δὲ Σωκράτης πάλιν αὖ καινοῦ λόγου κατῆρχεν. ᾿Αρ΄, ἔφη, ὦ ἄνδρες, εἰκὸς ἡμᾶς παρόντος δαίμονος με-

#### SYMPOSIUM 7.2-8.1

yours can exert as little effort as possible while giving us maximum pleasure in watching them,—this being your purpose also, I'm sure. Now turning somersaults into knives strikes me as a dangerous exhibition, and utterly out of place at a banquet. Writing and reading aloud on a whirling potter's wheel may be something of a feat too, yet I can't conceive what pleasure even that could afford. Nor is it any more diverting to watch the young and beautiful twisting their bodies about and imitating hoops than in repose. It's of course no rare event to encounter marvels, if that is what you want; in fact you can marvel at what's right in front of you now,—for instance, why the lamp gives light by having a bright flame while its bronze reflector, likewise bright, doesn't produce light but instead reflects other things that appear in it. Or how it is that olive oil, though wet, makes the flame higher, while water, because it is wet, puts the fire out. And yet even these questions fail to promote the same end that wine does. But if the young people were to have a pipe accompaniment and dance figures depicting the Graces, the Seasons, and the Nymphs, I believe that they would have a far easier time of it and that the banquet would be far more delightful."

"You're absolutely right, Socrates," replied the Syracusan, "and I'll bring on a show that you will all enjoy."

8. So the Syracusan withdrew to applause. Socrates now opened up another new topic for discussion. "Gentlemen," he said, "it is to be expected of us, is it not, when in

3

γάλου καὶ τῷ μὲν χρόνῳ ἰσήλικος τοῖς ἀειγενέσι θεοῖς, τῆ δὲ μορφῆ νεωτάτου, καὶ μεγέθει μὲν πάντα έπέχοντος, ψυχη δ' ἀνθρώπου ίδρυμένου, 16 "Ερωτος, μη άμνημονήσαι, άλλως τε καὶ έπειδη πάντες έσμεν τοῦ θεοῦ τούτου θιασώται; ἐγώ τε γὰρ οὐκ ἔχω χρό-2 νον εἰπεῖν ἐν ὧ οὐκ ἐρῶν τινος διατελῶ, Χαρμίδην δὲ τόνδε οἶδα πολλοὺς μὲν ἐραστὰς κτησάμενον, ἔστι δὲ ων καὶ αὐτὸν ἐπιθυμήσαντα. Κριτόβουλός γε μὴν ἔτι<sup>17</sup> καὶ ἐρώμενος ὢν ἤδη ἄλλων ἐπιθυμεῖ. ἀλλὰ μὴν 3 καὶ ὁ Νικήρατος, ὡς ἐγὼ ἀκούω, ἐρῶν τῆς γυναικὸς άντεραται. Έρμογένη γε μην τίς ήμων οὐκ οἶδεν ώς, ο τι ποτ' έστιν ή καλοκάγαθία, τῷ ταύτης ἔρωτι κατατήκεται; οὐχ ὁρᾶτε ὡς σπουδαῖαι μὲν αὐτοῦ αἱ ὀΦρύες. άτρεμες δε τὸ ὄμμα, μέτριοι δε οἱ λόγοι, πραεῖα δε ή φωνή, ίλαρὸν δὲ τὸ ἦθος; τοῖς δὲ σεμνοτάτοις θεοῖς φίλοις χρώμενος οὐδεν ήμας τοὺς ἀνθρώπους ὑπερορά: σὺ δὲ μόνος, ὧ Άντίσθενες, οὐδενὸς ἐρậς;

Ναὶ μὰ τοὺς θεούς, εἶπεν ἐκεῖνος, καὶ σφόδρα γε σοῦ.

Καὶ ὁ Σωκράτης ἐπισκώψας ὡς δὴ θρυπτόμενος εἶπε· Μὴ νῦν μοι ἐν τῷ παρόντι ὅχλον πάρεχε· ὡς γὰρ ὁρậς, ἄλλα πράττω.

Καὶ ὁ ἀντισθένης ἔλεξεν· 'Ως σαφῶς μέντοι σύ, μαστροπὲ σαυτοῦ, ἀεὶ τοιαῦτα ποιεῖς· τοτὲ μὲν τὸ δαιμόνιον προφασιζόμενος οὐ διαλέγη μοι, τοτὲ δ' ἄλλου του ἐφιέμενος.

Καὶ ὁ Σωκράτης ἔφη· Πρὸς τῶν θεῶν, ὧ ἀντίσθε-

4

5

the presence of a mighty deity who is coeval with the eternal gods, yet youngest of them in appearance, in magnitude encompassing the universe, yet enthroned in the heart of man—I mean Love—that we should not ignore him, particularly since we are all his followers? I can't recall a time when I was not in love with someone, and I know that Charmides here has attracted many suitors and has fallen for a few himself; Critobulus too, though still an object of desire, is already beginning to fall for others. Then Niceratus too, so I hear, is in love with his wife and is loved back. As for Hermogenes, who of us doesn't know that whatever gentlemanliness is, he is melting away with love for it? Don't you see how serious his brows are, how calm his gaze, how modest his words, how gentle his voice, how genial his demeanor? That although he enjoys the friendship of the most august gods, yet he does not disdain us mortals? Are you the only person, Antisthenes, in love with no one?"

"No, by heaven!" he replied; "I am madly in love—with you!"

And Socrates, jokingly pretending to flirt, said: "Don't pester me just now; I am engaged in other business, as you can see."

"How transparent you are, you procurer of your own charms," Antisthenes rejoined, "in always doing something like this; sometimes you refuse to speak with me on the pretext of your divine sign, other times because you have some other purpose in mind."

"In heaven's name, Antisthenes" implored Socrates,

<sup>16</sup> ίδρυμένου Blomfield: ἰσουμένου codd.

<sup>17</sup> μὴν ἔτι Bornemann: ἔτι μὴν (om. B) codd.

νες, μόνον μη συγκόψης με την δ' άλλην χαλεπότητα έγω σου καὶ φέρω καὶ οἴσω φιλικως, ἀλλὰ γάρ, ἔφη, τὸν μὲν σὸν ἔρωτα κρύπτωμεν, ἐπειδὴ καὶ ἔστιν οὐ ψυχής άλλ' εὐμορφίας τής έμης, ὅτι γε μὴν σύ, ὧ Καλλία, έρας Αὐτολύκου πάσα μὲν ἡ πόλις οἶδε, πολλοὺς δ' οἶμαι καὶ τῶν ξένων. τούτου δ' αἴτιον τὸ πατέρων τε ονομαστών αμφοτέρους ύμας είναι καὶ αὐτοὺς ἐπιφανεῖς. ἀεὶ μὲν οὖν ἔγωγε ἡγάμην τὴν σὴν φύσιν, νῦν δὲ καὶ πολὺ μᾶλλον, ἐπεὶ ὁρῶ σε ἐρῶντα ούχ άβρότητι χλιδαινομένου ούδὲ μαλακία θρυπτομένου, άλλὰ πᾶσιν ἐπιδεικνυμένου ῥώμην τε καὶ καρτερίαν καὶ ἀνδρείαν καὶ σωφροσύνην, τὸ δὲ τοιούτων έπιθυμείν τεκμήριόν έστι καὶ τῆς τοῦ ἐραστοῦ18 φύσεως, εἰ μὲν οὖν μία ἐστὶν Ἀφροδίτη ἢ διτταί, Οὐρανία τε καὶ Πάνδημος, οὐκ οἶδα καὶ γὰρ Ζεὺς ὁ αὐτὸς δοκῶν εἶναι πολλὰς ἐπωνυμίας ἔχει ὅτι γε μέντοι χωρὶς ἐκατέρα βωμοί τέ εἰσι καὶ ναοὶ καὶ θυσίαι τῆ μὲν Πανδήμω ραδιουργότεραι, τῆ δὲ Οὐρανία άγνότεραι, οἶδα. εἰκάσαις δ' ἂν καὶ τοὺς ἔρωτας τὴν μεν Πάνδημον των σωμάτων επιπεμπειν, την δ' Ούρανίαν της ψυχης τε καὶ της φιλίας καὶ τῶν καλῶν ἔργων, ὑφ' οὖ δὴ καὶ σύ, ὧ Καλλία, κατέχεσθαί μοι δοκείς έρωτος. τεκμαίρομαι δὲ τῆ τοῦ ἐρωμένου καλοκάγαθία καὶ ὅτι σε ὁρῶ τὸν πατέρα αὐτοῦ παραλαμβάνοντα είς τὰς πρὸς τοῦτον συνουσίας, οὐδὲν γὰρ τούτων έστιν απόκρυφον πατρός τῶ καλῶ τε κάγαθῶ έραστῆ.

8

10

<sup>18</sup> *ἔρωτο*ς pap.

# SYMPOSIUM 8.6-8.11

"just don't beat me up; I put up with any other manifestation of your bad temper and will continue to do so, in a friendly spirit. But," he went on, "let's keep your love a secret, because it's not for my soul but for my good looks. But as for you, Callias, all the city knows you're in love with Autolycus and so, I think, do a great many men from abroad. That's because you are both sons of distinguished fathers and are yourselves in the public eye. So I have always admired your character, but all the more so now, when I see you're in love with someone who doesn't revel in luxury or grow sissified in softness but shows the world physical strength and stamina, virile courage and selfcontrol. Desire for such traits gives an insight into the lover's character. Now, whether there is one Aphrodite or two, Celestial and Popular, 34 I do not know; even Zeus, though considered one and the same, yet has many bynames. I do know, however, that for each Aphrodite there are separate altars, temples, and sacrifices, those of the Popular rather casual, those of the Celestial more holy. You might conjecture also that different types of love come from the different sources, love for bodies from the Popular and from the Celestial love of souls, friendship, and fine deeds. That's the sort of love, Callias, that seems to have you in its grip. I infer this from the gentlemanliness of your beloved and because I see that you include his father in your meetings with him. For the gentlemanly lover does not conceal any of this from his beloved's father."

 $^{34}$  Actual cult titles similarly interpreted by Pausanias in Plato's  $\textit{Symposium},\,180d6$  ff.

10

12 Καὶ ὁ Ἑρμογένης εἶπε, Νὴ τὴν Ἡραν, ἔφη, ὧ Σώκρατες, ἄλλα τέ σου πολλὰ ἄγαμαι καὶ ὅτι νῦν ἄμα χαριζόμενος Καλλία καὶ παιδεύεις αὐτὸν οἶόνπερ χρὴ εἶναι.

Νη Δί, ἔφη ὅπως δὲ καὶ ἔτι μᾶλλον εὐφραίνηται. βούλομαι αὐτῷ μαρτυρήσαι ὡς καὶ πολὺ κρείττων έστὶν ὁ τῆς ψυχῆς ἢ ὁ τοῦ σώματος ἔρως. ὅτι μὲν γὰρ 13 δη άνευ φιλίας συνουσία οὐδεμία άξιόλογος πάντες έπιστάμεθα, φιλείν γε μην των μεν το ήθος άγαμένων άνάγκη ήδεια και έθελουσία καλείται των δε τοῦ σώματος ἐπιθυμούντων πολλοὶ μὲν τοὺς τρόπους μέμφονται καὶ μισοῦσι τῶν ἐρωμένων ἢν δὲ καὶ ἀμ-14 φότερα στέρξωσι, τὸ μὲν τῆς ὥρας ἄνθος ταχὺ δήπου παρακμάζει, ἀπολείποντος δὲ τούτου ἀνάγκη καὶ τὴν φιλίαν συναπομαραίνεσθαι, ή δε ψυχή ὅσονπερ αν χρόνον ζη έπὶ τὸ φρονιμώτερον καὶ άξιεραστοτέρα γίγνεται, καὶ μὴν ἐν μὲν τῆ τῆς μορφῆς χρήσει ἔν-15 εστί τις καὶ κόρος, ὥστε ἄπερ καὶ πρὸς τὰ σιτία διὰ πλησμονήν, ταῦτα ἀνάγκη καὶ πρὸς τὰ παιδικὰ πάσχειν ή δὲ τῆς ψυχῆς φιλία διὰ τὸ άγνη εἶναι καὶ ακορεστοτέρα έστίν, οὐ μέντοι, ώς γ' ἄν τις οἰηθείη, διὰ τοῦτο καὶ ἀνεπαφροδιτοτέρα, ἀλλὰ σαφῶς καὶ άποτελείται ή εύχη έν ή αἰτούμεθα την θεον έπαφρόδιτα καὶ ἔπη καὶ ἔργα διδόναι.

16 ΄Ως μὲν γὰρ ἄγαταί τε καὶ φιλεῖ τὸν ἐρώμενον θάλλουσα μορφῆ τε ἐλευθερία καὶ ἤθει αἰδήμονί τε καὶ γενναίω ψυχὴ εὐθὺς ἐν τοῖς ἤλιξιν ἡγεμονική τε ἄμα καὶ φιλόφρων οὖσα οὐδὲν ἐπιδεῖται λόγου ὅτι δὲ

#### SYMPOSIUM 8.12-8.16

"By Hera," said Hermogenes, "I admire you in many ways, Socrates, but now more than ever, because in flattering Callias you are in fact teaching him the sort of person he should be."

"True," he replied; "and to add to his pleasure, I wish to bear witness to him that love of the soul is far superior to love of the body. For we all know that no association worth mentioning lacks friendship. Now friendship on the part of those who admire character is termed a pleasant and willing constraint, whereas many of those who are after the body find fault with the behavior of their beloveds and detest it. But suppose they are satisfied on both scores: still the bloom of youth soon passes its prime, and as this disappears, friendship also inevitably fades away as fast: but the soul becomes more and more worth loving the longer it progresses toward wisdom. Besides, in the enjoyment of physical beauty there is a point of satiety, so that one cannot help feeling for his favorite the same as he feels for food when he's full. But affection for the soul, being pure, is also less liable to satiety, though it does not follow, as one might suppose, that it is also less rich in the graces of Aphrodite; on the contrary, our prayer that the goddess will bestow her grace on our words and deeds is manifestly answered.

"Now no further argument is necessary to show that there is both admiration and affection for the beloved in a soul verdant with the beauty of freeborn men and with a disposition reverent and noble, a soul that from the very 12

13

14

15

εἰκὸς καὶ ὑπὸ τῶν παιδικῶν τὸν τοιοῦτον ἐραστὴν ἀντιφιλεῖσθαι, καὶ τοῦτο διδάξω, πρώτον μὲν γὰρ τίς 17 μισείν δύναιτ' ἂν ὑφ' οὖ εἰδείη καλός τε κάγαθὸς νομιζόμενος, έπειτα δὲ ὁρώη αὐτὸν τὰ τοῦ παιδὸς καλὰ μᾶλλον ἢ τὰ ἐαυτοῦ ἡδέα σπουδάζοντα, πρὸς δὲ τούτοις πιστεύοι μήτ' αν παρανοήση<sup>19</sup> μήτ' αν καμών άμορφότερος γένηται, μειωθήναι αν την φιλίαν: οίς 18 γε μὴν κοινὸν τὸ φιλεῖσθαι, πῶς οὐκ ἀνάγκη τούτους ήδέως μεν προσοράν άλλήλους, εὐνοϊκώς δε διαλέγεσθαι, πιστεύειν δὲ καὶ πιστεύεσθαι, καὶ προνοεῖν μὲν άλλήλων, συνήδεσθαι δὲ ἐπὶ ταῖς καλαῖς πράξεσι, συνάχθεσθαι δὲ ἤν τι σφάλμα προσπίπτη, τότε δ' εύφραινομένους διατελείν όταν ύγιαίνοντες συνώσιν, ην δε κάμη όποτεροσούν, πολύ συνεχεστέραν την συνουσίαν έχειν, καὶ ἀπόντων ἔτι μᾶλλον ἢ παρόντων έπιμελεῖσθαι; οὐ ταῦτα πάντα ἐπαφρόδιτα; διά γέ τοι τὰ τοιαῦτα ἔργα ἄμα ἐρῶντες τῆς φιλίας καὶ χρώμενοι αὐτη εἰς γηρας διατελοῦσι, τὸν δὲ ἐκ τοῦ σώματος 19 κρεμάμενον διὰ τί ἀντιφιλήσειεν ἂν ὁ παῖς; πότερον ότι έαυτῷ μὲν νέμει ὧν ἐπιθυμεῖ, τῷ δὲ παιδὶ τὰ έπονειδιστότατα; η διότι α σπεύδει πράττειν παρα τῶν παιδικῶν, εἴργει μάλιστα τοὺς οἰκείους ἀπὸ τούτων; καὶ μὴν ὅτι γε οὐ βιάζεται, ἀλλὰ πείθει, διὰ 20 τοῦτο μᾶλλον μισητέος. ὁ μὲν γὰρ βιαζόμενος έαυτὸν πονηρον αποδεικνύει, ο δε πείθων την του αναπειθομένου ψυχὴν διαφθείρει. άλλὰ μὴν καὶ ὁ χρημάτων 21 γε ἀπεμπολῶν τὴν ὥραν τί μᾶλλον στέρξει τὸν πριάμενον ἢ ὁ ἐν ἀγορᾳ πωλῶν καὶ ἀποδιδόμενος; οὐ μὴν

#### SYMPOSIUM 8 16-8 21

first is commanding among its own age-mates and also kind but I will further show that such a lover will have his love returned. First, who could feel dislike for someone he knows considers him a gentleman, and in the next place saw that he placed more importance on the boy's good than his own pleasure, and in addition felt assured that this friendship would not be diminished whether he lost his mind or, through illness, his good looks? When people share friendship don't they unavoidably enjoy looking at each other, converse in amity, have mutual trust, and not only take thought for each other but also share joy in prosperity and distress if some setback befalls, and live in happiness when their relationship is attended by good health, but be much more constantly together if one or the other falls ill, and be even more solicitous for each other when apart than when together? Aren't all these things marked by Aphrodite's grace? It is by conducting themselves thus that men continue mutually to love their friendship and enjoy it clear down to old age. But what is there to induce reciprocal affection from a boy whose lover is hooked solely on his body? Because to himself the lover allots what he wants but to the boy only the most contemptible role? Or because he does his best to bar his own relatives from doing what he is bent on getting his favorite to do? As for his using seduction rather than coercion, that makes him all the more detestable: the rapist merely reveals his own rascality, while the seducer corrupts the soul of the seduced. And why will someone who sells his youthfulness for money feel greater affection for the purchaser than the tradesman in the market for the customer? He certainly

17

18

19

20

<sup>19</sup> PGiss. 175: παρά τι νοήση codd.

ὅτι γε ὡραῖος ἀώρῳ, οὐδὲ ὅτι γε καλὸς οὐκέτι καλῷ καὶ ἐρῶντι οὐκ ἐρῶν ὁμιλεῖ φιλήσει αὐτόν. οὐδὲ γὰρ ὁ παῖς τῷ ἀνδρὶ ὥσπερ γυνὴ κοινωνεῖ τῶν ἐν τοῖς ἀφροδισίοις εὐφροσυνῶν, ἀλλὰ νήφων μεθύοντα ὑπὸ τῆς ᾿Αφροδίτης θεᾶται. ἐξ ὧν οὐδὲν θαυμαστὸν εἰ καὶ τὸ ὑπερορῶν ἐγγίγνεται αὐτῷ τοῦ ἐραστοῦ. καὶ σκοπῶν δ' ἄν τις εὕροι ἐκ μὲν τῶν διὰ τοὺς τρόπους φιλουμένων οὐδὲν χαλεπὸν γεγενημένον, ἐκ δὲ τῆς ἀναιδοῦς ὁμιλίας πολλὰ ἤδη καὶ ἀνόσια πεπραγμένα.

'Ως δὲ καὶ ἀνελεύθερος ἡ συνουσία τῶ τὸ σῶμα μαλλον ἢ τῶ τὴν ψυχὴν ἀγαπῶντι, νῦν τοῦτο δηλώσω, ὁ μὲν γὰρ παιδεύων λέγειν τε ἃ δεῖ καὶ πράττειν δικαίως αν ωσπερ Χείρων και Φοινιξ ύπ' Άχιλλέως τιμώτο, ὁ δὲ τοῦ σώματος ὀρεγόμενος εἰκότως αν ώσπερ πτωχὸς περιέποιτο, ἀεὶ γάρ τοι προσαιτών καὶ προσδεόμενος ἢ φιλήματος ἢ ἄλλου τινὸς ψηλαφήματος παρακολουθεί, εί δε λαμυρώτερον λέγω, μή θαυμάζετε ὅ τε γὰρ οἶνος συνεπαίρει καὶ ὁ ἀεὶ σύνοικος έμοὶ έρως κεντρίζει είς τὸν ἀντίπαλον έρωτα αὐτῷ παρρησιάζεσθαι. καὶ γὰρ δὴ δοκεῖ μοι ὁ μὲν τῷ εἴδει τὸν νοῦν προσέχων μεμισθωμένω χῶρον ἐοικέναι, οὐ γὰρ ὅπως πλείονος ἄξιος γένηται ἐπιμελεῖται, άλλ' ὅπως αὐτὸς ὅτι πλεῖστα ὡραῖα καρπώσεται. ὁ δὲ της φιλίας έφιέμενος μαλλον έοικε τω τον οἰκείον άγρον κεκτημένω πάντοθεν γοῦν φέρων ὅ τι αν δύνηται πλείονος ἄξιον ποιεί τὸν ἐρώμενον, καὶ μὴν καὶ των παιδικών δς μέν αν είδη ότι ό του είδους έπαρκων ἄρξει τοῦ ἐραστοῦ, εἰκὸς αὐτὸν τἄλλα ῥαδιουργεῖν· ὃς

22

23

24

25

won't feel affectionate as a youthful companion for someone past it, or handsome for someone no longer handsome, or unimpassioned for someone impassioned. For a boy does not share in the pleasure of intercourse as a woman does, but looks on sober at another intoxicated by love. Consequently it's no surprise if contempt for the lover develops in him. And research would show that when people love each other for the way they are there's never any difficulty, but from shameless intercourse has come lots of unwholesome behavior.

22

23

"I will now show also that the companionship of a man who takes pleasure in the body rather than the soul is servile. The man who inculcates right speech and conduct would merit the honor shown by Achilles to Cheiron and Phoenix, 35 but the man who lusts only for the body would fittingly be treated as a beggar; for he dogs along, always begging and beseeching the favor of a kiss or a grope. Don't be surprised at my plain speaking: the wine incites me and the love that ever dwells with me spurs me on to say frankly what I think about its antagonist. For it seems to me that the man who pays attention only to looks is like a tenant farmer: his concern is not to increase its value but to gain from it the biggest harvest he can. By contrast, the man whose goal is friendship is more like the owner of a farm: he draws from all resources to enhance his beloved's value. So too for beloveds: the one who realizes that merely by flaunting his looks he can master his lover will predictably become loose in his general conduct; but

0.4

25

<sup>35</sup> Cheiron, the just centaur, and Phoenix, an exile received into the household of Peleus, were both tutors to the young Achilles.

δ' αν γιγνώσκη ὅτι αν μὴ καλὸς κἀγαθὸς ἢ, οὐ καθέξει τὴν φιλίαν, τοῦτον προσήκει μᾶλλον ἀρετῆς ἐπιμελεῖσθαι. μέγιστον δ' ἀγαθὸν τῷ ὀρεγομένῳ ἐκ παιδικῶν φίλον ἀγαθὸν ποιήσασθαι ὅτι ἀνάγκη καὶ
αὐτὸν ἀσκεῖν ἀρετήν. οὐ γὰρ οἶόν τε πονηρὰ αὐτὸν
ποιοῦντα ἀγαθὸν τὸν συνόντα ἀποδεῖξαι, οὐδέ γε
ἀναισχυντίαν καὶ ἀκρασίαν παρεχόμενον ἐγκρατῆ
καὶ αἰδούμενον τὸν ἐρώμενον ποιῆσαι.

Ἐπιθυμῶ δέ σοι, ἔφη, ὧ Καλλία, καὶ μυθολογῆσαι ὡς οὐ μόνον ἄνθρωποι ἀλλὰ καὶ θεοὶ καὶ ἥρωες τὴν τῆς ψυχῆς φιλίαν περὶ πλείονος ἢ τὴν τοῦ σώματος χρῆσιν ποιοῦνται. Ζεύς τε γὰρ ὅσων μὲν θνητῶν οὐσῶν μορφῆς ἤράσθη, συγγενόμενος εἴα αὐτὰς θνητὰς εἶναι· ὅσων δὲ ψυχαῖς ἀγασθείη, ἀθανάτους τούτους ἐποίει· ὧν Ἡρακλῆς μὲν καὶ Διόσκοροί εἰσι, λέγονται δὲ καὶ ἄλλοι· καὶ ἐγὰ δέ φημι καὶ Γανυμήδην οὐσώματος ἀλλὰ ψυχῆς ἔνεκα ὑπὸ Διὸς εἰς Ὅλυμπον ἀνενεχθῆναι. μαρτυρεῖ δὲ καὶ τοὔνομα αὐτοῦ· ἔστι μὲν γὰρ δήπου καὶ Ὁμήρω,

γάνυται δέ τ' ἀκούων

τοῦτο δὲ φράζει ὅτι ἥδεται δέ τ' ἀκούων. ἔστι δὲ καὶ ἄλλοθί που.

πυκινὰ φρεσὶ μήδεα εἰδώς

τοῦτο δ' αὖ λέγει σοφὰ φρεσὶ βουλεύματα εἰδώς. ἐξ οὖν συναμφοτέρων τούτων οὐχ ἡδυσώματος ὀνομα-

27

28

29

the one who recognizes that he can't hold on to the friendship without being a gentleman too is bound to have concern for excellence. But the greatest good that comes to the man who strives to make a true friend of his favorite is having to practice excellence himself. He can't produce goodness in his companion while his own conduct is evil, nor can he himself exhibit shamelessness and incontinence and at the same time render his beloved selfcontrolled and reverent.

"I also want to invoke the myths, Callias, in order to show you that not only humankind but also gods and heroes set higher value on the friendship of the soul than on the enjoyment of the body. For in all cases where Zeus was enamored of mortal women for their beauty, after sex he allowed them to remain mortal, but all those whom he delighted in for their souls' sake he made immortal. Among the latter are Heracles and the Dioscuri, 36 and tradition includes others also. And I declare that Ganymede too was brought up to Olympus by Zeus not for his body but for his soul. This is confirmed by his very name: Homer, you remember, has the words. 37

'he joys to hear'

that is to say, 'he enjoys hearing;' and in another place,

'harboring dense thoughts in his heart'

This, again, means 'harboring wise counsels in his heart.' So the name given Ganymede, compounded of the two foregoing elements, signifies not *physically* but *mentally* 

27

28

29

<sup>36</sup> Castor and Pollux.

<sup>37</sup> Neither phrase is found in our texts of Homer.

σθεὶς ὁ Γανυμήδης ἀλλ' ἡδυγνώμων ἐν θεοῖς τετίμη31 ται. ἀλλὰ μήν, ὧ Νικήρατε, καὶ ἀχιλλεὺς Ὁμήρῳ πεποίηται οὐχ ὡς παιδικοῖς Πατρόκλῳ ἀλλ' ὡς ἐταίρῳ ἀποθανόντι ἐκπρεπέστατα τιμωρῆσαι. καὶ Ὀρέστης δὲ καὶ Πυλάδης καὶ Θησεὺς καὶ Πειρίθους καὶ ἄλλοι δὲ πολλοὶ τῶν ἡμιθέων οἱ ἄριστοι ὑμνοῦνται οὐ διὰ τὸ συγκαθεύδειν ἀλλὰ διὰ τὸ ἄγασθαι ἀλλήλους τὰ μέγιστα καὶ κάλλιστα κοινῆ διαπεπρᾶχθαι.

Τί δέ: τὰ νῦν καλὰ ἔργα οὐ πάντ' ἂν εὕροι τις ἕνεκα έπαίνου ύπὸ τῶν καὶ πονεῖν καὶ κινδυνεύειν ἐθελόντων πραττόμενα μᾶλλον ἢ ὑπὸ τῶν ἐθιζομένων ἡδονὴν άντ' εὐκλείας αἰρεῖσθαι; καίτοι Παυσανίας γε ό Άγάθωνος τοῦ ποιητοῦ έραστὴς ἀπολογούμενος ὑπὲρ τῶν ἀκρασία συγκαλινδουμένων εἴρηκεν ὡς καὶ στράτευμα άλκιμώτατον ἂν γένοιτο ἐκ παιδικῶν τε καὶ έραστῶν. τούτους γὰρ ἂν ἔφη οἴεσθαι μάλιστα αἰδεῖσθαι άλλήλους άπολείπειν, θαυμαστά λέγων, εί γε οί ψόγου τε άφροντιστείν καὶ άναισχυντείν πρὸς άλλήλους έθιζόμενοι οὖτοι μάλιστα αἰσχυνοῦνται αἰσχρόν τι ποιείν. καὶ μαρτύρια δὲ ἐπήγετο ὡς ταῦτα έγνωκότες είεν καὶ Θηβαίοι καὶ Ἡλείοι συγκαθεύδοντας γοῦν αὐτοῖς ὅμως παρατάττεσθαι ἔφη τὰ παιδικὰ είς τὸν ἀγῶνα, οὐδὲν τοῦτο σημεῖον λέγων ὅμοιον. έκείνοις μεν γαρ ταθτα νόμιμα, ημίν δ' έπονείδιστα.

32

33

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>38</sup> Socrates etymologizes the name Ganymede as a compound of the two archaic words *ganytai* (he joys, exults) and *medea* (devices, thoughts).

attractive;<sup>38</sup> hence his honor among the gods. Or again, Niceratus, Homer makes Achilles view Patroclus not as his favorite but as a comrade, and in this spirit signally avenging his death. So also Orestes, Pylades, Theseus, Peirithous, and many another of the best demigods are celebrated in song for achieving glorious deeds of valor side by side, not because they slept together but because of mutual admiration and respect.

"For that matter, take the splendid feats of the present day: wouldn't vou discover that they are all done for glory's sake by people willing to endure hardship and jeopardy rather than by people with a habit of choosing pleasure before glory? Yet Pausanias, the lover of the poet Agathon, said in his defense of those who wallow in lasciviousness that the most valiant army, even, would be one recruited of lovers and their favorites!<sup>39</sup> For these, he said, would in his opinion be most likely to be ashamed to desert one another: a strange assertion indeed if those in the habit of disregarding censure and treating each other with disrespect are the ones most likely to be ashamed of doing something dishonorable. And he even produced as examples both the Thebans and the Eleans, 40 whose policy he said this was; at any rate, though they slept with their favorites, he said, they assigned them places alongside themselves in the battle line. But this is a false analogy: such practices, though normal among them, with us are

31

32

33

 $<sup>^{39}</sup>$  In Pl. Smp. this idea belongs rather to Phaedrus (178e3–79a8).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>40</sup> The Theban "Sacred Band" of three hundred existed from ca. 378 to 338 (Plu. *Pel.* 18); the Elean is otherwise unattested.

δοκοῦσι δ' ἔμοιγε οἱ μὲν παραταττόμενοι ἀπιστοῦσιν ἐοικέναι μὴ χωρὶς γενόμενοι οἱ ἐρώμενοι οὐκ ἀποτελῶσι τὰ τῶν ἀγαθῶν ἀνδρῶν ἔργα. Λακεδαιμόνιοι δὲ οἱ νομίζοντες, ἐὰν καὶ ὀρεχθἢ τις σώματος, μηδενὸς ἂν ἔτι καλοῦ κἀγαθοῦ τοῦτον τυχεῖν, οὕτως τελέως τοὺς ἐρωμένους ἀγαθοὺς ἀπεργάζονται ὡς καὶ μετὰ ξένων κἂν μὴ ἐν τἢ αὐτἢ²0 ταχθῶσι τῷ ἐραστῆ, ὁμοίως αἰδοῦνται τοὺς παρόντας ἀπολείπειν. θεὰν γὰρ οὐ τὴν ἀναίδειαν ἀλλὰ τὴν Αἰδῶ νομίζουσι. δοκοῦμεν δ' ἄν μοι πάντες ὁμόλογοι γενέσθαι περὶ ὧν λέγω, εἰ ὧδε ἐπισκοποῦμεν, τῷ ποτέρως παιδὶ φιληθέντι μᾶλλον ἄν τις πιστεύσειεν ἢ χρήματα ἢ τέκνα ἢ χάριτας παρακατατίθεσθαι. ἐγὼ μὲν γὰρ οἶμαι καὶ αὐτὸν τὸν τῷ εἴδει τοῦ ἐρωμένου χρώμενον μᾶλλον ἂν ταῦτα πάντα τῷ τὴν ψυχὴν ἐρασμίφ πιστεῦσαι.

Σοί γε μήν, ὧ Καλλία, δοκεὶ μοι ἄξιον εἶναι καὶ θεοῖς χάριν εἰδέναι ὅτι σοι Αὐτολύκου ἔρωτα ἐνέβαλον. ὡς μὲν γὰρ φιλότιμός ἐστιν εὕδηλον, ὡς τοῦ κηρυχθῆναι ἔνεκα νικῶν παγκράτιον πολλοὺς μὲν πόνους, πολλὰ δ' ἄλγη ἀνέχεται. εἰ δὲ οἴοιτο μὴ μόνον ἑαυτὸν καὶ τὸν πατέρα κοσμήσειν, ἀλλ' ἱκανὸς γενήσεσθαι δι' ἀνδραγαθίαν καὶ φίλους εὖ ποιεῖν καὶ τὴν πατρίδα αὕξειν τρόπαια τῶν πολεμίων ἱστάμενος, καὶ διὰ ταῦτα περίβλεπτός τε καὶ ὀνομαστὸς ἔσεσθαι καὶ ἐν Ἔλλησι καὶ ἐν βαρβάροις, πῶς οὐκ οἴει αὐτόν, ὅντιν' ἡγοῖτο εἰς ταῦτα συνεργὸν εἶναι κράτιστον,

 $^{20}$  αὐτ $\hat{\eta}$  Sauppe: αὐτ $\hat{\eta}$  πόλει codd.

35

36

37

#### SYMPOSIUM 8.34-8.38

regarded as reprehensible. My own view is that those who assign these posts in battle betray suspicion that their beloveds, if left by themselves, will not carry out the duties of brave men. In contrast to this, the Spartans, who hold that no one who so much as feels a carnal urge will ever amount to anything outstanding, render their beloveds so consummately brave that even when arrayed with foreigners and even when not stationed in the same line with their lovers they just as surely feel ashamed to desert their comrades. The goddess they worship is not Shamelessness but Shame. We could all agree, I think, on the point I'm trying to make if we considered it this way: of two boys, the objects of the different types of love, which one would a person prefer to trust with his money, or his children, or to lay under the obligation of a favor? My own belief is that even the person whose love is founded on the beloved's looks would rather entrust each of these to the one lovely of soul.

"In your case, Callias, I think the gods deserve your thanks for inspiring you with love for Autolycus. His ardor for glory is obvious, inasmuch as he endures many toils and pains so as to be proclaimed victor in the pancratium. Now if he were to believe that he is going not merely to shed luster on himself and his father but also to acquire through his manly excellence the ability to serve his friends and to exalt his country by setting up trophies of victory over its enemies, and thus to draw the admiring glances of all and be famous among both Greeks and barbarians, don't you suppose that he would esteem and honor highly anyone he considered the best partner in

655

35

36

37

τούτον ταίς μεγίσταις αν τιμαίς περιέπειν: εί οὖν 39 Βούλει τούτω ἀρέσκειν, σκεπτέον μέν σοι ποῖα ἐπιστάμενος Θεμιστοκλής ίκανὸς ένένετο τὴν Ἑλλάδα έλευθερούν, σκεπτέον δὲ ποῖά ποτε εἰδὼς Περικλῆς κράτιστος έδόκει τη πατρίδι σύμβουλος είναι, άθρητέον δὲ καὶ πῶς ποτε Σόλων φιλοσοφήσας νόμους κρατίστους τῆ πόλει κατέθηκεν, ἐρευνητέον δὲ καὶ ποία Λακεδαιμόνιοι ἀσκοῦντες κράτιστοι δοκοῦσιν ήγεμόνες είναι πρόξενος δ' εί και κατάγονται άει παρὰ σοὶ οἱ κράτιστοι αὐτῶν, ὡς μὲν οὖν σοι ἡ πόλις 40 ταχὺ ἂν ἐπιτρέψειεν αύτήν, εἰ βούλει, εὖ ἴσθι. τὰ μέγιστα γάρ σοι ὑπάρχει εὐπατρίδης εἶ, τῶν ἀπ' Ἐρεχθέως, ίερεὺς θεῶν21 οι καὶ ἐπὶ τὸν βάρβαρον σὺν Ίάκχω έστράτευσαν, καὶ νῦν ἐν τῆ ἑορτῆ ἱεροπρεπέστατος δοκείς είναι των προγεγενημένων, καὶ σώμα άξιοπρεπέστατον μεν ίδειν τής πόλεως έχεις, ίκανον δὲ μόχθους ὑποφέρειν. εἰ δ' ὑμῖν δοκῶ σπουδαιολο-41 γησαι μάλλον η παρά πότον πρέπει, μηδέ τοῦτο θαυμάζετε. ἀγαθῶν γὰρ φύσει καὶ τῆς ἀρετῆς φιλοτίμως έφιεμένων ἀεί ποτε τῆ πόλει συνεραστης ὢν διατελώ.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>21</sup> Todd:  $i\epsilon\rho\epsilon\dot{\nu}s$   $\theta\epsilon\hat{\omega}\nu$   $\tau\hat{\omega}\nu$   $\dot{a}\pi$  ' $E\rho\epsilon\chi\theta\epsilon\omega s$  codd.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>41</sup> A local native representative of another state.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>42</sup> Callias' family belonged to the priestly clan of the Ceryces, who traced their lineage back to Ceryx, son of Hermes and Aglaurus, who, however, was not a descendant of Erechtheus but one of his nurses.

<sup>43</sup> Herodotus (8.65) and Plutarch (Them. 15) report the tradi-

furthering all this? So if you want to be in his good graces, you must try to find out what sort of knowledge it was that enabled Themistocles to liberate Greece; you must try to find out what kind of knowledge it was that got Pericles recognized as his country's best counselor; you must reflect, further, how it was that Solon by deep thought established in his city the best laws; you must search out what kind of practices they are that give the Spartans the reputation of being preeminent military commanders; for you are their proxenos,<sup>41</sup> and their foremost citizens are always being entertained at your house. You may regard it as certain, therefore, that our city would be quick to entrust itself to your hands, if you so desire. You possess the highest qualifications for such a trust: you are of noble birth, of Erechtheus' line, 42 a priest serving the gods who under the leadership of Iacchus took the field against the barbarian;<sup>43</sup> and in today's festival you outshine your predecessors in the splendor of your priestly office, and you possess a physique more impressive to the eye than any other in the city and at the same time able to withstand effort and hardship. If what I say strikes you as too earnest for a drinking party, even so, don't be surprised: during practically all my life I have shared the city's love for men who add to a nature already good a zealous desire for excellence."

tion that while the Greek fleet was at anchor near Salamis just before the critical sea fight, great elation was caused at the sight of a great cloud of dust (or, in the later version, a brilliant light) off toward Eleusis, and a wonderful sound as of the Eleusinian festival with its cries to Iacchus (~ Dionysus), followed by a cloud that drifted directly toward the fleet.

39

**4**0

42 Οἱ μὲν δὴ ἄλλοι περὶ τῶν ῥηθέντων διελέγοντο, ὁ δ᾽ Αὐτόλυκος κατεθεᾶτο τὸν Καλλίαν. καὶ ὁ Καλλίας δὲ παρορῶν εἰς ἐκεῖνον εἶπεν Οὐκοῦν σύ με, ὧ Σώκρατες, μαστροπεύσεις πρὸς τὴν πόλιν, ὅπως πράττω τὰ πολιτικὰ καὶ ἀεὶ ἀρεστὸς ὧ αὐτῆ;

Ναὶ μὰ Δί, ἔφη, ἢν ὁρῶσί γέ σε μὴ τῷ δοκεῖν ἀλλὰ τῷ ὄντι ἀρετῆς ἐπιμελούμενον. ἡ μὲν γὰρ ψευδὴς δόξα ταχὺ ἐλέγχεται ὑπὸ τῆς πείρας ἡ δ' ἀληθὴς ἀνδραγαθία, ἢν μὴ θεὸς βλάπτῃ, ἀεὶ ἐν ταῖς πράξεσι λαμπροτέραν τὴν εὕκλειαν συμπαρέχεται.

9. Οὖτος μὲν δὴ ὁ λόγος ἐνταῦθα ἔληξεν. Αὐτόλυκος δέ, ἤδη γὰρ ὥρα ἦν αὐτῷ, ἐξανίστατο εἰς περίπατον καὶ ὁ Λύκων ὁ πατὴρ αὐτῷ συνεξιὼν ἐπιστραφεὶς εἶπε· Νὴ τὴν Ἡραν, ὧ Σώκρατες, καλός γε κἀγαθὸς δοκεῖς μοι ἄνθρωπος εἶναι.

Ἐκ δὲ τούτου πρῶτον μὲν θρόνος τις ἔνδον κατετέθη, ἔπειτα δὲ ὁ Συρακόσιος εἰσελθὼν εἶπεν ³Ω ἄνδρες, ᾿Αριάδνη εἴσεισιν εἰς τὸν ἑαυτῆς τε καὶ Διονύσου θάλαμον μετὰ δὲ τοῦθ' ἥξει Διόνυσος ὑποπεπωκὼς παρὰ θεοῖς καὶ εἴσεισι πρὸς αὐτήν, ἔπειτα παιξοῦνται πρὸς ἀλλήλους.

Έκ τούτου πρώτον μὲν ἡ Ἀριάδνη ὡς νύμφη κεκοσμημένη παρῆλθε καὶ ἐκαθέζετο ἐπὶ τοῦ θρόνου. οὕπω δὲ φαινομένου τοῦ Διονύσου ηὐλεῖτο ὁ βακχεῖος ρυθμός. ἔνθα δὴ ἠγάσθησαν τὸν ὀρχηστοδιδάσκαλον. εὐθὺς μὲν γὰρ ἡ Ἀριάδνη ἀκούσασα τοιοῦτόν τι ἐποίησεν ὡς πᾶς ἂν ἔγνω ὅτι ἀσμένη ἤκουσε· καὶ ὑπήντησε μὲν οῦ οὐδὲ ἀνέστη, δήλη δ' ἦν μόλις ἠρε-

43

2

The rest of the company began to discuss what he had propounded, but Autolycus kept his eyes fixed on Callias. And Callias, addressing Socrates but looking beyond him and returning the gaze of Autolycus, said: "So you mean to play the procurer, do you, Socrates, bringing me to the attention of the city, so that I can enter politics and stay in her good graces?"

"Assuredly," was the reply, "if they see that you're cultivating excellence not for show but for real. False reputation is soon exposed when tested, whereas true manly excellence, unless a god spikes it, confers an ever more brilliant glory when put to the test of actual deeds."

9. That conversation ended there. Autolycus got up to go out for a walk, as per his schedule, and his father Lycon left with him but turned around to say, "So help me Hera, Socrates, you seem to me a true gentleman."

After that a chair of state, first of all, was set down in the room, and then the Syracusan came in with the announcement: "Gentlemen, Ariadne will now enter the chamber she shares with Dionysus; then Dionysus, having got tipsy with the gods, will come join her; and then they will play with each other."

With that, in came Ariadne, decked out as a bride, and took her seat in the chair. Before Dionysus was visible, the Bacchic tune was played on the pipes. Then they truly admired the dancing master, for as soon as Ariadne heard the tune, her action was such that every one would have perceived her joy at the sound; and although she did not go to meet Dionysus or even rise, it was clear that she only

43

3

42

μοῦσα, ἐπεί γε μὴν κατείδεν αὐτὴν ὁ Διόνυσος, ἐπι-4 χορεύσας ὥσπερ ἂν εἴ τις φιλικώτατα ἐκαθέζετο ἐπὶ τῶν γονάτων καὶ περιλαβὼν ἐφίλησεν αὐτήν. ἡ δ' αίδουμένη μεν έφκει, όμως δε φιλικώς αντιπεριελάμ-Βανεν. οἱ δὲ συμπόται ὁρῶντες ἄμα μὲν ἐκρότουν, αμα δὲ ἐβόων Αὖθις. ὡς δὲ ὁ Διόνυσος ἀνιστάμενος 5 συνανέστησε μεθ' έαυτοῦ τὴν Αριάδνην, έκ τούτου δὴ φιλούντων τε καὶ ἀσπαζομένων ἀλλήλους σχήματα παρήν θεάσασθαι, οί δ' όρωντες όντως καλον μεν τον Διόνυσον, ώραίαν δὲ τὴν ᾿Αριάδνην, οὐ σκώπτοντας δὲ ἀλλ' ἀληθινῶς τοῖς στόμασι φιλοῦντας, πάντες άνεπτερωμένοι έθεωντο, καὶ γὰρ ἤκουον τοῦ Διονύσου 6 μεν έπερωτώντος αὐτὴν εἰ φιλεῖ αὐτόν, τῆς δε οὕτως έπομνυούσης ὥστε μὴ μόνον τὸν Διόνυσον <...>22 άλλὰ καὶ τοὺς παρόντας ἄπαντας συνομόσαι ἂν ἦ μὴν τὸν παίδα καὶ τὴν παίδα ὑπ' ἀλλήλων φιλείσθαι. έφκεσαν γάρ οὐ δεδιδαγμένοις τὰ σχήματα άλλ' έφειμένοις πράττειν ἃ πάλαι ἐπεθύμουν. τέλος δὲ οί συμπόται ίδόντες περιβεβληκότας τε άλλήλους καὶ ώς είς εὐνὴν ἀπιόντας, οἱ μὲν ἄγαμοι γαμεῖν ἐπώμνυσαν, οί δὲ γεγαμηκότες ἀναβάντες ἐπὶ τοὺς ἵππους ἀπήλαυνον πρὸς τὰς ξαυτών γυναϊκας, ὅπως τούτων τύχοιεν. Σωκράτης δε καὶ τῶν ἄλλων οἱ ὑπομείναντες πρὸς Λύκωνα καὶ τὸν υίὸν σὺν Καλλία περιπατήσον- $\tau \epsilon s \ \dot{a}\pi \hat{\eta} \lambda \theta o \nu$ .

Αὕτη τοῦ τότε συμποσίου κατάλυσις ἐγένετο.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>22</sup> Schenkl

#### SYMPOSIUM 9.4-9.7

just kept her composure. But when Dionysus caught sight of her, he came dancing toward her and in a most loving manner fell to his knees, put his arms around her, and gave her a kiss. Her demeanor was all modesty, but she returned his embrace with affection. As the banqueters saw it, they kept clapping and crying "encore!" Now Dionysus arose and gave his hand to Ariadne to rise also, and then there were the movements of lovers kissing and caressing each other to watch. The onlookers saw a Dionysus truly handsome, an Ariadne truly fair, not presenting a burlesque but offering genuine kisses with their lips; and all watched with heightened excitement. For they overheard Dionysus asking her if she loved him and heard her vowing that she did, so earnestly that not only Dionysus <. . .> but all the bystanders as well would have jointly sworn that the boy and the girl were surely in love with each other. Theirs was the appearance not of performers who had been taught their moves but of people now permitted to satisfy their long-cherished desires. At last the banqueters, seeing them in each other's arms and obviously heading for the bridal bed, the bachelors swore that they would get married and the married men mounted their horses and rode off to their own wives so that they might enjoy them. As for Socrates and the others who had lingered behind, they went out with Callias to join Lycon and his son on their walk.

So broke up the banquet held that evening.



# **APOLOGY**

# INTRODUCTION

In the year 399 BC, Socrates, then about seventy years old, was brought to trial by Anytus, Meletus, and Lycon on an indictment charging subversion of the city's gods and corrupting its young men. The fullest extant account of Socrates at this crisis is to be found in Plato's Euthyphro, Apology, Crito, and Phaedo. Of these, Apology gives a version of what Socrates said in his own defense at his trial in 399 and is probably accurate in its essentials: Plato was an eyewitness (34a1, 38b6) and could not have published his Apology so long after the event that he could get away with significantly falsifying what he reports Socrates as having said, and thus undermining the work's clear purpose. Xenophon's Apology, by contrast, is neither a full nor a firsthand account: Xenophon, who was far from Athens during the trial and for many years thereafter, relies on reports by Socrates' companion Hermogenes in order to answer a fundamental question about Socrates' defense that he thought previously published accounts left open: why did Socrates adopt such a cocky attitude if he expected his defense to be taken seriously? As Xenophon and Hermogenes explain it, Socrates deliberately invited condemnation: his divine sign forbade him to plan a defense, which he interpreted as signifying that the trial of-

#### APOLOGY

fered "the opportunity of ending my life not only at the right juncture but also in the easiest way" (7); that is, before the onset of senility and the burden it would place on his friends.

The first sentence of this composition, like that of *Oeconomicus*, seems to connect with something preceding, suggesting that it might have been intended to be part of a larger whole, perhaps the *Memorabilia*, where, in the last chapter (4.8), we find practically the same material. Almost equally indeterminate is the date. It is clear that when our *Apology* was written, Anytus had been dead several years, and some accounts of the trial had already appeared. If *Ap.* 29–31 react to Plato's rather lenient portrayal of Anytus in *Meno*, we would have a date no earlier than the mid-380s.

Hermogenes, the indigent brother of the rich Callias, appears, both from Xenophon's *Apology* and *Symposium* and from Plato, to have been an intimate in the Socratic circle. Although he is not mentioned in the doubtless incomplete list given in Plato's *Apology* (33d–34a) of friends and disciples present at the trial, he is named in Plato's *Phaedo* (59b) as one of those who were with Socrates at the time of his execution.

Xenophon includes elements of the defense that also appear in Plato's account, though they often differ in detail or interpretation: Chaerephon's oracle, Socrates' cocky at-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Note also the correspondences between Ap. 2-21 (Socrates speaking) and Mem. 1.2.1–20 (Xenophon speaking).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Date unknown: the grain inspector of that name mentioned by Lysias in 387 (22.8) need not be the same man.

#### XENOPHON

titude (though shaded toward irony by Plato), his refusal to speak, as was expected of defendants (and the resulting hubbub), his cross-examination of Meletus, his reliance on a divine sign, his hope of communion with great men of the past (in this case, Palamedes), his rejection of a plan to escape. Both omit any mention of Socrates' alleged malign influence on Critias and Alcibiades, which was prominent among the charges (cf. Mem. 1.2.12 ff., 4.8) and had been stressed in Polycrates' anti-Socratic Accusation (Kατηγορία), published sometime after 393.

Equally salient are the differences; for example, Xenophon's claim that Socrates' friends spoke on his behalf and that he offered no alternative penalty. In some passages (e.g., the boasting in 14 ff.), Socrates is pretty clearly being used as Xenophon's mouthpiece. In contrast to the central claim, that Socrates sought an easy escape from old age. Plato represents him as telling the jury that he can face death calmly because of his confidence in an afterlife (a doctrine elaborated in the Phaedo). Just as Xenophon never mentions this belief either in the Apology or in the Memorabilia, so Plato never mentions fear of old age as a motive.3 It is possible that in conversation Socrates had mentioned this commonplace comfort as one reason for his willingness to die, perhaps hoping that here at least was an argument that would appeal to his less metaphysical friends, but either Plato did not hear it or thought it not worth recording beside more spiritual thoughts.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> One would have to read this into his remark at the close of the defense that "this is clear to me, that it would be better for me to die now and once and for all be rid of troubles" (41d).

# APOLOGY

# TEXT

Ollier's Budé and Schmoll's 1990 study have clarified the tradition, so that the text can be based on the twelfthcentury manuscript Vaticanus graecus 1335 (B), supplemented by readings found in manuscripts of the early fifth-century anthologist Stobaeus, who quotes chapters 25-28 (Anthol. 3.7). There is one papyrus, POslo III 170 (AD 2).

# **EDITIONS**

- Macleod, M. D. Xénophon: Apology and Memorabilia I. Oxford, 2008.
- Marchant, E. C. Xenophontis Opera<sup>2</sup>. Oxford, 1921.
- Ollier, F. Xénophon Banquet, Apologie de Socrate. Budé: Paris. 1961.
- Pucci, Pietro. Xenophon. Socrates' Defense. Introduction and Commentary. Amsterdam, 2002.

# GENERAL.

- Gray, V. J. "Xenophon's Defense of Socrates. The Rhetorical Background to the Socratic Problem." CQ 39 (1989): 136-40.
- Hansen, M. H. The Trial of Socrates: From the Athenian Point of View. Copenhagen, 1995. Schmoll, E. A. "The Manuscript Tradition of Xenophon's
- Apologia Socratis." GRBS (1990): 313-21.

# ΑΠΟΛΟΓΙΑ ΣΩΚΡΑΤΟΥΣ [ΠΡΟΣ ΤΟΥΣ ΔΙΚΑΣΤΑΣ]<sup>1</sup>

1. Σωκράτους δὲ ἄξιόν μοι δοκεῖ εἶναι μεμνῆσθαι καὶ ώς έπειδη έκλήθη είς την δίκην έβουλεύσατο περί τε της ἀπολογίας καὶ της τελευτης τοῦ βίου. γεγράφασι μεν οὖν περὶ τούτου καὶ ἄλλοι καὶ πάντες ἔτυχον τῆς μεγαληγορίας αὐτοῦ: ὧ καὶ δῆλον ὅτι τῷ ὄντι οὕτως έρρήθη ύπὸ Σωκράτους, ἀλλ' ὅτι ἤδη ἑαυτῶ ἡγεῖτο αίρετώτερον είναι τοῦ βίου θάνατον, τοῦτο οὐ διεσαφήνισαν ώστε άφρονεστέρα αὐτοῦ φαίνεται εἶναι ή μεγαληγορία. Έρμογένης μέντοι ὁ Ἱππονίκου έταιρός 2 τε ην αὐτῶ καὶ ἐξήγγειλε περὶ αὐτοῦ τοιαῦτα ὥστε πρέπουσαν φαίνεσθαι την μεγαληγορίαν αὐτοῦ τῆ διανοία. ἐκεῖνος γὰρ ἔφη ὁρῶν αὐτὸν περὶ πάντων μαλλον διαλεγόμενον ή περί της δίκης εἰπείν, Οὐκ έχρην μέντοι σκοπείν, ὧ Σώκρατες, καὶ ὅ τι ἀπολογήση; τὸν δὲ τὸ μὲν πρῶτον ἀποκρίνασθαι, Οὐ γὰρ δοκῶ σοι ἀπολογεῖσθαι μελετῶν διαβεβιωκέναι; ἐπεὶ δ' αὐτὸν² ἐρέσθαι, Πῶς; "Ότι οὐδὲν ἄδικον διαγεγένη-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> ΠΡΟΣ ΤΟΥΣ ΔΙΚΑΣΤΑΣ om. Stobaeus

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> αὐτὸς Schenkl

# SOCRATES' DEFENSE [TO THE JURY]

1. I think it worth memorializing also how Socrates, on being summoned to trial, deliberated about his defense and about the end of his life. It is true that others have written about this, and all of them have captured his cockiness—obviously that was the sort of speech Socrates actually made—but what they have not made clear is that he already thought that for him death was preferable to life, so that his cockiness appears rather ill-considered. Hermogenes, the son of Hipponicus, however, was a companion of his and has divulged such reports as show that the cockiness of his speech suited the decision he had made. For he stated that on seeing Socrates discussing everything but the trial, he asked, "But Socrates, shouldn't you be giving some thought to what defense you're going to make?" He said that Socrates at first replied, "Why, don't I seem to you to have spent my whole life practicing my defense?" Then when he asked, "How so?" Socrates said, "Because I've lived a life without wrongdoing, and

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Impoverished brother of the wealthy Callias; a devoted companion of Socrates (*Mem.* 1.2.48) and present at his death (Pl. *Phaedo* 52b).

#### XENOPHON

μαι ποιῶν ἡνπερ νομίζω μελέτην εἶναι καλλίστην 4 ἀπολογίας, ἐπεὶ δὲ αὐτὸν³ πάλιν λέγειν, Οὐχ ὁρᾶς τὰ Άθηναίων δικαστήρια ώς πολλάκις μὲν οὐδὲν ἀδικοῦντας λόγω παραχθέντες ἀπέκτειναν, πολλάκις δὲ ἀδικούντας η έκ του λόγου οἰκτίσαντες η έπιχαρίτως εἰπόντας ἀπέλυσαν; Άλλὰ ναὶ μὰ Δία, φάναι αὐτόν, καὶ δὶς ἤδη ἐπιχειρήσαντός μου σκοπεῖν περὶ τῆς απολογίας έναντιοῦταί μοι τὸ δαιμόνιον. ώς δὲ αὐτὸν<sup>4</sup> 5 είπειν, Θαυμαστὰ λέγεις, τὸν δ' αὖ ἀποκρίνασθαι, 'Ή θαυμαστὸν νομίζεις εἰ καὶ τῷ θεῷ δοκεῖ ἐμὲ βέλτιον εἶναι ἤδη τελευτᾶν; οὐκ οἶσθα ὅτι μέχρι μὲν τοῦδε οὐδενὶ ἀνθρώπων ὑφείμην ἂν βέλτιον ἐμοῦ βεβιωκέναι; ὅπερ γὰρ ἥδιστόν ἐστιν, ἤδειν ὁσίως μοι καὶ δικαίως ἄπαντα τὸν βίον βεβιωμένον ὥστε ἰσχυρῶς άγάμενος έμαυτὸν ταὐτὰ εὕρισκον καὶ τοὺς έμοὶ συγγιγνομένους γιγνώσκοντας περί έμου. νυν δε εί έτι προβήσεται ή ήλικία, οἶδ' ὅτι ἀνάγκη ἔσται τὰ τοῦ γήρως ἐπιτελεῖσθαι καὶ ὁρᾶν τε χεῖρον καὶ ἀκούειν ηττον καὶ δυσμαθέστερον είναι καὶ ὧν ἔμαθον ἐπιλησμονέστερον. ἢν δὲ αἰσθάνωμαι χείρων γιγνόμενος καὶ καταμέμφωμαι έμαυτόν, πως ἄν, εἰπεῖν, έγω ἔτι αν ήδέως βιοτεύοιμι; ἴσως δέ τοι, φάναι αὐτόν, καὶ ὁ θεὸς δι' εὐμένειαν προξενεί μοι οὐ μόνον τὸ ἐν καιρῷ της ηλικίας καταλύσαι τὸν βίον, ἀλλὰ καὶ τὸ ἡ ράστα. ην γαρ νυν κατακριθή μοι, δήλον ὅτι ἐξέσται μοι τη τελευτή χρησθαι η ράστη μεν ύπο των τούτου

<sup>3</sup> αὐτὸς Schenkl <sup>4</sup> αὐτὸς Schenkl

# APOLOGY 1.3-1.7

that I consider the finest practice for a defense." Then when Hermogenes again asked, "Don't you observe that the Athenian courts have often been carried away by an eloquent speech and have condemned innocent men to death, and often on the other hand the guilty have been acquitted either because their plea aroused compassion or because their speech was charming?" "Yes, indeed!" he answered; "and I've tried twice already to look to my defense, but my divine sign opposes me." And when Hermogenes observed, "That is a surprising statement," he replied, "Do you really consider it surprising that even the god thinks it better for me to die at this time? Don't you know that to this day I would never have conceded that any man has lived a better life than I have? For I always knew that my whole life has been lived in piety and justice, a fact that affords the greatest pleasure; and so I have felt a deep self-respect and have discovered that my associates hold corresponding sentiments about me. But now, if my years are prolonged, I know that the frailties of old age will inevitably be realized: that my vision must be less perfect and my hearing less keen, that I shall be slower to learn and more forgetful of what I have learned. If I perceive my decay and start criticizing myself, how," he continued, "could I any longer take pleasure in living? Perhaps," he added, "the god in his kindness is taking my part and securing me the opportunity of ending my life not only at the right juncture but also in the easiest way. For if I'm condemned now, it will clearly be open to me to suffer a death judged by those who have superintended this matter

# XENOPHON

έπιμεληθέντων κέκριται, άπραγμονεστάτη δε τοις φίλοις, πλείστον δὲ πόθον ἐμποιοῦσα τῶν τελευτώντων. όταν γὰρ ἄσχημον μὲν μηδὲν μηδὲ δυσχερὲς ἐν ταῖς γνώμαις τῶν παρόντων καταλείπηται <τις>5, ὑγιὲς δὲ τὸ σῶμα ἔχων καὶ τὴν ψυχὴν δυναμένην φιλοφρονεῖσθαι ἀπομαραίνηται, πως οὐκ ἀνάγκη τοῦτον ποθεινὸν εἶναι: ὀρθῶς δὲ οἱ θεοὶ τότε μὲν ἡναντιοῦντο, φάναι αὐτόν, τῆ τοῦ λόγου ἐπισκέψει ὅτε ἐδόκει ἡμῖν6 ζητητέα εἶναι ἐκ παντὸς τρόπου τὰ ἀποφευκτικά. εἰ γὰρ τοῦτο διεπραξάμην, δηλον ὅτι ἡτοιμασάμην ἂν άντὶ τοῦ ήδη λήξαι τοῦ βίου ἢ νόσοις άλγυνόμενος τελευτήσαι ή γήρα, είς ὃ πάντα τὰ χαλεπὰ συρρεί καὶ μάλα ἔρημα τῶν εὐφροσυνῶν, μὰ Δί, εἰπεῖν αὐτόν, ὧ Έρμόγενες, ἐγὼ ταῦτα οὐδὲ προθυμήσομαι, άλλ' ὅσων νομίζω τετυχηκέναι καλῶν καὶ παρὰ θεῶν καὶ παρ' ἀνθρώπων καὶ ην έγω δόξαν έχω περὶ έμαυτοῦ, ταύτην ἀναφαίνων εἰ βαρυνῶ τοὺς δικαστάς, αίρήσομαι τελευτάν μάλλον ἢ ἀνελευθέρως τὸ ζῆν ἔτι προσαιτών κερδάναι τὸν πολὺ χείρω βίον ἀντὶ θανάτου.

Οὕτως δὲ γνόντα αὐτὸν ἔφη, ἐπειδὴ κατηγόρησαν αὐτοῦ οἱ ἀντίδικοι ὡς οὓς μὲν ἡ πόλις νομίζει θεοὺς οὐ νομίζοι, ἔτερα δὲ καινὰ δαιμόνια εἰσφέροι καὶ τοὺς
νέους διαφθείροι, παρελθόντα εἰπεῖν ᾿Αλλ᾽ ἐγώ, ὦ ἄνδρες, τοῦτο μὲν πρῶτον θαυμάζω Μελήτου ὅ τῳ ποτὲ γνοὺς λέγει ὡς ἐγὼ οὓς ἡ πόλις νομίζει θεοὺς οὐ νομίζω ἐπεὶ θύοντά γέ με ἐν ταῖς κοιναῖς ἑορταῖς καὶ ἐπὶ τῶν δημοσίων βωμῶν καὶ ἄλλοι οἱ παρατυγχάνον-

## APOLOGY 1.7-1.11

to be the easiest and least troublesome to one's friends, and that implants in them the deepest feeling of loss for those meeting their end. For when a person leaves behind in the hearts of those attending his death nothing unseemly or disagreeable, but dies away while he still possesses a sound body and a spirit capable of showing kind-liness, how can he fail to be sorely missed? It was with good reason," Socrates continued, "that the gods opposed my giving thought to my speech at least at that time, when we thought we had to find a plea that would get me acquitted by any means. For had I pulled that off, it's clear that instead of letting go of life at this point, I would have provided for a painful death from disease or old age, the sink into which all distresses flow, unrelieved by any joy. By Zeus no, Hermogenes," he went on, "I'll never court that fate, but if I offend the jury by declaring all the blessings that I feel gods and men have bestowed on me, as well as my personal opinion of myself, I will prefer death to begging, unlike a free man, for longer life and thus gaining instead of death a far inferior life.

Hermogenes stated that with this resolve Socrates came before the jury after his adversaries had charged him with not believing in the gods worshipped by the city and with the introduction of new deities in their stead and with corruption of the young, and replied: "One thing I marvel at in Meletus, gentlemen, is the basis of his assertion that I do not believe in the gods worshipped by the city, for all have seen me sacrificing at the communal festivals and on the public altars if they happened to be present, including

10

<sup>5</sup> add. Schenkl

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> ὑμῖν Weiske

τες έώρων καὶ αὐτὸς Μέλητος, εἰ έβούλετο, καινά γε 12 μην δαιμόνια πως αν έγω είσφεροιμι λέγων ὅτι θεοῦ μοι φωνή φαίνεται σημαίνουσα ὅ τι χρή ποιείν; καὶ γαρ οι φθόγγοις οιωνών και οι φήμαις ανθρώπων χρώμενοι φωναίς δήπου τεκμαίρονται. βροντάς δέ άμφιλέξει τις η μη φωνείν η μη μέγιστον οίωνιστήριον είναι; ή δὲ Πυθοί ἐν τῷ τρίποδι ἱέρεια οὐ καὶ αὐτὴ φωνῆ τὰ παρὰ τοῦ θεοῦ διαγγέλλει; ἀλλὰ μέντοι 13 καὶ τὸ προειδέναι γε τὸν θεὸν τὸ μέλλον καὶ τὸ προσημαίνειν ὧ βούλεται, καὶ τοῦτο, ὥσπερ ἐγώ φημι, οὕτω πάντες καὶ λέγουσι καὶ νομίζουσιν. ἀλλ' οἱ μὲν οίωνούς τε καὶ φήμας καὶ συμβόλους τε καὶ μάντεις ονομάζουσι τοὺς προσημαίνοντας εἶναι, ἐγὼ δὲ τοῦτο δαιμόνιον καλώ, καὶ οἶμαι οὕτως ὀνομάζων καὶ ἀληθέστερα καὶ ὁσιώτερα λέγειν τῶν τοῖς ὄρνισιν ἀνατιθέντων την των θεων δύναμιν. ως γε μην ού ψεύδομαι κατὰ τοῦ θεοῦ καὶ τοῦτ' ἔχω τεκμήριον καὶ γὰρ τῶν φίλων πολλοῖς δη έξαγγείλας τὰ τοῦ θεοῦ συμβουλεύματα οὐδεπώποτε ψευσάμενος ἐφάνην.

Έπεὶ δὲ ταῦτ' ἀκούοντες οἱ δικασταὶ ἐθορύβουν, οἱ μὲν ἀπιστοῦντες τοῖς λεγομένοις, οἱ δὲ καὶ φθονοῦντες εἰ καὶ παρὰ θεῶν μειζόνων ἢ αὐτοὶ τυγχάνοι,

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Delphi.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Or "divine sign." Here, as earlier, the mere adjective is used; but in Plato's *Theages* (128d ff.) and *Apology* (31d) this admonitory something is described as a voice sent by heavenly dispensation and is called variously "the sign" (*Ap.* 41d), "the usual sign" (*Ap.* 40c), "the divine sign" (*Rep.* 496c), "the usual divine sign"

Meletus himself if he so desired. As for introducing 'new 12 divinities,' how could I be guilty of that merely in asserting that a god's voice is made manifest to me indicating what I should do? Surely those who take their omens from the cries of birds and the utterances of humans form their judgments on 'voices.' Will any one dispute either that thunder utters its 'voice' or that it is an omen of the greatest moment? Does not the very priestess who sits on the tripod at Pytho² divulge the god's will through a 'voice'? But more than that, in regard to the god's foreknowledge 13 of the future and his forewarning of it to whomever he wishes, these are the same terms, I assert, that all people use and credit. The only difference between them and me is that whereas they call the sources of their forewarning 'birds,' 'utterances,' 'chance meetings,' 'prophets,' I call mine a 'divine' thing, 3 and I think that in using such a term I am speaking with greater truth and piety than those who ascribe the gods' power to birds. That I do not lie against the god I have this further proof: I have revealed to many of my friends the counsels which the god has given me, and in no instance has the event shown that I was mistaken "

Hermogenes further reported that when the jurors raised a clamor at hearing this, some of them disbelieving his statements, others jealous at his receiving greater fa-

(Euthd. 272e, Phaedrus 242b, Theages 129b), "the sign from God" (Ap. 40b), "something God-sent and divine" (Ap. 31d). Plato reports Socrates' description of this as a voice not directing his actions but serving only as a deterrent when he or his friends were contemplating doing something inadvisable.

πάλιν εἰπεῖν τὸν Σωκράτην· Ἄγε δὴ ἀκούσατε καὶ ἄλλα, ἴνα ἔτι μᾶλλον οἱ βουλόμενοι ὑμῶν ἀπιστῶσι τῷ ἐμὲ τετιμῆσθαι ὑπὸ δαιμόνων. Χαιρεφῶντος γάρ ποτε ἐπερωτῶντος ἐν Δελφοῖς περὶ ἐμοῦ πολλῶν παρόντων ἀνεῖλεν ὁ Ἀπόλλων μηδένα εἶναι ἀνθρώπων ἐμοῦ μήτε ἐλευθεριώτερον μήτε δικαιότερον μήτε σωφρονέστερον.

'Ως δ' αὖ ταῦτ' ἀκούσαντες οἱ δικασταὶ ἔτι μᾶλλον εἰκότως έθορύβουν, αὖθις εἰπεῖν τὸν Σωκράτην 'Αλλὰ μείζω μέν, ὦ ἄνδρες, εἶπεν ὁ θεὸς ἐν χρησμοῖς περὶ Λυκούργου τοῦ Λακεδαιμονίοις νομοθετήσαντος ἢ περὶ ἐμοῦ. λέγεται γὰρ εἰς τὸν νεὼ εἰσιόντα προσειπείν αὐτόν, Φροντίζω πότερα θεόν σε εἴπω ἢ ἄνθρωπον. ἐμὲ δὲ θεῶ μὲν οὐκ εἴκασεν, ἀνθρώπων δὲ πολλῶ προέκρινεν ύπερφέρειν. ὅμως δὲ ὑμεῖς μηδὲ ταῦτ' εἰκῆ πιστεύσητε τῷ θεῷ, ἀλλὰ καθ' ἐν ἔκαστον ἐπισκοπείτε ὧν εἶπεν ὁ θεός. τίνα μὲν γὰρ ἐπίστασθε ἡττον έμοῦ δουλεύοντα ταῖς τοῦ σώματος ἐπιθυμίαις; τίνα δὲ ἀνθρώπων ἐλευθεριώτερον, δς παρ' οὐδενὸς οὕτε δώρα οὔτε μισθὸν δέχομαι; δικαιότερον δὲ τίνα ἂν εἰκότως νομίσαιτε τοῦ πρὸς τὰ παρόντα συνηρμοσμένου ώς τῶν ἀλλοτρίων μηδενὸς προσδεῖσθαι; σοφὸν δὲ πῶς οὐκ ἄν τις εἰκότως ἄνδρα φήσειεν εἶναι ὃς έξ ότουπερ ξυνιέναι τὰ λεγόμενα ήρξάμην οὐπώποτε διέλιπον καὶ ζητών καὶ μανθάνων ὅ τι ἐδυνάμην ἀγαθόν; ώς δὲ οὐ μάτην ἐπόνουν οὐ δοκεῖ ὑμῖν καὶ τάδε τεκμήρια είναι, τὸ πολλοὺς μὲν πολίτας τῶν ἀρετῆς έφιεμένων, πολλούς δὲ ξένων ἐκ πάντων προαιρεῖσθαι

15

16

#### APOLOGY 1.14-1.17

vors even from the gods than they themselves, Socrates resumed: "Listen, let me tell you something more, so that those of you who feel so inclined may have still greater disbelief in my being honored by divinities. One time when Chaerephon<sup>4</sup> inquired at Delphi about me, in the presence of many people Apollo answered that no man is more free than I, or more just, or more sensible."

When the jurors, naturally enough, made a still greater hubbub on hearing this statement, he said that Socrates continued, "And yet, gentlemen, the god uttered in oracles greater statements about Lycurgus, the Lacedaemonian lawgiver, than he did about me. For there is a legend that, as Lycurgus entered the temple, the god said to him, 'I am pondering whether to call you a god or a man.' Me, Apollo did not compare to a god, though he did judge me far superior to the rest of mankind. Do not, however, believe the god even in this without due grounds, but examine the god's utterance in detail. First, whom do you know less enslaved to his bodily appetites than me? Whom in the world more free, since I accept neither gifts nor pay from anyone? Whom would you reasonably regard as more just than the one so well matched with his present possessions as to need nothing extra from others? And why wouldn't anyone with good reason call me a sage man, who from the time when I began to understand spoken words have never stopped seeking after and learning every good thing that I could? And as proof that my labor has not been in vain do you not credit this fact too, that many of my fellow citizens who strive for virtue and many from abroad

<sup>4</sup> A very enthusiastic follower of Socrates.

15

16

#### XENOPHON

έμοὶ ξυνείναι; ἐκείνου δὲ τί φήσομεν αἴτιον εἶναι, τοῦ πάντας είδεναι ὅτι ἐγὼ ἥκιστ' ἂν ἔχοιμι χρήματα άντιδιδόναι, ὅμως πολλοὺς ἐπιθυμεῖν ἐμοί τι δωρεῖσθαι: τὸ δ' ἐμὲ μὲν μηδ' ὑφ' ἐνὸς ἀπαιτεῖσθαι εὐεργεσίας, έμοὶ δὲ πολλοὺς ὁμολογεῖν χάριτας ὀφείλειν; τὸ δ' έν τη πολιορκία τους μέν άλλους οἰκτίρειν έαυτούς. έμε δε μηδεν απορώτερον διάγειν ἢ ὅτε τὰ μάλιστα ἡ πόλις ηὐδαιμόνει; τὸ δὲ τοὺς ἄλλους μὲν τὰς εὐπαθείας έκ της άγορας πολυτελείς πορίζεσθαι, έμε δε έκ της ψυχης ἄνευ δαπάνης ηδίους έκείνων μηγανασθαι: εί γε μην όσα είρηκα περί έμαυτοῦ μηδείς δύναιτ' αν έξελέγξαι με ώς ψεύδομαι, πως οὐκ ἂν ήδη δικαίως καὶ ὑπὸ θεῶν καὶ ὑπ' ἀνθρώπων ἐπαινοίμην: ἀλλ' όμως σύ με φής, ὧ Μέλητε, τοιαῦτα ἐπιτηδεύοντα τοὺς νέους διαφθείρειν; καίτοι ἐπιστάμεθα μὲν δήπου τίνες είσὶ νέων διαφθοραί συ δε είπε εί τινα οἶσθα ύπ' έμου γεγενημένον η έξ εύσεβους ανόσιον η έκ σώφρονος ύβριστην η έξ εύδιαίτου πολυδάπανον η έκ μετριοπότου οἰνόφλυγα ἢ ἐκ φιλοπόνου μαλακὸν ἢ άλλης πονηράς ήδονης ήττημένον.

'Αλλὰ ναὶ μὰ Δί', ἔφη ὁ Μέλητος, ἐκείνους οἶδα οὓς σὲ πέπεικας σοὶ πείθεσθαι μᾶλλον ἢ τοῖς γειναμένοις. 'Ομολογῶ, φάναι τὸν Σωκράτην, περί γε παιδείας· τοῦτο γὰρ ἴσασιν ἐμοὶ μεμεληκός. περὶ δὲ ὑγι-

18

19

choose to associate with me above all others? And what shall we say is the reason for this fact, that although everybody knows I am the least able to repay money, many are eager to make me some gift? Or for this, that no demands are made on me by a single person to repay kindnesses, while many confess that they owe me for favors received? Or for this, that during the siege,<sup>5</sup> while others were feeling sorry for themselves, I carried on in no greater destitution than when the city's prosperity was at its height? Or for this, that while other men get their delicacies in the market and pay a high price for them, I devise more pleasurable ones from the resources of my soul without cost? And now, if no one can convict me of misstatement in all that I have said of myself, how could I not fairly merit praise from both gods and men? But in spite of that, Me-19 letus, do you maintain that I corrupt the young men by such practices? And yet surely we know what kinds of corruption affect young men; so you tell us whether you know of any one who under my influence has fallen from piety into impiety, or from self-control into wantonness, or from moderation into extravagance, or from temperate drinking into sottishness, or from strenuousness into effeminacy, or has been overcome by any other base pleasure."

"But, by Heaven!" said Meletus: "there is one set of men I know: those whom you have persuaded to obey you rather than their parents." "I admit it," he reports Socrates as replying, "at least so far as education is concerned; people know that I've taken an interest in that. But on

 $<sup>^{5}\,\</sup>mbox{The blockade}$  of Athens by the Spartans in the last year of the Peloponnesian War.

είας τοις ιατροίς μαλλον οι ἄνθρωποι πείθονται ἢ τοῖς γονεῦσι καὶ ἐν ταῖς ἐκκλησίαις γε πάντες δήπου οί Άθηναῖοι τοῖς φρονιμώτατα λέγουσι πείθονται μάλλον ἢ τοῖς προσήκουσιν. οὐ γὰρ δὴ καὶ στρατηγοὺς αἰρεῖσθε καὶ πρὸ πατέρων καὶ πρὸ ἀδελφῶν καὶ ναὶ μὰ Δία γε ὑμεῖς πρὸ ὑμῶν αὐτῶν, οὓς ἂν ἡγῆσθε περὶ τῶν πολεμικῶν φρονιμωτάτους εἶναι; Οὕτω γάρ, φάναι τὸν Μέλητον, ὧ Σώκρατες, καὶ συμφέρει καὶ νομίζεται. Οὔκουν, εἰπεῖν τὸν Σωκράτην, θαυμαστὸν καὶ τοῦτό σοι δοκεῖ εἶναι, τὸ ἐν μὲν ταῖς ἄλλαις πράξεσι μη μόνον ισομοιρίας τυγχάνειν τους κρατίστους άλλὰ καὶ προτετιμήσθαι, ἐμὲ δέ, ὅτι περὶ τοῦ μεγίστου ἀγαθοῦ ἀνθρώποις, περὶ παιδείας, βέλτιστος εἶναι ὑπό τινων προκρίνομαι, τούτου ἔνεκα θανάτου ύπὸ σοῦ διώκεσθαι:

Έρρηθη μὲν δηλον ὅτι τούτων πλείονα ὑπό τε αὐτοῦ καὶ τῶν συναγορευόντων φίλων αὐτῷ. ἀλλ' ἐγὼ οὐ τὰ πάντα εἰπεῖν τὰ ἐκ τῆς δίκης ἐσπούδασα, ἀλλ' ήρκεσε μοι δηλώσαι ὅτι Σωκράτης τὸ μεν μήτε περὶ θεούς ἀσεβήσαι μήτε περί ἀνθρώπους ἄδικος φανήναι περὶ παντὸς ἐποιεῖτο τὸ δὲ μὴ ἀποθανεῖν οὐκ *ἄετο λιπαρητέον εἶναι, ἀλλὰ καὶ καιρὸν ἤδη ἐνόμιζεν* έαυτῷ τελευτᾶν. ὅτι δὲ οὕτως ἐγίγνωσκε καταδηλότε-23 ρον ἐγίγνετο ἐπειδὴ ἡ δίκη διεψηφίσθη. πρῶτον μὲν γὰρ κελευόμενος ὑποτιμᾶσθαι οὕτε αὐτὸς ὑπετιμήσατο οὔτε τοὺς φίλους εἴασεν, ἀλλὰ καὶ ἔλεγεν ὅτι τὸ ύποτιμᾶσθαι όμολογοῦντος εἴη άδικεῖν. ἔπειτα τῶν έταίρων ἐκκλέψαι βουλομένων αὐτὸν οὐκ ἐφείπετο,

21

a question of health, men take the advice of physicians rather than their parents, and in Assembly meetings all the Athenians of course follow the advice of those who speak most sensibly rather than that of their own relatives. Don't you also elect as your generals, in preference to fathers and brothers, indeed in preference to yourselves, those whom you regard as most sensible about military affairs?" "Yes," Meletus said; "for that is both expedient and customary." "Well, then," Socrates said, "doesn't it strike you as surprising that in other activities those who excel receive not merely equal honor but even superior honor, yet because I am judged by some to be supreme in humanity's greatest blessing, education, for that I'm being prosecuted by you on a capital charge?"

More than this of course was said both by Socrates himself and by the friends who joined in his defense. But I have not made it a point to report the whole trial; rather I am satisfied to make it clear that while Socrates' whole concern was to keep free from any act of impiety toward the gods or any appearance of wrongdoing toward mankind, he did not think he should beseech the jury to let him escape death; instead, he believed that the time had now come for him to die. This conviction of his became more evident than ever after the verdict had been decided. First of all, when he was invited to name an alternative penalty, he refused personally and forbade his friends to name one, but insisted that naming a penalty was an acknowledgment of guilt. Then, when his companions wished to break him out of prison, he would not accom-

21

22

23

άλλὰ καὶ ἐπισκῶψαι ἐδόκει, ἐρόμενος εἴ που εἰδεῖέν τι χωρίον ἔξω τῆς ἀττικῆς ἔνθα οὐ προσβατὸν θανάτῳ.

'Ως δὲ τέλος εἶχεν ἡ δίκη, εἰπεῖν αὐτόν 'Αλλ', ὧ ἄνδρες, τοὺς μὲν διδάσκοντας τοὺς μάρτυρας ὡς χρὴ έπιορκούντας καταψευδομαρτυρείν έμου και τους πειθομένους τούτοις άνάγκη έστὶ πολλην έαυτοῖς συνειδέναι ἀσέβειαν καὶ ἀδικίαν έμοὶ δὲ τί προσήκει νῦν μείον φρονείν ἢ πρὶν κατακριθῆναι, μηδὲν ἐλεγχθέντι ώς πεποίηκά τι ὧν έγράψαντό με; οὐδὲ γὰρ ἔγωγε άντὶ Διὸς καὶ "Ηρας καὶ τῶν σὺν τούτοις θεῶν οὔτε θύων τισὶ καινοῖς δαίμοσιν οὕτε ὀμνὺς οὕτε ὀνομάζων άλλους θεούς άναπέφηνα, τούς γε μην νέους πως αν διαφθείροιμι καρτερίαν καὶ εὐτέλειαν προσεθίζων; ἐφ' οίς γε μην έργοις κείται θάνατος ή ζημία, ίεροσυλία, τοιχωρυχία, ἀνδραποδίσει, πόλεως προδοσία, οὐδ' αὐτοὶ οἱ ἀντίδικοι τούτων πρᾶξαί τι κατ' ἐμοῦ φασιν. ωστε θαυμαστὸν ἔμοιγε δοκεῖ εἶναι ὅπως ποτὲ ἐφάνη ύμιν του θανάτου έργον ἄξιον έμοι είργασμένον, άλλ' ούδὲ μέντοι ὅτι ἀδίκως ἀποθνήσκω, διὰ τοῦτο μεῖον φρονητέον οὐ γὰρ ἐμοὶ ἀλλὰ τοῖς καταγνοῦσι τοῦτο αἰσχρόν ἐστι. παραμυθεῖται δέ τί με καὶ Παλαμήδης ό παραπλησίως έμοὶ τελευτήσας έτι γὰρ καὶ νῦν πολύ καλλίους υμνους παρέχεται Όδυσσέως του άδίκως άποκτείναντος αὐτόν οἶδ' ὅτι καὶ ἐμοὶ μαρτυρήσεται ὑπό τε τοῦ ἐπιόντος καὶ ὑπὸ τοῦ παρεληλυθότος

24

25

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> One of the Greek warriors at Troy; put to death on a trumped-up charge of treason.

# APOLOGY 1.23-1.26

pany them but even seemed to joke about it, asking them whether they knew of any spot outside of Attica that was inaccessible to death.

When the trial was over, Socrates (according to Hermogenes) remarked, "Well, gentlemen, those who instructed the witnesses that they must bear false witness against me, perjuring themselves to do so, and those who were won over to do this must feel in their hearts a consciousness of great impiety and injustice; but as for me, why should my spirits be any lower now than before my condemnation, since I have not been proved guilty of having done any of the acts mentioned in the indictment? For it has not been shown that I have sacrificed to new deities in place of Zeus and Hera and the gods of their company, or that I have sworn by or invoked other gods. And how could I be corrupt the young by habituating them to for-titude and frugality? Now of all the acts for which the laws have prescribed the death penalty—temple robbery, burglary, enslavement, treason—not even my adversaries themselves charge me with having committed any of these. And so it seems astonishing to me how you could ever have been convinced that I had committed an act meriting death. But further, my spirits need not be lower because I'm to be executed unjustly: that attaches disgrace not to me but to those who condemned me. And I take further comfort from the case of Palamedes 6 who died in circumstances similar to mine: for even now he affords us a far finer theme for songs than does Odysseus, the man who unjustly caused his death. And I know that time to come as well as time past will attest that I, too, far from

24

25

# XENOPHON

χρόνου ὅτι ἠδίκησα μὲν οὐδένα πώποτε οὐδὲ πονηρότερον ἐποίησα, ηὐεργέτουν δὲ τοὺς ἐμοὶ διαλεγομένους προῖκα διδάσκων ὅ τι ἐδυνάμην ἀγαθόν.

27

Εἰπὼν δὲ ταῦτα μάλα ὁμολογουμένως δὴ τοῖς εἰρημένοις ἀπήει καὶ ὅμμασι καὶ σχήματι καὶ βαδίσματι φαιδρός. ὡς δὲ ἤσθετο ἄρα τοὺς παρεπομένους δακρύοντας, Τί τοῦτο; εἰπεῖν αὐτόν, ἢ ἄρτι δακρύετε; οὐ γὰρ πάλαι ἴστε ὅτι ἐξ ὅτουπερ ἐγενόμην κατεψηφισμένος ἢν μου ὑπὸ τῆς φύσεως ὁ θάνατος; ἀλλὰ μέντοι εἰ μὲν ἀγαθῶν ἐπιρρεόντων προαπόλλυμαι, δῆλον ὅτι ἐμοὶ καὶ τοῖς ἐμοῖς εὔνοις λυπητέον εἰ δὲ χαλεπῶν προσδοκωμένων καταλύω τὸν βίον, ἐγὼ μὲν οἶμαι ὡς εὐπραγοῦντος ἐμοῦ πᾶσιν ὑμῖν εὐθυμητέον εἶναι.

28

Παρὼν δέ τις 'Απολλόδωρος, ἐπιθυμητὴς μὲν ὢν ἰσχυρῶς αὐτοῦ, ἄλλως δ' εὐήθης, εἶπεν ἄρα· 'Αλλὰ τοῦτο ἔγωγε, ὧ Σώκρατες, χαλεπώτατα φέρω ὅτι ὁρῶ σε ἀδίκως ἀποθνήσκοντα. τὸν δὲ λέγεται καταψήσαντα αὐτοῦ τὴν κεφαλὴν εἰπεῖν· Σὺ δέ, ὧ φίλτατε 'Απολλόδωρε, μᾶλλον ἂν ἐβούλου με ὁρᾶν δικαίως ἢ ἀδίκως ἀποθνήσκοντα; καὶ ἄμα ἐπιγελάσαι.

29

Λέγεται δὲ καὶ Ἄνυτον παριόντα ἰδὼν εἰπεῖν ἀλλὶ ὁ μὲν ἀνὴρ ὅδε κυδρός, ὡς μέγα τι καὶ καλὸν διαπεπραγμένος εἰ ἀπέκτονέ με ὅτι αὐτὸν τῶν μεγίστων ὑπὸ τῆς πόλεως ὁρῶν ἀξιούμενον οὐκ ἔφην χρῆναι τὸν υίὸν περὶ βύρσας παιδεύειν. ὡς μοχθηρὸς οὖτος,

ever doing anyone wrong or making him more wicked, I have instead tried to benefit those who conversed with me by teaching them, without charge, every good thing that I could "

With that he departed, blithe of eyes, posture, and step, as was fully consonant with the words he had just spoken. When he noticed that those who accompanied him were in tears, "What is this?" we are told he asked, "Are you just now beginning to weep? Haven't you known all along that from the moment I was born nature had condemned me to death? Now if I'm perishing before my time while blessings are still pouring in, clearly that should bring grief to me and my well-wishers; but if I'm ending my life when only hardships are in view, my own opinion is that you should all be cheerful, in the assurance that I'm doing well."

There with him was man named Apollodorus, a very ardent devotee of Socrates but otherwise simple, who exclaimed, "But Socrates, what I find it hardest to bear is that I see you being put to death unjustly!" Socrates stroked Apollodorus' head and reportedly replied, "My dearest Apollodorus, would you want to see me put to death justly or unjustly?" and smiled as he asked the question.

We are told also that he remarked as he saw Anytus<sup>7</sup> passing by, "There goes a man filled with pride, as having accomplished something great and noble by putting me to death, because, when I saw him honored by the city with the highest offices, I said that he shouldn't confine his son's

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> The most powerful of Socrates' three prosecutors.

έφη, δς οὐκ ἔοικεν εἰδέναι ὅτι ὁπότερος ἡμῶν καὶ συμφορώτερα καὶ καλλίω εἰς τὸν ἀεὶ χρόνον διαπέπρακται, οὖτός ἐστι καὶ ὁ νικῶν. ἀλλὰ μέντοι, φάναι αὐτόν, ἀνέθηκε μὲν καὶ "Ομηρος ἔστιν οἷς τῶν ἐν καταλύσει τοῦ βίου προγιγνώσκειν τὰ μέλλοντα, βούλομαι δὲ καὶ ἐγὼ χρησμωδήσαί τι. συνεγενόμην γάρ ποτε βραχέα τῷ ἀνύτου υἱῷ, καὶ ἔδοξέ μοι οὐκ άρρωστος την ψυχην είναι ώστε φημι αὐτον ἐπὶ τῆ δουλοπρεπεί διατριβή ην ὁ πατηρ αὐτῶ παρεσκεύακεν οὐ διαμενείν διὰ δὲ τὸ μηδένα ἔχειν σπουδαίον έπιμελητήν προσπεσείσθαί τινι αἰσχρα ἐπιθυμία καὶ προβήσεσθαι μέντοι πόρρω μοχθηρίας, ταῦτα δ' είπων οὐκ ἐψεύσατο, ἀλλ' ὁ νεανίσκος ἡσθεὶς οἴνω οὔτε νυκτὸς οὕτε ἡμέρας ἐπαύετο πίνων, καὶ τέλος οὕτε τῆ έαυτοῦ πόλει οὔτε τοῖς φίλοις οὔτε αὑτῷ ἄξιος οὐδενὸς ἐγένετο. Ἄνυτος μὲν δη διὰ την τοῦ υίοῦ πονηρὰν παιδείαν καὶ διὰ τὴν αύτοῦ ἀγνωμοσύνην ἔτι καὶ τετελευτηκώς τυγχάνει κακοδοξίας. Σωκράτης δε διά τὸ μεγαλύνειν έαυτὸν ἐν τῶ δικαστηρίω Φθόνον έπαγόμενος μᾶλλον καταψηφίσασθαι έαυτοῦ ἐποίησε τοὺς δικαστάς, ἐμοὶ μὲν οὖν δοκεῖ θεοφιλοῦς μοίρας τετυχηκέναι τοῦ μεν γαρ βίου τὸ χαλεπώτατον άπέλιπε, τῶν δὲ θανάτων τοῦ ράστου ἔτυχεν. ἐπεδείξατο δὲ τῆς ψυχῆς τὴν ῥώμην ἐπεὶ γὰρ ἔγνω τοῦ ἔτι ζῆν τὸ τεθνάναι αὐτῷ κρεῖττον εἶναι, ὥσπερ οὐδὲ πρὸς τάλλ' άγαθὰ προσάντης ἦν, οὐδὲ πρὸς τὸν θάνατον έμαλακίσατο, άλλ' ίλαρως καὶ προσεδέχετο αὐτὸν καὶ έπετελέσατο.

30

31

32

# APOLOGY 1.29-1.33

education to hides.8 What a shoddy fellow," he continued, "not to know, apparently, that whichever one of us has accomplished what is more beneficial and noble for all time, he is the real victor. But," he reportedly added, "Homer has attributed to some at the moment of life's dissolution the power to foresee the future, and so I too wish to utter a prophecy. At one time I had a brief association with the son of Anytus, and I thought he had some strength of soul; and so I predict that he will not continue in the servile occupation that his father has arranged for him but through lack of a sound advisor he will fall into some disgraceful propensity and surely go far along the path of vice." In saying this he was not mistaken: the young man, delighting in wine, never stopped drinking night or day, and at last turned out worth nothing to his city, his friends, or himself. So Anytus, even after his death, still has a bad reputation for his son's vile education and for his own thoughtlessness. And as for Socrates, by magnifying himself in court he brought ill will upon himself and thus made his conviction by the jury all the more certain. Now to me he seems to have met a fate that the gods love: he escaped the hardest part of life and met the easiest sort of death. And he displayed his strength of soul, for having once decided that death was better for him than longer life, he did not weaken in the presence of death, just as he had never set his face against any other thing, either, that was for his good, but was cheerful not only in the expectation of death but in carrying it out.

<sup>8</sup> The tanning trade had been in the family from at least the time of the boy's grandfather.

30

31

32

# XENOPHON

34 Έγὼ μὲν δὴ κατανοῶν τοῦ ἀνδρὸς τήν τε σοφίαν καὶ τὴν γενναιότητα οὕτε μὴ μεμνῆσθαι δύναμαι αὐτοῦ οὕτε μεμνημένος μὴ οὐκ ἐπαινεῖν. εἰ δέ τις τῶν ἀρετῆς ἐφιεμένων ὡφελιμωτέρῳ τινὶ Σωκράτους συνεγένετο, ἐκεῖνον ἐγὼ τὸν ἄνδρα ἀξιομακαριστότατον νομίζω.

# APOLOGY 1.34

And so, in contemplating the man's wisdom and nobility of character, I can neither put him out of mind or, when I remember him, refrain from praise. And if among those who make virtue their aim any one has ever been brought into contact with someone more helpful than Socrates, I think that man deserves to be called most fortunate.

References are to book, chapter, and section.

- accuser, of Socrates (i.e., Polycrates), 1.2.9, 1.2.12, 1.2.26, 1.2.51, 1.2.56, 1.2.58, 1.2.64
- Acumenus (doctor and friend of Socrates), prescription for loss of appetite, 3.13.2
- Agamemnon: called "majestic" by Homer, 3.1.4; "a good king and strong warrior," 3.2.2
- Alcibiades: causes of corruption, 1.2.24, 1.2.25; political conduct, 1.2.12; saucy talk with Pericles, 1.2.40-46; son of, 3.8–10; pupil of Socrates, 1.2.16, 1.2.39 ambition, political, 1.2.14;
- 2.3.16; 3.6.1–3 Amphiaraus, cold spring by his temple at Oropus, 3.13.3
- Anaxagoras, censured for theory about the sun, 4.7.6
- Antiphon the Sophist, talks with Socrates, 1.6.1–15
- Antisthenes (businessman who became a general), 3.4.1–4

- Antisthenes the Socratic: constantly with Socrates, 3.11.17; converses with Socrates on value of friends, 2.5.1–5
- Apollodorus, constant disciple, 3.11.17
- Archedemus, able but poor, became good friend to Crito, 2 10 4–8
- Areopagus, praised for dignity and justice, 3.5.20
- Aristarchus, helped by Socrates with female relative trouble, 2.7
- Aristippus, disputes with Socrates: about pleasure, 2.1; about the Good and the Beautiful, 3.8
- aristocracy, defined, 4.6.12
  - Aristodemus ("the dwarf"), despised religion and divination, converted by Socrates, 1.4
- army, Athenian, indiscipline of. See 3.5.19, 3.5.21–23
- art and artists: painting, 3.10.1-

- 5, 3.11.2; sculpture, 2.6.6; 3.10.6–8
- Asclepius, hot spring in his temple, 3.13.3
- Aspasia, authority on making marriages, 2.6.36
- assembly, Athenian, 2.6.38; composition and character of, 3.7.6, 3.7.8; conduct of Socrates when presiding, 1.1.18
- astronomy, 4.7.4-5
- Athenians: compared with Boeotians, 3.5.2–3; compared with Lacedaemonians, 3.5.15–16; praise and censure of, 3.5; preeminence of their choruses, 3.3.11–12
- Athens, journey from, to Olympia, 3.6.5
- Athletes, 3.5.13
- Attica: menaced by Boeotians, 3.5.4; mountains of, 3.5.25
- Beautiful, the, Socratic view of, 3.8; 4.6.9
- body, care of, 3.12
- Boeotians. See Athenians; Attica
- breastplates, cheap and costly, fits and misfits, 3.10.9–15 brothers, Socrates on relations between, 1.2.51; 2.3
- Carthaginians, 2.1.10 cavalry, qualifications of commander, 3.3

- Cebes the Theban, 1.2.48; 3.11.17
- Cecrops (king of Athens), judge in contest of the gods, 3.5.10
- Ceramon (wealthy and wise householder), 2.7.3
- Chaerophon and Chaerecrates, (brothers): disciples of Socrates, 1.2.48; quarrel settled by Socrates, 2.3
- Charicles (member of Thirty at Athens), 1.2.33; encounter with Socrates, 1.2.35–37
- Charmides (son of Glaucon), 3.6.1; urged by Socrates to enter public life, 3.7
- children, duty to parents, 1.2.49-50; 2.2
- choruses and dancers 3.3.12, 3.4.3-5
- Circe, Socrates' joke about,
- Cleiton (sculptor), visited by Socrates, 3.10.6–8
- Cosmos, Socrates on speculation about, 1.1.11
- Council, Athenian, 1.1.18, 1.2.35
- courage, Socrates on, 3.9.1; 4.6.10-11
- Critias: conduct as a member of the Thirty, 1.2.12, 1.2.31; motive in associating with Socrates, 1.2.16
- Critobulus (son of Criton), 1.3.8–10, 1.3.13; talks with Socrates on choice and acquisition of friends, 2.6

Crito: constant disciple of Socrates, 1.2.48; got better of detractors, 2.9

Daedalus, story of, 4.2.33 Dancing Boys, Spartan festival of, 1.2.61

death, penalty of, 1.2.62 defamation, 2.9.4-5; 4.4.11 deities, strange, 1.1.1

deity and "the divine sign (or something)," 1.1.2, 1.1.4; 4.8.1, 4.8.5

Delia (annual festival), 4.8.2 Delium, battle of, 3.5.4 Delos, 3.3.12; 4.8.2

Delphi: priestess at, 1.3.1; temple and oracle of, 4.2.24, 4.3.16

democracy, definition of, 4.6.12 despotism, 1.2.56; 4.6.12 disciples of Socrates, the true,

1.1.48Diodorus (friend of Socrates),

2.10.1Dionysodorus (brother of Euthydemus), professor of military art, 3.1.1

discussion: and classification, 4.5.12; method of Socrates in, 4.6.13–15

divination, Socrates and, 1.1.2— 9, 1.4.2, 1.4.15; 4.3.12, 4.7.10

eating, moderation in, 1.2.4, 1.3.5, 1.6.5; 2.1.1; 3.13.2, 3.14.2-6

education, 4.1.5, 4.2.1

envy, 3.9.8

Epicharmus, quoted, 2.1.20 Epigenes (companion of Socrates), urged to get more exercise, 3.12

Erasinides (general condemned to death after battle of Arginusae), 1.1.18

Erectheus (king), 3.5.10

Eutherus (one of the new poor), advised how to make his living, 2.8

Euthydemus: loved by Critias, 1.2.29; Socrates converses with, 4.2, 4.3, 4.5, 4.6 exercise, duty of taking, 3.12

fees: never exacted by Socrates, 1.2.60; Socrates on taking, 1.2.5-8, 1.6.11-14

friends and friendship, Socrates on, 1.2.52-55; 2.4, 2.5, 2.6

games, public, 2.6.26, 3.7.1 generals and generalship, Socrates on, 3.1, 3.2, 3.4, 3.5

gentleman, qualities and qualifications of, 1.1.16, 1.2.2, 1.2.7, 1.2.29, 1.2.48, 1.6.13-14; 2.3.16, 2.6.24

geometry, 4.7.2-3

Glaucon (son of Ariston), ambitious but incompetent, 3.6

gluttony, 1.2.2, 1.2.4; 3.14.2-6 gods: do not permit man to know everything, 1.1.7-8; 4.7.6; duty of offering sac-

rifice, 1.3.3; omniscient

- and omnipresent, 1.1.19, 1.4.18; providence of, 1.4.3–19; 4.3.3–9; reveal to man what to do and what to avoid, 1.1.19; 4.3.12, 4.3.15; Socrates' belief in, 1.1.5, 1.1.7, 1.1.19, 1.2.64, 1.3.1–4, 1.4.11–14; 4.3, 4.8.11; strange, 1.1.1–4 Good, the, 3.8.1–3; 4.6.8
- happiness, 1.6.1–10; 2.1.8–11; captious argument about, 4.2.34
- health, care of, essential to efficiency, 3.12.5-8; 4.7.9
- Heracles: choice of, discourse by Prodicus, 2.1.21-end; sons of, aided by Athenians, 3.5.10
- Hermogenes (son of Hipponicus): disciple of Socrates, 1.2.48; poor but worthy of assistance, 2.10.3—end; urges Socrates to think of defense, 4.8.4
- Hesiod, quoted, 1.2.56, 1.3.3; 2.1.20
- Hippias of Elis, conversation with Socrates, 4.4.5
- Hippocrates (Athenian general defeated at Delium), 3.5.4
- Homer (chief of epic poets), 1.4.3; Euthydemus' copy of his works, 4.2.10; quoted, 1.2.58; 2.6.11
- houses: beautiful and useful, 3.8.8-10; building of, 3.1.7

- idleness, 2.7.8 ignorance, 3.9.6–7 imposture, 1.7.1–5 indictment, of Socrates, 1.1.1 ingratitude, 2.2.1–3
- jury, error of, in judging Socrates, 1.1.17
- justice: and law, 4.4.12–13; nature of, 3.9.5; 4.6.5–6; Socrates' conduct in accordance with, 4.4.1–3, 4.8.11; works of, 4.2.12–23
- king and kingship, 3.1.3, 3.2.2; 4.6.12
- Lacedaemonians, habits and character of, 3.5.15–16; 4.4.15
- Lamprocles (eldest son of Socrates), quarrel with mother, 2.2.1; reproved by Socrates, 2.2–14
- law, 1.2.41–end lawful, equivalent to just, 4.4.12–25
- laws: Socrates' discourse on obedience to, 4.4.13–25; Socrates falsely accused of despising, 1.2.9, 1.2.34; unwritten, 4.4.19–20
- learning, duty of, insisted on by Socrates, 1.1.9; 3.1.2–3, 3.5.21–24, 3.6.5–18, 3.9.3; 4.2.1–7
- Lebadea, Athenian defeat at, 3.5.4
- leisure, Socrates on, 3.4.9, 3.9.9

quence, 2.6.13; talk about

laws, 1.2.41-48

Pericles (junior), conversation

love, dangers attending, 1.2.22 with Socrates after election as general, 3.5 luxury, does not mean happiness, 1.6.10 Persians, 2.1.10; 3.5.11 Lycurgus, made Spartans obedi-Phaedondas (faithful disciple of ent to laws, 4.4.14 Socrates), 1.2.48 piety: of Socrates, 1.1.2–19; Megarians, trade of, 2.7.6 4.8.11; Socrates on, 1.4; Melanippides of Melos (chief of 4.6.2 - 4dithyrambic poets), 1.4.3 Pistias (Athenian manufacturer), 3.10.9 Meletus (accuser of Socrates), 4.4.4, 4.8.4 Plato, 3.6.1 Menon (manufacturer of pleasure, 1.4.12, 1.5.6, 1.6.9, cloaks), 2.7.6 1.6.24; 2.1.20–34, 2.6.5; mind and body, 1.4.17 4.5.3 - 12poetry, use of, by Socrates, Mysians, raid Persia with impunity, 3.5.26 1.2.56 - 59politics, Socrates and, 1.6.15; Nausicydes (Athenian manufacturer), 2.7.6 Polycleitus (chief of sculptors), Nicias, paid a talent for a slave, 1.4.3 2.5.2prayer, 1.3.2, 1.4.2 Nicomachides, disgusted at not Procrustes (bandit), 2.1.14 being elected general, 3.4.1 Prodicus the wise, "Choice of Heracles," 2.1.21-end Odysseus, 1.3.7; 4.6.15 prudence, 1.1.16, 1.2.17–23; Olympia, 3.13.1 3.9.4; 4.5.7; in religion, 1.1.20; 4.3.2 Palamedes, envied for wisdom by Odysseus, 4.2.33 religion, Socrates and, 1.1.20 Parrhasius (Athenian painter), rule, fitness for, 2.1.7; 3.9.10-13 discusses painting with ruler, duties of, 2.1.8 Socrates, 3.10.1 Peloponnesians, 3.5.4, 3.5.10– sacrifice, offering of, regarded and practiced by Socrates, 11 Pericles (guardian of Alcibia-1.1.2, 1.3.3-4des), 1.2.40; effect of elosculptors, 2.6.6

liberty, 4.5.4

Lichas (wealthy and hospitable

Lacedaemonian), 1.2.61

Scylla, 2.6.31 Scythians, 2.1.10; 3.9.2 self-control, 2.1.1–7, 2.3.14, 2.6.1, 4.8.11; Socrates on, 1.5.1–5; 2.1.1–7, 2.6.5; 4.5.8–12

Self-examination and selfknowledge, 3.7.9; 4.2.24– 30

Sinis (brigand), 2.1.14 Sirens, 2.6.11, 2.6.31 slaves: and masters, 2.1.15–17, 2.4.3; value of, 2.5.2, 2.10.1–2; 3.13.4; 4.5.1–2

2.10.1–2; 3.13.4; 4.5.1–2
Socrates: character and habits of, 1.1.2, 1.1.10, 1.2.1, 1.2.14, 1.2.17–61; 3.3–8, 3.5.6, 3.6.2–3; friends in distress, 2.7.1; helpful to companions, 1.3.1; 3.8.1; 4.8.11; subjects discussed by, 1.1.11–16, 1.1.37, 1.4.2, 1.5.1, 1.7.1; 2.4.1, 2.5.1, 2.6.1; teaching of, 1.2.2, 1.2.17; 2.1.1; 4.5.1, 4.6.1, 4.7.1; to the ambitious, 3.1.1

sons, and parents, 1.2.49-55; 2.2

Thebans, relations with other Boeotians, 3.5.2 Themistocles: excelled, 4.2.2; fame of, 3.6.2; services to Athens, 2.6.13 Theodoras (of Cyrene; famous mathematician), 4.2.10
Theodote (courtesan), 3.11
Theseus, 3.5.10
Thirty, the (rulers of Athens in 403 BC), 1.2.32
Thracians, 3.9.2
Thrasyllus (Athenian general), put to death 1.1.18

put to death, 1.1.18 Tolmides (Athenian general), defeated at Lebadea, 3.5.4

Useful, the, 3.8.4-10

vice, 2.1.26, 2.1.29 virtue, 1.6.14; 3.5.17; 4.8.11

wealth, pride of, 4.1.5 wisdom, 1.6.13; of Socrates, 4.8.11; Socrates on, 3.9.4– 7; 4.6.7; captious argument about, 4.2.33

young: attitude of Socrates toward, 4.1.1–5; Socrates charged with corrupting, 1.2.1–60

Xenophon, reproved and warned by Socrates, 1.3.11

Zeuxis (prince of painters), 1.4.3

# INDEX TO OECONOMICUS

References are to chapter and section.

Aegean Sea, 20.27 agriculture: easy to learn, 6.9; 15.4, 10; 18.10; 19.1, 17; 21.1; praise of, 5.1-17; 6.7-10; 15.4, 12; reasons why some fail in, 20.1-21 alkanet, used as rouge, 10.2 Ariaeus, at the battle of Cunaxa, 4 19 army, as illustration of: obedience and industry, 21.5– 8; order and disorder, 8.4 - 7artisans, 6.7 arts and crafts, mechanical, how regarded in Greek states, 4.2-3; 6.5-7Aspasia, as authority on homemaking, 3.14 augury, 5.19

bailiff, choice and training of, 12–15 beauty, physical and moral, 6.15–16 bee, queen, duties of, 7.32–34 the Council, 9.15
children and parents, 7.12, 19
choirs and choristers, 8.3, 20
Choragus, office of, 2.6; 7.3
clothes, 7.21; 8.19; 9.6; 10.2–3
commander, perfect, 21.2–8
corn trade, 20.27–28
Critobulus (son of Criton), 1.1;
needs money and consults
Socrates, 2.1, 5–7, 16–18
Cyrus the elder, excelled as

cavalry, Athenian, inspected by

Cyrus the elder, excelled as much in agriculture as in war, 4.16

Cyrus the younger: gave promise of being excellent ruler, 4.18–19; conversation with Lysander, 4.20– 25

despots, misery of, 21.12 disorder in home, evils of, 3.2; 8.9 dogs, on a farm, 5.6 Dracon, laws of, 14.4 drones, 17.14

## INDEX TO OECONOMICUS

estate: improving, 3.10, 15; 5.1; 9.12; 11.12; management of, 1.2; 6.4

Euxine Sea, 20.27 exercise, good for woman, 10.11 expenses, household and estate, 3.6, 15; 7.36; 9.3; 20.21 eye, master's, 12.20

fallow land, 16.10 farming/farmers, 5.4; 16–20. See also agriculture farms, 3.5; 20.22, 26 figs, planting of, 19.12 friends, as property, 1.14 fruit trees, 19

furniture, household, 8.19; 9.6–9; 10.11
gardens ("paradises") of Cyrus

the younger, 4.22 generals, tests and qualities of good, 4.19; 20.6–9; 21.4–8 gentleman: name of, 6.12, 17; 7.2–3; 22.2; slave to be treated as, 14.9 gods, and the farmer, 4.19; 6.1

governing, art of, 21.20 granaries, 8.9

hoe, use of, 17.12 honesty, 14.2–3 horses: breaking, 13.7; buying, 3.10; on a farm, 5.5–6; rid-

3.10; on a farm, 5.5–6; riding, 11.15–18 house: building of, 3.1; 20.29; well-planned, 9.3–5 housekeeper, duties of, 9.11–13

husband: as provider, 3.15; 7.39;

should teach wife her duties, 3.11

idleness, 20.17–20 income, 1.21; 2.11 industry, 21.3 Ischomachus: house of, 9.3; incompany the 1.70, 10, above the part of 1.70, above the 1.7

structs wife, 7.9–10; objects and habits of, 7.1; 11.7–25; real gentleman, 6.17; 11.20

justice, 5.12

knowledge, 1.16; 20.2

laborers, agricultural, 4.9; 5.16; 20.16; 21.10 loyalty, to the master, 9.12;

12.16 Lycabettus, Mount, 19.6 Lyre, playing of, 2.13 Lysander the Spartan, conversa-

tion with younger Cyrus,
4.20

management, of men, 10.11; 13.3; 21.2–12

manure, 16.12; 17.10; 18.2 marriage, 7.18–19

master and men, 12.17–20; 21.10

Megara, 4.20 merchants, 20.27–28

money, not necessarily property, 1.13

Nicias (the foreigner?), remarkable horse of, 11.4

# INDEX TO OECONOMICUS

obedience, 4.19; 21.5-12 olives, propagating, 19.13 order, use and beauty of, 3.3; 8.3, 10-21

Persian king: gardens of, 4.13; interest in war and agriculture, 4.4; laws of, 4.7; method of government,

Phalerum, soil about, 19.6 Phoenician merchant vessel, remarkable, 8.11-14 pilots, 8.14 planting, 19.1-14 pleasures, deceitful, 1.20-23 plowing, 16.11 pots, 19.14 prayer, 5.19–20; 11.8 property: of Critobulus, 2.2; nature of, 1.7-15; 6.4; of Socrates, 2.3 puppies, 13.8 purple dye, 10.3

rain, 17.12 reaping, 18.1 rouge, use of, condemned, 10.2 rule, competence to bear, 13.4– 5; 15.1; 21.2

sacrifice (offering), 5.3 Sardis, 4.20 seed, sowing of, 17.8 servants, 9.16; 12 ships: merchant, 8.11–14; war, shoes, high-heeled, condemned,

10.2

Sicilian Sea, 20.27 slaves and masters, 3.4; 5.16; 13.9; 14.8-9

Socrates: and estate management, 2.17–18; property of, 1.3; reputation of, 11.3 soil, varieties of, 16.1–3; 17.8;

19.6: 20.12

Solon, laws of, 14.4 sowing, 17.1-11

state: service to, 11.9-13; taxes and burdens imposed by,

2.6; 7.3straw, 18.2

success, 2.17; 11.8

Tantalus, in hell, 21.12 theft, 14.5 threshing, 18.2-3; threshing floor, 18.6-8

utility and value, 1.14-15; 6.4

viceroys, Persian, 4.11 Vines, planting of, 19.12; 20.3-4, 20

war, 1.15; 5.13 wealth: advantages of, 11.9; meaning of, 1.9-16 weeds, 16.12; 17.14 white lead, for the face, 10.2 winnowing, 18.6-8 wives, position and duties of, 3.10–15; 7.32, 36–42; 9.15, 19

Zeus Eleutherius, 7.1 Zeuxis the painter, 10.1

# INDEX TO SYMPOSIUM

# References are to chapter and section.

Achilles (Greek warrior at Troy), 4.6; 8.23, 31 Aeschylus the Phliasian, 4.63 Agamemnon (Greek warrior at Troy), 4.6 Agathon (tragic poet), 8.32 Aidos (personification; Modesty), 8.35 Ajax (Greek warrior at Troy), 4.6 Alexander (Paris; son of Priam),

4.20 Anaideia (personification; Impudence), 8.35

Anaximander (of Miletus; author of prose version of the epic tales), 3.6

Antisthenes (follower of Socrates and afterward founder of the Cynic school), 1.3; 2.10, 12, 13; 3.4 (bis), 6, 8, 12; 4.2, 3, 6, 34, 61 (bis); 5.8; 6.5 (bis), 8; 8.3, 5, 6

Aphrodite, 3.1; 8.21 (cf. 8.15); "Celestial" (Urania) and "Popular" (Pandemos), 8.9 (bis), 10

Ariadne (daughter of Minos), 9.2, 3 (bis), 5 (bis)

Aristophanes (comic poet). Cf. 2.24; 6.8 Athena, 4.17 Athenians, 2.13 (bis) Autolycus (son of Lycon), 1.2 (bis), 3, 4, 8 (bis), 9, 12; 3.8, 12, 13; 8.7, 37, 42; 9.1. Cf. 9.7

Callias (son of Hipponicus), 1.2, 6, 10, 12, 13, 15 (bis); 2.2, 20, 23; 3.3, 10, 13; 4.1, 2, 4, 8, 15, 29, 33, 37, 45, 56, 62; 5.1, 10; 6.3, 5; 8.7, 10, 12, 28, 37, 42 (bis); 9.7

Callippides (tragic actor), 3.11 Castor. See sons of Zeus "Celestial" Aphrodite. See Aphrodite

Charmides (follower of Socrates and uncle of Plato), 1.3; 2.15, 19 (bis); 3.1, 9; 4.8, 27, 29, 52; 8.2

Cheiron (centaur), 8.23 Cleinias (cousin of Alcibiades), 6.12 (ter), 14 (bis), 16, 21 (bis), 23, 25

#### INDEX TO SYMPOSIUM

Crito (father of Critobulus). See Critobulus Critobulus (son of Crito), 1.3,

16; 2.3; 3.7; 4.10, 19, 23, 27, 28; 5.1, 2, 4, 7, 8, 9, 10 (bis); 6.1; 8.2

Critobulus' father (Crito), 4.24

Critobulus' wife, 2.3

Dionysus, 9.2 (bis), 3, 4, 5 (bis), 6 (bis)

Dioscuri (Castor and Pollux). See sons of Zeus

Elean (of Elis in western Peloponnese), 4.62; 8.34 Erechtheus (Attic hero), 8.40 Eros (Love), 1.10 (bis); 8.1

Ganymede (son of Tros; made cupbearer of Zeus), 8.30 (bis)

Gorgias (Sicilian orator), 1.5. Cf. 2.26 Gorgons, 4.24

Graces, 7.5 Greece (Hellas), 8.39

Greeks (Hellenes), 4.47; 8.38

Hellas. See Greece
Hellenes. See Greeks
Heraclean (of Heraclea), 4.63
Heracles, 8.29
Hermogenes (brother of Callias; son of Hipponicus),

1.3; 3.8, 14; 4.23, 46, 49; 6.1 (bis), 3, 4; 8.3, 12

Hippias of Elis (sophist), 4.62

Hipponicus (wealthy Athenian; father of Callias and Hipponicus), 1.2. Cf. 8.7

Homer, 3.5; 4.6, 7, 45; 8.30, 31

Horae (seasons), 7.5

Iacchus, 8.40 Iliad, 3.5; 8.30n. Cf. 4.6 (bis), 7,

Impudence (personification).

See Anaideia

Lacedaemonians, 8.35, 39 Love. See Aphrodite; Eros Lycon (father of Autolycus; one of three prosecutors of Socrates), 2.4, 5; 3.11, 12, 13; 9.1, 7. Cf. 1.4, 8; 3.13; 8.7, 11, 38

Modesty (personification). See Aidos

naiads (river nymphs), 5.7 Nestor (Greek warrior at Troy), 4.6

Niceratus (son of Nicias), 1.2; 2.3; 3.5, 6, 14; 4.6, 8, 45, 51; 8.3, 31

Niceratus' father (Nicias), 3.5 Niceratus' wife, 2.3; 4.8; 8.3 Nicias. See Niceratus Nicostratus (actor), 6.3 nymphs, 7.5. See also naiads

Odysseus (Greek warrior at Troy), 4.6

Odyssey, 3.5. Cf. 8.30n

# INDEX TO SYMPOSIUM

Olympus, Mount (in Thessaly; Seileni, 4.19; 5.7 home of the gods), 8.30 Socrates, 1.3 (bis), 5, 7; 2.2, 3, 4, 5, 7, 9, 10, 12, 15, 16, 17, Orestes (son of Agamemnon), 8.31 20, 24; 3.1, 2, 6, 7, 9, 10; 4.1 (bis), 5, 8, 9, 16, 18, 19 Panathenaea (festival to (bis), 20, 21, 22 (bis), 23 Athena), 1.2 Pandemos (Popular). See Aph-(bis), 27, 28, 32, 34, 43, 44, rodite 49 (bis), 53, 54, 56, 61, 62; 5.1 (bis), 9, 10; 6.1, 3, 4, 6 Paris. See Alexander Patroclus (comrade of Achilles), (bis), 7, 9; 7.1, 2, 5; 8.1, 4, 8.31 6, 12, 42; 9.1, 7 Solon (Athenian lawgiver), 8.39 Pausanias (enamored of sons of Zeus (the Dioscuri, Cas-Agathon), 8.32 Peiraeus (port of Athens), 1.2 tor and Pollux), 8.29 Peirithous (friend of Theseus), Stesimbrotus (of Thasos), rhapsode, 3.6 Syracusan (of Syracuse in Sic-Peisander (Athenian politician), 2.14ily), 2.1, 13, 16; 4.52; 6.6; Pericles (Athenian statesman), 8.39 7.2, 5; 8.1; 9.2 Philip (comedian), 1.11, 14, 15; 2.14, 20, 21, 27; 3.11; 4.50, Thasian (of the island of Tha-55; 6.8 sos), 4.41 Phleiasian (of Phleius, near Thebans, 8.34 Corinth), 4.63 Themistocles (Athenian gen-Phoenix (guardian of the young eral and statesman), 8.39 Achilles), 8.23 Theognis (gnomic poet of Meg-Pollux. See sons of Zeus ara), 2.4 "Popular" Aphrodite. See Aph-Theseus (Attic hero), 8.31 rodite Priam (king of Troy), 4.20 Urania ("Heavenly"). See Aph-Prodicus (sophist), 1.5; 4.62 rodite Protagoras (sophist), 1.5 Pylades (of Phocis; friend of Xanthippe (wife of Socrates), Orestes), 8.31  $2.\bar{10}$ 

river nymphs. See naiads

satyrs. Cf. 4.19 seasons. See Horae

Zeus, 8.9, 29, 30. Cf. also sons of Zeus Zeuxippus of Heraclea (painter). Cf. 4.63

# INDEX TO APOLOGY

References are to section.

Anytus (prosecutor at Socrates' trial), 29, 30, 31 Anytus' son, 30, 31 Apollo, 14 Apollodorus (follower of Socrates), 28 (bis) Athenians, 4, 20 Attica, 23

Chaerephon (follower of Socrates), 14

Delphi (seat of Apollo's oracle), 12 (Pytho), 14

Hera, 24 Hermogenes (brother of Callias; son of Hipponicus), 2,

Hipponicus (wealthy Athenian; father of Callias and Hipponicus), 2

Homer, 30

Lacedaemonians, 15 Lycurgus (Spartan lawgiver), 15

Meletus (one of three prosecutors of Socrates), 11 (bis), 19, 20 (bis)

Odysseus (Greek warrior at Troy), 26

Palamedes (Greek warrior at Troy), 26 Pytho. See Delphi

Socrates, 1 (bis), 3, 14, 15, 20 (bis), 21, 28, 32, 34

Zeus, 24

The Loeb Classical Library is the only existing series of books which, through original text and English translation, gives access to all that is important in Greek and Latin literature. A list of titles is available from Harvard University Press and at www.hup.harvard.edu/loeb.

LOEB CLASSICAL LIBRARY  $^{\textcircled{\$}}$  is a registered trademark of the President and Fellows of Harvard College.

# Other Greek historians in the Loeb Classical Library

HERODOTUS
THUCYDIDES
PLUTARCH
POLYBIUS
DIODORUS SICULUS
JOSEPHUS
ARRIAN
PROCOPIUS
MANETHO



