

GIRLS
GIRLS

GIRLS
GIRLS

THE INDUSTRIAL VAGINA

THE POLITICAL ECONOMY OF THE GLOBAL SEX TRADE

PEEP
SHOW

Sheila Jeffreys

↑ PEEP ↑
SHOW

AIR
CONDITIONED



WELKOMMEN

WELKOMMEN

ADMISSION
£3.00



MOD
UPST

ON
£1

The Industrial Vagina

The industrialization of prostitution and the sex trade has created a multibillion-dollar global market, involving millions of women, that makes a substantial contribution to national and global economies.

The Industrial Vagina examines how prostitution and other aspects of the sex industry have moved from being small-scale, clandestine and socially despised practices to become very profitable legitimate market sectors that are being legalized and decriminalized by governments. Sheila Jeffreys demonstrates how prostitution has been globalized through an examination of:

- the growth of pornography and its new global reach
- the boom in adult shops, strip clubs and escort agencies
- military prostitution and sexual violence in war
- marriage and the mail order bride industry
- the rise in sex tourism and trafficking in women

She argues that through these practices women's subordination has been outsourced and that states that legalize this industry are acting as pimps, enabling male buyers in countries in which women's equality threatens male dominance to buy access to the bodies of women from poor countries who are paid for their sexual subservience.

This major and provocative contribution is essential reading for all with an interest in feminist, gender and critical globalization issues as well as students and scholars of international political economy.

Sheila Jeffreys is a Professor in the School of Social and Political Sciences at the University of Melbourne. She is the author of six other books on the history and politics of sexuality, including *Beauty and Misogyny* (Routledge, 2005). She is the founding member of the Australian branch of the Coalition Against Trafficking in Women.

RIPE Series in Global Political Economy

Series Editors: Louise Amoore (*University of Durham, UK*), Jacqueline Best (*University of Ottawa, Canada*), Paul Langley (*Northumbria University, UK*) and Leonard Seabrooke (*Copenhagen Business School, Denmark*)

Formerly edited by Randall Germain (*Carleton University, Canada*), Rorden Wilkinson (*University of Manchester, UK*), Otto Holman (*University of Amsterdam*), Marianne Marchand (*Universidad de las Américas-Puebla*), Henk Overbeek (*Free University, Amsterdam*) and Marianne Franklin (*Goldsmiths, University of London, UK*)

The RIPE series editorial board are:

Mathias Albert (*Bielefeld University, Germany*), Mark Beeson (*University of Birmingham, UK*), A. Claire Cutler (*University of Victoria, Canada*), Marianne Franklin (*Goldsmiths, University of London, UK*), Randall Germain (*Carleton University, Canada*), Stephen Gill (*York University, Canada*), Jeffrey Hart (*Indiana University, USA*), Eric Helleiner (*Trent University, Canada*), Otto Holman (*University of Amsterdam, the Netherlands*), Marianne H. Marchand (*Universidad de las Américas-Puebla, Mexico*), Craig N. Murphy (*Wellesley College, USA*), Robert O'Brien (*McMaster University, Canada*), Henk Overbeek (*Vrije Universiteit, the Netherlands*), Anthony Payne (*University of Sheffield, UK*), V. Spike Peterson (*University of Arizona, USA*) and Rorden Wilkinson (*University of Manchester, UK*).

This series, published in association with the *Review of International Political Economy*, provides a forum for current and interdisciplinary debates in international political economy. The series aims to advance understanding of the key issues in the global political economy, and to present innovative analyses of emerging topics. The titles in the series focus on three broad themes:

- the structures, processes and actors of contemporary global transformations
- the changing forms taken by governance, at scales from the local and everyday to the global and systemic
- the inseparability of economic from political, social and cultural questions, including resistance, dissent and social movements.

The series comprises two strands:

The *RIPE Series in Global Political Economy* aims to address the needs of students and teachers, and the titles will be published in hardback and paperback. Titles include

Transnational Classes and International Relations

Kees van der Pijl

Gender and Global Restructuring:

Sightings, Sites and Resistances

Edited by Marianne H Marchand and Anne Sisson Runyan

Global Political Economy

Contemporary Theories

Edited by Ronen Palan

Ideologies of Globalization

Contending Visions of a New World Order

Mark Rupert

The Clash within Civilisations

Coming to Terms with Cultural Conflicts

Dieter Senghaas

Global Unions?

Theory and Strategies of Organized Labour in the Global Political Economy

Edited by Jeffrey Harrod and Robert O'Brien

Political Economy of a Plural World

Critical Reflections on Power, Morals and Civilizations

Robert Cox with Michael Schechter

A Critical Rewriting of Global Political Economy

Integrating Reproductive, Productive and Virtual Economies

V. Spike Peterson

Contesting Globalization

Space and Place in the World Economy

André C. Drainville

Global Institutions and Development

Framing the World?

Edited by Morten Bøås and Desmond McNeill

Global Institutions, Marginalization, and Development

Craig N. Murphy

Critical Theories, International Relations and 'the Anti-Globalisation Movement'

The Politics of Global Resistance

Edited by Catherine Eschle and Bice Manguashca

Globalization, Governmentality, and Global Politics

Regulation for the Rest of Us?

Ronnie D. Lipschutz, with James K. Rowe

Critical Perspectives on Global Governance

Rights and Regulation in Governing Regimes

Jean Grugel and Nicola Piper

Beyond States and Markets

The Challenges of Social Reproduction

Edited by Isabella Bakker and Rachel Silvey

The Industrial Vagina

The Political Economy of the Global Sex Trade

Sheila Jeffreys

Routledge/RIPE Studies in Global Political Economy is a forum for innovative new research intended for a high-level specialist readership, and the titles will be available in hardback only. Titles include:

1. Globalization and Governance*

Edited by Aseem Prakash and Jeffrey A. Hart

2. Nation-States and Money

The Past, Present and Future of National Currencies

Edited by Emily Gilbert and Eric Helleiner

3. The Global Political Economy of Intellectual Property Rights

The New Enclosures?

Christopher May

4. Integrating Central Europe

EU Expansion and Poland, Hungary and the Czech Republic

Otto Holman

5. Capitalist Restructuring, Globalization and the Third Way

Lessons from the Swedish Model

J. Magnus Ryner

*Also available in paperback

6. Transnational Capitalism and the Struggle over European Integration

Bastiaan van Apeldoorn

7. World Financial Orders

An Historical International Political Economy

Paul Langley

8. The Changing Politics of Finance in Korea and Thailand

From Deregulation to Debacle

Xiaoke Zhang

9. Anti-Immigrantism in Western Democracies

Statecraft, Desire and the Politics of Exclusion

Roxanne Lynn Doty

10. The Political Economy of European Employment

European Integration and the Transnationalization of the (Un)Employment Question

Edited by Henk Overbeek

11. Rethinking Global Political Economy

Emerging Issues, Unfolding Odysseys

Edited by Mary Ann Tétreault, Robert A. Denemark, Kenneth P. Thomas and Kurt Burch

12. Rediscovering International Relations Theory

Matthew Davies and Michael Niemann

13. International Trade and Developing Countries*

Bargaining Coalitions in the GATT and WTO

Amrita Narlikar

14. The Southern Cone Model

The Political Economy of Regional Capitalist Development in Latin America

Nicola Phillips

15. The Idea of Global Civil Society

Politics and Ethics of a Globalizing Era

Edited by Randall D. Germain and Michael Kenny

16. Governing Financial Globalization

International Political Economy and Multi-Level Governance

Edited by Andrew Baker, David Hudson and Richard Woodward

*Also available in paperback

17. Resisting Intellectual Property

Debra J. Halbert

18. Neoliberal Hegemony

A Global Critique

Edited by Dieter Plehwe, Bernhard Walpen and Gisela Neunhöffer

19. Global Standards of Market Civilization

Edited by Brett Bowden and Leonard Seabrooke

20. Beyond Globalization

Capitalism, Territoriality and the International Relations of Modernity

Hannes Lacher

21. Images of Gramsci

Connections and Contentions in Political Theory and
International Relations

Edited by Andreas Bieler and Adam David Morton

22. Global Public Policy

Business and the Countervailing Powers of Civil Society

Edited by Karsten Ronit

23. The Transnational Politics of Corporate Governance Regulation

Edited by Henk Overbeek, Bastiaan van Apeldoorn and Andreas Nölke

24. National Currencies and Globalization

Endangered Specie?

Paul Bowles

25. Conflicts in Environmental Regulation and the Internationalization of the State

Contested Terrains

Ulrich Brand, Christoph Görg, Joachim Hirsch and Markus Wissen

26. Governing International Labour Migration

Current Issues, Challenges and Dilemmas

Edited by Christina Gabriel and H el ene Pellerin

Praise for previous publications

By Sheila Jeffreys

BEAUTY AND MISOGYNY: HARMFUL CULTURAL PRACTICES IN THE WEST (ROUTLEDGE: 2005)

If readers are prepared to see the glitzy world of beauty through Sheila Jeffreys' eyes a whole new picture becomes available that is far from beautiful and which involves a re-evaluation of the meaning of beauty practices on a personal as well as a societal level. *Beauty and Misogyny* is not bedtime reading, but rather a brilliantly written, yet hard to digest, analysis of everyday realities that too often slip out of critical review by academic scholars and everyday women. It unmasks 'beauty' as a 'bastion of male dominance' (p. 197) that needs to be breached if these achievements are to be made towards the equal status of women. To conquer this bastion, however, women need to be aware of the roots and consequences of beauty practices. This process of consciousness-raising is central to Jeffreys' analysis and makes this book such an important one in a time where it all seems to come down to women's 'personal choice'.

Nadine Zacharias, University of Ballarat,
in *The Melbourne Journal of Politics*, January 2006

Sheila Jeffreys' book represents a powerful and provocative response to both liberal and postmodern feminists' defence of beauty practices against earlier feminist critiques of the 1960s and 1970s ... Overall, this book is passionately and persuasively argued and the examples given lend weight to Jeffreys' position, particularly in the concluding chapters ... Jeffreys writes with wit, clarity and vigour and her book is essential reading for feminist scholars and researchers.

Jo Pike, University of Hull, in *Feminist Theory*, 2006, 7: 366

In Jeffreys' latest book, she questions why the beauty industry is expanding, and why liberal feminists should see a virtue in women having the power to

choose practices that a few years back were condemned as oppressive. The critique of beauty practices, written about by Dworkin in *Woman Hating*, in 1974, has today all but disappeared, making way for procedures that ‘break skin and spill blood’ ... The book is one she has wanted to write for years, as ‘liberal feminists and postmodernists’ challenge the early feminist critique of beauty practices. ‘Not only are the practices creeping back, they are becoming more severe and invasive of the body itself,’ she says ... Jeffreys offers no comfort zone for her readers. Unlike some feminist theorists, she refuses to couch her arguments in inaccessible, academic language, or to accept that feminism has achieved its aims. For Jeffreys, the word ‘complicated’ does not exist. The reason for women’s oppression is horribly simple: men want their power and, for that reason, they will keep women in a state of subordination to maintain it.

Julie Bindel, *Guardian*, 2005

The Industrial Vagina

The political economy of the
global sex trade

Sheila Jeffreys

First published 2009

by Routledge

2 Park Square, Milton Park, Abingdon, Oxon OX14 4RN

Simultaneously published in the USA and Canada

by Routledge

270 Madison Ave, New York, NY 10016

*Routledge is an imprint of the Taylor & Francis Group,
an informa business*

This edition published in the Taylor & Francis e-Library, 2008.

“To purchase your own copy of this or any of Taylor & Francis or Routledge’s collection of thousands of eBooks please go to <http://www.ebookstore.tandf.co.uk/>.”

© 2009 Sheila Jeffreys

All rights reserved. No part of this book may be reprinted or reproduced or utilized in any form or by any electronic, mechanical, or other means, now known or hereafter invented, including photocopying and recording, or in any information storage or retrieval system, without permission in writing from the publishers.

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data

Jeffreys, Sheila.

The industrial vagina : the political economy of the global sex trade / Sheila Jeffreys.

p. cm.

Includes bibliographical references.

ISBN 978-0-415-41232-2 (hardback) –

ISBN 978-0-415-41233-9 (pbk.) –

ISBN 978-0-203-69830-3 (ebook)

1. Prostitution—Political aspects. 2. Prostitution—Economic aspects. 3. Prostitution—Social aspects.

4. Sex-oriented businesses. 5. Feminism. I. Title.

HQ117.J45 2008

306.74'2—dc22

2008021869

ISBN 0-203-69830-4 Master e-book ISBN

ISBN10: 0-415-41232-2 (hbk)

ISBN10: 0-415-41233-1 (pbk)

ISBN10: 0-203-69830-4 (ebk)

ISBN13: 978-0-415-41232-2 (hbk)

ISBN13: 978-0-415-41233-9 (pbk)

ISBN13: 978-0-203-69830-3 (ebk)

I dedicate this book to my partner, Ann Rowett, for the love and strength she has given me during the writing of this book. It is also dedicated to all my sisters in the international struggle to end men's prostitution of women. In particular women in the CATW network in the US, in Europe, in the Philippines and in Australia, such as Janice G. Raymond, Malka Marcovich, Jean Enriquez, Aurora Javarte de Dios, Gunilla Ekberg, and many others who have inspired and encouraged my work. They have made me feel part of something extraordinary, an international uprising of women against this traditional injustice.

Contents

Introduction: from pimping to a profitable market sector	1
1 Feminists and the global sex industry: cheerleaders or critics?	15
2 Marriage and prostitution	38
3 The international political economy of pornography	62
4 The strip club boom	86
5 Military prostitution	107
6 Prostitution tourism: women as men's leisure	129
7 Supplying the demand: the traffic in women	152
8 The state as pimp: legalizing prostitution	173
9 Conclusion: rolling back the global sex industry	198
<i>References</i>	211
<i>Index</i>	236

Introduction

From pimping to a profitable market sector

Prostitution did not wither away. Despite the confident understandings of feminists before the 1980s that prostitution was a sign and example of women's subordination which would cease to exist when women gained equality, at the end of the 20th century it had been constructed into a burgeoning and immensely profitable global market sector. This development is surprising if we consider the ways in which prostitution has been regarded by feminists over two centuries to be the very model of women's subordination (Jeffreys, 1985a). Kate Millett wrote in 1970 that prostitution was, 'paradigmatic, somehow the very core of the female's condition' which reduced woman to 'cunt' (Millett, 1975, p. 56). Feminists in the 1960s and 1970s understood prostitution to be a hangover from traditional male dominant societies that would disappear with the advance of women's equality. It was, as Millett put it, a 'living fossil', an old form of slave relations still existing in the present (ibid.). However, in the late 20th century various forces came together to breathe new life into this 'harmful cultural practice' (Jeffreys, 2004). The most important is the new economic ideology and practice of these times, neo-liberalism, in which the tolerance of 'sexual freedom' has been merged with a free market ideology to reconstruct prostitution as legitimate 'work' which can form the basis of national and international sex industries. This book analyses the processes by which prostitution has been industrialized and globalized in the late 20th and early 21st century. It argues that this growing market sector needs to be understood as the commercialization of women's subordination, and suggests how the rolling back of the global sex industry can begin.

Until the 1970s there was consensus amongst state governments and in international law that prostitution should not be legalized

or organized by states. This consensus followed a successful international campaign by women's groups and others against state regulation of prostitution from the late 19th century onwards (Jeffreys, 1997). This intensified through the League of Nations committee on trafficking in persons between the two world wars and culminated in the 1949 Convention on Trafficking in Persons and Exploitation of the Prostitution of Others. This Convention identified prostitution in its preamble as incompatible with the dignity and worth of the human person. It outlawed brothel keeping. In response to the Convention and the zeitgeist that it represented, pimping, living off the earnings of prostitution and procuring for prostitution were outlawed both in states which had signed up to this convention and in those which had not.

This mood of universal condemnation changed in the neo-liberal 1980s and the process began by which pimps were transformed into respectable business people who could join the Rotary Club. The business of brothel prostitution was legalized and turned into a 'market sector' in countries like Australia, the Netherlands, Germany and New Zealand, stripping became a regular part of the 'leisure' or 'entertainment' industry, and pornography became respectable enough for corporations like General Motors to make porn channels part of their stable. Whilst a section of the industry of prostitution became legal, respectable and a profitable market sector in this period, the vast majority of prostitution both within those western countries that legalized and throughout the world remained illegal and a most profitable sector for organized crime.

This book will look at practices in which cash or goods are exchanged in order for men to obtain sexual access to the bodies of girls and women. I include those practices generally recognized as prostitution in which men, through payment or the offer of some other advantage, gain the right to use their hands, penises, mouths or objects on or in the bodies of women. Though the prostitution of boys and young men for the sexual use of other men is a small part of this industry, this will not be considered in detail here (see Jeffreys, 1997). Included within this definition are the forms of marriage practice in which girls and women are exchanged between patriarchal families with the exchange of cash or favours, including child marriage and forced marriage, or through payment to agencies as in the case of the mail order bride industry. Pornography is included because it is different from other forms of prostitution only because it is filmed. It involves payment to girls and women for sexual access.

Stripping is included not just because prostitution and lap dancing take place in the clubs, but because it involves the sexual use of women even when no touching takes place. The practices covered here fit into the concept of 'sexual exploitation' which is the subject of the 1991 Draft UN Convention Against Sexual Exploitation: 'Sexual exploitation is a practice by which person(s) achieve sexual gratification, or financial gain, or advancement, through the abuse of a person's sexuality by abrogating that person's human right to dignity, equality, autonomy, and physical and mental wellbeing' (for discussion of this Draft Convention and the text, see Defeis, 2000). 'Sexual exploitation' includes non-pecuniary practices such as rape, whereas this book looks at commercial sexual exploitation in which the main means of power employed to extract sexual access from girls and women is economic, though other forms such as brutal force, kidnap and deceit may also be involved.

The industrialization and globalization of prostitution

This book will show that, in recent decades, prostitution has been industrialized and globalized. By industrialization I mean the ways in which traditional forms of organization of prostitution are being changed by economic and social forces to become large scale and concentrated, normalized and part of the mainstream corporate sphere. Prostitution has been transformed from an illegal, small-scale, largely local and socially despised form of abuse of women into a hugely profitable and either legal or tolerated international industry. In states that have legalized their prostitution industries large-scale, industrialized brothels employ hundreds of women overseen and regulated by government agencies (M. Sullivan, 2007). In some parts of Asia the industrialization of prostitution has taken place in the form of the creation of massive prostitution areas within cities. In Daulatdia, formed 20 years ago, in a port city in Bangladesh, 1,600 women are sexually used by 3,000 men daily (Hammond, 2008). This book will look at the globalization of prostitution too, examining the ways in which the global sex industry has been integrated into the international political economy. Kathleen Barry explains that, since 1970, 'the most dramatic changes in prostitution have been its industrialization, normalization, and widespread global diffusion' (Barry, 1995, p. 122). The result of the industrialization has been 'a multibillion-dollar

global market in women, at home and abroad, in highly organized trafficking and in the most diffused, informal arrangements' (ibid.). A 1998 International Labour Organization (ILO) report supplies powerful evidence to suggest that prostitution was organized on a quite new scale and integrated into national economies in significant ways in the 1990s. As Lin Leam Lim comments:

Prostitution has changed recently in some SE Asian countries. The scale of prostitution has been enlarged to an extent where we can justifiably speak of a commercial sex sector that is integrated into the economic, social and political life of these countries. The sex business has assumed the dimensions of an industry and has directly or indirectly contributed in no small measure to employment, national income and economic growth.

(Lim, 1998, p. vi)

The report is broadly positive about this development as good for the economies of these countries, arguing that prostitution should be recognized as legitimate by governments because of its profitability, even if they do not go so far as to legalize it.

Prostitution is now a significant market sector within national economies, though the worth of domestic sex industries is hard to estimate, considering the size of the illegal industry and the general lack of transparency that surrounds it. The industry of prostitution is most developed and entrenched in those countries in which militaries such as the US and Japan in the 1930s and 1940s set up prostitution systems on a scale and with a precision which is industrial, such as Korea, the Philippines and Thailand (Moon, 1997; Tanaka, 2002). The ILO report estimated that the sex industry accounts for 2–14 per cent of the worth of economies in the four countries studied, the Philippines, Malaysia, Thailand and Indonesia (ibid.). The Korean government estimated in 2002 that one million women were in prostitution at any one time in the country (Hurt, 2005). The industry was estimated to be worth 4.4 per cent of gross domestic product (GDP), more than forestry, fishing and agriculture combined (4.1 per cent). This was said to be a conservative estimate since many forms of prostitution were untrackable. It was estimated that between 1 in 6 and 1 in 10 of women in the country have worked in some capacity in prostitution (ibid.). The sex industry in the Netherlands, which legalized brothel

prostitution in 2001, has been estimated to be worth 5 per cent of GDP (Daley, 2001). In China the boom in the prostitution industry since the move towards a market economy from 1978 onwards has been particularly notable since it has developed from a low base in the Maoist era when prostitution was not tolerated. There are now an estimated 200,000–300,000 prostituted women in Beijing alone and anywhere between 10 and 20 million prostituted women in China as a whole (Zhou, 2006). The industry of prostitution is estimated to account for 8 per cent of the Chinese economy, and to be worth about US\$700 billion (ibid.).

The globalization of the sex industry is embedding prostitution in the international economy in many ways. The trafficking of women has become valuable to national economies, for instance, because of the remittances these women send to the home country. Governments like that of the Philippines have encouraged the trade by providing training for women before they leave. In 2004 Filipinas in Japan sent home \$258 million. \$8.5 billion in annual remittances from all Filipinos working abroad comprises 10 per cent of the country's income (McCurry, 2005, p. 15). Eighty thousand Filipinas entered Japan in 2004 on six-month entertainment visas, of whom up to 90 per cent were required to work in the sex industry. Globalization is enabling US pornography and strip club companies such as Spearmint Rhino and the Hustler chain, and the organized crime that is typically connected to them, to make profits from products and venues in many countries. Spearmint Rhino has a club in Melbourne. The US Hustler chain of Larry Flynt has acquired one too, and installed a local Melbourne pimp, Maxine Fensom, to run it. A celebratory article in the *Sunday Age* newspaper explains that Fensom is working with US 'adult' industry figures to create a home-grown Australian pornography industry based in Melbourne to make 'gonzo porn', which is the most debasing and abusive kind, for the American market, starting with 'Aussie f ... fest' (Halliday, 2007).

The sex industry does not just make profits for brothel and strip club owners and newly respectable pornography companies. Many other actors benefit economically, which helps to embed prostitution within national economies (Poulin, 2005). Hotels and airlines benefit from sex tourism, and business sex tourism. Taxi drivers who deliver the male buyers to brothels and strip clubs are given rakeoffs from the sex industry for doing so. Others who benefit include the bouncers and valets at strip clubs, and the businesses that

service strippers with costumes and makeup. They include the companies that market the alcoholic drinks that are consumed in those clubs. Two Scotch whisky companies, Chivas Regal and Johnnie Walker, have been identified as profiting from brothel prostitution in Thailand, for example, and thus, according to the Scottish *Daily Record*, fuelling the child prostitution and Asian crime barons that are so integral to the Thai industry (Lironi, 2005). Chivas Regal's 12 per cent profit growth in 2004 was attributed in one report to its association with Thai brothels. All of these profits are made from the sale of women's bodies in the marketplace, though the women themselves, as we shall see, are receiving a very small share of them.

The globalization of the sex industry means that markets in women's bodies are no longer confined within national boundaries. Trafficking, sex tourism and the mail order bride business have ensured that women's severe inequality can be transferred beyond national boundaries as the women of poor countries can be sexually bought by men from rich countries (Belleau, 2003). The late 20th century saw the wholesale engagement of prostitutes from rich countries in the prostitution of women from poor countries in a new form of sexual colonization. This is taking place through the mail order bride industry, in which women from Latin America are imported into the US, for instance, or women from the Philippines into Australia. It is taking place also through the industry of sex tourism. As part of tours organized through rich countries, or as individual 'tourists', rich buyers seek out local or trafficked women in sex tourism destinations. Thus men can be compensated for the loss of their status in countries where women have made strides towards equality, by outsourcing women's subordination to be consumed elsewhere or from imported poor women. The supply chain has been internationalized with large-scale trafficking of women from poor countries on every continent into destinations which include their richer neighbours, i.e. from North Korea to China, and to western sex tourism destinations such as Germany and the Netherlands. The Internet offers male buyers in the US sex chat lines funnelled through impoverished island states (Lane, 2001). This integration of the sex industry into global capitalism has not been sufficiently remarked or studied, and the implications for women's status and for governance have scarcely been remarked at all.

New technologies such as air travel have facilitated movement of prostituted women and girls and of the buyers and thus increased the

scale and international scope of the industry. Similarly the Internet has enabled sex tourism, the mail order bride business and other forms of prostitution to expand and interrelate. New electronic technologies from the videotape to the Internet have enabled the development of a massively profitable industry with a global reach, in which women in poor countries can be delivered in film or in real time to perform sex acts for men in the west (Hughes, 1999). Though the technologies which enable women's bodies to be delivered to male buyers change and develop, the vagina and the other parts of women's bodies which form the raw material of prostitution remain resolutely 'old technology' and impervious to change. The vagina becomes the centre of a business organized on an industrial scale though the vagina itself is still subject to the problems inevitably associated with the use of the interior of a woman's body in this way, in the form of pain, bleeding and abrasion, pregnancy and sexually transmitted disease, and the associated psychological harms that result from the bodies of live women being used as instruments of men's pleasure.

Prostitution is being globalized too through the process of economic development in countries previously organized around subsistence. Prostitution, or in some cases particular forms of prostitution, is exported to the sites of industrial development in 'poor' countries such as Papua New Guinea and the Solomon Islands (Wardlow, 2007; UNESCAP, 2007). Thus as foreign mining and logging companies open up new areas for new forms of colonial exploitation they set up prostitution industries to service the workers. These industries have a profound effect on local cultures and relations between men and women. This practice has a history in the 'development' of Australia in the 19th century, for instance, when aboriginal women or trafficked Japanese women were employed to service men involved in taking over indigenous lands for mining and cattle farming (Frances, 2007).

Traditional international politics does not include the sex industry within its concerns, as indeed it does not consider many other issues that relate to women and girls. Feminist theorists have advanced considerably in the last ten years in the gendering of international politics and international relations in particular. Cynthia Enloe was a pioneer in making prostitution a concern for feminist international politics through her work on militarism and military prostitution in the 1980s (Enloe, 1983, 1989). More recently feminist international politics texts have covered the issues of the trafficking in

women and sex tourism, notably the work of Jan Pettman (Pettman, 1996). But feminist work on the international political economy has generally either omitted prostitution or included it in ways which are problematic, i.e. as a form of reproductive and 'socially necessary' labour (Peterson, 2003). Trafficking in women has been the subject of a great outpouring of research in the last decade (Farr, 2004; Monzini, 2005), but other aspects of the industry such as pornography, for instance, have not been looked at in an international perspective. The only book which looks at the global sex industry as a whole from a political economy perspective is Richard Poulin's very useful *La Mondialisation des industries du sexe* (2005).

Language matters

In the last two decades the language used in academic literature and in policy formation has changed considerably as prostitution has been normalized. Even feminist scholars and activists now generally use a new euphemistic language, such that it has become unusual to find 'prostitution' referred to at all. In consonance with the understanding promoted by some sex work advocacy groups in the 1980s, prostitution is commonly referred to currently as 'sex work', which suggests that it should be seen as a legitimate form of work (Jeffreys, 1997; Jeness, 1993). Those who promote the notion that prostitution should be seen as ordinary work I shall refer to as the 'sex work lobby' and the ideas that underlie this approach as the 'sex work position'. The sex work position is the basis of the demands for the normalization and legalization of prostitution. As a corollary of this position the men who buy women are now commonly referred to as 'clients', which normalizes their practice as just another form of consumer activity. Those who run prostitution venues and take the profits from the industry are regularly referred to in my state of Victoria, Australia, where brothels are regulated by the Business Licensing Authority, as 'service providers' (M. Sullivan, 2007).

In the 1990s the language relating to the trafficking of women into prostitution has also been changed by those who consider prostitution an ordinary market sector. Thus trafficking is now called, by many sex worker activists and those in migration studies, migration for labour (Agustin, 2006a). Language is important. The use of the ordinary language of commerce in relation to prostitution makes

the harm of this practice invisible. It facilitates the profitable development of the global industry. If any progress is to be made in reining in the global industry then language which makes the harm visible must be retained or developed. In this book I use language which calls attention to the harm that prostitution constitutes for women. Thus I refer to prostituted women rather than sex workers, because this suggests that something harmful is being done to the women and brings the perpetrators into the picture. I call the male buyers 'prostitutors', rather than clients, in reference to the useful word in Spanish 'prostituidor', i.e. the man who prostitutes the woman, a formulation that suggests disapproval and one that is not available in English. I refer to those who gain third party profits as pimps and procurers, terms which may now seem old-fashioned but which show a reasonable disdain for the practice of deriving profits from women's pain. States which legalize their prostitution industries I refer to as 'pimp states'. I shall continue to use the term 'trafficking in women' to refer to the practice of transporting women into debt bondage.

Prostitution as a harmful cultural practice

Most of the academic and feminist literature on prostitution which uses the language of 'sex work' is based upon the premise that it is possible, or even desirable, to make distinctions between various forms of the sex industry; between child and adult prostitution, between trafficking and prostitution, between forced and free trafficking, between forced and free prostitution, between legal and illegal sectors of the industry, between prostitution in the west and prostitution in the non-west. The creation of distinctions legitimizes forms of prostitution by criticizing some and not others. This book is different because it looks for connections and interrelationships rather than distinctions. It looks at the ways in which all these aspects of sexual exploitation depend upon and involve one another. Those who seek to make distinctions generally subscribe to the notion that there is a free and respectable kind of prostitution for adults which can be seen as ordinary work and legalized, a form of prostitution for the rational, choosing individual, based upon equality and contract. The vast majority of prostitution fits this image very badly indeed but it is the necessary fiction that underlies the normalization and legalization of the industry.

This book employs a radical feminist framework which understands prostitution to be a harmful cultural practice originating in the subordination of women (Jeffreys, 2004) and constituting a form of violence against women (Jeffreys, 1997). It is inspired by the work of other radical feminist theorists on prostitution such as Kathleen Barry (1979, 1995) and Andrea Dworkin (1983), and seeks to extend their analyses to the global industry in a variety of its forms. Since this book takes the perspective that prostitution is harmful to women it does not take a normalizing approach. Thus the book ends with a consideration of ways in which the global industry of prostitution may best be wound back, so that the traditional feminist hopefulness of ending prostitution may once more become imaginable and a reasonable goal for feminists to pursue in public policy.

The Industrial Vagina starts from the understanding that prostitution is a harmful cultural practice. It is overwhelmingly a practice that is carried out through and in the bodies of women and for the benefit of men. Since the 1970s there has been considerable development in the recognition of what are called in United Nations documents 'Harmful traditional/cultural practices' (Jeffreys, 2005). The words traditional and cultural are used interchangeably in UN literature on this subject. This development is the result of feminist campaigning and was kickstarted by concerns about female genital mutilation, which can be considered the paradigmatic 'harmful cultural practice'. This concern was written into the 1979 United Nations Convention on the Elimination of all Forms of Discrimination Against Women (CEDAW). Article 2(f) of CEDAW states that parties to the Convention will 'take all appropriate measures, including legislation, to modify or abolish existing laws, regulations, *customs and practices* which constitute discrimination against women' (my italics). Article 5(a) similarly states that 'all appropriate measures' will be taken to 'modify *the social and cultural patterns of conduct* of men and women, with a view to achieving the elimination of prejudices and *customary* and all other practices which are based on the idea of the inferiority or the superiority of either of the sexes or on stereotyped roles for men and women' (my italics). Prostitution fits these criteria particularly well. It stems from the understanding that women have the stereotyped role of providing their bodies for men's pleasure with no concern for their feelings or personhood. In the case of the prostitutes it encompasses the stereotyped role of men acting out their patriarchal

right to use the bodies of women who wish to be elsewhere, or may even be crying from the pain, for their own satisfaction. It is justified by tradition as in the frequently uttered nostrum that it is the 'oldest profession'. Slavery is old too but seldom justified by its longevity. The feminist historian Gerda Lerner writes most usefully about the way in which brothel prostitution in the ancient Middle East originated in the enslavement of captives in warfare, as a way of tidily dealing with surplus women slaves (Lerner, 1987).

The definition of harmful traditional practices was extended in 1995 in a UN Fact Sheet No. 23 entitled *Harmful Traditional Practices Affecting the Health of Women and Children*. The criteria offered in the introduction cover several aspects which fit prostitution very well. The practices damage the health of women and girls, and there is a wealth of accumulating evidence about the extent of the harm that prostitution wreaks on health (Farley, 2004). Traditional cultural practices are said to 'reflect values and beliefs held by members of a community for periods often spanning generations' and are said to persist because they are not questioned and take on an aura of morality in the eyes of those practising them (United Nations, 1995, pp. 3–4). Though many values and beliefs of male dominance have been or are in the process of change in many societies, the idea that prostitution is necessary, as a way of protecting non-prostituted women from assault for instance, or because men cannot control themselves, is actually gaining in strength rather than diminishing. The practices are 'performed for male benefit', and it would be hard to argue that prostitution was not to men's benefit considering who is harmed thereby (ibid.). They are 'consequences of the value placed on women and the girl child by society', and they 'persist in an environment where women and the girl child have unequal access to education, wealth, health and employment'.

Many of the harmful cultural practices recognized in the international human rights community originate in the exchange of women. The exchange of women between men for the purpose of sexual and reproductive access and to extract free labour is the foundation of the subordination of women, and still deeply rooted within patriarchal cultures (Rubin, 1975). It can take a variety of forms, of which prostitution as commonly encountered in western cities is but one. Other forms of exchange in which the power relations of male dominance are clear, such as forms of marriage involving children, bride

price and dowry, force or cultural pressure rather than free choice, temporary marriage and concubinage, are all fairly well understood to be harmful cultural practices based upon women's subordination. But, as we shall see in this book, prostitution is integrally bound up with all of these other practices that have related origins. Women and girls are trafficked into brothel prostitution, but also into marriage and concubinage. It can be hard to separate out one of these practices from another. Prostitution is often seen as the opposite of marriage but, as we shall see in Chapter 2, there is in many cases barely a whisker of difference between these two dominant forms of patriarchal exchange of women. It is because prostitution is a harmful cultural practice that it cannot be airbrushed into a respectable industry. It is not like domestic labour, into which women are also trafficked and kept in servile conditions, though in considerably smaller numbers, because domestic labour can be done by men and is not necessarily based on women's biology and oppression. Domestic labour is not in itself a harmful cultural practice, though the conditions in which it is carried out can be profoundly harmful for women. This book is about the way in which this harmful cultural practice has been turned into a massively profitable global industry which is defended by proponents of the sex work position as the exercise of women's 'agency' and a form of 'entrepreneurship'.

The importance of social acceptance

The increasing profitability and expansion of the global sex industry depends on social acceptance. It requires that governments either tolerate or legalize the industry. Thus an industry report on the legalized brothel and strip club industry in Australia in 2007 makes it clear that increasing social acceptance is crucial to the continuing and increasing profits of the sex industry. A 'key success factor' listed in the report is 'ability to effectively change community behaviour' and this is necessary because of the 'significant level of moral stigma attached to prostitution' (IBISWorld, 2007, p. 22). The report notes that there has been a rise in 'consumer acceptance' but the industry is vulnerable to the 'negative image largely due to the moral, health and safety issues associated with it'. As the report puts it, 'entities are acutely sensitive to bad press that reduces the trust between (existing and potential) customers, the authorities and the general public' (IBISWorld, 2007, p. 8). Such a comment suggests that

feminist and community opposition could be effective in containing the industry. Unfortunately the majority of academic and activist feminist writing on prostitution in the present normalizes prostitution in its language and in its central concepts. This development in feminist theory is examined and criticized in Chapter 1.

Feminists and the global sex industry

Cheerleaders or critics?

National sex industries and the global sex industry are currently experiencing startling growth and profit levels (IBISWorld, 2007; Poulin, 2005). In consonance, the many problems that are now being recognized as intrinsically linked to the industry, harms to the health of women and girls (Jeffreys, 2004), organized crime and corruption (M. Sullivan, 2007), trafficking (Farr, 2004; Monzini, 2005), the early sexualization of girls (American Psychological Association, 2007), are growing apace. It is surprising in this context that many theorists and researchers on prostitution who define themselves as feminists, or concern themselves primarily with the interests of women, are increasingly using euphemisms in their approach to prostitution. The language of feminist theorists on prostitution was affected by the normalization of the industry in the last decades of the 20th century. Though some remained critical (Barry, 1995; Jeffreys, 1997; Stark and Whisnant, 2004), many started to use a language more in tune with the neo-liberal economists, such as Milton Friedman, who were calling for the decriminalization of prostitution and its treatment just like any other industry. They began to use terms such as ‘agency’, ‘entrepreneurship’ and ‘rational choice’ to describe the experience of prostituted women. These approaches are a public relations victory for the international sex industry. In this chapter I shall critically analyse the neo-liberal language and ideas that many feminists have adopted to see whether they are suited to the new realities.

The main vectors of neo-liberal language in relation to prostitution are the sex work agencies set up or funded by governments to supply condoms to prostituted women and men against the transmission of HIV. This ‘AIDS money’ has created a powerful force of sex workers’ rights organizations which take the position that

prostitution is just a job like any other, and now a useful market sector that must be decriminalized. Leading propagandists of this movement argue that AIDS funding has been crucial to their success in pushing the decriminalization argument (Doezema, 1998b). The international umbrella grouping of these sex work organizations is the Network of Sex Work Projects (NSWP) which uses neo-liberal understandings of prostitution to coordinate the international campaign for decriminalization through the work of activists such as Laura Agustin (2004, 2006b), and Jo Doezema (1998b). Jo Doezema, an NSWP spokeswoman, argues that AIDS money gave a big impetus to the campaign. She says: 'The original impetus for the NSWP came from the huge amount of interest in sex workers due to the AIDS pandemic. Vast amounts of resources were pumped into projects and research to stop sex workers from spreading AIDS' (Murphy and Ringheim, n.d.). Kamala Kempadoo, a significant researcher in the area of sex tourism and prostitution in the Caribbean who takes a sex work position, echoes the importance of AIDS money: 'some AIDS-prevention work has contributed to the formation of new sex worker organizations, inadvertently empowering sex workers in other areas than just in health matters' (Kempadoo, 1998, p. 19).

With the advent of AIDS funding, sex worker activists gained platforms and an authority, as experts in a supposed public health crisis, that enabled the creation of a strong, international pro sex work lobby group. Sex worker activists sometimes direct fury at those who point out the harms of prostitution, and this anger can influence feminists who have previously been critical of prostitution into changing their positions (B. Sullivan, 1994). In an example of this fury, Cheryl Overs refers to the work of academic feminists who challenge trafficking in women and are critical of prostitution as 'the drivel about sexual slavery that is produced in American "women's studies" departments and exported in a blatant act of cultural imperialism' (Doezema, 1998a, p. 206). The influence of the sex work position has been most marked in international health politics, UNAIDS and the ILO (Oriol, forthcoming). The position is a comfortable one for governments and UN agencies to adopt because it offers no challenge to the rights of men to buy women for sex. It represents a return to the 19th century situation before feminists initiated the campaign against the contagious diseases acts in the UK in the 1860s (Jeffreys, 1985a). At that time men's prostitution behaviour, that is buying women for sex, was an unchallenged prerogative. There were

prostitution survivors who set up organizations in the 1980s and 1990s in the US from a very different viewpoint, such as WHISPER (Women Hurt in Systems of Prostitution Engaged in Revolt) (Giobbe, 1990) and SAGE (Standing Against Global Exploitation) (Hotaling, 1999) and Breaking Free (V. Carter, 1999). All these groups argue that prostitution should be understood as violence against women, but their views have not been so influential, perhaps because they do not fit the politics and practice of neo-liberal economics so well.

The sex work position appealed to socialist feminists in particular because they were prepared to see prostitution as an issue of workers' rights rather than one of violence against women. Socialist feminist theory and action have focused less on violence against women and more on issues of work and the economy. The sex work position had considerable influence on feminist debate, also, because many feminist academics and activists from different points of view were keen to listen to and respect the views of those women who represented themselves as having experience of prostitution, and spokespersons of sex work organizations were generally uncritical (Jeffreys, 1995). When some sex work groups said that prostitution was a positive experience, an exercise of personal choice and should be seen as legitimate work, some found it hard to disagree. The fact that there were survivors expressing very different perspectives, and that adoption of a sex work perspective involved a conscious choice to reject these other views, did not cause as much concern as it should have. Radical feminists, on the other hand, were not prepared to see prostitution as ordinary work because their backgrounds lay in researching and working on violence against women, particularly sexual violence. They recognized the similarities between the experience of prostituted women and rape victims, such as having to disassociate emotionally from their bodies to survive, and suffering symptoms of post-traumatic shock and negative feelings about their bodies and their selves (Jeffreys, 1997; Farley, 2003).

The radical feminist philosopher Kathy Miriam explains the apparently positive motivation behind the adoption of the pro sex work position. She says that this position 'casts sex workers' rights in terms of a politics of "recognition"' which 'pivots on "identity" as its moral/political fulcrum and aims at redressing injuries to status, for example stigma and degradation, as a basic harm or injustice inflicted on certain identity-groups' (Miriam, 2005, p. 7). When this approach is applied to prostitution, 'the stigmatization of

prostitutes – rather than the structure of the practice itself – becomes the basic injustice to be redressed by pro-sex-work advocates’ (ibid.). Miriam explains that though this approach may well be founded upon the positive motivation of dealing justice to a stigmatized group, it makes it very difficult to see the ‘relations of dominance and subordination’ that underlie prostitution, particularly in forms that go beyond obvious force. Though the impulse towards adopting a sex work position might have been progressive on the part of many of the theorists and activists who adopted it, the language and concepts of the position are precisely those that most suit the present economic ideology of neo-liberalism. They can, as Miriam points out, veer towards a decontextualized individualism of personal choice which is quite far from the politics of gender, race and class that is at the root of both socialist and radical feminism. They can even go so far as to support a free market, deregulationist approach to prostitution which suits the interests of sex industrialists rather than the girls and women caught up in the industry. Since radical feminists have focused more on the politics of the personal, such as how power relations are represented in women’s everyday relationships with men, they have tended to be less well represented in theorizing international politics than socialist feminists. Those radical feminists who have been writing in the area of international politics have tended to concentrate on issues of violence against women, including prostitution (Kelly, 2000; Jeffreys, 1997; Barry, 1995). The sex work position has, therefore, tended to predominate in international feminist political theory through socialist feminist work which privileges a workers’ rights or politics of identity approach.

Prostitution as reproductive labour

One upshot of the adoption of the sex work position is that many feminist theorists of the international political economy have lumped prostitution in with domestic labour in the category of ‘reproductive labour’ (Peterson, 2003; Jyoti Sanghera, 1997). When serious feminist critics of globalization mention prostitution it is usually not problematized, since reproductive labour is an area of women’s work that such theorists tend to valorize in compensation for the way in which women’s work, particularly unpaid work in the home, has been ignored in economic theory. Theorists such as Spike Peterson (2003), Barbara Ehrenreich and Arlie Hochschild

(2003), have pointed out that the 'service sector', which is becoming more and more significant in rich countries as manufacturing is outsourced to the poor world, represents to a large extent work that women have always carried out in the private sphere with no pay. Once commercialized as 'services', this work attracts payment in the form of domestic labour, or caring work. These writers, less convincingly, tack on prostitution to this analysis and point to 'sex work' being paid for as 'sexual services'. Identifying prostitution as a form of reproductive labour is a category error. Domestic labour fits this category in a way that prostitution does not, particularly because 'reproductive labour' is defined as 'socially necessary' (Peterson, 2003, p. 94; Jyoti Sanghera, 1997). Though arguably the preparation of food and care of children is 'socially necessary', and indeed men may, though they do not much at present, do it too, prostitution is not. The idea of 'social necessity' in relation to prostitution applies specifically to men. Prostitution is a socially constructed idea (Jeffreys, 1997) and behaviour which may be necessary to the maintenance of male dominance, but is not in any way socially necessary to women.

There is another problem with recognizing 'sexual services' as part of reproductive labour. This could imply that providing sexual access to men whilst they disassociate is an ordinary part of women's work in the home, which would undermine decades of feminist work to end the requirement that women engage in unwanted sex which has no connection with their pleasure. Prostitution may outsource that part of women's obligations under male domination that they most despise and are particularly harmed by. It is not the same as cleaning or baking cakes. One good indication of this is the fact that youth and inexperience are the most highly valued aspects of a girl inducted into prostitution. She will never be as valuable to her handlers as she is at the moment at which she is first raped, which may be as early as 10 years old (Saeed, 2001). Maids are not most valuable when they are children and do not know what they are doing. It is more useful to see prostitution as the outsourcing of women's subordination, rather than the outsourcing of an ordinary form of servicing work which just happens to be performed by women.

Choice and agency

The sex work position employs an individualist approach, representing the diverse aspects of prostitution, such as stripping,

as areas in which women can exercise choice and agency or even be empowered (Hanna, 1998; Schweitzer, 1999; Liepe-Levinson, 2002; Egan, 2006). This approach is in rather sharp contradiction to the industrialization of prostitution which has been taking place in recent decades. As Carole Pateman points out, when socialist feminists adopt this approach to prostitution they end up being rather more positive and context blind in relation to prostitution than they would be towards other kinds of work, which are understood to be carried out in relations of domination and subordination (Pateman, 1988). Until recently the sex work position was mainly confined to research on forms of prostitution in the west, where prostituted women could be seen by 'choice' theorists as having the possibility of engaging in a variety of occupations to maintain subsistence. Now, however, the use of liberal individualist language, and even rational choice theory, has been extended to describe the most impressively unlikely situations in the non-west.

Alys Willman-Navarro, for instance, uses the language of rational choice in an issue of the journal *Research for Sex Work*, on 'Sex Work and Money' (2006). The journal publishes material from sex work organizations from different countries. She looks at research literature showing that prostituted women in Calcutta and Mexico engage in sex with prostitutes without condoms because they know 'sex workers who are willing to perform unprotected sex will be compensated for doing so, while those who prefer to use condoms earn less', a loss which can be as much as 79 per cent of earnings (Willman-Navarro, 2006, p. 18). Such research, she says, shows 'sex workers' as 'rational agents responding to incentives' (ibid., p. 19). The 'choice' between the chance of death from HIV/AIDS and the ability to feed and school her children does not offer sufficient realistic alternatives to qualify as an exercise in 'agency'. Nonetheless, Willman-Navarro remains upbeat in her approach: 'In Nicaragua I have met sex workers who are barely making ends meet. I have met others who send their children to some of the best schools in the capital ... They didn't do this by cashing in on one lucky night, but through years of rational choices.' Women in prostitution, this account tells us, can be successful entrepreneurs if only they act rationally.

Another example of this individualist approach can be found in the work of Travis Kong (2006) on prostituted women in Hong Kong. Kong's determination to respect the women as self-actualizing and possessed of agency leads to an individualist

approach quite at odds with what the research itself reveals about the conditions of the women's existence. Kong takes the fashionable approach to prostitution of defining it as emotional labour. The concept of emotional labour, developed by Arlie Hochschild (1983), is very useful for analysing much of the paid and unpaid work that women do, such as that of cabin staff on aeroplanes. When this concept is carried over to prostitution, in which what is done to the inside and outside of women's bodies is the very heart of the 'work', it suggests a squeamishness about recognizing the physical details involved, and requires a mind/body split. A large part of the 'emotional' work of prostitution is the construction of measures to enable a disassociation of mind from body in order to survive the abuse (Farley, 2003). This is not a usual component of 'emotional labour'. Kong says that she will employ a 'poststructuralist conception of power and identity formation' and 'depict my respondents as performing the skilled emotional labour of sex in exchange for their clients' money ... I argue that their major problem is not with the commercial transaction ... but with the social stigma, surveillance and dangers at their workplaces' (Kong, 2006, p. 416). These women, Kong explains, are 'independent workers' and she expresses some disappointment at how 'apolitical and conventional' they are, in contrast with the 'image of a transgressive sexual and political minority that has been portrayed in the agency model of prostitution feminism' (Kong, 2006, p. 415). But when the bald facts of their conditions of work are mentioned they seem to be about the use of their bodies rather than their minds: 'Since they have ejaculated on us ... They won't rape other women ... and they wouldn't lose their temper when they go home ... they won't ejaculate on their wives when they get home' (Kong, 2006, p. 420). The example given of how they have to develop 'skilled work techniques' is 'they have to learn to do fellatio' (Kong, 2006, p. 423). It is interesting to note that a 2007 report on the Australian sex industry states, for the benefit of those seeking to set up brothels, that the work requires no skills training (IBISWorld, 2007).

The postcolonial approach

Exponents of the sex work position can be very critical of those feminists who seek to abolish prostitution and the traffic in women. One major form of criticism is that feminists who seek to abolish prostitution 'victimize' prostituted women by not recognizing their 'agency'.

This has been employed against anti-trafficking campaigners and feminists who seek to end prostitution, who are said to 'victimize' prostituted women (Kapur, 2002). This criticism is not newly minted in relation to prostitution, but has been common to liberal feminist criticisms of the anti-rape and anti-pornography movements such as the work of Katie Roiphe in the US (Roiphe, 1993; Denfeld, 1995). US liberal feminists of the early 1990s argued that it is important to recognize women's sexual agency. They said that harping on about sexual violence and the harms that women suffer at the hands of men showed a lack of respect for women's sexual choices and sexual freedom. It is interesting to note that this idea has been taken up by postcolonial feminists to criticize radical feminists, as in the work of Ratna Kapur (2002).

Kapur says that those who 'articulate' the 'victim subject', such as suggesting that prostituted women are oppressed or harmed, base their arguments on 'gender essentialism' and generalizations which reflect the problems of privileged white, western, middle-class, heterosexual women (Kapur, 2002, p. 6). This accusation implies that those who identify women as being oppressed are 'classist' through the very fact of making that identification. Such arguments are based on 'cultural essentialism' too, portraying women as victims of their culture, Kapur says. Those guilty of these racist and classist practices are those involved in working against violence. She identifies Catharine MacKinnon and Kathleen Barry in particular, and anti-trafficking campaigners who 'focus on violence and victimization'. Campaigns against violence against women, she says, 'have taken feminists back into a protectionist and conservative discourse' (ibid., p. 7). Anti-violence feminists are accused of using 'metanarratives' and erasing the differences between women, and of a lack of complexity that 'sets up a subject who is thoroughly disempowered and helpless' (ibid., p. 10). However, it is not just 'western' feminists that Kapur criticizes for these solecisms, but Indian ones too who happen to be anti-violence campaigners. They too negate the 'very possibility of choice or agency' by saying that 'sex work' in South Asia is a form of exploitation (ibid., p. 26). She is critical of what she perceives as an alliance between 'Western feminists and Indian feminists' in the human rights arena as a result of which '[t]he victim subject has become a de-contextualised, ahistorical subject, disguised superficially as the dowry victim, as the victim of honour killings, or as the victim of trafficking and prostitution' (ibid., p. 29).

Another argument that Kapur makes is that prostitution is transgressive. This idea fits into the pro sexual freedom position of the new left which led to the promotion of pornography by those creating the 1960s and 1970s 'counterculture' (see Jeffreys, 1990/91). She argues that the correct approach for feminist theorists is, therefore, to 'focus on moments of resistance' and thus disrupt the 'linear narrative produced by the VAW [violence against women] campaigns' and this will 'complicate the binary of the West and the Rest' (ibid., p. 29). She explains that she chooses to do this by foregrounding the 'sex worker' because '[h]er claims as a parent, entertainer, worker and sexual subject disrupt dominant sexual and familial norms. In post-colonial India, her repeated performances also challenge and alter dominant cultural norms. From her peripheral location, the sex worker brings about a normative challenge by negotiating her disclaimed or marginalized identity within more stable and dominant discourses' (ibid., p. 31). But the idea that prostituted women transgress the social norms of heterosexuality and the heteropatriarchal family is by no means clear in India and Pakistan, where forms of family prostitution thrive (Saeed, 2001; Agrawal, 2006b).

In her research on family prostitution in Bombay in the 1920s and 1930s, Ashwini Tambe specifically refutes the notion that prostituted women should be seen as transgressive (Tambe, 2006). She stresses the continuities between families and brothels. She says that feminist theory is wrong in always locating prostitution 'outside the ambit of official familial institutions' (Tambe, 2006, p. 220). She criticizes the idea put forward by what she calls 'sex radicals' that prostitution has the potential to 'sever the link between sex and long-term intimacy and allow the performance of undomesticated sexualities that challenge common prescriptions of feminine passivity' (ibid., p. 221). What, she asks, 'do we make of sex workers who are, effectively, domesticated?' (ibid., p. 221). She cites national studies from India in the present that show that for 32 per cent of prostituted women 'kith and kin' were responsible for their entry into prostitution, and that 82 per cent of prostituted women in Bombay have and raise children in brothels. Precisely similar family structures exist in Calcutta's brothels too, she points out. Many prostituted women remain in brothels because they have been born there. In her historical study she found that husbands and mothers delivered girls and women to brothels. Brothel keepers adopted maternal roles towards the girls delivered

to them. Family members put girls into prostitution through the devadasi system, and in castes that traditionally practised 'entertainment' for their livelihood, girls and women supported whole families through prostitution combined with dancing and music. Tambe 'cautions against' the celebration of the 'liberatory potential of sex work and brothel life' and is critical of 'sex radicals' who say that 'sex work can be a source of agency and resistance' (ibid., p. 236–7).

But Kapur goes further in her romanticization of prostitution, stating that the agency of the women that the anti-violence perspective turns into 'victims' is 'located in the recognition that the post-colonial subject can and does dance, across the shaky edifice of gender and culture, bringing to this project the possibility of imagining a more transformative and inclusive politics' (Kapur, 2002, p. 37). In her laudatory commentary on Kapur's work, Jane Scoular makes the basis of this approach, which she identifies as 'postmodern', plain. She says such theorizing, 'by maintaining a critical distance from oppressive structural factors', enables theorists 'to resist attempts to see power as overwhelming and consuming the subject', thus creating space for a 'transformative' feminist theory which seeks to 'utilize the disruptive potential of the counter-hegemonic and "resisting" subject to challenge hierarchical relations' (Scoular, 2004, p. 352). If power relations are downplayed, then it is easier to see prostituted women as 'dancing'. In contrast, *The Industrial Vagina* is diametrically opposed to the idea of keeping a distance from 'structural factors' that underlie prostitution; rather, I seek to make them more visible.

Kapur's approach is echoed in the work of Jo Doezema, who argues that 'western' feminists victimize Third World prostituted women (Doezema, 2001). She too is savagely critical of the work of feminist anti-trafficking campaigners such as Kathleen Barry and the Coalition Against Trafficking in Women (CATW), accusing them of what she calls 'neo-colonialism' in their attitude to Third World prostituted women (ibid.). She says that the attitude 'that Third World women – and prostitutes in particular – are victims of their (backward, barbaric) cultures is pervasive in the rhetoric of CATW' (Doezema, 2001, p. 30). She is harsh in her criticism of feminists engaged in anti-trafficking work, saying that they are engaged in 'relations of domination and subordination' (ibid., p. 23), i.e. the feminists are the

oppressors here, a construction which very effectively disappears male domination from the picture. But, like Kapur, she has to deal with the problem that, as she admits, many activist Indian feminists are also abolitionists and involved in CATW. In her account these women become 'dupes' for accepting a western, colonialist position on prostitution and abandoning their own best interests.

Though Doezema is relentlessly positive in relation to prostitution in her more recent writings and advocacy work, it is interesting to note that she was rather candid about the harms of prostitution as she herself experienced them in Amsterdam, before she became involved in the Network of Sex Workers' Projects. In an interview from the mid-1990s she said 'all brothels are actually shit' (Chapkis, 1997, p. 117). She said, 'you are kind of struggling the whole time to keep the client from doing things you don't want and trying to keep him satisfied at the same time' (ibid., p. 119). On one occasion in escort work she had a 'client' who was 'really really drunk and a little bit crazy and ... I don't think about it a lot actually' (ibid., p. 119). She was in such danger that she says she did not tell her friends because '[t]hey would have said, "You are stopping; don't ever do this again." I didn't want to stop, so I never dared tell anybody' (ibid., p. 120). She comments that 'for almost everybody I make it more positive than it is, because everybody has such a negative idea about it already. So you tend to only talk about the good things or the funny things' (ibid., p. 120). In other words she deliberately downplays the severe harms of prostitution that she has experienced. Her attitude towards having to suffer unwanted sex acts, which would be called sexual harassment or sexual assault outside the prostitution context, is to blame herself: 'Sure, there are still times when I put up with something from a client that I don't want to have happen, either because I'm too tired, or I don't know how to say that I don't want it. But I have learned now to deal with that; instead of thinking, "Oh, I'm the worst whore in the world", I just think, "Okay, next time better"' (ibid., p. 122). Currently Doezema, along with other sex worker activist colleagues, minimizes the harms of prostitution in order to achieve the decriminalization of the industry. The minimization of harm is a common practice amongst prostituted women, who routinely block out or downplay the violence they experience both inside and outside prostitution (Kelly and Radford, 1990; Gorkoff and Runner, 2003).

Radical feminist responses to the 'agency' approach

The pro sex work approach to the industry of prostitution has been strongly challenged on many levels by radical feminist critics. Radical feminist theorists have been sharply critical in particular of what they identify as the liberal individualism of scholars and activists who emphasize the importance of women's 'agency' and concentrate on the freedom of action of the individual prostituted woman in contradiction to the oppressive relations of power within which she acts (Pateman, 1988; Miriam, 2005). The 'agency' approach is used in feminist theory in relation to other issues such as the veil, makeup and fashion, as well as sexual practice. Rosalind Gill has addressed the problems involved in this approach to the politics of appearance (Gill, 2007). She explains that an approach which focuses on 'autonomous choices' 'remains complicit with, rather than critical of, postfeminist and neoliberal discourses that see individuals as entrepreneurial actors who are rational, calculating and self-regulating' (Gill, 2007, p. 74). Pro sex work writers practise precisely the problematic approach she criticizes in their interpretation of the experiences of trafficked women: 'The neoliberal subject is required to bear full responsibility for their life biography no matter how severe the constraints upon their action ... Just as neoliberalism requires individuals to narrate their life story as if it were the outcome of deliberative choices' (ibid.). She asks why it is that so much feminist theory has taken up choice language and suggests that it is because a postfeminist perspective no longer allows recognition of the oppression of women: 'Is there a subtext to this? A postfeminist subtext that no longer views women as oppressed' (ibid.).

Kathy Miriam addresses the way the 'agency' approach is employed in relation to trafficking in women in particular and characterizes well the problematic liberal individualism that underlies this approach (Miriam, 2005). She argues that the sex work approach 'depends on a contractual, liberal model of agency that both conceals and presupposes the demand side of the institution of prostitution' and also conceals the power relations within which women are prostituted (Miriam, 2005, p. 2). The radical feminist approach, on the other hand, 'radically *challenges* feminism to theorize power and agency *outside a liberal framework*' (ibid., p. 2). The power relations in which prostitution takes place are founded, she argues, using Pateman's excellent

development of this concept (Pateman, 1988), on the male sex right. Under male domination, she explains, 'men's right to be sexually serviced is non-negotiable whatever else women can negotiate' (ibid., p. 14).

It is the fact that the male sex right cannot be questioned that creates the greatest challenge for feminists in the anti-prostitution struggle: 'this legitimized and entrenched relation defined by men's right to demand access to women is the central conception of male power at stake for the feminist movement to abolish prostitution' (ibid., p. 13). Under a political system in which this male demand is understood as simply ordinary sex drive, or sexual initiation, the whole idea of women being able to express 'sexual agency', an idea central to the pro sex work position, becomes problematic. They may only express 'agency' through answering the demand and allowing access; no other possibility is open. But because the male sex drive is seen as a fact of life, the very demand for prostitution itself is unquestioned. The pro sex work lobby cannot see this because 'male power is invisible to it as *domination* and only intelligible as *coercive force*' (ibid.). Miriam makes the important point that agency and oppression are not in contradiction to one another. Women exercise agency in order to survive the power relations and oppressive circumstances in which they find themselves. The theoretical task, Miriam argues, is for radical feminist theory to 'theorize freedom in terms of women's collective political agency (power to): this task requires an understanding that freedom is not negotiating within a situation taken as inevitable, but rather, a capacity to radically transform and/or determine the situation itself' (ibid., p. 14). The very general acceptance within feminist activism and theory of the sex work position represents an accommodation to the male dominant construction of men's sexual drive and men's right to commandeer the bodies of women in which to act it out. In that sense it is a defeat of the idea that feminism can recreate sex as eroticized equality (Jeffreys, 1990/91), and release women from the tyranny of the male sex right.

The earnings of prostituted women

Though women may, in the sex work approach, be seen as exercising 'agency' this is unlikely to bring them great economic benefit, though they may earn more than other unskilled women. The approach which emphasizes the rational choice of women to enter prostitution

on the grounds of the fine earnings they can make therein (Willman-Navarro, 2006) is contradicted by some more critical and carefully calculated analysis. Research is just beginning to take place into the economics of prostitution from the point of view of the women who are prostituted. Though prostitution forms an increasingly profitable global economic sector, the profits are largely going to those who control the business rather than to the individual prostituted women themselves. Prostituted women in Hong Kong, for instance, barely make enough to survive. The NGO Zi Teng (2006), writing about Chinese migrant 'sex workers' in Hong Kong, explains that there is a redundant labour force of 150 million people in the Chinese countryside. The higher unemployment rates among women cause them to move to Hong Kong and into prostitution, where they earn meagre wages of \$20 per 'service' and have an average of three customers per day. Zi Teng describes the physical abuse they suffer and the problem of being robbed. As is common in prostitution, they engage in sex without condoms in order to get the few customers they are able to attract. The majority of the prostituted women Zi Teng studied would 'not absolutely insist their customers use condoms'. Zi Teng does not place this in such a positive light as Willman-Navarro (2006), however, and explains the lack of condom use as the result of customer reluctance and the concern of the prostituted women not to 'affect the business' (Zi Teng, 2006, p. 30).

The situation was not markedly different for prostituted women in New York. Juhu Thukral, in a study of 'Sex Workers and Finances' in New York City, found that prostitution was not regular work for the 52 women she interviewed (Thukral, 2006, p. 22). The women 'moved in and out of indoor sex work' and 'the money made through sex work is often quickly made and quickly spent', which kept the women in prostitution. Half of the women wanted to save money but found that very hard. Thirty-eight per cent of participants said that they 'did not regularly meet their financial goal when working ... The four trafficked women reported being physically and verbally abused when they fell short' (ibid., p. 23). The situation of trafficked women was particularly dire: 'Trafficked women were rarely able to keep the money they earned, which was reported as low as \$13 per client, or just over half the takings of a \$25 session in a brothel catering to Latino immigrants' (ibid., p. 23). The need to make some money vied with the desire to keep themselves safe, so one respondent described how she would only 'go out with clients' when 'high'. If sober she preferred to go hungry rather

than face the dangers. Prostituted women in New York City might be expected to gain more economic benefit from prostitution than women in poor countries, but this is clearly not necessarily the case. A 2006 report on the legalized brothel and strip club industry in Australia, while waxing lyrical about the increased profitability of the industry, quotes a Sydney survey which found that, after brothel charges, one-third of women earned up to \$500 each week, about 20 per cent earned \$800–\$1,000 and another 20 per cent earned more than \$1,000 (IBISWorld, 2007). These are certainly not high earnings, and are likely to be restricted to the short number of years that the women remain in the industry. They do not reveal what the women are able to earn on leaving. Nonetheless the report states that average wages had decreased in the previous five years as a result of greater competition. The success of the industry, it seems, may disadvantage prostituted women.

One particularly impressive study does look at the effect of prostitution on a woman's economic prospects over the life cycle. Linda DeRiviere examined, through eight case studies and 54 interviews, the economics of prostitution in the life experience of prostituted women in Canada. Most of the women were aboriginal and had worked in a variety of prostitution settings (DeRiviere, 2006). She explains that '[c]urrent literature in North America is riddled with debate about whether prostitution is a profit-making and empowering venture of rational, utility-maximising actors' (ibid., p. 367). 'Most', she says, 'propose that prostitution is financially lucrative' and equate 'the sex trade with entrepreneurial skills'. They represent the 'choice' to enter 'sex work' as a rational decision in which the individual 'weighs personal costs and benefits or the expected utility of engaging in this lifestyle'. DeRiviere, in contrast, looks at prostitution in Winnipeg, Canada, over the life cycle. It usually begins in adolescent years, with Canadian research showing that 96 per cent of women enter prostitution before 17 years, and thus leads to 'opportunity costs' such as the loss of education, skills, work experience and on-the-job training which could enable prostituted women to leave prostitution and move on to another occupation. It is a temporary situation for most but has a permanent effect on lifetime earnings and productive outcomes. Her research subjects were overwhelmingly (90.3 per cent) indigenous women. In Canada, as she explains, indigenous women are hugely overrepresented in prostitution (see also Gorkoff and Runner, 2003; Farley and Lynne, 2004). The gross earnings of her respondents were \$27,071 but the women

did not receive this amount for their own use as 'transfers to pimps and dependent partners and escort agency owners' amounted to \$10,068 annually, or 37.2 per cent. Drugs and alcohol, which are necessary to enable the women to survive prostitution and disassociate from the abuse, accounted for \$12,617, or 46.6 per cent. Lost earnings following violent incidents etc. amounted to \$2,305, or 8.5 per cent. Thus the net annual surplus funds after subtracting substantial costs are less than 8 per cent of gross earnings.

The women she studied suffered reduced lifelong earnings as a result of the physical and mental health issues which resulted from prostitution, the costs of which, in DeRiviere's estimation, far exceeded the benefits over the woman's lifetime. She concludes, from her eight case studies, 'that throughout the period of involvement in the sex trade, a small earnings premium is the only direct benefit of prostitution at a personal level. However, such benefits are short term relative to the individual's available working years, and the offsetting costs of prostitution are huge' (DeRiviere, 2006, p. 379).

The development of prostitution

Despite the negative effects of prostitution on the lives of individual women, there has been a tendency in feminist theory to be upbeat and positive towards the contribution prostituted women make to 'development'. Feminist theorizing of prostitution has not paid much critical attention to the role of prostitution in development, and the variety of ways in which prostitution is linked with development are not yet included in development studies. If writers mention prostitution at all it is likely to be in the context of how useful the remittances of prostituted women are to the development of the economies of their countries of origin. Those who take a sex work approach see the prostitution of women who 'migrate for labour', meaning those who have been trafficked into debt bondage since women from poor countries do not have the resources or knowhow to 'migrate' under their own steam, as being positively beneficial for developing countries. Though prostitution does not bring about large profits for the vast majority of prostituted women, women are good at repatriating to their home countries as much of their earnings as they are able to spare from their own subsistence. This is in contrast to the behaviour of male migrants, who are likely to spend much more of what they earn, including expenditure for their own behaviour as prostitutes of their own countrywomen or

others in their worksites (Pesar and Mahler, 2003). Laura Agustin, for instance, argues that prostitution is economically valuable in a piece entitled 'Contributing to "Development": Money Made Selling Sex'. It is valuable, she says, because, 'recent studies reveal how money sent home by migrants finances important social and structural projects known as "development" ... This goes for money made picking strawberries ... and selling sex ... the amounts mean the same no matter how they were earned, and they are used to finance construction projects, small businesses and cooperative agriculture for families, communities and whole regions' (Agustin, 2006b, p. 10). She says that 'most cultures do have their own visions of developing, and migrants who send money home contributed to the realisation of those visions, including the millions who sell sex' (ibid., p. 10).

Jyoti Sanghera makes the same argument. She says prostituted women contribute to the development of their 'larger cultural communities by financing the construction of schools, religious shrines, post offices and other public service facilities. Remittances of their earnings from abroad help their governments service the national debt of the country' (Sanghera, 1997, p. 10). Moreover, Sanghera argues, encouraging governments to assess the value of prostitution to their economies would be helpful: 'Societies that allow sex businesses to flourish and proliferate could include them in government accounting' (ibid.). This positive approach does not factor in the harms of prostitution to the life-courses and economic possibilities of those who are prostituted. It does not consider the expenses that states may have to enter into in order to support the girls and women who have been harmed when through age or physical and mental health problems they are no longer valuable to the industry, the expenses of policing and the operation of the legal system involved in combating trafficking and other problems integral to the industry.

There is no question that the prostitution of women has played a significant role in the development of many national economies and continues to do so. What is in question is whether this should be celebrated or condemned. The role of black slavery in the construction of British economic supremacy in the 19th century, for instance, is considered a cause for shame rather than celebration (Fryer, 1989). It is not obvious that the contribution of prostituted women in debt bondage should receive a much more positive treatment. There is evidence of the way in which the prostitution of girls and women has contributed to the historical economic development

of Japan and Australia. The foundation of the 'comfort women' system for the Japanese military in the 1930s and 1940s lies in the phenomenon of *karayuki-san* in the second half of the 19th century (Tanaka, 2002). Young women and girls from poor rural areas were kidnapped, deceived by being offered jobs or sold by their parents to traffickers, through very similar methods to those used today in the trafficking in women. They were smuggled out of Japan and sold to brothels in neighbouring countries, in particular China and the east coast of Russia. The children, some of whom were as young as seven when sold, were raised and trained in brothels in the major business centres for this industry, Vladivostok, Shanghai and Singapore. They were trafficked on to brothels in South East Asia, India, Australia, Hawaii, the East Coast of the US, and even Cape Town. In the decades after 1868 their numbers increased rapidly. The trafficking of *karayuki* replicates closely the trafficking that takes place today. The girls were sold for \$500–800 to brothels and were then in debt bondage, often finding themselves tied into servicing the debt for many years. Many never saw their homes again, and many committed suicide. By 1910 the number of registered *karayuki-san* was more than 19,000, whereas their equivalent in prostitution within Japan numbered only 47,541. The trafficking was well organized through established crime organizations such as the Yakuza which were traditionally involved in this trade.

Yuki Tanaka uses the work of Japanese feminist historians from as early as the 1950s to argue that this form of trafficking in women was crucial to the rapid economic and industrial development of Japan in this period. But this importance was long neglected in scholarship. This neglect was perhaps similar to the neglect until comparatively recently of acknowledgement of the role of black slavery in the development of British capitalism (Fryer, 1989). Japan's domestic licensed prostitution system, on which high tax rates were levied, also played an important part in 'raising public money when the government needed large sums to build the basic economic infrastructure' (Tanaka, 2002, p. 182). The overseas prostitution business, however, was an important source for the acquisition of much needed foreign currency. There is evidence for its significance in the fact that out of a total of 1,000,000 yen that Japanese residents in Vladivostok remitted home to Japan in 1900, 630,000 yen was from earnings in prostitution. In the trafficking hub of Singapore most Japanese residents were dependent on servicing the industry of prostitution, including retail dealers, drapers, photographers, doctors

and brothel keepers. Japanese trade followed the *karayuki-san*, rather than the other way about. As Tanaka comments: 'It can be said that Japan's modern international trade developed from such small-scale retail trade beginnings which followed the expansion of the traffic in Japanese women in the Asia-Pacific region' (Tanaka, 2002, p. 170).

Even after World War II, Tanaka points out, the prostitution of local women was used in economic reconstruction as they were placed into a new 'comfort system', this time to acquire dollars from GIs. He comments that Japan's sex industry was so closely intertwined with the development of Japanese capitalism that it may be 'unusual to find another nation that exploited women for sex to that extent' (*ibid.*, p. 182). As Susan Brownmiller tellingly remarks in her preface to Tanaka's book: 'The moral lawlessness accompanying crude, rudimentary capitalism is not very different from the brutal sexual exploitation that accompanies warfare' (Brownmiller, 1975, p. xvi). This moral lawlessness has continued to create prostitution industries in countries engaged in the rogue capitalism of the free market today. Other poor Asian countries followed Japan's example a century later when the Philippines and Thailand made the sale of women's bodies vital to their economies.

Raelene Frances' work on the history of prostitution in Australia gives useful information about how the trafficked Japanese girls were used there (Frances, 2007). They were taken in debt bondage to outback mining towns like Kalgoorlie in West Australia for the sexual use of the isolated male workforces of those areas in the late 19th century, and can thus be seen as having played an important part in enabling Australia's economic development. Australia's present-day wealth owes something to the prostitution of these women in conditions of servitude. The prostitution of convict women, some of whom were already prostituted before transportation or prostituted aboard the ships to Australia, and many of whom had no other chance of survival on arrival, was also necessary to the foundation of Australia as a functional economy. Frances explains that the prostitution of convict women was undertaken by those entrusted with their care, who set up brothels in the warehouse accommodation they were put into when they got off the ships (*ibid.*). This is not the only form of slavery employed in Australia's economic development since there was enslavement of aboriginal people and the trafficking of Torres Strait Islander people into a variety of forms of labour as well. But the contribution

of prostituted women in debt bondage to Australia's prosperity, particularly its mining industry, has not been so much remarked. Frances has also researched the ways in which aboriginal women were kidnapped or leased through the exchange of gifts from the men with rights over them. They were used sexually as well as for domestic and other forms of labour in remote areas of western and northern Australia, on farming and cattle properties, by pearl divers in Broome, by fisherman and traders from Indonesia on the northern coasts (Frances, 2007). Unfortunately economic development in many countries and in many forms is increasingly dependent on the prostitution of women today, and this needs to be a concern of feminist globalization literature.

Feminist literature in development studies has begun to address the problem of violence against women, but not yet prostitution (Sweetman, 1998a). Non-governmental organizations (NGOs) involved in development are increasingly concerned to alleviate the violence which already exists in patriarchal cultures within which they operate, but the fact that violence against women can be a result of the development process is only just beginning to be recognized. Caroline Sweetman comments that 'there is evidence that violence against women increases in intensity where gender relations are being transformed and male privilege is challenged' (Sweetman, 1998b, p. 5). She calls upon development organizations to recognize 'the existence of violence against women as a barrier to development' (ibid., p. 6). Thus in Papua New Guinea NGO efforts to give women more opportunities of education are hampered by the fact that the dominant status of male partners might be undermined and result in greater battering of women seeking to attend classes. As economic development takes place, traditional structures of male dominance are undermined in other ways too. Village life, in which girls and women gained some protection through the males who had rights over them, and through traditional cultural restraints, is being replaced by urban growth, the creation of truck routes and mining camps, and girls and women are moving about more freely as well as taking part in economic activities. All of this has contributed to a wave of very severe violence against girls and women, including a high rate of gang rape (Jenkins, 2006). The development of violence against women is taking place in relation to economic change in many countries in Latin America, such as border towns in Mexico and in Guatemala (Amnesty International, 2006c), resulting in the killing of women and girls in their hundreds yearly. In Cambodia

the practice of gang rape has developed considerably in response to women's increasing mobility and economic participation (Jejeebhoy *et al.*, 2005), such that 61 per cent of male university students admit to having engaged in this activity against prostituted girls, 'beer' girls and other young women in the workforce who can be seen as departing from traditional roles and being fair game. Violence against women is a most important area for development studies that is beginning to receive attention, but the way in which prostitution is linked to development is much less understood.

Prostitution is created, even in cultures which have not known any form of the practice previously, to service male workers in economic development projects such as mining and logging camps, where it negatively affects the health and opportunities of women and girls at very young ages, and undermines the traditional ways in which women and men relate (Wardlow, 2007). Cynthia Enloe, whose work is always breaking new ground in forcing attention to the harms suffered by women in international economic and military development, pointed out the problem of the prostitution of girls and women on banana plantations in Brazil, for instance (Enloe, 1989). Mining and logging camps create the same harms to girls. Children are being prostituted in the Solomon Islands logging industry (*Taranaki Daily News*, 2007). A Church of Melanesia study found that 'Malaysian loggers in the Solomon Islands are involved in horrific sexual abuse of village children who are being raped, sold into marriage and used for pornography' (*ibid.*). In one small area 73 children had been 'exploited'. The logging industry is dominated by Malaysians but the clear-felled timber is shipped to China for projects such as building the Beijing Olympic facilities. An islander who had worked in a logging camp explained: 'There were seven Malaysian men there, and every one was married to a young girl, aged 13 or 14. They are not interested in the older girls – once they are 18. I don't know what the arrangement was – if they got money. But they must' (*ibid.*). A nine-year-old girl who was interviewed said that her father had taken her to the camp, where 'I have seen Malaysian men touching their house girls' breasts. They used to do that to their house girls. While they were eating, they would have one hand on their spoon (eating), and one hand on a girl's breast'. Children are sold into temporary 'marriages' in the camps by their parents. Bride price is a harmful cultural practice in the Solomons so this new form of prostitution is simply a development of this patriarchal tradition. In the port of Honiara itself girls

as young as 12 are reportedly working as 'dugongs', which is the local name for prostituted children. They service foreign freighters that anchor to collect tuna caught by local fishing boats (Callinan, 2006). A 2004 UNICEF study found dozens of examples of sexual abuse of children, 'from underage prostitution to the manufacture of child pornography, child sex tourism and marriages of convenience'. Nine boys aged 6–14 survived on the streets by having sex with the crews of Japanese fishing boats. One commented: 'It is very painful but I need money for food' (ibid.).

Shamima Ali's research for UNICEF in 2006 on violence against the girl child in 14 Pacific Island states demonstrates the ways in which economic development is creating severe problems of sexual violence against girls and women, including prostitution (Ali, 2006). She documents the same custom of parents selling girl children to logging and mining workers in Papua New Guinea, under the guise of original customs such as bride price which 'have been modified to suit the needs of the males in the family' (ibid., p. 6). Even the introduction of education can have harmful effects on girls, as some teachers ask for sex from students to pay the school fee (ibid.). Carol Jenkins' work on the changing sexual culture in Papua New Guinea as a result of economic development and the importation of pornography explains that from the 1930s onwards Australian administrators, miners and policemen exchanged trade goods for access to local women as they opened up the Highlands for profit (Jenkins, 2006, p. 27). Mining was cited, however, as a contributor to the growth of prostitution as early as 1900. From the earliest days when the colonizers began to develop mining, a prostitution industry was created, in a culture in which it had not existed, for male workers recruited locally. By 1970, when prostitution was being documented in urban and rural areas, it was contributing to the spread of syphilis. The negative consequences of economic development in the prostitution of women and girls need to be taken seriously. The ethical concerns that are considered in relation to mining and logging developments need to include the construction of prostitution alongside issues of land rights, human rights and environmental destruction. The harms of prostitution can perhaps become visible if the bodies of girls are seen as part of the environment too. Discussion of human rights and gender equality in development in relation to mining now includes consideration of violence against women and HIV but not yet prostitution (Macdonald, 2003). The creation of prostitution is a serious

obstacle to the stated aim of the International Labour Organization of creating 'fair globalization'.

Conclusion

When feminist theorizing of prostitution frames the practice as ordinary work which enables women to express 'choice' and 'agency', and represents trafficked women in debt bondage as simply 'migrating for labour', it serves to normalize the industry and support its growth. It airbrushes the harms that girls and women suffer in prostitution and makes it very difficult for feminist activists to oppose the construction of prostitution industries as an ordinary part of economic development, and demand dignified work for women. Such theorizing also supports the campaign by the prostitution industry, sex work organizations and some governments to legalize or decriminalize prostitution. For the industry to prosper, toleration is good, but legalization is better. Thus the approaches that feminist theorists choose to take have important implications. The growth of the industry multiplies the harms that are an integral part of prostitution and other forms of sexual exploitation whether 'legal' or not. The sex industry cannot be quarantined, set apart from the rest of the society for men to abuse the women caught within the industry in seclusion. Approaches to prostitution which focus on 'choice' and 'agency' are profoundly unsuitable to address the conditions in which the vast majority of women and girls enter and struggle to survive in prostitution, as the following chapters will demonstrate.

Marriage and prostitution

In 2007 the UN Trafficking Rapporteur identified trafficking in women for marriage, in such practices as the mail order bride industry and forced marriage, as a significant aspect of the trafficking in women which needed to be addressed (UNHRC, 2007a). This is an important extension of feminist and human rights analysis of trafficking in women. It places the spotlight on marriage, which has not usually been associated with prostitution in contemporary human rights scholarship. As the Rapporteur's report points out, marriage is often a straightforwardly economic transaction, in which sexual access to girls and women is purchased through bride price or a fee to an introduction agency. An understanding of the dynamics of marriage is helpful as a basis for an examination of the global industry of prostitution because it illustrates that prostitution is not just a form of ordinary ungendered work, like domestic labour or tomato picking, but has its origin, and its counterpart, in traditional forms of exchange of girls and women for cash or goods, in a form of chattel slavery (Rubin, 1975). Not all forms of marriage include the element of giving cash or goods in exchange for the woman or girl, but forms which do, such as child marriage, temporary marriage, the trafficking of women for marriage in India and China, and even concubinage, are increasing in many countries. The mail order bride industry has integrated the sale of women for sexual and other purposes into the global sex industry and the global economy. Where marriage is the result of sale or any form of commercial exchange it can be hard to distinguish this particular harmful practice from prostitution. I refer to this practice as servile marriage. Where no direct financial exchange takes place, but women are trapped by poverty and lack of remedy such as divorce, marriage still contains the aspect of prostitution

since women have to allow sexual access to their bodies in return for subsistence.

The United Nations convention on marriage of 1964 shows a clear awareness of the harms to the human rights of women and girls involved in traditional practices that create servile marriages. The convention requires 'full and free consent' for marriage, that states specify a minimum age of marriage, though not what that age should be, and that marriages should be registered (United Nations, 1964). It 'reaffirms' in the preamble that all states 'should take all appropriate measures with a view to abolishing such customs, ancient laws and practices by ensuring, *inter alia*, complete freedom in the choice of a spouse, eliminating completely child marriages and the betrothal of young girls before the age of puberty, establishing appropriate penalties where necessary and establishing a civil or other register in which all marriages will be recorded'. The confidence of the marriage convention that servile marriage could be brought to an end looks strangely out of place today. Many of the practices have become sources of concern in western nations as they are practised by some members of immigrant or indigenous communities. Even at the time that the convention was promulgated critics attacked it on the grounds of cultural relativism and it had to be defended by such arguments as the fact that many non-western nations supported the convention (Schwelb, 1963). In more recent decades some feminist scholars have developed defences of practices such as arranged marriage and early marriage from a cultural relativist perspective, which have undermined human rights approaches to the problems (Moschetti, 2006).

Surprisingly, marriage and prostitution are often seen as polar opposites and distinguished from one another. The operation of this distinction is particularly clear in the phenomenon of 'temporary marriages', called *mut'a* or *sigheh* amongst Shi'ite muslims, where 'marriage' even for a couple of hours, for sexual purposes with payment to the woman, is seen as religiously acceptable whilst prostitution is totally condemned (Haeri, 1992). To eyes untrained in such religious distinctions it can be hard to see the difference. Feminist theorists, indeed, for more than two centuries have argued that prostitution and marriage are but two aspects of the one problem (Jeffreys, 1985b; Pateman, 1988). The problem is that, under male dominance, women are forced to submit their bodies to men's use in exchange for subsistence, or even, in the case of the honour killings of girls who reject arranged marriages,

to escape assassination. This exchange of women between men has been recognized in the work of Lévi-Strauss as the very basis of the organization of society and culture. Gayle Rubin criticized the fact that Lévi-Strauss seemed to accept this exchange as just the way things were without recognizing the oppression of women involved (Rubin, 1975). She says that the usefulness of his concept was that 'it suggests that we look for the ultimate locus of women's oppression within the traffic in women, rather than within the traffic in merchandise' (ibid., p. 175). The exchange of women was specifically between men since men were the gift givers and women the gifts. The system was for the benefit of men because '[t]he relations of such a system are such that women are no longer in a position to realize the benefits of their own circulation ... it is men who are the beneficiaries of the product of such exchanges – social organization' (ibid., p. 174).

In this chapter I will look at the ways in which feminists have made the connections between marriage and prostitution. I will examine the development of the forms of marriage which are most difficult to distinguish from prostitution, such as the mail order bride industry, into profitable market sectors and argue that forms of servile marriage do, like prostitution, commercialize the subordination of women.

Marriage and prostitution in feminist theory

In every outbreak of feminist activity from the late 18th century onwards, the similarities between marriage and prostitution have been theorized and often made central to analysis. Thus as early as 1790 Mary Wollstonecraft called marriage 'legal prostitution' (quoted in Pateman, 1988, p.190). Mrs Lucinda B. Chandler, speaking on the need to reform marriage at an international women's conference in the US in 1888, expostulated: 'Women as well as men must eliminate from marriage the features of prostitution, for when prostitution ceases inside of marriage it will disappear outside' (quoted in Jeffreys, 1985a, p. 23). British feminist activists against prostitution were often quite explicit about the similarities between these institutions of male dominance. Thus Elizabeth Wolstenholme Elmy, who combined the surname of her partner with her own, and would not have married him but for pressure from other feminists in the 1880s to be respectable, saw the 'bodily slavery' of women

as forming the foundation of both systems (Jeffreys, 1985a, p. 34). 'Free love' feminists who rejected marriage altogether in the 1890s and sought a different way to conduct relationships with men in which they would not have to relinquish control over their own bodies and souls, spoke of marriage having evolved into 'that terrible growth, prostitution' (ibid., p. 43). In the decade before World War I the feminist playwright Cicely Hamilton saw marriage as a trade with insupportable conditions of work. These included lack of payment, sexual subjection and occupational hazards for which no warning or compensation was given. She likened venereal disease to the risk of lead poisoning in a pottery or the danger of combustion in a dynamite factory (C. Hamilton, 1909). Women were forced into marriage, in her view, by the cutting off of any other means of subsistence. They had to surrender their bodies for use in order to be fed and clothed.

Christabel Pankhurst, in the same pre-World War I period in the UK, made a similar connection: 'The system under which a woman must derive her livelihood from her husband – must eat out of his hand as it were – is a great bulwark of sex-subjection, and is a great reinforcement to prostitution. People are led to reason thus: a woman who is a wife is one who has made a permanent sex bargain for her maintenance; the woman who is not married must therefore make a temporary bargain of the same kind' (Pankhurst, quoted in Jackson, 1994, p. 21). The relationship between prostitution and marriage, as two forms of exchange of women for sexual use in return for subsistence, was a fundamental understanding of feminists both in the 'first' and 'second' waves of feminism in the 20th century. Beauvoir made the same point in the 1940s in *The Second Sex*, saying that the wife is 'hired for life by one man; the prostitute has several clients who pay her by the piece. The one is protected by one male against all the others; the other is defended by all against the exclusive tyranny of each' (quoted in Pateman, 1988, p. 190).

A particularly profound critical analysis of marriage was made by Carole Pateman in the mid-1980s (Pateman, 1988). Pateman explains that patriarchy is founded upon the male sex right. This right of men to have sexual access to women's bodies has been most commonly exercised through marriage, and is evidenced by the difficulties feminists have had in getting rape in marriage recognized as a crime instead of as the legitimate exercise of a man's 'conjugal rights'. Men are constructed as individuals and as men

through this right: 'The patriarchal construction of sexuality, what it means to be a sexual being, is to possess and to have access to sexual property ... In modern patriarchy, masculinity provides the paradigm for sexuality; and masculinity means sexual mastery. The "individual" is a man who makes use of a woman's body (sexual property); the converse is much harder to imagine' (Pateman, 1988, p. 185). Pateman is clear on the indissoluble connections between marriage and prostitution. As she puts it, 'marriage is now only one of the socially acceptable ways for men to have access to women's bodies' because '[p]rostitution is an integral part of patriarchal capitalism' (ibid., p. 189). Prostitution is also 'part of the exercise of the law of male sex-right, one of the ways in which men are ensured access to women's bodies' (ibid., p. 94). Pateman argues that the 'sexual contract' in which men were awarded and enjoyed possession of subordinate women through their place in a 'brotherhood' of men predated the 'social contract' touted by 17th and 18th century political theorists in the west. As male citizens made 'social contracts' with their governments to be obedient in exchange for good governance, they did so astride the bodies of their already subordinated sisters. Gerda Lerner in the *Creation of Patriarchy* goes further back to look at how patriarchy originated in the ancient Middle East (Lerner, 1987). She identifies the development of the exchange of women for profit as the lynchpin of the developing system of patriarchy. It could, as Pateman observes, take the form either of marriage or of prostitution. The incorporation of the exchange of women for men's sexual use into the fabric of the contemporary global economic system can thus be seen as a logical development that demonstrates and typifies the emergence of capitalism as a patriarchal system in itself. In this understanding prostitution is not peripheral, but central to the current capitalist project.

In the 19th and early 20th centuries feminist campaigners gained legislative changes which allowed women to have some rights in marriage, rather than simply being appendages of husbands who had complete control over their movements and activities (Hollis, 1979). They gained the right to preserve their property and income through the Married Women's Property Acts, some rights to retain custody of their children, and the right to live separately from their husbands, who could previously kidnap escaping wives and lock them up. In 1923 in the UK women obtained the right to divorce on the same grounds as men. The legal basis of marriage in countries with western legal systems has changed considerably. In the late

20th century legislation was changed, or legal precedents established, to make rape in marriage illegal in some countries. This was a crucial development because it established the right of women to control the territory of their bodies and not be simply used at a man's will, but it is comparatively recent. In the vast majority of the world these rights do not exist; wives cannot divorce, for instance, and often do not have freedom of movement. But most importantly for the theme of this chapter, in most jurisdictions women do not have ownership of their bodies in marriage. Husbands may rape them and use them sexually in any way they wish with impunity.

In the west after World War II a new form of marriage which resulted from these legal changes and from women's greater economic opportunities developed, known as 'companionate marriage' (Bernard, 1982). This is widely understood to have abolished the old basis of marriage, which can be seen as servile conditions in which women worked for no pay, husbands had ownership over their bodies and the women had no legal or economic means of escape or redress. Changing relationships between the sexes are understood in the companionate model to have led to a more egalitarian rather than starkly slave owner/slave basis to marriage. The changes which might be expected to lead to progress continue apace, with greater and greater percentages of women entering the workforce in western countries and continuing to work after marriage to create dual-career families. Despite these changes feminist theorists in the 1960s, 1970s and 1980s made very similar arguments to their predecessors about the similarities between marriage and prostitution (Pateman, 1988; Dworkin, 1983).

In fact the traditional elements of marriage have not completely disappeared in western societies, even in the case of employed, highly educated and well paid professional women. The right of men to women's bodies for sexual use has not gone but remains an assumption at the basis of heterosexual relationships in general as a considerable quantity of feminist research reveals (Phillips, 2000). Research on sexual violence in marriage finds that one in seven women who have ever been married has experienced rape with the threat or use of force by husbands (Russell, 1990; Finkelhor and Yllo, 1985). But the research indicates a wider problem for women in relationships with men in the contemporary west, which is that they endure a great deal of unwanted sex, which, though it might not be easily classified as 'rape' since the women do not say no, or even think they have a right to, is often fiercely resented and

experienced as profoundly subordinating and abusive (Gavey, 1992; Jeffreys, 1993). In theory these women have the right to leave and may even have the economic resources to do so, though they are likely to suffer reduced living standards. But they feel they have no choice but to stay and endure and may be 'loving to survive' (Graham *et al.*, 1994). Modern marriage and 'marriage-like' heterosexual relationships do not liberate women from the unwanted sex that earlier waves of feminism have criticized so sharply.

'Companionate' marriages, in which there is no direct financial exchange and the woman is apparently in a position to leave, are not the dominant form in the world. The stark reality of traditional patriarchal marriage, as exchange of women between men, is evident in most forms of the practice in the present. In child marriage and arranged/forced marriage women are property exchanged between men. The girls'/women's bodies and labours are owned by their husbands and there is little chance of escape. I choose to use the expression arranged/forced on the grounds that the difference between these forms is sometimes moot (Beckett and Macey, 2001). All these traditional forms of marriage have an economic basis and they include aspects of prostitution, defined as allowing sexual access in return for subsistence, at their heart. The description of women as 'chattels' in the marriage exchange is controversial, however.

Are women bought in marriage?

The question of whether women are bought as if they were chattels or slaves in marriage practices has exercised anthropologists. Valerio Valeri explains that a serious controversy broke out in the journal *Man* in the 1930s over this issue (Valeri, 1994). It seems that the controversy was over the suitability of the term 'bride price'. This was seen as disrespectful and the term 'bride wealth' seems to have won out to describe the money paid by the groom's family to the bride's family at the point where the girl was exchanged. But, Valeri points out, the groom's family in the tribe he studied in Eastern Indonesia quite bluntly speak of buying brides:

What the anthropologist is taught modestly to call 'bridewealth', they crudely call *mulua heliam* 'the price of the woman'. What he is careful to name the 'prestation' of 'marriage gifts', they name without qualms 'buying the woman'. As if this were not

enough, they shamelessly compare the price of different women and decry the 'priciness' of some.

(Valeri, 1994, p. 1)

The bride's family, however, calls the transaction 'giving'. Valeri explains that mainstream anthropologists have rejected the idea that 'affinal payments are mere commercial transactions' on the grounds that there are significant differences, such as the fact that a woman cannot be sold on to others by the group that acquires her and the right to 'give her away' remains with the natal group. Valeri is sceptical about these differences and points out that the goods used to buy wives can also be used to buy slaves. Women are more valuable than other goods, he says, because they reproduce and give to the group that buys them 'its existence as a group' (ibid., p. 9). The payment is made because '[i]n giving up a woman as a source of reproduction ... [t]hey must be offered a compensation which they find acceptable'. Moreover the payment made for the bride on marriage is gradually repaid over the lifetime of the marriage. 'There is a clear contrast between the initial stages, when only rights in sexual and culinary access to a woman are transferred, and the later ones, when full control over the woman's residence and her reproductive powers is alienated' (ibid., p. 10).

None of this, however, is likely to make a crucial difference from the wife's point of view. Her body and personhood are exchanged for goods between persons other than herself and she must fulfil the bargain in sexual and reproductive use. In the tribe Valeri studied the husband takes armshells back to the bride's father's house and the rite emphasizes the transfer of the rights in the reproductive potential of the woman to the husband. Another tribe in the same area is even more 'anatomical', as he puts it, with certain types and quantities of valuables being exchanged for different parts of the woman's body, 'a certain type of plate for the skull, a gong for the voice, and so on' (ibid., p. 11).

Bride price or bride wealth are important in determining male authority and rights in relation to the wives who are bought. Thus, in a fascinating study of changing concepts of marriage and the emergence of systems of prostitution in Papua New Guinea, Holly Wardlow (2007) explains how this works:

almost all the men in the study emphasized the importance of bride wealth in determining spouses' obligations to each other

and, in part, justifying a man's authority over his wife ... Huli men from all generations repeatedly invoked bride wealth as an explanation for why wives were expected to do more agricultural labor than their husbands were, why wives had to ask permission to leave the household, why wives had to comply when a husband requested sexual relations and why wives had to obey a husband's explicit instructions, such as fetching something when asked.

(Wardlow, 2007, p. 1010)

Bride wealth was the basis on which men knew who they could use sexually. A woman for whom bride wealth had been paid belonged to her husband, who had 'sole claim to her sexual and reproductive body' (ibid.).

Gerda Lerner, in her fascinating history of the birth of male dominance in the ancient Middle East, argues that the exchange of women in marriage and the ubiquitous bride price did not mean that women were made into chattels and objects. She says, 'it is not women who are reified and commodified, it is women's sexuality and reproductive capacity which is so treated. The distinction is important. Women never become "things", nor are they so conceived' (Lerner, 1987, p. 212). They did, Lerner tells us, retain their 'power to act'. However, this distinction may be moot. It is hard to separate women's 'sexuality' from their selves, as Carole Pateman (1988) argues. Such a separation would require precisely the mind/body split which lies at the base of contemporary prostitution and proves to be such a damaging aspect thereof (Farley, 2003). Prostituted women have to learn to disassociate their minds from their bodies whilst being used in prostitution, if they have not already learned to do this from experience of child sexual abuse, and those who do not are not able to tolerate the abuse.

Marriage trafficking

A new concern in feminist scholarship about the basis of marriage in women's subordination and the abuses of women's human rights that this involves, has been sparked by the intrusion of traditional forms of servile marriage into the west through the forces of globalization. The clearest example is the mail order bride industry, which involves the acquisition by men of brides from poor countries such as the Philippines or Russia, through commercial agencies which

profit from the trade. They may order a bride sight unseen, or they may visit on tours organized by the agencies to select a bride. The proliferation of agencies and the money to be made from this industry now make it a significant player in the international sex industry (Demleitner, 2000). In some cases the women themselves have to pay the agencies in order to have their information displayed, and may even find themselves in debt to the agencies for travel costs, which can be hard to repay if husbands do not allow them access to money. The practice reveals in unalloyed form the traditional basis of marriage, as women's bodies and labour are clearly acquired, in this case by western male owners, in return for subsistence. The UN Trafficking Rapporteur's report for 2007 calls attention to the seriousness of the mail order bride trade as a form of trafficking (UNHRC, 2007a, p.18).

The term 'mail order bride' has been rejected by some feminist commentators for representing women as commodities and being insulting to women who marry in this fashion. Interestingly the same arguments that some feminist scholars have made about other forms of prostitution, i.e. that women's agency or choice should be recognized and that they should not be 'victimized', have been used by feminist commentators in relation to the mail order bride industry. Nora Demleitner, for instance, argues that women who marry in this way are not 'pawns, victims or prostitutes' or 'goods' and should be treated as 'free agents, voluntary actors, highly adventurous, courageous, strong-willed and resourceful individuals' (Demleitner, 2000, p. 626). Nonetheless she characterizes very well the inequality of the relations that mail order brides find themselves in, in terms of economic dependency, lack of language skills and cultural knowledge, isolation from families, friends and all other forms of support, and in constant awareness that if they leave the marriage they may be repatriated and lose any advantage they may have gained out of their experience. The harms appear to include a greater chance of being battered or murdered, and several high profile murder cases in the US in the last decade have placed the spotlight on the abuses women can suffer in such marriages (Terzieff, 2007). As the UN Trafficking Rapporteur, Sigma Huda, points out, this practice is 'incompatible with the equal enjoyment of rights by women and with respect for their rights and dignity. There is an unequal balance of power that puts women at special risk of violence and abuse, particularly when it is the man who is paying money to marry the woman concerned' (UNHRC, 2007a). Often, she explains, mail order bride

marriages become 'forced marriages because women are not free to leave because of immigration status, isolation, economic dependence and fear of husbands' (ibid.). There should be no necessary contradiction between recognizing the harms women suffer from male dominance as well as their courage and resourcefulness in dealing with them. Otherwise feminist critique might have to be abandoned altogether on the grounds that it is insulting to women.

The mail order bride industry is the form of marriage most obviously commercialized in the global economy, and the aspect most obviously linked to the global sex industry. The relationship with prostitution is clear, as impoverished women from poor countries give unknown men in whom they have no affectional interest and for whom they have no desire their domestic and reproductive labour and sexual access to their bodies in order to escape from dire economic circumstances. Though mail order bride brokers existed well before the 1990s, the scale and efficiency of the industry may have been restricted by the need to use snail mail. The Internet changed all that: 'When the mail-order bride industry shifted from using a magazine format to operating over the Internet during the 1990s, the number ... providing matchmaking services exploded and spread from Russia and Asia into Latin America' (Schaeffer-Grabel, 2006, p. 331). One source estimates that the number of companies rose from 200 in 1999 to 500 in 2005, with 4,000–6,000 foreign spouses entering the US each year through the mediation of international marriage brokers (Minnesota Advocates for Human Rights, 2007). The industry is taking root in many rich nations where men seek foreign spouses. Thus there is a considerable industry providing 'wives' from Vietnam and Indonesia for Taiwanese men, for instance (ibid.). Taiwanese men pay agencies up to US\$10,000 for trips to China, Indonesia or Vietnam to acquire 'brides'. The number of immigrant spouses in Taiwan is 306,700, accounting for half of the total foreign population in Taiwan. Almost two-thirds are from China and the remaining one-third mostly from South East Asian nations (Tsay, 2004).

Some theorists have identified the development of such practices as emerging from the creation of a 'corporate masculinity' which is being globalized through business practices and connections as well as the Internet. In this 'corporate masculinity', or what Felicity Schaeffer-Grabel calls, usefully, 'corporate multiculturalism', rich men are able to exercise their male sex right to buy women who are more subordinate than those in their countries of

origin, to experience the excitements of exoticism and racist sexual stereotyping, and to cement international relationships through women's bodies. Male western consumers, and particularly businessmen, can all become playboys of the whole world in their access to vulnerable women transnationally. Schaeffer-Grabel identifies the 'cyberbride' industry as one of the 'transnational routes of U.S. masculinity' (Schaeffer-Grabel, 2006). In 'corporate multiculturalism' US men seek comparative advantage in the form of being able to buy women's sexual subservience from poor countries in the same way that a US sneaker manufacturer can offshore its production to take advantage of the poverty of Asian workers, mainly women (Enloe, 2004):

The First World husband is typically looking for a docile, submissive, and subservient bride whom he can control and dominate. He seeks a MOB [mail order bride] specifically because of sexist sentiments, and his hatred and fear of the feminist movement. He rejects women of his own nationality as wives because he considers them to be aggressive and egotistical. He believes they are too ambitious, make excessive demands in marriage, and have expectations of equality with their husbands. He criticizes the desire of women for autonomy, independence, and equality.

(Belleau, 2003, p. 596)

The agency websites regularly solicit custom by promising their male customers that the women they offer will be more subservient than western women. Goodwife.com is a website which provides space for bride agencies to advertise. It states: 'We, as men, are more and more wanting to step back from the types of women we meet now. With many women taking on the "me first" feminist agenda and the man continuing to take a back seat to her desire for power and control many men are turned off by this and look back to having a more traditional woman as our partner' (Goodwife.com, accessed 2008). The site exhibits strong resentment of 'radical feminists' and calls them 'feminazis' 'for their attitudes and position regarding the roles of the man and the woman in a relationship'. These feminists apparently 'want a man to be sensitive to their needs and desires to the point of losing everything about him that makes him a man' (ibid.). The qualities that the Goodwife website identifies as abhorrent in non-traditional wives are the fact that they want to change

their husbands, they stop 'taking care' of themselves when they are married, they want to be the 'boss', they provide takeaway food instead of cooking, and they want to work on and improve their relationships with their husbands.

The buying of brides is not just happening in rich countries where regular bride selling agencies have been established. Bride selling as a part of the trafficking of women into sexual exploitation is growing around the world, and particularly in Asia and the Middle East. Wherever women are trafficked as wives they leave the protection of families and friends and the protections offered by being able to speak the language and know the geography far behind. The trade in wives from North Korea to China is a good example. More than 100,000 North Koreans are estimated to have migrated illegally into China in the past decade, with 80–90 per cent of the women becoming trafficking victims (Davis, 2006). The women are trafficked as wives, as prostitutes or start as 'wives' and then find that they are prostituted. The causes of this 'transnational market of selling and exploiting women' lie in both countries (*ibid.*, p. 131). North Korea has experienced severe economic problems since the downfall of the Soviet Union, which used to subsidize the country. Economic output has been halved. Women are vulnerable not just because of economics but because of traditional roles which restrict them to low-level jobs, demand that they leave the workforce when they marry and cut them off from state rations so they become dependent on spouses. As factories shut down women find it harder to get jobs and many see their only option as seeking work in China or marrying a Korean-Chinese or Chinese man so they can help to support their aging parents and other family members. The demand in China comes from the imbalanced sex ratio created by the one-child policy, to the extent that there are 116 males to 110 females. In some regions the imbalance is as high as 14 males to one female. By 2020 it is estimated that there will be more than 40 million bachelors in China looking for wives (*ibid.*).

Some of the women are trafficked through marriage brokers who promise better lives in China. But the women find their situations are very different from what they were promised. Sometimes the North Korean women are kidnapped whilst trying to migrate and sold into 'marriage' or they are lured by men who say they will find them jobs and then sold, sometimes to farmers who cannot find wives, for anywhere from 400–410,000 yuan (US\$50–51,250).

Not only do they suffer violence and severe impoverishment but often they are re-abducted by the brokers or sold by husbands who have tired of them, sometimes ending up being sold multiple times. In one case, a North Korean woman was chained up whenever her Chinese husband left the house to prevent escape (Muico, 2005). One North Korean woman trafficked into forced marriage in China was sold to a 'horrible gambler' who 'offered me to other men as a mortgage' when he ran out of gambling money (*ibid.*, p. 4). The sexual demands of the 'husbands' are experienced as rape: 'the only thing he wanted was for us to always have sex. When I became depressed he beat me ... Every night, he stretched out my arms, tied my wrists and raped me. This hellish life lasted for six months ... When night fell, he appeared, reeking of alcohol, and ruthlessly abused me. He shackled me like a dog so I could not get away'. One woman went to China to look for her eldest daughter who went missing at a border town market in China. She worked as a nanny for a Korean-Chinese family and found that they sold her younger daughter whilst she was running an errand (*ibid.*, p. 5). Sometimes the marriages are more consensual, though the 'brokers' may be the same persons as the 'traffickers' in non-consensual cases. Even those who agree to 'consensual' marriages have no say in who the brokers sell them to. Some of these women too suffer severe sexual and physical violence and imprisonment, though others speak of their 'husbands' being 'kind'.

They cannot escape even if the opportunity arises, because of fear of harsh consequences for themselves and their families in North Korea, where they are treated as criminals if they return, sent to jails, to labour training camps and tortured (*ibid.*). They may experience forced abortions by drugs or beatings. There have also been cases of infanticide in which other detainees have been forced to participate in the killing of newborns who were left to die, buried alive or suffocated with wet towels because the state did not want more mouths to feed. When women are sent back to their communities they are likely to be treated as social outcasts and thus become vulnerable to re-trafficking. In some cases those who are repatriated are executed as enemies of the state.

In some situations the selling of girls and women for marriage or for prostitution is openly practised. The Asian Human Rights Commission has publicized the sale of girls and women in the Northern Indian states of Rajasthan and Gujarat, for instance (Asian Human Rights Commission, 2007). In Rajasthan girls and women are sold

on the open market by their parents on market days just beside the cattle market. The dowry system is implicated here since girl children are seen as a burden when parents cannot afford to pay dowry in order to marry off their daughters and sell them instead. Women and sometimes children are bought and trafficked to various parts of India and to neighbouring countries, mainly for the sex industry. Some are later married and, if not suitable, sold on. A 'fairly beautiful woman' can be bought for as little as US\$227. The shortage of women in other areas of India, too, as a result of the selected abortion of unwanted girls, has led to trafficking in wives becoming a blatant and profitable slave buying practice (Huggler, 2006). Sometimes brothers will share a woman, and sometimes beautiful ones are sold on at a profit. In the village of Ghasera, only 40 kilometres from Delhi, there are estimated to be more than 100 trafficked brides. Villagers have attacked police who tried to rescue the brides, and set their cars on fire.

Another form of bride trafficking takes place with the corpses of dead women. In remote areas of China custom demands that unmarried dead sons should be buried with a girl or woman so that he will not be unhappy (Fremson, 2006). Not only is sex-selective abortion affecting the chance men have of marrying but also women leave for the cities, never to return. They do not want to remain in the privation of a rural lifestyle. Families rely on agents to find dead daughters that can be bought to share the graves of sons. Parents see this as a duty to their daughters too, who must be married even if they are dead because, according to a Beijing sociology professor, 'China is a paternal clan culture. A woman does not belong to her parents. She must marry and have children of her own before she has a place among her husband's lineage. A woman who dies unmarried has no place in this world' (ibid.).

The difference between prostitution in brothels or on the street and forced marriages brokered by traffickers resides mainly in the number of men that the woman is sexually used by. In 'marriage' there are usually fewer than in prostitution. One factor common to the experience of women who are subject to marriage trafficking through US agencies or by being kidnapped is that they will have to accept sexual use by a man in whom they are most likely to have no erotic interest. Like other women who are prostituted, they will have to learn to disassociate their minds from their bodies to bear the sexual assaults they suffer in return for subsistence. This feature is likely to be common to the experience of women in other forms

of forced marriage too, which are taking place in western countries in immigrant communities.

Forced marriage

The UN Working Group on Contemporary Forms of Slavery recognized in 2003 that forced marriage is a form of contemporary slavery, a form of trafficking and a form of sexual exploitation (UNHRC, 2007a). The 1956 Supplementary Convention on the Abolition of Slavery that the working group monitors includes within its definition of slavery any institution or practice whereby '[a] woman, without the right to refuse, is promised or given in marriage on payment of a consideration in money or in kind to her parents, guardian, family or any other person or group'. It extends to situations where '[t]he husband of a woman, his family or his clan, has the right to transfer her to another person for value received or otherwise' and where '[a] woman on the death of her husband is liable to be inherited by another person'. It also includes child marriage in the clause identifying as slavery '[a]ny institution or practice whereby a child or young person under the age of 18 years, is delivered by either or both of his natural parents or by his guardian to another person, whether for reward or not, with a view to the exploitation of the child or young person or of his labour'. Unfortunately little progress has been made on this issue and in some countries child marriage is on the rise.

It is interesting to note that the UN Trafficking Rapporteur's report casts doubt on the possibility of easily making a distinction between forced and arranged marriage: 'The Special Rapporteur is concerned that in some cases the difference between an arranged and a forced marriage is tenuous' (UNHRC, 2007a, p. 26). This problem of making a distinction has been commented upon by many feminist scholars in recent years, which have seen a moderation in the way arranged marriage has traditionally been defended by 'progressive' scholars, i.e. on cultural relativist grounds which involve recognizing the practices of another culture as legitimate without value judgement (Beckett and Macey, 2001; Moschetti, 2006). The problems inherent in arranged marriage and its connections with forced marriage have come under scrutiny because of an increasing rejection by feminist theorists and activists of 'harmful cultural practices' and a developing critique of forms of

multiculturalism in theory and practice that defend or promote them (Okin, 1999; Nussbaum, 2000).

Nonetheless state agencies, such as the Home Office in the UK, and many feminist scholars who are well aware of the severe harms of forced marriage do still seek to differentiate it from arranged marriage. Anne Phillips and Moira Dustin, for instance, in an article in which they most usefully outline the UK policy responses to the problem of forced marriage in the British Asian community, argue that 'arranged' marriage may be more successful than 'romantic' marriage and gloss over the aspects of arranged marriage which are related to prostitution. They say that 'research that parents carry out on potential partners may well prove a better guide to future compatibility than the more haphazard mechanisms of dating; and the expectations attached to arranged marriage may be more realistic than those associated with "romantic" marriage' (Phillips and Dustin, 2004, p. 540). They do not mention the problem that the bride will have to submit her body to sexual use by someone she does not know, or scarcely knows, and may have no liking for, let alone desire. Differentiation between arranged and forced marriages is difficult when the degree of non-physical force that may be employed to persuade a girl to accept her parents' wishes is taken into account, such as the real threat of ostracism from the extended family or the possibility of physical retribution. Jasvinder Sanghera runs an organization in the UK to help girls and women who are escaping arranged marriages, and her book *Shame*, based on the experiences of her sisters and herself, is most instructive on the kinds of pressures that are used (Sanghera, 2007). Cultural relativist arguments are still being made, too, in the justice systems of western countries, with disastrous results. In Australia there has been considerable public outcry in recent years when cultural relativist arguments have been used by judges in the courts to hand down extremely light penalties for old aboriginal men who have, in continuance of a traditional harmful practice, taken possession of young teenage girls 'promised' by their parents since early childhood, and subjected them to brutal rapes (Moschetti, 2006).

In the UK the practice of arranged marriage, and support for the custom, is falling substantially in younger generations of the Pakistani, Bangladeshi and Indian communities in which it has been most commonly practised. Some parents, however, are turning to forced marriage to deal with the problems of independence, drug use and crime that their children are exhibiting (Phillips and

Dustin, 2004). Girls are trafficked by their parents to the country in which the family has its origins, often on the pretext of taking a holiday to meet the relatives, and abandoned with a man to whom they are forcefully married off. Increasingly there has been a recognition of the link between the number of 'honour killings' that are taking place in the UK and arranged/forced marriages. Families are murdering their daughters in order to prevent the shame that would result from the girl's rejection of an arranged marriage or her determination to date a boy of her choice (Welchman and Hossain, 2005). In response, there has been a flurry of government concern, with a Home Office inquiry, special instructions to police forces and other social services, a plan to legislate against forced marriages (later rejected), and the setting up of squads and units in the Foreign Office and the police force to counter the problem. The Foreign Office unit, which is responsible for identifying and supporting young people who reside in the UK but have gone 'missing' after taking holidays on the Indian subcontinent, handles 250–300 cases yearly (Phillips and Dustin, 2004).

In some cases husbands or wives in arranged/forced marriages are imported to the UK. Thus in 2000 over 10,000 Pakistani nationals obtained entry clearance to join spouses in the UK. The practice of British-born children marrying Pakistani nationals is increasing. Most weddings take place in Pakistan, after which the husband or wife applies for permission to come to the UK. Until 1997 most of these migrants were women. In 1997 the 'Primary Purpose Rule', which refused entry to spouses who were suspected of using marriage as a way to immigrate, was abolished. Thereafter the numbers of husbands gaining entry has increased to almost equal proportions. The marriages offer parents in the UK a way to 'strengthen connections between much-missed kin separated by migration decades earlier' (Charsley, 2005, p. 86). The marriages are consanguineous, i.e. carried out between cousins or other close kin, which is in contrast to the practice of consanguineous marriage tending to die out in other societies. Whilst there are serious problems for young girls imported into UK families in such arranged marriages, in that they are entirely without recourse should their husbands be violent and bullying, the girls who wed immigrant husbands may suffer severely too. The men may be using marriage as a way to obtain visas and be intending to abandon their wives. Their frustrations at not being in a position of power in their own families relative to their brides may cause them to be violent (*ibid.*).

Some arranged marriages in immigrant communities are actually 'child' marriages, taking place before the legally acceptable age. In the UK, Germany and Australia, some women from particular immigrant communities are being married off by their parents to men they do not choose at young ages, and in some cases are being sent overseas to be traded off as child brides in Lebanon or Pakistan, a practice that is hard to distinguish from other forms of trafficking for sexual exploitation. Direct monetary exchange is often involved as the girls are exchanged for bride price or dowry. Some fathers from the Lebanese community in Australia traffic their daughters to Lebanon, where they are married to relatives at ages from 14 upwards (Harris, 2005). The girls do not know the purpose of the visits. Some manage to get to the Australian embassy, demanding to be returned home. In one case that was reported in the media a 14-year-old girl turned up at the embassy with her suitcases saying she had been married against her will at 13 and imprisoned. In 2005 embassy staff reported that they had handled 12 cases in two years of teenagers fleeing arranged marriages, of which 7 involved minors, (ibid.). Social workers estimated that there were several hundred cases yearly of girls dropping out of school to get married, mainly in Sydney and Melbourne. It would be wrong, however, to see child marriage as a problem only of communities who do not ascribe to Christian values. The Trafficking Rapporteur's report points to evidence that adolescent girls are trafficked over the border between polygamous communities in the US and in Canada in order to enter into arranged polygamous marriages (UNHRC, 2007a). Child marriage in immigrant communities in western countries, however, does not take place on the very considerable scale that it does in Asia and Africa.

Child marriage

The UN Trafficking Rapporteur's report argues that the practice of child marriage should be understood as a form of trafficking in women (UNHRC, 2007a). The 1964 marriage convention defines child marriage as forced marriage which must be strictly prohibited, because children are incapable of consent. It fits the definition of slavery in the slavery convention very well since the child is completely within the control of her owner/husband. Unfortunately international instruments are inadequate to deal with the problem. There is no recommended minimum age of marriage identified in

the marriage convention. The Convention on the Rights of the Child defines childhood as the period before the age of 18 but marriage is understood to officially remove the child from this category and in most jurisdictions the legal age of marriage for girls is below 18. It is possible that it is the very importance of marriage as the basis of the social organization of male dominance that bedevils the task of ending the practice (Moschetti, 2006). Marriage is treated with unreasonable respect and trumps all protections that children might otherwise have recourse to. Nonetheless human rights activists and researchers on child marriage take as their understanding of 'the child' young persons under 18 years old in accordance with the Convention on the Rights of the Child 1989 (CRC).

The sexual use that children are subjected to in marriage might be characterized either as rape or as prostitution, and has severely harmful effects on the physical and mental wellbeing of the girls involved. In Purna Sen's research in Calcutta, for instance, almost half of the women in her sample had been married at or below the age of 15, and the youngest was merely seven years old. One woman explained that her marriage at 14 to a previously married man was precipitated by her parents finding blood on her clothes from an injured goat she had carried home. Since it was assumed that she had started to menstruate she was married off three months later. She described her husband's sexual use of her thus: 'It was very bad, very difficult. I had a lot of pain ... I used to be scared when he came to get me and carry me to his bed. I used to cry and go to lie somewhere else, but he'd come and get me' (Ouattara *et al.*, 1998, p 30).

The numbers of girls involved in child marriages are considerable (Bunting, 2000). The estimated percentages of girls married at very young ages vary between countries. In Cameroon, for instance, 62 per cent of girls are married before the legal minimum age of 18 (Mathur *et al.*, 2003). Worldwide there are 51 million girls between 15 and 19 years who are married. In West Africa, South Asia, East and Central Africa 30 per cent or more of girls aged 15–19 are already married. The percentage of girls who are married before age 18 in Niger is 82 per cent, in Bangladesh 75 per cent, in Nepal 63 per cent, in India 57 per cent and in Uganda 50 per cent. The number of girls who are expected to marry before 18 in the decade after 2003 is 100,000,000. The International Centre for Research on Women's report on child marriage comments on the significance of the commercial element in these marriages: 'in most cultures around

the world, economic transactions are integral to the marriage process, with an underlying assumption that these costs are lower when marriage occurs at an early age' (ibid., p. 5). Dowry is an important cause of the continuing low age of marriage, because dowries are lowest when the girls are young and seen as most valuable, and increase as they grow older, so for impoverished parents it is imperative to marry off their daughters early. In relation to bride price the report comments that 'it is when a girl is young that her productive labor and reproductive capacities are seen as "best buys" in exchange for valued cattle or other goods' (ibid., p. 6). The term 'child' marriage should perhaps be seen as a euphemism because this practice is gendered, and it is overwhelmingly girls and not boys who are subjected to it. The difference is stark, since in Mali the girl:boy ratio of marriage before age 18 is 72:1, in Kenya, 21:1, and even in the United States it is 8:1 (Nour, 2006).

Worsening economic conditions through wars, drought or the destruction of subsistence lead to an increase in the marriage trafficking of girls as fathers decide to relieve themselves of the burden of feeding their girl children and, where bride price exists, make a profit from selling them. Though the international human rights community is in some agreement that progress has been made in the last decade in reducing child marriage, where certain exigencies exist the reverse is the case. Thus in Afghanistan increased child marriage is the result of the privations suffered through the last decade of conflict. The Afghanistan Independent Human Rights Commission estimates that 57 per cent of marriages involve girls under the legal marriage age of 16 (IRIN, 2007). Though the government has introduced a new marriage contract to combat child marriage which decrees that marriage certificates cannot be issued for brides under 16, this is unlikely to be effective when the vast majority of 'marriages' are not officially registered. But it is not just poverty that causes child marriage. The practice originates in the desire to get girls married before they can be sexually used and thus lose the virginity which guarantees a good bride price, and the family's honour (Bunting, 2000).

In her work on child marriage, Annie Bunting provides a very useful warning to human rights activists not to imagine that child marriage is a problem of non-western cultures (Bunting, 2000). She points out that early sexualization of girls in the west is a significant problem that results in similar harms to girls such as early pregnancies and truncated education. The men who sexually use young

teenage girls in the US, for instance, are routinely 10 years older than the girls and engaged in what should be seen as child abuse. The reaction of state welfare and justice systems can be quite different, however. They may waive penalties if the men marry the girl children, who may be 13 or 14 years old, and they may even encourage such marriages, particularly if the girls are pregnant Latinas, to relieve the welfare system of extra mouths to feed. The implication of Bunting's argument is that the campaign against child marriage needs to be widened to include the sexual use of girl children at early ages whether they are married or not.

Temporary marriage

Marriage of underage girls is taking place in some Muslim communities in Yemen and Egypt in a form in which the elements of prostitution are most clearly represented. The practice is called 'temporary marriage' and parents sell the girls for short-time sexual use by rich foreign Muslim men (IRIN, 2005, 2006). In other countries the women involved are likely to be adults and taking part in the practice out of dire economic need, or they may be divorcees or women who have no other way to support their children. This is practised by Shi'a Muslims in the Middle East. It is defended by some Muslim scholars as having been engaged in by Mohamed himself and as necessary particularly for men who travel for business or study and need a temporary sexual outlet (Haeri, 1992). It is promoted as being a protection against prostitution, and even as good for women since it can be a way that poor women and widows can gain some subsistence. Temporary marriages are solemnized before clerics and last for anything from a couple of hours to a lifetime. In Iran the practice of *sigheh* is being touted by clerics as a solution to the permissiveness that the clerical régime sees as developing in the country. Thus in 1990 Ali Akbar Hashemi Rafsanjani gave a sermon whilst he was president of Iran advising that temporary marriage was a religiously acceptable alternative to western promiscuity. This led to a storm of protest from women because the practice is so clearly about men's rights. A married man can have as many temporary wives as he wants, as well as up to four permanent ones, and can break the contract any time he wants, whereas women cannot. Women who are married 'temporarily' are seen as no longer virgins and have little chance of permanent marriage. They do not have the same rights to inheritance and support

when the marriage ends, and neither do any children of the union. There are tens of thousands of children of temporary marriages whose fathers do not acknowledge them and who are therefore considered illegitimate. As recently as 2007 Iran's Interior Minister, Mostafa Pour-Mohammadi, promoted temporary marriage as a solution to the country's social problems (Harrison, 2007). Temporary marriage is now being exploited by the prostitution tourism industry, with a travel agent in Tehran advertising holidays by the Caspian Sea for couples wanting to have temporary marriages, with accommodation and a cleric to solemnize the marriage (*ibid.*).

There has been a rise in temporary marriages in Iraq, which is worrying women's rights campaigners who say that 300 occur daily in the three main cities in the south of the country, Kerbala, Najaf and Basra, the main Shi'ite cities. The phenomenon is explained as resulting from the poverty suffered by women, especially those who have lost their husbands during the years of war. They seek to protect their children and feed them. As Salua Fatihi, head of two non-governmental women's rights organizations, puts it: 'They [men] use them as sexual objects under the guise of a religious belief' (WLUML, 2006). A payment, often around US\$1,000 or the equivalent in gold, is made to the woman. The practice was banned during Saddam Hussein's régime but has re-emerged since 2003. As one woman whose husband had died in the war said of her experience of the practice: 'I was his sexual slave for one month and then he just said my time had expired and left' (*ibid.*). Another woman was used sexually for a week and the man left her pregnant, with the result that she is now seen as a prostitute. One cleric who presided over five such marriages a day in Najaf explained that the practice protected women's honour and was helpful to them because they could support their families (*ibid.*).

In some countries where temporary marriage is practised it more closely resembles child prostitution and the girls are directly sold by their parents. Saudi men, for instance, buy access to teenage girls in Yemen in this fashion (IRIN, 2005). Low incomes encourage parents to sell their daughters to men from the Gulf States, who use them sexually for a month or so in a hotel and then abandon them. Forty-two per cent of Yemen's 19.7 million people live on under US\$2 per day. According to the UN World Food Programme 7.9 per cent of people in Yemen experience severe food insecurity and cannot afford to buy food for themselves or their family. Once the girls have been abandoned they are stigmatized as divorcees and

unlikely to remarry. This form of 'sex tourism' temporary marriage also takes place in Egypt, where girls as young as 14 are sold to Saudi men (IRIN, 2006).

Conclusion

This chapter has sought to show that prostitution is less a legitimate form of women's work than a harmful cultural practice which cannot be easily differentiated from traditional forms of marriage in which women are exchanged between men for cash or other advantages. Human rights instruments and campaigners seek to eliminate forced and child marriage, rather than normalizing them. The progress of women's equality requires that the elements of prostitution are removed from marriage, so that no women have to accept sexual use of their bodies which is against their inclinations. The future of women's equality does not have a place for either servile marriage or the industry of prostitution which places precisely this traditional abuse of women's physical autonomy and exercise of the male sex right in the marketplace. Unfortunately, as we shall see in Chapter 3, the ability to recognize prostitution as a harmful practice has been undermined by the growth and influence of the pornography industry in western countries. Pornography creates an acceptance that the practice of prostitution is acceptable and even enjoyed by the women who are used. It transforms traditional cultures as this western practice creates new markets for sexual exploitation.

The international political economy of pornography

The pornography industry is the launching pad of the contemporary normalization of the sex industry in the west. It is where the considerable growth throughout the sector began. Defended in the counterculture and sexual revolution of the 1970s as ‘transgressive’ and liberating (Jeffreys, 1990/91), it is now a massively profitable industry which has been mainstreamed to provide revenue for major corporations. The foundation of the industry is the sexual use of girls and young women made vulnerable by homelessness and histories of sexual abuse, or by trafficking. But the profits of this industry do not flow to those who are most harmed by it. The harms have been made invisible as pornography has been normalized within popular culture, through the entertainment, sports, music and fashion industries (Jeffreys, 2005). Pornography has made the sex industry hip. It has created customers for strip clubs, sometimes called ‘live pornography’, and ultimately for brothels and other forms of prostitution. The doubling in the percentage of men in the UK in 10 years who now prostitute women has been attributed to the normalization of the commercial sexual exploitation of women that pornography and strip clubs have enabled (Ward and Day, 2004). In this chapter I will examine the expansion and globalization of the industry, and what is involved in its production.

Feminist theory and pornography

In the mid-1980s the feminist opposition to pornography was at its height, and provided a motivating force to the women’s liberation movement. This opposition developed in response to the decensorship of pornography that took place in the so-called sexual revolution of the 1960s and 1970s (Jeffreys, 1990/91).

Feminist critics rejected the normalizing impulses that represented pornography as just sex or representation, and any attempts to limit its production as 'censorship' and a threat to free speech. They argued that pornography provided the DNA of male dominance, and Kathleen Barry described pornography as the propaganda of womanhatred (Barry, 1979). It was seen as violence against women because of what was done to the girls and women in the production of pornography, and it was understood to provide men with a roadmap for sexual violence against women, teaching them to see women as loving and deserving of abuse (Dworkin, 1981). In the mid-1980s it looked as if the feminist opposition might bear fruit in the anti-pornography ordinance drawn up in the US by radical feminist theorists Andrea Dworkin and Catharine MacKinnon, which allowed women a civil remedy against pornographers. Women harmed in the making of pornography or by having it used against them could sue the makers and distributors of the materials (MacKinnon and Dworkin, 1997). But, to the devastation of many of those campaigning against pornography, a feminist defence of the practice developed, which echoed precisely the arguments of male free speech liberals and the male manufacturers, that it was a form of 'speech' which must be defended lest censorship be allowed to chill political freedom in America (MacKinnon, 1993). The ordinance was successfully challenged by an alliance of civil liberties groups and feminists who adopted a free speech approach, and it was never implemented.

In the mid- to late 1980s feminist communities and activism in the west were riven by what some called the 'sex wars', in which feminist anti-violence feminists who opposed the sexual exploitation of women and demanded the total transformation of the dominant/submissive sexuality of male supremacy were vigorously resisted by others who promoted a 'sexual freedom' which took as its foundation the very sexuality that male power had created (Jeffreys, 1990/91). The fissure between these different perspectives on sexuality was so wide, and the sexual freedom camp so powerfully underpinned by male liberals and pornographers in mainstream media and culture, that feminist anti-pornography campaigning had by the 1990s lost its momentum. Thus the transformation of pornography into a hugely profitable and mainstream industry sector in the 1990s was able to take place with little interruption from the pickets and protests that characterized the previous two decades.

The work of Laura Kipnis, who teaches Radio-TV-Film at Northwestern University, is a good example of the sexual freedom/free speech approach (Kipnis, 2003). Her enthusiastic defence of pornography is quite far reaching. She does not look at pornography as an industry, or notice that anything is done to real live women and girls in the production of it. She sees pornography as 'fantasy' and an essential part of 'culture': 'Pornography is a form of cultural expression, and though it's transgressive, disruptive, and hits below the belt – in more ways than one – it's an essential form of contemporary national culture' (ibid., p. viii). The argument that proponents of pornography are in some way countercultural is rather thin considering the way that pornography has been mainstreamed into western culture, but some still cling to the romantic notion that pornographers are 'transgressive' in using or defending the practice, rather than simply the flag bearers of male dominance. The opponents of pornography, in Kipnis' view, 'seem universally overcome by a leaden, stultifying literalness, apparently never having heard of metaphor, irony, a symbol – even fantasy seems too challenging a concept' (ibid., p. 163). Feminist attacks on pornography, she says, are 'so depressing and so politically problematic' (ibid., p. 188). The feminist critics are, she considers, middle class and inhibited, wanting to 'annihilate' the 'low-rent *Hustler* male and his pleasures' (ibid., p. 148). Feminists should not worry because '*Hustler*'s "violations" are symbolic' and have no connection to 'real sex or violence' (ibid., p. 158). There are no real live women being sexually exploited and abused in the 'fantasy' porn that Kipnis defends.

Nadine Strossen, President of the American Civil Liberties Union and a law professor, takes a similar approach. She is dedicated to defending 'free speech', and calls pornography 'sexual expression' which it is vital to defend from censors (Strossen, 2000). The women's movement, she claims, depends on 'robust free expression, particularly in the realm of sexuality' (ibid., p. 29). She is even more dismissive of feminist concerns: 'It is essential to derail the traditionalist-feminist antisex-juggernaut before its impact on public perceptions and public policy becomes even more devastating' (ibid., p. 29). Clearly, to American liberals the feminist opposition to pornography did seem powerful, though it was unable to limit or dent the growth of the industry. However, in the 21st century there is evidence of a revival in feminist activism and concern about pornography, in response to the size and influence of the

industry and the way that it is seen to be constructing the culture in which women, and particularly young women, live (Levy, 2005; Paul, 2005; Guinn and DiCaro, 2007; Stark and Whisnant, 2004).

In contradiction to this free speech approach, Catharine MacKinnon, both before and after the untimely death of Andrea Dworkin in 2005, has continued to point out that pornography is not *Only Words* (MacKinnon, 1993), but a political practice that subordinates women. It is an essential and inseparable part of the industry of prostitution and a form of trafficking in women for sexual exploitation. As she explains: 'In material reality, pornography is one way women and children are trafficked for sex. To make visual pornography, the bulk of the industry's products, real women and children, and some men, are rented out for use in commercial sex acts. In the resulting materials, these people are then conveyed and sold for a buyer's sexual use' (MacKinnon, 2006, p. 247). Pornography is a 'technologically sophisticated slave traffic' allowed 'because its victims are regarded as socially worthless' (ibid., p. 112). Pornography may be a particularly severe form of prostitution in terms of the harms that the women prostituted in this practice experience. This chapter will address the harms of the production process as well as testing out more generally the view that pornography is about harmless fantasy and 'speech' and socially 'transgressive'.

The worth of the industry

The size and worth of the pornography industry in the present, and the extent to which it has been mainstreamed into the day to day business of major corporations and into the entertainment, music and fashion industries (Jeffreys, 2005), should immediately cast doubt on any notion that pornography is 'transgressive', though this is an idea that its defenders still cling to. The industry is now covered seriously in the business pages of newspapers. Pornography companies, such as Beate Uhse from Germany, are listed on the Stock Exchange. The exact profits being made from the industry are hard to gauge, partly because there is such a diversity of forms of sexual exploitation involved, and because some companies are not keen for their involvement in pornography to be known. Frederick Lane's book *Obscene Profits* (2001) provides useful information on the history and *modus operandi* of the industry. It is also a good example of the extent to which the industry has become respectable

since it is a 'how-to' book for aspiring pornography entrepreneurs published by a mainstream academic publisher, Routledge. As he chattily explains: 'As the pornography industry continues to grow increasingly mainstream, the social barriers for starting an adult business will continue to drop' (Lane, 2001, p. 146). Lane is surprisingly frank, in his very positive account of the industry, about the fact that it is controlled by men and the profits go to men. Thus, he explains: 'While the number of sites actually run by women is certainly higher than two, it probably is not significantly higher ... The images of women and the profits they generate are still largely controlled by men ... the demand is being satisfied by the sale of large collections of photographs of women who were paid a nominal amount (if at all)' (Lane, 2001, p. 211). Lane estimated that in 2001 the total worth of the industry in the US was US\$10 billion or possibly as much as \$15–20 billion (Lane, 2001, p. xiv). Even using the most conservative estimate, he explains, the pornography industry takes in about what Americans pay for sporting events and live musical performances combined.

In 2007 a website which reviews technology for the web, including Internet filter systems, Top Ten Reviews, collated information from a number of sources on the size and worth of the pornography industry. Pornography revenue for the US was estimated at \$13.33 billion, which is higher than the total revenue of the media corporations ABC, NBC and CBS. Top Ten Reviews estimated that the industry was worth US\$97.06 billion worldwide, which is more than the combined revenue of the top ten web technology companies such as Microsoft, Google and Amazon (Top Ten Reviews, 2007). In 2007 there were 4.2 million porn websites, which constituted 12 per cent of all websites, and 420 million web pages of pornography. Internet sales of porn were estimated to be worth \$4.9 billion. By country, the largest number of pornography webpages originated in the US, with 244,661,900, followed by Germany, with 10,030,200, the UK, with 8,506,800, Australia, with 5,655,800, Japan, with 2,700,800, the Netherlands, with 1,883,800, Russia, with 1,080,600, Poland, with 1,049,600, and Spain, with 852,800. In Denmark pornography is estimated to be the third largest industry in financial terms, and Richard Poulin points out that the country was the cradle of the 'sexual revolution' which decensored pornography and ushered in the commercialization of women's sexual subordination (Poulin, 2005, p. 108). European Internet users paid 70 per cent of the US\$364 million they spent

in 2001 on pornography (*ibid.*). The number of hardcore pornography titles produced increased from 1,300 in 1988 to 12,000 in 2004 and 13,588 in 2005 (Top Ten Reviews, 2007). The big mainstream pornography distribution companies had considerable incomes. Playboy earned US\$331,100,000 in 2006, for instance, and Beate Uhse earned US\$271 million.

The part of the industry that resides in the San Fernando Valley in Hollywood was estimated to be worth US\$1 billion in 2006 (Barrett, 2007). This is the main area of production in the US and has 200 companies operating. In 15 years the Valley's 'adult entertainment' industry has quadrupled, with annual revenues equal to the restaurant, fast-food and bar businesses in the area combined (*ibid.*). The studios are mostly small and the movies cheap to make, most costing \$20,000 or less. However, Vivid, the Valley's biggest company, made US\$150 million in 2005. The average production worker makes \$61,000 per year. The Californian industry employs 20,000 and pays US\$31 million in taxes just on the sale of videos (Poulin, 2005). Changes are taking place in the industry, though, which threaten its profit base. Sales and rentals of X-rated DVDs were down 15 per cent in 2006 because Internet competition is reducing the market (*ibid.*). Most of the money in the pornography industry in the US is made by the distributors, such as pay-per-view and subscription porn businesses, cable and satellite companies, adult channels and hotels, which are worth US\$1.7 billion (*ibid.*). In the American hotel system, 40 per cent of rooms have pay-per-view pornography, which accounts for 50 per cent of the videos watched. This is worth \$200 million per year (*ibid.*). The considerable profits of the pornography industry need to be weighed against the financial pain suffered by the male consumers. A 2008 study by the UK Insolvency Helpline found that a quarter of people, overwhelmingly male, with problem debt confessed to spending money on viewing pornography, phone sex and visiting brothels or strip clubs (Chivers, 2008). The sex industry, the report concludes, lies in third place behind drug and alcohol abuse and shopping addiction in the table of the most common reasons for getting into debt. Some men lost their jobs because of their 'sex obsessions' and this male behaviour also led to divorce, which deepened their financial problems.

Phone sex is another lucrative aspect of the pornography industry. Frederick Lane suggested that in 2000 phone sex alone generated between \$750 million and \$1 billion in revenues in the US, with as

much as 50 per cent being retained by US long-distance telephone carriers (Lane, 2001, p. 151). Impoverished Third World nations gain income from having lax phone regulations and high per-minute phone rates that US customers are charged for placing calls to those countries. Thus, according to Lane, the island of São Tomé saw the number of calls it received from the US go from 4,300 in 1991 to 360,000 in 1993. The island kept approximately \$500,000 of the \$5.2 million worth of phone sex calls and used the money to build a new telecommunications system (*ibid.*). Not only is the work very low paid but even Lane, who is so positive generally about the pornography industry, admits that crank callers and 'misogynists' can create problems for the women employed. Not surprisingly, the average burnout rate is six months. The women workers, he explains, make an average of US\$9–10 per hour, while bureaux get US\$180–360. The workers are, he says, 'mostly undereducated and single mums' (*ibid.*).

Expansion of the industry

The forces that enabled the pornography industry to develop from a marginal activity, a secret men's business of stag films shown at private parties, to the mainstream industry of today included changes in government and community attitudes and technological developments. In the 1960s and 1970s in western countries censorship controls on pornography were progressively relaxed under the influence of the 'sexual revolution'. Pornography was represented as embodying sexual freedom. I have argued elsewhere that this sexual revolution simply enshrined as positive social values men's rights of sexual access to women as playthings in pornography and prostitution and in their sexual relationships (Jeffreys, 1990/91, 1997). Certainly women made some gains. Women's rights to some form of sexual response and to have sexual relationships outside marriage became much more accepted, but the main beneficiary of this 'revolution', I suggest, is the international sex industry.

According to Frederick Lane, the period 1957–73 is referred to in the business as the 'Golden Age of Porn'. He explains that the industry was stimulated by the demand of American soldiers in World War II for 'girlie mags'. Thus the military prostitution which was such a force in the construction of prostitution and sex tourism industries in South East Asia after World War II was involved in constructing the global sex industry in another arena too. When the

war ended the magazines were launched onto the US home market. *Playboy* was founded in 1953 and launched on the Stock Exchange in 1971. *Hustler* was founded in 1974. The Playboy company was able to exploit a different form of male bonding, substituting businessmen in this economic boom period for the military. Lane explains that the Playboy clubs were set up to service 'businessmen' who were 'looking for ways to tangibly reward themselves for their success' (Lane, 2001, p. 26). They found this in 'holding a key to a Playboy Club', which was a 'tangible symbol of having "made it"' (ibid.). As Lane records: 'The clubs were a huge success; in the last quarter of 1961, for instance, more than 132,000 people visited the Chicago night club, making it the busiest in the world at the time' (ibid.). In this period it was expensive to produce pornography, so the industry was dominated by the few production companies that could afford the US\$200,000–300,000 needed to make one film. In the 'Golden Age' the mafia-controlled industry made links with free speech activists and developed the money and resources to fight legal cases to protect their industry against attempts to restrict it.

In the 1980s and 1990s the sex industry was able to expand in an economic and social climate of *laissez-faire*, free market individualism. The political liberalism associated with this particular economic ideology privileged men's 'free speech' right to pornography over the rights of women to physical integrity. The expansion was facilitated by the development of new technologies such as the video cassette and the Internet. The video cassette recorder (VCR) was born in 1973 and was a crucial technology for pornography because it provided privacy for the male consumers. They could access pornography without having to go to special theatres or peep shows. Pornography drove the video revolution, leading to the explosion of adult video stores and eventually mainstream chains such as Blockbuster. In the early 1990s the development of the Internet provided the pornography industry with important new opportunities. It was easier for the male consumers to protect their anonymity, and they did not have to leave their homes to visit the video store.

Hardcore pornography went mainstream with the release of *Deep Throat* in 1972. Linda Lovelace, the prostituted woman in the movie who had penises thrust down her throat with the justification that she had a clitoris there, was controlled by a violent pimp/husband and her bruises were visible on screen (Lovelace, 1987). Her sexual slavery is generally agreed to be the moment the modern industry

took off. 'Adult' movies stopped being a dirty little secret and became part and parcel of the entertainment mainstream. Frank Sinatra put on a showing of *Deep Throat* for US Vice President Agnew at his home (Adult Video News, 2002). The American talk show host Johnny Carson joked about the film on *The Tonight Show* in the early 1970s. Reporters Woodward and Bernstein in the Watergate scandal dubbed their informant 'Deep Throat'.

The easy accessibility of consumer camcorders in the late 1970s led to homemade pornography. Amateur pornography led to what is now known as gonzo porn, which is created by the male actor holding the camera himself and interspersing the sexual use of women with interviews with them. The development of digital technologies made it possible for men to market their female partners straight onto the Internet, cutting out the middleman. Pornography became more easily accessible in the mid-1990s as its reach extended to cable and satellite systems, allowing consumers to purchase adult videos without even having to leave their home. It was at this stage that the pornography industry became attractive to corporate America, to General Motors and AT&T. The new delivery systems enabled blue-chip corporations to profit from pornography without getting too close to the product. In the mid-1990s extreme hardcore pornography became popular amongst young men. This included such practices as 'spit and gape', where a man would stretch his partner's anus as wide as it would go and place a speculum and hose into it in which he could spit or urinate. Anal and double penetration became requirements and what was known in the industry as the 'airtight' trick, meaning a penis in every orifice, gang rape, what is called 'choke-fucking', and bukkake, in which 50–80 men ejaculate simultaneously onto the naked body of a woman lying on the ground.

The mainstream pornography industry went very quickly from being disreputable to gaining very considerable social acceptability in the 1990s. Adult Video News (AVN) attributes the expansion of the industry in this period to the policy of the Clinton administration not to prosecute pornography (Adult Video News, 2002). AVN speculates that Clinton was a libertine who liked pornography and had a special stock on his aeroplane Air Force One (ibid.). In this period the number of pornography production companies doubled and pornography made inroads into many areas of American society. The US industry went to great efforts to gain acceptance, such as hiring lobbyists, participating in charity and campaigning for

condom use to prevent HIV infection. It learned from another very harmful industry, tobacco, which, though it has lost social standing now, at one time used lobbyists and spokespersons to front for the industry very well. The Marlboro men were used to promote the industry, for instance, though some died of its effects.

Donna Hughes (2000) identifies the US as the 'country mainly responsible for the industrialization of pornography and prostitution' through local and military prostitution and through the development of an unregulated Internet pornography industry. She points out that the US 'set the policy for the commercial development of the Internet' through Ira Magaziner, Senior Advisor to the President for Policy Development 1993–8. Magaziner coordinated government strategy on electronic commerce and the digital economy, advocating for a free market policy towards the Internet, where the private sector led the development and regulation of the new technology. He said that the lack of governmental interference gave rise to 50 per cent of the economic growth of the US economy in the seven to eight years before 1999. He argued that censorship would be impossible, and problems with pornography such as the protection of privacy and protecting children could be dealt with by empowering people to protect themselves and the placing of responsibility on parents to protect their children from harm. Such protection, he said, was not a role for government. This policy gave the US a commercial advantage and in this period Federal prosecutions of violations of obscenity law dropped from 32 in 1993 to 6 in 1997. The significance of US domination of the industry might justify it being seen as a form of American neo-colonialism as the industry was injected into both modern and traditional societies all over the world. Organized crime was heavily involved in the creation of the industry and in its day to day organization because of the amount of money to be made and the fact that it is a form of prostitution, which has always provided a happy hunting ground for crime groups.

Organized crime goes mainstream

Since the majority of the pornography industry has always been under the control of organized crime, the normalization of the industry can be seen as mainstreaming organized crime. The iconic 1970s pornography films *Deep Throat*, *Behind the Green Door* and *The Devil in Miss Jones*, which are credited with making

pornography respectable for mainstream audiences, were directed by Gerard Damiano, who was involved with the mafia (Poulin, 2005, p. 121). Richard Poulin documents some of the history of mafia involvement. In 1975–80 there was a mafia war for control of the developing sex industry which led to 25 deaths in New York State alone. Poulin quotes the view of William Kelly, FBI investigator of the pornography industry, that it was impossible to be in the industry and not deal in some fashion with the mafia. He quotes Daryl Gates, chief of police in LA, who states that the mafia took control of the sex industry in California in 1969 because of the large profits to be made. In 1975 they controlled 80 per cent, whilst in 2005 they controlled 85–90 per cent.

Poulin details the origins of the Playboy empire in mafia control. When the Playboy Club first opened in 1960 in Chicago it was very much in the hands of organized crime. The alcohol licence was gained from politicians under mafia control, and the Chicago mob supplied the manager, waste disposal, parking, liquor and meat (*ibid.*). The Chicago mafia were heavily involved with strip clubs and pornography in Las Vegas too. In California in 2002 most of the production and distribution of pornography videos was in the hands of Joseph Abinanti, associate of the Lucchese crime family of New York (*ibid.*, p. 123). The Philadelphia motor-bike club the Pagans is implicated in the sale of pornography in the US and biker gangs are involved in the industry in Canada too. Other organized crime groups internationally are involved in the pornography industry. Thus the Japanese Yakuza finances the pornography industry of the Netherlands (*ibid.*).

One good example of the way in which pornography mainstreams criminal activity is the reporting of, and attendance at, the funeral of James Mitchell and his brother, Artie, who were pioneers of the strip club and porn industries in the US. They opened the O'Farrell Theater in San Francisco in 1969 and had problems with police over the 'live sex shows and X-rated films they produced at the adult movie theater' (Coetsee, 2007). James served a prison sentence for 'fatally shooting the younger brother' he 'adored' (*ibid.*). James, like Larry Flynt, who set up the Hustler pornography and strip club empire now being franchised worldwide, and had a mainstream Hollywood film made vaunting his importance to the political freedom of Americans, *The People Versus Larry Flynt* (1996), is held up as an inspiration. Thus at his funeral San Francisco political consultant Jack Davis said: 'We all owe [our] personal freedoms to

the brothers for the fights they fought on our behalf' and credited Mitchell for his part in transforming the adult entertainment from a 'dark, dank back room' business to a legitimate industry. Jeff Armstrong, the manager of the theatre, said: 'He was our Hector and our Achilles, and we drafted behind him.'

This mafia controlled business gained respectability in the late 20th century. Mainstream corporations got over any squeamishness they might have had as they saw the profits that could be made from distributing pornography. As the founder and director of Digital Playground said: 'I look at the porn business where Vegas and gambling was in the 70s. Vegas was still mob-owned and they were making the transition between these small groups of people to being corporate-owned. I feel the same exact thing is going to happen with adult' (Barrett, 2007).

The mainstreaming of pornography

The pornography industry is fast gaining so much legitimacy that mainstream finance houses are prepared to invest in it. The *New York Times* reports that the involvement of mainstream investors is 'in its infancy' (Richtel, 2007). 'Venture capitalist and private equity funds', it reports, are starting to show interest in pornography production and distribution companies. Thus the boutique investment bank Ackrell Capital has a 'growing practice' of 'matching investors with makers and distributors of sex-themed content'. Investors are attracted by 'public relations cover' from repackaging the companies in a 'more conventional way' so that they get a large part of their revenue from pornography but branch out into more mainstream areas as a cover. Thus Waat Media distributes content to mobile phones and has deals with several makers of explicit pornography, like Penthouse and Vivid Entertainment. In September Spark Capital, a mainstream venture capital firm, led a \$12.5 million round of financing for Waat, but changed the company's name to Twistbox Entertainment and packaged the company as a 'mobile content distributor' (ibid.).

Pornography is now so mainstream that it forms a very lucrative sector of the business of respectable mainstream companies such as General Motors, which sells more pornography films annually than the Hustler chain (Poulin, 2005). General Motors previously owned DirecTV, a pornography distributor, which is now owned by Rupert Murdoch. The integration of mainstream media with the

pornography industry helps to explain the way that pornography and strip clubs are normalized in the media. The Bank of Ireland has invested in Remnant Media, which is a porn producer. It can now be costly for mainstream companies to decide not to be involved with pornography. America Online, Microsoft and MSN have refused to allow adult businesses to set up shop on their services and do not accept ads from pornographers. But, Frederick Lane points out, when Infoseek was bought by Disney and made the same decision about pornography it was set to lose 10 per cent of its ad revenues, which are 95 per cent of overall revenues (Lane, 2001, p. 189). Credit card companies are implicated in the pornography industry because they are the main form of payment. The pornography companies nurture relationships with the card companies because they can be seen as high risk on the grounds of 'chargebacks', meaning situations in which customers refuse to pay a charge, perhaps because of the huge amount they find they have spent or because their female partner questions the statement. The pornography industry is careful to reassure bashful customers that the charges on their cards will be registered in such a way that they will appear innocuous to their wives. Thus AdultShop.com in Australia explains that purchases will 'be billed in Australian dollars and your statement will report your purchase as "AXIS Hume Au"' (see <http://shop.adultshop.com.au/>).

Adult Video News, the online magazine of the US pornography industry, claims that pornography videos are worth more than the legitimate Hollywood film industry and often use the same personnel. The industry is centred in Hollywood and creates more employment for Hollywood's army of film technicians and set personnel than mainstream production. It uses similar methods and language. Pornography production companies, for instance, now have 'contract girls' who are under contract to work for the company as film actresses used to be in the regular industry. There are more and more crossovers between the regular and pornography genres. Mainstream movies are made about the industry enabling men to see stripping and sexual acts in their local movie cinema. The regular industry becomes more and more pornographized, showing ever more graphic sexual activity. Another aspect of the normalization that is taking place is the way the music industry is becoming intertwined with the pornography industry. Whole genres of pop music now join with the newly respectable industry, with pornography actors doing signings at Tower Records, for instance. They market to the same consumers, young men.

The pornography industry has made great advances in gaining influence over mainstream politics, too. One example of this is the success of Richard Desmond, the famous UK pornographer and publisher of such top shelf titles as *Big Ones* and *Horny Housewives* and a 'live' sex website. In February 2001 the British Labour government approved Desmond's takeover of the tabloid newspapers the *Daily Express* and the *Daily Star* with money made from pornography. Eight days later the British Labour Party banked a £100,000 donation towards election expenses (Maguire, 2002). At the time, Desmond's most profitable business interests were in pornographic television channels, which provided 75 per cent of his pre-tax profits (Fletcher, 2002). Despite some critical reaction to what looked like a decision to hand two major UK newspapers to a porn king in return for a donation, in May 2002 Desmond was invited for tea at Downing Street to meet with Tony Blair. It is hard to imagine this degree of social acceptance of pornography and the sex industry as completely reasonable sergeants in arms to the Labour Party in the 1970s when pornography still had a disreputable air about it. The profits of the pornography industry are now so large that it is able to command considerable political obedience.

Desmond tried unsuccessfully to acquire the *Telegraph*, the *Sunday Telegraph* and the *Spectator*. Interestingly, for a pornographer who should surely be 'transgressive' if pornography apologists are correct, he has only been interested in ownership of right-wing newspapers. As a result of donations to charity he has had lunch at Buckingham Palace and in 1992 the Duke of Edinburgh officially opened the new headquarters of the company that runs his pornography magazines (Jones, 2000). He is now estimated to be worth £1.9 billion. He had plans afoot in 2007 to complete a £220,000 million floatation of Portland, his broadcasting business that includes pornography channels such as Fantasy TV and Red Hot TV (Judge, 2007). As proof that it is hard to be in the pornography industry without involvement with organized crime, Philip Bailey, Desmond's top aide, was badly assaulted by mafia thugs as a message to his boss in New York in the early 1990s. He had electric shocks administered to his genitals, had his face slashed with a box-cutter and was pistol-whipped in association with a conflict that Richard Martino, suspected of involvement with the Gambino family, had with Desmond over advertisements for dial-a-porn in Desmond's magazines. Martino and cohorts went on trial in 2005

over accusations that threats of mob violence were used to help them earn hundreds of millions of dollars in dial-a-porn and Internet pornography schemes (Robbins, 2005).

Production of pornography

Despite the determination of the defenders of pornography to claim that it is speech and fantasy, live girls and women do have their orifices penetrated to produce pornography. They take drugs to survive the pain and humiliation, and they bleed. Pornography has the harmful physical effects on women's health of other forms of prostitution, which include abraded vaginas and anuses, and considerable pain (see Holden, 2005). They include the physical harms of sexually transmitted diseases, unwanted pregnancies, abortions, infertility, diseases of the reproductive tract, that lead to complications in later life, and psychological harms (Farley, 2003). Many pornography movies are routinely made without condoms despite several pornography actors having been found, in the 1990s, to be HIV positive and to have passed on HIV on set to others. Harms can include infections of the eyes from 'money shots' when men ejaculate onto women's faces (Dines and Jensen, 2007). The girls subjected to these harms are most frequently very young, just 18 or younger, and extremely vulnerable, often homeless and with troubled family backgrounds from which they can draw no support, and with no money to live on (Lords, 2003; Canyon, 2004).

Those whose fortunes are created out of the sexual exploitation of girls and women in pornography can be quite frank about the harms involved. Thus Rob Stallone, who runs Starworld Modeling, a pornography pimping business in the US, comments: 'An 18–20 year old girl, is her life ruined if she does this? Ninety per cent of them, yeah. They make their \$1000 a day, then they're out of the business and they don't have 20 cents' (quoted in Hopkins, 2007). He explained that at first the money seemed marvellous to young and vulnerable girls who had never had any: 'Young unknowns can come in, earn a grand for six hours of work, then do it all over again the next day. With \$30,000 rolling in each month, they've soon got nice clothes and a flashy car' (ibid.). However, he acknowledged, many turned to drugs, and they found it hard to get other work when they were used up in pornography and no longer sought out. They could not show prospective employers résumés that only showed work in pornography and no qualifications. A difficult

paradox exists for young would-be porn stars. To get work they have to perform more hardcore acts, and while that pays better, it also lessens their appeal for future work and tends to shorten their careers. The actress signs away rights to her image for US\$1,200 whilst the really serious money will be made by those who sell and distribute it, since what started out as one scene can then be repackaged in endless compilation films or posted in perpetuity on the web. A pornography actress interviewed about working in the industry complained about the lack of preparation for the sort of work involved: 'In adult, there's no training. In any other business with some kind of risk, there's training. If you're working down on the docks in Long Beach, there's safety classes. There's nothing in this industry like that' (ibid.).

There is a burgeoning number of porn star biographies available, which give some information about the conditions the women experience, even though they seem to be written for pornography consumers and are rarely critical of the industry. In one such biography the European ex porn star Raffaella Anderson gives a useful description of what porn production entails for the young women who are abused in the process:

Take an inexperienced girl, who does not speak the language, far from home, sleeping in a hotel or on the set. Made to undergo a double penetration, a fist in her vagina plus a fist in her anus, sometimes at the same time, a hand up her arse, sometimes two. You get a girl in tears, who pisses blood because of lesions, and she craps herself too because no one explained to her that she needed to have an enema . . . After the scene which the girls have no right to interrupt they have two hours rest.

(quoted in Poulin, 2005, p. 138; my translation)

In recognition of such serious harms, Richard Poulin calls pornography the 'aestheticisation of sexual violence'.

Porn star biographies suggest that the girls who get involved have been made vulnerable by histories of sexual violence. Thus the famous porn star Traci Lords, who reveals in her autobiography that she began her brief career in pornography at 15 years old, was raped at the age of 10 by a 16-year-old boy (Lords, 2003). She was then subjected to sexual molestation by her mother's boyfriend. She became pregnant by a 17-year-old boy just after her 15th birthday and left home to seek money for an abortion, shelter and help from

her mother's now ex-boyfriend. She lived with him and he pimped her into pornography, driving her to sets and taking the money. She was swiftly inducted into cocaine use, which was rife on the production sets. At first she posed for stills photography with her pimp masturbating with excitement at the side of the set. She was hired for use in *Playboy* while still 15. By 16 she was living with an abusive addict who pimped her and pressured her into hardcore 'live' pornography since she would otherwise get no work, and she earned \$20,000 for 20 movies. One of them featured a group of women, including herself, being beaten and pretending to be ponies for a Japanese production company. She started stripping at the O'Farrell Theater at 16.

Another porn star, Christy Canyon, entered the industry at 18 and had to sign paperwork which asked her if she would do 'anal' or 'gang bangs' and whether there was any part of her body she did not want to be ejaculated upon (Canyon, 2004). She said she only wanted to do magazines, meaning stills. Three days later she was sent onto the set of a hardcore pornography movie by the pimping agency that hired her. She describes the pimp as being like a father figure to her and the only emotional or financial support she had. In these porn star biographies the common story is that the girls are young teenagers desperate for money, routinely homeless and with little self-worth or sources of emotional support. They are swiftly pressured into hardcore movies which they initially reject. If they do not accept, then the money dries up and they are on the street once more.

The cruelty of the practices they are thus forced to engage in, as well as the hatred of women that the pornography films represent, is revealed in the descriptions on the Adult Video News website of the movies it reviews. The description of the production of a 2005 title in AVN shows the cruelty involved as the woman being prostituted here endures lengthy anal penetration by two penises.

Cock-crazed Audrey is lighting up the room to critical mass levels with her blinding, nuclear-strength energy, taking multiple man hammers . . . two and three at a time, in her mouth, cunt and ass for the better part of a very sweaty hour.

'Goddamn! Fill me up like a fucking fuck whore!' she roars to one and all, the depraved blast furnace heat making her heavy makeup run down her pretty face all Alice Cooper-like. Audrey even sets a supposed new porn record (such records being

dubious at best) for length of time doing continuous double anals – 18 minutes (breaking, she tells me, Melissa Lauren's old 17-minute mark).

The scene is shot by the dynamic duo of Jim Powers and Skeeter Kerkove, the latter of whom just oozes pure joy at the porn-making process. 'Look at that double anal!' he exclaims excitedly at one point, full of kid-in-a-candy-store glee. 'This is better than a holiday in Cambodia.'

(Adult Video News, 2005)

Cambodia is mentioned because, as we shall see in the next section, the desperation of the women and children for subsistence has made it into a haven for western sex tourists and pornography production companies.

The globalization of the pornography industry

The pornography industry is now international in its production and distribution, in the trafficking in women which it facilitates, and in the damaging effects it has on women's status in non-western cultures in which pornography is a new harmful practice. As the industry expands it seeks both new and cheaper environments in which to produce the materials and new markets into which to sell it. Elements of the pornography industry choose to make porn movies in countries in which women are vulnerable to severe forms of exploitation and can be paid a pittance. One good example of what could be seen as the outsourcing of risk (Haines, 2005) is an American company producing sadomasochist materials for the website 'Rape Camp' using cheap and compliant Vietnamese women in Cambodia where the excitement for male consumers in seeing them raped was enhanced by racism (Hughes, 2000). The particularly severe sexual exploitation of women in Cambodia is a result of the way in which the sex industry was developed to serve the militaries that took part in the wars in the Mekong sub-region before 1975, particularly US soldiers. As Donna Hughes explains, this Phnom Penh resident announced in 1999 that he was adding a live bondage sex show to his Internet site which features 'Asian sex slaves' used for 'bondage, discipline and humiliation' (ibid.). The women were 'blindfolded, gagged, and/or bound with ropes while being used in sex acts; some had clothespins clipped to their breasts'.

Viewers were, Hughes reports, encouraged to ‘humiliate these Asian sex slaves to your heart’s content’. There was to be pay-per-view access in which customers could request torture to be carried out in real time at up to US\$75 for 60 minutes. The website also offered prostitution tourism to Cambodia. The pornographer, Don Sandler, used Vietnamese rather than Cambodian women as he thought this would create less local outrage.

He was outsourcing women’s subordination as well as risk, as he made clear in answering suggestions that the website might provoke violence against Cambodian women. He said he expected the market to be in America and he was happy for women to be attacked there: ‘I hate those bitches. They’re out of line and that’s one of the reasons I want to do this ... I’m going through a divorce right now ... I hate American women.’ The Cambodian Minister of Women’s Affairs stated that this constituted violence against women and Sandler was arrested. United States officials ensured that he was not prosecuted but deported back to the US. Donna Hughes identifies this incident as one example of the expansion of the global sex industry that has resulted from ‘[t]olerance and *de jure* and *de facto* legalization of prostitution and pornography’, which have ‘increased men’s demand for women and girls to be used as sexual entertainment or acts of violence’. Sandler’s activities in Cambodia marked the beginning of a big expansion in live sex shows via the Internet through companies such as Private Media Group operating by satellite out of Barcelona (Hughes, 2000). In 1999 this company broadcast simultaneously to 1,000 customers.

It is not just adult women that are being exploited in the production of pornography in Cambodia. UNICEF has decried the use of Cambodian children in pornography. Cambodian media have pointed out that children as young as seven are freely available from video disk vendors in Phnom Penh, and the films have Khmer language titles such as *Luring Underage Child* and *70-year-old Grandfather Rapes 9-year-old Girl* and include scenes of bondage and sexual abuse (*Cambodia Daily*, 2007). The impact of the global pornography industry in Cambodia extends beyond the harm it creates for women and children used in its production. Research suggests that the availability of pornography to children in Cambodia is having a profound effect on attitudes to sexuality and on sexual practice. One study was conducted in response to several assault cases by minors on minors in which the perpetrators claimed they had been influenced by pornography (Child Welfare Group, 2003).

The researchers interviewed 677 minors in Phnom Penh and three provinces. They found that 61.7 per cent of boys and 38.5 per cent of girls had viewed pornography. Pornography was openly on display and sold at news-stands, coffee houses, video shops, underground businesses and by market vendors. Some coffee shops show pornography throughout the day and the customers are all male. The coffee has to be paid for but the pornography is simply an enticement.

Some of the effects of watching pornography on young males were indicated in group interviews. In one interview group, for instance, the boys said that they 'enjoyed watching violence, and that most men do' (ibid., p. 17). When they were asked how it made them feel, one boy replied: 'We want to do what we see.' The boys said they did not hurt women but would 'use strong language and raise their voices to prostitutes after watching these films' (ibid., p. 17). However, they also said that they were sure that watching violent pornography made men violent towards women and encouraged rape and that they believed that women enjoyed being hit during sex because it heightened the women's sexual pleasure. The authors say that though their evidence is anecdotal it suggests there may be a 'desensitizing effect' from pornography. They comment that it is clear that minors use pornography as a means to obtain information about sex. The boys explained that they went to watch the films at coffee shops every evening as they had nothing else to do, and that if they could afford it they would visit a prostitute afterwards. They added that 'it is not possible to watch these films without having sex or masturbating afterwards, and that it isn't uncommon for men who cannot afford a prostitute to pick up a girl off the street and rape her' (ibid.).

Pornography may have even more profound effects in traditional communities, where it has been identified as playing a part in normalizing sexual abuse and prostitution for children and young people. Where pornography is introduced quite suddenly to an indigenous culture it may be possible to identify more easily the ways in which women's status is damaged. In western societies pornography has been normalized over 40 years. As this has taken place the rhetoric of sexual freedom, free speech and sexual liberation has been used to justify it. It may be hard now for citizens to turn around and observe the harm that pornography has wrought because its values have become so much a part of many areas of culture (Jeffreys, 2005). In traditional communities, however,

pornography can be seen as having a similarly dramatic effect to that of the Christian church, which was brought to Pacific societies by colonizers in the 20th century. Christianity undermined traditional sexual practices through categorizing as unchristian sexual activity which did not take place in Christian marriages. The impact of pornography has been arguably equally powerful in promoting a new sexual value system, but in a very different form. This new form of cultural colonization is largely about spreading the value system of US pornography, since the US is the main fount of the pornography that penetrates these societies. As Stiki Lole comments in an article on changing sexual practices in the Solomon Islands: 'While Malaitan Kastom and Christianity are still influential, young people's sexual practices are influenced also through globalizing processes, including the increased movement of people and exposure to radio, television and videos, pornography and the Internet'(Lole, 2003, p. 219).

Pornography has been pinpointed as a significant factor in the transformation of sexual practices and attitudes in traditional Australian aboriginal communities where there has been, in recent decades, an epidemic of child sexual abuse and violence against women. In 2007 the *Little Children Are Sacred* report (Wilde and Anderson, 2007) gained much media coverage for its disturbing revelations about child sexual abuse in communities in the Northern Territory. It supports the importance of pornography in creating this devastation. The report states that the issue of children's and the community's response to pornography was 'raised regularly' in the communities that were visited (ibid., p. 199). The authors comment that 'use of pornography as a way to encourage or prepare children for sex ("grooming") has featured heavily in recent prominent cases'. They say that in written submissions community groups and individuals expressed concern at the way in which children were exposed to pornography. This exposure was attributed to poor supervision, overcrowding and the normalization of the material. The report is clear that the effects are harmful, stating that '[t]he daily diet of sexually explicit material has had a major impact, presenting young and adolescent Aboriginals with a view of mainstream sexual practice and behaviour which is jaundiced. It encourages them to act out the fantasies they see on screen or in magazines'.

The report also blames pornography for the advent of sexualized behaviour evident in young people and even in young children who

act out sexually and aggressively towards each other. Some examples of the sexual abuse that were occurring in the communities included an 18-year-old boy anally raping and drowning a six-year-old girl who was swimming with friends at a waterhole, an 18-year-old boy digitally penetrating the vagina of his seven-month-old niece, and a 17-year-old boy who would regularly show pornographic DVDs at a certain house and then get young children to act out the scenes from the films. The report states that there is 'increasing sexually aggressive behaviour by both boys and girls' and teenagers are becoming 'more violent, more sexual and more anarchic' (ibid., p. 66). There was a high rate of sexually transmitted infections (STIs) and of pregnancy in children aged 12–16, and increasing 'consensual' sex between children. The problem had got to the point where in one community 'girls did not understand that they had a choice to refuse sex. They accepted that if they walked around at night they were available for sex' (ibid.). Many, if not all, of these children had either been sexually abused themselves, had witnessed inappropriate sexual behaviour through pornography, or seen others having sex in front of them. The pornography was seen in the communities as having broken down the traditional cultural constraints which would once have made such behaviour unthinkable. Pornography is available in the communities through pay-TV via Austar as well as through DVDs. Austar says that there is blocking software available to block the pornography it distributes, but instructions for this are only available in English, not aboriginal languages. One group interviewed for the report identified the state TV channel whose brief is the showing of multicultural programmes, SBS, as another source of pornographic programmes, which it mainly shows on Friday evenings. Another group complained about both pornography videos and music videos with pornographic content, as well as regular TV and magazines with pornographic content, and another commented that 'it was often white fellas who would come in and sell the pornographic DVDs' (ibid., p. 199).

Shamima Ali's UNICEF study of violence against the girl child in five Pacific nations also points to the infiltration of pornography into these traditional societies and the role it plays in the creation of prostitution industries and the sexual exploitation of girls (Ali, 2006). She explains that men in Papua New Guinea (PNG) are 'spending the family's cash income (derived from royalty payments or from their wife's small business) on pornography and prostitution, thereby fuelling industries which demean women and

girls' (ibid., p. 7). The spread of pornography, she says, and 'its easy accessibility in many Pacific countries' is believed to 'significantly increase the risks to the girl child of becoming a victim of sexual violence' (ibid., p. 7). In countries where resource exploitation is taking place, such as Papua New Guinea and the Solomon Islands, she points out, there is internal labour migration among males to mines and logging camps where they live away from their families. This fuels markets for video pornography as well as prostitution and leads to the sexual exploitation of girl children. In Fiji the main forms of sexual exploitation include pornography as well as prostitution, sex tourism and adoption.

In Carol Jenkins' fascinating study of the changing sexual culture of PNG one interviewee describes the change in behaviour that pornography has created. She says that in her youth she slept with boys but they were only allowed to rub noses. This had changed because '[o]ur minds are now full of sex. We see white people naked and kissing on the TV screen and books' (Jenkins, 2006, p. 10). Jenkins reports that '[m]edia, especially video and pornographic magazines, also play a large part in the changing ways of sex' (ibid., p. 30). In focus group discussions in her study, pornography was held responsible for 'increased rape, heightened sex drive, and the spread of STIs' (ibid.). The comments of one of her informants strikingly depict the way that pornography can affect a boy who has not been brought up with the expectations of a western pornographic culture. He was asked what movie he last saw and responded that he could not remember but 'it was acted by white people ... I saw them naked, they played around with their sexual organs, sucking each others' sexual organs – they f*** like wild dogs' (ibid., p. 30). He said he could not 'control my feelings. I lost control, my penis expanded and expanded. Some of the boys, when they saw it, they held on to their expanded penis and tried to control it, but they couldn't ... when I came outside, when I saw girls I really was tempted to rape them. I wanted to put into practice what I saw that made me sexy' (ibid., p. 30).

The changes in sexual culture have led to extremely high rates of gang rape in particular. Jenkins comments that group rape is culturally specific to PNG, where it accounts for at least half of all rapes and is referred to locally as 'lineup, deep line, single file and plural copulation'. Of the youth in this study, 11 per cent of women and 31 per cent of men reported personal involvement in lineups. Where men were concerned this was mostly on numerous

occasions, and 40 per cent of men also admitted raping women when alone. In a national rural study 61 per cent of men said they had participated in group sex at least once, and 65 per cent of women said they had been raped, often with the use of weapons. Sexual violence, she considered, was so common as to be seen as normative in many communities.

Conclusion

The pornography industry stimulates the expansion of many other areas of the global sex industry and creates the male clients who use the strip clubs and brothels. Its profitability tempts major corporations to become involved and it is attracting the interest of banks and investors. The practices and products are evolving very fast and show considerable variety, from phone sex to live sex websites. But as the industry expands internationally it draws in girls and women around the world whose bodies are the sites in which the profits are made. Women in poor South East Asian communities can now go into a booth in an Internet café and create live pornography for customers in other countries who instruct them on what to do (personal communication with Coalition Against Trafficking in Women member from the Philippines). Men can sell the sexual use of their wives and children internationally online. As the production and distribution of pornography are globalized it is transforming sexual cultures all over the world, with harm to the status of women and girls. In the 1990s the strip club industry, sometimes called 'live pornography', was normalized too, as we will see in Chapter 4, and it has had similarly worrying effects upon the women and girls who are exploited within the industry and the status of women.

The strip club boom

There has been a rapid expansion of the strip club industry in the western world in the last decade, particularly in the form of lap dancing clubs. The industry is estimated to be worth US\$75 billion worldwide (D. Montgomery, 2005). Some writers in the field of gender studies have defended the practice of stripping. They have argued that stripping should be understood as socially transgressive, an exercise of women's agency or a form of empowerment for women (Hanna, 1998; Schweitzer, 1999; Liepe-Levinson, 2002). These arguments exemplify the decontextualized individualism which is common to many defences of the sex industry. However, the tradition of women dancing to sexually excite men (usually followed by commercial sexual use of the women) is a historical practice of many cultures, as in the case of the auletrides of classical Greece, who were slaves (Murray and Wilson, 2004), and the dancing girls of Lahore, who are prostituted within their families from adolescence (Saeed, 2001). It does not signify women's equality. Rather, the tradition of stripping signifies sexual inequality and it is most prevalent, historically, in societies in which women were very much second class citizens. This chapter will examine the context in which stripping takes place, looking at who owns the industry and who benefits most from it, in order to expose the weakness of the argument that stripping is a form of women's empowerment. It will look at the evidence that suggests that both national and international organized crime gangs run the most profitable sectors of the industry. It will show how, as the industry both expands and becomes more exploitative to create greater profits, the trafficking of women and girls into debt bondage has become a staple way of sourcing strippers in Europe and North America. Rather than empowering women,

this chapter will suggest, the strip club boom helps to compensate men for lost privileges.

The strip club boom

Striptease is not a new phenomenon in the west. However, in the 20th century the practice was gradually decensored and became increasingly explicit in the amount of nudity and touching permitted: from *tableaux vivants* in which women were not permitted to move and had to wear skin-coloured coverings, to the lap dancing of the present. In the latter, women are usually naked and use their genitals to massage the penises of clothed men whilst seated on their laps in private booths. Customers for the recent expansion of the industry are likely to have been trained and encouraged in the commercial sexual use of women by the decensorship of the pornography industry from the 1960s onwards. Many of the clubs and chains set up in the boom are owned by men who got rich through pornography, such as the Hustler chain of Larry Flynt.

In the 1980s striptease moved into a new phase. Prior to this time it was traditional for clubs to pay women to dance. The change began in the United States. Dawn Passar, a former stripper who now organizes the Exotic Dancers' Alliance, explains that when she first danced in San Francisco the well-known venue the Mitchell Brothers' O'Farrell Theater, whose operations were mentioned in Chapter 3, 'paid wages, minimum per hour and tips' (Brooks, n.d.). The Market Street Cinema in the same city introduced 'stage fees' in which dancers had to pay management for the right to dance, making a living through tips from private dances, and this spread to the other venues. This was a profound change which enabled the venue owners to make much more considerable profits. They were now charging the dancers instead of paying them. From this point on the amount of the 'stage fee' rose very fast, to the point where women sometimes dance with no profit for themselves in an evening, or even make a loss. This new level of profitability and the new principle that workers should pay to work, stimulated the strip club boom. The US industry was estimated in one media report in 2006 to be worth much more than baseball: '\$4 billion a year is spent by men on baseball, the national pastime. Compare that to \$15 billion a year spent by men at strip clubs' (Sawyer and Weir, 2006).

The feminist debate

In response to this boom in strip clubs it might be expected that there would be a lively feminist discussion of the issue, but this is not so. Feminist critiques of stripping are thin on the ground. Instead there are many articles and books which represent stripping as an exemplification of Judith Butler's ideas of the transgressing of gender through the performance of femininity and masculinity (Butler, 1990). Liepe-Levinson, for instance, in a book in the Routledge series 'Gender in Performance', argues that strip shows involve 'social transgressiveness' because female dancers 'play desired sex-object roles as they openly defy the expectations of the double standard' (Liepe-Levinson, 2002, p. 4). Dahlia Schweitzer, in the *Journal of Popular Culture*, also argues that stripping is transgressive (Schweitzer, 1999). Striptease, in her view, enables women to role reverse and take power over men: 'With men the suckers, and women pocketing the cash, the striptease becomes a reversal of society's conventional male/female roles. Striptease is, at its core, a form of role removal' in which women are 'clearly in charge' (ibid., p. 71). She gives the impression that a pro-stripping line is the correct feminist position when she argues: 'By removing her clothes, the stripper disrupts years of patriarchal hegemony' (ibid., p. 72). The anthropologist Lynne Hanna, on the other hand, takes the approach of pure American liberal individualism (Hanna, 1998). She both researches and writes in the field of dance studies and now serves as an expert witness on behalf of the strip club industry in cases where local authorities seek to exercise control over strip clubs. She argues that attempts to limit strip clubs and activities in the US violate First Amendment rights to freedom of communication. Her conclusion is that '[i]t is time to cease stripping the First Amendment, corseting the exotic dancer and patron, and tying up the community and to promote equality of opportunity for everyone' (ibid., p. 21).

This form of literature on strip clubs, much of it written by women who have experience in the industry, tends to stress the agency that women who strip are able to exercise. Katherine Frank, who worked as a stripper before researching a PhD on strip clubs and their patrons, says that she had 'increased feelings' of 'self-efficacy' when 'dancing', though she acknowledges in her work that the fact that she was known to be a graduate student and had other options is likely to have made her personal experience untypical (Frank, 2002a).

She is critical of the notion that stripping is transgressive. She seeks to create a 'feminist politics of stripping' and writes of how she 'performs' femininity through the practice, but argues that the male buyers are not aware of the 'performance' and 'hold very normative views about gender roles'. She is forced to ask whether the transgression works: 'What is the effect of my double-agent approach to womanhood on the men who gaze up at me? The hard truth is that I cannot predict or prescribe how my performances will be interpreted' (Frank, 2002b, p. 200). Frank is well aware that there are constraints on the exercise of agency. She speaks, for example, of stripping being 'deeply intertwined with gendered and sexual positionings and power relations' (Frank, 2002a, p. 4). But she is quite positive about what stripping offers to women. Frank speaks, for instance, of the 'potential economic and personal rewards' and the 'radical political potential of mixing money, sexuality, and the public sphere' so that 'sex work cannot be dismissed as a possible form of feminist resistance or an exercise in female agency' (Frank, 2002a, p. 16). Of strippers she writes: 'We open spaces of resistance within the heteronormative culture of the strip club and elsewhere' (Frank, 2002b, p. 206). The constraints themselves, such as the structural dimensions of the industry, the exploitative and abusive practices of strip club owners, managers and clients, restrictions on how much money is made by women who strip and what precisely they have to do to get it, are scarcely mentioned.

Though there is now a considerable feminist literature on the harms of prostitution, looking at the effects on prostituted women psychologically and physically (Farley, 2004; Jeffreys, 1997), this has not been the case for stripping, where there is little analysis of the harms. Feminist research has only just begun to address the effects of this boom on other women, such as those in the neighbourhoods where the clubs are set up, and those who seek equality in a business world where, in some sectors, the majority of deals take place in strip clubs from which they are excluded (Morgan and Martin, 2006). A literature is just beginning to develop on the gains that the male buyers make from their involvement in the strip club industry. Most significantly there has been a conspicuous gap in the literature in relation to the context in which the stripping takes place. The feminist literature does not discuss who is developing this industry and who benefits. This chapter begins with an examination, mainly from media reports, of the context of stripping, looking at who owns the industry, the involvement of organized crime and

the trafficking of women that supplies it. The second part looks at the harms suffered by the women who strip within this exploitative context using the little research which exists combined with material from strip club industry magazines and sex work organizations. The third part looks at the impact of strip clubs on equality between the sexes through the experience of the male buyers, and that of the women in the world of business who have to confront a new glass ceiling created by male colleagues' use of strip clubs, using some interesting recent research in this area.

The context of the strip club industry

Strippers do not work independently. The practice takes place in clubs which are extremely exploitative. The clubs are often part of national and international chains which, according to the work of investigative journalists in the UK and the US, have criminal connections (Blackhurst and Gatton, 2002). This context is likely to affect the potential for empowerment. The strip club industry is expanding because of the profit levels in the business. In the US in 2005, there were an estimated 3,000 clubs, employing 300,000 women (Stossel, 2005). In 2002, there were 200 lap dancing clubs in the UK (Jones *et al.*, 2003). A 2003 media report estimated the annual turnover of UK lap dancing clubs at £300 million and commented that 'they are one of the fastest growing elements in the UK's leisure services industry' (*ibid.*, p. 215). The strip club industry is estimated to be worth £22.1 million a year to the Scottish economy alone (Currie, 2006).

Spearmint Rhino, the American chain owned by John Gray, now has clubs in the UK, Moscow, Australia, as well as the US. British investigative journalists Jonathan Prynne and Adrian Gatton report that the Tottenham Court Road, London, club makes profits of more than £3 per minute (Prynne and Gatton, 2003). In 2001, a year after it opened, the club made a 'tax profit of more than £1.75 million from sales of £7.8 million, equivalent to takings of £150,000 a week' (*ibid.*). Over the Christmas period the revenues were £300,000 a week. They point out that a busy city pub would take only around £20,000 pounds in a good week and this goes a long way to explaining why many pubs in the UK have been converted to strip clubs in recent years. Spearmint Rhino operates in the common style of lap dancing clubs, with dancers paying £80 per night to work and the club taking 35 per cent of the earnings from customers.

Media reports suggest that some strip club owners and managers are associated with organized crime. This is relevant to the degree of 'empowerment' that is likely to be available to strippers. The owners of strip clubs are careful to represent themselves as upstanding members of the community in their sponsorship of football teams, donations to charity and so on. The owners of upmarket clubs promote them as elegant destinations for socially elite men. However, there are indications, despite all attempts to maintain the veneer of respectability, that strip club owners have disreputable associations. One indication is the amount of unexplained death and injury sustained by the owners/managers and their associates. The manager of Spearmint Rhino UK, a supposedly upmarket chain, was viciously attacked whilst walking from the Tottenham Court Road club to the car park in 2002 (Blackhurst and Gatton, 2002). 'Two men came up behind, struck him on the head with a machete and knocked Mr Cadwell to the ground. He somehow fought back but was stabbed at least twice, one blow puncturing a lung' (ibid.). No one was charged and the police 'suspect this was no ordinary street robbery, that Mr Cadwell was targeted by associates of a notorious north London crime family in a feud with his company' (ibid.). An unexplained death occurred in relation to Cadwell when, in September 1990, a 21-year-old woman who was riding with him in his helicopter in California was killed. She was the girlfriend of Cadwell's close friend David Amos: 'She stepped out of the helicopter as it stood on the tarmac at Long Beach Airport to greet Mr Amos, who was waiting for her, and walked into the still turning tail rotor blades.' The police investigation concluded the death was an accident. In 2001 Amos was convicted of the machine-gun killing of a strip club boss in Los Angeles in 1989. He was close to a member of the Bonnano mafia family in New York and had paid a hitman to shoot Horace McKenna at his home (ibid.). An attack similar to that on Cadwell took place in Edinburgh in 2005. The manager of one of Scotland's biggest lap dancing bars 'was stabbed as he locked up for the night' (J. Hamilton, 2005). The *Sunday Mail* reporter notes: 'Police believe he may have been caught up in a feud between the capital's gangsters' (ibid.).

John Gray's Spearmint Rhino is the most successful international chain. These clubs go to particular lengths to establish that they are upmarket venues and not just 'strip joints' and are popular with business executives for entertaining clients. Gray, however,

is a controversial figure. He has six convictions in the US for offences ranging from carrying a concealed weapon to writing dud cheques, for which, collectively, he received a suspended sentence, 68 months probation and periods in jail (Blackhurst and Gatton, 2002). According to an *Evening Standard* (London) investigation, though ‘born John Leldon Gray ... he has used the names, John Luciano, John Luciano Gianni and Johnny Win’ (ibid.). The *Standard* article makes the interesting point that ‘[o]ddly, there is also a John L Gray, born in February 1957 and linked to two Spearmint Rhino addresses and one of Mr Gray’s home addresses, who is registered in the US as “deceased”’ (ibid.). Journalists in different countries are clearly interested in the connections between organized crime and the strip club industry but have to be careful what they say in case of libel claims.

Arguments about women gaining agency and empowerment through stripping need to be looked at in the context of the extent of organized crime involvement in the industry. Organized crime employers and managers are men who bully, threaten and kill to gain their profits. This needs to be factored in as a powerful form of inequality between the sex entrepreneurs and those they exploit. It is interesting to note that one of the arguments made for legalizing the prostitution industry in many countries where brothels are still illegal is that this will drive out organized crime, which only thrives because the illegal industry is driven underground. But strip clubs are legal everywhere and persons connected with organized crime are running them and collecting the considerable profits.

An approach of decontextualized individualism is inappropriate for analysis of stripping because, unlike the women who strip, the club owners and entrepreneurs are very organized nationally and internationally. They are not operating simply as individuals. Many are involved in networks of organized crime. But even those for whom there is no evidence of such involvement are organizing together to influence, and in many cases bribe, politicians, to engage lawyers and experts who can swap ways to avoid regulation and defeat community activism. These networks are organized through associations and online resources such as the US newsletter of the Association of Club Executives, *Strip Magazine* in Europe and the Eros Foundation in Australia.

As a result of their careful efforts to achieve respectability, such as sex exhibitions, stripping competitions, support for charities and a positive coverage in the media, strip clubs have experienced

a remarkable normalization. Such leading figures of the UK establishment as Margaret Thatcher, Prince Harry and Tony Blair's son Euan have all been recorded as patronizing the clubs in 2005/2006. Thatcher was a guest at a Tory Party fundraiser in Peter Stringfellow's London club in April 2005 (Strip Magazine, 2005). Euan Blair was observed 'spending the evening in the Hustler club late in November while on work experience in Paris' in 2005 (Strip Magazine, 2006). In April 2006 Prince Harry was observed at a lap dancing club: 'He [Harry] and a group of mates arrived at Spearmint Rhino at Colnbrook near Slough, Berks, at 3am ... Harry grabbed a seat near the topless dancers – and stripper Mariella Butkute sat on his lap' (Rousewell, 2006). Meanwhile the industry is promoted in the business pages of newspapers, in how-to books and, currently, in some academic disciplines such as business studies (Jones *et al.*, 2003) and leisure studies, where it is described positively in a leisure studies collection as 'a satisfying leisure experience' and 'passive recreation' (Suren and Stiefvater, 1998).

Trafficking

Despite the attempts of the strip club entrepreneurs to promote themselves and their venues as respectable, trafficking in women by organized crime groups has become a common form of supply of dancers. All over Europe and North America women and girls are brought into the clubs by deception, by force or, initially, by consent. In all cases they are kept in debt bondage, have their travel documents confiscated and are controlled by threats to themselves or their families, all the traditional aspects of this modern form of slavery. Governments can be complicit in the trafficking of women to strip clubs, acting as procurers for the business. In Canada, for instance, the importation of women was organized through exotic dancer visas issued by the state. Visas for particular skilled occupations which could not be staffed by local employees were a formal part of the immigration programme; 400–500 visas a year for Eastern European women were issued until 2004. In order to gain visas women had to supply proof that they were strippers, and this was accomplished by the provision of 'soft-porn' pictures to immigration authorities (Agence France-Presse, 2004). Audrey Macklin argues in *The International Migration Review* that local strippers could not be found because the conditions of work in stripping had deteriorated drastically with the advent of lap dancing

and private booths (Macklin, 2003). Canadian citizens were not prepared to experience the extreme degradation involved. Macklin makes the fascinating argument that the strippers from Eastern Europe should be seen as the 'spoils of war'. She explains: 'If the fall of the Berlin Wall symbolizes the defeat of communism and the triumph of capitalism, then perhaps commodified East European women, exported to serve Western men, are the spoils of the Cold War served up by the global market to the victors' (Macklin, 2003). The soldiers of liberty from the west, in the form of strip club habitués in North America and Western Europe, can claim and use the bodies of women of the defeated communist régime. They exercise the colonizing power of rich males within a globalized economy.

The strip club owners have such power and influence within national economies that they are able to get governments to act as procurers for their industry. Macklin explains that Mendel Green, lawyer for the clubs, asserted that the state owed a duty to the private sector to provide labour inputs where market incentives failed (Macklin, 2003). Indeed he is quoted in a newspaper at the time as calling strippers 'products', saying: 'They're a critical sort of product in the entertainment industry that is not readily available in Canada' (*Guelfh Mercury*, 2004). Interestingly, Green argued that foreign women were needed because 'Canadian-born dancers were controlled by biker gangs' (ibid.), which is an admission by an industry representative of the involvement of organized crime. The Canadian government became sufficiently embarrassed at so clearly acting as a pimp to the local strip club owners that the exotic dancer visas were discontinued in 2004.

Trafficking of women from Eastern Europe into strip clubs has caused considerable concern in Ireland. Until 2002 the Irish state, like Canada, issued work permits for lap dancers under the category of 'entertainment', thus making the trafficking effortless (Haughey, 2003). Justice Minister Michael McDowell told the parliament in 2002 that 'there was clear evidence that human traffickers from Eastern Europe used lap dancing clubs as a front for the sex trade' (Wheeler, 2003). In June 2003 the Gardai in Ireland 'blocked a bid by Eastern European organized crime gangs to take control of the money-spinning lap dancing industry' (Brady, 2003). The gangsters were thought to have links with paramilitaries and criminals in Ireland. The *Irish Times* comments that the industry is 'plagued' by reports that prostitution occurs in the clubs and in Dublin one

club was closed by a court order after illegal sex acts were found to have been taking place (Haughey, 2003). The feminist anti-violence organization Ruhama argues that the clubs 'groom' women for prostitution and 'in every other country in the world they are just a cover for prostitution' (ibid.). There is trafficking into the clubs in the US too. In an example from 2005, 'a Russian entertainment promoter Lev Trakhenberg of Brooklyn, NY got 5 years for admitting he and his wife helped more than 25 women to come illegally from Russia to the United States to perform nude lap dances at strip clubs' (Parry, 2006).

Exploitation and violence towards strippers

It is in the context of huge profits to club owners, of organized crime and trafficking, that women strip in the clubs. The profits would not be so large if women were being fairly remunerated for stripping. In fact the vast majority of the profits go to the club owners, and not to the dancers, who may find it hard to earn enough to pay the stage fees. In San Diego dancers 'can make several hundred dollars on a weekend night, but most struggle to make \$100 a night, many of them earning only what they can make in tips ... Another dancer at Minx Showgirls ... said she averages closer to \$45 a night' (Washburn and Davies, 2004). The strip club habitué of 25 years, Tyke, who writes for the industry journal *Strip Magazine* explains that the idea that UK dancers can make £2,000 a night is a myth. It is in fact a story frequently repeated by club owners, who would find it hard to attract dancers if they told the truth. Tyke explains that 'to make £2,000 in 1 night would involve 100 table dances i.e. around 15 an hour for a typical 7 hour shift, I just don't think that happens' (Tyke, 2004). He explains that 'girls' might in exceptional circumstances find a merchant banker who will spend his 'Christmas bonus' and that could create the much touted large earnings.

The profit levels in the industry are enhanced by the fact that strippers do not get the benefits that other club workers receive, such as sick leave or superannuation, since the club owners treat them as individual agents who simply rent space in the club. As Kelly Holsopple points out in her research on stripping, although the club owners argue that they are not employers and that the strippers are independent agents, they control hours and schedules, fees and tips and even set the price of table dances and private dances (Holsopple, 1998).

They pressure dancers to engage in complete shaving of pubic hair, year-long tans or breast implants. They regulate when women can use the bathroom, when they can mix with other women and when they can smoke. The rules are enforced with fines for being late, for calling in sick, for 'talking back' to customers or staff and many other infringements which can deplete their earnings. Many of the offences for which the strippers are fined are in fact invented. On top of this strippers have to tip those who are employed by the club on regular wages. Managers enforced 'a mandatory tip out to bouncers and disc jockeys' (ibid., p. 3). Liepe-Levinson also writes of fines for minor transgressions, and harsh work schedules (Liepe-Levinson, 2002).

As the clubs seek to maximize profits they put on greater numbers of dancers, which creates greater competition, forces down earnings and pressures strippers to engage in violating practices they would rather avoid such as lap dancing or prostitution. 'Retired' stripper Amber Cooke explained in a 1980s collection on sex work that strippers are forced, because there are too many dancers and not enough male buyers, to compete and 'encourage hands-on entertainment rather than dance, in order to make their money' (Cooke, 1987, p. 98). She points out that this is 'dangerous' and bouncers are not an effective protection because they cannot watch all tables, let alone the more recent private booths, and may be 'reluctant' to back up a stripper against a group of aggressive male customers. The advent of lap dancing in strip clubs has been seen by stripper advocacy groups and individual dancers as creating severe harms. When carried out in private booths it enables male buyers to sexually assault women, and to engage in forms of intimate contact that the women find intolerable. In a Melbourne court case a man was jailed in July 2006 for raping a stripper in a private booth: 'During the dance, she took off her G-string and was naked. Her breasts were about 30cm from Nguyen's face ... [he] lunged at the woman, digitally raping her ... he pinned the woman to a couch' (*The Australian*, 2006).

Canadian strippers formed an organization to oppose the development of lap dancing in the clubs, and those interviewed in one study particularly objected to having to come into contact with 'customers' ejaculate', which could occur 'when ejaculate penetrated the men's clothing during lap dances' (Lewis, 2000, p. 210). One interviewee explained: 'So halfway through the song, like no warning, you're sitting on their lap, and all of a sudden you're wet.' Another concern

was ‘dancers’ genital contact with other dancers’ vaginal secretions, left on customers’ clothing’. These lap dancing opponents also talked of the harm they experienced from being pressured by owners and managers and customers to engage in lap dancing, and being threatened with job loss if they did not comply. Such practices made them feel ‘disempowered and victimized’. Two dancers said that they were ‘crying their eyes out’ after their first night of lap dancing, and were distressed by ‘[t]hese strangers’ fingers all over you – it was really nasty’ (ibid.). Nonetheless, the researcher, Jacqueline Lewis, opposed the ban on lap dancing that many of her interviewees saw as necessary for their survival in the industry. She considered that the solution to the problems strippers faced was to treat stripping just like other forms of work. But there are no other forms of work apart from the sex industry in which women have to battle to keep men’s fingers and ejaculate off their naked bodies.

There has been very little research on the physical and psychological harms that strippers face in clubs. Indeed, information on the harms of stripping may be hard to elicit for some researchers. Thus Danielle Egan, who writes about stripping from what she calls a ‘sex radical’ perspective and rejects radical feminist analyses which focus on harm, comments that the women she worked with as a stripper and interviewed for her book avoided elaborating on their ‘experiences with bad nights’ (Egan, 2006, p. 83). Egan interpreted bad nights as those on which women got very little money and were made to feel bad or ‘like whores’ and the good nights as those on which they made money and felt good. She does not enlarge on the women’s experiences of being touched by men or having to touch them and how they felt about such practices. This more detailed analysis is hard to come by. Kelly Holsopple, who worked as a stripper in the US for 13 years, conducted research into the harm of the industry to the dancers (Holsopple, 1998). She argues that the ‘common underlying element in strip clubs is that male customers, managers, staff, and owners use diverse methods of harassment, manipulation, exploitation, and abuse to control female strippers’ (ibid., p. 1). Holsopple conducted 41 interviews and 18 face to face surveys followed by discussions.

Her interviewees did not report the empowerment of women or expression of agency that some gender studies scholars have attributed to stripping (e.g. Egan, 2006). Women had to engage in activities they did not want because their income was ‘entirely dependent on compliance with customer demands in order to earn tips’

(Holsopple, 1998, p. 3). Holsopple concludes from her interviews that in abuse by the male buyers 'customers spit on women, spray beer, and flick cigarettes at them' and they are 'pelted with ice, coins, trash, condoms, room keys, pornography, and golf balls' (ibid., p. 8). Missiles included a live guinea pig and a dead squirrel. Women were hit by cans and bottles thrown from the audience, and male buyers also 'pull women's hair, yank them by the arm or ankle, rip their costumes, and try to pull their costumes off'. Women are commonly 'bitten, licked, slapped, punched, and pinched' (ibid.). The male buyers attempt to penetrate women vaginally and anally with 'fingers, dollar bills, and bottles'. Successful vaginal and anal penetration was common.

Holsopple's study showed that women suffered particular harms from the conditions in which they were required to dance. They had to dance on elevated runways so narrow that they could not get away from men on either side touching them. In the context of private dances men openly masturbated and 'stick their fingers inside women'. Wall dancing, for example, 'requires a stripper to carry alcohol swabs to wash the customer's fingers before he inserts them into her vagina. His back is stationary against the wall and she is pressed against him with one leg lifted' (Holsopple, 1998, p. 6). Holsopple's interviewees described clearly the forms of pressure and sexual harassment that they experienced from the male buyers in private dances: 'I don't want him to touch me, but I am afraid he will say something violent if I tell him no' and 'I could only think about how bad these guys smell and try to hold my breath' or 'I spent the dance hyper vigilant to avoiding their hands, mouths, and crotches' (ibid.). All of the 18 women in her survey reported being both physically and sexually abused in the clubs, and receiving verbal harassment, often multiple times. Most had been stalked by someone associated with the club, from one to seven times each. Holsopple says that regulations that customers should not touch dancers are 'consistently violated' and 'stripping usually involves prostitution' (ibid.). Liepe-Levinson reports that the strippers she interviewed experienced pressure to provide sexual favours to bosses and employees (Liepe-Levinson, 2002).

The advice offered to strippers from within the industry or from state funded sex work agencies on how to avoid violence supports Holsopple's findings of the dangers associated with stripping. On the *Strip Magazine* website, for instance, Ram Mani offers advice on how to be constantly alert to all the possibilities of

men's violence (Mani, 2004). Women are advised not to leave the clubs alone. Outside the club they should get straight into their cars and lock the doors, moving off immediately. They should not take a direct route home and should keep an eye on the mirror to check they are not being followed. They should park neither too far from the club so they have a dangerous walk to get to it, nor so close that a man may be able to take the registration number. When they register their cars they should do so to another address than their home one. They are warned: 'The odds of being stalked, mugged and attached [*sic*] are on increase and you must always keep your guard up' (ibid.). The advice offered to strippers by the sex work advocacy website STAR in Toronto includes tips for combating sexual assault: 'Watch for roaming hands. Clients have an easier time touching you when you dance on a box, specially when you're bending over' (STAR, 2004). Dancers are told to '[w]atch out for unruly or aggressive customers' and to '[u]se the mirrors to keep track of your back'. There is specific advice for private dances since 'there's a greater possibility of assault', which is: 'If a customer is trying to manhandle you, try holding his hands in a sexy way to control him. But be aware the touching violates some municipal bylaws. If you're being assaulted, scream' (ibid.). The strip club industry is thus dangerous and abusive for the women involved in it, but the harms of this industry stretch beyond the clubs themselves to affect the status and experience of other women.

Reinforcing gender inequality: the glass ceiling for women in business

Women in a society in which strip clubs flourish are likely to be affected by them in a variety of ways. Women whose husbands, partners, sons, male friends and male workmates visit strip clubs will suffer some effects. Wives and partners of pornophiles, for instance, report in interviews that they suffer harms such as losing self-esteem as men compare them with the women in pornography, having to do poses and practices that come from pornography to satisfy their male partners, and losing needed family income to men's obsession with pornography (Paul, 2005). Frank's research found that men reported visiting strip clubs to get revenge on their wives if they had an argument, and were well aware of the distress that their behaviour would cause if wives knew of it, and did cause to wives who suspected (Frank, 2002a). When areas of cities

are commandeered for men's sexual commodification of women, women who are not in the sex industry are likely to feel excluded from these spaces. Whilst men may take for granted their right of being able to access public space freely, women have always suffered a reduction in this right because of male violence and its threat.

Strip clubs are not separate from society but affect the way men relate to women on many levels. One area of harm in which legal cases are now being brought and research is just beginning to be done relates to the obstacles strip clubs place in the way of equality for women in the business world. A fascinating 2006 study (Morgan and Martin, 2006) shows how women professionals are blocked from engaging in the vital social networking which secures clients and contracts. It explains that many women professionals 'traverse other settings beyond the office in the course of their work', including conferences, aeroplanes, hotel rooms and lobbies, restaurants, shop floors, golf courses, tennis courts, sporting events, bars, cars and trade shows (Morgan and Martin, 2006, p. 109). The study explains that '[e]mployer-sponsored out-of-the-office socializing with colleagues, customers and suppliers is institutionalized'. In this way day-to-day work is done as well as the 'relationship building' that 'embeds the foundation for reciprocity and long-lasting organizational ties in personal ones' (ibid.). Thus this out-of-office socializing has important purposes which are completely necessary to a woman's work and career, not optional at all. The authors of the study, Morgan and Martin, explain that entertaining clients at strip clubs is an ordinary part of the work of the sales representatives they were researching in many industries. They write: 'Accounts from industry trade magazines suggest that almost half of salesmen, but only 5 per cent of saleswomen, had entertained clients in topless bars' (Morgan and Martin, 2006, p. 116). Saleswomen, they point out, are excluded from 'industry contacts and denied access to professional information exchange'. The interview information they were examining showed that some of the women professionals were disgusted by the visits to strip clubs, whilst others were just angry that they were excluded by being sent to their hotel rooms whilst the men went on to the clubs. The entertainment receipts showed the clubs as restaurants so that the accountants did not have to know where the events took place.

There is plenty of evidence to suggest that when men enter strip clubs in groups the atmosphere is even more exaggeratedly masculine (Frank, 2003; Erickson and Tewksbury, 2000).

As Morgan and Martin put it: 'Patrons tend to be louder and more raucous. The male-bonding bravado permeates the entire audience to some degree. The level of objectification of the dancers also appears to increase as a result of this phenomenon' (Morgan and Martin, 2006, p. 118). Women are not able to join in this bonding, which is expressly constructed between men through their objectification of naked women. Saleswomen said that at such events 'they undermined the "cavorting" and "fun" and ultimately the "bonding" that the events were intended to promote' (ibid.). One woman described trying to attend a strip club with a customer and two company managers. She ended up speaking, and perhaps bonding, with the strippers rather than her male companions, saying: 'And I'm like, "Okay where do I look?" I'm talking to the strippers' (ibid.). Her interaction with the strippers would be likely to humanize them and provide an impediment to the men's enjoyment of objectification.

The practice of taking clients to strip clubs seems to be particularly common in the finance industry. An estimated 80 per cent of city workers (presumably male ones) visit clubs such as Spearmint Rhino in London as a part of their work. This came out in a court case about the poaching of clients between two London finance firms in 2006 (Lynn, 2006). The journalist reporting on this interesting piece of information comments helpfully: 'In effect, just as their fathers might have taken clients to one of the gentlemen's clubs of Pall Mall, so brokers today take their business associates to see lap dancers. The old gentlemen's clubs banned women – some still do – whereas the lap-dancing establishments merely intimidate them' (ibid.). He explains that if one bank won't let its workers take clients to lap dancing clubs then its rivals certainly will. In the US this form of exclusion of women from equal opportunities has resulted in some high-profile actions for sex discrimination against top finance houses by women employees. Morgan Stanley, for instance, in 2004, agreed to pay \$54 million to settle Equal Employment Opportunity Commission (EEOC) charges that it had 'discriminated against women in pay and promotions, and tolerated crude comments about sex and men-only outings to strip clubs with clients' (Lublin, 2006). The woman who sued said in the lawsuit that she was left out of a client entertainment weekend in Las Vegas because 'the men would be uncomfortable participating in sexually oriented entertainment with a woman colleague present, especially one who knew their wives' (Summers, 2007). Another company,

UBS, paid out US\$29 million to a former director of international equities who had a number of complaints which included being invited by her manager to a 'bottomless' club (ibid.).

The practice of men in business fraternizing in strip clubs extends to politicians on the business of the state too. In 2007 it was revealed that the leader of the opposition Labour Party in Australia, Kevin Rudd, a committed Christian who is now Prime Minister, visited the strip club Scores in New York while on official business observing the UN (Summers, 2007). He was invited by Col Allen, editor of the *New York Post*, owned by Rupert Murdoch, to go to the club along with Australian Labour MP Warren Snowdon. Anne Summers, Australian journalist and director in the 1980s of the Equal Opportunities Commission, writes of her disappointment that this visit was greeted with jovial acceptance in the Australian media despite being a practice that discriminates against women. She points out that the practice of business and political entertaining in strip clubs can be very big business in terms of the amount of money spent. Scores strip club, she points out, 'settled a contested bill of \$US241,000 charged to the American Express card of the former CEO of information technology company Savvis' (ibid.). The newspaper in the Kevin Rudd story is likely to have picked up the bill. The use of strip clubs for discriminatory male bonding activities offers opportunities for corruption too to men in business and political élites as they hobnob with another male network, organized crime. The Scores club was controlled in the 1990s by the Gambino mafia family (Raab, 1998).

So integral and accepted have the strip clubs become within corporate culture that their importance to business is now being used as an argument as to why town councils should encourage their development (Valler, 2005). When the issue of granting a lap dancing club licence was before the council in Coventry, UK, in 2005, a 'leading businessman' argued that 'a lap-dancing club would boost Coventry's reputation as a major centre of commerce . . . When businessmen travel to a major city where they stay overnight, they almost expect to find a lap-dancing club. If Coventry has aspirations to be a major business area, then it has to have a quality adult entertainment area, and that would include a lap-dancing club' (ibid.). Strip clubs are an aspect of the international sex industry which is integral at present to the way that men do business, politics and crime, albeit through the bodies of naked women. The effect is to reinforce the glass ceiling for those women in business

and the professions who are permitted to keep their clothes on in male company.

Reinforcing gender inequality: a masculinizing practice

Concomitant with the losses women experience from the existence of strip clubs, there appears to be a direct enhancement of men's self-esteem, their feelings of masculinity and their bonding with other men. Though there is little evidence from research on strip club practices to suggest that the strippers experience a reversal of gender roles, and an access of power, there is, however, some very interesting research on what the male buyers gain in terms of personal power in relation to women from visiting the clubs. Katherine Frank used her status as a stripper to gain access to male customers and interview them. Her work is most revealing on the motivations of buyers (Frank, 2003). She studied men in traditional strip clubs that did not provide lap dancing, and reports that none of the men she interviewed said they went to the clubs for 'sexual release'. They had other motives, of which the most common were the 'desire to relax' and visiting a place where they could 'be a man' (Frank, 2003, p. 6). Frank explains that the clubs 'provide an environment where men, singularly or in groups can engage in traditionally "masculine" activities and forms of consumption frowned upon in other spheres, such as drinking, smoking cigars, and ... being "rowdy", "vulgar" or aggressive' (ibid.). Strip clubs recreate the gendered spaces for men that were challenged in second wave feminism. In the 1970s and 1980s some major campaigns were directed at stripping away from men the privilege of having male-only spaces in which to socialize and do business where women were not allowed. These campaigns included demanding and achieving women's entry to public houses, to sporting clubs and other places of entertainment on an equal basis with men. The boom in strip clubs can be seen as a counterattack, in which men have reasserted their right to network for and through male dominance without the irritating presence of women, unless those women are naked and servicing their pleasures.

Frank found that an important reason for men to visit the clubs was that they provided a compensation for the decline in power that they experienced as their wives, partners and women work-mates shed their subordination, began to compete with them and demanded equality. The strip clubs provided an antidote to the

erosion of male dominance by institutionalizing the traditional hierarchy of gender relations. The men found everyday relationships with women 'a source of pressure and expectations' and described relations between women and men in general as being 'strained', as 'confused', or 'tense'. One buyer referred to the 'war between the sexes'. They sought respite from the problems of having to treat women as equals in the workplace too. One of Frank's respondents, Philip, said that he was able to 'let frustration out', particularly about 'this sexual harassment stuff going around these days, men need somewhere to go where they can say and act like they want'. Some buyers, Frank found, 'desire to interact with women who were not "feminist," and who still want ... to interact with men in "more traditional" ways'. One of these traditional ways, it seems, is women's unconditional servicing of male sexual demands. Other buyers told her that, outside the sex industry, 'men had to continually "be on guard" against offending women'. Franks points out that 'several of the above comments could be analysed as part of a backlash against feminism' but says that she prefers to see them as a result of confusion caused by feminism and women's movement towards equality, as falling within 'a framework of confusion and frustration rather than one of privilege or domination'. She does say, however, that the rapid increase in strip clubs in the US in the 1980s 'was concurrent with a massive increase of women into the workforce and an upsurge of attention to issues of sexual harassment, date rape' (ibid.). 'Many' of the men she spoke with said they were confused about what women expected of them in relationships, and particularly when wives worked, had their own incomes and wanted to be included in decision making.

Frank considers that what takes place in the clubs does more than compensate men for these changes. The visits to strip clubs can be understood as 'masculinizing practices' in their own right. In the clubs otherwise unattainable women could be subjected to the men's control, exercised through the ability to refuse payment, over the length of their conversations with the women, what would be discussed and whether and when the women had to strip. Men reported that they got an 'ego boost' because there was no fear of rejection or of competition with other men. Frank concludes that strip clubs help to reinforce male power, through maintaining 'imbalance in the power dynamics in personal relationships with women, especially when they are used to shame or anger wives or partners' (ibid., p. 74). However, she remains determined not to place too strong an

emphasis on this. She remarks, despite the evidence she presents, that '[t]his is not to say that commodified sexual exchanges are inherently about the preservation and reproduction of male power' (*ibid.*, p. 75).

Another study of strip club patrons by two male researchers supports Frank's findings about the role the clubs play in upholding male dominance (Erickson and Tewksbury, 2000). The study analyses how the 'ultra-masculine context of the setting affects and illuminates patrons' motives for frequenting strip clubs' (*ibid.*, p. 272). This study also points out that the men in the clubs are in control as the women are bound to 'reciprocate most of the attention paid to them by the customer' rather than being able to reject male attention as they can in the world outside (*ibid.*, p. 273). The customer 'may dictate the nature, and often the course, of the interactions because the dancer is both obligated and financially motivated to cooperate with the direction of the customer in defining the interactions' (*ibid.*). This study confirms Frank's argument that the clubs are male-only environments that confirm masculinity, 'it is almost exclusively a "man thing" to go to strip clubs. It is one of the very few places where men have the opportunity to openly exhibit their latent sexual desires and to perform their "male privilege"' (*ibid.*, p. 289). The 'context' of the strip club serves to affirm masculinity because it is 'pervaded by images and norms that openly objectify women, is ultra-masculine' (*ibid.*). They conclude, however, in a way which seems to contradict their earlier findings, by saying that their study contradicts the notion that strippers are exploited because the dancers 'control the sequencing and content of their interactions with patrons and, in doing so, they generate a substantial income for themselves and provide men with access to important social commodities' (*ibid.*, p. 292). In their view, this is a fair exchange. Yet earlier they explicitly state that the men are in charge of the interactions, because the women cannot reject their advances as they can in the world outside the clubs, and they provide no evidence of the good earnings of the dancers. Their research thus seems to represent a male buyers' perspective.

Unlike the traditional gentlemen's clubs of London's Pall Mall, the strip clubs offer the opportunity to debase women, not just to bond and do business in their absence. The new gentlemen's clubs require women to be present, but only when naked and available to be bought. Men can drink with their friends whilst staring into a woman's genitals or shoving their fingers into her anus

or vagina. The context in which the male buyers are delivered this bounty is created for them by masculine networks of owners and franchisees.

Conclusion

The strip club boom needs to be fitted into understandings of the industrialization and globalization of the sex industry. An examination of the context of the strip club boom, of the way that profits are made, of the involvement of organized crime, of the trafficking of women and girls into the clubs, of the violence and exploitation that takes place, makes the arguments of some liberal feminists that dancers are empowered by stripping, able to exercise agency and transgress gender relations, look very thin. Such arguments represent a decontextualized individualism which takes no account of existing inequality between men and women and the way that strip clubs can only derive from and serve to reinforce this. Rather, I suggest, the strip club boom represents a rebalancing of the power relations of male dominance, away from what has been gained through feminist movements and the social and economic changes of the last quarter-century. It does this through its role in international capitalism and organized crime, the masculinizing effects of club patronage on male buyers, the subordination of hundreds of thousands of women in the clubs, and the exclusion of women from equal opportunities in national and international professional and business networks of men who use the clubs to bond and do business. The strip club boom imports into the west degrading practices developed in the poor countries of South East Asia to service the US military in rest and recreation. The norms of military prostitution were globalized. Women danced and waited to be chosen, in the west for 'lap dances', ostensibly, and in South East Asia for other forms of prostitution, as we shall see in Chapter 5.

Military prostitution

Military prostitution was a most important vector in the globalization and industrialization of prostitution in the late 20th century. The massive industrialized militaries of the 20th century understood that prostitution was necessary to their military preparedness. The male soldiers were provided with easy, organized, cheap and 'safe' access to prostituted women. The prostituted women were recruited in a variety of ways. The 'comfort women' were kidnapped, deceived or bought from parents in Korea, China and other invaded and colonized countries for the Japanese military brothels of the 1930s and 1940s. The women and girls used by peacekeepers in brothels in Kosovo are trafficked women kept in debt bondage, mostly from Eastern Europe. The methods are strikingly similar but the degree of official involvement by militaries and state governments varies. Military prostitution on a scale similar to that employed by the Japanese was part of the US military rest and recreation régimes after World War II throughout South East Asia. This formed the basis for the huge sex industries and trafficking of women that developed in Korea, Thailand and the Philippines, and became such important sectors of their economies. In its sheer scale, military prostitution can be seen as kickstarting a crucial aspect of the globalization of prostitution, the sexual exploitation of a sexual proletariat of women and children from poor countries by members of rich westernized nations.

Feminist concern with military prostitution dates back at least to the UK campaign against the Contagious Diseases Acts (CD Acts) of the 1860s and the subsequent international campaign against state regulated prostitution (Jeffreys, 1985a, 1987). The CD Acts were introduced, ostensibly, to protect servicemen from venereal diseases and the temptation of homosexuality. The Acts decreed

that women in designated areas near camps and ports who were suspected of prostitution could be arrested, examined and locked up in 'lock' hospitals if found to be infected. Feminist outrage at that time, from the iconic anti-prostitution feminist Josephine Butler and others, was at the violation of women's rights in this regulation of provision by the state of women for men's use. This system of state regulation started from military prostitution and presages precisely how military prostitution was organized in the 20th century in Asia for Japanese and then American troops – the women were compulsorily inspected and registered whilst the men were not. The CD Acts campaign was successful, with the Acts being suspended in 1886. Unfortunately their equivalent exists today in legalized prostitution systems in Australia, for instance, in which women prostituted in brothels have to be examined and the prostitutes do not (M. Sullivan, 2007).

The problem of sexual exploitation by militaries was raised early in second wave feminism. Susan Brownmiller showed how militaries used rape to punish vanquished male populations by stealing 'their' women, and to gee up their soldiery to battle-ready aggression (Brownmiller, 1975). In the 1980s Cynthia Enloe made military prostitution an important issue for international feminist theory in her work on militarization (Enloe, 1983, 2000). Enloe explained that the problem for analysis was not so much militaries as militarization, or the gearing of societies for conflict in ways which profoundly affected their economies and everyday politics. The creation and maintenance of huge, war-ready militaries requires the involvement of hundreds of thousands of civilians, and particularly women, to bolster and service them. Many of these women are those inducted into prostitution. The masculinity of troops is, in this feminist understanding, deliberately created by militaries through the provision of prostitution and pornography, which enable men to 'other' women.

The othering of women is fundamental to basic training, in which men are accused of being women in order to toughen them up. Without the concept of 'women' as social inferiors from whom the male soldiers must differentiate themselves by their actions, the male soldier might have no founding myth to hang onto, no rationale (A. Carter, 1996). When US soldiers buy prostituted women for use in rest and recreation in areas which have often been supervised by military police, as in Korea, they are further working to differentiate themselves from women and to develop the aggressive masculinity

which will enable them to kill others (Moon, 1997; Sturdevant and Stoltzfus, 1992). They affirm male bonding by visiting brothels in groups. Women soldiers are deprived of this bonding activity and, presumably, of the other benefits that the US military considers that prostitution provides to its male soldiers. They are not equal in this respect but represent precisely in their persons the 'others' on and in whose bodies the male soldiers are being trained to be men. Some feminist critics of the military and of militarization have pointed out not just that the military is a masculine institution, as are other institutions that women seek to enter such as the police force or fire service, but that it requires masculinity in order to function (Jeffreys, 2007; Enloe, 2000; Morgan, 1989).

The use of prostitution in its many forms to comfort and entertain soldiers, to pump them up, to maintain their military aggression, is pervasive across militaries and conflict zones. Pornography can be used in military training too, to encourage soldiers to distinguish themselves from women and develop their aggressive masculinity. Pornography was used, for instance, to encourage aggression when the Pakistani army invaded Bangladesh in 1971. Brownmiller reports that '[i]n some of the camps, pornographic movies were shown to the soldiers, "in an obvious attempt to work the men up," one Indian writer reported' (Brownmiller, 1975, p. 82). Hundreds of thousands of rapes of Bangladeshi women were carried out by the soldiers who had been so thoroughly 'worked up'. Ruth Seifert makes the important point that militaries make offers of masculinity to soldiers. Male soldiers expect a consolidation of their masculine status and receive this from training and the male bonding around violence in warfare. Ruth Seifert calls this 'the elevation of masculinity that accompanies war in western cultures' (Seifert, 1994, p. 65).

Though they are generally critical of military prostitution, there is some disagreement amongst feminist commentators over the extent to which particularly severe forms of sexual exploitation should or could be separated out from the ordinary run of military prostitution. The feminist literature tends to rank the different forms in which militaries organize their troops' sexual access to women according to perceived degrees of harm. Thus the form which creates the most outrage and condemnation is what is commonly referred to as 'sexual slavery'. 'Sexual slavery' is separated out by some scholars from prostitution, and depicted as distinct because women were obviously kidnapped, forced or deceived, or did not get paid,

or because of the severity with which the women were treated, such as being killed after a period of sexual use in Bosnian camps. Ustinia Dolgopol, for instance, argues that the abuse of the 'comfort women' should not be seen as prostitution, but rape (Dolgopol, 1996). The Japanese government, in its consistent and continuing representation of the comfort women system as voluntary prostitution which was not organized by the state, and thus does not require that the survivors be compensated, has pushed activists into the argument that it should be seen as military sexual slavery or rape (Lys, 2007). In this chapter I will seek to show the continuities, rather than the discontinuities, between the different forms of military prostitution.

Military sexual slavery

The comfort women system

Yuki Tanaka takes the approach of looking for continuities, saying that in its essence the 'comfort women' system was not much different from other forms of prostitution or sexual violence against women (Tanaka, 2002, p. 181). He explains that it emerged from the state organized brothel prostitution systems of Japan, and of Korea under Japanese rule, where about 200,000 of the victims, the vast majority, originated. It did, though, he considers, resemble most closely the rape camps of Bosnia-Herzegovina. The difference between the comfort women system and other forms of military prostitution lies in the degree of brutality, and in the fact that the Japanese system was organized from the highest echelons of the military, which planned and implemented it in cooperation with state authorities.

He explains the phenomenon as arising from the particular historical situation of Japan at that time. It was going through a swift change from feudalism to capitalism, skipping the stage of bourgeois revolution that would normally intervene. Thus the régime was still dominated by feudal and patriarchal ideologies. The first Japanese military brothels were set up exclusively for the military in Shanghai in 1932 as Japan's colonial expansion into Asia began to accelerate. Previously Japanese brothels were privately run and not just for troops. Women in the military brothels were examined twice weekly for venereal disease and the provision of brothels was expected to deter the rape of civilians, which

had the unfortunate effect of alienating subject populations and creating 'anti-Japanese sentiment'. The 'comfort women' selected were mainly Japanese at first, drawn from the women and girls sold by their families into brothels. In some areas of China women were requisitioned by requiring local Chinese security councils to provide women for the purpose. By 1938 there was a full-scale mobilization of Korean women. Japanese pimps and procurers were employed too, being asked to come to China and set up private brothels stocked with Japanese women.

The fact that all this was planned and organized from the top levels of the military is plain. Senior staff officers issued orders to establish the brothels, which were put into operation by staff officers of units on the ground. Those involved were all élite army officers, some of whom were members of the Japanese government. The recruiting methods included using agents or labour brokers, who used the classic methods by which the trafficking in women still takes place in the present: 'deception, intimidation, violence and even kidnapping' (*ibid.*, p. 21). Often the privilege of first sexual use of the virgin girls went to officers. The scheme, however, failed to control rape. In some areas of Korea, for instance, unofficial 'comfort stations' were set up, in which women were simply abducted, kept in military compounds and raped for months. This is very similar to what took place in Bosnia, and Tanaka suggests that prostituted women in this form of prostitution should be called 'sexual slavery hostages' rather than 'comfort women' (Tanaka, 2002, p. 47). The girls selected were young and virgins because they were considered to be less likely to be suffering from venereal disease. The requisitioning of women in the Philippines was slightly different. They were abducted from their homes or kidnapped when walking in the street by groups of soldiers. They were held captive for from one month to two years in army compounds rather than separate brothels. About 10 young women and girls were held by each unit for the use of its members. Girls from the Philippines and China were very young, even as young as 10 when 'requisitioned'. Some Filipino girls saw their family members killed before they were abducted.

The 'comfort women' system as it operated in Rabaul in Papua New Guinea shows clearly the degree of state responsibility. The historian Hank Nelson points out that this site is little known about despite the fact that when Australian troops re-entered the territory, which Australia administered before the Japanese invasion, after the

war there was plenty of evidence and there were both Australian and local eye-witnesses to provide details (Nelson, 2007). Nelson, like other serious researchers, dismisses the notion that there was no official state involvement in the system and the idea that private entrepreneurs just set up brothels to service the troops on their own initiative. The women were observed being brought in on troop ships, and so swiftly after the original landing that it is clear that they were not travelling 'privately' but organized by the state. About 3,000 women were shipped to military brothels in Rabaul.

The brothels in Rabaul were euphemistically, and with great disrespect to the women who are thus officially designated as 'goods' to be stored, called 'special warehouses'. Australian witnesses said that the women came from Japan, China and Korea. The brothels were graded so that the Japanese women in kimonos were set aside for the use of officers, whilst the women from Japanese conquered territories used in other brothels were kept in worse conditions and looked down at heel. The fact that a small proportion of the 'comfort women' were Japanese has been used by some to suggest that the system was indeed one of the voluntary prostitution of women who were already prostituted and 'chose' to take this opportunity to make a better living. In fact the Japanese women were likely to have been enslaved in prostitution very young when sold by impoverished families, so that 'choice' on their part does not have much meaning. Moreover one witness described the Japanese women as 'little more than children'. The Korean women were deceived, told they were coming south for work in factories and on plantations and then imprisoned in the brothels. They had an average of 25–35 clients per day. Many perished when the Japanese were forced off the island and ships taking them out were bombed.

Descriptions of how the Japanese military brothels functioned show that they did not differ substantially from the way prostitution takes place currently in legalized or tolerated brothel systems. The girls were trafficked in after deception, or sale, suffered terrible violence if they resisted rape, were told that they were in debt and therefore indentured. This is very similar to what takes place today when trafficked women are placed in legal brothels in Australia (Fergus, 2005). The 'comfort women' suffered 10 men per day outside periods of combat, but before and after action they suffered 30–40 men per day. Men are described as shaking with anticipation in the long queues outside the brothels. The women in the comfort women system describe severe pain and the swelling and bleeding of

their genitals. Descriptions of harm in the legalized brothel system in the state of Victoria in Australia have some commonalities with the pain and injury that 'comfort women' complain of. Kate Holden, for instance, explains that the first difference she noticed when she was sexually used in the brothels was a burning vagina since in street prostitution she had only had to do oral sex (Holden, 2005). In the Japanese system soldiers paid at the front desk and received tickets that they gave to the women, who were supposed to receive half the fee but in reality usually got extremely little or only tips. The fee system works much the same way in the brothels in the legalized system of Victoria, Australia (M. Sullivan, 2007), except that in Victoria the prostituted women would expect to receive one-half to two-thirds of what the prostitutes paid. In the Japanese system prostituted women were expected to clean their genitals with creosol after each use by a man but often had no time for this, and some used the creosol to commit suicide (Tanaka, 2002). Women in legalized brothel systems in the west today are unlikely to use such harmful chemicals on their genitals, but they do use douches, and local anaesthetic to dull the pain, as we shall see in Chapter 8. Those who advocate a sex work position in relation to brothel prostitution are unlikely to emphasize such similarities, but a consideration of the common experiences of women who are warehoused for men's sexual use in systems of state sanctioned or organized prostitution can be useful in demonstrating the common harms of prostitution.

Comfort women for the US postwar

The US military, which was to be the major force in constructing military prostitution in the post-World War II world, partook of the 'comfort women' system too. In the immediate postwar period the Japanese government was concerned that the US occupation troops would rape Japanese women if they were not supplied with prostituted women as a substitute. They thought this particularly because they were well aware of their own troops' propensity to rape. Thus they constructed as deliberate state policy a comfort women system for the US military. A memo from the Home Ministry's security division instructed police chiefs to 'aggressively lead and quickly establish sexual comforting institutions' (Lie, 1997, p. 257). The thousands of women required were to be recruited from women already in prostitution, 'geisha, licensed and unlicensed prostitutes, waitresses, barmaids, habitual prostitutes and the like' according to

the official instruction to police chiefs (Tanaka, 2002, p. 134). The US and allied forces had already made plans, apparently, to set up military brothels as they advanced (*ibid.*, p. 87). Not all the women were already in prostitution, as some high-school students working in munitions factories were recruited by the mafia groups closely linked with fascist political organizations, who acted as procurers. These students, who had lost their families in the war, were almost certainly deceived. They were gang-raped by groups of GIs as their induction. Some of the brothels were set up specifically to entertain high-ranking US officers and top delegates of the US government's missions. There were always 20 'top geisha' on hand to send to the dinner parties of high-ranking officers.

Some of the brothels set up at this time for the US military were so large that they can be seen as presaging the industrialization of prostitution. One had 300–400 women and was set up in the dormitories of an ex-munitions plant (Tanaka, 2002, p. 153). The total number of prostituted women being used by occupation troops in Tokyo alone at the end of 1945 was an estimated 10,000, with 70,000 overall (Lie, 1997). The state worked with private club and brothel owners to set up the Recreation and Amusement Association (RAA), which has been called 'the world's biggest white-slave traffic combine', with capital of 50 million yen, of which 35 million yen was provided by the Finance Ministry. The state recruited by advertising for 'special women employees' for 'comforting stationed troops' and some women signed up because there was massive hunger and unemployment (*ibid.*).

Genocidal sexual slavery: 'rape camps' in Bosnia

There are considerable similarities between the comfort women system and the rape camps set up by Serb militias in Bosnia. The signal difference between what was inflicted on Korean, Chinese and Filipino women by the Japanese military, when they were kidnapped or bought and imprisoned in brothels, is that this took place in a context of colonization and war but not 'genocide'. In Bosnia the experience of women and girls kidnapped for rape camps was regularly fatal. Since the 'ethnic cleansing' of a whole people was underway, murder was just an ordinary part of business (Stiglmayer, 1994). Once the women had outlived their usefulness or novelty value, there was no reason to keep them alive, except in those cases

where women who had been impregnated were seen as useful in diluting the ethnic purity of the enemy, in which case pregnant women were deliberately sent back to their own side to cause humiliation. Catharine MacKinnon calls attention to the continuities between the rape camps and the pre-existing sex industry. She explains that the 'rape camps' were a product of attitudes towards women that already existed in Yugoslavia before the war when Yugoslavia was saturated with pornography. She quotes a Yugoslav critic of the system as saying that the pornography market in the former Yugoslavia was 'the freest in the world' (MacKinnon, 2006, p. 163). 'When pornography is this normal', she says, a whole group of men 'is primed to dehumanize women and to enjoy inflicting assault sexually' (ibid., p.164). One effect of the Serb combatants' familiarity with pornography was that they made pornography of their rapes of non-Serb women as propaganda, even seeking to change the ethnicity of those involved so that the violence could be seen as being perpetrated on Serb women to gee up their own side. Considerable misogyny was expressed: 'Sometimes those who were watching put out cigarette butts on the bodies of the women being raped' (ibid., p. 165). As we have seen earlier in this volume, this practice of burning women with cigarettes is one of the forms of violence women in strip clubs in the US have to suffer (Holsopple, 1998).

In another genocide, under the Nazi régime in Europe, a different version of 'rape camp' prostitution was instituted in concentration camps and in ghetto imprisonment, about which Catharine MacKinnon offers fascinating information and insights (MacKinnon, 2006). The Warsaw ghetto was ordered by the Nazi health department to set up a brothel of fifty Jewish women for the use of German soldiers, despite the fact that such fraternization was forbidden. Himmler required the creation of 'at least' nine brothels in concentration camps by the end of the war. Women in the camps were forced into the brothels to service particular categories of male prisoners or into army and SS brothels. The women in the brothels for foreign workers, MacKinnon explains, were the same nationalities as the slave labourers. Some volunteered in order to get enough to eat. Men who used the camp brothels in which Jewish women were incarcerated were mainly Jewish but included block seniors and Kapos. In some places Jewish women were imprisoned for use by the élite SS guards (ibid., p. 217). As MacKinnon puts it: 'In the Holocaust, a corrupted political economy of force targeted Jewish

women for prostitution in all its forms, integrally to the genocidal destruction of the Jewish people' (ibid., p. 218). The prostitution of Jewish women was part and parcel of the other practices of extreme violence, from sexual assault to murder, that were carried out upon them, thus '[o]n admission to the camps, women were made to strip and stand genitally exposed on two stools where they were internally searched and genitally shaved while being sexually ridiculed' (ibid., p. 219). One SS officer, she explains, 'had the custom of standing at the doorway ... and feeling the private parts of the young women entering the gas bunker' (ibid., p. 219).

US military rest and recreation in South East Asia

US military prostitution is not usually included in 'military sexual slavery', though there are some clear similarities. The similarities include the sheer numbers of women mobilized to service the military, and their containment in large-scale brothel areas, the methods used to obtain women, the practices the women were compelled to experience, and the involvement of governments and military commands in setting up and overseeing the system. The difference would seem to be in the degree of violence involved, such as the fact that the comfort women system involved the deaths of very large numbers of the prostituted women, as did the Bosnian rape camps. In Korea the US military prostitution system built on the Japanese system, and was instituted just five years after the war. It followed the licensed brothel system already set up in Korea by the Japanese in the 1920s, which provided a template for the comfort women system. US military prostitution was the foundation of the sex tourism industries of the Asian countries in which it was set up, and therefore a very important motor force in the industrialization and globalization of prostitution. Though the direction and organization of the US government is not quite so clear as in the comfort women system, US military prostitution was created out of the cooperation of the militaries with the governments of countries in which the troops were based or which they visited for 'rest and recreation', R&R.

Katharine Moon (1997) explains that the military prostitution industry in Korea was established during the Korean War (1950–3). Before the war there was prostitution of 'camp followers' by the US military but it was informal and unregulated. It took place in the

US barracks and in makeshift dwellings. There was no R&R system offering 'a myriad of sexual fantasies and forms of entertainment – peep shows, strip tease, "vaginal coin-suck," "short/long time" and so on' (ibid., p. 26). Camptowns began with the Korean War and the arrival of US troops. The war created what Moon calls a 'supply of raw materials' in the form of girls and women affected by poverty and social chaos and millions of young orphans and widows. They fled towards the UN/US areas, which were mostly isolated in the countryside, and crime and gangsters went with them. Writing in 1997 she says that '[s]ince the war, over one million Korean women have served as sex providers for the U.S. military' (ibid., p. 1). Her book explores the relationship between the US military and Korean national and local governments that created the system and states: 'It is a system that is sponsored and regulated by two governments' (ibid.). 'Camptowns' were set up around the American bases, and their main business consisted of the clubs offering prostitution and the associated businesses that serviced the prostituted women and other employees. One camptown, American town, is described as 'completely isolated and walled off' and it has 'incorporated status'. It had a president and board of directors who managed all the businesses and the people living and working there. It was constructed in the early to mid-1970s from funds from local and national government. The board managed the apartments of the prostituted women and charged them rent. Some prostituted women were registered and others, mainly streetwalkers, not. Registration took place at the police station with the name of the club the women worked in. They had to pay to be examined at a clinic once a week, get VD cards showing their disease status and carry them at all times. The Korean Ministry of Health and Social Affairs supervised all of this.

As in the Philippines and other sites of US military prostitution in Asia, the registered women would sell drinks, dance with men and solicit prostitution buyers. They had to fondle the GIs and be fondled in order to sell the drinks. They had to be used sexually to acquire the bulk of their income at an hourly rate, in the mid-1980s, of \$10, or \$20 for overnight. The club owners and pimps took 80 per cent, with women getting the rest. Moon explains that how the women fared depended upon how the club owners and customers chose to behave. The worst that could happen was murder, with brutality such as a Coke bottle shoved into a woman's uterus and an umbrella in her rectum (ibid., p. 21). The women were in debt

bondage and debts increased for medical treatment, through bribing police officers and through the adding on of all expenses. Debts were sometimes deliberately created so that women could not leave the clubs. The women entered military prostitution because they had already suffered severe deprivation and abuse, poverty, rape, domestic violence, rape by family members. Some were physically forced by traffickers and pimps who 'greeted young girls arriving from the countryside with promises of employment or room and board, then "initiated" them – through rape – into sex work or sold them to brothels' (ibid., p. 23).

There are considerable similarities with the prostitution system set up for the American military in the Philippines when it was occupied by the US following World War II. An agreement was made between the two governments called the Military Base Agreement, or MBA (Farr, 2004). This provided unhampered use of the Philippines for bases and other facilities for 44 years. In the Philippines prostitution around bases had the full support of the military, which organized the medical checks. The experiences of women abused by the US military in South East Asia were severe in the routine violence they entailed. Filipino women describe the favourite practice of their American prostitutes as 'three holes'. Women and bars were advertised to the servicemen as 'three-holers', meaning penetration of mouth, vagina and anus. One woman who was prostituted as a virgin for the first time at 14 said: 'I really didn't want to, but he forced me. It was very painful. He tried to undress me and I wouldn't get undressed. There was a lot of blood on my clothes' (Sturdevant and Stoltzfus, 1992, p. 80). Other practices that were required included boxing and wrestling so that the prostitutes could get sexually excited by seeing women in pain, and performing oral sex on groups of men under the tables in clubs. All of these practices are commonplace in the sex tourism which absorbed the prostituted women when the US military moved out, as we shall see in Chapter 6.

By the late 1960s, the Philippines was providing R&R with 55,000 prostituted women. When the agreement came to an end there was considerable public feeling in the Philippines against its renewal. When Clark Air Force Base, which spawned the prostitution town of Angeles City, and Subic Bay naval base, which obtained prostitution services from Olongapo, closed, the prostituted women in the base towns went to other military bases in Guam, Okinawa or Germany. Thousands were trafficked to Korea through the

Korean Special Tourism Association (KSTA), which served to bring 'entertainers' into the country to the camptowns. It was the *de facto* policy of the military to work with the KSTA for this purpose. In 1999, however, a new Visiting Forces Agreement was signed between the two governments despite considerable opposition from civil society organizations which objected to the creation of prostitution industries. This enabled the US military to use 22 ports for R&R, and Angeles City and Olongapo began to grow again.

Military prostitution made prostitution into a considerable market sector, to the extent that the country is now significantly dependent on the sex industry and prostitution trafficking. Kathryn Farr estimates the numbers of registered prostituted women in the Philippines in 2004 at 400,000, of whom one-quarter are underage, with the number of unregistered prostituted women unknown (Farr, 2004). When the troops left for the first time a gap in the market enabled a new set of entrepreneurs to set up. Americans, Australians and New Zealanders took ownership of bars and hotels through Filipino female partners, because foreigners were not allowed to own them, and created an industry of sex tourism (Jeffreys, 1999). More recently a new site of military prostitution has developed in the South of the Philippines in Zamboanga to service US troops sent to fight the threat of 'Islamic' terrorism in the area, and there are now an estimated 2,000 women and girls in prostitution compared with a mere handful before (Farr, 2004). Similar systems of US military prostitution were set up in Okinawa, in Hawaii, in Thailand and in Vietnam. Kathryn Farr sees military prostitution as just one form of what she calls 'congregational prostitution', a phenomenon that occurs wherever large groups of men live and work without their families. In such situations the women they are culturally empowered and expected to use are absent, and no community judgements act as a drag upon their sexual licence.

After military prostitution caused the industrialization of prostitution in a country, local women and girls became the raw materials of the global sex industry, not only prostituted within local and sex tourism industries at home but trafficked into prostitution worldwide. Thus in the 1980s and 1990s Thai women came to represent prostitution both to the sex tourists from rich nations who flocked into Thailand to use them sexually and in sex industries in Germany, Australia and Japan into which they were trafficked. Today Vietnamese women are trafficked into prostitution

in Cambodia and Australia and many other countries. Korean women are increasingly trafficked to Australia (Fergus, 2005).

Peacekeeper prostitution: whose peace are they keeping?

Since the early 1990s another source for the development of prostitution industries has emerged in the form of the gathering of mostly men to engage in UN peacekeeping and reconstruction activities (Whitworth, 2004). It is an irony that not just militaries engaged in combat but also peacekeepers who are supposed to bring an end to the harms of combat should create prostitution systems in countries such as Cambodia, Kosovo, Liberia. The obvious question in relation to the prostitution of trafficked or local women and girls by peacekeepers is ‘Whose peace are they keeping?’, because though they may prevent some kinds of violence, they institute an abusive régime for many women. In conflict zones women and girls become vulnerable to prostitution as a result of being separated from families and being reduced to penury by displacement and destruction of subsistence. This vulnerability is easily exploited by ‘peacekeepers’ to add a new dimension of harm through sexual exploitation in return for survival. In some cases these gatherings of men create prostitution industries in areas where they have been barely in existence before their arrival, such as in Bosnia-Herzegovina and Kosovo (Harrington, 2005). In other cases where some form of prostitution industry already existed they have transformed this local practice into large-scale industries which require the trafficking of girls and women to provide supply. In some cases the peacekeepers, as in the Balkans, have been involved in trafficking themselves (*ibid.*). In Cambodia the arrival of UN peacekeeping troops caused the number of prostituted women and girls to rise from 1,500 to 20,000 in 1990 (Farr, 2004). In Mozambique in 1992 the prostitution industry had grown so large that a liaison officer was assigned to mediate between troops and prostitutes and traffickers. Peacekeepers created a prostitution industry in Rwanda in 1995. In West Africa, in Liberia, Guinea and Sierra Leone, women and girl children were forced into prostitution by peacekeepers and UN personnel in exchange for food and medicine. Peacekeeping and reconstruction are now very large-scale economic activities which, like mining, forestry or banana plantations, ruthlessly require and

construct prostitution as an ordinary adjunct activity. As Carol Harrington puts it: 'Peacekeeping produces conditions for violence against women and girls in the sex industry by creating a lucrative market of buyers in highly paid militarized men' (Harrington, 2005, p. 176).

Harrington, however, does not condemn prostitution *per se*. In her work on Bosnia-Herzegovina and Kosovo she is careful to restrict her area of concern to 'violence in the sex industry'. She explains that peacekeeping is dominated by the military, and violence in the sex industry could not exist without the cooperation of locals and internationals in official positions. The men controlling the industry are former militia commanders from the area with the cooperation of local police. Though once they were rivals from different ethnic groups, they cooperate to make their living from trafficking and the earnings of prostitution. In the Balkans region, night clubs operate as 'confined brothels' and proliferated when the peacekeepers arrived. The women held captive within are foreign women in debt bondage and subject to considerable violence. They were often seeking to migrate to the west when trapped by traffickers. Though the clubs are off limits to the soldiers they still visit, and trafficked women have been taken onto army bases. The number of bars and clubs in Kosovo listed as off limits for soldiers because they were thought to be involved in trafficking gives an idea of the size of the problem of peacekeeper prostitution and trafficking in that country. Two hundred were listed in January 2004, which Harrington estimates as each having an average of nine women and girls, making a total of 1,800 prostituted women. The problem with Harrington being concerned specifically about 'violence' in peacekeeper prostitution is that it could be seen to create an unfortunate precedent, the normalizing of military prostitution when obvious 'violence' is not involved. This may be an example of the influence of the sex work position which can chill the usual condemnation that feminists might invoke towards this practice.

The NGO Refugees International named its report on sexual abuse by peacekeepers in the Democratic Republic of Congo, Liberia and Haiti after the remark by the UNTAC Missions' special representative in Cambodia in response to criticisms of the peacekeeper initiated sex industry there that 'boys will be boys' (Martin, 2005). The report points out the different ways in which peacekeepers sexually exploit local women and girls. In 2002 in Sierra Leone,

humanitarian staff were found to be coercing sex from women and girls in refugee camps in exchange for subsistence (*ibid.*). In Eritrea, since 2000, there have been numerous reports of peacekeeper sexual exploitation and Italian, Danish and Slovak peacekeepers have been expelled for sex with minors. An Irish soldier was found to be making pornographic films of Eritrean women. Unfortunately it was the main female actor in the film who got punished with two years imprisonment whereas the peacekeeper himself got 16 days jail and was then dismissed. In 2003 Irish peacekeepers were reported to be prostituting girls as young as 15. The Refugees International report points out, usefully, that this behaviour of peacekeepers has much in common with sex tourism. In both cases men from richer countries find themselves free to play with the sexual exploitation of economically desperate girls, many very young, in poor countries.

In the early 2000s Thai women were being trafficked into brothels in East Timor, where peacekeeping and reconstruction forces created a thriving industry (Farr, 2004). In 2007 there continued to be revelations about the creation of a prostitution industry in East Timor to service UN peacekeepers and civilian staff there (Murdoch, 2007). Australian expatriates in Dili are reported as saying that the recent UN zero-tolerance policy towards sexual abuse and misconduct is being openly violated. A dozen brothels have recently opened and have UN vehicles parked outside most nights. One of the brothels has a dozen ethnic-Chinese women, which suggests that trafficking is already in place to supply the UN demand. The UN is reported to have received an internal report exposing a culture that has covered up abusive behaviour by UN staff in East Timor over years, including the fact that peacekeepers have left behind at least 20 babies they fathered to poor Timorese women. However, the UN spokeswoman in Dili is quoted as replying to these claims by saying the policy is being strictly enforced, with a special internal investigation unit being set up, which had received two reports of sexual abuse, but both cases had been closed for lack of evidence. The UN presence consists of 1,600 police and about 500 civilian workers.

Peacekeeper prostitution can take the form of marriage-like arrangements, i.e. sexual and domestic servicing for a period of time in return for subsistence or payment. This practice took place in Kosovo too. Some civilian peacekeepers took ownership of individual women for sex and housework by paying off their

brothel debts. Others simply bought young teenage girls as sex slaves. Victor Malarek, in his account of trafficking and prostitution in the Balkans, comments upon an ethical peacekeeper's outrage when, in response to a dinner invitation from him and his wife, a co-worker arrived accompanied by a 14-year-old girl he had acquired in this way (Malarek, 2003). An Australian peacekeeper was accused of a similar practice in Sierra Leone (Sheil and Petrie, 2004). In this case Mandy Cordwell, a highly experienced Tasmanian police officer, reported and was the key witness in a case against a senior Victorian police superintendent, Peter Halloran, accused of sex crimes. Halloran was on unpaid leave, and Cordwell's boss in the war crimes unit of the United Nations-backed Special Court in Sierra Leone. Cordwell and her husband shared a house with Halloran, and she claimed that a 14-year-old girl, hired from her family as a maid, shared his bedroom overnight and made the bed in the morning. Halloran was cleared of the charge of sexual misconduct and returned to work in Victoria.

Prostitution in the form of marriage-like arrangements is common to sites in which military prostitution takes place. In the Philippines, as well in as other Asian military prostitution sites, servicemen sometimes paid a woman's debt to relocate her from bars and clubs into one-on-one prostitution/marriage until they were posted elsewhere. This form of relationship has commonly been a recourse of women forced to prostitute themselves in conflict zones, where attachment to one man affords some small protection against sexual use and abuse by many. It offers some element of control. Thus in her memoir of what was done to women in Berlin in 1945 when victorious Russian troops entered the city, the anonymous author of *A Woman in Berlin* describes how she would be claimed by a succession of individual soldiers who would return to use her sexually each day in exchange for food and alcohol, a practice which was better than gang rape by the multitude, though there was no real element of choice or power of refusal (Anonymous, 2005). In conflicts in Sierra Leone and Myanmar women and girls have been forced into sexual slavery and sometimes into marriage by rebel groups (Farr, 2004, p. 173). Refugees International points to the practice of 'bush wives' or sexual slaves being taken by combatants in Liberia and Sierra Leone (Martin, 2005). In Liberia, where, some reports state, the percentage of those who suffered sexual assault from combatants is as high as 60–70 per cent, being a 'bush wife' might be seen as a protected status.

Banning military and peacekeeper prostitution

As a result of the considerable unease that military and peacekeeper prostitution aroused in the international community, the increasingly obvious problem of trafficking and the prodding of women's rights organizations, two important developments took place in the 2000s to limit the damage. The scandal that arose from peacekeeper sexual exploitation, particularly of girls in refugee camps in return for food and survival in West Africa, caused new rules to be issued for peacekeepers by the UN in 2003 (United Nations, 2003). These rules forbid UN staff from having sexual relations with anyone under 18, the exchange of money, food or other privileges for sex, and 'strongly discourage' relations with beneficiaries, which means all members of host populations, on the grounds that they are based on inherently unequal power dynamics and undermine the credibility and integrity of the United Nations (Otto, 2007). In the US the Trafficking Victims Protection Reauthorization Act of 2005 amends the US military's Manual for Courts-Martial. Under the new Act, any service member convicted of patronizing a prostitute can receive a dishonourable discharge, forfeiture of all pay and allowances and one year of confinement. It is to be expected that the radical change of direction involved in directing US troops away from prostitution when they are so accustomed to see their prostitution behaviour as expected and condoned will not be achieved easily or quickly. There are some indications that there is no clear change as yet. Thus a 2006 report suggests that US servicemen at Yokosuka naval base in Japan are still using South Korean or Chinese, probably trafficked, 'massagy girls' a year after the change in military law made 'patronizing a prostitute' a specific offence (Batdorff and Kusumoto, 2006).

Surprisingly, the directive to UN staff has proved controversial in some circles, with even one feminist international law theorist arguing that it is a backward move (Otto, 2007). Dianne Otto is extremely critical of the fact that this policy bans staff from buying what she calls 'survival sex', which she says is a form of prostitution, from girls who are desperate for food and other privileges. She takes a sex work position towards this child prostitution and emphasizes the importance of the children's 'agency'. She starts her critique with examples of three girls, aged 13–17, who engage in survival sex in West African refugee camps. The 13-year-old does

this to get scraps of food that will enable her to have the strength to look after her six-month-old baby. The directive, Otto considers, will wrongly deprive these girls of a means of survival. It is, she says, 'so out of step with the promotion of women's and children's rights' (ibid., p. 2, online version). Otto considers 'sex' to be innocent of harm. The problem for the girls is one of poverty rather than demonstrating any wrongful behaviour on the part of the UN staff, who might actually be trying to help. The directive is driven, she says, by 'sexual negativity' and a 'repressive politics of the body' and she references Gayle Rubin here (Rubin, 1984), a leading queer theorist of sadomasochism who takes a 'pro sex' position on prostitution and pornography. She points out that if payment is made for 'survival sex' it is 'often not even enough to buy a full meal' and there is always the risk of no payment at all. The girls, she acknowledges, had 'little or no power to negotiate the rate or to determine the kind of sexual exchange that took place, including whether safe sex was practiced' (Otto, 2007, p. 6). But this practice should not, she considered, be banned. The girls' 'stories' 'offer an opportunity to question overdetermined representations of powerlessness and to respect the rational calculations they are making ... but it is poverty that is the main harm, not sex' (ibid., p. 10). The preclusion of the activities covered in the directive 'drains agency' from those involved (ibid., p. 12). This is an example of the determination by some of those who take a sex work position to find 'choice' and 'agency' even in the most unlikely situations.

Military prostitution and civilian prostitution

There is a contradiction involved in seeking to prevent the clear harms to girls and women that are involved in military and peacekeeper prostitution whilst some governments, and even some feminist theorists and activists on prostitution, are arguing that legalization and decriminalization of civilian prostitution are the correct ways forward. Though the UN and American military prohibitions on prostitute use by servicemen and peacekeepers do not differentiate between sites in which prostitution is criminal, tolerated or legalized, it is reasonable to suppose that the prospective prostitutes might. Men reared in legalized environments such as the state of Nevada in the US, or the Eastern states of Australia, might find it hard to understand why prostitution that is understood

as legitimate work and the exercise of women's agency in one place is a form of abusive practice in another. US sailors in Sydney or Melbourne might find it hard to understand why they should not use the legalized brothels, held up as world's best practice, that are available to them. Military prostitution cannot effectively be separated off from the ordinary civilian kind. Feminist theorists are much less likely to take a sex work or agency approach to military prostitution, though, as we have seen above in the work of Dianne Otto, some still do. This could be because the involvement of militaries and states is seen to overpower the exercise of women's agency and make an individualist approach less appropriate. Military prostitution may be an easier target of criticism because states and militaries can be held accountable, whereas in domestic contexts pinning down the culprits may require attacking the rights of men in general to prostitute women, and also bring confrontation with all the vested interests and forces of corruption that cause local sex industries to flourish.

The distinction between military and civilian prostitution could be seen to reproduce a public/private divide. Feminist theorists have shown that the idea that the public sphere is the proper realm of political theory and intervention, whilst the private sphere of the home, the family and intimate relationships is seen as not within the purview of real politics, is a dangerous one for women (Pateman, 1988; MacKinnon, 1989). Women and girls suffer the politics of male domination in the home, from doing housework for no pay whilst their brothers go skateboarding, for instance, to rape and violence from male family members. Feminist international politics theorists have usefully extended this understanding of the problem of the public/private divide to explain women's absence in person and in theory from international politics (Grant, 1991). The international stage can be seen as the 'public' stage, compared with domestic politics which represents the 'private'. Women, and feminist theory, have to bestride two huge barriers to become significant actors or have their concerns taken seriously within international politics. They have to get out, not only of the bedroom and the kitchen, but the boundaries of the nation as well. A concern with military prostitution which fails to connect it squarely with the problem of prostitution *per se* could be seen as replicating this unfortunate distinction. Through the lens of the public/private distinction, military prostitution can be identified as properly 'political', whereas domestic prostitution, even in Cambodia or Thailand, may be

viewed as a matter of individual agency and not the concern of political theorists, particularly those involved with the important matters of relations between states. This sort of distinction between military and civilian prostitution could be seen as similar to the opposition between rape in marriage and 'stranger rape' that has afflicted legal practice. In civilian prostitution local men exercise rights to 'their women' when they prostitute them, whereas the prostitution of 'their women' by interlopers such as foreign militaries is a violation of ownership and of national boundaries and thus regarded as reprehensible.

Radical feminist theorists have made connections rather than distinctions in their approach to all areas of the sex industry and violence against women. Catharine MacKinnon, for instance, shows what the rape camps in Bosnia have in common with prostitution more generally. Of the Bosnian rape camps she writes: 'It is at once mass rape and serial rape indistinguishable from prostitution. It is concentration camp as brothel: women impounded to be passed around by men among men' (MacKinnon, 2006, p. 145). She says that '[w]artime is exceptional in that atrocities by soldiers against civilians are always essentially state acts' but 'men do in war what they do in peace' (ibid., p. 148). Radical feminist scholars seek explanations for rape and the prostitution of women in conflict zones in the cultures of misogyny and violence against women that the soldiers and their commanders were raised in. Liz Kelly expresses this idea succinctly in saying that 'sexual violence as a deliberate strategy in war and political repression by the state is connected in a range of ways to sexual violence in all other contexts' (Kelly, 2000, p. 45). In this understanding wartime rape and sexual exploitation are products of a pervasive climate of abuse of women. Ruth Seifert explains that the background to the rape orgies in Bosnia-Herzegovina was a culturally rooted contempt for women that is acted out with particular vehemence in times of crisis (Seifert, 1994). She employs this idea to explain how terrible atrocities against women came to take place, 'atrocities of a *quasi*-ritualistic character, whose core was the femaleness of the body. Thus, after being raped, women had their breasts cut off and their stomachs slit open' (ibid., p. 65). This behaviour is held down to some extent during peacetime by the possibility of social disapproval and let loose in times of social crisis when such controls no longer apply: 'women are raped not because they are enemies, but because they are the objects of a fundamental hatred

that characterizes the cultural unconscious and is actualized in times of crisis' (ibid., p. 65).

Conclusion

This chapter has sought to draw connections between the everyday R&R prostitution carried out by the American military in Korea and the 'sexual slavery' of the comfort women system and the Bosnian rape camps. They share common features in the organization, recruitment and harms involved. All these systems create harms to the status of women and other social and political harms such as crime and corruption that are a regular part of prostitution industries in the countries in which they are practised. They may be distinguished by the extremity of the violence done to the women and the fact that in the Bosnian rape camps and in some areas of the comfort women system the women were not paid. Common to all these forms of prostitution is the idea that men have the right to access women for sexual use, an idea that is formed from cultures of misogyny and male dominance. This idea is the basis of domestic prostitution industries too. Many of the harms we have seen involved in military prostitution are common to domestic prostitution, because military systems are frequently built on traditional forms of prostitution. They are not distinct. This is an important issue because it is unlikely to be possible to effectively ameliorate the problems involved in military prostitution whilst men's sense of entitlement to use women in this way is developed through the toleration or legalization of civilian prostitution in their home countries. In Chapter 6 we examine the civilian prostitution tourism industry that was built out of the havoc that military prostitution created, and we will see the demobbed sexual warriors returning to the playgrounds of South East Asia and beyond.

Prostitution tourism

Women as men's leisure

The development of the sex tourism industry in Asia from the 1970s onwards was substantially aided by the groundwork put in place by US military prostitution. It began in the same sites in which prostitution had been developed to service the US military in rest and recreation, such as Thailand, the Philippines and Korea, and developed to the point where it was providing a substantial proportion of GDP in those countries. Indeed the governments of poor countries have deliberately developed sex tourism as a means to gain foreign exchange (Truong, 1990). But the sex industry grew strongly in other destinations in this period too, such as Amsterdam, Havana, Estonia, Jamaica, and needs to be explained in terms of other global forces. These include the development of the tourism industry and of consumption as a central engine of economic growth (Wonders and Michalowski, 2001). Sex tourism is a recent development, and an aspect of the development of tourism as an industry. Asian women caught up in the traffic in women in the east in the interwar period did not service occidental tourists as might happen in today's prostitution tourism, but went to foreign countries 'in search of clients among their own countrymen abroad' (League of Nations, 1933, p. 22). Nowhere were there found 'attempts to provide exotic novelty to brothel clients by offering them women of alien races' (*ibid.*).

The field of leisure studies has grown up in response to the developing importance of 'consumption' in the global economy. Currently sex tourism is being researched and taught as a legitimate aspect of 'leisure' in leisure and tourism studies (Opperman, 1998; Ryan and Hall, 2001). Consumption, leisure and tourism itself are all profoundly gendered, as feminist leisure studies researchers are pointing out (Deem, 1999). Women both facilitate men's leisure,

through their unpaid work as housewives, and become the objects through which men achieve leisure, by being prostituted or acting as hostesses or strippers. Men's tourism stresses adventure and risk, and '[i]ncreasingly, women are themselves viewed as the destination' (Wonders and Michalowski, 2001, p. 551). Sex tourism has its apologists too in some women academics who write about the industry from a sex work perspective, stressing the agency of the prostituted women and arguing that sex tourism is not gendered, since women do it too, and does not require a feminist analysis (Kempadoo, 1998).

This chapter will examine this new 'leisure industry', looking at the way it is being normalized, its usefulness to male buyers and to business, and the serious harms to women that are integral to this exercise of the male sex right. I will argue that sex tourism outsources women's subordination, allowing tourists and businessmen from rich countries to access the greater desperation and degradation that can be bought in poor countries, or from trafficked women in cities like Amsterdam. It enables men in countries in which women are making advances towards equality, one aspect of which is the ability to deny men absolute sexual access, to buy women's sexual subordination elsewhere through their greater spending power. It offers white men the advantage of being able to purchase sexual fantasies of otherness and the notion that there are women elsewhere who are desperate for their touch.

Sex tourism is being increasingly recognized as important to regional and national economies. Tourism itself has grown hugely in importance in the world economy, so that in 1996 it formed 10 per cent of all consumer spending (Wonders and Michalowski, 2001, p. 549). As some poor countries have found themselves at a disadvantage in the new economic world order they have turned to tourism and expressly sex tourism as a way to gain dollar income: 'As newly industrializing countries struggle to find commodity niches in the globalized economy, they frequently find many of the best product niches taken. As a consequence, in some countries, sex tourism becomes a significant market fostering both national economic development and international capital accumulation' (*ibid.*, p. 551). Ryan Bishop and Lillian Robinson, in their book on sex tourism in Thailand, do not seek to estimate what proportion of the worth of the tourism industry is attributable specifically to prostitution tourism, but clearly consider it significant when they say that '[a] \$4 billion per year tourist industry is

the linchpin of the modernization process called the “Thai Economic Miracle”. And the linchpin of that industry is sex’ (Bishop and Robinson, 1998). Cities in rich countries, too, are venturing into the promotion of sex tourism in order to compete for tourist numbers. Windsor in Canada legalized ‘escort’ prostitution, in a country where prostitution is illegal, in order to maximize the male tourists from the US who would come over the border to use its casinos and are important to the city’s economy (Maticka-Tyndale *et al.*, 2005). Though some commentators express deep unease at the development of prostitution tourism, others are more upbeat, saying that the economic worth of this industry should be recognized, and suggesting ways in which this can be enhanced (Singh and Hart, 2007).

I shall use the term ‘prostitution tourism’ rather than ‘sex’ tourism in this chapter for the sake of clarity. Though ‘sex tourism’ has generally been understood to be the behaviour of male tourists whose purpose is to engage in commercial sex with local women in tourist destinations (Enloe, 1989), it can have a wider application. The term does not necessarily imply prostitution and can potentially be used to apply to the behaviour of tourists who expect sexual interaction with fellow tourists in resorts, or non-commercial sex with locals or with other holidaying strangers in western destinations as a routine part of their holiday experience. The term ‘sex tourism’ is a euphemism, and a normalizing term, which can conceal the harm done by prostitution tourists and represent this form of men’s behaviour as being about mutual fun and entertainment. The term ‘prostitution tourism’ is more suited to making the gendered nature of the phenomenon and its harms to women visible.

Prostitution tourism has not just developed in countries and sites in Asia that have harboured military prostitution. It is a developing part of the prostitution industry in all those areas where men as individuals or in groups travel for fun, on business, for sports events or political assemblies. They may be tourists visiting specially for the purpose of prostituting women, or to use casinos since prostitution use is integrally connected with this activity, or visiting businessmen, or male sports enthusiasts who prostitute women as an ordinary part of their travelling experience. There are prostitution tourism destinations in the rich world, such as Amsterdam and the US state of Nevada (Wonders and Michalowski, 2001; Shared Hope International, 2007; Farley, 2007). There are poor countries too that have used prostitution tourism as a tool to develop

their economies and place local women in the marketplace as a resource to be exploited, without having profound experiences of military prostitution, such as Jamaica (Shared Hope International, 2007).

The Philippines

The Philippines provides a good example of prostitution tourism as it developed from the construction of a massive sex industry to service the American military bases (Santos *et al.*, 1998). It represents the variety of prostitution tourism in which rich men visit a poor country where they can access women as racialized others. Prostitution tourism in the Philippines has provoked intense campaigning by local and diaspora Filipino feminists to gain legislative change which would outlaw the practice. The report of a study tour to show Australians how prostitution tourism works characterizes these harms well:

the sex tourism industry matters. It is big, it is wealthy, and it is damaging. It thrives on the poverty of the Philippines, and on the racism and sexism that exists in Australia, New Zealand and the Philippines. It exposes women and girls to violence and humiliation, and leaves them in it, day after day, year after year, until it has no further use for them. It paints a picture of the Philippines as a nation of available, submissive women, who can be fucked, beaten, married, discarded, divorced, killed.

(Distor and Hunt, 1996, p. 3)

Prostitution tourism has been promoted by the government in the Philippines because of its profitability. Income generated by visitor arrivals in 1993 was US\$2.12 billion, and 63.7 per cent of tourists were men (Distor and Hunt, 1996).

Angeles City, for instance, owes its existence to the servicing, including through prostitution, of the Clark Air Force Base. When the Americans withdrew there was a hiatus in the sex industry in the city which was quickly filled by Australian entrepreneurs and Australian sex tourists. At least 80 per cent of the 152 nightclubs and other entertainment spots were owned and operated by Australians in 1995. There are no beaches or views in Angeles City, only prostitution, and almost all hotels and bars are devoted to that end. Australians formed the largest number out of the 120,000 tourists

who visited the area in 1994. Agencies in Australia arrange package tours for sex tourists to the city, amongst other destinations. The majority of the women in the bars servicing sex tourists are very young, some barely teenagers, sometimes playing cat's cradle when not needed by male buyers or having to dance on the stage where they get chosen (Jeffreys, 1999). Prostitution tourism in the Philippines works through the provision of a companion for the entire holiday or/and the buying of women and girls in bars through the payment of bar fines. The bars service different socioeconomic segments of men. Those servicing Japanese and Taiwanese sex tourists are the most expensive and luxurious. The next layer services European and Australasian tourists. The lowest level of bar, which might have no sanitation, services working class Filipino men. The tourist selects a girl and asks to buy her a 'ladies' drink' so that she will sit with him at a table. Men who so desire can buy the woman for the night or for the day by paying a bar fine to the bar cashier, of which half would go to the girl. Women's NGOs in the Philippines and Filipino expatriates in the countries which send prostitution tourists are working to end the practice because it harms generations of Filipino women who are caught up in prostitution and because it harms the status of Filipino women in general. Campaigns by the Coalition Against Trafficking in Women Asia Pacific (CATWAP) and other organizations led to the passing of a far-reaching anti-trafficking law in 2003. This legislation, which penalizes those who 'maintain or hire a person to engage in prostitution or pornography', specifically targets prostitution tourism, making it an offence to '[t]o undertake or organize tours and travel plans consisting of tourism packages or activities for the purpose of utilizing and offering persons for prostitution, pornography or sexual exploitation' (see www.catw-ap.org). The prostitution tourism destination of Amsterdam has a very different history, but it is also facing growing opposition from politicians and citizens who want to reduce the presence of the industry in the city.

The Netherlands

The Netherlands represents a different kind of sex tourism destination, not just because it is a city in a rich country, but because the sex tourists are most likely to be using the resource of trafficked women, who have been removed from their countries of origin to

service rich men elsewhere, rather than local women who may have alternatives to being prostituted for their survival. An estimated 75 per cent of the women in windows prostitution in Amsterdam in the 1990s were foreign women, and this form of prostitution is particularly directed at tourists (Wonders and Michalowski, 2001). As Wonders and Michalowski put it in their study of prostitution tourism in Amsterdam and Havana: 'In Amsterdam, the commodification of bodies has been perfected to the level of an art form' so that the red light district resembles a 'shopping mall' with 'windows and windows of women to choose from' (ibid., p. 553). It became a 'sex tourist's Mecca' (ibid.) as a result of a history of toleration of prostitution and drug use and easy access to these commodities. Many businesses in the city that service the sex tourists are now dependent upon the revenues they get from this source, such as hotels, strip clubs and the sex museum. The Netherlands has 13 official red light districts, which are well suited to a prostitution tourism industry. Apart from windows prostitution there are a variety of clubs in which prostitution is readily accessed. Interestingly, these clubs operate in a similar way to those in the Philippines, in that the male buyers must order drinks and can request girls for conversation, and then pay if they wish to penetrate the woman (Shared Hope International, 2007). This may suggest that the practices of prostitution are being disseminated worldwide as tourists and pimps circulate in the global economy of prostitution. There are some local teenage girls in windows prostitution for tourists to access too. They are inducted into the industry at an average age of 15½ years, and controlled by 'loverboy' pimps of Turkish and Moroccan origin (ibid.; UNHRC, 2007b). They carry tattoos of their pimps' names on their arms. Amsterdam Councillor Roel van Duijn of the Green Left Party says that there are over 10,000 prostituted women in Amsterdam and only about 2,000 are employed legally. The rest are in the illegal industry, which is 'rife with sex slavery' (Shared Hope International, 2007).

So famous, and normalized, has Amsterdam become as a prostitution tourist destination that in 2005 the major UK travel company Thomas Cook initiated a walking tour of the red light district which was open to all ages (Shared Hope International, 2007). The tour included a stop at the Prostitution Information Centre. There was some outrage amongst locals who objected to the company permitting and encouraging minors to participate through cost incentives. Adult tickets for the tour, for instance,

cost £12, whilst children's tickets cost only £6 and tickets for under threes were free. In December 2005 the company removed the offensive tour description but other tour operators still promote and host walking tours with 'adults only' restrictions. There has been some disillusionment about Amsterdam's prostitution industry since legalization in 1999, which was supposed to clean up the associated crime and trafficking, because these problems have markedly increased and the city government has found it necessary to close down one-third of the windows in Amsterdam as a result (Hesen, 2007; Moore, 2007). Also citizens and business organizations have become uneasy about the way that prostitution tourism represents their city. Buildings in the main windows district are being requisitioned and turned into clothing boutiques.

The normalization of prostitution as leisure

For the discipline of leisure studies, prostitution tourism is most usually proclaimed to be a satisfying form of leisure activity for the prostitutes and an ordinary form of work for those who are prostituted, but plagued by a few problems, such as child prostitution and violence, that can be cleared up by legalizing the industry. Leisure studies approaches do not generally recognize that there is anything gendered about prostitution tourism. Thus Martin Opperman, in a collection which lays out the field of 'sex' tourism as an area of leisure studies, comments in relation to businessmen engaged in prostitution tourism: 'With the increase in female executives, the reversed sex roles may also become more common' (Opperman, 1998, p. 16). There is a gap in the analysis here, since there are no men and boys dancing on stages to be chosen by 'women', and that needs to be explained as more than an absence of equal opportunities for women. Contributors to the volume all take the position that prostitution needs to be legitimized as ordinary work. Joan Phillip and Graham Dann argue that women prostituted in tourism related bars in Bangkok should be recognized as 'entrepreneurs', involved in the ordinary risk taking activities associated with business enterprise, in a manner which blithely disappears the gender dimension and the harms of the practice: 'Prostitution is simply another form of entrepreneurship' (Phillip and Dann, 1998, p. 70). These risks, they say, include not getting paid and still having to pay off the bar fine to the bar owner, violence which can lead to death, health

problems such as AIDS, and male buyers who take condoms off as soon as the lights go off. But these 'risks' that are integral to prostitution are seen as the woman's responsibility: 'Risk taking involves bearing responsibility for one's actions' (ibid., p. 66). They say that the women need, like any entrepreneur, to make decisions, and the main one is which male buyers to accept, i.e. which ones are murderous and which are not: 'Decision making is a function of skill' and '[t]he skill needed to reduce that element of chance is defined as entrepreneurial' (ibid.).

Stripping is seen as a leisure or 'tourist' activity by some leisure studies researchers. Male leisure studies academics in particular seem to have some difficulty empathizing with the actual experience of strippers and allow their own identities as male voyeurs to get in the way. Thus Donlon, who identifies all men who go to strip clubs as 'participants in touristic episodes' (Donlon, 1998, p. 116), describes women who are looking about to identify men who might be interested enough to tip them well, whilst they are dancing, thus: 'The procedure may be likened to a skilful predator casting about for prey' (ibid., p. 120). He proceeds to make his identification with what he sees as the poor beleaguered buyer rather than the stripper even clearer: 'For the duration of the club visit, entertainers are certainly freely ogled, with little or no feigned concern for this gaze, and yet are largely in power. Clients are, conversely, forced to operate in a direct *quid pro quo* relationship, entirely based on commercial exchange' (ibid., p. 121). Donlon specializes in studying 'controversial' leisure such as cock fighting as well as stripping. Two other male leisure studies professors who take a similarly gender biased approach are Ryan and Hall (2001). They specifically reject feminist criticism of sex tourism and prostitution in scathing tones. They say that 'much of the debate on sex tourism ... has been hijacked by a feminist rhetoric within which the client is the male and the prostitute female ... It also implies that the prostitute is the victim' (Ryan and Hall, 2001, p. 37).

Another very positive perspective from the leisure studies field is the work of Singh and Hart, who argue that prostitution tourism should receive recognition as a 'cultural industry'. They say that '[n]aming sex work as a cultural industry will lead to effective policies that ... accord it status' (Singh and Hart, 2007, p. 170). They say that organizations such as the World Trade Association and the World Tourism Organization are 'working with the developing world to promote cultural policies – often linked to

cultural industries such as tourism' (ibid., p. 156). This will enable developing countries to increase their share of the sex tourism market. They explain that in 2004, whilst globally international tourism arrivals numbered 763 million and were worth \$623 billion, the developing world received less than 20 per cent of the arrivals and receipts. Creating the idea that prostitution is a 'cultural industry', they consider, will help to right this inequality. They say that the cultural industries usually recognized are about the performing and creative arts rather than prostitution but prostitution should be included. Foreign tourists, they say, go to Thailand to access prostituted women for a distinct cultural experience. They could, after all, use prostituted women in their home countries without the costs of travel if all they were concerned with is cheapness. One of the 'cultural' differences they offer is that: 'Thai women are described as tender and nurturing, offering companionship to their clients, not just sex' (ibid., p. 161). This could also be seen as showing more desperation for money which occasions greater subservience, but this is not their understanding. Singh and Hart conclude that the idea that 'sex work' should be 'shut down' is a facile solution. Though there are problems connected with it such as trafficking, dehumanization and racism, these can be dealt with individually whilst preserving the industry of prostitution itself because the 'answer lies in reform, and monitoring of abusive practices, not in shutting down the industry altogether' (ibid., p. 170). Unfortunately, this sex work perspective also dominates the considerable body of work in which feminist researchers have mapped the forms and practices of prostitution tourism in the last decade (Kempadoo, 1999a, 2004; Kempadoo and Doezema, 1998).

The sex work approach to sex tourism in feminist theory

Feminist researchers who take a sex work approach differ from the completely uncritical researchers above in analysing the class and race dimensions of the practice. They take a Marxist and postcolonial perspective and explain that 'sex' tourism is a good illustration of the global flows of inequality. The feminist commentators explain that tourism destinations are formed, as in the Caribbean, from colonial oppression. In the neo-colonial practice of sex tourism, rich, often white and western men choose to visit poor countries to sexually use women who must prostitute to survive. They show

how 'sex' tourism operates as a service sector for the capitalist west, refreshing tired corporate warriors in a form of 'rest and recreation' similar to that created for US soldiers in South East Asia (Jyoti Sanghera, 1997). Kemala Kempadoo explains that prostitution tourism props up 'corporate capital, First World identities, and masculine hegemony' (Kempadoo, 1999b, p. 18).

Prostitution tourism offers men from rich countries the opportunity to confirm their masculine dominance over women, who are claiming equality in the west and prepared neither to accept masculine authority nor to adapt themselves so dutifully to men's sexual demands. As Kempadoo puts it: 'Many male sex tourists ... expressed the view that in their home countries, women enjoy excessive power, through which traditional male authority is being undermined ... In the Caribbean, they are able to fully reaffirm their masculinity' (ibid., p. 26). However, Kempadoo takes a sex work approach and positions the prostituted women and men of the Caribbean as having 'agency' and being involved in acts of transgression which free them from oppressive relations rather than subjecting them to oppression. Too many studies, she considers, emphasize the problems associated with prostitution, and obscure the 'agency and subjectivity' of sex workers (Kempadoo, 2001, p. 41).

Though this feminist work shows an acute awareness that prostitution tourism is based on class, race and gender inequality, it takes the position that recognizing prostitution as work and legalizing it will resolve the problems associated with the practice. Beverley Mullings, for instance, writing about Jamaica, says that if 'paid sexual labor' is not recognized as 'legitimate work' then the sex workers will be vulnerable to labour and human rights abuses (Mullings, 1999). Sex tourism should, she says, 'be viewed as an export industry, with consumers who import services from local providers' (ibid., p. 57). Taking this 'industry approach' will allow the 'truly exploitative aspects' to be 'more effectively policed' (ibid., p. 79). 'Sex' tourism can then take on the character of a 'truly community-based tourism' (ibid., p. 79). In fact studies of the states in which prostitution has been recognized as work and the industry has been legalized do not support the notion that this approach will reduce the harms of prostitution (Farley, 2007; M. Sullivan, 2007; Shared Hope International, 2007). The field research and interviews of feminist prostitution tourism researchers, whether they take a sex work perspective or not, provide good support for the notion that prostitution tourists from the rich western world seek to compensate

themselves for the loss of masculine status they experience from an increase in women's equality.

Motives of prostitution tourists

Women's emancipation caused a great deal of angst to men at the start of the 20th century, and some of those who were bestriding the empire as administrators or traders were able to reassure themselves through the prostitution of Asian women. Thus this wail of complaint, from a 1928 book by a European man on the perils of feminism, demonstrates an infuriation with western, more emancipated women, which will be translated later in the century, after another wave of feminist activism, into an impulse towards prostitution tourism:

he who knows how terrible and degrading it can be, especially to a nobler masculine nature, to be reduced to mating with one of the numerous sexually anaesthetic white women, will understand the European returned from the tropics, who replies to the experts' enquiries that he prefers the Malayan, Polynesian or Japanese mistress, who screamed with joy if he only laid his hand on her, to the icy white woman, who regarded his erotic transports with contempt and did not even shrink from showing him that she only just bore with him because it was supposed to be part of her wifely duties. And to make things worse, she wronged her husband in this by a feeling that precisely by doing so she showed herself a 'higher being' than he, though, of course, the truth is that she is a defective individual, a poor invalid, a presumptuous ignoramus in matters of love.

(Knudsen, 1928, p. 111)

Weith Knudsen's words are taken from a book in which he complains generally about the emancipation of women, which clearly caused him considerable displeasure. In this earlier time the colonial adventurers who discovered the joys of sexually using Asian women were engaged on the business of the empire rather than holidaying.

In the late 20th century, a study found similar motivations on the part of male Australian prostitution tourists. It reports that 'a variety of factors have converged to endanger the individual's sense of his place in the world' (Kruhse-MountBurton, 1995, p. 199), such as

smaller families, wives who work for payment and a reduction in women's willingness to do housework. In relation to sex, men's ideal of the passive woman, which allowed them to see themselves as teachers and initiators, has been undermined by women's expectation of sexual pleasure. Even prostitution behaviour in Sydney, Australia, whose red light district is a hangover from the servicing of the US military in the Vietnam War, is unsatisfactory because the prostituted women are seen as being 'emotionally and sexually cold ... making little effort to please' and as failing to 'disguise the commercial nature of the interaction' (*ibid.*, p. 193). Also prostituted women in Australia may demand safe sex, restrict the practices they are prepared to offer, and may not be sufficiently young for the men's taste. Prostitution tourism reaffirms their superior status as men and reassures them against the troubling 'changing role of women', which 'appears to have posed a considerable threat to the male identity' (*ibid.*, p. 202).

O'Connell Davidson's work on male sex tourists to Thailand demonstrated that they were all strongly motivated by the opportunity to 'live like kings' or 'playboys' (O'Connell Davidson, 1995, p. 45). The men experienced pleasures ranging from the acquisition of mail order brides through 'the mere pleasure of looking at sexually available women [and men and children], at one pole to the satisfaction of complete sexual possession at the other' (*ibid.*, p. 46). These pleasures are illustrated by a bar in Pattaya called the 'No Hands Bar', where prostituted women 'crawl under the tables in order to fellate the customers' (*ibid.*). The men O'Connell Davidson interviewed were not just angry at European prostitutes but had what she calls a 'misogynistic rage' at western women in general for acting as though they are men's equals and not worshipping them as kings. The rage is at 'women who have the power to demand anything at all, whether it is the right to have a say over who they have sex with and when, or the right to maintenance payments for their children' (*ibid.*, p. 53). 'Sex tourism', says O'Connell Davidson, 'helps British men to reinforce and construct a powerful and positive image of themselves as a particular kind of white heterosexual man' (*ibid.*, p. 52).

The male sex tourists gain enhanced masculine status from demonstrating their sexual use of local women to their mates. O'Connell Davidson explains one motivation for male sex tourists in the Dominican Republic to make sexual use of local women is that it 'provides the basis for recognition and acknowledgement

between men' (O'Connell Davidson, 2001, p. 16). She quotes a male sex tourist saying that in his hotel which is '95% single men' they achieved 'great comradeship' by discussing their sexual use of local women. She comments that 'women serve to reproduce social links between the male members of the community' (ibid., p. 19). Sex tourism for men helps to cement the male bonding which is an important component of male dominance. This male bonding can be achieved through the 'stag' weekends offered to young British men in Eastern Europe (CBS News, 2005), in which 1,200 groups of men descend on Prague yearly to partake of the pleasures of sexual 'entertainment', cause distress to local people and get barred from restaurants for their destructive behaviour.

Business and sports prostitution tourism

Male bonding of this kind is becoming more and more central to business networking internationally, and this practice excludes businesswomen. An article in the *Economist* in 2005 comments on the three main explanations that top business women in America give for why so few of them get to the highest level. The first of these involves the sex industry: 'First comes exclusion from informal networks. In many firms jock-talk and late-night boozing still oil the wheels of progress. In America and elsewhere it has become almost traditional for sales teams to take potential clients to strip clubs and the like. These activities specifically exclude most women' (*Economist*, 2005). This is particularly true of business conducted in Asian markets. Research on British women executives on international assignments has shown that they face 'greater problems with adaptation in traditionally patriarchal cultures' (Forster, 1999). Those working in China and Japan, for instance, were much more likely to report difficulties with cultural adaptation and to face specific obstacles and prejudices. One reason is likely to be the common practice of mixing business with prostitution.

The practice of providing prostitution as an ordinary accompaniment to business has been strongly developed in Japan. A 2007 report on prostitution tourism in Japan gives some details of how this operates. The Japanese mafia, the Yakuza, organize sex cruises in the Maldives for Japanese businessmen and foreign nationals (Shared Hope International, 2007, p. 131). Corporate after-hours socializing tends to be done with entertainers and

prostitutes (*ibid.*, p. 135). The practice is not new in the west, though it may, until recently, have been less common as prostitution was less normalized as a practice. Today western corporations provide prostituted women to valued international guests. The biggest escort agency in Australia, Royalty Services, which has an annual turnover of \$20 million, provides 'escorts with modelling backgrounds to clients for negotiable prices ranging from \$5000 per night to \$130,000 per month' (IBISWorld, 2007, p. 23), with 'the bulk of business being visiting businessmen being entertained by corporations attempting to gain their custom'.

Business prostitution becomes particularly important to the economies of cities that rely heavily on business conventions, such as Atlanta. As a report on sex tourism and trafficking to that city explains, there is '[a]ggressive marketing of the city to organizers of conventions and sporting events' (Shared Hope International, 2007, p. 104). This is necessary because Atlanta, like other cities that are lured into creating massively expensive and subsequently useless sports infrastructure to service the masculine culture of competitive sport, has 'cavernous venues constructed for the Olympic games of 1996' which it needs to fill. Sports prostitution tourism is in itself an important and growing driver of prostitution markets. The IBISWorld report on the prostitution industry in Australia announces that sporting events such as the motor racing Grand Prix in Melbourne cause huge increases in the demand for prostitution from overseas and interstate visitors (IBISWorld, 2007). The Atlanta Convention and Visitors Bureau reported 2005 convention attendance numbers at 3,105,256 people, attending 3,068 conventions averaging 3.4 days each. This creates considerable income for the city. Though women doubtless were in attendance, most of the visitors were expected to be men. In Atlanta advertisement cards are handed out to convention attendees promising VIP treatment at the various 'gentlemen's clubs' in the area. Discount entry cards are also distributed at sporting events, concerts and other entertainments. Men's prostitution behaviour is such an integral part of these jamborees that '[o]ne major hotel's courtesy guest shuttle was observed providing transportation for guests to a strip club, further facilitating the commercial sex markets' (*ibid.*, p. 104).

The city of Sydney, Australia, where brothels are legal, experienced a prostitution boom when the Asia-Pacific Economic Cooperation (APEC) summit took place in 2007. The male buyers were mostly secret service agents and international trade envoys.

Business went up by 300 per cent (*Sun-Herald*, 2007). The varieties of sexual abuse of prostituted women on offer reveal a worrying lack of respect for women: 'Interstate prostitutes were brought in to fill demand at the city's establishment, where APEC-themed specials such as the Condi Combo, the UN Duo and the Presidential Platter were on offer.' The 'United Nations Duo' comprised time with 'two girls of different ethnicities' (Ahmed, 2007). Such practice harms the equality of women in the international delegations and the possibility of women's issues being fairly discussed at such meetings.

Business prostitution has become a significant problem in China since the introduction of the market economy (Zhou, 2006). Traditional forms of prostitution, too, have been revived and diversified and new forms have been introduced in a good example of the ways in which capitalist economic development currently uses women's bodies as a basic but unspoken resource. Some Chinese companies advertise jobs for beautiful young women under 25 as 'Public Relations Officers', which is often synonymous with being prostitutes employed by the companies for high-ranking executives, potential clients and company partners (*ibid.*). Hong Kong and Taiwanese men who work in China are able to exploit the severe poverty of mainland Chinese women who migrate to the special economic zones, such as Shenzhen, to find work (Hobson and Heung, 1998). A flourishing prostitution industry has developed to service visiting businessmen. A Hong Kong magazine reported that 'five or six "porn stables" have been set up in the lounges of Shenzhen hotels. The prostitutes, known as female "horses", have to pay HK\$50 (US\$7) entrance fee. The men then pay HK\$200 (US\$25) to take a horse to their table, additional services at the horse's table cost upwards of HK\$750 (US\$100)' (*ibid.*, p. 137). There are also 'luxurious yellow "sex tour" coaches' available, 'with female tour guides who are available to provide sexual services to the guests while they are on the bus' (*ibid.*). The customers are from Hong Kong, Taiwan and Japan. The harmful traditional practice of concubinage, however, is particularly common amongst working class truck drivers. In either case it is problematic for the men's wives, 41 per cent of whom said they would divorce their husbands if they found out. As a radio talk show put it in Hong Kong: 'In HK they might be a truck driver or even a street sweeper, with no status. But, when they go across the border to their concubines they get treated like gods' (quoted in Hobson and Heung, 1998, p. 140).

One problematic aspect of the normalization of prostitution tourism practices is that a sizeable proportion of girls involved in the local prostitution industries that tourists access are children.

Child prostitution tourism

The positive picture of prostitution tourism which is given in the leisure studies literature is bedevilled by one difficult reality, which is that a large proportion of those used in the industry are girls under 18 years old. In the last two decades, during which prostitution tourism has developed very considerably as a market sector, there has been increasing concern in the international community about 'child sex tourism' (Jeffreys, 2000a). As is the case with 'child' prostitution and 'child' pornography, children are separated out from the rest of the global sex industry as special objects of concern. This distinction is visible in the work of the international NGO End Child Prostitution in Asian Tourism (ECPAT) and in the Protocol to the 1999 UN Convention on the Rights of the Child, which deals specifically with the sexual exploitation of children in prostitution and pornography. In relation to 'child sex tourism' governments have passed special extraterritorial legislation so that they can prosecute on return their nationals who have sexually exploited children overseas (Hall, 1998; Seabrook, 2000; Jeffreys, 2002). These organizations and international instruments distinguish the harms of prostitution according to age. They use the age of 18, as in the children's convention, as a cut-off point, seeing prostitution from the 18th birthday onwards as potentially freely chosen, agentic prostitution with which they should have no concern, whereas prostitution up to the day before this birthday is seen as physically and emotionally harmful and morally repugnant.

In fact 'child' prostitution is hard to distinguish from the rest of the prostitution industry, as an ILO report shows (Lim, 1998). In one major brothel complex in Indonesia, 10 per cent of workers were below 17 and, of those 17 and above, 20 per cent became prostitutes under 17. A 1994/5 survey of Indonesia's registered prostitutes found 60 per cent aged 15–20 (*ibid.*, p. 7). In Malaysia, of the women and girls rescued by police from brothels between 1986 and 1990, 50 per cent were under 18 and the rest 18–21 (*ibid.*, p. 173). A Thai study found that 20 per cent of prostituted women and girls started working between 13 and 15 (*ibid.*). The clear conclusion from such statistics would seem to be that prostitution is based upon the

sexual use of very young women or girls in poor countries. Tourism exacerbates the problem of child prostitution but the children are already integrated into the home-grown prostitution industry.

Some feminist commentators have questioned the distinction between child and adult prostitution. I have argued, for instance, that the harms identified as arising from the prostitution of children replicate quite precisely the harms that have been identified in adult prostituted women (Jeffreys, 2000a). Julia O'Connell Davidson also argues against the usefulness of the distinction (O'Connell Davidson, 2005). She points out that teenage girls are fully integrated into systems of prostitution in many parts of the world. She explains that though there is a demand from men specifically interested in prostituting young children, a.k.a. paedophiles, this is a small and specialist market. The majority of prostitution abusers are indigenous men and both they and prostitution tourists use teenagers in prostitution as a routine part of their prostitution abuse, neither seeking children nor, in many cases, recognizing or remarking the extreme youth of those they abuse. Though O'Connell Davidson and I both criticize the distinction, it is with different intent. Whereas I argue that NGOs and feminist theorists should be aiming to end the prostitution of all women and girls if they are serious about ending child sexual exploitation, because child prostitution cannot effectively be separated out, O'Connell Davidson takes a different path. She says she is 'uncomfortable with what I view as a more general impulse to separate children out as a special case' and with what she calls '[t]his process of ranking' which evinces 'outrage at child prostitution' (O'Connell Davidson, 2005, p. 1). But she criticizes what she calls 'anti-prostitution feminists', who, she says, ignore the 'diverse and complex realities' of those who are prostituted and deny their 'autonomy and agency' (ibid., p. 3). Through stressing that children can have 'agency', she joins a growing stream of feminist researchers who are arguing that both children and adult women express agency and choice in prostitution, and that showing special concern for children infantilizes them.

Since such a large proportion of those being used by the global sex industry are young teenage girls, the normalization of their participation is necessary if the global sex industry is to be legitimated and continue its growth unhindered. Some writers, even in feminist anthologies, are prepared to support this normalization. Thus Heather Montgomery, for instance, writing about prostituted children in a tourist resort in Thailand, says that children's 'agency'

needs to be acknowledged (H. Montgomery, 1998). She says that arguments that prostitution damages children are ethnocentric. Treena Rae Orchard argues that girls in devadasi prostitution in India, who are given to priests to be brought up as prostitutes in an act which historically was supposed to show religious devotion but is now engaged in by families so that they can live on the daughter's income, should not be understood as 'victimized' (Orchard, 2007). The practice, she says, has positive aspects. The girls gain in status because they are important economically in their families and surrounded by networks of friends, despite the fact that they do not want to be prostituted and their virginity is auctioned off to the highest bidder at 14 or younger.

The argument that child prostitution in situations where it is practised by whole tribes, such as the 'untouchables', or among the people who practise devadasi prostitution, gives girls status is not borne out by other accounts. A report in the *Guardian* on child prostitution among dalit or untouchable tribes in Madhya Pradesh explains that girls are put into prostitution from 10–14 years old by the Baccharas and the Bedia (Prasad, 2007). Girls are hawked to buyers along the highways, with violence against the girls from clients and families being common. An example is given of a girl who was delivered to a food shack run by her uncle on a highway at 12. All the money she earned was taken by her family and used to build a new house with a room for each of four sons and to pay for the sons' marriages. Her low status as a girl was not, in this case, alleviated by the fact she provided most of the family income. Indeed the status of women is not necessarily high in other situations where they supply income to pimps/partners in western prostitution.

Do women do it too?

Another difficulty for those seeking to justify prostitution tourism as sex work and the expression of agency is the rather obviously gendered nature of the practice. To get around this problem some prostitution tourism researchers and theorists have taken to stressing that 'women do it too', generally in the form of western women having sex with 'beach boys' in the Caribbean. This 'sex tourism' by women, they argue, shows that prostitution is not fundamentally gendered, and it is reasonable to downplay feminist analysis and concentrate on race and class perspectives (Kempadoo, 1998;

O'Connell Davidson, 2005; Sanchez Taylor, 2001). These writers use the existence of 'female sex tourism' to argue that women can be just as exploitative as men, so that, were it not for the restrictions on the construction of sexuality created by patriarchy, women would be as likely to use men and women in prostitution as men. Jacqueline Sanchez Taylor accuses 'radical feminists' such as Cynthia Enloe and myself of promoting misleading stereotypes of sex tourists. She says that we are wrong to portray sex tourists as men, rather than persons of both sexes, and wrong to 'treat sex tourism and prostitution as first and foremost an expression of male patriarchal power and female powerlessness' (Sanchez Taylor, 2001, p. 749). This approach degenders prostitution. A careful analysis of the differences between the 'sex tourism' of women and that of men, however, shows profound variations in power, effects, consequences and meanings as a result of the different positions of the actors in the sex class hierarchy.

The similarities that those who seek to include women point to are the economic and racial privileges of both male and female western tourists in comparison with their local sexual partners. Western tourists are seen as being motivated by racist sexual stereotypes and using sex tourism to bolster their privileged race and class status. Female sex tourists, such researchers say, employ fantasies of otherness in the same way male sex tourists do, in their interaction with black men in the Caribbean. The women are looking for 'black men with good bodies, firm and muscle-clad sex machines that they can control, and this element of control should not be overlooked' (O'Connell Davidson and Sanchez Taylor, 1999, p. 51). Another similarity is the fact that the women 'sex' tourists and some of the men claim that they are not engaging in prostitution at all, but romance (Pruitt and LaFont, 1995; Dahles and Bras, 1999). Research on male sex tourists suggests that though some men visit destinations such as Thailand with the expectation that they will pay prostituted men and women for sex, others are naïve enough to believe that they are not engaging in prostitution behaviour (O'Connell Davidson, 1995). The women they engage with are skilled at not making their financial demands clear so that such men can remain deluded as to the nature of the relationships (Seabrook, 2001). It is surprising that the male tourists are so naïve considering that men are aware that a prostitution script exists for relations between men and women. The prostitution and pornography industry, as well as the tales of their mates, exist to

make them aware of this. For women there is no such script. The purchase of sex from men plays no part in the culture that women inhabit and there is no reason that they should be aware of this possibility.

The differences between the behaviour of male and female sex tourists are numerous. They are clearest in the forms of sexual and romantic interactions which take place between women tourists and Caribbean men. The scale of 'female sex tourism' is rather different from that of male sex tourism. Julia O'Connell Davidson says that 'heterosexual female sex tourism is, in numerical terms, a far, far smaller phenomenon than male sex tourism' (O'Connell Davidson, 1998, p. 81). Most of the differences arise from the different positions in the sex class hierarchy that the women and men tourists occupy. The sexuality of men under male dominance is constructed to confirm their masculinity through practices of objectification and aggression (Jeffreys, 1997). The clearest expression of this sexuality of dominance lies in the existence of the sex industry which both reflects and helps to shape it. Women's sexuality, constructed out of a position of powerlessness, tends to be expressed in very different ways. There is no street or brothel prostitution of men and boys for women to access in any sex tourist destinations. This might suggest that whilst men's sex tourism is simply the extension of already existing systems of prostitution that exist for men to access prostituted others, women's 'sex tourism' is an altogether different phenomenon, with little relationship to prostitution.

One principle that distinguishes the sexuality of prostitution is that the prostituted women service the men sexually without any sexual pleasure on their part, and with the men firmly in control of the action. It is notable that women 'sex tourists' also end up servicing male sexuality. One Barbadian beach boy interviewed for Joan Phillip's study explained his sexual enthusiasm for women tourists thus: 'Bajan women can't fuck, and they doan even wanta suck you. You got to beg she to do it, and still she might not do it, and if she do it she acting like if she doin you a favor. Now a white woman, you gotta beg she to stop!' (Phillip, 1999, p. 192). In this case the 'sex tourist' is servicing the local man rather than the other way around. The power dynamics of male dominance seem well preserved. Oral sex is indeed the practice men have traditionally visited prostituted women to engage in (McLeod, 1982) because of their wives' reluctance. The local men remain in control of the sexual interaction as they would be with any women, tourist or not,

by virtue of male privilege and the construction of male dominant sexuality.

Another very significant difference between 'female' and 'male' sex tourism lies in the degree of harm caused by the behaviour. In relation to male prostitution tourism the harms created are the regular harms that result to women from men's prostitution behaviour whether in the west or in tourist destinations (Farley *et al.*, 1998). Self-mutilation is strongly related to the experience of sexual violence, in childhood, in rape and in prostitution (Jeffreys, 2000b). One British sex tourist to Thailand who spoke to Julia O'Connell Davidson found the self-mutilation engaged in by the women he was prostituting difficult to stomach:

they cut themselves with a knife. They get drunk and just slash themselves. I find that terrible. When I see a girl, when I'm looking to buy her, I always look at her arms to see what she's been doing to herself.

(O'Connell Davidson, 1995, p. 42)

In the case of 'female sex tourism' there does not seem to be evidence of the traumatic harm of repeated sexual violation. Indeed researchers agree that because men gain superior masculine status in Caribbean societies amongst their peers according to the number of their sexual conquests, and white women count for more points, beach boys can gain socially from sexual engagement with women tourists (Kempadoo, 1999b). The sex taking place, after all, is the traditional sex of male supremacy, in which the men do the penetrating and are not having to disassociate to survive whilst their bodies are used as objects.

In one study of the experience of the women prostituted by male sex tourists in Jamaica (Campbell *et al.*, 1999), the graphic descriptions of the violence and danger they are exposed to create a stark contrast with what happens to beach boys, but fit well with accounts of prostitution from the west (Hoigard and Finstad, 1992). Women in the Jamaican study describe as their best experiences those in which they can avoid actually being penetrated, such as being asked to urinate on the client or walk on him in high heels. The worst experiences ranged 'from a client attacking a worker with a machete because of dissatisfaction with the job, to agreeing to have sex with a client who then turned up with six men in a hotel room' (Campbell *et al.*, 1999, p. 140). The women said they never knew whether a

client would be dangerous and, as one put it, she was 'full of fear because you don't know what can happen. You always have some fear because you don't know who bad and who good' (ibid., p. 142). Women spoke of having to drink tequila or get stoned on ganja so that they did not have to see the man who was using them. As one woman puts it: 'I love my job but I hate it for the sex. We are talking to a guy, he makes me feel sick but he is paying the price. You have sex with him. It really hurts. It makes your heart get sick too, you know ... He is real ugly, he is real white, he is so soft and you just want to scream' (ibid., p. 150).

The male power which results in the abuse of prostituted women can lead to violence by beach boys against their tourist partners if the relationships progress beyond the duration of the holiday, as many do. In order to include the women within the ranks of sex tourists they are described as having economic power over local men. But this economic power does seem to be the only power they have, and may not necessarily trump the power that the beach boys have over them as a result of their superior position in the gender hierarchy. Sanchez Taylor says that a number of women in her study who had migrated to marry or live with their local boyfriends found themselves in 'extremely abusive relationships' and that when they reported this to the police no action was taken (Sanchez Taylor, 2001, p. 761). Thus, as she points out, 'white privilege can be jeopardized by entry into permanent or semi-permanent' relationships with black men (ibid.). The women's economic and race privilege were only able to hold the men's sex class privilege at bay temporarily, in quite specialized settings.

The differences between the behaviour of male and female sex tourists in terms of its context, meanings and effects are considerable and result from the different positions of men and women under male dominance. Why then do some commentators determinedly place women within the ranks of sex tourists? The decision of whether to include women stems from the different theoretical positions these writers hold on prostitution. Kempadoo uses the inclusion of women as sex tourists to argue that feminist understandings of prostitution as resulting from male dominance are invalid. She explains that the existence of both male and female sex tourists in the Caribbean 'underscores the point that feminist accounts that focus exclusively on the operations of the masculine hegemony to explain prostitution and sex work may not be entirely appropriate' (ibid., p. 57). 'Female sex tourism' allows her to move

beyond 'essentialist notions of "the prostitute" and "the client" to remind us that these categories are not fixed, universal, or transhistorical, but are subject to transformation and change in particular ways' (ibid.). Prostitution, then, does not necessarily need to be tied to male dominance and could potentially be about women and men using both women and men in the future.

O'Connell Davidson uses the phenomenon of female sex tourists to prove that patriarchy is not primary. She says that feminist arguments about prostitution constituting 'patriarchal rights of access to women's bodies' and a 'form of sexual oppression' (ibid., p. 61) deflect attention from other 'economic and social relations'.

Conclusion

Whilst leisure studies scholars legitimize prostitution as work for women and leisure for men with little compunction, feminist scholars find prostitution tourism troubling because it reeks of colonialism and racism, and can be seen to be supportive of corporate capitalism. Prostitution tourism is indeed fuelled by racism and colonialism, and it needs to be analysed in terms of its role in the international political economy and global flows of inequality, but it is fundamentally about the commercialization of women's subordination. Prostitution tourists seek to buy subordination when they travel. They express quite clearly their desires to purchase sexual servants to compensate for the infuriating rise of women's equality in many rich countries. But, most importantly, prostitution tourism is overwhelmingly a behaviour of men which enables male bonding to uphold their dominance, particularly in the area of business, and the victims are overwhelmingly female. As prostitution tourism gathers pace as a developing industry, it is the lives of women and often very young girls that will continue to be blighted by physical and psychological harms as they seek to survive a brutal and violent industry for the usually short number of years in which they will be able to attract male buyers. Trafficking in women is one of the clear harms that is involved as this is a common supply mechanism for prostitution tourism in many destinations, as well as for other forms of the industry, as we shall see in Chapter 7.

Supplying the demand

The traffic in women

In the last decade governments all over the world have been recognizing the seriousness of the problem of trafficking for prostitution. Though trafficking for a variety of purposes takes place, trafficking of women and children for sexual exploitation accounts for 87 per cent of reported victims (UNODC, 2006, p. 33). Women and girls are trafficked into all forms of the sex industry, brothel, street and escort prostitution, strip clubs, pornography, military prostitution and prostitution tourism sites. Trafficking in women and girls into debt bondage is becoming the main method of supply for national and international sex industries. It is worth US\$31 billion yearly according to UN estimates (Correspondents in Vienna, 2008). This has created an image problem for the global sex industry. As the scale and brutality of this supply system has become better known in the last decade through the work of women's NGOs such as Coalition Against Trafficking in Women and media exposure, it has become more difficult to promote prostitution as simply a job like any other and a respectable market sector. The new concern has resulted in the Protocol on Trafficking in Persons of the 2000 United Nations Convention against Transnational Organized Crime, known as the Palermo Protocol, and in a great amount of work creating national and regional legislation, training programmes, documentation systems and research. Much less money has been put into support services for women who have been trafficked, however (Zimmerman, 2003). Government interest has tended to stem from seeing trafficking as a problem of 'organized crime', security and immigration control, whereas feminists have seen it as a problem of violence against women. None of this has led to any reduction in the problem, which is, by all accounts, increasing rapidly (Ribeiro and Sacramento, 2005;

Savona and Stefanizzi, 2007). Research into trafficking and prostitution in Europe suggests that the problem of trafficking segues seamlessly into prostitution, with the majority of prostituted women in Western European cities such as Amsterdam now having been trafficked (Agustin, 2002). Some European governments, such as Bulgaria, the Baltic States and the Czech Republic, are rejecting the legalization of prostitution specifically on the grounds of the new awareness that this promotes trafficking, and Norway has promised to introduce the Swedish model, in which male clients are penalized for 'buying sexual services', in 2008 to combat trafficking (Cook, 2007; Aftenposten, 2007).

This turn of events creates challenges for the 'sex work' lobby, those who want prostitution to be seen as ordinary work and legalized/decriminalized. Various techniques are now being used to address this difficulty. Sex work organizations such as the international Network of Sex Work Projects (NSWP) and academic apologists are engaged in minimizing trafficking, arguing that very few women are actually forced or deceived, and even those who are obviously 'trafficked' can recover quite easily and have a good career in prostitution (O'Connell Davidson, 2006). They are being forced to engage in changing language and seeking to prettify trafficking. In the new language, trafficking into prostitution has become 'migration for labour' (Jeffreys, 2006). Trafficked women in debt bondage have become 'contract workers' or even, with postmodern hyperbole, 'daring border crossers' and 'cosmopolites' (Agustin, 2002).

The history of trafficking

Trafficking has a long history as a supply system for prostitution. As we saw in Chapter 1, Japanese girls were being trafficked from the mid-19th century onwards to destinations in South Asia and the Pacific, including Australia (Frances, 2007; Tanaka, 2002). Trafficking was used to supply the Japanese military's 'comfort' women system, too. In the late 19th and early 20th centuries, international concern about prostitution and trafficking led to a number of international agreements, much work by national and international NGOs, and, after World War I, a special committee of the League of Nations through which feminists worked to end the traffic in persons (see Jeffreys, 1997). Their work led to the United Nations 1949 Convention Against Trafficking in Persons

and the Exploitation of the Prostitution of Others. The history of trafficking shows how much about the practice, such as methods of recruitment and control, remains unchanged today. The women who were vulnerable in this earlier period, such as Jewish women who were escaping pogroms and were trafficked in rolls of carpet through London to Buenos Aires, and Russian women who were escaping the 1921 famine who were trafficked into and through China, shared characteristics with those women who are vulnerable today. They suffered from economic devastation in their countries, from civil war and persecution which caused them to flee. The methods used to acquire them were similar too, such as deception in which they were told they would get jobs as waitresses or dancers, kidnap, being sold by their parents, and in some cases they were already prostituted and vulnerable to deceptive promises of better incomes and conditions. Whatever method was used to recruit them, then, as today, the women ended up in debt bondage, controlled by pimps and required to service male buyers for months or years with little or no payment. Debt bondage is the defining feature of trafficking because it is the way the traffickers make their profits.

This earlier wave of trafficking arose from changes in transport, such as the development of the steamship, which made travel easier, and from the globalization and flows of human migration of the time, which meant women were shipped to the places where their co-national males were working, in San Francisco or Hong Kong, for instance. It was interrupted by the international attention which led to the 1949 Convention. In the post-World War II period governments, both those that signed up to the Convention and those that did not, passed legislation that made illegal the brothels they had earlier tolerated. The Convention was founded on the premise that tolerated brothels acted as 'entrepôts' for the trade. Women were stored in them and trafficked on. It was a firmly anti-prostitution convention, and stated in the preface that prostitution was 'against the dignity and worth of the human person'. Since trafficking was understood to supply the business of prostitution, the making of third party profits, exploitation of prostitution, was outlawed to end the demand for trafficked women.

Trafficking for prostitution has returned with a vengeance. The current wave of trafficking is taking place in a much changed ideological, economic and political environment. Once more technological changes, such as the aeroplane, and now the Internet, are making trafficking easier. Neo-liberal economic policies enacted through

the World Bank and the World Trade Organization are creating problems of subsistence for people internationally. As structural adjustment programmes are implemented, women suffer particularly, and fewer alternative forms of employment are available to them as subsistence economies are destroyed. The destruction of communism in Eastern Europe, and now in China and Vietnam, has immediately led to the growth of huge sex industries in those countries and exposed women there to the blandishments of traffickers on a large scale. The present stage of capitalist development, with its attachment to unfettered markets, combined with the sexual liberalism unleashed in the 'sexual revolution', has enabled sex industries to be developed as market opportunities, and deliberately legalized and even promoted by states. This is a very different political environment from the one in which the post-World War II world banned brothel keeping. Even some human rights organizations have now decided that 'free' prostitution should be seen as ordinary work and legalized. Thus Anti-Slavery International, which identified prostitution and trafficking as forms of slavery that should be abolished until late in the 20th century, adopted a position in the late 1990s that prostitution should be legalized and unionized to protect working conditions, and separated firmly from 'forced' trafficking (Bindman, 1998).

All of these changes have led to a vast problem of trafficking for which, as yet, few proposed solutions have been effective. This is because most governments, NGOs and researchers are seeking to act against 'trafficking', the supply chain for prostitution, whilst leaving the sex industry itself intact, as if the two could be separated. This is a very different situation from that in which the 1949 convention on trafficking emerged, when prostitution was understood to be the very foundation for trafficking. This separation bedevils attempts to alleviate the problem.

Estimating trafficking numbers

It is not possible to make firm estimates of the numbers of women, girls and even a few young men (Kelly, 2005) who are trafficked into prostitution annually. Many scholarly papers are written about the difficulties and the usefulness of different methodologies involved in arriving at estimates (Savona and Stefanizzi, 2007; Laczko and Gozdiak, 2005). Figures usually rely either on the number of trafficked persons found by the police, immigration authorities and/or

NGOs and seen by them as matching their understanding of a 'trafficked' person, or on extrapolations from this number. Such extrapolations are made on the basis of an understanding of the small percentage of women who report sexual offences to the police, about 1 in 5 in a UK survey, used by one pair of trafficking researchers to make estimates (Di Nicola and Cauduro, 2007). These researchers acknowledge that there are particular variables that make it likely that even fewer trafficking victims will report to the police. These include lack of trust in the authorities, their illegal status in the destination country, their isolation, their subjugation to the traffickers and the covert nature of trafficking. Thus they consider the reported numbers of victims could represent somewhere between 5 and 10 per cent of the total. 'Trafficking' is not necessarily easily distinguishable from 'smuggling'. Usually people smugglers profit from the fees paid by their clients. They do not have contact with the smuggled persons once they have dropped them in their destination. Traffickers, on the other hand, are paid to deliver their victims to persons who will profit from keeping them in debt bondage. But researchers are now discovering that some women who accept the help of 'smugglers' find that they have been deceived and are trafficked into debt bondage on reaching their destination (Savona and Stefanizzi, 2007).

The number of reports to the police will also depend upon whether the police take the issue seriously. Some countries may have extremely low figures or none because they are not being kept. But there are other complicating factors involved in the reporting of trafficking that make it quite different from other forms of sexual violence. Trafficked women who took part in the process of their own volition, as a result of wretched penury and because they were desperate to earn money for themselves and their families, may not be willing to go to the police however poor their conditions, and even though they are subject to violence. Reporting means the end of the chance of making any money (Harrington, 2005). They may still be in debt bondage and hoping that at some time in the future some money will be forthcoming and they will not have to return penniless to their families. If they report, they lose that chance.

Trafficking deniers, those who downplay the significance of trafficking (see Jeffreys, 2006), sometimes argue that the small numbers of those women who report to the police or seek to take advantage of the support services offered by NGOs for trafficked women show that the phenomenon is greatly exaggerated and that in fact there

are very few 'trafficked' women in need of help. They also point out that some women who are 'rescued' from brothels, though they fit the profile of trafficked women, may not be grateful. This is not difficult to understand. If they choose not to return to their countries of origin or if repatriated, they may be re-trafficked. They may have been sold by their parents in the first place, which means they have nothing to return to (Melrose and Barrett, 2006). They may be seen as having been dishonoured and may be subject to violence from their families and communities if forced to return. Desperation to get some money plus the stigma that makes returning 'home' after being prostituted difficult, all lead to such a lack of gratitude in the case of some women from newly independent states trafficked into Bosnia and Kosovo, for instance (Harrington, 2005). A report on trafficking in Bulgaria explains that the experience of being trafficked can lead to traumatic bonding which means that the victim will be most unlikely to betray the perpetrator (Stateva and Kozhouharova, 2004). The report found that 22 per cent of clients seen by the NGO were sold by their relatives, husband or boyfriend, 50 per cent were 14–21 years old (*ibid.*). The methods of coercion that had been used on them included brainwashing through violence and gang rapes, the witnessing of violence and even murders and executions, and threats of violence against the prostituted women, their families and relatives. Their sense of autonomy was destroyed through isolation or denial of contact with people outside, through psychological undermining and insults, and financial control. They experienced forced involvement in crimes and/or violence and abusive relationships (*ibid.*, p. 113). All of these factors, as well as adoption of a prostitute self-image, fear and inability to form trusting relationships, make escape very difficult and mean there is no immediate comfort to be drawn from 'rescue'.

Despite all these difficulties some estimates are made. The US State Department's Office to Monitor and Combat Trafficking in Persons estimated that the numbers of persons trafficked across international borders between 2003 and 2004 ranged between 700,000 and 900,000 per year (Albanese, 2007). In the same time period the number trafficked to the US was estimated to have declined from 45,000–50,000 per year to 14,500–17,500. However, as Savona and Stefanizzi comment, on the question of numbers, '[a]lthough it may still be difficult to estimate the value of the trade in human beings ... all experts confirm that the volume of the traffic has never been so great, nor has it ever increased at such a dizzying rate'

(Savona and Stefanizzi, 2007, p. 2). In the UK, for instance, three-quarters of prostituted women are estimated by the government to be from the Baltic States, Africa and South East Asia (Townsend, 2005). In 2006 the Crown Prosecution Service in the UK revealed that 'slave auctions' of trafficked women were taking place on the concourses of British airports (Weaver, 2007).

The UNODC database in 2006 showed that trafficking victims were recruited from 127 countries, with 98 countries featuring as transit countries and 137 as destination countries (Kangaspunta, 2007). In some cases one country can have all three roles. The most reported origin countries are in the Commonwealth of Independent States, Central and South Eastern Europe, West Africa and South East Asia. Countries of destination are mostly in Western Europe, North America and Asia. It should be noted that legalization of prostitution plays no part in reducing this problem since both Germany and the Netherlands, which are in the top ten destination countries, legalized their brothel prostitution industries only a few years before these rankings were created and engaged in *de facto* legalization before this time.

Governments tend to approach trafficking from a different angle from feminist NGOs and theorists. They are concerned with border protection and illegal immigration rather than the welfare of women. Thus law enforcement and migration agencies are likely to see women who took a decision to be trafficked – though they usually do not know the conditions they will face, such as confiscation of documents, confinement, threats or actual violence, huge debts and the requirement to service 800 or more male buyers without payment – as not 'innocent' victims, and not worthy of their services or concern. The problem of this distinction between 'consenting' and 'forced' trafficking was apparent to the feminists who worked through the League of Nations on the issue of trafficking into prostitution between the two world wars. Thus the convention that came out of their work, the 1949 Convention on the Trafficking in Persons and the Exploitation of the Prostitution of Others, determinedly made consent irrelevant to their definition of trafficking (see Jeffreys, 1997). The 2000 Protocol on Trafficking also says consent is irrelevant so long as any of the detailed forms of force are exercised. Nonetheless state agencies that deal with trafficking, and sometimes NGOs too, tend to make a distinction between good and bad women, those who 'chose' and those who did not (O'Connell Davidson, 2006).

Trafficking in international law

The latest international instrument to define trafficking, the 2000 Protocol on Trafficking in Persons of the UN Convention on Transnational Organized Crime, has a definition which is designed to capture the variety of methods that may be used to gain control of women, both those which use overt violence and those which do not. It deliberately makes consent irrelevant. The definition is as follows:

‘Trafficking in persons’ shall mean the recruitment, transportation, transfer, harbouring or receipt of persons, by means of the threat or use of force or other forms of coercion, of abduction, of fraud, of deception, of the abuse of power or of a position of vulnerability or the giving or receiving of payments or benefits to achieve the consent of a person having control over another person, for the purpose of exploitation.

(United Nations, 2000, Article 3a)

The definition makes it clear that besides violent force or deception other methods can be employed such as the exploitation of a position of power, or the giving of payments to others such as parents or relatives of a victim. As to the issue of consent, the Protocol is unambiguously clear: ‘The consent of a victim of trafficking in persons to the intended exploitation set forth in subparagraph (a) of this article shall be irrelevant where any of the means set forth in subparagraph (a) have been used’ (*ibid.*, Article 3b).

The wording of this definition was the subject of fierce lobbying and argument, with representatives of the sex work lobby and those NGOs who take similar positions arguing strongly in favour of separating ‘forced’ trafficking from legitimate ‘free’ prostitution, and even trying to ensure that no mention was made of prostitution in the definition. As the Coalition Against Trafficking in Women (CATW), which played a large part in drawing up the document, comments: ‘During those negotiations, some NGOs and governments wanted to exclude prostitution and sexual exploitation from any mention in the definition of trafficking. These efforts were not successful’ (Coalition Against Trafficking in Women, 2006). CATW points out that proponents of the sex work position have worked since 2000 to misrepresent the definition by leaving out the bits they do not like in publications and statements, such as the

concept of 'abuse of a position of vulnerability', because this does not require obvious force, and the fact that consent is irrelevant (*ibid.*). The Working Group on Contemporary Forms of Slavery, which oversees the 1949 Trafficking Convention, was able to note, however, 'with satisfaction' in its 2003 report, that 'the definition of trafficking adopted in the 2000 Protocol is consistent with the 1949 Convention in that it does not incorporate a forced/free distinction' (United Nations, 2003, p. 17). The report 'recognizes' that sex trafficking and prostitution are 'interconnected parts of the global sex industry and must be addressed together' since 'the demand for prostitution and all other forms of sexual exploitation plays a critical role in the growth and expansion of trafficking in women and children'.

Harms of trafficking into prostitution

Trafficking for prostitution is not the only form of trafficking taking place in the world at present. The majority of trafficked women are destined for prostitution (UNODC, 2006), but trafficking of women into domestic labour which involves debt bondage does take place too (Surtees, 2003). This latter form of trafficking is enabled by the government of Indonesia with training programmes which prospective domestic labourers 'migrating' to the Middle East are required to take (*ibid.*). The conditions of the hundreds of thousands of women from South East Asia who go to Hong Kong and Singapore, and of the South American women who go to the US, for domestic labour or work caring for the elderly or disabled, can be very exploitative and involve physical and psychological abuse and, frequently, sexual violence from the employers or family members. There are considerable abuses of human rights involved, but there are differences between these practices and trafficking into prostitution that need to be acknowledged. The other forms of labour can be legitimate forms of work which are not necessarily gendered and can be performed in respectable industry sectors without human rights abuses. In such industries a concentration on improving the conditions of labour is a reasonable one. This is not the case with prostitution. Prostitution is a practice which is carried out directly on and in the bodies of women. There is no way to make this safe since the transmission of diseases, unwanted pregnancy, pain and abrasion cannot be avoided in the ordinary everyday work itself (M. Sullivan, 2007). Emotional disassociation from the body is

necessary to survive prostitution but causes serious harm to women's feelings about themselves, their bodies and their sexuality (Jeffreys, 1997). Some commentators who take a pro sex work position deride the particular concern that many NGOs and feminist activists feel towards trafficking into prostitution, attacking it as a 'moral panic' (Doezema, 2001; Agustin, 2007) for example. This is because they do not see prostitution as any different from domestic work or tomato picking.

Trafficking into prostitution harms women and girls through the psychological and physical abuses they suffer (Barwise *et al.*, 2006). As a European report on the health of trafficked women points out, these resemble those suffered by other women in prostitution, in domestic violence, torture and sexual abuse, and those suffered by other trafficked persons and migrants (Zimmerman, 2003). But there are severe harms, also, that trafficked women experience which are extremely similar to those suffered by prostituted women generally, but more extreme in the 'level of exploitation and violence' (*ibid.*, p. 27). Studies of women in prostitution, whether they are perceived to have been 'trafficked' or not, show that they experience psychological and physical health problems such as symptoms of post-traumatic stress disorder, reproductive health issues, sexually transmitted diseases, marks of physical violence, including permanent disfigurements and disabilities (Farley, 2003, 2006).

The European study found that trafficked women suffer violence in the recruitment, transport and destination stages. In the travel or transit stage they are likely to suffer from threats or actual violence and suffer severe and life-threatening conditions. They may be forced to swim across rivers with fast-running currents during the night, and see a companion drown, or have to lie in the ceiling panel of a train (Zimmerman, 2003). They suffer the psychological harm of being sold. Some are sold multiple times before they reach their destination. Three women out of 28 in the study were 'purchased' at auction-like settings, where prospective pimps came to select new 'merchandise' (*ibid.*, p. 40). During the transit stage they are routinely raped by their traffickers, either by the one pimp who has bought the woman or by a group. Fourteen of the 28 women reported being 'confined, raped, or beaten once or several times during this stage, before starting to work' (*ibid.*, p. 41). Three who were virgins were raped at this stage. The report explains that these techniques are used to

establish psychological control over the victims. At the destination 25 women reported experiencing violence such as being 'hit, kicked, punched, struck with objects, burned, cut with knives, and raped' (ibid., p. 46). Murder is 'not uncommon' and serves to terrify other women who are being trafficked. In Italy 168 foreign prostituted women were reported killed by the Ministry of the Interior in 2000. The majority were Albanian or Nigerian who were murdered by their pimps (ibid., p. 46). The women were starved at their destinations, being given extremely unhealthy and inadequate rations by the pimps, and kept in very difficult conditions, not only unable to leave the premises where they both lived and worked, but having to share beds or sleep on the floor and being locked individually into small rooms for the whole day before being taken out to be prostituted (ibid.).

They were raped, often daily, by the pimps and their friends and acquaintances. From the rapes by pimps and the ordinary sexual use by clients they suffered infections, tears and trauma to the vaginal lining which were painful and led to easier infection with HIV. Sexually transmitted diseases (STDs), usually untreated since access to health provision was extremely difficult and often impossible for these women, led to pelvic inflammatory diseases, lasting damage to the reproductive tract, kidney and bladder, infertility, miscarriage, infant morbidity and mortality, and cervical cancer. Trafficked women were expected to accept far more prostitutes per day and at a cheaper rate than other prostituted women. Women reported that the men they called their 'owners' controlled condom use and sometimes forbade it. Women could be charged as much as US\$10 per condom by pimps and the sums were added to the debts they owed. Women were likely to douche to try to make themselves clean. Douching by itself can cause health problems by upsetting the balance in the vagina, but these women were using very harmful products in some cases such as disinfectants unsuitable for internal use. Some prostituted women, as the report points out, use herbs or other mixtures in the vagina to make it dry or tight, which is valued by prostitutes from particular cultures but creates injury to the women. They also suffer 'acute or chronic pain during sex; tearing and other damage to the vaginal tract' (ibid., p. 240). The harms that women trafficked into prostitution suffer are very similar wherever they are trafficked from or to. A study of 49 trafficked women in the Philippines, which included four women who were trafficked locally and four mail order brides, found that half

of the women had suffered vaginal bleeding (Raymond *et al.*, 2002, p. 112). Almost 70 per cent suffered broken bones, and 62 per cent suffered mouth and teeth injuries. The report notes that underreporting is likely since some women became agitated when asked about the violence they suffered and said they did not want to talk about it because they were trying to forget. The psychological harms included 82 per cent reporting depression, 75 per cent rage and 40 per cent suicidal thoughts (*ibid.*).

Pregnancy and abortion, which were common in the European study since, even in the cases where condoms are used, men deliberately damage them or tear them off, can create considerable health problems. In the case of Elena, trafficked from Ukraine to the United Arab Emirates, who had an abortion at 14 performed by a doctor, but illegally, soapy water was injected into her and she was later taken to the American hospital. Outreach workers in Italy and the UK reported that some trafficked women were having as many as 12 abortions, and were sometimes forced immediately back into prostitution, which could lead to infection (Zimmerman, 2003).

The harms that trafficked women are subjected to are revealed in the advice sheets published specifically for Nigerian prostituted women in Italy by the organization Tampep, which takes a 'sex work' approach to prostitution (Wallman, 2001). They are advised to check cars for knives, guns, cushions or pillows, belts or pieces of rope, because these can all be used as weapons. If they find such an object they are advised to 'make the client lock it in the boot'. They are told they should be prepared to 'grab a client by the balls' and they should not wear long or tight skirts or high heeled shoes. Despite the severity of these risks, the author of an article on the Tampep advice argues that it 'empowers' the trafficked women, because 'knowing strategies that she may choose to use, against danger, however, changes her relation to it' (Wallman, 2001, p. 81). The advice converts the situation from 'non-negotiable to negotiable' and from 'stark to fuzzy'. The author explains that '[i]n terms of the logic I have been exploring, empowerment is prevention. A person's capability in risk arenas begins with the conviction that present danger is – or could be – subject to personal control' (*ibid.*, p. 86). Unfortunately it is not true that the danger is under the control of the trafficked woman, and it could be seen as highly irresponsible to make her believe that this is so, and perhaps blame herself when she is attacked. Street prostituted women are the most vulnerable of all prostituted women, and are unlikely to

be able to negotiate with the men who buy them in the ways that are suggested.

The psychological problems that trafficked women endure are complex. One that the European study describes is the ambiguity that women experienced in relation to their pimps and handlers (Zimmerman, 2003). They had trouble naming them and spoke of them being 'trafficker-boyfriend-pimp'. They had 'traumatic bonding' with the men, being beaten and raped by them, but also completely dependent on them for any treats, bought with the money the women had earned, or acts of kindness. Another name for this 'traumatic bonding' is Stockholm syndrome, a term developed to describe the way that hostages bond with their kidnappers in order to survive, and adapted usefully by feminist theorists to describe women's experience of relating to men under régimes of fear and violence (Graham *et al.*, 1994). Such ambivalence can create difficulties in getting women to report or testify to their abuse.

The normalization of trafficking

The same sex work organizations who, as a result of being treated as experts and funded by state governments in response to the AIDS crisis in the 1980s, were able to lobby with some success to euphemize prostitution as 'sex work' and work towards normalization transferred their attentions in the 1990s to the international stage and the issue of trafficking in women. Their peak organization, the Network of Sex Work Projects, led the campaign to normalize trafficking in women as 'migration for labour'. Their approach took several forms. One was to change the language; thus 'trafficking' was to become 'migration for labour', trafficked women were to become 'migrant sex workers', traffickers were to become agents and brokers, or 'immigration organisers' (Fawkes, 2003; Agustin, 2002). Debt bondage, recognized in international law as a 'modern form of slavery', was to become 'contract work'. Another was to deny or minimize trafficking, making the argument that only those who were specifically 'forced' or 'deceived' should be recognized as trafficked, and these numbers were vanishingly small and insignificant. Another was to attack those NGOs, activists and researchers involved in combating trafficking as colonialists and racists who 'victimized' migrant women and refused to recognize their 'agency' (Kempadoo, 1998). The only harms to prostituted and trafficked women that the trafficking deniers recognize come from 'anti-traffickers' who are too

ready to enter brothels and remove women who would prefer to stay and serve out their 'contract', or from police, immigration authorities and 'whore stigma', that is, negative social attitudes towards prostitution (Agustin, 2007).

The euphemisms and the practice of minimization are clear in the submission which the Australian sex work umbrella organization Scarlet Alliance made to a parliamentary inquiry into 'trafficking in women for sexual servitude' which took place in 2003 (Fawkes, 2003). In the submission trafficking has all but disappeared under a host of euphemistic terms. Trafficked women are described as 'contract' women. Instead of trafficking, Janelle Fawkes of Scarlet Alliance talks of 'women who have come to work under a contract system' and 'contract workers' throughout. She downplays the problem by saying that less than 400 'sex workers' enter Australia 'on a contract' each year, of whom the majority 'knowingly consent' and are not, in the Scarlet Alliance definition, trafficked. Fawkes says that the organizations associated with Scarlet Alliance have had contact with fewer than 10 women who have been 'deceptively recruited'. Scarlet Alliance, as a body responsible for advising the federal and state governments on prostitution issues, has played a significant part in downplaying trafficking and allowing the government to say, until 2003, that there was no trafficking into Australia because all the 'migrant sex workers' 'chose' and knew what they were coming into.

The submission describes trafficked women as 'persons who are migrating for work'. Debt bondage in their account gets disappeared too. They say '[t]hese sex workers usually have agreed to repay a fee to be "trafficked"' (Fawkes, 2003, p. 10). They explain debt bondage as arising from the women's ignorance. Trafficked women have an unfamiliarity with exchange rates: 'often they do not understand the rate of exchange with Australia so end up paying back more than they expected' (Fawkes, 2003, p. 10). Scarlet Alliance characterizes the identification of women as having been trafficked as a kind of insult to those women: 'Viewing people under contract as "trafficked" denies the personal agency people exercise when they desire to work in Australia and then choose to enter a contract in order to do so' (Fawkes, 2003, p. 10).

Scarlet Alliance in Australia is part of a network of sex work organizations internationally that disseminate the same language and ideas. Europap and Tampep in Europe also deny the significance of trafficking as an issue and redefine trafficked women as

'migrant sex workers'. As a result of their funding and status as EU expert bodies on prostitution they have considerable influence. Both are committed to the decriminalization of prostitution. A Tampep report on the Europap website, for instance, on 'Intervention Models for Migrant Sex Workers in Europe' by Licia Brussa, recognizes that more and more women in prostitution in Europe are from other countries: 'An important change in the prostitution scene resulted from the enormous migration flows from Central and Eastern Europe towards Western Europe' (Brussa, n.d., p. 5). But Tampep does not make any link between this circumstance and trafficking. Brussa says that it is time to recognize prostitution as a 'social reality' and 'that the resources offered by the prostitution market represent an actual possibility of economic resources for a relevant part of the feminine foreign population' and thus it may be the right path to consider the objectives of normalization of prostitution and of protection of human rights (Brussa, n.d., p. 6). A major collection on international prostitution, *Transnational Prostitution. Changing Global Patterns* (2002), uses the new language and understanding of trafficking. Susanne Thorbek explains that she considers the word 'trafficking' to be applied on far too wide a scale when the term 'migrant sex workers' is more appropriate: 'It is common in the rich world today to define anyone who arranges for a prostitute to travel to work in a richer country as a trafficker, regardless of whether the prostitute has chosen to travel herself or has been forced or lured into the situation' (Thorbek, 2002, p. 5). Pataya Ruenkaew writes that 'transnational prostitution' should be understood as 'a kind of transnational labour migration' (Ruenkaw, 2002, p. 69).

Perhaps the most remarkable transformation of language in relation to trafficking comes from Laura Agustin, whose research on 'migrant sex workers' has contributed to normalizing the trafficking of women into prostitution within migration studies. Agustin explains that trafficked women gain positive advantages. One is that they can earn well so that 'a migrant may be able to pay back debts undertaken to migrate fairly soon', i.e. she will be able to buy herself out of debt bondage (Agustin, 2004, p. 90). But also she has a fascinating work environment:

she works in multicultural, multilingual clubs, brothels, apartments and bars. ... For those selling sexual services, *milieux* are workplaces where many hours are spent socializing, talking

and drinking, with each other, clientele and other workers like cooks, waiters, cashiers and bouncers. In the case of flats, some people live in them while others arrive to work shifts. The experience of spending most of their time in such environments, if people adapt to them at all, produces cosmopolitan subjects, who may consider the world their oyster, not their home.

(Agustin, 2004, p. 91)

But of course women may not 'adapt to them' and may find the context of sexual exploitation, a world in which men socialize and bond with each other through the bodies of women, frightening and alienating. This is not a world of women but one of men. She endorses the findings of other researchers in the UK and mainland Europe that trafficked women are sold between men in the clubs of immigrant communities which are likely to be men's clubs, strictly segregated from the lives of other women. The Poppy Project study of the sites and organization of prostitution in London found that one woman had been trafficked into a Turkish social club, for instance (Dickson, 2004, p. 16). The women become 'cosmopolitan subjects' because they are moved by pimps/traffickers to different countries and cities to keep the prostitutes interested, and to disorientate the women so that they cannot gain strength through learning a language and finding out where they are. Agustin is positive about this practice: 'It is easy to find migrant sex workers who have lived in multiple European cities: Turin, Amsterdam, Lyon. They have met people from dozens of countries and can speak a little of several languages; they are proud of having learnt to be flexible and tolerant of people's differences' (Agustin, 2004, p. 91). The trafficked women become, in her words, the 'hope of the world' because they are unlikely to be nationalistic and have joined a group of people that judges others on their actions and thoughts, and not on how they look or where they are from. 'This', she says, 'is the strength of the cosmopolitan' (Agustin, 2004, p. 91). In her analysis trafficked women, who are, as she notes, the majority of 'those selling sex in Europe', become the very model of citizenship to which others may aspire.

Stigma

The physical and psychological harms of prostitution and trafficking are so clear, even to researchers who take a sex work

approach, that they need to be explained away. This has led to the creation of another interesting euphemism, the concept of stigma (see Pheterson, 1996). This idea is used to suggest that the harms are created, not by the ordinary practice of prostitution, but by the negative social attitudes which lead to the stigmatizing of prostitution and prostituted women. Sophie Day and Helen Ward make use of this concept in their research on prostitution and health in Europe (Day and Ward, 2004). Most of the prostituted women they interviewed (56 per cent) were 'migrants', which means they were most likely to have been trafficked into debt bondage. They explain the serious health problems the prostituted women they interviewed experienced as a result of being in prostitution, but they attribute all the ills the women report to stigma. They consider that complete social acceptance of prostitution, with the removal of stigma, will remove the problems and enable prostitution to be just ordinary work. However, the harms they report seem to stem from what the prostitutes do to them rather than 'stigma'. As they explain: 'HIV was not the only, or even the most serious, health problem for women. Many participants were concerned primarily about violence at work', which was mostly from 'clients' (*ibid.*, p. 148). Women spoke of 'the psychological effects', 'the lack of respect', 'the degradation' and 'the humiliation' of the work. Women also spoke of how much they hated being prostituted, saying: 'I do not have much feeling left', 'it is a heavy job for the mind', and 'it is dirty' (*ibid.*, p. 150). When women were asked about the worst aspects of their work, they 'complained about dirty, abusive, drunk and exploitative clients' (*ibid.*, p. 150). Of the 40 respondents in Lisbon, 20 women 'explicitly claimed' that there were 'no good things about prostitution' (*ibid.*, p. 150).

Day and Ward found the following in their interviewees, 'a range of psychological problems including stress and depression, insomnia, flash backs, panic attacks and fears of disclosure, problem alcohol and drug use, nervous breakdowns, anorexia, bulimia, manic depression and severe personality disorder' (*ibid.*, p. 171), but attribute them to 'stigma'. They comment that they noted 'the linkage between mental health problems and a sense of stigma and injury in sex work, which persisted on changing jobs' (*ibid.*, p. 171). They found that women grew more unhappy the longer they were prostituted and conclude that this too is the result of stigma. However, the issues the women talked about do not relate to stigma very well since the 'most prominent theme in this discussion

concerned clients', '[i]t was hard to minimize exposure to violent or difficult men' and they were overwhelmingly concerned with 'safety' (ibid., p. 169). Even regular clients were difficult because 'they might hit you when they could not have an erection', for instance. Day and Ward fall back on 'stigma' here too, saying: 'While the conversation ranged over many dimensions of stigma, it was the long-term effects of prejudice that troubled these women most' (ibid.).

Day and Ward cannot interpret the data on the women's distress in a way which respects what they were actually saying, which is that violence and degradation from the prostitutes is the main source of harm, without discrediting their sex work approach. Thus they are forced into mental gymnastics and summersaults designed to attribute the harms to 'stigma' instead. Prostituted women do, of course, suffer additional harms from the way that they are treated socially, by police and the legal system, and by being unable to return to families or explain to them what has happened to them. These harms can reasonably be attributed to 'stigma'. Day and Ward, however, confidently expect that all the problems they outline will disappear when 'stigma' is dealt with, thus confusing an unreasonable stigma, which is prejudice directed at prostituted women, from what is a very reasonable 'stigma' indeed, i.e. disapproval of a practice which causes harms to women.

The demand question

Legislation and policy on trafficking in women have concentrated on dealing with the traffickers, and the trafficked. There has not been so much attention to addressing the root causes of trafficking, or, indeed, agreement as to what they are. Push factors which make women and girls vulnerable to trafficking, such as destruction of subsistence and global inequality, have been recognized as important and governments and NGOs in the rich world fund education programmes for girls in high trafficking areas such as Northern Thailand or Nepal in order to reduce the vulnerability of girls. Unfortunately these may not be very effective because, in Thailand at least, there is research to show that the girls whose parents have kept them at school are the ones most likely to be called upon to pay back the investment by entering prostitution (Taylor, 2005). The 'pull' factors, i.e. those which create the demand in the destination countries, are rarely addressed, because, in the case of trafficking for prostitution, it means addressing the sex industry itself, and forms

of privileged male behaviour, such as pornography consumption, strip club use, buying women, which are important to masculinity and male dominance. Indeed even feminist commentators who recognize that prostitution is not an optimal practice for women are likely to take an 'after the revolution' approach to trafficking and prostitution, which is that these practices will end when women's poverty ends so it is poverty that should be addressed and not prostitution (Kempadoo, 2004). But this is not the approach taken to addressing other forms of violence against women such as forced marriage and woman battering, even though these harmful practices are exacerbated by poverty. In these cases there is more likely to be a recognition that legislation and education can play a part in ending the practices.

The 2000 Protocol on Trafficking has brought the issue of 'demand' into clearer focus. It calls for the ending of the 'demand' that fuels the traffic in women. Article 9, Clause 5 is as follows:

States Parties shall take or strengthen legislative or other measures, such as educational, social or cultural measures, including through bilateral and multilateral cooperation, to discourage the demand that fosters all forms of exploitation of persons, especially women and children, that leads to trafficking.

This approach is based upon the understanding that men's prostitution behaviour is socially constructed (Jeffreys, 1997). It is learned behaviour and in societies where it is socially discouraged or penalized it is possible to decrease this behaviour. The fact that the numbers of prostituted women escalate in countries where governments show social approval of prostitution by legalizing it and are very low in countries where the buyers are penalized is a good indication of the usefulness of penalization. Thus in Germany, where prostitution is legalized, there are an estimated 400,000 prostituted women, which is a rate of 3.8 per 1,000 of the population, whereas in Sweden, which penalized the buyers of sexual services in 1999 in order to reduce the demand, there are an estimated 2,500 prostituted women, a rate of 0.3 per 1,000 of the population (Ward and Day, 2004).

Some policymakers have chosen a different approach from that of Sweden, however. They have the fixed idea that the industry of prostitution is not the problem, and seek to address the demand for 'trafficked' women in particular whilst leaving men's demand to use

women in other forms of prostitution intact. They have promoted or created legislation which punishes the male buyers who use trafficked women, seeing this as a form of rape because the women were 'forced' rather than exercising free choice. In 2005 Home Office Minister Tony McNulty in the UK told the *Observer* newspaper that men who have sex with trafficked prostitutes should be charged with rape as a way of reducing trafficking (Townsend, 2005). In the legalized environment of the Netherlands the government decided that prostitutes should be enlisted in the fight against trafficking. Advertising space was bought on a sex industry website on which Dutch buyers networked, for a public notice asking men to report if they discovered trafficked women whilst buying women for sex. The signs by which trafficked women could be recognized were said to be little responsiveness to the client, bruising and fearfulness (Expatica, 2006). Bruises and reluctance are quite likely to be found on 'free prostitutes' too, and are unlikely to be a reliable guide. CATW comments on this approach: 'What better way to dignify the male demand for the sex of prostitution than to enlist these men in the service of identifying victims, the very victims they help create?' (Coalition Against Trafficking in Women, 2006). One difficulty with the idea is that research does not support the view that men who buy women care about whether they have been trafficked or not. Indeed a 2007 study of prostitutes in London found that they were not deterred from using women by the possibility that they may have been trafficked (Coy *et al.*, 2007). This should not cause surprise since the same study found that more than three-quarters saw women who sell sex as dirty (89 per cent) and inferior (77 per cent) (Coy *et al.*, 2007). Such contempt is not a good basis for ethical consumer behaviour.

Conclusion

Though it might seem counterintuitive, some commentators suggest that legalization of the industry of prostitution can be a strategy to end the trafficking in women. Bridget Anderson and Julia O'Connell Davidson, in their work on the demand factor in trafficking, allow the possibility that regulation of the sex industry rather than moves to abolish it might inhibit that part of the demand that comes from the third parties, pimps, who exploit trafficked women. They explain: 'The continued expansion of any unregulated market is likely to require and facilitate the exploitation of vulnerable labour'

and thus a case can be made ‘for bringing the sex ... sector(s)’ above ground and ‘regulat[ing] them like any other economic sector’ (Anderson and O’Connell Davidson, 2003, p. 46). In Chapter 8 we will consider whether the legalization of prostitution is a useful way forward in ending the harms of prostitution that have been outlined so far in this book.

The state as pimp

Legalizing prostitution

The concern of international bodies and NGOs about trafficking in women and girls into prostitution is at odds with the fact that some states are legalizing/decriminalizing their prostitution industries. The majority of Australian states took this path in the 1990s, and the Netherlands, Germany and New Zealand in the 21st century. The 1949 UN Convention Against Trafficking in Persons and the Exploitation of the Prostitution of Others joined up the issue of trafficking for prostitution with local sex industries by outlawing brothel keeping (Jeffreys, 1997). It made an explicit connection based on the understanding that local brothel prostitution is the foundation of the traffic. It is quite surprising how firmly this straightforward connection has been repudiated in much of the debate about how to address trafficking in the last 15 years. There is generally a scrupulous separation of 'trafficking' from 'free' prostitution in the programmes and policies adopted to combat the trafficking in women both in legalizing states and in those that simply tolerate 'massage parlours' and 'escort' agencies. The effect is that local prostitution industries are protected from any negative effect, despite the fact that the trafficking of women and girls supplies local prostitution markets. I shall suggest in this chapter that states which legalize become pimps and procurers in the global sex industry.

As we have seen in previous chapters, states are involved in procuring and trafficking women in many different forms. The Japanese state acted as a pimp for both its own military and for the occupying US forces after World War II (Tanaka, 2002). The Irish, Japanese and Canadian governments have, until recently, had special visa categories for 'entertainers' which enable the trafficking in women for strip clubs and prostitution (Macklin, 2003).

States in South East Asia, such as the Philippines, have special training programmes for ‘entertainers’ that facilitate trafficking for prostitution. None of these states have officially legalized prostitution, however. Legalizing states are much more hands-on in their relationship with the prostitution of women. Legalization needs to be understood not as a reluctant response to a ‘necessary evil’, as it is sometimes portrayed, but as an active policy which creates the conditions for the rapid expansion of the industry of prostitution. As the industry expands, rather than reducing the harms associated with prostitution, from trafficking to organized crime, legalization exacerbates them. Legalizing states become responsible for the management of ‘free’ methods of recruitment, trying to ensure that prostituted women are not obviously recruited by force, deception or trafficking. They become responsible for issuing occupational health and safety advice. They profit from slicing off part of the profits of the industry in the form of licence fees and taxes. For the sex industry to grow effectively, and reach its full potential as a market sector, active intervention through such policies is required because the profits that can be made by an illegal industry, which carries substantial social stigma, are limited. Thus an industry report on strip clubs and brothels in the legalized environment of Australia points out that continued and increasing normalization and acceptance of the sex industry are fundamental to the continuing growth in profits (IBISWorld, 2007).

The modern wave of legalization

In the post-World War II period, in response to a considerable campaign by feminist activists and abolitionist organizations to end state regulation of prostitution and the base it provides for trafficking, both states which had signed up to the 1949 Convention against Trafficking in Persons and those which did not, closed the brothels they had previously regulated or tolerated (Jeffreys, 1997). But in the last 20 years, a campaign for legalization by sex industry lobby groups has caused a normalization of prostitution and an acceptance by many states that it should be treated as a legitimate business and state regulated once more. The policies of legalizing or decriminalizing brothels have been suggested as cures for many of the other social harms that prostitution brings in its train, besides the trafficking in women. These touted benefits do not eventuate. As Janice Raymond of CATW puts it: ‘The alleged

benefits of legalizing/decriminalizing prostitution sound a lot like the promised land of trickle-down economics' (Raymond, 2004, p. 1184). In states that 'legalize', the ordinary buying and selling of sexual access to prostituted women is usually already legal and remains unchanged by 'legalization'. Only certain activities that are associated with prostitution have usually been subject to penalty, such as solicitation in the street by prostituted women and/or the male buyers, and the extraction of third party profits from prostitution, known as pimping, 'living off the earnings of prostitution' or brothel keeping. There is usually no decriminalization of street prostitution. All that gets legalized is pimping, through the acceptance of a small minority of brothels as legitimate businesses and the requirement that they apply for licences to operate. Most of the industry of prostitution remains illegal, but the foundation is created for the industrialization of prostitution. This is the system in the states of Victoria and Queensland in Australia (M. Sullivan, 2007).

Starting with the state of Victoria in 1984, and followed by the other most populous states, New South Wales (NSW) and Queensland and the Australian Capital Territory, in the 1990s, and the Netherlands, Germany and New Zealand in the 2000s, there has been a wave of decriminalization/legalization of brothel systems in the last two decades. Legalization has been promoted mainly as a cure-all for local ills, such as violence against women and girls, organized crime and corruption, sexually transmitted diseases and threats to public health (M. Sullivan, 2007). Meanwhile, an alternative approach has been promoted by feminist organizations which see all forms of prostitution as violence against women, which is the penalization of male buyers as well as the pimps and procurers, and the decriminalization of prostituted women. This approach is now being taken up by enlightened state governments such as Norway and South Africa (Aftenposten, 2007; Cape Argus, 2007). It is called the 'Swedish model' because Sweden was the first country to institute legislation which penalizes the buyers of 'sexual services' in 1999 (Ekberg, 2004). The developing controversy as to the best method for states to use in dealing with prostitution is of immense importance to the future of the global sex industry.

In legalized systems brothels are licensed and regulated by the state. In decriminalized systems there is no state oversight of brothels. They do not need licences and, like any other businesses, they need only apply for planning permission. This is the situation in

New South Wales where in 2005 there were 600 brothels in Sydney and 800 in the state as a whole, and where street prostitution is permitted except in certain specified areas (O'Dwyer, 2005). Complete decriminalization is the common demand of sex work organizations. Melissa Ditmore, of the Sex Workers' Project of the Urban Justice Center in New York, says that prostitution should be decriminalized because this would 'render prostitution akin to other businesses. It'd be taxed and subject to business requirements'. It would solve problems of 'graft and abuse' associated with the police, and it would 'better protect people in the sex industry from violence and abuse' (Ditmore, 2007). This is not the approach generally favoured by policymakers, who are, though they may not draw any useful lessons from this, aware that considerable social harms are associated with prostitution, and it is not just like any other business. As an example of the problems that accompany decriminalization, in 2007 the New South Wales government passed new laws enabling councils to close illegal brothels. Local courts are allowed to order that gas and water supplies be cut off. NSW Premier Morris Iemma said the legislation was necessary because '[i]llegal brothels can destroy the amenity of a residential area, intimidate residents and families, put our children at risk, and are a magnet for other types of crime' (*Sydney Morning Herald*, 2007). Janelle Fawkes from the Australian Sex Workers Association said this was a return to the situation before decriminalization (*The West*, 2007). Certainly it suggests that the New South Wales decriminalized system has not solved the problem of illegal prostitution, and it has now been partially abandoned.

Some states, such as Tasmania in 2005, decide that they will not legalize forms of prostitution from which third parties take profits, such as brothels and escort agencies, in order to prevent the growth of a prostitution industry. They legalize the practice of one or two women working from home in what are called in New Zealand small owner-operated brothels, or SOOBs. Unfortunately many of the harms of prostitution are not alleviated by this approach. One of these is the growth of the illegal industry and organized crime. Crime groups operate under the guise of owner-operated brothels, and can set up, or take over, networks of brothels. In New Zealand Chinese gangs are reportedly using trafficked Chinese women through networks of SOOBs which they control (Fleming, 2006). Street prostitution, with all its attendant harms of violence against prostituted women and damage to amenity, continues to exist in all the

systems where brothels have been legalized or decriminalized, such as the Netherlands (Shared Hope International, 2007) and Victoria (M. Sullivan, 2007).

Legalization creates a two-tier system of prostitution since the illegal industry in all legalized systems is hugely greater than the legal sector. The regulations, such as they are, apply only to the small legalized sector so the vast majority of prostituted women and girls are not covered by them. But legalizing states can be seen to be offering 'grade A' prostituted women in establishments which do comply with the regulations, despite the fact that most women in prostitution have worked in many sectors, including the street, strip club prostitution, legal and illegal brothels (Farley, 2004). The legalized brothels, at least, have the imprimatur of the state and are held up internationally as 'best practice'. Thus the Victorian system of legalization or the New South Wales or New Zealand systems of decriminalization are used as models by other states considering going down this path.

Pimping by patriarchal states

The gendered nature of prostitution, the fact that prostitution is overwhelmingly of women for men, with no street, brothel or any other sector of prostitution dedicated to offering men to women, is carefully glossed over by legalizing states. The fact that prostitution is gendered is so obvious that it might be expected to give pause to governments which pay lip-service to the importance of women's equality. Legalizing states argue that they act in the interests of prostituted women since those who pass through the legal sector will not be so vulnerable to severe violence. But legalized systems affect the status of all women, not just those who are prostituted, in negative ways. There is no attempt to argue in any literature that prostitution benefits women as a group, and there is a good deal of evidence, as we shall see in this chapter, that the opposite is the case.

Legalization can, from a critical feminist perspective, be understood as the behaviour of patriarchal governments acting in the interests of male citizens. John Lie, in his work on the Japanese military/government comfort women system, argues that the Japanese state provided prostituted women to its military in order to create a contract with these male subjects (Lie, 1997). He explains that the Japanese state needed to satisfy the interests of its male subjects once the despotic elements of the government

were reduced, in order to ensure their support. Thus an 'egalitarian ethos' was developed in the 1930s which recognized the 'sexual "rights" of citizen-soldiers' (ibid., p. 254). As he puts it:

In order to advance its aims, the state – even an authoritarian one like the Japanese state of the early 1940s – must elicit the participation of its subjects. The massive military organization required the consent of its conscripts. Moreover, access to sexual gratification could not be restricted to the privileged few; the sexual 'rights' of soldiers, which would not have been of concern before the modern period, had to be widely dispersed among citizen-soldiers. The Emperor's 'gift' had to be distributed widely.

(Lie, 1997, p. 254)

In this respect the state that ensures and organizes access to prostituted women for its male citizens is acting out what feminist political theorist Carole Pateman calls the 'sexual contract' (Pateman, 1988). The 'sexual contract' underlies the 'social contract' and guarantees the 'male sex right' whereby men receive access to and control over women's bodies in the form of servile marriage and various forms of prostitution. The behaviour of states in legalizing prostitution can be seen as the continuing fulfilment of this bargain by patriarchal states. It may even be more pressing in the present when the original sexual contract has been undermined by women's increasing movement into the public sphere and refusal to accept the servile conditions of marriage. The legalizing state supplies a compensation, a nudge and a wink to male citizens about the proper role of women and to the protection of men's superior status and privileges.

Lie explains that prostitution does not occur simply from 'men's sexual desires or "deviant" women's willingness to offer sex for money' but from 'the underlying structural conditions and concrete organizations'. After the end of 'feudal relations', 'modern' prostitution requires the 'regulating or administrative state, urbanization and the commodification of social life'. In fact, he points out, the state needs to play an active role because 'prostitution usually entails organizations – be it the state or private sexual entrepreneurs – to sustain relations of sexual exchange between prostitutes and their clients' (Lie, 1997, p. 260). The history of prostitution demonstrates that whilst some states, like Japan, set up licensed prostitution

systems to service male citizens, others merely tolerated prostitution as a 'necessary evil' through discriminatory legislation and practice in which male buyers were protected and women were persecuted (Frances, 2007). This was effected through the Contagious Diseases Acts, for instance, in the 19th century in the UK and Australia that forced women suspected of being prostituted to undergo examination for venereal diseases and to be incarcerated in lock hospitals if found to be infected (Jeffreys, 1985a). With the modernization of patriarchy in the 20th century in western states, more efficiency, and thus the legalization of the delivery of male sexual privileges, was required. In legalized brothel systems today the women are assumed to be a threat to public health, and once more compulsorily inspected, whilst the male buyers are exempt.

This practice of compulsory examination of women, but not male buyers, was identified by feminists in the late 19th and early 20th centuries as one aspect of the 'double standard' in relation to sexuality (Jeffreys, 1985a). This 'double standard' is the basis of legalization and toleration, in which women are rostered on in warehouse brothels to service men's sexual pleasures while the state benignly oversees or looks the other way. Sequestration of 'fallen' women from 'pure' women has been, and continues to be, necessary to the continuation of this double standard, which separates out women who may be treated as the common property of all men from those whose bodies are the private perquisite of their male partners.

The ways in which prostituted women have been separated out have sometimes been geographical and sometimes through the use of particular forms of clothing. Clothing rules were used in the ancient Middle East, where prostituted women, predominantly slaves captured in warfare and placed in brothels, were required to be bareheaded in public places, whilst privately owned women were required to be veiled to show their respectability (Lerner, 1987). This crucial division predates Islam but shows the importance of prostitution, and this approach of separating out the classes of women, in the development of veiling as a practice in this cultural crucible. Today in the brothel towns of Bangladesh, which are run by the police, a different form of physical marking of prostituted women is employed. Women are not allowed beyond the boundaries with their shoes on (Jenkins and Rahman, 2002). Thus their movements are controlled and their degraded status made clear to other citizens so that men can know which women are to be used

and which women have the property rights of other men invested in them.

Geographical sequestration is not necessary so long as non-prostituted women do not have freedom of movement and are kept in seclusion in the home or restricted in where they may venture without damaging their virtue. Respectable middle class women in late 19th century London were not supposed to venture into certain parts of the city such as the Haymarket, because they were given over to men's privileges of purchasing prostituted women (Walkowitz, 1992). When department stores such as Harrods were set up and required women consumers, the prostituted women were cleared from the streets so that the respectable women would not be disturbed by seeing the men's buying behaviour. Precisely the same practice of clearing the streets as 'respectable' women entered them for shopping took place in Australian cities too in the late 19th and early 20th century (Frances, 2007).

Geographical sequestration, however, is a frequently employed method of controlling and offering prostituted women in contemporary legalized systems of prostitution. Whilst women have, in theory, the right to roam cities freely, this is reduced when red light areas are created in which strip clubs and shops selling pornography are clustered together. Sometimes sequestration is effected by requirements such as those in Australian states that brothels may not be set up close to churches or schools, or in residential areas, or that women may not engage in street prostitution, in the rare cases where this is decriminalized such as New South Wales, in particular areas. Even though there are brothels on main streets in shopping centres in the state of Victoria, male buyers never enter through the front door, but via the back lane. Their behaviour must be protected from the public gaze, or perhaps the gaze of the womenfolk, wives and work-mates who might otherwise despise them. Sometimes the forms of sequestration are more extreme and more damaging to the rights of the prostituted women who suffer them.

In some jurisdictions legalized brothels are physically isolated and the prostituted women severely restricted in their movements. They can resemble concentration camps or prisons. Kamala Kempadoo describes the way in which the colonial Dutch state has acted as a pimp, recruiting for and regulating a state brothel on the island of Curaçao in the Caribbean from the early 20th century to the present (Kempadoo, 2004). Her description of the state brothel or 'Camp Happy', now called 'Mirage', as resembling a concentration camp

or prison is startlingly similar to that of licensed brothels in the state of Nevada, the only US state that has instituted a legalized system (Farley, 2007):

The brothel is hidden from the main road at the end of a dirt road, appearing from the outside as a fortified army barrack or even a 'concentration camp' – a bare compound surrounded by a solid, high wall with several rows of low zinc-roofed barrack-like buildings with rooms to accommodate over a hundred working women. The starkness of the compound is emphasized by a lack of any vegetation, even of cacti ... An iron gate with a number of guards continually on duty is the only entrance point ... located in a dusty, shadeless environment far removed from the daily island activities and a distance from the capital, Willemstad. The air of a detention or army camp is further accentuated by the rule that the women may not leave the site between 6 p.m. and 6 a.m., and after sundown the guards patrol the compound to check that the women are all inside and available to serve clients.

(Kempadoo, 2004, pp. 87–8)

The brothel was set up in 1949. Only migrant women are allowed to work in the brothel and they apply through state channels, so the state is directly pimping and procuring in this instance. The movements of prostituted women are restricted, denying them the rights that other women may take for granted.

The legalized brothel system in the US state of Nevada delivers women to male buyers in similar conditions:

In 2006 there were about 30 brothels in 10 Nevada counties. Located in sparsely populated rural counties, the brothels reflect a lingering frontier mentality with its sex-libertarian worldview. Surrounded by barbed wire and high fences, Nevada's legal brothels are little prisons in doublewide trailers ... the Nevada brothels are miserable institutions, some smelling worse than others, a mix of yesterday's cigarettes, sweaty clothes, semen, and last year's booze and rug cleaners.

(Farley, 2007, p. 9)

Some of the fences are electrified, with barbed wire or spikes on top, with controlled access and exit through buzzers. The Nevada

brothels also restrict the movements of the women who are prostituted in them. Melissa Farley describes a 'grated iron door with bars' in one brothel she visited, with the women's food being 'shoved through the door's steel bars between the kitchen to the brothel area' (Farley, 2007, p. 17). In one brothel women were locked in, at another women were not allowed to own their own cars. Some required that women live on the premises and be available for use 24/7, being allowed off premises for four hours in a week. The city of Winnemucca, Farley explains, requires that prostituted women are inside brothels by 5 p.m. In Ely prostituted women are not permitted in bars and if they go to a restaurant they must enter by a separate side entrance accompanied by a male (*ibid.*). These forms of sequestration and restrictions on mobility are not visited upon women in other occupations, and are indications of the historical roots of prostitution as a harmful practice of setting aside one class of women, often acquired through slavery and warfare, for men's use.

Legalizing states may use zoning laws to segregate street prostituted women for men's use. The Netherlands has zoned street prostitution which provides one of the most disturbing examples of the state organized and supervised provision of prostituted women to male buyers. The city of Utrecht has a special, state provided, designated parking area with 14 parking spaces divided by corrugated iron fences, around a central roundabout, to which men can bring women they have picked up on the street to use sexually in their vehicles (Shared Hope International, 2007). This area is busy at night with queues of cars. There are on-site medical services and coffee and cheap condoms from a government funded services bus parked at the area. Women used in such venues are overwhelmingly trafficked women and drug addicted women and they are used by middle-aged Dutch men. The sequestration of prostituted women by various means suggests that legalizing states see prostitution as potentially polluting to the body politic. This is similar to the ways in which other forms of pollution were zoned in the medieval city. In medieval London the slaughterhouses, which emitted foul smells, were restricted to the East End, which remained, until late in the 20th century, a poor, working class area (Bermant, 1975).

Legalization does not deliver the benefits that states postulate as their motivations for this policy. Most significantly prostitution does not deliver safety and freedom from harm to the girls and women who are prostituted in the industry. Moreover it exacerbates a number of social and political harms, including the undermining of

good governance and democracy, and damage to women's equality in both the private and the public sphere, that the creation of a large and growing legal and much larger illegal sex industry brings in its train. These harms are integrally involved in the development of prostitution as an industry. They do not result from the development of other industries, even those which predominantly employ women, such as hairdressing or domestic labour. This is because prostitution fits the United Nations criteria for a harmful cultural/traditional practice and cannot be made into a respectable market sector. A harmful cultural/traditional practice in CEDAW, the Convention on Ending All Forms of Discrimination against Women (1979), calls upon states to end the social attitudes that underlie these practices. Legalizing prostitution so that it becomes a larger and more profitable industry does the opposite of this. Rather, the growing sex industry gradually transforms societies in which it is encouraged to develop, and encourages the social attitudes that create men's prostitution buying behaviour.

Violence and harms to women's health in legalized prostitution

Legalizing states tend to conceal their institutionalization of male privileges behind statements about protecting the welfare of prostituted women. The Victorian Prostitution Control Act of 1994 places the welfare of prostituted women well behind issues of public health, civic amenity and controlling organized crime in its list of objectives, whereas the Australian Capital Territory's legislation in 1992 puts women's welfare first (see www.catwa.org.au/ for links to the statutes). The common understanding behind both approaches, however, is that prostitution is inevitable and that women will always be prostituted, so the state has the responsibility to step forward on behalf of these unfortunate women and seek to better their situation through what is commonly referred to as 'harm minimization'. It is interesting to note the feminists working against state regulation of prostitution in the late 19th century had to face this kind of argument and rejected it roundly. Thus the British feminist who led the campaign against the Contagious Diseases Acts, Josephine Butler, stated, in 1875:

Robbery and murder are evils that have always existed, but no society ever thought of saying: Since we cannot eliminate

robbery or murder, let us agree to a way of living that will submit them to certain regulations and monitoring so that, for example, the law will determine in what places, at what times and under what conditions stealing and killing are permitted.

(Josephine Butler; quoted in Marcovich, n.d., p. 2)

As Butler makes clear, there is considerable hypocrisy behind an approach which makes this kind of distinction. Harm minimization masks the issue of who stands to gain most from the policy of legalization, such as the pimps and procurers and male buyers, rather than the small number of prostituted women who will end up in the legalized segment of the industry. But also it is based on the idea that the male urge to use prostituted women is removed from the social, something bestowed by nature and uncontrollable, that the state can only seek to surround with free condoms, cups of coffee and other civilizing influences, but could not seriously hope to contain. Occupational health and safety (OHS) advice is offered by legalizing states, usually in concert with state funded 'sex work' organizations, to prostituted women as a way to fulfil their responsibility to make prostitution safer, but the advice shows little acknowledgement of the physical or psychological harms involved, and is unable to offer realistic solutions (M. Sullivan, 2007). It is often ludicrously misdirected. Thus the OHS guide on the website of Australian sex work organization Scarlet Alliance has as its first point the need to make sure that beds are in proper repair (Edler, n.d., p. 1).

Prostitution presents severe problems for women's reproductive and sexual health because it entails the use of women's reproductive tract, anus, mouth and other body parts by penises, hands and objects. It is the only form of 'work' which requires use of the inside of women's bodies, apart from reproductive surrogacy (Jeffreys, 1997). Thus a fundamental concern should be the abrasion of areas of internal mucous membrane, but this problem is, in fact, not mentioned in OHS advice at all. The advice does direct itself to problems of sexually transmitted diseases, including HIV/AIDS, and pregnancy that have profound implications for women's lives and would be unimaginable as hazards in other forms of work. OHS codes transfer responsibility on to prostituted women for safeguarding themselves from these very serious harms and they ignore the problems of power imbalance that construct the practice of prostitution. Thus an OHS code on the website of

the Scarlet Alliance, the peak body for sex work organizations in Australia, advises prostituted women to examine the male buyers' penises to see if they show signs of disease: 'After visually inspecting the client gently squeeze along the shaft of the client's penis to see if a discharge occurs' (Edler, n.d., p. 41). It is quite possible that buyers would object to such a practice and a woman might be in danger of violence or of losing a booking. OHS codes advise the use of condoms, but condom usage is by no means guaranteed in legalized environments since women will sometimes accept more money for sex without condoms, or simply accept a man who refuses to wear one because they have had no custom all evening (M. Sullivan, 2007). Even when they are worn they may break or slip, or the man might remove them. One Australian OHS code suggests that in this situation women should squat and use their muscles to squeeze out the semen, then scoop out excess with fingers, being careful not to scratch the mucosa with fingernails, then scour or flush with a douche or use spermicides (M. Sullivan, 2007, p. 276). Both douching and spermicide use are harmful to the vagina's natural environment. Douching can push sperm up towards the cervix causing pelvic inflammatory disease and ectopic pregnancy. Spermicides can cause irritation, ulcers and yeast infection. Whilst other businesses, like building sites or offices, may have health and safety officers to inspect the safety of the workplace, and employers know they may be held accountable, none of this applies to the dangers of prostitution, where brothel owners have no accountability.

Advice from the sex work organization STAR in Canada, which takes a pro decriminalization position, shows the problems a prostituted woman may encounter when trying to enforce condom use. The advice makes the inequality of power involved in prostitution plain as the prostituted woman is advised to '[l]earn techniques to put a condom on a client or simulate vaginal sex without him noticing'. The techniques are said to be 'difficult to learn and take practice', and may lead to violence since '[t]hese techniques may be responded to in a negative way if a client becomes aware of what you are doing' (STAR, 2004). There is other helpful advice for women seeking to avoid penetration by a man who refuses to wear a condom, such as: 'Tell him that you have diarrhoea if he insists on anal sex without a condom' (STAR, 2004). It is difficult to imagine such advice being seen as reasonable in any other form of 'work'.

Prostituted women suffer two forms of physical violence, unpaid violence, which includes rape, beatings and murder from male buyers, pimps, traffickers and passers-by that is not remunerated, as well as the ordinary everyday violence of unwanted and often painful penetration that is paid for. There is a great deal of evidence from numerous well researched studies of the severe unpaid harms that women suffer in the form of psychological harms, broken bones, head injuries, sexual violence, imprisonment (for a useful summary, see Farley, 2004). Though these harms are usually understood to be particularly severe in street prostitution, there are studies to show that escort prostitution in which women visit male buyers in hotel rooms or their homes involves similar risks (*ibid.*). Any advantage that legalization can offer in reducing the threat of this violence would only be available to a small minority of women in the industry, however, since most women in Australia, in Nevada, in the Netherlands and Germany are prostituted in illegal sectors from brothel to escort, strip club and street prostitution (Wallman, 2001). These harms may be alleviated to some extent in brothel systems, whether or not these are legalized, simply because the male buyers cannot be so anonymous and may be more circumspect about the violence they inflict. They are not eliminated. Thus some legalized brothels install panic buttons for women to press when in fear of being assaulted, though women may not be able to reach the buttons, or at least not before the assault takes place. At the large, legalized, Daily Planet brothel in Melbourne, for instance, a bouncer has described how, if the button is pressed, he will rush up to the room and break down the locked door behind which a naked woman is likely to be being attacked (*Sunday Age*, 1998).

There is no evidence that legalized brothels provide alleviation of the harms that are involved in the ordinary everyday acts of penetration that the male buyers pay for, however, or the psychological humiliation and distress that prostituted women experience. Prostitutors use verbal violence such as saying to a woman 'on your knees, bitch', language which is run of the mill in the pornography from which male buyers learn the practice of prostituting women (Barclay, 2001; Farley, 2006). They grab women's bodies in degrading and painful ways during bookings, such as twisting nipples, and thrusting fingers into the woman's anus to show they want anal sex (M. Sullivan, 2007). Women are subjected to the constant showing of pornography on the ceilings of the rooms

in which they are prostituted in legal brothels. The psychological harms that result from the continual disassociation of mind and body needed to survive prostitution, and the routine dehumanization integral to the practice, commonly bear all the characteristics of post-traumatic stress disorder (Farley, 2003, 2004).

OHS guides do not address these ordinary hazards. An autobiography of a woman prostituted in legal brothels in Melbourne, Victoria, depicts these everyday harms very well (Holden, 2005). The author, Kate Holden, entered prostitution after graduating from university because she needed to pay for her heroin habit. She describes how she tried to maintain control of the discomfort and pain which she could not avoid experiencing since it was precisely what she was paid to endure:

Control, not to squeal when a man grabbed my breast hard enough to make it twinge. Control to keep my legs stretched in the air even when they were trembling. Control to brace against pounding from behind, as my face mashed in to the pillow and my arms shuddered and my spine jarred with every thrust. Control, not to gag at a slimy tongue in my mouth, burrowing wetly into my ear, licking at my throat. Control not to twitch when a fingernail suddenly dug into my anus, when a cock scraped into my vagina against burning skin and I felt my face go pale with pain.

(Holden, 2005, p. 172)

She is positive about prostitution, and does not include such material to show the harms involved, but rather the skills she developed to survive them.

If occupational health and safety advice is less than adequate in relation to brothel prostitution, it is outrageously inappropriate to address the harms peculiar to escort prostitution. The escort industry involves women visiting the private homes or hotel rooms of prostitutes, where no checks have been carried out for safety, hygiene or any other workplace health and safety risks. There are 'Safety Tips' specifically directed at the legalized escort industry on a state community health website in Victoria (RhED, n.d.). Escort workers are advised, for instance, to reconnoitre around the premises on arrival to see if there are too many cars or too many lights on, which may indicate the possibility of gang rape. They are advised to ask for a

tour of the property when the door is opened so that they can check the exits in case of trouble. Other safety tips include:

- Pens, screech whistles and breath sprays can make good weapons, and may allow you the opportunity to get away.
- Assert yourself in the first 10 minutes of meeting the client. From the moment you are alone with the client it's important to take control and stay in control of the situation. Be polite and friendly – it's often the best way to gain control – even when the client is behaving like a jerk.
- Let the client know that there is someone waiting outside for you, even if you are not using a driver.
- If you drive yourself, park your car so only the back can be seen from the house (for example behind a tree or some bushes) and leave the car radio on if possible (this will suggest to the client that someone is waiting for you).
- Have your belongings near the door in a pile so you can grab them if you need to get away quickly.

The latter instruction is aimed at ensuring that when a woman has to run from danger she will not have to be naked, and without her car keys or purse. This advice sheet includes an instruction that 'escort workers' should be careful when using local anaesthetic in the vagina since that can make it more difficult to ascertain when serious injury has occurred. Women who are often drug addicted, perhaps trafficked and unable to speak the language, and who have to get naked behind locked doors with unknown males are not in a good position to implement all these 'tips'. When legalizing states offer health and safety advice as their panacea for these terrifying harms, they can be seen to be washing their hands of women's safety rather than ensuring it.

Other social and political harms

The violence prostituted women suffer, though the most severe harm of prostitution, is only one of many harms that are integrally involved in this practice. These include harms to good governance, such as the encouragement of organized crime, the encouragement of corruption of police and public officials, the undermining of local democracy, harm to the status of all women and harm to neighbourhoods.

Good governance

Where sex industries are tolerated or legalized a profitable terrain for the development of organized crime is created. There is, of course, a considerable history of organized crime involvement before legalization of prostitution in states such as Victoria, Australia, Nevada in the US, and in the Netherlands (Frances, 2007; Farley, 2007). Governments frequently state that legalizing prostitution will reduce or control organized crime, but it is quite unclear how this is to be accomplished. In legalized environments illegal prostitution is always a much larger sector than legalized prostitution. Individual criminals, small-scale criminals as well as larger organized crime groups run the illegal industry. But they are also involved in the legal industry, too, which offers them considerable advantages. In Victoria police checks on brothel owners in the legal sector take place but crime figures own brothels through front organizations. Thus the gangland boss from Melbourne, Tony Mokbel, bought the major city brothel, Top of the Town, through a business partner, and laundered Aus\$2 million through it (Moor, 2007b). Two other men involved in Mokbel's drug operations owned their own legal brothels. At least one major legal brothel was established using drug money provided by the Calabrian mafia and police believe that various crime syndicates have interests in other legal and illegal brothels (Moor, 2007a). The Chief Commissioner of Police, Christine Nixon, told a parliamentary committee that organized crime gangs are entrenched in Victoria's legal brothel industry (*ibid.*). In Victoria there are 93 legal brothels and an estimated 400 illegal ones.

In all Australian states that have legalized prostitution motorcycle gangs are an important element in the organized crime that is associated with the industry. The 17 Australian songs are involved in a war in Sydney to set up drug distribution through night clubs/strip clubs. They seek to control security at strip clubs and use standover tactics against brothels, or acquire legal ones through frontspeople, mainly so that they can distribute drugs (Silvester, 2007). The Australian Crime Commission says 'the size, profile, geographic spread and level of sophistication of OMCG [outlaw motorcycle gangs] criminal activity presents a significant threat to Australia and its interests' (Silvester, 2007). In June 2007 a gang member who was assaulting a stripper in a bar next to a strip club followed another stripper out into the street and assaulted her as she tried to get away in a taxi (*ibid.*). He shot two male passers-by who went to the woman's aid

and the woman herself. One of the male helpers died. This incident showed Melbournians how the crime linked to the sex industry can explode on to the street at 8 a.m. and endanger citizens. The sex industry cannot be quarantined, such that only prostituted women have to suffer the violence associated with organized crime, but affects the cities in which it is allowed to prosper.

Queensland has 23 legal brothels operating in city and regional areas. The illegal industry, which operates largely through the use of mobile phones (Osborne, 2007), is very much larger, according to the legal brothel owners' association, which sees the illegal business as undercutting prices, having fewer overheads and imperilling safety. Illegal prostitution is run across state borders by phone networks (Griffith, 2007). The legal industry seeks to run the escort business from its legal brothels but this has been rejected after an inquiry by the Crime and Misconduct Commission of the state government. The number of prostitution offences reported in Queensland increased from 362 in 2000 to 6,000 in 2005–6. The Crime and Misconduct Commission said that illegal escort services accounted for 75 per cent of Queensland's sex industry (Corkill, 2005). In 2007 in Queensland, Benjamin Turner received an eight-month suspended jail sentence and was fined \$5,000 for running a 'prostitution empire that turned over almost \$2 million dollars in less than two years' (Stolz, 2007). He had 230 male and female prostitutes on his books and 59 phones registered to his address. Turner had a previous conviction for prostitution. Legal brothel owners say that organized crime is strengthening its grip on prostitution in Queensland, with prostituted women taking part in organized sex tours of rural towns (Griffith, 2007). They say that an Asian crime gang with Australian partners has operated Asian gambling tours to the Gold Coast where prostitutes were made available free of charge (*ibid.*). In 2005 Queensland approved restrictions on strip clubs. All private rooms are to be closed because of concerns about illegal prostitution and violence (Leading the Charge, 2005). When prostitution is legalized local police forces no longer have a role in monitoring the industry. Industry lobbyists seek to reintroduce police vice squads to close down the illegal competition (Lucas, 2007).

In the Netherlands politicians on both the Christian right and the left are arguing for measures to rein in prostitution as well as the permissive drug culture in Amsterdam. This is the result of concern over international crime organizations that have infiltrated

prostitution and the drug trade, increased trafficking of women, and dismay over the image of the Netherlands as a sex tourist and drug destination (Moore, 2007). Amsterdam Labour Party councilman De Wolf commented: 'In the past, we looked at legal prostitution as a women's liberation issue; now it's looked at as exploitation of women and should be stopped' (ibid.). He said Amsterdam's police force was overwhelmed and ill equipped to fight the sophisticated crime networks. According to him and other city officials, legalization opened the trade to criminal gangs. Mayor Job Cohen says that legalization led to an increase in organized crime, human trafficking and money laundering. Legalization, he says, has not had the desired effect on the status of prostituted women since many prostituted women have not become 'ordinary employees' or self-employed businesswomen, but are still exploited by pimps (Hesen, 2007). The mayor wants a ban on pimping. Amsterdam councillor Karina Schaapman, a former prostitute, says: '... I think it's a cesspit. There's a lot of serious criminality. There's a lot of exploitation of women, and a lot of social distress. That's nothing to be proud of' (ibid.).

Legalization of the prostitution industry makes trafficking in women more profitable. The European nations that have legalized, the Netherlands and Germany, have the highest numbers of trafficked women. Thus estimates of the percentages of prostituted women in those two countries that are trafficked are never less than 50 per cent and in some cases are as high as 90 per cent in the case of Germany (Monzini, 2005). If the lowest estimate for Germany is used this means that 150,000 prostituted women in Germany have been trafficked. And 70–80 per cent of prostituted women in the Netherlands are estimated to be foreign (Expatica, 2006). The increase in numbers of male buyers that results from legalization increases the demand for prostitution, which is met by the trafficking of women into both legal and illegal sectors of the sex industry. Where trafficking of women fails to meet the demand, then local 'loverboys' or pimps will increase their practice of 'turning out' teenage girls that they romance and then coerce into prostitution. A recent report suggests that this is what is taking place in the Netherlands in 2007 as boys of Moroccan and Turkish descent 'turn out' Dutch girls into the industry, tattooing the girls' arms with their names (Shared Hope International, 2007).

Trafficking of women into prostitution is a problem in the legalized environment of Australia too (Kotnik *et al.*, 2007;

Project Respect, 2004). Women are brought in on tourist visas. The traffickers then apply for refugee status for the women, which is usually not forthcoming, and set the women to work in legal brothels in debt bondage during the period of time, 18 months, that the applications take to process. The existence of legalized brothels makes trafficking relatively trouble free. It is estimated that 300 women are trafficked for prostitution to Australia each year, and 1,000 women are held as 'sex slaves' in the country at any one time. Most trafficked women are from South Korea, Thailand and China. While the number of women from South Korea has recently risen, there has been a fall in the number of women trafficked from Thailand (ibid.). Women who are recruited by traffickers are told on arrival that, because the industry is legal, they have no grounds to complain to police about their conditions of 'employment' (Fergus, 2005).

The existence of tolerated as well as legalized sex industries creates the significant problem of the corruption of police, officials and politicians. When police are not involved in regulating prostitution the practice of corruption moves from the police to local council officials. The sex industry constantly bucks against any legal restrictions that exist to contain its growth, such as limits on the range and size of businesses, restrictions on advertising for workers and clients, and zoning restrictions. In Nevada, for instance, brothels are legal outside the city of Las Vegas, in smaller cities and in countryside areas, but not in the big city itself. Strip clubs are legal, however, and prostitution operates through these venues. Politicians are bribed to oppose bye-laws that create a statutory distance that should exist between strippers and the male buyers in order to prevent prostitution in the clubs. They are bribed to vote in particular ways on zoning laws that affect the sex industry (Farley, 2007). Council officials can be corrupted in legalized environments also. Thus in Sydney a corruption inquiry was told in 2007 that Wade Fryar, employed by Parramatta Council, took bribes of cash and sexual services while he headed a team that enforced council policies on the use of premises as brothels (ABC News, 2007a). One witness said she paid Fryar up to \$500 per month to warn her about council inspections because she feared her business would be closed down. He took bribes from at least 12 illegal brothels.

Police corruption is also endemic in tolerated and legalized prostitution. When prostitution is *de facto* illegal, but in fact tolerated, as has traditionally been the case in male dominant states prior to *de jure* legalization, police corruption is rampant (Frances, 2007).

Police took bribes from individual prostituted women, as well as forcing prostituted women to submit to them sexually, and from pimps and brothel owners. Legalization does not alleviate this problem. In the state of Victoria in November 2007 hearings before the Office for Police Integrity took place seeking to establish which serving police officers were involved in tipping off another of their number that he was under investigation for giving the address of a male sadomasochist prostitute to hired killers who carried out a professional hit (Hedge, 2007). The man, Shane Chartres-Abbott, was about to give evidence in a case against him for biting off part of the tongue of a Thai woman client and raping her.

Another area of good governance that is undermined by legalizing prostitution is the operation of local democracy. In all jurisdictions in which legalization takes place it becomes impossible for citizens, or their elected councils, to successfully oppose the opening of brothels in their streets and cities as long as planning procedures are followed. Planning regulations commonly cover such features as the space that should exist between licensed brothels, or how close brothels can be to churches or schools. Brothels cannot be opposed on what are referred to as 'moral' grounds, such as the fact that citizens do not want them in their community, because of the effect on children or relations between men and women for instance, or because they consider prostitution to be violence against women. In Queensland legal brothels cannot be set up in small towns if there are local objections, but this restriction does not exist in Victoria or New South Wales. Consequently, citizens' campaigns have been established in rural towns to prevent the establishment of brothels, but these have all, to date, been unsuccessful (personal communication with campaigners). In New Zealand, too, where councils have been required to draw up planning schemes as to where brothels should be located but not to reject them, there have been campaigns and legal challenges, with several councils seeking to outlaw brothels or severely restrict where they may be located (McAlley and Gill, 2005; Katterns, 2007).

Citizens may feel profound discomfort at the way in which legalized prostitution affects the regard in which their cities are held. Cities may become sex tourism destinations. This is a concern in Amsterdam, where local politicians consider that legalization has created an image of Amsterdam as a sleazy sex tourist destination. The red light district has live sex shows and an erotic museum and the Prostitution Information Centre sells statues, T-shirts,

mugs, paintings and key-rings with prostituted women on them (Shared Hope International, 2007). Also there is increasing unease with 'planeloads of British thrill-seekers who take cheap flights to Amsterdam each Friday evening for weekend binges of sex, drugs and alcohol' in the red light district. This image is increasingly unpopular with city politicians who would like to encourage a different kind of tourism. A research report on male buyers in London found that 31 per cent had paid for sex overseas, and the most popular destinations – the Netherlands, Spain, Germany and Australia – are all countries where pimping is legal (Coy *et al.*, 2007). One interviewee volunteered that prostitution use was easy in Australia because '[i]t's not as undercover in Australia, because it's all legal ... there are just sort of parlours everyone goes to'. Another remarked: 'Australia's different because in most states it's legal ... you can just pick up the phonebook so it's easier' (*ibid.*, p. 17). The study authors conclude that 'the socio-legal context can influence men's attitudes and behaviours. The normalization of the sex industry and male entitlement to sex have global resonances, but clearly men seek out paid sex where it is easier and most accessible to do so' (*ibid.*, p. 18).

Undermining women's equality

The lives of a whole generation of girls and women who are not directly involved in prostitution are now suffering the harms of this burgeoning industry. The toleration and legalization of prostitution mean that the percentage of male buyers increases, with resultant harms to their relationships with women partners, workmates and offspring. Governments that legalize do not usually consider what percentage of their male citizens they want to have becoming prostitutes, but this is a question with considerable implications for the women whose partners and sons are involved. In legalized environments men feel justified in their prostitution behaviour and the percentage of men who prostitute women is likely to increase. Thus in Australia, 1 in 6, or 15.6 per cent, of men report paying for sex (Rissel *et al.*, 2003). The corresponding number of men in the UK is 1 in 29, though that number has doubled in a decade as a result of the growth of the illegal industry in the UK, stimulated by the normalization of strip clubs and pornography, which fosters prostitution behaviour, and sex tourism (Coy *et al.*, 2007). Prostituting women whilst abroad on business and tourist trips and stag weekends has

become more acceptable behaviour for men (Friday, 2005). The effects of legalization on the numbers of women involved in prostitution is clear from a comparison of Germany, which has legalized brothels and has 3.8 prostituted people per 1,000 population, and Sweden, which penalizes the male buyers and has 0.3 prostituted people per 1,000 population (Ward and Day, 2004).

The increased numbers of prostitutes in tolerated or legalized environments is of concern because of the attitudes they have towards prostituted women. More than three-quarters of prostitution buyers in a study carried out in London, where massage parlour prostitution is tolerated, saw prostituted women as dirty (89 per cent) and inferior (77 per cent) (Coy *et al.*, 2007). This is problematic for the safety and mental health of prostituted women. But their motives for prostitute use indicate how such male behaviour undermines men's respect for women's equality in general. Analysis of the reasons in this report for the men's prostitution behaviour concluded that it 'reflects an underlying theme of male entitlement' (*ibid.*, p. 19). Sex was viewed as a product to shop for, or something to be bought as a group after an evening out. It enabled the buyers to be disrespectful of women: 'I don't have to ask or think "No, is that too dirty for her?" or – like I don't really have to be as respectful as if it was my girlfriend or my wife or partner' (*ibid.*, p. 22).

The sex industry undermines the equality of girls and women both in the private sphere of their relationships, families and sex lives and in the public sphere of business and the professions. In the private sphere women's relationships with male partners are negatively affected by their male partners' use of strip clubs and pornography (Paul, 2005). Men lie to their wives or the women are distressed by the knowledge or suspicion of their husbands' behaviour. The sexual practices that are expected of them may become more degrading (*ibid.*). In the public sphere women's equality is seriously undermined by the increasingly strong nexus between the sex industry and the business world (Morgan and Martin, 2006). Corporations in Australia supply prostituted women as inducements and bribes to entertain international visitors and cement relationships and contracts (IBISWorld, 2007). Strip clubs in Australia promote themselves on their websites to businessmen for meetings, after-work activities, networking with clients and product promotions. This is an area in which the possibility of women's equality and the growth of the sex industry are most clearly in contradiction with each other.

As the values and practices of the sex industry sexualize public space the public landscape becomes more masculine, intimidating and alienating for women. Strip club and brothel advertising offers women's bodies for sale on the public highway, but non-sex industry billboard advertising increasingly incorporates the codes of prostitution too.

These can be seen as a form of sexual harassment of women which, if it occurred inside office buildings, would be understood as discriminatory and harmful (Rosewarne, 2005, 2007). The lives of citizens are affected by the establishment of no-go areas in city centres where sex industry venues flourish. These areas are dangerous for the women who work in the strip club venues, and they are warned to keep their details secure and take care in getting to their cars because of stalkers (Mani, 2004). Other women are likely to steer themselves and their children away from these streets as they become safe areas for men to sexually exploit women, and women lose their right of access to public space. Street prostitution neighbourhoods present difficulties for residents, particularly women. In Melbourne residents suffer harassment from prostitutes and male sightseers and from the sexual use of prostituted women in front yards and doorways. Streets and gardens are littered with faeces, used condoms and needles (M. Sullivan, 2007).

Conclusion

Though it is appropriate that the first concern in assessing the impact of legalization should be the safety of prostituted women and girls in the legal and illegal sectors, brothels and the street, there are other social and political harms to be taken into account too. These harms are not incidental problems that can be dealt with piecemeal until, eventually, a tidy and respectable sex industry is created. The harms to good governance and democracy, to women's status in the private and the public sphere, to the environment of cities and public space, are integral to prostitution. Unlike domestic labour, or hairdressing, prostitution is a harmful cultural practice of male dominant societies which is based upon women's subordinate status. Legalization/decriminalization does not provide a solution but an exacerbation of the harms that are integral to this practice. Considering the magnitude of these harms it is surprising that legalization is still being advanced by policymakers in some jurisdictions as a promising path to pursue. The fact that this is so may

indicate the crucial importance to patriarchal governments of facilitating the sexual contract with their male citizens. But some states are taking a very different path and seeking to roll back the prostitution industry. In the conclusion (Chapter 9) some of the most effective of these initiatives will be explored.

Conclusion

Rolling back the global sex industry

In this conclusion I shall make some suggestions as to what can be done to end prostitution. I am sure that there are readers who will think that I am unrealistic to consider that this industry can be brought to an end. There is a great deal of fatalism about the inevitability of prostitution even in much of the feminist literature. Many feminist NGOs are fatalistic too and take a ‘harm minimization’ approach (see Oriel, forthcoming) of handing out condoms and providing safety advice, without imagining a future for women beyond prostitution. It is not surprising that there should be so little optimism about achieving such a future considering the way that the global sex industry is powering along at present. Indeed this book could serve to make the reader quite pessimistic. For that reason I think it is useful to look at examples of good practice that give pointers as to how the ending of prostitution may be approached. Considering the very serious harms – not only to the women, girls and boys who are prostituted but to women’s equality and to the social and political fabric of societies – that are integral to the industry of prostitution, it is important to envisage how to end it.

It is surprising that so many policymakers are prepared to embark only on harm minimization, through attacking what they see as the most egregious harms such as child prostitution and child pornography, ‘forced’ prostitution, despite the difficulties involved in trying to separate out these aspects of the industry from those which involve only prostituted persons over 18 who profess to be volunteering. The evidence assembled in this book suggests that it is very unrealistic to imagine that there is, somewhere, a safe, free, respectable industry of prostitution, entered only by fully empowered adults, which is worthy of all this sidestepping and looking the other way.

It is hard to pretty up an industry which depends to a large extent on the continual rape of girls and women who are numbed with shock and pain. This unrealistic belief is ideological. It depends upon a liberal determination to respect the free will of the individual and the market above all other values, and on a respect for the power and inevitability of men's sex right.

Feminists involved in working to end other forms of violence against women such as battering in relationships, on the other hand, do not assume that it is unrealistic to imagine a future without this form of cruelty. They do not work from the premise that the best they can do is to distribute sticking plasters and cups of coffee because men cannot help themselves. They envisage a future in which women will be free from violence in the home. Feminist legal theorists have done excellent work explaining how violence against women needs to be taken seriously as a rights issue, even though male dominant notions of human rights have not traditionally included violence from intimate partners, or by other than state actors (Romany, 1994; Charlesworth, 1995). In the 21st century Amnesty International launched its global campaign 'Stop Violence Against Women' (Amnesty International, 2004). This marks a historic change in which a traditional human rights organization has made the decision to make men's violence against women a priority. As evidence of the seriousness with which this campaign is now proceeding, four detailed country reports were issued by Amnesty in 2006, documenting violence against women in Jamaica, Papua New Guinea, Mexico, Albania (Amnesty International, 2006a, 2006b, 2006c, 2006d). Unfortunately, only 'forced' prostitution is included as a form of violence in the Amnesty campaign (Amnesty International, 2004). The exclusion of that form of prostitution for which women are seen to volunteer, rather than being conscripted, provides succour to the global sex industry and is crucial to its continued profits and growth. In neo-liberal times the notion of women as part of a collective which requires rights is being overwhelmed by the idea that each woman should be able to work out an individual contract as an 'agent' in the global sex industry. This ideology still dominates thinking on prostitution in parts of the human rights community.

However, the approach that Amnesty is taking to violence against women does provide a model for combating prostitution also, and acts as a pointer to ways in which the global sex industry can be rolled back. The reports all stress that violence against women is

created by misogyny and harmful cultural attitudes towards women, and warn against arguments that 'culture' justifies violence. The report on PNG, for instance, warns that 'traditional customary norms and practices are often afforded a mythical, elevated status in public and political discourse in Papua New Guinea' (Amnesty International, 2006b, pp. 72–3). This is the case with prostitution too, and shows how important it is that 'customary norms' about how prostitution is the oldest profession, and has always existed, or is inevitable, must be rejected. The Amnesty reports put forward a three-pronged approach to ending violence against women. This comprises effective legislation combined with training of police and the judiciary and all those who will come into contact with the victims, services to support and reintegrate the women who have been harmed, and education programmes such as those requiring zero tolerance of violence against women, to change deeply entrenched attitudes that support men's violence. Prostitution can be approached in a precisely similar way.

The task of ending prostitution is more difficult than that of ending other forms of violence against women because of the vested interests involved. The vested interests are not just the commercial ones of those who make profits in different ways from the industry, but the interests of those males who provide the customer base and are likely to be enraged at attempts to rein in their male privileges. Such a situation could create problems for those states that decide they will not act as pimps but seek to bring the practice to an end. The ILO report on prostitution in four South East Asian countries – Philippines, Malaysia, Thailand, Indonesia – usefully characterizes the nature of the problem, speaking of the 'highly structured and organized nature of the sector and the vast network of dependencies and powerful vested interests involved' which make 'regulating or controlling' prostitution difficult (Lim, 1998, p. 11). Protection and support, they explain, are given to the industry of prostitution by 'corrupt politicians, police, armed forces and civil servants'. These personnel receive bribes and demand sexual favours, they are customers of the brothels and may be partners in or owners of the businesses. However, the entrenched nature of these interests is not a sufficient reason to protect the harmful cultural practice of prostitution. Progress in the area of women's rights generally provokes hostile reactions but it provokes an incremental change in attitudes too, towards respect for women's full human status

(MacKinnon, 2006). I shall consider how a comprehensive programme to roll back the sex industry can be developed through looking at legislative change, services to victims and education.

Legislative approaches

Until recently it did seem that arguments for legalization/decriminalization of prostitution taking the sex work approach would come to dominate the international discussion on prostitution policy. But, as we saw in Chapter 8, the evidence is mounting that such an approach exacerbates the harms of prostitution instead of alleviating them, and more states are seriously considering penalizing the male buyers to be a more effective response. Thus arguments that prostitution should be legalized, and the agency of prostituted girls and women recognized, are beginning to seem rather out of date. For a concerted legislative approach to prostitution there needs to be effective international as well as domestic law.

International law

In recent years, in response to the increasing influence of the sex work position and the strength of the industry of prostitution, the clear condemnation of prostitution in international instruments has been challenged. It has been supplanted, to a large extent, by a reference only to 'forced' prostitution, which has undermined the usefulness of international law. The 1949 Convention Against Trafficking in Persons and the Exploitation of the Prostitution of Others, however, is an anti-prostitution convention, and makes no forced/free distinction or recognition of the possibility of a respectable 'free' prostitution industry. It should still be signed and ratified by states concerned to end prostitution and trafficking because, in outlawing 'exploitation', it is against the creation of third party profits from prostitution and prohibits brothel keeping. It is thus a most useful instrument against the development of the industry of prostitution. It emerged from an earlier wave of feminist activism on this issue. There is no UN instrument that has emerged from the more recent wave of feminism that is as useful towards ending the global sex industry, but the 1979 Women's Convention or CEDAW (The Convention to Eliminate All Forms of Discrimination Against Women) repeats the language of the 1949 Convention in

its mention of trafficking in women. Article 6 states that 'States Parties shall take all appropriate measures, including legislation, to suppress all forms of traffic in women and exploitation of prostitution of women'. In 1979 there was no campaign to separate out 'forced' from 'free' prostitution, because feminists were united in their condemnation of the prostitution of women. The global sex industry had not yet begun to advance towards its present globally dominant influence on thinking about this form of sexual violence.

By 1993 this had changed. As a result of a long campaign by feminists to get the issue of violence against women taken seriously in international law, the 1993 UN Declaration Against Violence Against Women was adopted. This document, which has not gained the status of a convention, makes a forced/free distinction in relation to prostitution as a result of the dissemination of the sex work position in the intervening period. Thus the Declaration condemns 'forced' prostitution as a form of violence against women, carefully separating this off from the supposedly volunteer form. In 1991 a draft UN Convention Against Sexual Exploitation was drawn up which still represents the closest that concerned feminists and NGOs have come to obtaining a convention which targets the global sex industry in all its forms (Defeis, 2000). It is a very important document. The definition of sexual exploitation is the one that I have been employing in this book, and specifically includes pornography, temporary marriage and the mail order bride industry. This Convention provides a good basis for rolling back the global sex industry but it is still only a 'draft' convention.

The 2000 Protocol on Trafficking in Persons (United Nations, 2000) is the most useful instrument that currently exists to target the global sex industry. It is directed at trafficking rather than prostitution, which is only one aspect of the global sex industry, but a most important one since it does, in many countries, represent the majority of the supply. Article 9 of the Protocol on Trafficking, which enjoins states to take legislative and educational, social and cultural measures to 'discourage the demand that fosters all forms of exploitation of persons, especially women and children, that leads to trafficking', provides a very good platform for the creation of policy that will end the industry of prostitution. The most useful educative tool against the demand, however, is likely to be domestic legislation which penalizes men for buying women in prostitution and decriminalizes prostituted women.

Domestic legislation: the Swedish model

In contrast to the movement of some states to become pimps and legalize prostitution in the last decade, Sweden has taken a very different direction and provides an example, usually called the 'Swedish model', of an effective approach to dealing with the harms of prostitution. Sweden's law that 'Prohibits the Purchase of Sexual Services' entered into force in January 1999 (Ekberg, 2004). The law was a result of campaigning by feminist organizations in Sweden, including the peak body on violence against women, since the 1980s. It recognizes prostitution as a form of violence against women. The law decriminalizes the women involved in prostitution, understanding them to be the victims of abuse. The government provides funding for assistance to women to leave prostitution, including shelter provision, counselling, education and job training. The law is supported by 80 per cent of Swedish citizens, with, significantly, women making up a minority of those who oppose it, 7 per cent. As the Special Advisor to the Swedish Division for Gender Equality on prostitution and trafficking in human beings, Gunilla Ekberg, puts it, the law has a normative effect, it 'dispels men's self-assumed right to buy women and children for prostitution purposes and questions the idea that men should be able to express their sexuality in any form and at any time' (Ekberg, 2004, p. 1205). The buying of women and girls for sexual purposes is 'seen to be firmly against the basic tenets of Swedish gender equality politics' (ibid., p. 1208). The positive effects of the law are that street prostitution has declined in all parts of the country and the majority of 'prostitution buyers' have disappeared. The number of women trafficked to Sweden has remained relatively stable and at very low numbers compared with its neighbours, Finland and Denmark. The traffickers, according to telephone conversations between traffickers recorded by the police, are deterred from setting up business in Sweden because it is difficult and expensive as a result of precautions needed under the new laws, and the buyers are put off by them (ibid.).

Critics of the Swedish model argue that, though prostitution appears to have diminished in public places, it has simply gone underground and moved to the Internet. In fact research shows that there is no evidence of an increase in prostitution related contacts on the Internet, with the number of women prostituted in this fashion remaining stable at 80–100 women (Ekberg, 2007). The argument is

commonly made by critics of abolitionism such as the author of the ILO report on the 'Sex Sector' (Lim, 1998) that criminalization of the business and buyers of prostitution will drive the practice underground where it will create more problems than bringing it into the healthy light of ordinary commerce. The creation of an underground industry does not seem to be the effect of Sweden's law. But the argument that an 'underground' industry is more dangerous needs to be questioned in its own right. It is not usually made about other practices that are clearly and obviously harmful, such as the creation of child pornography, for instance, which is also marketed via the Internet. So far no one has suggested that child pornography should be made and sold in a high street store. The argument is based on the example of alcohol prohibition in the United States in the 1920s. The legalization of alcohol led to a cessation of organized crime involvement in a way which has clearly not happened with prostitution, probably because alcohol use is not a harmful cultural practice based upon the subordination of a social group.

The effectiveness of the Swedish model is inspiring imitation in other European states where there is a commitment to women's equality. Norway's centre-left government decided to criminalize purchase of sexual services in 2008 and the Justice Minister Knut Storberget describes the intention thus: 'Norway shall not be a free zone for pimps and human traffickers' (Aftenposten, 2007). Harriet Harman, Deputy Prime Minister and Minister for Equality in the UK, announced in December 2007 that she considered that the law should be changed to the Swedish model (Bell, 2008). The UK government in 2008 is seriously considering adoption of the Swedish model and government ministers have been on a mission to Sweden to see how the approach works (*ibid.*). In December 2007 South Africa adopted legislation based closely on the Swedish model of punishing the buyer (Cape Argus, 2007). This is despite the fact that there has been a very strong campaign by the sex work organization SWEAT for decriminalization of prostitution in that country (see www.sweat.or.za). The clause that penalizes buyers is in the Sexual Offences Amendment Act. Prostituted women remain subject to penalties for soliciting under South Africa's prostitution laws. Despite this serious limitation, it moves the controversy over prostitution policy internationally into a new phase in which not merely first world nations but those with severe problems of economic inequality are prepared to move to abolitionism in order to defeat the trafficking of women.

In fulfilment of their obligations under the 2000 Protocol on Trafficking, many states are adopting anti-trafficking legislation. The usefulness of this legislation to fighting trafficking, as well as providing a means to reduce the demand, depends on the extent to which it incorporates a forced/free distinction and seeks to protect what the legislators understand to be the volunteer sector of the prostitution industry. In this respect it is important to note that two other developing nations, the Philippines and South Korea, which have suffered severely from the development of large prostitution industries by the US military, have adopted groundbreaking legislation that provides a model for other nations. The Philippines' Anti-Trafficking in Persons Act of 2003 was campaigned for by feminist NGOs and does not go quite as far as they might wish (see the CATWAP website, http://www.catw-ap.org/?page_id=46). The Philippines' legislation introduces the principle of penalizing the buyers, but only those who buy women seen as fitting the UN Protocol (United Nations, 2000) definition of trafficking. It is innovative in outlawing the mail order bride and sex tourism industries and including the use of 'trafficked' persons for pornography as well as for other forms of prostitution. It requires the provision of support services for trafficking victims in the form of 'counseling and temporary shelter to trafficked persons', legal and medical help, livelihood and skills training, educational assistance to children, without the requirement that exists in trafficking legislation in other jurisdictions that such help will depend upon willingness to act as a witness for the prosecution. This legislation breaks new ground because it targets the prostitutes even though it makes a forced/free distinction.

The Korean anti-sex trafficking law, however, which came into effect in 2004, goes further towards the Swedish model (Dasi Hamkke Center, 2006). The purpose of the Act is 'to eradicate the sex trade, intermediating in sex trade and associated acts, and human trafficking for the purpose of sex trade and protect the human rights of victims of sex trade'. A report on the legislation by the support centre for trafficked women, Dasi Hamkke, set up by the Seoul Metropolitan government, explains that the feminists who had long campaigned for this legislation did not achieve what they wanted, which was the decriminalization of all prostituted women. They wanted all those 'selling sex' to be defined as victims and not punishable by law, but the legislators decided that this would be publicly unacceptable. Thus in the legislation men and women 'selling and buying sex' are criminalized unless they

fall within the definition of 'victims of sex trade'. Victims include those who are forced by means of deception, those who are hooked on drugs by their exploiters, those unable to make decisions, or with serious disabilities, those who are trafficked, those who are in any form of debt bondage or who have their documents taken away. This covers the vast majority of prostituted women in Korea because most are trafficked internally to the place where they are prostituted, or they have accepted 'advance payments' from traffickers, which they usually give to their families and which are then employed to trap them in debt bondage (*ibid.*). Though some prostituted women are vulnerable to being penalized under this legislation, it provides a model for penalizing buyers that is potentially quite expansive.

There was considerable opposition to the Korean legislation from pimps and other exploiters, and they arranged a 'huge protest' of brothel owners and women in prostitution just after the law came into effect. The prostitution business owners, explains the Dasi Hamkke Center, 'used the women to give voice to their message and were the force behind organizing an association made up of women in prostitution', and they were supported by the 'sex buyers' and sex workers' rights groups (*ibid.*, p. 18). This is useful information to keep in mind when confronted with 'protests' against such legislative initiatives that purport to represent the independent interests of prostituted women. The report points out that despite many positive results there are still 'strong links' between some pimps and the police and a need for education on sex trafficking issues (*ibid.*, p. 21). The way in which a forced/free distinction in the definition of victims was incorporated into the legislation in Korea suggests a reason for those who see themselves as adopting such a distinction from a progressive motive, such as respect for women's agency, to be cautious. In the conservative context of Korean policymaking, the distinction gained public support because of deeply entrenched, traditional, cultural attitudes in male dominant societies, which paint women who 'choose' to sin as beyond sympathy and concern, if not actually worthy of punishment. The distinction between 'forced' and 'free' prostitution serves the agenda of traditional morality, rather than women's interests. No legislation aimed at reducing the harms of prostitution will be effective without training of the police, the judiciary and all those who come into contact with women who have been prostituted. The police and judiciary in particular are likely to be as prejudiced in relation to prostitution as they have traditionally

been in relation to other forms of violence against women. In Sweden considerable resources are directed towards training of police and all those to whom prostituted women might turn for help and support (Ekberg, 2007).

Services to victims

A strategy for ending the prostitution industry must offer comprehensive exit programmes to prostituted women and girls. Exiting prostitution is difficult for a number of reasons, all of which need to be addressed in service provision. First, women need places of safety to go to whether they have been trafficked, are under the control of pimps or are homeless. They need counselling to recover from the violence and degradation they have suffered and recover or develop self-esteem. They need targeted drug and alcohol programmes which recognize their particular needs, such as the need to be women-only and include sexual violence counselling. They need material support, retraining, educational support, skills training and support in gaining employment, as well as free legal advice and access to health services. All of this is expensive, as is the cost of not providing these services in opportunity costs for the women, and medical and welfare costs for them and probably their children too. The Protocol on Trafficking in persons requires states parties to provide housing, counselling, legal information, medical, psychological and material assistance and employment, and educational and training opportunities, but this may only be directed at women who meet the definition of trafficking in the Protocol and who are prepared to testify against their traffickers. States which have signed up to the Protocol have sought to fulfil their responsibilities in varying ways.

Korea has a broad definition of 'victims' and has introduced broad-ranging services to support them. Thus in 2006 Korea had 35 support centres and 29 counselling centres for victims/survivors of sex trafficking, 2 self-support centres for those leaving prostitution, and 2 shelters for foreign women, and there were plans to establish more facilities in the near future. Moreover the Ministry of Justice set up a Johns' School to 'educate and deter sex buyers' in 2005. Some states interpret their responsibilities in a more limited fashion. Services for victims need to be extended to those who do not meet definitions of 'trafficking' if the harmful practice of prostitution is to be brought to an end without further disadvantaging

those subject to its harms. There are many good practice examples internationally of service provision for prostituted women which goes well beyond harm minimization and is directed at getting women out. One is SAGE, Standing Against Global Exploitation, founded by prostitution survivors in San Francisco, which offers a comprehensive range of services which form part of court mandated diversion programmes for women arrested for prostitution offences, as well as prison outreach programmes (www.sagesf.org). SAGE also famously offers a 'John school' or perpetrator programme for prostitutes, and its model programme has been adopted in a number of other jurisdictions, sometimes with training from the SAGE team.

Education against the demand

The 'John school' offers one example of how education against the demand can usefully be carried out. In the John school model, prostitutes who are arrested can divert onto a course where they are educated by trainers and by women who have been prostituted about the harms that their behaviour causes. It does not discriminate between prostitutes who buy trafficked women and those who buy other prostituted women. It not only serves to re-educate those prostitutes who take the course but serves to raise community awareness. Effective education against the demand needs to be directed towards men and boys who have not yet embarked upon prostitution behaviour, and at breaking through the indifference of those who have.

The Coalition Against Trafficking in Women Asia Pacific (CATWAP), based in Manila, provides some excellent examples of how this can be undertaken (Enriquez, n.d.). CATWAP's initiatives include group discussions and weekend training courses and public education advertisements. They are aimed at 'Rethinking Masculinity' so that young men will change the attitudes towards women which enable them to engage in prostitution behaviour. They involve criticism of gender roles and detailed and thoroughgoing self-reflection on the way that male sexuality and use of prostituted women are constructed through questions about motivations and how their behaviour makes them feel. A short television infomercial depicts a group of boys outside the door to a bedroom. One boy enters the room, where a girl sits on a bed. A thought bubble from his head says, 'She could be my sister', and the boy retreats (*ibid.*).

The CATWAP boys' education programme stems from the understanding that prostitution behaviour is just one manifestation of male dominant sexuality. Aggressive, compulsive, risk-taking masculine sexual behaviour in which 'men are much more likely to take risks than responsibility' has been recognized as the driving force behind the global AIDS epidemic (Foreman, 1999, p. 36). In this respect, Martin Foreman asks 'whether millions of men across the social and geographical spectrum can be persuaded to see abstinence, fidelity and the use of condoms as desirable and viable alternatives' to their learned masculine patterns (*ibid.*, p. 35). He argues that men 'need the opportunity to discuss what it means "to be a man", why they use their penis, mouth or anus in certain ways' (*ibid.*, p. 45). He stresses the importance of the men 'who hold the reins of power in society' the 'parliamentarians, religious leaders, newspaper editors and broadcast producers, as fathers and husbands' using their influence and resources to open up the debate on how men can change because these men are the 'custodians of tradition' (*ibid.*).

Public education against the demand needs to go further, however, than working directly with boys. Campaigns which resemble those commonly undertaken by local and national authorities against violence against women, particularly 'zero-tolerance' campaigns, would be likely to be effective against prostitution behaviour too (see, for example, the Zero Tolerance Trust website at www.zerotolerance.org.uk). Harmful attitudes which construct girls and women as suitable objects for sexual use underlie the harmful cultural practice of prostitution and need a more general approach to prohibiting degrading images of women in advertising, the media and public spaces (Rosewarne, 2005, 2007).

Prostitution and development

All of the initiatives that we have looked at above can most easily be implemented in rich countries where women are not so vulnerable to being conscripted into prostitution through sheer economic necessity. It is important to note, however, that some of the most innovative initiatives are being developed in less developed nations such as South Africa, the Philippines and Korea as well. The dire necessity that drives many women into prostitution needs to be addressed at the practical level of livelihood and job creation concurrently with measures to reduce the demand.

The processes of economic development and structural adjustment that are being employed in many countries create economic misery for women as their traditional forms of subsistence and their jobs are destroyed. Currently, in countries such as China, millions of women are being prostituted because the processes of development are geared to providing economic resources suited to male workers and women's opportunities are not considered. There is a tendency in much of the literature on prostitution to see economic development and jobs for women as necessary before prostitution can be addressed. This is the 'after the revolution' position, and it enables the global industry of prostitution to burgeon freely. Programmes to create dignified labour should exist alongside the measures considered above to eliminate prostitution. The International Labour Organization's understanding of the sort of work that women and men require, as expressed in the 'mains aims', is instructive: 'The International Labour Organization (ILO) is devoted to reducing poverty, achieving fair globalization, and advancing opportunities for women and men to obtain decent and productive work in conditions of freedom, equity, security and human dignity' (International Labour Organization, n.d.). As we have seen in this book, prostitution rather clearly does not fit with these ideals. It cannot offer equity, security or human dignity, and it is discriminatory to accept prostitution as reasonable work for women that should be tolerated or allowed to form the basis of a hugely profitable global market sector. Prostitution is a harmful cultural practice that both emerges from and embodies women's traditional subordination. It has no part to play in 'fair globalization'.

References

- ABC News (2007a). 'Motels Urge Prostitution Laws Rethink'. *ABC News*, 8 March.
- ABC News (2007b). 'Brothel Owner Bribed Council Staffer'. *ABC News*, 15 May.
- Adult Video News (2002). 'The 25 Events that Shaped the First 25 Years of Video Porn'. *Adult Video News*, August.
- Adult Video News (2005). 'Fresh Line/Titles'. *Adult Video News*, May.
- Aftenposten (2007). 'Norway – Buying Sex Can Yield Jail Term'. *Aftenposten*, 4 July.
- Agence France-Presse (2004). 'Strippers “bare all for visas”', 29 July. From correspondents in Toronto, Canada.
- Agrawal, Anuja (ed.) (2006a). *Migrant Women and Work*. New Delhi/Thousand Oaks/London: Sage Publications.
- Agrawal, Anuja (2006b). 'Family, Migration and Prostitution: The Case of the Bedia Community of North India'. In Agrawal, Anuja (ed.), *Migrant Women and Work*. New Delhi/Thousand Oaks/London: Sage Publications, pp. 177–94.
- Agustin, Laura (2002). 'Challenging “place”: Leaving Home for Sex'. *Development*, 45.1, Spring: 110–17.
- Agustin, Laura (2004). 'Daring Border-Crossers: A Different Vision of Migrant Women'. In Day, Sophie and Ward, Helen (eds), *Sex Work, Mobility and Health in Europe*. London: Kegan Paul, pp. 86–94.
- Agustin, Laura (2006a). 'The Disappearing of a Migration Category: Migrants Who Sell Sex'. *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies*, 32.1 (January): 29–48.
- Agustin, Laura (2006b). 'Contributing to “Development”: Money Made Selling Sex'. *Research for Sex Work*, 9: 8–11.
- Agustin, Laura (2007). *Sex at the Margins. Migration, Labour Markets and the Rescue Industry*. London: Zed Press.
- Ahmed, Nabila (2007). 'Industry Prospers as Lockdown Becomes Lay Down'. *The Age*, 4 September. Melbourne.

- Albanese, Jay (2007). 'A Criminal Network Approach to Understanding and Measuring Trafficking in Human Beings'. In Savona, Ernesto U. and Stefanizzi, Sonia (eds), *Measuring Human Trafficking. Complexities and Pitfalls*. New York: Springer, pp. 55–71.
- Ali, Shamima (2006). *Violence Against the Girl Child in the Pacific Islands Region*. United Nations Division for the Advancement of Women (DAW). In collaboration with UNICEF. Expert Group Meeting. Elimination of all forms of discrimination and violence against the girl child. EGM/DVGC/2006/EP.14.
- American Psychological Association (2007). *Report of the APA Task Force on the Sexualization of Girls*. Washington, DC: American Psychological Association.
- Amnesty International (2004). *It's in Our Hands. Stop Violence Against Women*. London: Amnesty International.
- Amnesty International (2006a). *Albania. Violence Against Women in the Family: 'It's not her shame'*. London: Amnesty International.
- Amnesty International (2006b). *Papua New Guinea. Violence Against Women: Not Inevitable, Never Acceptable!* London: Amnesty International.
- Amnesty International (2006c). *Mexico. Violence Against Women and Justice Denied in Mexico State*. London: Amnesty International.
- Amnesty International (2006d). *Jamaica. Sexual Violence Against Women and Girls in Jamaica: 'Just a Little Sex'*. London: Amnesty International.
- Andaya, Barbara Watson (1998). 'From Temporary Wife to Prostitute: Sexuality and Economic Change in Early Modern Southeast Asia'. *Journal of Women's History*, 9.4: 11–35.
- Anderson, Bridget and O'Connell Davidson, Julia (2003). *Is Trafficking in Human Beings Demand Driven? A Multi-Country Pilot Study*. Geneva: International Organization for Migration.
- Anonymous (2005). *A Woman in Berlin. Diary 20 April 1945 to 22 June 1945*. London: Virago.
- Asian Human Rights Commission (2007). 'India: Women Sold in Rajasthan Open Markets', 18 July; www.ahrchk.net/statements/mainfile.php/2006statements/1119/.
- Australian, The* (2006). 'Jail for Rape of Stripper'. *Weekend Australian*, 8–9 July: 9.
- Barclay, Ingrid (2001). 'Interactive Processes in Brothel Prostitution'. Honours thesis, Department of Political Science, University of Melbourne.
- Barrett, Beth (2007). 'It's a \$12 Billion Industry, but the Profits Go Elsewhere'. *Daily News of Los Angeles*, 5 June.
- Barry, Kathleen (1979). *Female Sexual Slavery*. New York: New York University Press.
- Barry, Kathleen (1995). *The Prostitution of Sexuality*. New York: New York University Press.

- Barwise, Katy, Rijks, Barbara and Houlding, Jerotich Seii (2006). *Breaking the Cycle of Vulnerability: Responding to the Health Needs of Trafficked Women in East and Central Africa*. Pretoria, South Africa: International Organization for Migration Regional Office, Southern Africa.
- Batdorff, Alison and Kusumoto, Hana (2006). 'Despite Ban, Yokosuka Sex Trade Flourishes'. *Stars and Stripes*, 22 October. Pacific edition.
- Beckett, Claire and Macey, Marie (2001). 'Race, Gender and Sexuality: The Oppression of Multiculturalism'. *Women's Studies International Forum*, 24.3-4 (May-August): 309-19.
- Bell, Dan (2008). 'Can You Outlaw the Oldest Profession?' *BBC News*, 24 February.
- Belleau, Marie-Claire (2003). 'Mail-Order Brides in a Global World'. *Albany Law Review*, 67: 595-607.
- Bermant, Chaim (1975). *Point of Arrival: A Study of London's East End*. London: Eyre Methuen.
- Bernard, Jessie (1982). *The Future of Marriage*. New Haven, CT: Yale University Press.
- Bindman, Jo (1998). 'An International Perspective on Slavery in the Sex Industry'. In Kempadoo, Kamala and Doezema, Jo (eds), *Global Sex Workers. Rights, Resistance, and Redefinition*. New York: Routledge, pp. 65-8.
- Bishop, Ryan and Robinson, Lillian S. (1998). *Night Market: Sexual Cultures and the Thai Economic Miracle*. London: Routledge.
- Blackhurst, Chris and Gatton, Adrian (2002). 'A Gangland Killing, Lap Dancers Who Are Said to Sell Sex and the Criminal Past of the Man behind the Spearmint Rhino Empire'. *Evening Standard*, 16 September. London.
- Brace, Laura and O'Connell Davidson, Julia (2000). 'Minding the Gap: General and Substantive Theorizing on Power and Exploitation'. *Signs: Journal of Women in Culture and Society*, 25.4: 1046-50.
- Brady, Tom (2003). 'Crime Czars Targeted in Swoop on Lap Dance Clubs'. *Irish Independent*, 7 June. Independent Newspapers Ireland Ltd.
- Brock, Deborah, Gilles, Kara, Oliver, Chantelle and Monk (2000). 'Migrant Sex Work: A Roundtable Analysis'. *Canadian Woman Studies* 20.2, Summer: 84-91.
- Brooks, Siobhan (n.d.). 'Interview with Dawn Passar'; <http://www.shapingsf.org/ezine/womens/dancers/main/html>.
- Brownmiller, Susan (1975). *Against Our Will. Men, Women and Rape*. London: Secker and Warburg.
- Brush, Lisa D. (1993). 'Violent Acts and Injurious Outcomes in Married Couples: Methodological Issues in the National Survey of Families and Households'. In Bart, Pauline B. and Moran, Eileen Geil (eds), *Violence Against Women. The Bloody Footprints*. Newbury Park, CA: Sage Publications, pp. 240-51.

- Brussa, Licia (n.d.). 'Tampep Report on Intervention Models for Migrant Sex Workers in Europe'. Europap website; <http://www.europap.net/>.
- Bunting, Annie (2000). 'Child Marriage'. In Askin, Kelly D. and Koenig, Dorean M. (eds), *Women and International Human Rights Law*, vol. 2. New York: Transnational Publishers, Inc., pp. 669–96.
- Butler, Judith (1990). *Gender Trouble: Feminism and the Subversion of Identity*. New York: Routledge.
- Callinan, Rory (2006). 'Generation Exploited'. *Time*, 19 March.
- Cambodia Daily (2007). 'UNICEF Outraged by Cambodian Child Porn Trade'. *Cambodia Daily*, 11 January.
- Campbell, Shirley, Perkins, Althea and Mohammed, Patricia (1999). "'Come to Jamaica and Feel All Right". *Tourism and the Sex Trade*'. In Kempadoo, Kamala (ed.), *Sun, Sex, and Gold. Tourism and Sex Work in the Caribbean*. Lanham, MD: Rowman and Littlefield, pp. 125–56.
- Cape Argus (2007). South Africa: High Cost of Paying for Sex. *Africa News*, 15 December.
- Canyon, Christy (2004). *Lights, Camera, Sex! An Autobiography*. Sherman Oaks, CA: Publisher Christy Canyon.
- Carter, April (1996). 'Women, Military Service and Citizenship'. In Sullivan, Barbara and Whitehouse, Gillian (eds), *Gender, Politics and Citizenship in the 1990s*. Sydney, Australia: UNSW Press.
- Carter, Vednita (1999). Breaking Free in Minnesota. In Hughes, Donna M. and Roche, Claire (eds), *Making the Harm Visible. Global Sexual Exploitation of Women and Girls*. Kingston, RI: Coalition Against Trafficking in Women, pp. 287–94.
- CBS News (2005). 'British Go Stag in Eastern Europe'. *CBS News*, 3 December. New York.
- Chapkis, Wendy (1997). *Live Sex Acts: Women Performing Erotic Labour*. New York: Routledge.
- Charlesworth, Hilary (1995). 'Human Rights as Men's Rights'. In Peters, Julie and Wolper, Andrea (eds), *Women's Rights, Human Rights: International Feminist Perspectives*. New York: Routledge, pp. 103–13.
- Charsley, Katharine (2005). 'Unhappy Husbands: Masculinity and Migration in Transnational Pakistani Marriages'. *Journal Royal Anthropological Institute*, 11: 85–105.
- Child Welfare Group (2003). 'As if they were watching my body': *A Preliminary Study into the Accessibility of Pornography by Minors in Cambodia*. Cambodia: World Vision.
- Chivers, Tom (2008). 'Sex and Porn Major Causes of Debt Woe'. *The Age*, 24 January: 10. Melbourne.
- Clift, Simon and Forrest, Simon (2000). 'Tourism and the Sexual Ecology of Gay Men'. In Clift, Simon and Carter, Simon (eds), *Tourism and Sex*.

- Culture, Commerce and Coercion*. London and New York: Pinter, pp. 179–99.
- Clift, Stephen and Carter, Simon (eds) (2000). *Tourism and Sex. Culture, Commerce and Coercion*. New York: Pinter.
- Coalition Against Trafficking in Women (2006). Statement to Third session of the Conference of the Parties to the United Nations Convention against Transnational Organized Crime, Vienna, 9–18 October.
- Coetsee, Rowena (2007). ‘Memorial Celebrates Life of Porn Industry Icon’. *Contra Costa Times*, 20 July. California.
- Cook, Kathryn (2007). ‘Joining Trend, Bulgaria Won’t Allow Prostitution’. *New York Times*, 6 October.
- Cooke, Amber (1987). ‘Stripping: Who Calls the Tune?’ In Bell, Laurie (ed.), *Good Girls, Bad Girls. Sex Trade Workers and Feminists Face to Face*. Toronto: The Women’s Press.
- Corkill, Michael (2005). ‘Escorts Sell Most Illegal Sex’. *Courier Mail*, 5 December. Brisbane.
- Correspondents in Vienna (2008). ‘Human Trafficking Industry Worth \$31 Billion’, 16 February; <http://www.news.com.au/story/0,23599,23223293-23109,00.html>.
- Coy, Maddy, Horvath, Miranda and Kelly, Liz (2007). ‘It’s Just Like Going to the Supermarket’: Men Buying Sex in East London. Report for Safe Exit. London: Child and Woman Abuse Studies Unit, London Metropolitan University.
- Currie, Brian (2006). ‘Lap Dancing Boosts City by GBP 6 M a Year’. *Evening Times*, 26 April. Glasgow.
- Dahles, Heidi and Bras, Karin (1999). ‘Entrepreneurs in Romance. Tourism in Indonesia’. *Annals of Tourism Research*, 26.2: 267–93.
- Daley, S. (2001). ‘New Rights for Dutch Prostitutes, but No Gain’. *New York Times*, 12 August.
- Dasi Hamkke Center (2006). *Out of the Trap, Hope One Step. Case Studies of Prostitution and Sex Trafficking in Korea*. Seoul, South Korea: Dasi Hamkke Center, Seoul Metropolitan Government. Center for Victims and Survivors of Sex Trafficking.
- Davis, Kathleen (2006). ‘Brides, Bruises and the Border: The Trafficking of North Korean Women into China’. *SAIS Review*, XXVI.1: 131–41.
- Day, Sophie and Ward, Helen (eds) (2004). *Sex Work, Mobility and Health in Europe*. London: Kegan Paul.
- Deem, Rosemary (1999). ‘How Do We Get out of the Ghetto? Strategies for Research on Gender and Leisure for the Twenty First Century’. *Leisure Studies*, 18: 161–78.
- Defeis, Elizabeth F. (2000). ‘Draft Convention Against Sexual Exploitation’. In Askin, Kelly D. and Koenig, Doreen M (eds), *Women and International Human Rights Law*, Vol. 2. New York: Transnational Publishers, Inc., pp. 319–48.

- Delphy, Christine (1984). *Close to Home: a Materialist Analysis of Women's Oppression*. Amherst, MA: University of Massachusetts Press.
- Demleitner, Nora V. (2000). 'In Good Times and Bad: The Obligation to Protect "Mail-Order Brides"'. In Askin, Kelly D. and Koenig, Dorean M. (eds), *Women and International Human Rights Law*, Vol. 2. New York: Transnational Publishers, Inc., pp. 613–52.
- Denfeld, Rene (1995). *The New Victorians: A Young Woman's Challenge to the Old Feminist Order*. St Leonards, NSW, Australia: Allen and Unwin.
- DeRiviere, Linda (2006). 'A Human Capital Methodology for Estimating the Lifelong Personal Costs of Young Women Leaving the Sex Trade'. *Feminist Economics*, 12.3 (July): 367–402.
- Deutchman, Iva (1998). It's (Not) Just the Victim in Me: Gender and Power in the 1990s. *Women and Politics*, 19.1: 1–18.
- Di Nicola, Andrea and Cauduro, Andrea (2007). 'Review of Official Statistics on Trafficking in Human Beings for Sexual Exploitation and their Validity in the 25 EU Member States from Official Statistics to Estimates of the Phenomenon'. In Savona, Ernesto U. and Stefanizzi, Sonia (eds), *Measuring Human Trafficking. Complexities and Pitfalls*. New York: Springer, pp. 73–94.
- Dickson, Sandra (2004). *Sex in the City. Mapping Commercial Sex Across London*. London: The Poppy Project.
- Dines, Gail and Jensen, Robert (2007). 'Who Wants to Be a Porn Star'. Slide show; <http://www.myspace.com/stoppornculture>.
- Distor, Emere and Hunt, Dee (1996). *Confronting Sexual Exploitation*. Report of the participants from Australia and New Zealand, exposure/ study tour to the Philippines June 19–July 4. Brisbane, Australia: Centre for Philippine Concerns (CPCA).
- Ditmore, Melissa (2007). 'For Decriminalization'. In *Debating Legalized Prostitution*; humantrafficking.org/updates/643.
- Doezema, Jo (1998a). 'Forced to Choose. Beyond the Voluntary v. Forced Prostitution Dichotomy'. In Kempadoo, Kamala and Doezema, Jo (eds), *Global Sex Workers. Rights, Resistance, and Redefinition*. New York: Routledge, pp. 34–50.
- Doezema, Jo (1998b). 'Interviews NWSP Coordinator, Cheryl Overs'. In Kempadoo, Kamala and Jo Doezema (eds), *Global Sex Workers. Rights, Resistance, and Redefinition*. New York and London: Routledge, pp. 204–9.
- Doezema, Jo (2001). 'Ouch! Western Feminists' "Wounded Attachment" to the "Third World Prostitute"'. *Feminist Review*, 67, Spring: 16–38.
- Dolgopol, Ustinia (1995). 'Women's Voices, Women's Pain'. *Human Rights Quarterly*, 17.1: 127–54.
- Dolgopol, Ustinia (1996). 'Pragmatism, International Law and Women's Bodies'. *Australian Feminist Studies*, 11.24: 242–72.

- Donlon, Jon Griffin (1998). 'A Travel Model in the Runway Setting: Strip-Tease as Exotic Destination'. In Opperman, Martin (ed.), *Sex Tourism and Prostitution. Aspects of Leisure, Recreation, and Work*. New York: Cognizant Communications Corporation, pp. 116–22.
- Dworkin, Andrea (1981). *Pornography: Men Possessing Women*. New York: Perigree.
- Dworkin, Andrea (1983). *Right-Wing Women: The Politics of Domesticated Females*. London: The Women's Press.
- Economist, The* (2005). 'Special Report: The Conundrum of the Glass Ceiling – Women in Business'. *Economist*, 376, 8436 (23 July): 67.
- Eidler, David (n.d.). *A Guide to Best Practice. Occupational Health and Safety in the Australian Sex Industry*. Canberra, Australia: Scarlet Alliance.
- Egan, Danielle (2006). *Dancing for Dollars and Paying for Love*. New York: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Ehrenreich, Barbara and Hochschild, Arlie (2003). *Global Woman. Nannies, Maids and Sex Workers in the New Economy*. London: Granta.
- Ekberg, Gunilla (2004). 'The Swedish Law that Prohibits the Purchase of Sexual Services: Best Practices for Prevention of Prostitution and Trafficking in Human Beings'. *Violence Against Women*, 10.10: 1187–1218.
- Ekberg, Gunilla (2007). Speech at Conference, Prostitution, Trafficking and Demand: Making the Links, organized by Glasgow Inter-Agency Group on Trafficking, 5 December.
- Enloe, Cynthia (1983). *Does Khaki Become You*. London: Pluto Press.
- Enloe, Cynthia (1989). *Bananas, Beaches and Bases. Making Feminist Sense of International Politics*. London: Pandora.
- Enloe, Cynthia (2000). *Maneuvers. The International Politics of Militarizing Women's Lives*. Berkeley, Los Angeles and London: University of California Press.
- Enloe, Cynthia (2004). *The Curious Feminist. Searching for Women in a New Age of Empire*. Berkeley, CA: The University of California Press.
- Enriquez, Jean (n.d.). 'Rethinking Masculinity: Educating Young Men to Reduce the Demand Side of Trafficking'. Manila: CATWAP; http://www.catw-ap.org/?page_id=45.
- Erickson, David John and Tewksbury, Richard (2000). 'The "Gentlemen" in the Club: A Typology of Strip Club Patrons'. *Deviant Behavior*, 21: 271–93.
- Eros Magazine (2006). Sting's Strip Club Plans. *Eros Magazine*, 23 May; http://www.eros.org.au/index.php?option=com_content&task=view&cid=74&Itemid=70.
- Expatica (2006). 'Ladies of Pleasure or Sex Slaves?' *Expatica*, 7 September; www.expatica.com.
- Farley, Melissa (ed.) (2003). *Prostitution, Trafficking, and Traumatic Stress*. Binghamton, NY: Haworth Maltreatment and Trauma Press.

- Farley, Melissa (2004). '“Bad for the Body, Bad for the Heart”: Prostitution Harms Women Even if Legalized or Decriminalized'. *Violence Against Women*, 10.10 (October): 1087–125.
- Farley, Melissa (2006). 'Prostitution, Trafficking, and Cultural Amnesia: What We Must Not Know in Order to Keep the Business of Sexual Exploitation Running Smoothly'. *Yale Journal of Law and Feminism*, 18: 109–44.
- Farley, Melissa (2007). *Prostitution and Trafficking in Nevada. Making the Connections*. San Francisco: Prostitution Research and Education.
- Farley, Melissa and Lynne, Jacqueline (2004). 'Prostitution in Vancouver: Pimping Women and the Colonization of First Nations'. In Stark, Chris and Whisnant, Rebecca (eds), *Not for Sale. Feminists Resisting Prostitution and Pornography*. Melbourne: Spinifex Press, pp. 106–30.
- Farley, Melissa, Baral, Isin, Mevals, Kinemine and Sezzin, Ufuk (1998). 'Prostitution in Five Countries: Violence and Post-Traumatic Stress Disorder'. *Feminism and Psychology*, 8.4: 405–26.
- Farr, Kathryn (2004). *Sex Trafficking. The Global Market in Women and Children*. New York: Worth Publishers.
- Fawkes, Janelle (Scarlet Alliance) (2003). Submission to the Parliamentary Joint Committee on the Australian Crime Commission. Inquiry into Trafficking in Women for Sexual Servitude.
- Fergus, Larissa (2005). *Trafficking in Women for Sexual Exploitation*. Melbourne: Australian Centre for the Study of Sexual Assault. Briefing No. 5, June.
- Finkelhor, David and Yllo, Kersti (1985). *License to Rape (Sexual Abuse of Wives)*. New York: Holt, Rinehart and Winston.
- Fleming, Grant (2006). 'Asian Gangs Exploiting Prostitution Laws – Copeland'. New Zealand Press Association, 28 September.
- Fletcher, Richard (2002). 'Desmond Laid Bare'. *Telegraph*, 26 October.
- Foreman, Martin (ed.) (1999). *AIDS and Men. Taking Risks or Taking Responsibility?* London: The Panos Institute and Zed Books.
- Forster, Nick (1999). 'Another “Glass Ceiling”? The Experiences of Women Professionals and Managers on International Assignments'. *Gender, Work and Organization*, 6.2 (April): 79–90.
- Frances, Raelene (2007). *Selling Sex. A Hidden History of Prostitution*. Sydney, Australia: University of New South Wales Press.
- Frank, Katherine (2002a). *G-Strings and Sympathy. Strip Club Regulars and Male Desire*. Durham, NC, and London: Duke University Press.
- Frank, Katherine (2002b). 'Stripping, Starving, and the Politics of Ambiguous Pleasure'. In Johnson, Merri Lisa (ed.), *Jane Sexes It Up. True Confessions of Feminist Desire*. New York and London: Four Walls Eight Windows, pp. 171–206.
- Frank, Katherine (2003). '“Just Trying to Relax”: Masculinity, Masculinizing Practices, and Strip Club Regulars'. *Journal of Sex Research* 40.1 (February): 61–75.

- Fremson, Ruth (2006). 'Dead Bachelors in Remote China Still Find Wives'. *New York Times*, 5 October.
- Friday, Laura Barton (2005). 'It's All about What You Want and When You Want It'. *Guardian*, 2 December.
- Fryer, Peter (1989). *Black People in the British Empire. An Introduction*. London: Pluto Press.
- Gavey, Nicola (1992). 'Technologies and Effects of Heterosexual Coercion'. *Feminism & Psychology*, 2: 325–51.
- Gill, Rosalind C. (2007). 'Critical Respect: The Difficulties and Dilemmas of Agency and "Choice" for Feminism. A Reply to Duits and van Zoonen'. *European Journal of Women's Studies*, 14.1: 69–80.
- Gjובה, Evelina (1990). 'Confronting the Liberal Lies about Prostitution'. In Leidholt, Dorchon and Raymond, Janice G. (eds), *The Sexual Liberals and the Attack on Feminism*. New York: Pergamon Press.
- Gorkoff, Kelly and Runner, Jane (eds) (2003). *Being Heard. The Experiences of Young Women in Prostitution*. Winnipeg, Canada: Fernwood Publishing; Winnipeg, Canada: RESOLVE (Research and Education for Solutions to Violence and Abuse).
- Graham, D.L.R., with Rawlings, E. and Rigsby, R. (1994). *Loving to Survive: Sexual Terror, Men's Violence, and Women's Lives*. New York: New York University Press.
- Grant, Rebecca (1991). 'The Sources of Gender Bias in IR Theory'. In Grant, Rebecca and Newland, Kathleen (eds), *Gender and International Relations*. Bloomington, Indianapolis, IN: Indianapolis University Press, pp. 8–26.
- Griffith, Chris (2007). Twilight at Noon. Prostitution: 20 Years on from Fitzgerald. Online streamed video. *Courier Mail*.
- Guelph Mercury* (2004). 'Stripper Shortage Reflects Industry Demands for More Demeaning Acts, Professor Says'. *Guelph Mercury*, 26 November. Ontario.
- Guinn, David E. and DiCaro, Julie (eds) (2007). *Pornography: Driving the Demand in International Sex Trafficking*. Los Angeles, CA: Captive Daughters Media.
- Haeri, Shahla (1992). 'Temporary Marriage and the State in Iran: An Islamic Discourse on Female Sexuality'. *Social Research*, 9.1: 201–23.
- Haines, Fiona (2005). *Globalization and Regulatory Character: Regulatory Reform after the Kader Toy Factory Fire*. Aldershot, UK: Ashgate.
- Hall, Michael C. (1998). 'The Legal and Political Dimensions of Sex Tourism: The Case of Australia's Child Sex Tourism Legislation'. In Opperman, Martin (ed.), *Sex Tourism and Prostitution. Aspects of Leisure, Recreation, and Work*. New York: Cognizant Communications Corporation.
- Halliday, Claire (2007). 'Naked Ambition'. *Sunday Age*, 15 July: 12. Melbourne.

- Hamilton, Cicely (1909). *Marriage as a Trade*. London: Chapman and Hall.
- Hamilton, Jane (2005). 'Lap-Dance King Stabbed at Club. Cops Link Knife Attack to Gangland Feud for Control of Capital's Sex Industry'. *Sunday Mail*, 17 April. Scottish Daily Record and Sunday Mail Ltd.
- Hammond, Claudia (2008). 'I'm Just Here for Survival'. *Guardian*, 9 January.
- Hanna, Judith Lynne (1998). 'Undressing the First Amendment and Corsetting the Striptease Dancer'. *TDR, The Drama Review* (Cambridge, MA), 42.2: 38–6.
- Harrington, Carole (2005). 'The Politics of Rescue. Peacekeeping and Anti-trafficking Programmes in Bosnia-Herzegovina and Kosovo'. *International Feminist Journal of Politics*, 7.2: 175–206.
- Harris, Trudy (2005). 'Forced Marriage "Is Like Sex Trade"'. *The Australian*, 2 August: 3. Sydney.
- Harrison, Frances (2007). 'Iran Talks up Temporary Marriages'. *BBC News*, 2 June, Tehran; http://news.bbc.co.uk/go/pr/fr/-/e/hi/middle_east/6714885.stm.
- Haughey, Nuala (2003). 'Lap-dancing Cannot Shed Seedy Side'. *Irish Times*, 7 June.
- Hedge, Mike (2007). 'Police Felled by "Vampire" – Boy Who Grew up in Brisbane Brothel at Centre of Crime Scandal'. *Courier Mail*, 17 November. Brisbane.
- Henley, Jon (2003). 'Parisian Store Hopes Striptease Plan Will Take off'. *Guardian*, 6 November.
- Hennink, Monique and Simkhada, Padam (2004). *Sex Trafficking in Nepal: Context and Process*. Opportunities and Choices Working Paper No. 11. Division of Social Statistics, University of Southampton, UK.
- Herman, Judith L. (1992). *Trauma and Recovery*. New York: Basic Books.
- Hobson, J.S. Perry and Heung, Vincent (1998). 'Business Travel and the Emergence of the Modern Chinese Concubine'. In Opperman, Martin (ed.), *Sex Tourism and Prostitution. Aspects of Leisure, Recreation, and Work*. New York: Cognizant Communications Corporation, pp. 132–43.
- Hesen, Eric (2007). 'Pimping Ban in Amsterdam', 21 September; www.radionetherlands.nl.
- Hochschild, Arlie (1983). *The Managed Heart: Commercialization of Human Feeling*. Berkeley, CA: University of California Press.
- Hoigard, Cecilie and Finstad, Liv (1992). *Backstreets. Prostitution, Money and Love*. Cambridge: Polity Press.
- Holden, Kate (2005). *In My Skin*. Melbourne: The Text Publishing Company, p. 172.
- Hollis, Patricia (1979). *Women in Public Places*. London: Allen and Unwin.

- Holsopple, Kelly (1998). *Strip Club Testimony*. The Freedom and Justice Center for Prostitution Resources: A Program of the Volunteers of America of Minnesota. 2825 East Lake Street, Minneapolis MN 55406.
- Hopkins, Brent (2007). 'Doing Porn an Easy Job to Get but Loaded with Downsides'. *LA Daily News*, 3 June.
- Hotaling, Norma (1999). 'The First Offender Prostitution Program in San Francisco'. In Hughes, Donna M. and Roche, Claire (eds), *Making the Harm Visible. Global Sexual Exploitation of Women and Girls*. Kingston, RI: Coalition Against Trafficking in Women, pp. 299–313.
- Huggler, Justin (2006). 'A Slave Market in Brides'. *Independent*, 15 April. London.
- Hughes, Donna M. (2000). '“Welcome to the Rape Camp”. Sexual Exploitation and the Internet in Cambodia'. *Journal of Sexual Aggression*, 6, double issue: 29–51.
- Hughes, Donna M. (1999). 'The Internet and the Global Prostitution Industry'. In Hawthorne, Susan and Klein, Renate (eds), *Cyberfeminism. Connectivity, Critique and Creativity*. Melbourne: Spinifex, pp. 157–84.
- Hurt, Michael (2005). 'Sex Business Lives on Despite Crackdown'. *Korea Herald*, 27 May.
- IBISWorld (2007). *Sexual Services in Australia*. Q9528. IBISWorld Pty Ltd.
- International Labour Organization (n.d.). Main Aims. Home page of the ILO; <http://www.ilo.org/global/index.htm>.
- IRIN (2005). *Yemen: Social Impact of Temporary Marriages*. IRIN. UN Office for the Coordination of Humanitarian Affairs, 7 July.
- IRIN (2006). *In Egypt, Minors Sold for Prostitution under Guise of Marriage*. IRIN. UN Office for the Coordination of Humanitarian Affairs, 17 November.
- IRIN (2007). *Afghanistan: New Contract to Curb Child Marriages*. IRIN. UN Office for the Coordination of Humanitarian Affairs, 14 March.
- Jackson, Margaret (1994). *The Real Facts of Life: Feminism and the Politics of Sexuality c1850–1940*. London: Taylor and Francis.
- Jeffreys, Sheila (1985a). *The Spinster and Her Enemies: Feminism and Sexuality 1880–1930*. London: The Women's Press; republished 1997 by Spinifex Press, Melbourne.
- Jeffreys, Sheila (1985b). 'Prostitution'. In McNeil, Sandra and Rhodes, Dusty (eds), *Women Against Violence Against Women*. London: Onlywomen Press.
- Jeffreys, Sheila (ed.) (1987). *The Sexuality Debates*. London: Routledge; republished 2001.
- Jeffreys, Sheila (1990/91). *Anticlimax. A Feminist Perspective on the Sexual Revolution*. London: The Women's Press; New York: New York University Press.
- Jeffreys, Sheila (1993). 'Consent and the Politics of Sexuality'. *Current Issues in Criminal Justice* (Australian Institute of Criminology, Sydney): 173–83.

- Jeffreys, Sheila (1995). 'Representing the Prostitute'. *Feminism and Psychology*, 5: 539–42.
- Jeffreys, Sheila (1997). *The Idea of Prostitution*. Melbourne: Spinifex.
- Jeffreys, Sheila (1999). 'Globalising Sexual Exploitation: Sex Tourism and the Traffic in Women'. *Leisure Studies*, 18: 179–96.
- Jeffreys, Sheila (2000a). 'Challenging the Child/Adult Distinction in Theory and Practice on Prostitution'. *International Feminist Journal of Politics*, 2:3, Autumn: 359–79.
- Jeffreys, Sheila (2000b). 'Body Art and Social Status'. *Feminism and Psychology*, 10.4: 409–29.
- Jeffreys, Sheila (2002). 'No Hiding Place: Child Sex Tourism and the Role of Extraterritorial Legislation'. A Review. *Contemporary Sociology*, 31.6 (November): 687–88.
- Jeffreys, Sheila (2004). 'Prostitution as a Harmful Cultural Practice'. In Stark, Christine and Whisnant, Rebecca (eds), *Not For Sale. Feminists Resisting Prostitution and Pornography*. Melbourne: Spinifex, pp. 386–99.
- Jeffreys, Sheila (2005). *Beauty and Misogyny: Harmful Cultural Practices in the West*. London: Routledge.
- Jeffreys, Sheila (2006). 'The Traffic in Women: Human Rights Violation or Migration for Work?' In Agrawal, Anuja (ed.), *Migrant Women and Work*. New Delhi, Thousand Oaks, CA, and London: Sage Publications, pp. 194–217.
- Jeffreys, Sheila (2007). 'Double Jeopardy: Women, the US Military and the War in Iraq'. *Women's Studies International Forum*, 30.1: 16–25.
- Jejeebhoy, Shireen J., Shah, Iqbal and Thapa, Shyam (eds) (2005). *Sex without Consent. Young People in Developing Countries*. London: Zed Press.
- Jeness, Valerie (1993). *Making It Work: The Prostitutes' Rights Movement in Perspective*. New York: Aldine de Gruyter.
- Jenkins, Carol (2006). *HIV/AIDS, Culture, and Sexuality in Papua New Guinea*. Asian Development Bank.
- Jenkins, Carol and Rahman, Habibur (2002). 'Rapidly Changing Conditions in the Brothels of Bangladesh: Impact on HIV/STD'. *AIDS Education and Prevention*, 14, Supplement A: 97–106.
- Jones, Chris (2000). 'Richard Desmond: Express Route to Respectability'. *BBC News*, 25 November. World Edition.
- Jones, Peter, Shears, Peter and Hillier, David (2003). 'Retailing and the Regulatory State: A Case Study of Lap Dancing Clubs in the UK'. *International Journal of Retail and Distribution Management*, 31.4: 214–19.
- Judge, Elizabeth (2007). 'Business Big Shot: Richard Desmond'. *The Times*, 8 October.
- Kangaspunta, Kristiina (2007). 'Collecting Data on Human Trafficking: Availability, Reliability and Comparability of Trafficking Data'.

- In Savona, Ernesto U. and Stefanizzi, Sonia (eds), *Measuring Human Trafficking. Complexities and Pitfalls*. New York: Springer, pp. 27–36.
- Kapur, Ratna (2002). 'The Tragedy of Victimization Rhetoric: Resurrecting the "Native" Subject in International/Post-colonial Feminist Legal Politics'. *Harvard Human Rights Journal*, 15, Spring: 1–37.
- Katterns, Tanya (2007). 'Sex for Sale'. *Dominion Post*, 24 March.
- Kelly, Liz (2000). 'Wars Against Women: Sexual Violence, Sexual Politics and the Militarised State'. In Jacobs, Susie, Jacobson, Ruth and Marchbank, Jennifer (eds), *States of Conflict. Gender, Violence and Resistance*. London: Zed Press.
- Kelly, Liz (2005). *Fertile Fields: Trafficking in Persons in Central Asia*. Vienna: International Organization for Migration.
- Kelly, Liz and Radford, Jill (1990). '“Nothing Really Happened”: The Invalidation of Women's Experiences of Sexual Violence'. *Critical Social Policy*, 10.30: 39–53.
- Kempadoo, Kamala (1998). 'Introduction. Globalizing Sex Workers' Rights'. In Kempadoo, Kamala and Doezema, Jo (eds), *Global Sex Workers. Rights, Resistance, and Redefinition*. New York: Routledge, pp. 1–28.
- Kempadoo, Kamala (ed.) (1999a). *Sun, Sex, and Gold. Tourism and Sex Work in the Caribbean*. Lanham, MD: Rowman and Littlefield.
- Kempadoo, Kamala (1999b). 'Continuities and Change'. In Kempadoo, Kamala (ed.), *Sun, Sex and Gold. Tourism and Sex Work in the Caribbean*. Lanham, MD: Rowman and Littlefield, pp. 3–36.
- Kempadoo, Kamala (2001). 'Freelancers, Temporary Wives, and Beach-Boys. Researching Sex Work in the Caribbean'. *Feminist Review*, 67, Spring: 39–62.
- Kempadoo, Kamala (2004). *Sexing the Caribbean. Gender, Race, and Sexual Labour*. London and New York: Routledge.
- Kempadoo, Kamala and Doezema, Jo (eds) (1998). *Global Sex Workers. Rights, Resistance, and Redefinition*. New York: Routledge.
- Kipnis, Laura (2003). *Bound and Gagged. Pornography and the Politics of Fantasy in America*. Durham, NC: Duke University Press.
- Kong, Travis S.K. (2006). 'What It Feels Like for a Whore: The Body Politics of Women Performing Erotic Labour in Hong Kong'. *Gender, Work and Organization*, 13.5 (September).
- Kotnik, Erica, Czymoniewicz-Klippel, Melina and Hoban, Elizabeth (2007). 'Human Trafficking in Australia: The Challenge of Responding to Suspicious Activities'. *Australian Journal of Social Issues*, 42.3, Spring: 369–86.
- Knudsen, K.A. Weith (1928). *The Woman Question from Ancient Times to the Present Day*. London: Constable.
- Kruhse-MountBurton, Suzy (1995). 'Sex Tourism and Traditional Australian Male Identity'. In Lanfant, Marie-Françoise, Allcock, John B.

- and Bruner, Edward M. (eds). *International Tourism. Identity and Change*. London: Sage, pp. 192–204.
- Laczko, Frank and Gozdiak, Elzbieta (eds) (2005). *Data and Research on Human Trafficking: A Global Survey*. Geneva: International Organization for Migration.
- Lane, Frederick A. (2001). *Obscene Profits: Entrepreneurs of Pornography in the Cyber Age*. New York: Routledge.
- Leading the Charge (2005). 'City Council Puts Restrictions on Strip Clubs, 31 August; www.leadingthecharge.com.
- League of Nations (1933). *Commission of Enquiry into Traffic in Women and Children in the East*. Report to the Council. C.26.M26. Geneva: League of Nations.
- Lerner, Gerda (1987). *The Creation of Patriarchy*. New York: Oxford University Press.
- Levy, Ariel (2005). *Female Chauvinist Pigs: Women and the Rise of Raunch Culture*. New York: Free Press.
- Lewis, Jacqueline (2000). 'Controlling Lap Dancing: Law, Morality, and Sex Work'. In Weitzer, Ronald (ed.), *Sex for Sale. Prostitution, Pornography, and the Sex Industry*. New York: Routledge, pp. 203–16.
- Lie, John (1997). 'The State as Pimp: Prostitution and the Patriarchal State in Japan in the 1940s'. *The Sociological Quarterly*, 38.2: 251–63.
- Liepe-Levinson, Katherine (2002). *Strip Show. Performances of Gender and Desire*. New York: Routledge.
- Lim, Lin Lean (ed.) (1998). *The Sex Sector. The Economic and Social Bases of Prostitution in Southeast Asia*. Geneva: International Labour Office.
- Lironi, Brian (2005). 'Scotch and Vice: Whisky Giants Slammed Over Sales in Sleazy Thai Bars'. *Sunday Mail*, 15 May: 7.
- Lisborg, Anders (2002). 'Bodies across Borders: Prostitution-related Migration from Thailand to Denmark'. In Thorbek, Susanne and Pattanaik, Bandana (eds), *Transnational Prostitution. Changing Global Patterns*. London and New York: Zed Press, pp. 100–20.
- Lole, Stiki (2003). 'Language and the Mediation of Desire in Auki, Malaita, Solomon Islands'. *Culture, Health and Sexuality*, 5.3 (May): 219–35.
- Lords, Traci Elizabeth (2003). *Underneath It All*. New York: HarperCollins.
- Lovelace, Linda (1987). *Ordeal: An Autobiography*. London: Random House.
- Lublin, Joann S. (2006). 'Harassment Issue Roils Firms – Foreigners Find Laws in U.S. Are Stricter than Other Countries'. *Wall Street Journal*, 15 May.
- Lucas, Clay (2007). 'Illegal City Brothels to Escape Prying Eyes'. *The Age*, 4 July. Melbourne.
- Lynn, Matthew (2006). 'Morgan Stanley Can't Declare War on Lap Dancers', 11 January; bloomberg.com.

- Lys, Anzia (2007). 'Trafficking is a Long Standing Crime – US Troop Use of Japan's Trafficked Women 1945'. WNN. *Women News Network*, 29 September.
- McAlley, Andrea and Gill, Mary Anne (2005). 'We Saw Sex Bylaw Challenge Coming – Lobby', 7 December; www.stuff.co.nz.
- McClintock, Anne (1992). 'Gonad the Barbarian and the Venus Flytrap. Portraying the Female and Male Orgasm'. In Segal, Lynne and MacIntosh, Mary (eds), *Sex Exposed. Sexuality and the Pornography Debate*. London: Virago, pp. 111–31.
- McCurry, Justin (2005). 'Red Light for Tokyo's "Entertainment" Trap'. *Irish Times*, 15 March.
- Macdonald, Ingrid (2003). 'Mining, Human Rights and Gender Equality'. Paper for the 'Mining for Whom'? Papua New Guinea Mine Affected Communities' conference, Motupore Island, 18 July. Oxfam Community Aid Abroad.
- MacKinnon, Catharine (1989). *Towards a Feminist Theory of the State*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.
- MacKinnon, Catharine A. (1993). *Only Words*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.
- MacKinnon, Catharine A. (2006). *Are Women Human? And Other International Dialogues*. Cambridge, MA: Belknap Press of Harvard University.
- MacKinnon, Catharine A. and Dworkin, Andrea (eds) (1997). *In Harm's Way: The Pornography and Civil Rights Hearings*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.
- Macklin, Audrey (2003). 'Dancing across Borders: "Exotic Dancers", Trafficking and Canadian Immigration Policy'. *The International Migration Review*, 37.2: 464–500.
- McLeod, Eileen (1982). *Women Working: Prostitution Now*. London: Croom Helm.
- Mactaggart, Fiona (2008). 'Buyers Beware'. *Guardian*, 8 January.
- Maguire, Kevin (2002). 'Blair Risks New Row by Inviting Porn Tycoon to Tea'. *Guardian*, 28 May.
- Malarek, Victor (2003). *The Natashas. Inside the New Global Sex Trade*. New York: Arcade Publishing.
- Mani, Ram (2004). 'How to Become the Best Performer Artist – Part 2'. Power of Anchoring, 20 July; www.strip-magazine.com (accessed 17/5/2006).
- Marcovich, Malka (n.d.). *Guide to the UN Convention of 2 December 1949 for the Suppression of the Traffic in Persons and of the Exploitation of the Prostitution of Others*. Coalition Against Trafficking in Women.
- Martin, Sarah (2005). *Must Boys Be Boys? Ending Sexual Exploitation and Abuse in UN Peacekeeping Missions*. Washington, DC: Refugees International, October.

- Mathur, Sanyukta, Greene, Margaret and Malhotra, Anju (2003). *Too Young to Wed. The Lives, Rights and Health of Young Married Girls*. International Center for Research on Women.
- Maticka-Tyndale, Eleanor, Lewis, Jacqueline and Street, Megan (2005). 'Making a Place for Escort Work: A Case Study'. *Journal of Sex Research*, 42.1 (February): 46–53.
- Melrose, Margaret and Barrett, David (2006). 'The Flesh Trade in Europe: Trafficking in Women and Children for the Purpose of Commercial Sexual Exploitation'. *Police Practice and Research*, 7.2 (May): 111–23.
- Millett, Kate (1972). *Sexual Politics*. London: Abacus, Sphere Books.
- Millett, Kate (1975). *The Prostitution Papers*. St Albans: Paladin.
- Minnesota Advocates for Human Rights (2007). 'New Law in Taiwan Bans Overseas Marriage Brokers'. *Stop Violence Against Women*. A project by Minnesota Advocates for Human Rights, 6 November; http://www.stopvaw.org/New_Law_in_Taiwan_Stops_Overseas_Marriage_Brokers.html (accessed 29/07/2007).
- Miriam, Kathy (2005). 'Stopping the Traffic in Women: Power, Agency and Abolition in Feminist Debates over Sex-Trafficking'. *Journal of Social Philosophy*, 36.1, Spring: 1–17.
- Montgomery, Dave (2005). 'Industry Trying to Take Its Image Upscale'. *Fort Worth Star-Telegram*, 3 October. Texas.
- Montgomery, Heather (1998). 'Children, Prostitution and Identity: A Case Study from a Tourist Resort in Thailand'. In Kempadoo, Kamala and Doezema, Jo (eds), *Global Sex Workers. Rights, Resistance and Redefinition*. New York: Routledge, pp. 139–50.
- Monzini, Paola (2005). *Sex Traffic: Prostitution, Crime, and Exploitation*. Translated by Patrick Camiller. London and New York: Zed Press.
- Moon, Katharine S. (1997). *Sex Among Allies. Military Prostitution in U.S.–Korea Relations*. New York: Columbia University Press.
- Moor, Keith (2007a). 'How Crime Gangs Clean Up'. *Herald Sun*, 17 April. Australia.
- Moor, Keith (2007b). 'Business Washed Drug Cash'. *Herald Sun*, 30 April. Australia.
- Moore, Molly (2007). 'Changing Patterns in Social Fabric Test Netherlands' Liberal Identity'. *Washington Post Foreign Service*, 23 June.
- Morgan, Laurie A. and Martin, Karin A. (2006). 'Taking Women Professionals Out of the Office. The Case of the Women in Sales'. *Gender and Society*, 20.1: 108–28.
- Morgan, Robyn (1989). *The Demon Lover: The Sexuality of Terrorism*. London: Methuen.
- Moschetti, Carole (2006). '“Conjugal Wrongs Don't Make Rights”: Feminist Campaigns against Child Marriage between the Two World Wars'. PhD thesis, Department of Political Science, University of Melbourne.

- Muico, Norma Kang (2005). *An Absence of Choice. The Sexual Exploitation of North Korean Women in China*. London: Anti-Slavery International.
- Mullings, Beverley (1999). 'Globalization, Tourism, and the International Sex Trade'. In Kempadoo, Kamala (ed.), *Sun, Sex, and Gold. Tourism and Sex Work in the Caribbean*. Lanham, MD: Rowman and Littlefield, pp. 55–80.
- Murdoch, Lindsay (2007). 'UN Turns a Blind Eye to Use of Timor Brothels'. *The Age*, 7 May. Melbourne.
- Murphy, Elaine and Ringheim, Karin (n.d.). 'An interview with Jo Doezema of the Network of Sex Work Projects: Does Attention to Trafficking Adversely Affect Sex Workers' Rights?'; <http://www.walnet.org/csis/papers/RHR-Doezema> (accessed 10/11/2003).
- Murray, Penelope and Wilson, Peter (2004). *Music and the Muses. The Culture of Mousike in the Classical Athenian City*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Nagle, Jill (ed.) (1997). *Whores and Other Feminists*. New York: Routledge.
- Naqvi, Shahid (2002). 'Ex-stripper Leads Fight to End Lap Dance "slavery"'. *Birmingham Post*, 1 December. Birmingham Post and Mail Ltd.
- Nelson, Hank (2007). 'The New Guinean Comfort Women, Japan and the Australian Connection: Out of the Shadows'. *Japan Focus*, 2 May; <http://japanfocus.org>.
- Nour, Nawal (2006). 'Health Consequences of Child Marriage in Africa'. *Emerging Infectious Diseases*, November; <http://www.cdc.gov/ncidod/EID/vol12no11/06-0510.htm>.
- Nussbaum, Martha C. (2000). *Women and Development. The Capabilities Approach*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- O'Connell Davidson, Julia (1995). 'British Sex Tourists in Thailand'. In Maynard, Mary and Purvis, June (eds), *(Hetero)sexual Politics*. London: Taylor and Francis, pp. 42–65.
- O'Connell Davidson, Julia (1998). *Prostitution, Power and Freedom*. Cambridge: Polity.
- O'Connell Davidson, Julia (2001). 'The Sex Tourist, The Expatriate, His Ex-Wife and Her "Other": The Politics of Loss, Difference and Desire'. *Sexualities*, 4.1 (February): 5–24.
- O'Connell Davidson, Julia (2005). *Children in the Global Sex Trade*. Cambridge: Polity.
- O'Connell Davidson, Julia (2006). 'Will the Real Sex Slave Please Stand Up?' *Feminist Review*, 83: 4–22.
- O'Connell Davidson, Julia and Sanchez Taylor, Jacqueline (1999). 'Fantasy Islands. Exploring the Demand for Sex Tourism'. In Kempadoo, Kamala (ed.), *Sun, Sex, and Gold. Tourism and Sex Work in the Caribbean*. Lanham, MD: Rowman and Littlefield, pp. 37–54.

- O'Dwyer, Erin (2005). 'Sex and the City'. *Sun-Herald*, 11 September.
- Okin, Susan Moller (1999). *Is Multiculturalism Bad for Women? Susan Moller Okin with Respondents*. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press.
- Opperman, Martin (ed.) (1998). *Sex Tourism and Prostitution. Aspects of Leisure, Recreation, and Work*. New York: Cognizant Communication Corporation.
- Orchard, Treena Rae (2007). 'Girl. Woman, Lover. Mother: Towards a New Understanding of Child Prostitution among Young Devadasis in Rural Karnataka, India'. *Social Science and Medicine*, 64.12: 2379–90.
- Oriel, Jennifer (forthcoming). 'All Quiet on the Western Front'. *The International Sexual Politics of HIV/AIDS*. London: Ashgate.
- Osborne, Paul (2007). 'Backpackers "Undercutting Brothels"'. *The Australian*, 30 January.
- Otto, Dianne (2007). 'Making Sense of Zero Tolerance Policies in Peacekeeping Sexual Economies'. In Munro, Vanessa and Stychin, Carl (eds), *Sexuality and the Law: Feminist Engagements*. London: GlassHouse Press.
- Ouattara, Mariam, Sen, Purna and Thompson, Marilyn (1998). 'Forced Marriage, Forced Sex: The Perils of Childhood for Girls'. In Sweetman, Caroline (ed.), *Violence against Women*. Oxford: Oxfam, pp. 27–33.
- Pateman, Carole (1988). *The Sexual Contract*. Cambridge: Polity Press.
- Paul, Pamela (2005). *Pornified: How Porn Is Transforming Our Lives, Our Relationships, and Our Families*. New York: Times Books, Henry Holt and Co.
- Parry, Wayne (2006). 'Traffickers Exploit Foreign Women at NJ Bars and Brothels'. *Associated Press Newswires*, May. The Associated Press.
- Pesar, Patricia R. and Mahler, Sarah J. (2003). 'Transnational Migration: Bringing Gender In'. *International Migration Review*, 37.3: 812–46.
- Peterson, V. Spike (2003). *A Critical Rewriting of Global Political Economy. Integrating Reproductive, Productive and Virtual Economies*. London: Routledge.
- Pettman, Jan Jindy (1996). *Worlding Women: A Feminist International Politics*, North Sydney: Allen & Unwin; London and New York: Routledge.
- Pheterson, Gail (1996). *The Prostitution Prism*. Amsterdam: Amsterdam University Press.
- Phillip, Joan L. (1999). 'Tourist-Oriented Prostitution in Barbados: The Case of the Beach Boy and the White Female Tourist'. In Kempadoo, Kamala (ed.), *Sun, Sex, and Gold. Tourism and Sex Work in the Caribbean*. Lanham, MD: Rowman and Littlefield, pp. 183–200.
- Phillip, Joan and Dann, Graham (1998). 'Bar Girls in Central Bangkok'. In Opperman, Martin (ed.), *Sex Tourism and Prostitution. Aspects of*

- Leisure, Recreation, and Work*. New York: Cognizant Communications Corporation, pp. 60–70.
- Phillips, Anne and Dustin, Moira (2004). 'UK Initiatives on Forced Marriage: Regulation, Dialogue and Exit'. *Political Studies*, 52: 531–51.
- Phillips, Lynn (2000). *Flirting with Danger: Young Women's Reflections on Sexuality and Domination*. New York and London: New York University Press.
- Poulin, Richard (2005). *La Mondialisation des industries du sexe*. Paris: Imago.
- Prasad, Raekha (2007). 'New Start for Young Sex Workers in India'. *Guardian Weekly*, 16 November: 6.
- Project Respect (2004). *One Victim of Trafficking Is too Many: Counting the Human Cost of Trafficking*. Melbourne, Australia: Project Respect.
- Pruitt, Deborah and LaFont, Suzanne (1995). 'For Love and Money. Romance Tourism in Jamaica'. *Annals of Tourism Research*, 22.2: 422–40.
- Prynn, Jonathan and Gatton, Adrian (2003). 'Spearmint Rhino Makes £1.75m'. *Evening Standard*, 4 March. London.
- Raab, Selwyn (1998). 'Strip Club Partners, Now Ruined, Blame Greed and the Mob'. *New York Times*, 30 August.
- Raymond, Janice G. (2003). 'Ten Reasons for Not Legalizing Prostitution and a Legal Response to the Demand for Prostitution'. In Farley, Melissa (ed.), *Prostitution, Trafficking, and Traumatic Stress*. Binghamton, NY: Haworth Maltreatment and Trauma Press, pp. 315–32.
- Raymond, Janice G. (2004). 'Prostitution on Demand. Legalizing the Buyers as Sexual Consumers'. *Violence Against Women*, 10.10 (October): 1156–86.
- Raymond, Janice G., D'Cunha, Jean, Dzuhayatin, Siti Ruhaini, Hynes, Patricia H., Rodriguez, Zoraida Ramirez and Santos, Aida (2002). *A Comparative Study of women Trafficked in the Migration Process*. Amherst, MA: Coalition Against Trafficking in Women; <http://action.web.ca/home/catw/attach/CATW%20Comparative%20Study%202002.pdf>.
- Reuters (2006). 'Cologne Fills Tax Gap with Levy on Prostitutes'. *Today*, 15 December; reuters.com/news/articlenews.
- RhED, (n.d). 'Safety Tips for Escort Workers'; www.sexworker.org.au/uploads/documents/Safety_Tips_for_Escort_Workers.pdf.
- Ribeiro, Manuela and Sacramento, Octavio (2005). 'Violence against Prostitutes. Findings of Research in the Spanish–Portuguese Frontier Region'. *European Journal of Women's Studies*, 12.1: 61–81.
- Richtel, Matt (2007). 'A Thaw in Investment Prospects for Sex-Related Businesses? Maybe'. *New York Times*, 27 July.
- Rissel, C.E., Richters, J., Grulich, A.E., Visser, R.O. and Smith, A.M.A. (2003). 'Sex in Australia: Experiences of Commercial Sex in a

- Representative Sample of Adults'. *Australian and New Zealand Journal of Public Health*, 27, 191–97.
- Robbins, Tom (2005). 'Porn Stars. How the Mob Sent a Scary, Shocking Message to a British Press Lord'. *Village Voice*, 8 February.
- Roiphe, Katie (1993). *The Morning After: Sex, Fear and Feminism on Campus*. Boston, MA: Little, Brown and Co.
- Romany, Celina (1994). 'State Responsibility Goes Private: A Feminist Critique of the Public/Private Distinction in International Human Rights Law'. In Cook, Rebecca J. (ed.), *Human Rights of Women: National and International Perspectives*. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press.
- Rosewarne, Lauren (2005). 'The Men's Gallery. Outdoor Advertising and Public Space: Gender, Fear and Feminism'. *Women's Studies International Forum*, 28.1: 65–76.
- Rosewarne, Lauren (2007). 'Pinups in Public Space. Sexist Advertising as Sexual Harassment'. *Women's Studies International Forum*, 30: 313–25.
- Rousewell, Dean (2006). 'Chel Shocked; Exclusive Charles and Camilla's Anniversary Joy as Prince Faces'. *The People*, 9 April. London.
- Rubin, Gayle (1975). 'The Traffic in Women: Notes on the "Political Economy" of Sex'. In Reiter, Rayna (ed.), *Toward an Anthropology of Women*. New York and London: Monthly Review Press, pp. 157–210.
- Rubin, Gayle (1984). 'Thinking Sex'. In Vance, Carole (ed.), *Pleasure and Danger. Exploring Female Sexuality*. New York: Routledge, Kegan, Paul, pp. 267–319.
- Ruenkaw, Pataya (2002). 'The Transnational Prostitution of Thai Women to Germany: A Variety of Transnational Labour Migration?' In Thorbek, Susanne and Pattanaik, Bandana (eds), *Transnational Prostitution. Changing Global Patterns*. London and New York: Zed Press. pp. 69–85.
- Russell, Diana (1990). *Rape in Marriage*. Indiana: Indiana University Press.
- Ryan, Chris and Hall, Michael C. (2001). *Sex Tourism. Marginal People and Liminalities*. London: Routledge.
- Saeed, Fouzia (2001). *Taboo! The Hidden Culture of a Red Light District*. Karachi: Oxford University Press.
- Sanchez Taylor, Jacqueline (2001). 'Dollars Are a Girl's Best Friend? Female Tourists' Sexual Behaviour in the Caribbean'. *Sociology*, 35.3: 749–64.
- Sanghera, Jasvinder (2007). *Shame*. London: Hodder & Stoughton.
- Sanghera, Jyoti (1997). 'In the Belly of the Beast: Sex Trade, Prostitution and Globalization'. GAATW Canada. Discussion Paper for South Asia Regional Consultation on Prostitution. Bangkok, Thailand.
- Santos, Aida, Hofman, Cecilia and Bulawan, Alma (1998). *Prostitution and the Bases: A Continuning Saga of Exploitation*. Manila, Philippines: Coalition Against Trafficking in Women Asia Pacific; <http://www.catw-ap.org/pros.htm>.
- Savona, Ernesto U. and Stefanizzi, Sonia (eds) (2007). *Measuring Human Trafficking. Complexities and Pitfalls*. New York: Springer.

- Sawyer, Diane and Weir, Bill (2006). 'Undercover Stripper; Tyra Banks Spies on Different World'. *Good Morning America*, 1 March. ABC News Transcripts.
- Scarlet Alliance (2007). *New Sex Work Laws – Protest Parliament House Tomorrow*. Sydney: Scarlet Alliance, 25 June.
- Schaeffer-Grabiell, Felicity (2006). 'Planet-Love.com: Cyberbrides in the Americas and the Transnational Routes of U.S. Masculinity'. *Signs*, 31.2, Winter: 331–56.
- Schweitzer, Dahlia (1999). 'Striptease: The Art of Spectacle and Transgression'. *Journal of Popular Culture*, 34.1: 65–75.
- Schwelb, Egon (1963). 'Marriage and Human Rights'. *American Journal of Comparative Law*, 12: 337–83.
- Scoular, Jane (2004). 'The "Subject" of Prostitution: Interpreting the Discursive, Symbolic and Material Position of Sex/Work in Feminist Theory'. *Feminist Theory*, 5.3: 343–355.
- Seabrook, Jeremy (2000). *No Hiding Place. Child Sex Tourism and the Role of Extraterritorial Legislation*. London: Zed Press.
- Seabrook, Jeremy (2001). *Travels in the Skin Trade. Tourism and the Sex Industry*. London: Pluto Press; first published 1996.
- Seifert, Ruth (1994). 'War and Rape: A Preliminary Analysis'. In Stiglmeier, Alexandra (ed.), *Mass Rape. The War against Women in Bosnia-Herzegovina*. Lincoln, NE: Nebraska University Press, pp. 54–72.
- Shared Hope International (2007). *Demand: A Comparative Examination of Sex Tourism and Trafficking in Jamaica, Japan, the Netherlands, and the United States*. Vancouver, WA: Shared Hope International.
- Shaver, Francis M. (2005). 'Sex Work Research. Methodological and Ethical Challenges'. *Journal of Interpersonal Violence*, 20.3 (March): 296–319.
- Sheil, Fergus and Petrie, Andrea (2004). 'Detective Tells of Fears about Schoolgirl and Policeman'. Associated Press, 26 August.
- Silvester, John (2007). 'Riding Low: The World of Bikie Inc; OUTLAWS'. *The Age*, 23 June. Melbourne.
- Singh, J.P. and Hart, Shilpa A. (2007). 'Sex Workers and Cultural Policy: Mapping the Issues and Actors in Thailand'. *Review of Policy Research*, 24.2: 155–73.
- STAR (2004). *Dancing Matters*. Toronto: STAR (Sex Trade Advocacy and Research), September; www.uwindsor.ca/star.
- Stark, Christine and Whisnant, Rebecca (eds) (2004). *Not for Sale. Feminists Resisting Prostitution and Pornography*. Melbourne: Spinifex.
- Stateva, M. and Kozhouharova, N. (2004). 'Trafficking in Women in Bulgaria: A New Stage'. *Feminist Review*, 76.1: 110–16.
- Stiglmeier, Alexandra (ed.) (1994). *Mass Rape. The War against Women in Bosnia-Herzegovina*. Lincoln, NE: Nebraska University Press.
- Stolz, Greg (2007). 'Pimp to Push for Appeal'. *Courier Mail*, 27 June. Brisbane.

- Stossel, John (2005). 'Women Who Dance: A Look at the Lives of Strippers', *ABC News*, 15 April. ABC News Transcripts. American Broadcasting Companies, Inc.
- Strip Magazine (2005). 'Get the May Gossip from the Strip, Lap, and Exotic Dancers Scene in UK!'. Strip-magazine.com, 4 May; http://www.strip-magazine.com/mmazine/new_welcome.php?subaction=showfull&id=1115239580&ucat=7.
- Strip Magazine (2006). "'London's Lap Dancing Scene Gossip for the New Year!': London Strip Scene Gossip'. Strip-magazine.com, January; http://www.strip-magazine.com/mmazine/new_welcome.php?subaction=showfull&id=1135201134&ucat=7.
- Strossen, Nadine (2000). *Defending Pornography. Free Speech, Sex, and the Fight for Women's Rights*. New York: New York University Press.
- Sturdevant, Sandra Pollock and Stoltzfus, Brenda (eds) (1992). *Let the Good Times Roll: Prostitution and the U.S. Military in Asia*. New York: New Press.
- Sullivan, Barbara (1994). 'Feminism and Female Prostitution'. In Perkins, Roberta and Prestage, Garrett (eds), *Sex Work and Sex Workers in Australia*. Sydney: University of New South Wales Press.
- Sullivan, Mary (2007). *Making Sex Work: The Failed Experiment of Legalized Prostitution in Australia*. Melbourne: Spinifex.
- Summers, Anne (2007). 'Strip Clubs – Big for Businessmen, Not for Business'. *The Age*, 21 August. Melbourne.
- Sun-Herald* (2007). 'Condi Combo Winner for Brothels'. *Sun-Herald*, 9 September.
- Sunday Age, The* (1998). 'Everything but the Girls'. *Sunday Age*, 31 May. Melbourne.
- Suren, Asuncion and Stiefvater, Robert (1998). 'Topless Dancing: A Case for Recreational Identity'. In Opperman, Martin (ed.), *Sex Tourism and Prostitution. Aspects of Leisure, Recreation, and Work*. New York, Sydney, Tokyo: Cognizant Communication Corporation.
- Surtees, Rebecca (2003). 'Female Migration and Trafficking in Women: The Indonesian Context'. *Development*, 46.3: 99–106.
- Sweetman, Caroline (ed.) (1998a). *Violence against Women*. Oxford: Oxfam.
- Sweetman, Caroline (1998b). Editorial. *Violence against Women*. Oxford: Oxfam, pp. 2–6.
- Sydney Morning Herald* (2007). 'Lights Out for Illegal Brothels'. *Sydney Morning Herald*, 12 February.
- Tambe, Ashwini (2006). 'Brothels as Families. Reflections on the History of Bombay's Kothas'. *International Feminist Journal of Politics*, 8.2 (June): 219–42.
- Tanaka, Yuki (2002). *Japan's Comfort Women. Sexual slavery and prostitution during World War II and the US Occupation*. London and New York: Routledge.

- Taranaki Daily News* (2007). 'Children Paying Big Price for Solomon's Logging Industry'. *Taranaki Daily News*, August. New Zealand.
- Taylor, Lisa Rende (2005). 'Dangerous Trade-offs. The Behavioural Ecology of Child Labor and Prostitution in Rural Northern Thailand'. *Current Anthropology*, 46.3: 411–31.
- Terzieff, Juliette (2007). 'New Law Puts Brakes on International Bride Brokers'. *Women's ENews*, 23 July.
- Thomas, Michelle (2000). 'Exploring the Contexts and Meanings of Women's Experiences of Sexual Intercourse on Holiday'. In Clift, Simon and Carter, Simon (eds), *Tourism and Sex. Culture, Commerce and Coercion*. London and New York: Pinter, pp. 200–20.
- Thorbek, Susanne (2002). 'Introduction. Prostitution in a Global Context: Changing Patterns'. In Thorbek, Susanne and Pattanaik, Bandana (eds), *Transnational Prostitution. Changing Global Patterns*. London and New York: Zed Press, pp. 1–9.
- Thukral, Juhu (2006). 'Sex Workers and Finances: A Case Study of New York City'. In *Research for Sex Work*, 9: 22–4.
- Top Ten Reviews (2007). 'Internet Pornography Statistics', March; www.toptenreviews.com/pornography.
- Townsend, Mark (2005). 'Sex with Trafficked Women Is Rape, Says Minister'. *Observer*, 16 October.
- Truong, Thanh-Dan (1990). *Sex, Money and Morality: Prostitution and Tourism in Southeast Asia*. London: Zed Books.
- Tsay, Ching-lung (2004). 'Marriage Migration of Women from China and Southeast Asia to Taiwan'. In Jones, Gavin W. and Ramdas, Kamalini (eds), *(Un)tying the Knot: Ideal and Reality in Asian Marriage*. Singapore: University of Singapore Press.
- Tyke (2004). 'Advice for Would Be Strippers/Pole/Lap Dancers'. *Strip Magazine*; http://www.strip-magazine.com/mmagazine/new_welcome.php?subaction=showfull&id=1090341882&ucat=3.
- UNESCAP (2007). 'Children Paying Big Price for Solomon's Logging Industry', 2 August; www.illegal-logging.info.
- United Nations (1964). 'Convention on Consent to Marriage, Minimum Age for Marriage and Registration of Marriages'; <http://www.unhchr.ch/html/menu3/b/63.htm>.
- United Nations (1995). *Harmful Traditional Practices Affecting the Health of Women and Children*. Fact Sheet No. 23. Geneva: United Nations.
- United Nations (2000). *Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons, Supplementing the United Nations Convention Against Transnational Organized Crime*. Doc A/55/383.
- United Nations (2003). 'Special Measures for Protection from Sexual Exploitation and Abuse'. Secretary-General's Bulletin. ST/SGB/2003/13, 9 October.
- United Nations (2003). *Report of the Working Group on Contemporary Forms of Slavery*. Geneva: United Nations E/CN.4/Sub.2/2003/31.

- UNHRC (United Nations Human Rights Council) (2007a). *Report of the Special Rapporteur on the Human Rights Aspects of the Victims of Trafficking in Persons, Especially Women and Children*. Sigma Huda. United Nations. A/HRC/4/23, 24 January.
- UNHRC (United Nations Human Rights Council) (2007b). *Report of the Special Rapporteur on Violence against Women, Its Causes and Consequences, Yakin Erturk*. Addendum. Mission to the Netherlands. Geneva: Human Rights Council, United Nations. A/HRC/4/34/Add.4, 7 February.
- UNODC (2006). *Trafficking in Persons: Global Patterns*. UNODC.
- Valeri, Valerio (1994). 'Buying Women but Not Selling Them: Gift and Commodity Exchange in Huauilu Alliance. (People of Seram, Eastern Indonesia)'. *Man*, 29.1 (March): 1–26.
- Valler, Dean (2005). 'Business Visitors Expect This on Agenda; Lap Dancing: Club "Good for City's Commercial Profile"'. *Coventry Evening Telegraph*, 9 November.
- Walkowitz, Judith (1992). *Cities of Dreadful Delight: Narratives of Sexual Danger in Late-Victorian London*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.
- Wallman, Sandra (2001). 'Global Threats, Local Options, Personal Risk: Dimensions of Migrant Sex Work in Europe'. *Health, Risk and Society*, 3.1: 75–87.
- Ward, Helen and Day, Sophie (2004). 'Sex Work in Context'. In Day, Sophie and Ward, Helen (eds), *Sex Work, Mobility and Health in Europe*. London: Kegan Paul, pp. 15–32.
- Wardlow, Holly (2007). 'Men's Extramarital Sexuality in Rural Papua New Guinea'. *American Journal of Public Health*, 97.6 (June): 1006–14.
- Washburn, David and Davies, Jennifer (2004). 'Shifting Fortunes: Long Targeted by Tough Zoning and Conduct Laws, S.D. Strip Club Industry is Less Lucrative Today'. *San Diego Union-Tribune*, 19 October: A-1.
- Weaver, Matthew (2007). 'National Police Campaign to Target Sex Trafficking'. *Guardian*, 3 October.
- Welchman, Lynn and Hossain, Sara (eds) (2005). *Honour. Crimes, Paradigms, and Violence against Women*. London: Zed Press.
- West, The (2007). 'Brothel Laws "Will Lead to Corruption"', 26 June; www.thewest.com.au.
- Wheeler, Caroline (2003). 'Forget Being a Prostitute, Have a New Career in ... Lap Dancing'. *Sunday Mercury*, 14 December. Birmingham Post and Mail.
- Whitworth, Sandra (2004). *Men, Militarism and UN Peacekeeping: A Gendered Analysis*. Boulder, CO: Lynne Rienner.
- Wilde, Rex and Anderson, Pat (2007). *Ampe Akelyernemane Meke Mekarle 'Little Children Are Sacred'*. Report of the Northern Territory Board of Inquiry into the Protection of Aboriginal Children from Sexual Abuse. Northern Territory Government, Australia.

-
- Wilkinson, Sue and Kitzinger, Celia (2006). 'In Support of Equal Marriage: Why Civil Partnership Is Not Enough'. *Psychology of Women Section Review*, 8.1: 54–7.
- Willman-Navarro, Alys (2006). 'Money and Sex: What Economics Should Be Doing for Sex Work'. *Research for Sex Work*, 9: 18–21.
- WLUML (2006). 'Iraq: Women's Groups Blast "Temporary" Marriages'. *Women Living Under Muslim Laws*, 2 February; www.wluml.org.
- Wonders, Nancy A. and Michalowski, Raymond (2001). 'Bodies, Borders, and Sex Tourism in a Globalized World: A Tale of Two Cities – Amsterdam and Havana'. *Social Problems*, 48.4, Special Issue on Globalization and Social Problems: 545–71.
- Zhou, Jinghao (2006). 'Chinese Prostitution: Consequences and Solutions in the Post-Mao Era'. *China: An International Journal*, 4.2: 238–62.
- Zi Teng (2006). 'Chinese Migrant Sex Workers in Hong Kong'. *Research for Sex Work*, 9: 29–32.
- Zimmerman, Cathy (2003). *The Health Risks and Consequences of Trafficking in Women and Adolescents. Findings from a European Study*. London: London School of Hygiene and Tropical Medicine.

Index

- Abinanti, J. 72
- Aboriginal community,
 pornography 82–3
- Ackrell Capital 73
- Adult Video News* 74, 78–9
- Adult Video News (AVN) 70
- AdultShop.com 74
- Afghanistan, child marriage 58
- Agency and choice: prostitution
 19–21, 22; radical feminism
 26–7
- Agustin, L. 16, 31, 166–7
- AIDS funding, and sex workers’
 rights organizations 15–16
- Alcohol, spending 30
- Ali, S. 36, 83–4
- American Civil Liberties Union 64
- Amnesty International, Stop
 Violence Against Women
 campaign 199–200
- Amos, D. 91
- Amsterdam 130, 134–5; local
 democracy and legalized
 prostitution 193–4
- Anderson, B. and O’Connell
 Davidson, J. 171–2
- Anderson, R. 77
- Angeles City 132–3
- Anti-Slavery International 155
- Asian Human Rights
 Commission 51
- Atlanta, business prostitution 142
- Australia: aboriginal community
 and pornography 82–3;
 corruption 192–3; earnings 29;
 legalized brothels systems 113;
 motorcycle gangs 189–90;
 organized crime and prostitution
 legalization 189–90; prostitution
 and development 33–4;
 prostitution growth and
 legalization 194; prostitution
 legalization 175, 176, 177, 180;
 social acceptance 12–13;
 trafficking women 191–2;
 Victorian Prostitution Control
 Act (1994) 183
- Bailey, P. 75–6
- Bangladesh 179
- Bank of Ireland 74
- Barry, K. 3, 10, 22, 24, 63
- Beate Uhse 65, 67
- Beauvoir, S. de 41
- Belleau, M. 49
- Bishop, R. and Robinson, L. 130–1
- Bosnia-Herzegovina: peacekeeper
 prostitution 121; rape camps
 110, 111, 114–16, 127
- bride price, term 44–5, 46, 58
- bride trafficking 46–53; corpses 52
- bride wealth, term 44–5, 46
- Brownmiller, S. 33, 108, 109
- Brussa, L. 166
- Bulgaria, trafficking women 157
- Bunting, A. 58–9
- bush wives 123

- business prostitution 141–4;
 Atlanta 142; China 143; Hong
 Kong 143; Sydney 142–3
 Butler, J. 88, 108, 183–4
- Cadwell, S. 91
 Cambodia 79–81; development
 34–5; pornography effects 80–1
 Canada: earnings 29–30; exotic
 dancer visas 93–4
 Canyon, C. 78
 Caribbean, sex tourism and women
 146–50
 Chandler, L.B. 40
 chattels 44, 46
 child marriage 56–9; Afghanistan
 58; and Dowry 58; International
 Centre for Research on Women
 57–8; statistics 57
 children, and prostitution tourism
 144–6
 China 5; Business prostitution 143;
 corpses and bride trafficking 52;
 mail order brides 50–1
 Chivas Regal 5
 choice and agency: prostitution
 19–21, 22; and radical feminism
 26–7
 Clinton, President B. 70–1
 Coalition Against Trafficking in
 Women (CATW) 24–5, 152,
 159–60, 171, 174–5
 Coalition Against Trafficking in
 Women Asia Pacific (CATWAP)
 133, 208–9
 comfort women system 110–14,
 153, 177; Recreation and
 Amusement Association (RAA)
 113; United States postwar
 period 113–14
 congregational prostitution 119
 Contagious Diseases Acts 107–8,
 179, 183
 Convention to Eliminate All Forms
 of Discrimination Against
 Women (CEDAW) 201–2
 Cooke, A. 96
 Coventry, lap-dancing club 102
Creation of Patriarchy (Lerner) 42
 credit card companies,
 pornography 74
 Curacao 180–1
- Damiano, G. 72
 Dasi Hamkke Center 206
 Daulatdia 3–4
 Day, S. and Ward, H. 168–9
 debt, and pornography 67
 debt bondage 154, 156, 160, 164,
 165, 168, 170
Deep Throat 69–70
 Demleitner, N. 47
 Denmark, pornography 66
 DeRiviere, L. 29–30
 Desmond, R. 75–6
 devadasi prostitution, India 145
 development: Australian
 prostitution 33–4; Cambodia
 34–5; Japanese prostitution
 32–3; Latin America 34; Pacific
 Islands 36; Papua New Guinea
 34; and prostitution 30–7;
 prostitution and economic
 projects 35; Solomon Islands
 35–6; violence against women 34
 Digital Playground 73
 DirecTV 73
 Ditmore, M. 176
 divorce rights, marriage 42, 43
 Doezema, J. 16, 24–5
 Dolgopol, U. 110
 Dominican Republic 140–1
 Donlon, J.G. 136
 douching 185
 Dowry, and child marriage 58
 drugs, spending 30
 Dworkin, A. 10; and
 MacKinnon, C. 63
- earnings: alcohol and drugs
 spending 30; Australia 29;
 Canada 29–30; Hong Kong 28;
 and life cycle economic prospects
 29–30; New York 28–9;
 prostitution 27–30; trafficked
 women 29–30
 East Timor, peacekeeper
 prostitution 122

- Egan, D. 97
 Ehrenreich, B. 18–19
 Ekberg, G. 203
 emancipation, women 139
 emotional labour 21
 End Child Prostitution in Asian
 Tourism (ECPAT) 144
 ending prostitution 198–209;
 developing countries 209–10;
 domestic legislation 203–7;
 education against the demand
 208–9; exit programmes 207–8;
 international law 201–2;
 Norway 204; Philippines 206;
 and services to victims 207–8;
 South Korea 206–7; Swedish
 model 203–7; vested
 interests 200
 Enloe, C. 7, 35, 108, 147
 Eritrea, peacekeeper
 prostitution 122
 escort industry, occupational health
 and safety (OHS) advice 187–8
Evening Standard 92
 Exotic Dancers' Alliance 87
- Farley, M. 181–2
 Farr, K. 119
 Fatihi, S. 60
 Fawkes, J. 165, 176
 feminism: anti-violence
 campaigners 22; choice and
 agency 19–21, 22; free love 41;
 global sex industry 15–37;
 marriage and prostitution 40–4;
 neo-liberal language and
 prostitution 15; postcolonial
 approach 21–5; pro sex work
 position 17–20; reproductive
 labour and prostitution 18–19;
 sex tourism and sex work
 position 137–9; strip club boom
 88–90; Third World
 victimisation 24–5
 Fensom, M. 5
 Flynt, L. 5, 87
 forced marriage 53–6; Aboriginal
 community 53; and arranged
 marriage 53–5; Australian
 Lebanese community 56; British
 Asian community 53, 55
 Foreman, M. 209
 Frances, R. 33
 Frank, K. 88–9, 99, 103–5
 Friedman, M. 15
 Fryar, W. 192
- gender inequality reinforcement:
 strip club masculinizing process
 103–6; women and business
 glass ceiling 99–103
 General Motors 73
 geographical sequestration,
 prostituted women 179–80
 Germany 170, 194; organized
 crime and legalized
 prostitution 191
 Gill, R. 26
 globalization: live internet sex
 shows 80; pornography industry
 79–85; risk outsourcing 79–80;
 subordination outsourcing 80
 good governance, and prostitution
 legalization 189–94
 Goodwife.com 49–50
 Gray, J. 91–2
 Green, M. 94
- Hamilton, C. 41
 Hanna, L. 88
 Harm, pornography production
 process 76–9
 Harman, H. 204
 Harrington, C. 121
 Hochschild, A. 18–19, 21
 Holden, K. 113, 187
 Holsopple, K. 95–6, 97–8
 Hong Kong: business prostitution
 143; earnings 29
 honour killings, marriage
 39–40, 55
 Huda, S. 47–8
 Hughes, D. 71, 79–80
 Hustler 5, 64, 69, 72
- Iemma, M. 176
 India: devadasi prostitution 145;
 family prostitution 23–4

- Indonesia: domestic labour and trafficking 160; marriage 44–5
- International Centre for Research on Women, child marriage report 57–8
- International Labour Organization (ILO) 4, 210
- International Migration Review* 93
- internet 6–7; mail order brides 48–9
- Iran, temporary marriage 59–60
- Iraq, temporary marriage 60
- Ireland, strip club boom 94–5
- Irish Times* 94
- Jamaica 138
- Japan: business and prostitution 141–2; comfort women system 110–13; prostitution and development 32–3; Recreation and Amusement Association (RAA) 113
- Jenkins, C. 36, 84
- Johnnie Walker 5
- Kapur, R. 2, 22–3, 24
- Kelly, L. 127
- Kempadoo, K. 16, 138, 150, 180–1
- Kipnis, L. 64
- Knudsen, K.A. 139
- Kong, T. 20–1
- Korea: comfort women 111, 112; military prostitution 116–17
- Korean Special Tourism Association (KSTA) 119
- Kosovo, peacekeeper prostitution 121, 122, 123
- La Mondialisation des industries du sexe* (Poulin) 8
- Lane, F. 65–6, 67–8, 69, 74
- language, prostitution 8–9
- lap dancing, strip club boom 96–7
- legalization: Australia 175, 176, 177; brothels and harms 186–7; compulsory examination 179; and condom use 185; and corruption 192–3; Curacao 180–1; and double standard 179; and geographical sequestration 179–80; good governance and harms 189–94; harms 182–3; and local democracy 193; modern wave 174–7; Nevada 181–2; New Zealand 176–7; and numbers growth 194–5; and occupational health and safety (OHS) advice 184–5, 187–8; panic buttons 186; patriarchal state pimping 177–83; prostitution 173–97; Swedish model 175, 203–7; and trafficking 191–2; undermining equality of women 194–6; violence and harms to health 183–8; zoning laws 182
- leisure studies, stripping 136
- Lerner, G. 10, 41, 46
- Lévi-Strauss, C. 40
- Lewis, J. 97
- Liberia, peacekeeper prostitution 123
- Lie, J. 177–8
- Liepe-Levinson, K. 88, 96, 98
- Lim, L.L. 4
- Little Children Are Sacred* report 82–3
- local democracy, and legalized prostitution 193
- logging industry, prostitution and development 35, 36
- Lole, S. 82
- Lords, T. 77–8
- Lovelace, L. 69–70
- MacKinnon, C. 22, 64, 114–15, 127; and Dworkin, A. 63
- Macklin, A. 93–4
- McNulty, T. 170
- Magaziner, I. 71
- mail order brides 5, 46–53; China 50–1; corporate masculinity 48; corporate multiculturalism 48–9; India 51–2; internet 48–9; North Korea 50; Taiwan 48; term 47
- Malarek, V. 123
- male bonding, sex tourism 140–1
- male sex right 27, 41–2, 178

- Man* 44
 Mani, R. 98–9
 marriage: and buying women 44–6;
 and child marriages 56–9;
 companionate 43; divorce rights
 42, 43; feminist theory and
 prostitution 40–4; and forced
 marriages 38, 53–6; honour
 killings 39–40, 55; Indonesia
 44–5; mail order brides 38, 46–8;
 Married Women's Property Acts
 42; Papua New Guinea 45–6;
 and prostitution 38–61; and rape
 43–4; servile 38–9; temporary
 39, 59–61; trafficking 46–53;
 United Nations convention
 (1964) 39; and unwanted sex
 43–4; women's rights 42–3
 Married Women's Property Acts 42
 Martino, R. 75–6
 masculinity: sex tourism 140; strip
 club boom 103–6
 Military Base Agreement
 (MBA) 118
 military prostitution 4, 107–28;
 banning 124–5; and civilian
 prostitution 125–8; comfort
 women system 110–14; and
 militarization 108–9; othering of
 women 108–9; and peacekeeper
 prostitution 120–3; Philippines
 117–19; and pornography 109;
 rape camps 110, 111, 114–16;
 and sexual slavery 109–20; US
 military in South East Asia
 116–20
 Millett, K. 1
 Miriam, K. 17–18, 26, 27
 Mitchell, J., funeral 72–3
 Mokbel, T. 189
 Montgomery, H. 144
 Moon, K. 116–17
 Morgan, L.A. and Martin, K.A.
 100–1
 Morgan Stanley 101
 motorcycle gangs, Australia
 189–90
 Mullings, B. 138
 Nelson, H. 111–12
 Netherlands, the 4–5; local
 democracy and legalized
 prostitution 193–4; organized
 crime and legalized prostitution
 190–1; prostitution tourism
 133–5; trafficking women 171;
 zoning laws 182
 Network of Sex Work Projects
 (NSWP) 16, 25, 153, 164
 Nevada 181–2
 New South Wales 175, 176,
 177, 180
 New York, earnings 28–9
New York Times 73
 New Zealand, small
 owner-operated brothels
 (SOOBs) 176–7
 North Korea, mail order brides 50
 Norway, prostitution 204

Obscene Profits (Lane) 65–6
 occupational health and safety
 (OHS) advice, and legalization
 184–5, 187–8
 O'Connell Davidson, J. 148, 149,
 150; and Anderson, B. 171–2;
 and Sanchez Taylor, J. 140,
 144, 147
 O'Farrell Theatre, San Francisco
 72, 87
Only Words (MacKinnon) 64
 Opperman, M. 135
 Orchard, T.R. 145
 organized crime: and pornography
 71–3; prostitution legalization
 189–94; strip club boom 91–2
 Otto, D. 124–5, 126
 Overs, C. 16

 Pacific Islands, development and
 prostitution 36, 83
 Pankhurst, C. 41
 Papua New Guinea 7, 45–6, 83–4;
 comfort women 111–12;
 development and violence
 against women 34, 36; gang rape
 84–5; violence against
 women 200

- Passar, D. 87
 Pateman, C. 20, 41–2, 46, 178
 patriarchal state pimping: clothing rules 179; double standard 179; geographical sequestration 179–80; Nevada 181–2; and prostitution legalization 177–83
 peacekeeper prostitution 120–3; banning 124–5; East Timor 122; Eritrea 122; Kosovo 121, 122, 123; Liberia 123; marriage-like arrangements 122–3; Philippines 123; Refugees International Report 121–2, 123; Sierra Leone 121–2, 123; United Nations (UN) and new rules 124–5; violence 121
People Versus Larry Flynt 72
 Peterson, S. 18–19
 Pettman, J. 8
 Philippines 173; Anti-Trafficking in Persons Act (2003) 205; Military Base Agreement (MBA) 118; military prostitution 117–19; peacekeeper prostitution 123; prostitution tourism 131–2
 Phillip, J. 148; and Dann, G. 135
 Phillips, A. and Dustin, M. 53, 54–5
 phone sex 67–8
 Playboy 67; clubs 69, 71
 police, and prostitution legislation 206–7
 police corruption 192–3
 Poppy Project 167
 pornography 2; cable and satellite 70; Cambodia 79–81; Clinton administration 70–1; condom use 76; credit card companies 74; and debt 67; feminist theory 62–5; and gang rape 84–5; Golden Age 68, 69; harms in production process 76–9, 80; homemade 70; hotel pay-per-view 67; industry expansion 68–71; industry globalization 79–85; industry size and worth 65–8; international political economy 62–85; and internet 69; and mainstream 70, 73–6; mainstream political influence 75; and organized crime mainstreaming 71–3; Papua New Guinea 84; and porn star biographies 77–8; production process 76–9; San Fernando Valley 67; traditional communities 81–5; US domination 71; and video cassette recorder (VCR) 69
 Poulin, R. 8, 66, 72, 77
 Private Media Group 80
 prostitution: anti-violence campaigners 22–3; choice and agency 19–21, 22; condom use 28; and development 30–7; downplaying violence 25; earnings 27–30; emotional labour 21; euphemisms 15; harmful cultural practice 9–12; harms 25; India 23–4; industrialization and globalization 3–8; language and normalization 8–9; legalization 173–97; and marriage 38–61; military 107–28; normalization as leisure 135–7; postcolonial approach 21–5; pro sex work position 17–20; radical feminism and agency approach 26–7; reproductive labor 18–19; romanticization 24; and social necessity 19; Third World victimisation 24–5; trafficking women 152–71; transgressive nature 23
 prostitution survivors' groups 17
 prostitution tourism 5, 8, 129–51; business and sports 141–4; children 144–6; feminism and sex work position 137–9; harms 149–50; and leisure studies 135–7; motives 139–41; the Netherlands 133–5; the Philippines 131; varieties 131–3; women 146–51

- Queensland: local democracy and legalized prostitution 192; organized crime and legalized prostitution 190
- Rajasthan, bride trafficking 51–2
- rape, and marriage 43–4
- rape camps 110, 111, 114–16; Bosnia-Herzegovina 110, 111, 114–15, 127; Nazi regime 115–16
- Raymond, J. 174–5
- Recreation and Amusement Association (RAA) 113
- Refugees International, peacekeeper prostitution report 121–2, 123
- reproductive labour, and prostitution 18–19
- Research for Sex Work* 20
- Roiphe, K. 22
- Rubin, G. 40, 125
- Rudd, K. 102
- Ruenkaew, R. 166
- Ruhama 95
- Ryan, C. and Hall, M.C. 136
- San Fernando Valley, pornography 67
- Sanchez Taylor, J. 150; O’Connell Davidson, J. and 147
- Sandler, D. 80
- Sanghera, Jasvinder 54
- Sanghera, Jyoti 18, 19, 31, 138
- Savona, E.U. and Stafannizi, S. 157
- Scarlet Alliance 165, 184–5
- Schaeffer-Grabiel, F. 48–9
- Schweitzer, D. 88
- Scouler, J. 24
- Second Sex* (de Beauvoir) 41
- Seifert, R. 109, 127
- self-mutilation 149
- Sen, P. 57
- services to victims 207–8
- servile marriage 38–9
- sex workers’ rights organizations, and AIDS funding 15–16
- sexual contract, and prostitution legalization 178
- sexual slavery: Bosnia-Herzegovina 114–16; Japan 109–14; and military prostitution 109–16; United States and South East Asia 116–20
- Shame* (Jasvinder Sanghera) 54
- Sierra Leone, peacekeeper prostitution 121–2, 123
- Sinatra, F. 70
- Singh, J.P. and Hart, S.A. 136–7
- small owner-operated brothels (SOOBs), New Zealand 176–7
- social acceptance, importance 12–13
- Solomon Islands 7, 82, 84; development and prostitution 35–6
- South Africa, prostitution 204
- South Korea: anti-trafficking law 205–6; services to victims 207
- Spark Capital 73
- Spearmint Rhino 5, 90–2, 93, 101; profits 90
- spermicide use 185
- stage fees, strip club boom 87
- Stallone, R. 76
- Standing Against Global Exploitation (SAGE) 208
- STAR, Canada 185
- Starworld Modeling 76
- Stop Violence Against Women campaign, Amnesty International 199–200
- Storberget, K. 204
- strip club boom 3, 86–106; business meetings 101–2; decontextualized individualism 92; exotic dancer visas 93–4; exploitation and violence 95–9; feminist debate 88–90; First Amendment rights 88; gender inequality reinforcement 99–106; harms 89; industry context 90–3; Ireland 94; lap dancing 96–7; lap dancing licence 102; masculinizing process 103–6; normalization 93; organized crime 91–2; physical and psychological harms 96–7;

- politicians 102; private booths 96; profits and earnings 95; social transgressiveness 88, 89; stage fees 87; stalking 98, 99; trafficking 93–5; UK turnover 90; wall dancing 98; and women's business glass ceiling 99–103
- Strip Magazine* 98
- Strossen, N. 64
- Summers, A. 102
- survival sex 124–5
- SWEAT, South Africa 204
- Sweden 170, 195
- Swedish model: and ending prostitution 203–7; prostitution legalization 175; and underground industry 203–4
- Sweetman, C. 34
- Sydney, business prostitution 142–3
- Taiwan, mail order brides 48
- Tambe, A. 23–4
- Tampep 163, 165, 166
- Tanaka, Y. 32–3, 110, 111
- Tasmania 176
- temporary marriage 39, 59–61; Iran 59–60; Iraq 60; and sex tourism 60, 61; Yemen 59, 60–1
- Thailand 140
- Thorbek, S. 166
- Thukral, J. 28
- Trafficking Victims Protection Reauthorization Act (2005) 123
- Trafficking women 7–8; Bulgaria 157; coercion 157; consenting and forced 158; debt bondage 154, 160, 164, 165, 168, 170; and demand question 169–71; domestic labour 160; emotional disassociation from body 160–1; and estimating numbers 155–8; euphemisms and minimization 165–7; Germany 170; harms 160–4; history 153–5; international law 159–60; murder 162; the Netherlands 171; normalization 164–7; pregnancy and abortion 162; and prostitution 152–71; Protocol on Trafficking in Persons (2000) 152, 158, 159, 170, 202, 205, 207; psychological and physical abuses 161–4, 167–9; rape 162; Sexually Transmitted Diseases (STDs) 162; slave auctions 158; stigma 167–9; Sweden 170; transit stage 161–2; traumatic bonding 157, 164; violence 161–2; vulnerability 154
- traumatic bonding, trafficking women 157, 164
- Turner, B. 190
- UK Insolvency Helpline 67
- UNAIDS 16
- United Kingdom 195; prostitution 204
- United Nations Convention Against Sexual Exploitation (1991) 3, 202
- United Nations Convention Against Trafficking in Persons and the Exploitation of Others (1949) 2, 153–4, 158, 173, 201
- United Nations Convention on Ending All Forms of Discrimination Against Women (CEDAW) 10, 183
- United Nations Convention on Marriage (1964) 39; and cultural relativist perspective 29
- United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child (CRC) 57
- United Nations Convention on Transnational Organized Crime, Protocol on Trafficking in Persons (2000) 152, 158, 159–60, 170, 202, 205, 207
- United Nations Declaration Against Violence Against Women (1993) 202
- United Nations Trafficking Rapporteur's Report (2007) 47, 53, 56
- United States of America (USA): comfort women system 113–14;

- South East Asia and sexual slavery 116–20
- Valeri, V. 44–5
- Victoria: corruption 193; organized crime and legalized prostitution 189–90
- Victorian Prostitution Control Act (1994), Australia 183–4
- violence: and development 34–5; harms and prostitution legalization 183–8
- Vivid 67, 73
- Waat Media 73
- Ward, H. and Day, S. 168–9
- Wardlow, H. 45–6
- Willman-Navarro, A. 20, 28
- Wollstonecraft, M. 40
- Wolstenholme Elmy, E. 40
- Woman in Berlin* 123
- Women Hurt in Systems of Prostitution Engaged in Revolt (WHISPER) 16
- women's equality, and prostitution legalization 194–6
- Wonders, N. and Michalowski, R. 134
- Yemen, temporary marriage 59, 60–1
- Zero Tolerance Trust 209
- Zi Teng 28
- zoning laws, prostitution legalization 182